

# Federal Trade Commission 

## E-Cigarette Report

for 2019-2020

## Executive Summary

In 2018, seeing data about the increased popularity of e-cigarette products, particularly among youth, the Federal Trade Commission ("FTC" or "Commission") decided to study the ecigarette industry's domestic sales and marketing, as it has for many decades studied the cigarette and smokeless tobacco industries. ${ }^{1}$

In 2019, the FTC issued identical Orders to File Special Reports ("Orders") under Section 6(b) of the FTC Act to six of the country's largest domestic e-cigarette manufacturers, who together comprised virtually all of the e-cigarette market measured by the Nielsen Company. The Orders sought information from these companies as to their e-cigarette sales and advertising and promotional activities for the years 2015, 2016, 2017, and 2018. The information collected was used to publish the FTC's first E-Cigarette Report in March 2022.

In 2021, the Commission sent another round of Orders covering the years 2019 and 2020 to those companies among the original recipients who were still marketing e-cigarettes. This report summarizes the information provided in response to the Commission's 2021 Orders, including information gathered through follow-up questions.

## Key Findings

In this second E-Cig Report, the Commission observed four important market trends, related to sales, flavors, discounting, and sampling.

The data we collected revealed that the dramatic growth in e-cigarette sales by the

[^0]reporting manufacturers continued during 2019, but apparently ceased in 2020. E-cigarette product sales for the reporting companies, which had increased from $\$ 304.2$ million in 2015 to $\$ 2.046$ billion in 2018, grew to $\$ 2.703$ billion in 2019 and then declined to $\$ 2.224$ billion in 2020. It appears that this decline in sales for the reporting companies may not represent that large a decline in total e-cigarette sales, but rather a shift to products sold by new or growing market participants. National survey data appears to show national cartridge-based unit sales declining and disposable product sales increasing in 2020. ${ }^{2}$ The Commission hopes to shed light on this in future reports and is sending its Orders to additional e-cigarette companies to strengthen the data it collects going forward.

Second, the data show a significant reduction in the sales of "other" flavored cartridges popular with youth, indicating that the FDA's 2020 enforcement policy prohibiting the sale of flavored cartridge-based products other than menthol ${ }^{3}$ has been effective in limiting the availability of these products to youth. "Other" flavored cartridge-based products plummeted from $42.1 \%$ of cartridges sold and given away in 2018 to $0.8 \%$ in 2020, but menthol cartridgebased products surged to $63.5 \%$ of cartridges sold and given away. At the same time, publicly available sources indicate that sales of disposable e-cigarettes, which were exempt from the

[^1]FDA's enforcement policy and continue to be available in a wide variety of flavors, have increased substantially. ${ }^{4}$ "Other" flavored disposables made up 77.6\% of disposables sold in December 2020. ${ }^{5}$ National survey data indicate a more than $1,000 \%$ increase in disposable ecigarette use among youth from 2019 to 2020. ${ }^{6}$ The national survey data also show that fruit and mint flavored e-cigarettes continue to be extremely popular with youth, and that menthol and candy/dessert flavored products were popular among youth. ${ }^{7}$

Third, price discounting reached a record high in 2019 (\$182.3 million) and, although it declined somewhat in 2020 ( $\$ 169.1$ million), it was the largest category of advertising expenditures reported by the recipient companies. Studies indicate that consumers are clearly responsive to price changes of tobacco products - with youth more responsive to price changes than adults. ${ }^{8}$ In considering the available studies demonstrating that tobacco use among youth is responsive to price changes, the U.S. Surgeon General concluded that use of price-reducing

[^2]promotions has led to higher rates of tobacco use among youth. ${ }^{9}$ The prevalence of price discounting for e-cigarettes is therefore concerning.

Fourth, the data revealed that spending on sampling and the distribution of free and deeply discounted e-cigarette products more than doubled in two years to $\$ 140.1$ million, making it the second largest expenditure category in 2020. The FDA prohibited sampling in 2016 to limit youth access to tobacco products. ${ }^{10}$ The increased spending occurred because following the ban on free e-cigarette samples, some companies began offering e-cigarette products for $\$ 1$ or a similar highly discounted price in order to evade the spirit, if not the letter, of the FDA's sampling ban.

In addition to the four key findings discussed above, the report notes that, due to volatility in the disposable e-cigarette market, the reporting manufacturers appear to not be representative of the disposables market as a whole. In particular, only two of the five manufacturers that received the Commission's Orders continued to market disposable ecigarettes in 2020, and those that did provided more limited offerings. In addition, the 20192020 period saw a number of new market entrants. As a result, although the data collected show that sales of disposable e-cigarettes declining from $\$ 74.7$ million in 2018 to $\$ 69.3$ million in 2019 and then to $\$ 59.3$ million in 2020 , most published data indicate that the market for e-
${ }^{9}$ Id. at 530.
10 "Deeming Tobacco Products To Be Subject to the Federal Food, Drug, and Cosmetic Act, as Amended by the Family Smoking Prevention and Tobacco Control Act; Restrictions on the Sale and Distribution of Tobacco Products and Required Warning Statements for Tobacco Products" 81 Fed. Reg. 28974, 28986 (May 10, 2016).
cigarette disposables grew significantly after 2018. ${ }^{11}$ New market entrants most likely account for this discrepancy. ${ }^{12}$

11 See CDC Foundation, Monitoring U.S. E-Cigarette Sales: National Trends, October 2020, https://www.cdcfoundation.org/E-cigaretteSalesDataBrief?inline (based upon Information Resources, Inc. data); Hannah Hammond, Disposable E-Cigarette Sales Take Off, CSP Daily News, Feb. 11, 2021, https://www.cspdailynews.com/tobacco/disposable-e-cigarette-salestake\#page $=0$ (based upon Nielsen data).

12 The two most popular brands of disposable devices in April 2021, neither of which was covered by a Commission 6(b) order, had a combined $75.3 \%$ share of the disposable market. Truth Initiative, E-cigarettes: Facts, stats and regulations, https://truthinitiative.org/research-resources/emerging-tobacco-products/e-cigarettes-facts-stats-and-regulations.

## I. INTRODUCTION

This is the Federal Trade Commission's second report on e-cigarette sales, advertising, and promotion and it contains data for 2019 and 2020. The prior report presented data for 2015 through 2018. ${ }^{13}$

The Commission has published similar reports on cigarette and smokeless tobacco sales and marketing expenditures since 1967 and 1987, respectively. In February 2019, when it released its Cigarette Report for 2018 and its Smokeless Tobacco Report for 2018, the FTC issued a statement that it "lack[ed] similar data about the rapidly growing market for e-cigarettes, and as a result the FTC's and the public's understanding of the overall market for nicotine-based products [wa]s substantially incomplete."

In order to assist policymakers, the public, and itself to better understand that market, the Federal Trade Commission issued compulsory process orders ("Orders") in October 2019 to six leading domestic e-cigarette manufacturers ("the manufacturers" or "the companies") requiring them to report detailed information on their e-cigarette sales and advertising and promotional activities for calendar years 2015, 2016, 2017, and 2018. ${ }^{14}$ In February 2021, the Commission
${ }^{13}$ The first Commission report, Federal Trade Commission E-Cigarette Report for 2015-2018, issued in March 2022, can be found at: https://www.ftc.gov/reports/e-cigarette-report-20152018.

The data contained in the tables appended to this report are also in an electronic spreadsheet available at: https://www.ftc.gov/ecigarettedata.
${ }^{14}$ A generic version of the Order seeking data for 2015 through 2018 can be found at: https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/attachments/press-releases/ftc-study-e-cigarette-manufacturers-sales-advertising-promotional-methods/generic e-
cigarette 6b order to file a special report 0.pdf.
The owners of one manufacturer did not have data from the period before they acquired the company and did not report the company's activities in 2015 or 2016. Therefore, aggregate data
issued slightly revised Orders for calendar years 2019 and 2020 to the five original recipients that were still selling e-cigarette products. ${ }^{15}$

The Orders covering data for 2019 and 2020 were sent to: Fontem US, Inc.; JUUL Labs, Inc.; Logic Technology Development LLC; NJOY, LLC; and R.J. Reynolds Vapor Company. Fontem US, Inc., a subsidiary of Imperial Brands plc, markets e-cigarette products under the blu brand name. JUUL Labs, Inc. markets the JUUL brand e-cigarette products, and currently is the largest domestic e-cigarette manufacturer in terms of sales. Logic Technology Development LLC, a subsidiary of Japan Tobacco International, markets e-cigarette products under the Logic brand name. NJOY, LLC markets the NJOY brand of e-cigarette products, which were among the first e-cigarette products introduced in the United States. R.J. Reynolds Vapor Company, a subsidiary of Reynolds American, Inc., markets e-cigarette products under the Vuse brand name.

## II. E-CIGARETTE PRODUCT TYPES

E-cigarettes are battery-powered devices that deliver aerosolized e-liquid, usually containing nicotine, when inhaled. ${ }^{16}$ They include vape pens and personal vaporizers. Some e-
from 2015 and 2016 are not strictly comparable to aggregate data from subsequent years.
The sales, advertising, and promotional expenditure figures contained in this report and in the electronic spreadsheet are in nominal dollars and have not been adjusted for inflation.
${ }^{15}$ The Commission also issued an Order for 2015 through 2018 data to Nu Mark LLC, a subsidiary of Altria Group, Inc. that marketed the MarkTen and GreenSmoke brands of ecigarette products through the end of 2018, when it stopped manufacturing and distributing ecigarette products.

A generic version of the Order seeking data for 2019 and 2020 can be found at: https://www.ftc.gov/reports/order-file-special-section-6b-report-e-cigarette-products-calendar-year-2021-generic-text.
${ }^{16}$ Although the Commission's definition of e-cigarettes could include cannabis vaping devices, none of the recipients of the Commission's Orders sold such devices during the period covered
cigarette systems have rechargeable batteries and are refillable. Closed refillable systems ("cartridge systems") consist of rechargeable devices that use sealed cartridges, pods, or tanks ("cartridges") pre-filled with e-liquid that are replaced when the e-liquid is used up. Such prefilled cartridges are usually designed to work with one brand's or one manufacturer's products. Closed non-refillable systems ("disposables") come with pre-filled e-liquid and nonrechargeable batteries. Open system products are rechargeable devices and have tanks that are manually filled by the user with e-liquid. Generally, an open system device can be filled with eliquid sold by any entity.

## III. E-CIGARETTES SOLD AND GIVEN AWAY

As reported in Table 1, total e-cigarette sales of the reporting manufacturers grew from $\$ 2.046$ billion ${ }^{17}$ in 2018 to $\$ 2.703$ billion in 2019 and then decreased to $\$ 2.224$ billion in 2020. Indirect sales, through retailers, which were $92.1 \%$ of total dollar sales in 2018, were $91.6 \%$ of total dollar sales in 2019 and $92.3 \%$ in 2020. The companies' direct sales to consumers increased from $\$ 131.3$ million in 2018 to $\$ 219.9$ million in 2019 and then declined to $\$ 157.6$ million in 2020. Highly discounted sales of products for $\$ 1$ or less decreased from $\$ 31.3$ million
by the Orders, and the data collected by the Commission do not include information about cannabis vaping devices. As discussed below, the recipients reported selling nicotine-free products.

