

PUBLIC

**UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
BEFORE THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES**

**In the Matter of**  
  
**The Kroger Company,**  
  
**and**  
  
**Albertson Companies Inc.,**  
  
**Respondents.**

**DOCKET NO. 9428**

**NON-PARTY VALLARTA FOOD ENTERPRISES, INC.'S UNOPPOSED MOTION  
TO EXTEND THE TIME TO MOVE TO QUASH OR LIMIT SUBPOENA**

Non-party Vallarta Food Enterprises, Inc. (“Vallarta”), by and through its undersigned counsel, hereby moves, pursuant to Rules 3.22, 3.34, and 4.3 of the Federal Trade Commission’s (“FTC”) Rules of Practice for Adjudicative Proceedings, to further extend its time to move to quash or limit the Subpoena for Production of Documentary Material (“Subpoena”) issued by the FTC in the above-captioned proceeding on April 15, 2024.

In support thereof, Vallarta states as follows:

The Subpoena was served on Vallarta on April 15, 2024.

By order dated May 23, 2024, the time for Vallarta to file a motion to quash or to limit subpoena was extended to May 30, 2024.

Counsel for Vallarta and counsel for the FTC continued to engage in negotiations regarding the scope of the Subpoena and the time required for Vallarta to produce responsive documents. Following the meet and confer on April 24, 2024, the parties’ counsel met again on April 30, May 10, May 21, and June 10, 2024. On June 10, counsel for the FTC informed Vallarta’s counsel that the FTC will not oppose this motion for a further six (6) days extension of Vallarta’s deadline to object or otherwise move to limit or quash the subpoena.

**PUBLIC**

This further extension that has been agreed upon to afford Vallarta sufficient time to negotiate with counsel for the FTC regarding reasonable limitations and modifications of the Subpoena to reduce the burden on Vallarta of responding as a third party and thereby potentially avoid the necessity of filing a motion to quash or to limit the Subpoena.

Accordingly, Vallarta respectfully requests that this unopposed motion to extend the time to file a motion to quash or limit the Subpoena be granted and that Vallarta be given until June 19, 2024, to file any such motion. A proposed order granting the requested relief is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

DATED this 12<sup>th</sup> day of June, 2024.

Respectfully submitted,

*/s/ Alexander H. Merritt* \_\_\_\_\_

Alexander H. Merritt

GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP  
1050 Connecticut Avenue, N.W., Washington, D.C. 20036-  
5306  
Telephone: (202) 831-6163

**PUBLIC****CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE AND ELECTRONIC FILING**

I hereby certify that on June 12, 2024, a true and correct copy of the foregoing document and the accompanying proposed order were filed electronically with the Federal Trade Commission using the Commission's E-Filing System, and a notification of such filing with a courtesy copy of the forgoing document was sent by email to:

April Tabor  
Office of the Secretary Federal Trade Commission  
600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, Rm. H-113  
Washington, DC 20580  
ElectronicFilings@ftc.gov

The Honorable D. Michael Chappell  
Chief Administrative Law Judge  
Federal Trade Commission  
600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N. W., Rm. H-110  
Washington, D.C. 20580  
oalj@ftc.gov

I also hereby certify that on June 12, 2024, I caused a true and correct PDF copy of the foregoing document to be served by email to:

Charles Dickinson  
James H. Weingarten  
Emily Blackburn  
Paul Frangie  
Laura Hall  
Janet Kim  
Kenneth A. Libby  
Eric Olson  
Rohan Pai  
Harris Rothman  
Albert Teng  
Elizabeth Arens  
Jacob Hamburger  
Joshua Smith  
Katherine Bies  
Lily E. Hough

**PUBLIC**

Katharine Drummonds  
Federal Trade Commission Bureau of Competition  
600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20580  
cdickinson@ftc.gov  
jweingarten@ftc.gov  
eblackburn@ftc.gov  
pfrangie@ftc.gov  
lhall1@ftc.gov  
jkim3@ftc.gov  
klibby@ftc.gov  
eolson@ftc.gov  
rpai@ftc.gov  
hrothman@ftc.gov  
ateng@ftc.gov  
earens@ftc.gov  
jhamburger1@ftc.gov  
jsmith3@ftc.gov  
kbies@ftc.gov  
lthough@ftc.gov  
kdrummonds@ftc.gov