The Commission's e-cigarette definition does not encompass battery-operated devices that heat, but do not burn, tobacco or the cigarette products used in such devices.
${ }^{17}$ All sales figures and advertising and promotion expenditures discussed in the text of this report that are stated in billions are rounded to the nearest million, those stated in millions are rounded to the nearest hundred thousand, and those stated in thousands are rounded to the nearest thousand. The precise, unrounded figures are in the tables at the end of the report.
in 2018 to $\$ 6.7$ million in 2019 and then grew to $\$ 13.3$ million in $2020 .{ }^{18}$

## Cartridge-Based Systems

The reporting manufacturers' best-selling e-cigarette products have been cartridge system products. Cartridge-based systems can be distributed as individual devices, individual cartridges, multiple cartridges bundled together, one or more cartridges bundled with one or more devices, or multiple devices bundled together. As reported in Table 1, sales of cartridge products by the reporting manufacturers increased from $\$ 1.969$ billion in 2018 (representing $96.3 \%$ of total sales) to $\$ 2.633$ billion in 2019 ( $97.4 \%$ of total sales) and then declined to $\$ 2.165$ billion in 2020 (97.3\% of total sales).

As reported in Tables 2A and 2B, sales of one or more cartridges by themselves rose from $\$ 1.560$ billion in 2018 to $\$ 2.196$ billion in 2019 and $\$ 2.081$ billion in 2020. Sales of cartridge and device bundles decreased from $\$ 240.4$ million in 2018 to $\$ 132.7$ million in 2019 and $\$ 2.7$ million in 2020. Devices sold by themselves made up $8.5 \%$ of cartridge system sales in 2018 ( $\$ 168.3$ million), $11.6 \%$ in 2019 ( $\$ 304.8$ million), and $3.8 \%$ in 2020 ( $\$ 81.2$ million).

Direct sales of cartridge system products made up $6.2 \%$ of their overall dollar sales in $2018,8.0 \%$ in 2019 , and $6.8 \%$ in 2020. Heavily discounted sales for $\$ 1$ or less dropped from $1.6 \%$ of dollar sales in 2018 to $0.3 \%$ in 2019 and then grew to $0.6 \%$ in 2020 .

Combined sales and giveaways ${ }^{19}$ of cartridges grew from 831.3 million cartridges in
${ }^{18}$ The Commission's Order asked the reporting manufacturers to report sales for $\$ 1$ or less separately from indirect and direct sales although they could have occurred at retail or directly through company representatives.

19 The Commission's definition of E-Cigarette Products given away included all products distributed for free, whether given for free to retailers or wholesalers for subsequent sale to consumers, or given for free to retailers, wholesalers, or consumers through sampling, a free trial promotion, coupons for free product, or otherwise.

2018, to 976.7 million in 2019 and then decreased to 943.2 million in 2020. Combined sales and giveaways of devices increased from 30.5 million devices in 2018 to 33.9 million in 2019 and then decreased to 21.0 million in 2020. Giveaways of cartridges decreased from 3.1 million cartridges in 2018 to 189,000 in 2019 and 30,000 in 2020. Giveaways of devices declined from 313,000 in 2018 to 89,000 in 2019 and 5,000 in 2020. At the same time, devices sold for $\$ 1$ or less (by themselves or with cartridges) grew from $7.6 \%$ of devices sold or given away in 2018 ( 2.3 million devices) to $23.8 \%$ in 2019 ( 8.1 million devices) and $63.9 \%$ in 2020 ( 13.4 million devices). Cartridges sold for $\$ 1$ or less were $0.5 \%$ of cartridges sold or given away in 2018, $0.01 \%$ in 2019 , and $0.0007 \%$ in 2020.

## Disposable E-Cigarettes

As reported in Table 1, sales of disposable, non-refillable e-cigarette products by the reporting manufacturers declined from $\$ 74.7$ million in 2018 (representing $3.7 \%$ of total sales) to $\$ 69.3$ million in 2019 ( $2.6 \%$ of total sales) and $\$ 59.3$ million in 2020 ( $2.7 \%$ of total sales). It appears, however, there were new entrants selling disposable products and that contrary to the FTC's data, total sales for e-cigarette disposables have grown significantly. ${ }^{20}$

As reported in Table 3, the reporting companies sold or gave away 17.2 million disposable e-cigarettes to consumers in 2018, 16.1 million in 2019, and 13.3 million in 2020. Of those sales and giveaways, indirect sales accounted for $89.4 \%$ in $2018,89.4 \%$ in 2019 , and $88.0 \%$ in 2020. Giveaways were $0.5 \%$ in $2018,0.1 \%$ in 2019 , and $0.07 \%$ in 2020. Sales for $\$ 1$ or less represented $0.1 \%$ of disposables sold or given away in 2018 and 2019. In 2020, there

[^3]were virtually no sales of disposables for $\$ 1$ or less. Again, it appears that the data from the Order recipients alone paint an incomplete picture of disposable sales.

## Open System Products

As reported in Table 1, open system products have represented less than $0.1 \%$ of the sales of the reporting manufacturers since 2018. Open system products tend to be sold at specialized vape shops and it is likely that the reporting manufacturers account for only a fraction of the overall sales for such products.

Tables 4A and 4B provide information on the sales of open system products. As mentioned above, such product sales make up a small portion of sales by the reporting manufacturers. Therefore, those tables are not discussed in this report beyond noting that by 2020, the reporting manufacturers had apparently abandoned the open system market, with negative sales. ${ }^{21}$

## IV. CHARACTERISTICS OF E-CIGARETTE PRODUCTS

## Flavors

Tables 5A and 5B report the flavor characteristics of e-cigarette products sold or given away. The four primary flavor categories reported are tobacco flavors (e.g., absolute tobacco, classic tobacco, Carolina bold, and sweet original); mint (e.g., wintermint, spearmint, and wintergreen); menthol flavors (e.g., bold menthol); and "other" flavors. For 2015 through 2018, the Commission required the companies to report menthol and mint flavors in a single category; it asked the companies to report menthol and mint separately for 2019 and 2020. The tables provide breakdowns of the "other" flavors. The subcategories include alcohol flavors (e.g., bourbon blend, Havana wine, mimosa, and peach schnapps); beverage flavors (e.g., caramel

[^4]cafe, java jolt, chai, and lemon tea); candy or dessert flavors (e.g., mint chocolate, lemon poppy seed, apple crumble, and chestnut croissant); fruit flavors (e.g., cherry, strawberry, watermelon, and mixed berry); fruity mint or menthol flavors (e.g. strawberry mint, berry mint, pear mint, and iced fruit); spice flavors (e.g., vanilla, ginger, cinnamon, and aniseed); and other flavors that do not fit in any of the above categories.

Several events affected the data on flavors. In November 2018, Juul, the largest ecigarette manufacturer, stopped selling flavors other than tobacco, menthol, and mint in retail locations and, in October 2019, it stopped selling such "other" flavors online. ${ }^{22}$ In January 2020, FDA amended its enforcement policy guidance such that companies that continued to sell flavored cartridge-based products (other than tobacco and menthol flavored) could face prosecution for failure to have premarket authorization. ${ }^{23}$ The amended policy does not apply to disposable or open system products, which may have led to the surge in sales of disposables described below, particularly those that were "other" flavored.

In 2018, the most popular flavor category of e-cigarette cartridges was the "other" category, representing $42.1 \%$ of all cartridges sold or given away. The popularity of "other" flavored cartridges dropped to $14.3 \%$ of cartridges in 2019 and to $0.8 \%$ in 2020. The most popular subcategory of the "other" flavor category was fruit-flavored, which represented 29.7\%

[^5]of cartridges sold or given away in 2018, $11.5 \%$ in 2019 , and $0.8 \%$ in 2020. The popularity of mint and menthol-flavored cartridges combined grew from $36.9 \%$ in 2018 , to $60.8 \%$ in 2019 , and $63.5 \%$ in 2020. Mint accounted for $44.1 \%$ of cartridges sold or given away in 2019 and $-.06 \%$ in 2020. Menthol accounted for $16.7 \%$ of cartridges in 2019 and $63.5 \%$ in 2020. The percentage of tobacco-flavored cartridge products sold or given away grew from $21.0 \%$ in 2018 , to $24.9 \%$ in 2019, and $35.7 \%$ in 2020.

For completeness, the Commission is providing summaries of the data it received from the reporting manufacturers about disposable e-cigarettes, but as described above, disposables made up only a small percentage of the products sold by those manufacturers during this period and appear to not accurately represent the market for such products. According to the data collected from reporting manufacturers, the most popular flavor category of disposables in 2018 was the "other" flavor category, representing $37.4 \%$ of all devices sold or given away. The popularity of "other" flavored devices increased to $39.3 \%$ in 2019 and then decreased to $23.5 \%$ in 2020. The most popular subcategory of the "other" flavor category was fruit-flavored, which represented $33.2 \%$ of disposable devices sold or given away in 2018, $35.2 \%$ in 2019, and $18.4 \%$ in 2020. The popularity of mint and menthol-flavored disposables combined increased from $27.2 \%$ in 2018 to $29.7 \%$ in 2019 and $36.9 \%$ in 2020. Mint accounted for $7.4 \%$ of disposables in 2019 and $9.6 \%$ in 2020. Menthol accounted for $22.3 \%$ of disposables in 2019 and $27.3 \%$ in 2020. The percentage of tobacco flavored products decreased from $35.4 \%$ in 2018 to $31.0 \%$ in 2019, and then increased to $39.6 \%$ in 2020.

In contrast, information collected for the CDC Foundation by Information Resources, Inc. showed that, in December 2020, "other" flavored disposables made up 77.6\% of disposables
sold, mint made up $8.6 \%$, menthol $6.2 \%$, and tobacco only $7.6 \% .{ }^{24}$ New market entrants and reduced disposable offerings from the reporting manufacturers likely account for this discrepancy.

## Nicotine Concentrations

The Commission asked the reporting companies to provide the nicotine concentrations of each of their products as measured in milligrams of nicotine per milliliter (" $\mathrm{mg} / \mathrm{ml}$ ") of e-liquid. Tables 6A and 6B report nicotine concentration in ranges and averages. For cartridge products, the average nicotine concentration increased from $49.4 \mathrm{mg} / \mathrm{ml}$ in 2018 to $52.3 \mathrm{mg} / \mathrm{ml}$ in 2019 and then decreased to $51.2 \mathrm{mg} / \mathrm{ml}$ in 2020.

## Bundling

Tables 7A and 7B provide details with respect to the bundling of cartridge system products. In 2018, $97.7 \%$ of cartridges were distributed separately from a cartridge system device. This percentage grew to $99.1 \%$ in 2019 , and over $99.9 \%$ in 2020. In 2018, $26.1 \%$ of cartridges sold or given away were distributed in bundles containing two cartridges, which increased to $31.4 \%$ in 2019 and $43.8 \%$ in 2020. In 2018, $56.3 \%$ of cartridges were sold or given away together in bundles containing four cartridges. That increased to $63.2 \%$ in 2019 and then decreased to $55.1 \%$ in 2020. Few bundles contained more than four cartridges; only $0.007 \%$ in 2019 and $0 \%$ in 2020 of cartridges were sold or given away in bundles of five or more, down from 1.1\% in 2018.

The proportion of devices sold or given away together with cartridges declined from $63 \%$ in 2018 to $26.9 \%$ in 2019 and to $2.6 \%$ in 2020. Almost no cartridge system devices sold or given

[^6]away in 2019 were bundled together with other such devices and none were in 2020.
Table 8 provides details with respect to the bundling of disposable e-cigarette products. In 2019 and 2020, $2.1 \%$ and $1.2 \%$, respectively, of disposable e-cigarettes were sold or given away in bundles of five or more and the rest were distributed individually. In 2018, 3.7\% of disposables were sold or given away in bundles of five or more.

## V. ADVERTISING AND PROMOTIONAL EXPENDITURES BY CATEGORY

Tables 9A and 9B show the annual expenditures of the reporting manufacturers on e-cigarette advertising and promotion. ${ }^{25}$ The tables list the amounts spent on the different types of media advertising (e.g., magazines) and sales promotion activities (e.g., distribution of coupons). ${ }^{26}$

The reporting manufacturers spent $\$ 1.033$ billion on e-cigarette advertising and promotion in 2019, up from $\$ 643.5$ million in $2018 .{ }^{27}$ Total advertising and promotion then declined to $\$ 719.9$ million in 2020.

Spending on television advertising, which was $\$ 7.6$ million in 2018 , increased to $\$ 93.8$ million in 2019. This category includes advertising on broadcast, cable, and satellite television
${ }^{25}$ The reported figures include all advertising and promotional expenditures related to ecigarettes, regardless of whether such expenditures would constitute "commercial speech" or would be protected from law enforcement action under the First Amendment. They do not include the costs of employing full-time company employees or any overhead expenses attributable to the activities of such company employees. They do not include advertising that will only be seen or heard by the trade.
${ }^{26}$ Numerous expenditures could have been reported in more than one expenditure category. The Orders instructed the manufacturers in which category to report an expenditure when it fell in multiple categories, but often told them to do so "to the extent practicable." The Orders also said that expenditures should be included in only one category to the extent practicable.
${ }^{27}$ Definitions of the advertising and promotional expenditure categories appear in the Appendix to this report.
channels, Internet television (e.g., Hulu, Netflix, Amazon Prime), and webisodes, but does not include product placement. The Commission is not reporting the amount spent on television advertising in 2020 because only one company reported spending in that category. ${ }^{28}$

As in prior years, no company reported advertising e-cigarettes before or during movies in 2019 or 2020.

The Commission asked about radio advertising, including Internet radio, audio streaming services (e.g., Pandora and Spotify), and podcasts. The manufacturers reported spending \$54.2 million on radio advertising for e-cigarettes in 2019, up from $\$ 4.5$ million in 2018. Radio advertising expenditures then decreased to $\$ 10.2$ million in 2020.

The Commission is not reporting the amount spent on other audio-visual advertising in 2019 or 2020, as was the case with respect to 2018. The Commission defined other audio-visual advertising as audio and/or visual advertising other than TV, movie, or radio advertising, product placement, social media, endorsements, or transit advertising. It could include advertising on screens or monitors in commercial establishments, such as video arcades or retail shops, and video games.

In 2019 and 2020, the manufacturers reported spending nothing on product placement in the creative content of any program or performance. The Commission did not report product

[^7]In Table 9, "NA" appears where the Commission is not reporting the expenditure in a category for this reason. The unreported expenditures are included in the "Other" category.
placement expenditures in 2018.
Spending on company websites directed to persons located in the United States decreased from $\$ 11.6$ million in 2018 to $\$ 8$ million in 2019 and $\$ 4.7$ million in 2020.

The Commission inquired about advertising on company-controlled social media accounts or channels (e.g., Facebook, Twitter, Instagram, Snapchat, Reddit, and YouTube) directed to persons located in the United States, including company-authored posts and replies, and re-posts of other users' content. The category excludes expenses related to celebrities, social media influencers, or other endorsers. Expenditures in this category increased from $\$ 577,000$ in 2018 to $\$ 1.4$ million in 2019, and then decreased to $\$ 1.3$ million in 2020.

The reporting category "other Internet and digital advertising" could include, among other things, banner, display, pop-up, and native advertising on third-party Internet sites, search advertising, sponsored digital content, advertising using a short message service (SMS text), multimedia messaging (MMS), instant messaging (IM), and direct messaging (DM), and advertising viewed in apps or video games. Spending on other Internet and digital advertising increased from $\$ 22.3$ million in 2018 to $\$ 79.2$ million in 2019 and then decreased to $\$ 36.6$ million in 2020.

The reporting companies spent $\$ 6.8$ million in 2019 to procure endorsements of ecigarette products by celebrities, social media influencers, brand ambassadors, or other endorsers, up from $\$ 4.3$ million in 2018. The companies reported that they made no expenditures on endorsements in 2020.

The reporting manufacturers spent $\$ 16.1$ million on direct mail marketing in 2019, which decreased to $\$ 11.1$ million in 2020. The companies had spent $\$ 4.3$ million on direct mail marketing in 2018. Email marketing expenditures for e-cigarettes increased from \$430,000 in

2018 to $\$ 630,000$ in 2019 and then decreased to $\$ 165,000$ in 2020.
The companies reported spending $\$ 57.7$ million on newspaper advertising in 2019. Only one of them had newspaper advertising expenditures in 2018 or 2020, so the Commission is not reporting those expenditures.

The amount reported on magazine advertising of e-cigarettes rose from $\$ 5.2$ million in 2018 to $\$ 13$ million in 2019 and then declined to $\$ 2.7$ million in 2020. This category includes advertising appearing in digital editions of magazines that are nearly identical to print editions.

Spending on outdoor advertising rose from $\$ 1.0$ million in 2018 to $\$ 19.1$ million in 2019, then declined to $\$ 7.2$ million in 2020. Outdoor advertising includes billboards; signs and placards in arenas, stadiums, and shopping malls, whether they are open-air or enclosed; and any other advertising placed outdoors.

The manufacturers reported no spending in 2020 on transit advertising, that is advertising on or in private or public vehicles and ads placed at, on, or in any bus stop, taxi stand, transportation waiting area, subway or train station, airport, or any other transportation facility. Transit advertising expenditures were $\$ 667,000$ in 2018. The Commission is not reporting transit advertising expenditures in 2019.

Spending on point-of-sale advertising - advertising displayed or distributed at a physical retail location - went up from $\$ 45.9$ million in 2018 to $\$ 85.7$ million in 2019 , then declined to $\$ 61.8$ million in 2020.

The largest promotions spending category in 2018, 2019, and 2020 was price discounts paid to cigarette product retailers or wholesalers to reduce the price of e-cigarette products to consumers. The manufacturers reported spending $\$ 182.3$ million on price discounts in 2019 and $\$ 169.1$ million in 2020, up from $\$ 155.1$ million in 2018.

Promotional allowances paid to wholesalers declined from $\$ 141.4$ million in 2018 to $\$ 126.8$ million in 2019, when it was the second largest expenditure category, and $\$ 113.6$ million in 2020, when it was the third largest expenditure category. Examples of promotional allowances paid to wholesalers might include payments for volume rebates, incentive payments, value-added services, promotional execution, and satisfaction of reporting requirements.

Promotional allowances paid to retailers also declined from $\$ 73.9$ million in 2018 to $\$ 51.2$ million in 2019, before ticking back up to $\$ 56.8$ million in 2020. Examples of promotional allowances paid to retailers might include payments for stocking, shelving, displaying, and merchandising brands, slotting fees, volume rebates, incentive payments, and the cost of ecigarette products given to retailers for free for subsequent resale to consumers.

Price discounts and promotional allowances together represent $34.9 \%$ of advertising and promotional expenditures in 2019 and $47.2 \%$ in 2020, down from 57.5\% in 2018.

The reporting manufacturers spent $\$ 44.2$ million in 2019 on coupons to reduce the retail cost of e-cigarette products, up from $\$ 36.5$ million in 2018. Spending then declined to $\$ 19.3$ million in 2020.

The Commission asked the companies about retail-value-added expenditures promotions involving free products given to consumers at the point of sale, including online, in connection with a purchase of e-cigarette products. Some such promotions involve free ecigarette products (e.g., buy two, get one free or buy a device and get a free e-liquid) while others involve other free products (e.g., buy two, get a free $t$-shirt). Because only one company reported spending in this category, the Commission is not reporting the expenditures in 2019 or 2020 on retail-value-added promotions involving free e-cigarette products. The manufacturers reported spending $\$ 11.3$ million in 2018 on such promotions. The companies reported spending
\$3.1 million in 2020 on retail-value-added promotions involving items other than free e-cigarette products. The Commission is not reporting the expenditures on such promotions in 2018 or 2019.

The manufacturers reported that they spent nothing in 2019 or 2020 on branded specialty item distribution - that is, the selling or giving consumers items such as t-shirts, caps, sunglasses, key chains, or sporting goods bearing the brand name of an e-cigarette product. They spent $\$ 212,000$ in 2018 distributing such items. The companies also reported that, as in 2018, they made no expenditures in 2020 on specialty item distribution involving products not bearing an e-cigarette product brand name. The Commission is not reporting the expenditures on the distribution of such items in 2019 because only one company reported spending in this category. When the distribution of items, whether branded or non-branded, is combined with the sale of ecigarettes, the associated expenditures are reported as retail-value-added expenditures.

Sampling includes the distribution of free e-cigarette products and the distribution of e-cigarette products sold at a price of $\$ 1$ or less. ${ }^{29}$ Sampling includes the costs of the products themselves and all costs of organizing and conducting the sampling. The companies reported sampling spending of $\$ 111.9$ million in 2019 (the third largest expenditure category) and $\$ 140.1$ million in 2020 (the second largest expenditure category), up from $\$ 58.1$ million in 2018.

The Commission inquired about expenditures for public entertainment events (e.g.,

[^8]concerts or sporting events) that take place in adult-only facilities and that promote e-cigarette products. Expenditures in connection with such events grew from $\$ 2.3$ million in 2018 to $\$ 4.3$ million in 2019 and $\$ 10.1$ million in 2020. As in prior years, the companies did not report any expenditures in 2019 or 2020 on public entertainment events promoting e-cigarette products that took place outside of adult-only facilities. ${ }^{30}$

The manufacturers reported spending $\$ 16.1$ million in 2019 on consumer engagement (not involving the distribution of free e-cigarette products) that took place inside adult-only facilities, up from $\$ 12.8$ million in 2018. The companies reported spending nothing in this category in 2020. The Commission is not reporting expenditures in 2019 or 2020 on consumer engagement that took place outside of adult-only facilities, because, as in all prior years, only one company reported such expenditures.