*Complaint Counsel*

Michael B. Bernstein  
Matthew Wolf  
Sonia Pfaffenroth  
Joshua Davis  
Michael Kientzle  
Jason Ewart  
Yasmine Harik  
Christina Cleveland  
Arnold & Porter Kaye Scholer LLP  
601 Massachusetts Ave, NW  
Washington, DC 20001  
Telephone: (202) 942-5227  
michael.b.bernstein@arnoldporter.com  
matthew.wolf@arnoldporter.com  
sonia.pfaffenroth@arnoldporter.com  
joshua.davis@arnoldporter.com  
michael.kientzle@arnoldporter.com  
jason.ewart@arnoldporter.com  
yasmine.harik@arnoldporter.com

John Holler  
Arnold & Porter Kaye Scholer LLP  
250 West 55th Street  
New York, NY 10019  
Telephone: (212) 836-7739  
john.holler@arnoldporter.com

**PUBLIC**

Mark Perry  
Luke Sullivan  
Weil, Gotshal & Manges LLP  
2001 M Street, NW, Suite 600  
Washington, DC 20036  
Telephone: (202) 682-7511  
mark.perry@weil.com  
luke.sullivan@weil.com

Luna Barrington  
Weil, Gotshal & Manges LLP  
767 Fifth Avenue  
New York, NY 10153  
Telephone: (212) 310-8421  
luna.barrington@weil.com

Bambo Obaro  
Weil, Gotshal & Manges LLP  
200 Redwood Shores Parkway  
Redwood Shores, CA 94065  
Telephone: (650) 802-3083  
bambo.obaro@weil.com

*Counsel for The Kroger Company*

Edward Hassi  
Debevoise & Plimpton LLP  
801 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20004  
Telephone: (202) 383-8135  
thassi@debevoise.com

Michael Schaper  
Shannon R. Selden  
J. Robert Abraham  
Natascha Born  
Jaime Freilich-Fried  
Marieugenia Cardenas  
Tom E. Buckley  
Heather T. Mehler  
Marie Ventimiglia  
Debevoise & Plimpton LLP  
66 Hudson Boulevard  
New York, NY 10001  
Telephone: (212) 909-6737  
mschaper@debevoise.com  
srselden@debevoise.com  
jrabraham@debevoise.com  
nborn@debevoise.com  
jmfried@debevoise.com

**PUBLIC**

mcarden@debevoise.com  
tebuckley@debevoise.com  
htmehler@debevoise.com  
msventim@debevoise.com

Mike Cowie  
James Fishkin  
Dechert LLP 1900 K Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20006  
Telephone: (202) 261-3339  
mike.cowie@dechert.com  
james.fishkin@dechert.com

Thomas Miller  
Dechert LLP  
Cira Centre  
2929 Arch Street  
Philadelphia, PA 19104  
Telephone: (215) 994-2906  
thomas.miller@dechert.com

George L. Paul  
White & Case LLP  
701 13th Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20005  
Telephone: (202) 626-3656  
gpaul@whitecase.com

*Counsel for Albertsons Companies, Inc.*

DATED this 12th day of June, 2024.

/s/ Alexander H. Merritt

Alexander H. Merritt

GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP  
1050 Connecticut Avenue, N.W., Washington, D.C. 20036-  
5306  
Telephone: (202) 831-6163

PUBLIC

**EXHIBIT A**  
**UNITED STATES OF AMERICA**  
**BEFORE THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION**  
**OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES**

**In the Matter of**

**The Kroger Company,**

**and**

**Albertson Companies Inc.,**

**Respondents.**

**DOCKET NO. 9428**

**[PROPOSED] ORDER GRANTING VALLARTA FOOD ENTERPRISES, INC.'S UNOPPOSED MOTION TO EXTEND THE TIME TO MOVE TO QUASH OR LIMIT SUBPOENA**

Before the Administrative Law Judge is the Unopposed Motion to Extend the Time to File a Motion to Quash, or in the alternative to Limit the Subpoena for Production of Documents (“Subpoena”) that the Federal Trade Commission (“FTC”) Complaint Counsel served on nonparty Vallarta Food Enterprises, Inc. (“Vallarta”) on or about April 15, 2024. Vallarta requests a further extension to through and including June 19, 2024, to file any such motion to quash and/or limit, or to otherwise serve objections to the Subpoena. Having considered the motion, and the fact that it is unopposed by FTC Complaint Counsel, this Court finds that the motion should be, and hereby is, GRANTED.

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that the deadline for Vallarta to file any Motion to Quash and/or Limit the Subpoenas is extended to through and including June 19, 2024.

Signed this [ ] day of June, 2024.

---

D. Michael Chappell  
Chief Administrative Law Judge