Because only one company reported spending in this area, the Commission is not reporting expenditures in 2019 or 2020 on sponsoring sports teams or individual athletes. The companies reported that they did not sponsor sports teams or individual athletes in 2018.

Finally, the Commission inquired about expenditures related to advertising or promotion through college campus programs including the use of brand ambassadors, campus representatives, or on campus or off campus events or promotions. This category is duplicative of expenditures for other categories. For all reporting years, the manufacturers stated that they spent nothing on such college campus programs.

[^9]
## VI. PRODUCT PLACEMENT ${ }^{31}$

The Commission asked the e-cigarette manufacturers whether, in 2019 or 2020, they or their agents: compensated anyone engaged in product placement in motion pictures, television shows, video games, magazines, or other publications ("in creative content"); solicited the appearance of e-cigarettes in creative content, or paid money or other compensation (including free product) in connection with the appearance of any e-cigarette product brand imagery in creative content; or granted approval for the appearance of an e-cigarette product in creative content. All of the reporting companies said they had not engaged in any of those activities.

## VII. AGE VERIFICATION

All of the reporting companies maintained websites to advertise and sell their e-cigarette brands. The Commission inquired about any mechanisms used to deter entry onto those websites by underage persons. The companies used self-certification in 2019 and 2020, asking website visitors to confirm that they were either 18 or 21 years of age. ${ }^{32}$ Three of the companies required throughout the time period that individuals attest they were 21 years or older; in early 2019 , one company switched from requiring visitors to be 18 years of age to requiring them to be 21 ; and one company simply stated that it required visitors to certify they were "of legal age."

During 2019 and 2020, all of the reporting manufacturers used third-party age verification services before allowing customers to purchase e-cigarette products directly on their

[^10]websites. ${ }^{33}$ They collected information including name, date of birth, and address and/or telephone number and matched it to information in databases in order to verify that prospective customers were at least 21 years of age. The nature of age verification varied between the companies and over time. One company allowed the submission and matching of the last four digits of a consumer's Social Security number ("SSN digits") or the uploading of governmentissued identification ("ID") when a more general verification failed, but started, in 2020, to require all potential customers under 27 years of age to upload an ID. A second company required the submission and matching of SSN digits or the uploading of an ID together with a matching "selfie." A third company required the submission and matching of SSN digits or the completion of a knowledge-based authentication employing a series of multiple-choice questions referencing then-current and historical data derived primarily from government sources. The other two companies required matching of SSN digits, one throughout the time period and the other starting in January 2020. Two of the companies also noted that they used two-factor authentication, one starting in January 2019 and the other in August 2019. One company noted that its system locked the consumer's age-verified name, so a consumer could not use a different name in the credit card, billing address, or shipping address sections.

All of the companies reported that in 2019 and 2020 they followed state laws with respect to obtaining an adult signature upon delivery. One company stated that starting in February

[^11]2020, UPS required adult signatures for all e-cigarette product deliveries and that because of the extent of its use of UPS, almost all deliveries from that point on required adult signature. Another company reported that beginning in stages between April and October 2019, it also required adult signature for the first completed purchase on an account and any time there was a mismatch between the billing and shipping address on an order.

The Commission asked the manufacturers about their mechanisms to prevent underage individuals from joining their mailing lists and loyalty programs in 2019 and 2020. All the companies required consumers to be 21 years old to join their mailing lists or loyalty programs. To be on their mailing lists, three of the companies required third-party age verification, one required self-certification, and one relied on self-certification until March 2019, when it switched to third-party age verification.

Two companies said they had loyalty programs and a third said that it offered a nontraditional program through which participants could obtain discounts on up to two replacement devices per year. All three companies stated that they required third-party age verification in order to enroll in those programs.

## VIII. SOCIAL MEDIA ACCOUNTS

Two of the five companies said that in 2019 and 2020 they only used social media accounts for non-promotional communications, e.g., customer service. Three of the companies used social media accounts to promote their e-cigarette products in 2019 or 2020. Two companies said they maintained Twitter, Instagram, and Facebook accounts to advertise their ecigarette products, and one of them also used a YouTube account until December 2020. ${ }^{34}$ The

[^12]final company used a YouTube account to advertise e-cigarette products and also used Facebook and Instagram accounts between July 2019 and September 2020.

The companies that used social media accounts reported that they used tools made available by the social media platforms, which permit account holders to designate age restrictions. Before allowing an individual to access a company account, the platforms confirm that the individual meets the designated age - based either on the age the individual reported when creating a personal account for the platform or on an affirmation that the user was of a certain required legal age in response to a challenge question. One of the e-cigarette manufacturers reported that it hired a third party to manually review its social media followers and remove fraudulent profiles and those that appeared to be under 21 years of age.

## IX. AFFILIATES

Three of the five manufacturers said that they did not use online affiliate programs to market their e-cigarette products in 2019 or 2020. One company had an affiliate program that primarily partnered with deal websites such as Groupon or Slick Deals, but also used vaping blog affiliates. Another company had a limited affiliate program for four months during 2019 for the publication of promotional codes to be used for making purchases from its website.

## X. CELEBRITIES, INFLUENCERS, AND ENDORSERS

The FTC asked the companies whether they engaged in marketing using celebrities, social media influencers, or other endorsers (collectively "influencers") during 2019 or 2020. Two companies said that they did not use influencers. One said that it engaged influencers to publish product reviews online between January and March 2019. Another company utilized social media influencers and other adult endorsers until October 2019 to create content on the influencers' social media pages and on the company's websites and social media accounts. The
final company ran consumer testimonials in 2019, hired radio personalities to share their switching stories, and until September 2019, had an endorsement arrangement with a talk show host. None of the companies reported using influencers in 2020.

One company said that it reviewed all paid influencer social media posts before and after they were posted. A second company said its legal department was involved in reviewing and overseeing certain influencer messaging and content prior to publication. A third company said it reviewed all influencer scripts.

Table 1
Total Product Sales and Percentages of Total Sales
(2015-2020)

|  | 2015 |  | 2016 |  | 2017 |  | 2018 |  |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Total sales | $\$ 304,170,139$ |  | $\$ 487,791,646$ |  | $\$ 782,269,969$ |  | $\$ 2,045,622,966$ |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Cartridge systems | $\$ 259,984,551$ | $85.47 \%$ | $\$ 417,302,598$ | $85.55 \%$ | $\$ 707,415,500$ | $90.43 \%$ | $\$ 1,969,019,051$ | $96.26 \%$ |
| Disposables | $\$ 44,185,495$ | $14.53 \%$ | $\$ 68,404,886$ | $14.02 \%$ | $\$ 72,420,899$ | $9.26 \%$ | $\$ 74,683,954$ | $3.65 \%$ |
| Open systems | $\$ 92$ | $0.00 \%$ | $\$ 2,084,163$ | $0.43 \%$ | $\$ 2,427,812$ | $0.31 \%$ | $\$ 1,535,492$ | $0.08 \%$ |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Indirect sales | $\$ 268,574,337$ | $88.30 \%$ | $\$ 436,160,722$ | $89.42 \%$ | $\$ 690,224,679$ | $88.23 \%$ | $\$ 1,883,091,677$ | $92.05 \%$ |
| Direct sales | $\$ 35,480,901$ | $11.66 \%$ | $\$ 50,047,078$ | $10.26 \%$ | $\$ 90,605,887$ | $11.58 \%$ | $\$ 131,274,855$ | $6.42 \%$ |
| Sales for $\$ 1$ or <br> less | $\$ 114,901$ | $0.04 \%$ | $\$ 1,583,847$ | $0.32 \%$ | $\$ 1,439,403$ | $0.18 \%$ | $\$ 31,256,434$ | $1.53 \%$ |


|  | 2019 |  | 2020 |  |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Total sales | $\$ 2,702,811,187$ |  | $\$ 2,223,795,406$ |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| Cartridge <br> systems | $\$ 2,633,333,620$ | $97.43 \%$ | $\$ 2,164,546,108$ | $97.34 \%$ |
| Disposables | $\$ 69,274,687$ | $2.56 \%$ | $\$ 59,250,133$ | $2.66 \%$ |
| Open systems | $\$ 193,583$ | $0.01 \%$ | $-\$ 834$ | $0.00 \%$ |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| Indirect sales | $\$ 2,476,210,392$ | $91.62 \%$ | $\$ 2,052,886,910$ | $92.31 \%$ |
| Direct sales | $\$ 219,856,446$ | $8.13 \%$ | $\$ 157,595,133$ | $7.09 \%$ |
| Sales for $\$ 1$ or <br> less | $\$ 6,744,349$ | $0.25 \%$ | $\$ 13,313,364$ | $0.60 \%$ |

Table 2A
Cartridge System Sales and Giveaways and Percentages of Total Sales (2015-2018)


Table 2B
Cartridge System Sales and Giveaways and Percentages of Total Sales (2019-2020)

|  | 2019 |  | 2020 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Cartridge system sales | \$2,633,333,620 |  | \$2,164,546,108 |  |
| Cartridge sales | \$2,195,797,626 | 83.38\% | \$2,080,565,721 | 96.12\% |
| Device sales | \$304,839,736 | 11.58\% | \$81,203,408 | 3.75\% |
| Cartridge \& device bundle sales | \$132,696,259 | 5.04\% | \$2,729,832 | 0.13\% |
| Indirect sales | \$2,415,511,724 | 91.73\% | \$2,003,415,959 | 92.56\% |
| Direct sales | \$211,101,250 | 8.02\% | \$147,816,787 | 6.83\% |
| \$1 sales | \$6,720,647 | 0.26\% | \$13,313,362 | 0.62\% |
| Total cartridges sold \& given away | 976,656,877 |  | 943,180,991 |  |
| Cartridges sold indirectly | 919,757,576 | 94.17\% | 901,905,290 | 95.62\% |
| Cartridges sold directly | 56,601,584 | 5.80\% | 41,239,688 | 4.37\% |
| Cartridges sold for $\$ 1$ or less | 109,205 | 0.01\% | 6,333 | 0.00\% |
| Cartridges given away | 188,512 | 0.02\% | 29,680 | 0.00\% |
| Total devices sold \& given away | 33,851,529 |  | 21,042,495 |  |
| Devices sold indirectly | 25,010,441 | 73.88\% | 7,234,693 | 34.38\% |
| Devices sold directly | 684,560 | 2.02\% | 355,837 | 1.69\% |
| Devices sold for \$1 or less | 8,067,283 | 23.83\% | 13,447,132 | 63.90\% |
| Devices given away | 89,245 | 0.26\% | 4,833 | 0.02\% |

Table 3
Disposable Sales and Giveaways and Percentages of Total Sales
(2015-2020)

|  | 2015 |  | 2016 |  | 2017 |  | 2018 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Disposable sales | \$44,185,495 |  | \$68,404,886 |  | \$72,420,899 |  | \$74,683,954 |  |
| Indirect sales | \$43,410,770 | 98.25\% | \$67,178,662 | 98.21\% | \$66,396,135 | 91.68\% | \$66,058,562 | 88.45\% |
| Direct sales | \$774,726 | 1.75\% | \$1,226,224 | 1.79\% | \$6,024,764 | 8.32\% | \$8,544,270 | 11.44\% |
| Sales for \$1 or less | \$0 | 0.00\% | \$0 | 0.00\% | \$0 | 0.00\% | \$81,123 | 0.11\% |
| Total sold \& given away | 7,802,219 |  | 12,879,262 |  | 15,838,443 |  | 17,226,341 |  |
| Indirect sales | 7,727,777 | 99.05\% | 12,635,814 | 98.11\% | 14,609,115 | 92.24\% | 15,402,865 | 89.41\% |
| Direct sales | 58,144 | 0.75\% | 157,888 | 1.23\% | 1,221,223 | 7.24\% | 1,706,549 | 9.91\% |
| Sales for \$1 or less | 0 | 0.00\% | 0 | 0.00\% | 0 | 0.00\% | 22,752 | 0.13\% |
| Given away | 16,298 | 0.21\% | 85,560 | 0.66\% | 8,105 | 0.05\% | 94,175 | 0.55\% |


|  | 2019 |  | 2020 |  |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Disposable <br> sales | $\$ 69,274,687$ |  | $\$ 59,250,133$ |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| Indirect <br> sales | $\$ 60,574,533$ | $87.44 \%$ | $\$ 49,474,662$ | $83.50 \%$ |
| Direct sales | $\$ 8,676,452$ | $12.52 \%$ | $\$ 9,775,469$ | $16.50 \%$ |
| Sales for \$1 <br> or less | $\$ 23,702$ | $0.03 \%$ | $\$ 2$ | $0.00 \%$ |
|  | $16,072,942$ |  | $13,270,159$ |  |
| Total sold <br> \& given <br> away | $14,366,110$ | $89.38 \%$ | $11,679,252$ | $88.01 \%$ |
| Indirect <br> sales | $2,662,942$ | $10.35 \%$ | $1,581,200$ | $11.92 \%$ |
| Direct sales | $2.15 \%$ | 2 | $0.00 \%$ |  |
| Sales for \$1 <br> or less | 19,934 | $0.12 \%$ | 9,705 | $0.07 \%$ |
| Given away |  |  |  |  |

Table 4A
Open System Sales and Giveaways and Percentages of Total Sales (2015-2018)

|  | 2015 |  | 2016 |  | 2017 |  | 2018 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Open system sales | \$92 |  | \$2,084,163 |  | \$2,427,812 |  | \$1,535,492 |  |
| E-liquid sales | \$57 | 65.52\% | \$815,107 | 39.14\% | \$1,347,033 | 55.46\% | \$1,147,756 | 74.75\% |
| Device sales | \$0 | 0.00\% | \$1,182,794 | 56.80\% | \$951,038 | 39.16\% | \$314,167 | 20.46\% |
| E-liquid \& device bundle sales | \$30 | 34.48\% | \$84,427 | 4.05\% | \$130,800 | 5.39\% | \$73,586 | 4.79\% |
| Indirect sales | \$62 | 67.39\% | \$1,857,643 | 89.13\% | \$1,487,524 | 61.27\% | \$1,020,130 | 66.44\% |
| Direct sales | \$30 | 32.61\% | \$226,519 | 10.87\% | \$940,288 | 38.73\% | \$515,362 | 33.56\% |
| Sales for \$1 or less | \$0 | 0.00\% | \$0 | 0.00\% | \$0 | 0.00\% | \$0 | 0.00\% |
| Total e-liquids sold \& given away | 1,135 |  | 200,543 |  | 261,665 |  | 193,862 |  |
| E-liquids indirect sales | 1,134 | 99.91\% | 157,439 | 78.51\% | 171,184 | 65.37\% | 121,526 | 62.69\% |
| E-liquids direct sales | 1 | 0.09\% | 43,091 | 21.49\% | 89,526 | 34.27\% | 54,632 | 28.18\% |
| E-liquids sold for \$1 or less | 0 | 0.00\% | 0 | 0.00\% | 0 | 0.00\% | 0 | 0.00\% |
| E-liquids given away | 0 | 0.00\% | 13 | 0.01\% | 955 | 0.36\% | 17,704 | 9.13\% |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Total devices sold \& given away | 1 |  | 197,368 |  | 112,573 |  | 40,664 |  |
| Devices indirect sales | 0 | 0.00\% | 177,778 | 90.07\% | 82,128 | 72.96\% | 23,980 | 58.97\% |
| Devices direct sales | 1 | 100.00\% | 19,589 | 9.93\% | 30,292 | 26.91\% | 16,682 | 41.02\% |
| Devices sold for \$1 or less | 0 | 0.00\% | 0 | 0.00\% | 0 | 0.00\% | 0 | 0.00\% |
| Devices given away | 0 | 0.00\% | 1 | 0.00\% | 153 | 0.14\% | 2 | 0.00\% |

Table 4B
Open System Sales and Giveaways and Percentages of Total Sales (2019-2020)

|  | 2019 |  | 2020 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Open system sales | \$193,583 |  | -\$834 |  |
| E-liquid sales | \$144,259 | 91.70\% | -\$2,185 | 261.78\% |
| Device sales | -\$8,915 | -5.67\% | -\$1,527 | 182.99\% |
| E-liquid \& device bundle sales | \$21,966 | 13.96\% | \$2,877 | -344.77\% |
| Indirect sales | \$124,135 | 64.12\% | -\$3,712 | 444.77\% |
| Direct sales | \$69,448 | 35.88\% | \$2,877 | -344.77\% |
| Total e-liquids sold \& given away | 15,653 |  | -63 |  |
| E-liquids indirect sales | 13,422 | 85.75\% | -205 | 324.92\% |
| E-liquids direct sales | 2,231 | 14.25\% | 142 | -224.92\% |
| Total devices sold \& given away | 778 |  | 24 |  |
| Devices indirect sales | -553 | -71.00\% | -118 | -485.44\% |
| Devices direct sales | 1,331 | 171.00\% | 142 | 585.44\% |

[^13]Table 5A
Percentages of Cartridges, Disposables, and E-Liquid Containers with Various Flavors (2015-2018)

|  | 2015 | 2016 | 2017 | 2018 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Cartridge flavors |  |  |  |  |
| Tobacco | 47.24\% | 39.80\% | 34.26\% | 20.96\% |
| Menthol or Mint | 39.00\% | 38.04\% | 36.26\% | 36.90\% |
| All other | 13.76\% | 22.16\% | 29.47\% | 42.14\% |
| -Alcohol | 0.11\% | 0.14\% | 0.04\% | 0.03\% |
| -Beverage | 3.56\% | 4.07\% | 5.37\% | 3.47\% |
| -Candy/Dessert | 4.47\% | 7.26\% | 6.67\% | 4.38\% |
| -Fruit | 4.72\% | 8.95\% | 15.27\% | 29.70\% |
| -Fruit \& Menthol/Mint | 0.00\% | 0.02\% | 0.19\% | 0.09\% |
| -Spice | 0.90\% | 1.72\% | 1.04\% | 0.50\% |
| -Other | 0.00\% | 0.00\% | 0.88\% | 3.96\% |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| Disposable flavors |  |  |  |  |
| Tobacco | 52.05\% | 45.64\% | 38.52\% | 35.44\% |
| Menthol or Mint | 25.95\% | 22.42\% | 25.72\% | 27.16\% |
| All other | 22.00\% | 31.94\% | 35.76\% | 37.40\% |
| -Candy/Dessert | 0.00\% | 0.00\% | 0.07\% | 0.12\% |
| -Fruit | 22.00\% | 26.81\% | 31.96\% | 33.16\% |
| -Spice | 0.00\% | 0.00\% | 3.73\% | 4.12\% |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| E-liquid bottle flavors |  |  |  |  |
| Tobacco | 12.78\% | 35.07\% | 32.97\% | 27.94\% |
| Menthol or Mint | 14.45\% | 30.15\% | 36.12\% | 28.04\% |
| All other | 72.78\% | 34.78\% | 30.91\% | 44.02\% |
| -Alcohol | 8.46\% | 0.18\% | 0.26\% | 0.12\% |
| -Beverage | 0.00\% | 0.69\% | 1.62\% | 15.27\% |
| -Candy/Dessert | 30.66\% | 1.97\% | 4.68\% | 2.32\% |
| -Fruit | 27.31\% | 28.52\% | 18.10\% | 21.47\% |
| -Fruit \& Menthol/Mint | 0.00\% | 2.09\% | 3.20\% | 1.10\% |
| -Spice | 3.17\% | 1.31\% | 3.06\% | 3.74\% |
| -Other | 3.17\% | 0.03\% | 0.00\% | 0.00\% |

Table 5B
Percentages of Cartridges, Disposables, and E-Liquid Containers with Various Flavors (2019-2020)

|  | 2019 | 2020 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Cartridge flavors |  |  |
| Tobacco | 24.93\% | 35.70\% |
| Menthol | 16.67\% | 63.53\% |
| Mint | 44.13\% | -0.06\% |
| All other | 14.27\% | 0.83\% |
| -Alcohol | 0.00\% | 0.00\% |
| -Beverage | 1.11\% | 0.03\% |
| -Candy/Dessert | 0.74\% | 0.00\% |
| -Fruit | 11.53\% | 0.79\% |
| -Fruit \&Menthol/Mint | 0.34\% | 0.00\% |
| -Spice | 0.31\% | 0.02\% |
| -Other | 0.23\% | 0.00\% |
|  |  |  |
| Disposable flavors |  |  |
| Tobacco | 31.04\% | 39.62\% |
| Menthol | 22.30\% | 27.29\% |
| Mint | 7.37\% | 9.59\% |
| All other | 39.29\% | 23.49\% |
| -Candy/Dessert | 0.02\% | 0.00\% |
| -Fruit | 35.25\% | 18.45\% |
| -Spice | 4.03\% | 5.04\% |
|  |  |  |
| E-liquid bottle flavors |  |  |
| Tobacco | 21.67\% | -122.10\% |
| Menthol | 20.64\% | 138.58\% |
| Mint | 0.06\% | 0.00\% |
| All other | 57.62\% | 83.52\% |
| -Alcohol | -0.15\% | -7.81\% |
| -Beverage | 29.38\% | -98.43\% |
| -Candy/Dessert | -0.41\% | 21.90\% |
| -Fruit | 10.71\% | 121.44\% |
| -Fruit \& Menthol/Mint | 0.00\% | 0.00\% |
| -Spice | 2.91\% | 30.79\% |
| -Other | 15.18\% | 0.00\% |

* Negative sales represent returns of products sold in a prior year.

Table 6A

## Percentages of Cartridges, Disposables, and E-Liquid Containers Within Various Nicotine Concentration Ranges and Their Average Nicotine Concentrations Measured in Milligrams of Nicotine per Milliliter of E-liquid

(2015-2018)

|  | 2015 | 2016 | 2017 | 2018 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Cartridges - nicotine concentration |  |  |  |  |
| 0 | 0.21\% | 0.18\% | 0.03\% | 0.02\% |
| 1-10.99 | 0.58\% | 0.46\% | 0.01\% | 0.01\% |
| 11-20.99 | 11.42\% | 6.75\% | 8.21\% | 13.07\% |
| 21-30.99 | 15.52\% | 16.05\% | 10.67\% | 5.65\% |
| 31-40.99 | 0.82\% | 10.72\% | 20.62\% | 9.21\% |
| 41-50.99 | 0.00\% | 0.18\% | 1.33\% | 0.91\% |
| 51-60.99 | 71.44\% | 65.66\% | 59.13\% | 71.13\% |
| Average | 47.46 | 47.23 | 46.79 | 49.41 |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| Disposables - nicotine concentration |  |  |  |  |
| 0 | -0.06\% | 0.13\% | 0.00\% | 0.00\% |
| 11-20.99 | 28.72\% | 7.17\% | 1.93\% | 0.00\% |
| 21-30.99 | 71.34\% | 92.57\% | 68.91\% | 55.07\% |
| 31-40.99 | 0.00\% | 0.00\% | 1.20\% | 2.35\% |
| 41-50.99 | 0.00\% | 0.01\% | 7.16\% | 4.37\% |
| 51-60.99 | 0.00\% | 0.11\% | 18.49\% | 28.25\% |
| 61-70.99 | 0.00\% | 0.00\% | 2.31\% | 9.95\% |
| Average | 25.04 | 27.06 | 34.53 | 39.53 |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| E-liquid Bottle - nicotine concentration |  |  |  |  |
| 0 | 0.00\% | 1.06\% | 1.06\% | 1.62\% |
| 1-10.99 | 27.22\% | 89.37\% | 53.36\% | 35.19\% |
| 11-20.99 | 13.13\% | 2.83\% | 32.60\% | 11.49\% |
| 21-30.99 | 0.00\% | 6.30\% | 12.98\% | 30.77\% |
| 31-40.99 | 29.60\% | 0.23\% | 0.00\% | 0.00\% |
| 41-50.99 | 0.00\% | 0.00\% | 0.00\% | 20.94\% |
| 51-60.99 | 30.04\% | 0.22\% | 0.00\% | 0.00\% |
| Average | 32.35 | 7.75 | 11.84 | 21.83 |

Table 6B
Percentages of Cartridges, Disposables, and E-Liquid Containers Within Various Nicotine Concentration Ranges and Their Average Nicotine Concentrations Measured in Milligrams of Nicotine per Milliliter of E-liquid
(2019-2020)

|  | 2019 |  |
| :--- | ---: | ---: |
|  |  | 2020 |
| Cartridges - nicotine concentration |  |  |
| 0 | $0.02 \%$ | $0.01 \%$ |
| $1-10.99$ | $0.01 \%$ | $0.00 \%$ |
| $11-20.99$ | $4.82 \%$ | $5.49 \%$ |
| $21-30.99$ | $5.51 \%$ | $10.60 \%$ |
| $31-40.99$ | $11.77 \%$ | $9.24 \%$ |
| $41-50.99$ | $0.01 \%$ | $0.00 \%$ |
| $51-60.99$ | $77.86 \%$ | $74.66 \%$ |
| Average | 52.31 | 51.22 |
|  |  |  |
| Disposables - nicotine concentration |  |  |
| 0 | $0.00 \%$ | $0.00 \%$ |
| $11-20.99$ | $0.00 \%$ | $0.00 \%$ |
| $21-30.99$ | $49.13 \%$ | $54.65 \%$ |
| $31-40.99$ | $2.14 \%$ | $-0.20 \%$ |
| $41-50.99$ | $6.42 \%$ | $1.67 \%$ |
| $51-60.99$ | $27.97 \%$ | $23.30 \%$ |
| $61-70.99$ | $14.35 \%$ | $20.58 \%$ |
| Average | 41.74 | 41.90 |
|  |  |  |
| E-liquid Bottle - nicotine concentration |  |  |
| 0 | $7.06 \%$ |  |
| $1-10.99$ | $-5.99 \%$ | $316.08 \%$ |
| $11-20.99$ | $-5.33 \%$ | $292.76 \%$ |
| $21-30.99$ | $42.16 \%$ | $-224.92 \%$ |
| $31-40.99$ | $0.00 \%$ | $0.00 \%$ |
| $41-50.99$ | $62.10 \%$ | $-285.10 \%$ |
| Average | 38.81 | -124.79 |
|  |  |  |

[^14]Table 7A
Bundling of Cartridge System Components
(2015-2018)

|  | 2015 | 2016 | 2017 | 2018 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| \% Devices bundled with cartridges | 97.10\% | 95.40\% | 88.12\% | 63.03\% |
| \% Devices not bundled with cartridges | 2.90\% | 4.60\% | 11.88\% | 36.97\% |
| \% Cartridges bundled with devices | 4.88\% | 4.13\% | 3.33\% | 2.31\% |
| \% Cartridges not bundled with devices | 95.12\% | 95.87\% | 96.67\% | 97.69\% |
| \# of devices bundled together |  |  |  |  |
| 1 device | 100.01\% | 100.00\% | 99.98\% | 100.00\% |
| 2 or more devices | -0.01\% | 0.00\% | 0.02\% | 0.00\% |
| \# of cartridges bundled together |  |  |  |  |
| 1 cartridge | 4.50\% | 4.30\% | 5.05\% | 4.88\% |
| 2 cartridges | 71.77\% | 69.16\% | 58.42\% | 26.06\% |
| 3 cartridges | 3.58\% | 14.83\% | 11.41\% | 11.64\% |
| 4 cartridges | 1.31\% | 4.27\% | 22.05\% | 56.33\% |
| 5 cartridges | 18.84\% | 7.44\% | 0.09\% | 0.02\% |
| 6 or more cartridges | 0.00\% | 0.00\% | 2.98\% | 1.06\% |

Table 7B
Bundling of Cartridge System Components
(2019-2020)

|  | 2019 | 2020 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| \% Devices bundled with cartridges | 26.90\% | 2.55\% |
| \% Devices not bundled with cartridges | 73.10\% | 97.45\% |
| \% Cartridges bundled with devices | 0.93\% | 0.03\% |
| \% Cartridges not bundled with devices | 99.07\% | 99.97\% |
| \# of devices bundled together |  |  |
| 1 device | 100.00\% | 100.00\% |
| 2 or more devices | 0.00\% | 0.00\% |
| \# of cartridges bundled together |  |  |
| 1 cartridge | 1.63\% | 0.66\% |
| 2 cartridges | 31.41\% | 43.83\% |
| 3 cartridges | 3.73\% | 0.44\% |
| 4 cartridges | 63.23\% | 55.07\% |
| 5 cartridges | 0.00\% | 0.00\% |
| 6 or more cartridges | 0.00\% | 0.00\% |

Table 8
Percentages of Disposables Sold or Given Away Individually or in Bundles (2015-2020)

|  | 2015 | 2016 | 2017 | 2018 |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 | $100.00 \%$ | $100.00 \%$ | $92.29 \%$ | $96.30 \%$ |
| 5 | $0.00 \%$ | $0.00 \%$ | $2.70 \%$ | $3.70 \%$ |
| 20 | $0.00 \%$ | $0.00 \%$ | $2.06 \%$ | $0.00 \%$ |
| 100 | $0.00 \%$ | $0.00 \%$ | $2.95 \%$ | $0.00 \%$ |


|  | 2019 | 2020 |
| :--- | ---: | ---: |
|  |  |  |
| 1 | $97.91 \%$ | $98.81 \%$ |
| 5 | $1.89 \%$ | $0.72 \%$ |
| 20 | $0.20 \%$ | $0.47 \%$ |
| 100 | $0.00 \%$ | $0.00 \%$ |

Table 9A

## Advertising and Promotional Expenditures (2015-2018)

|  | 2015 | 2016 | 2017 | 2018 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| TV advertising | \$18,765,588 | \$13,706,190 | \$5,994,063 | \$7,590,297 |
| Movie advertising | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Radio advertising | \$1,949,099 | \$1,519,965 | \$1,308,292 | \$4,505,002 |
| Other audio-visual advertising | \$0 | \$0 | N/A | N/A |
| Product placement | N/A | \$113,012 | N/A | N/A |
| Company Internet sites | \$5,171,616 | \$7,888,889 | \$8,888,138 | \$11,616,875 |
| Social media | N/A | N/A | \$779,291 | \$577,285 |
| Other Internet and digital advertising | \$6,389,902 | \$8,908,004 | \$12,392,570 | \$22,315,874 |
| Endorsements | \$287,950 | \$104,381 | \$4,431,029 | \$4,287,431 |
| Direct mail marketing | N/A | N/A | \$1,249,778 | \$4,325,312 |
| Email marketing | \$66,648 | \$225,703 | \$152,984 | \$430,359 |
| Newspaper advertising | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | N/A |
| Magazine advertising | \$2,451,090 | \$7,072,483 | \$4,884,538 | \$5,240,440 |
| Outdoor advertising | \$969,603 | \$2,815,302 | \$2,854,201 | \$1,028,472 |
| Transit advertising | N/A | \$3,453,245 | \$2,319,535 | \$666,682 |
| Point-of-sale advertising | \$13,365,702 | \$26,462,177 | \$21,445,036 | \$45,872,667 |
| Price discounts | \$11,184,584 | \$33,709,537 | \$33,648,290 | \$155,124,847 |
| Promotional allowances paid to retailers | \$28,430,304 | \$36,305,608 | \$40,944,305 | \$73,852,950 |
| Promotional allowances paid to wholesalers | \$21,072,195 | \$29,273,783 | \$52,326,119 | \$141,375,232 |
| Coupons for reduction of purchase price | \$22,788,155 | \$20,395,598 | \$27,154,852 | \$36,461,104 |
| Retail-value-added - free e-cigarette products | \$60,115 | \$5,616,750 | \$10,586,295 | \$11,311,627 |
| Retail-value-added - free items other than ecigarette Products | N/A | N/A | \$0 | N/A |
| Specialty item distribution - branded | N/A | N/A | N/A | \$211,770 |
| Specialty item distribution - not branded | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Sampling | \$22,962,323 | \$32,439,417 | \$14,153,277 | \$58,083,793 |
| Public entertainment - adult-only facilities | N/A | \$3,024,758 | N/A | \$2,303,716 |
| Public entertainment - not adult-only facilities | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Consumer engagement - adult-only facilities | \$1,613,769 | \$8,537,860 | \$1,701,784 | \$12,771,648 |
| Consumer engagement - not adult-only facilities | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A |
| Sponsorship | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 |
| All other | \$40,280,324 | \$29,401,798 | \$31,341,033 | \$43,587,550 |
| Total reportable expenditures | \$197,808,967 | \$270,974,462 | \$278,555,410 | \$643,540,932 |
| Campus promotion | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 |

Table 9B
Advertising and Promotional Expenditures (2019-2020)

|  | 2019 | 2020 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| TV advertising | \$93,786,067 | N/A |
| Movie advertising | \$0 | \$0 |
| Radio advertising | \$54,182,097 | \$10,243,086 |
| Other audio-visual advertising | N/A | N/A |
| Product placement | \$0 | \$0 |
| Company Internet sites | \$7,972,951 | \$4,720,225 |
| Social media | \$1,370,151 | \$1,255,990 |
| Other Internet and digital advertising | \$79,185,896 | \$36,632,537 |
| Endorsements | \$6,792,765 | \$0 |
| Direct mail marketing | \$16,112,008 | \$11,148,762 |
| Email marketing | \$630,821 | \$164,761 |
| Newspaper advertising | \$57,746,568 | N/A |
| Magazine advertising | \$12,967,789 | \$2,744,355 |
| Outdoor advertising | \$19,076,783 | \$7,196,454 |
| Transit advertising | N/A | \$0 |
| Point-of-sale advertising | \$85,709,226 | \$61,769,932 |
| Price discounts | \$182,269,887 | \$169,074,590 |
| Promotional allowances paid to retailers | \$51,163,171 | \$56,780,807 |
| Promotional allowances paid to wholesalers | \$126,783,783 | \$113,626,836 |
| Coupons for reduction of purchase price | \$44,154,292 | \$19,283,623 |
| Retail-value-added - free e-cigarette products | N/A | N/A |
| Retail-value-added - free items other than ecigarette Products | N/A | \$3,070,220 |
| Specialty item distribution - branded | \$0 | \$0 |
| Specialty item distribution - not branded | N/A | \$0 |
| Sampling | \$111,860,067 | \$140,074,983 |
| Public entertainment - adult-only facilities | \$4,265,926 | \$10,052,027 |
| Public entertainment - not adult-only facilities | \$0 | \$0 |
| Consumer engagement - adult-only facilities | \$16,134,780 | \$0 |
| Consumer engagement - not adult-only facilities | N/A | N/A |
| Sponsorship | N/A | N/A |
| All other | \$60,847,782 | \$75,178,082 |
| Total reportable expenditures | \$1,033,012,809 | \$719,947,048 |
| Campus promotion | \$0 | \$0 |

## APPENDIX <br> Advertising and Promotional Expenditure Categories for 2019 and 2020

TV Advertising: Advertising on broadcast, cable, and satellite television channels, Internet television (e.g., Hulu, Netflix, Amazon Prime), and webisodes (e.g., web shows on YouTube), including spot ads, long-form commercials, and sponsored programming; but excluding, to the extent practicable, expenditures in connection with Product Placement, Social Media, Endorsements, or Public Entertainment (Adult-Only and Not Adult-Only).

Movie Advertising: Advertising spots before or during movies, including in movie theaters, on DVDs, and streamed movies (e.g., a movie streamed on Hulu); but excluding, to the extent practicable, expenditures in connection with TV Advertising, Product Placement, or Endorsements.

Radio Advertising: Advertising on broadcast, satellite, Internet radio, audio streaming services (e.g., Pandora and Spotify), and podcasts, including spot ads, long-form commercials, and sponsored programming; but excluding, to the extent practicable, expenditures in connection with Product Placement, Social Media, or Endorsements.

Other Audio-Visual Advertising: Audio, audio-visual, and video advertising not covered by TV Advertising, Movie Advertising, Radio Advertising, Product Placement, Social Media, Endorsements, or Transit Advertising, including advertising on screens or monitors in commercial establishments, such as video arcades or retail shops, and video games.

Product Placement: All expenditures for product placement in the creative content of any program or performance (e.g., movies, television shows, Internet series, video games, and other broadcast and digital media).

Company Internet Sites: All expenditures for any Company-owned or -operated Internet site, or any site operated on its behalf, that contains information about the Company's e-cigarette products, and that is directed to persons located in the United States; but excluding, to the extent practicable, expenditures in connection with Email Marketing, Coupons for Reduction of Purchase Price, Public Entertainment - Not Adult-Only Facilities, or Sponsorship.

Social Media: Advertising on any Company-controlled social media account or channel (e.g., Facebook, Twitter, Instagram, Snapchat, Reddit, YouTube) that is directed to persons located in the United States, including Company-authored posts and replies, and re-posts of other users' content on Company-controlled accounts or channels; but excluding expenses related to celebrities, social media influencers, brand ambassadors, or other endorsers endorsing e-cigarette products, which should be reported as Endorsements.

Other Internet and Digital Advertising: All expenditures for Internet or digital advertising directed to persons located in the United States that are not covered by TV Advertising, Movie Advertising, Radio Advertising, Other Audio-Visual Advertising, Product Placement, Social Media, Endorsements, or Email Marketing, including banner, display, pop-up, and
native advertising on third-party Internet sites, search advertising, sponsored digital content, advertising using a short message service (SMS text), multimedia (MMS) messaging, instant messaging (IM), and direct messaging (DM), and advertising viewed in apps or video games; but excluding, to the extent practicable, expenditures in connection with Coupons, Retail-Value-Added (Free E-Cigarette Products and Other Free Items), Specialty Item Distribution (Branded and Not Branded), Sampling, Public Entertainment (Adult-Only and Not AdultOnly), Consumer Engagement (Adult-Only and Not Adult-Only), or Sponsorship.

Endorsements: All expenditures to procure the mention or use of e-cigarette products by a celebrity, social media influencer, or other endorser, in any situation; but excluding expenditures related to an actor mentioning or using an e-cigarette product when assuming the role of a character, which should be reported as Product Placements.

Direct Mail Marketing: Direct mail marketing; but excluding, to the extent practicable, expenditures in connection with Endorsements, Email Marketing, Coupons, Retail-ValueAdded (Free E-Cigarette Products and Other Free Items), Specialty Item Distribution (Branded and Not Branded), Sampling, Public Entertainment (Adult-Only and Not AdultOnly), Consumer Engagement (Adult-Only and Not Adult-Only), or Sponsorship.

Newspaper Advertising: Newspaper advertising, including print advertising and native advertising; but excluding, to the extent practicable, expenditures in connection with Endorsements, Coupons, Retail-Value-Added (Free E-Cigarette Products and Other Free Items), Specialty Item Distribution (Branded and Not Branded), Sampling, Public Entertainment (Adult-Only and Not Adult-Only), Consumer Engagement (Adult-Only and Not Adult-Only), or Sponsorship. To the extent that advertising appearing in print editions of newspapers also appears in nearly identical digital editions of the newspapers, such expenditures should be reported here, but other advertising on a newspaper website should be reported in Other Internet and Digital Advertising.

Magazine Advertising: Magazine advertising, including print advertising and native advertising; but excluding, to the extent practicable, expenditures in connection with Endorsements, Coupons, Retail-Value-Added (Free E-Cigarette Products and Other Free Items), Specialty Item Distribution (Branded and Not Branded), Sampling, Public Entertainment (Adult-Only and Not Adult-Only), Consumer Engagement (Adult-Only and Not Adult-Only), or Sponsorship. To the extent that advertising appearing in print editions of magazines also appears in nearly identical digital editions of the magazines, such expenditures should be reported here, but other advertising on a magazine website should be reported in Other Internet and Digital Advertising.

Outdoor Advertising: Billboards; signs and placards in arenas, stadiums, and shopping malls, whether any of the foregoing are open-air or enclosed; and any other advertising placed outdoors, regardless of their size; but excluding, to the extent practicable, expenditures in connection with Endorsements, Transit Advertising, Point-of-Sale Advertising, Coupons, Retail-Value-Added (Free E-Cigarette Products and Other Free Items), Specialty Item Distribution (Branded and Not Branded), Sampling, Public Entertainment (Adult-Only and Not Adult-Only), Consumer Engagement (Adult-Only and

Not Adult-Only), or Sponsorship. Expenditures for advertising placed inside physical retail locations, whether facing inward or outward, which should be reported in Point-of-Sale Advertising.

Transit Advertising: Advertising on or within private or public vehicles and all advertisements placed at, on or within any bus stop, taxi stand, transportation waiting area, subway or train station, airport or any other transportation facility; but excluding, to the extent practicable, expenditures in connection with Endorsements, Outdoor Advertising, Coupons, Retail-Value-Added (Free E-Cigarette Products and Other Free Items), Specialty Item Distribution (Branded and Not Branded), Sampling, Public Entertainment (Adult-Only and Not Adult-Only), Consumer Engagement (Adult-Only and Not Adult-Only), or Sponsorship.

Point-of-Sale Advertising: Advertising materials displayed or distributed at a physical retail location; but excluding, to the extent practicable, expenditures in connection with in store video advertising (which should be reported as Other Audio-Visual Advertising), Coupons, Retail-Value-Added (Free E-Cigarette Products and Other Free Items), Specialty Item Distribution (Branded and Not Branded), Sampling, Public Entertainment (Adult-Only and Not Adult-Only), Consumer Engagement (Adult-Only and Not Adult-Only), or Sponsorship.

Price Discounts: Expenditures paid to e-cigarette product retailers or wholesalers to reduce the price of e-cigarette products to consumers, including off invoice discounts, buy downs, voluntary price reductions, and trade programs; but excluding, to the extent practicable, expenditures in connection with Coupons or Retail-Value-Added - Free E-Cigarette Products.

Promotional Allowances Paid to Retailers: All expenditures for promotional allowances paid to E-Cigarette Product retailers to facilitate the sale or placement of any E-Cigarette Product, including, but not limited to, payments for stocking, shelving, displaying, and merchandising brands, slotting fees, volume rebates, incentive payments, and the cost of E-Cigarette Products given to retailers for free for subsequent resale to consumers; but excluding, to the extent practicable, expenditures in connection with Other Audio-Visual Advertising, Other Internet and Digital Advertising, Direct Mail Marketing, Newspaper Advertising, Magazine Advertising, Outdoor Advertising, Point-of-Sale Advertising, and Price Discounts.

Promotional Allowances Paid to Retailers: All expenditures for promotional allowances paid to E-Cigarette Product retailers to facilitate the sale or placement of any E-Cigarette Product, including, but not limited to, payments for volume rebates, incentive payments, value-added services, promotional execution, and satisfaction of reporting requirements; but excluding, to the extent practicable, expenditures in connection with Other Audio-Visual Advertising, Other Internet and Digital Advertising, Direct Mail Marketing, Newspaper Advertising, Magazine Advertising, Outdoor Advertising, Point-of-Sale Advertising, and Price Discounts.

Coupons for Reduction of Purchase Price: All expenditures associated with coupons used to reduce the retail cost of e-cigarette products (whether distributed in person, by mail, online, or otherwise and whether redeemed at the point of sale, by mail, online, or otherwise), including all redemption expenses and costs associated with promoting, designing, printing, and distributing the coupons. This includes coupons with offers such as "buy 2 e-cigarette products and get $50 \%$ off the price of a third product." Coupons for free e-cigarette products or for e-cigarette products sold at a price of $\$ 1$ or less, with no purchase or payment required to obtain the coupons are reported as Sampling.

Retail-value-added - Free E-Cigarette Products: All expenditures associated with promotions involving free e-cigarette products that are given to consumers at the point of sale, including online, in connection with a purchase of e-cigarette products (e.g., buy two, get one free or buy a device and get free e-liquid), whether or not the free products are physically bundled together with the purchased products. For e-cigarette products bundled together to be reported in this category, one or more of the products in the bundle must be promoted as free.

Retail-value-added - Free Items Other Than E-Cigarette Products: All expenditures associated with promotions involving free items other than e-cigarette products that are given to consumers at the point of sale, including online, in connection with a purchase of ecigarette products (e.g., buy two, get a free t-shirt), whether or not the free products are physically bundled together with the purchased products. For product bundles to be reported in this category, the products in the bundle that are not e-cigarette products must be promoted as free.

Specialty Item Distribution - Branded: All costs of distributing any items (other than e-cigarette products, written or electronic publications, and items whose sole function is to advertise or promote e-cigarette products) that bear the name, logo, or an image of any portion of the package of any e-cigarette product, when the items are not given to consumers at the point of sale (e.g., a branded umbrella redeemed with loyalty program points). The expenditures reported are the net cost to the Company, i.e., payments received from consumers for such items should be deducted.

Specialty Item Distribution - Not Branded: All costs of distributing any items (other than e-cigarette products, written or electronic publications, and items whose sole function is to advertise or promote e-cigarette products) that do not bear the name, logo, or an image of any portion of the package of any e-cigarette product, when the items are not given to consumers at the point of sale (e.g., a gift card to an online music retailer redeemed with loyalty program points). The expenditures reported are the net cost to the Company, i.e., payments received from consumers for such items should be deducted.

Sampling: All costs of sampling of e-cigarette products, including the costs of the products themselves and all costs of organizing, promoting, and conducting the sampling. Sampling includes the distribution of e-cigarette products sold at a price of $\$ 1$ or less. Sampling also includes the distribution of e-cigarette products for consumer testing or evaluation when consumers are able to use the products outside of a facility owned or operated by the

Company or its agents, but not the cost of actual clinical testing or market research associated with such distributions. Coupons distributed for free e-cigarette products or e-cigarette products sold at a price of $\$ 1$ or less, with no purchase or payment required to obtain the coupons, should be reported in this category.

Public entertainment - Adult-Only Facilities: All expenditures for public entertainment events (including, but not limited to, concerts and sporting events) referring or relating to ecigarette products that take place in an Adult-Only Facility, includes expenditures promoting or sponsoring such events. Whenever such activities are combined with the consumer engagement in adult-only facilities, the expenditures connected with consumer engagement should be reported solely in Consumer Engagement - Adult-Only Facilities.

Public Entertainment - Not Adult-Only Facilities: All expenditures for public entertainment events (including, but not limited to, concerts and sporting events) referring or relating to e-cigarette products, at facilities that are open to persons under the legal age, including expenditures promoting or sponsoring such events. Whenever such activities are combined with the consumer engagement in facilities open to persons under the legal age, the expenditures connected with consumer engagement should be reported solely in Consumer Engagement - Not Adult-Only Facilities.

Consumer Engagement - Adult-Only Facilities: All expenditures for consumer engagement in adult-only facilities, when such activities do not involve the distribution of free e-cigarette products, e-cigarette products sold at a price of $\$ 1$ or less, or coupons for free e-cigarette products or e-cigarette products sold at a price of $\$ 1$ or less with no purchase or payment required to obtain the coupons, including any third-party agency fees, and excluding the cost of any coupons distributed.

Consumer Engagement - Not Adult-Only Facilities: All expenditures for consumer engagement at facilities open to persons under the legal age, when such activities do not involve the distribution of free e-cigarette products, e-cigarette products sold at a price of \$1 or less, or coupons for free e-cigarette products or e-cigarette products sold at a price of $\$ 1$ or less with no purchase or payment required to obtain the coupons, including any third-party fees, and excluding the cost of any coupons distributed in the course of consumer engagement activities.

Sponsorship: All expenditures for sponsorship of sports teams or individual athletes; but excluding, to the extent practicable, expenditures in connection with Endorsements. This category excludes expenditures promoting or sponsoring sporting events, which should be reported as Public Entertainment (Adult-Only or Not Adult-Only).

All Other: All expenditures for any advertising or promotional expenditures not covered by another reporting category.

Campus Promotion: All expenditures related to advertising or promotion through college campus programs, including but not limited to, compensation to campus representatives or brand ambassadors, expenditures for organizing, promoting, or conducting any campus
events or promotions, whether on campus or off campus, and all expenditures for implementing such programs or events. This category is duplicative of expenditures for other categories.


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ In 2018, 8.1 million adults in the United States or $3.2 \%$ of adults were current e-cigarette users, while $20.8 \%$ of high school students and $4.9 \%$ of middle school students were current ecigarette users.

[^1]:    ${ }^{2}$ CDC Foundation, Monitoring U.S. E-Cigarette Sales: National Trends, October 2020, https://www.cdcfoundation.org/E-cigaretteSalesDataBrief?inline (based upon Information Resources, Inc. data). Between February 2020, when FDA's flavor policy became effective, and October 2020, the market share of cartridges decreased from $81.1 \%$ to $67.8 \%$ and the market share of disposables increased from $18.8 \%$ to $32.1 \%$.

    3 "Enforcement Priorities for Electronic Nicotine Delivery Systems (ENDS) and Other Deemed Products on the Market Without Premarket Authorization" (January 7, 2020; 85 FR 720) (available at https://www.fda.gov/regulatory-information/search-fda-guidance-documents/enforcement-priorities-electronic-nicotine-delivery-system-ends-and-other-deemed-products-market).

[^2]:    4 Hannah Hammond, Disposable E-Cigarette Sales Take Off, CSP Daily News, Feb. 11, 2021, https://www.cspdailynews.com/tobacco/disposable-e-cigarette-sales-take\#page=0.

    5 CDC Foundation, Monitoring E-Cigarette Use Among Youth, aggregate data through 10/31/21, https://www.cdcfoundation.org/programs/monitoring-e-cigarette-use-among-youth.

    6 Wang TW, Neff LJ, Park-Lee E, et al., "E-Cigarette Use Among Middle School and High School Students - United States - 2020;" Morbidity and Mortality Weekly, 69(37); 1310-1312 (2020).

    7 Id. In 2020, some e-cigarette products were sold in packaging that "imitate[d] packaging for food products that often are marketed and appeal to youth, such as Cinnamon Toast Crunch cereal, Twinkies, Cherry Coke and popcorn." "FDA Notifies Companies, Including Puff Bar, to Remove Flavored Disposable E-Cigarettes and Youth-Appealing E-Liquids from Market for Not Having Required Authorization," (July 20, 2020) (available at https://www.fda.gov/news-events/press-announcements/fda-notifies-companies-including-puff-bar-remove-flavored-disposable-e-cigarettes-and-youth).
    ${ }^{8}$ U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Preventing Tobacco Use Among Youth and Young Adults. A Report of the Surgeon General (2012), at 524.

[^3]:    ${ }^{20}$ Based on Nielsen data, it appears that unit sales of disposable e-cigarettes grew $211.8 \%$ between November 2019 and November 2020, having grown 12.3\% the year before. See Hannah Hammond, Disposable E-Cigarette Sales Take Off, CSP Daily News, Feb. 11, 2021, https://www.cspdailynews.com/tobacco/disposable-e-cigarette-sales-take\#page=0.

[^4]:    ${ }^{21}$ Negative sales represent returns of products sold in a prior year.

[^5]:    ${ }^{22}$ See, e.g., Matthew Perrone, Juul halts sales of fruit, dessert flavors for e-cigarettes, Associated Press, Oct. 17, 2019, https://apnews.com/article/d3beff8e79934a828edf35de0ba4c2a3.

    23 "Enforcement Priorities for Electronic Nicotine Delivery Systems (ENDS) and Other Deemed Products on the Market Without Premarket Authorization" (January 7, 2020; 85 FR 720) (available at https://www.fda.gov/regulatory-information/search-fda-guidance-documents/enforcement-priorities-electronic-nicotine-delivery-system-ends-and-other-deemed-products-market).

[^6]:    ${ }^{24}$ CDC Foundation, Monitoring E-Cigarette Use Among Youth, aggregate data through 10/31/21, https://www.cdcfoundation.org/programs/monitoring-e-cigarette-use-among-youth.

[^7]:    ${ }^{28}$ If only one company reported spending money on a particular type of advertising or promotion in a year, the Commission is not reporting that expenditure in order to avoid potential disclosure of individual company data. For this reason, the Commission is not separately reporting the amount(s) spent in 2019, 2020, or either year on television advertising, "other audio-visual" advertising, endorsements, newspaper advertising, transit advertising, retail-valueadded promotions involving free e-cigarette products, retail-value-added promotions involving free items other than e-cigarette products, non-branded specialty item distribution, consumer engagement that took place outside of adult-only facilities, and sponsorship.

[^8]:    ${ }^{29}$ Highly discounted sales became more popular following the 2016 effective date of FDA's Deeming Regulation, which asserted jurisdiction over all tobacco products and, among other things, prohibited free sampling of tobacco products. See Deeming Tobacco Products To Be Subject to the Federal Food, Drug, and Cosmetic Act, as Amended by the Family Smoking Prevention and Tobacco Control Act; Restrictions on the Sale and Distribution of Tobacco Products and Required Warning Statements for Tobacco Products, 81 Fed. Reg. 28974 (May 10, 2016).

[^9]:    ${ }^{30}$ Some expenses related to public entertainment events could have been reported under the sampling category.

[^10]:    ${ }^{31}$ See Federal Trade Commission E-Cigarette Report for 2015-2018 for discussions of the e-cigarette manufacturers' activities in prior years with respect to: product placement; age verification; social media accounts; affiliates; and celebrities, influencers, and endorsers.
    ${ }^{32}$ In 2019, amendments to the Food, Drug, and Cosmetics Act raised the nationwide minimum legal sales age for tobacco products from 18 years to 21 years. See 21 U.S.C. § 906(d)(5).

[^11]:    ${ }^{33}$ In March 2021, the Preventing Online Sales of E-Cigarettes to Children Act took effect, prohibiting the United States Postal Service from shipping e-cigarette products and requiring online e-cigarette sellers to verify the age of consumers through commercially available (or similar) databases and obtain proof of age from persons accepting delivery. As reported, other carriers such as DHL, FedEx and the United Parcel Service ("UPS") have also implemented bans on shipping e-cigarette products. Therefore, direct sales are likely to significantly decline in 2021.

[^12]:    ${ }^{34}$ Twitter, Facebook/Instagram, and YouTube do not themselves sell e-cigarette or tobacco advertising.

[^13]:    * Negative sales represent returns of products sold in a prior year.

[^14]:    * Negative sales represent returns of products sold in a prior year.

