UNITED STATES OF AMERICA BEFORE THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES

)	
In the Matter of:)	
)	Docket No. 9428
The Kroger Company and)	
Albertsons Companies, Inc.)	
)	
)	

UNOPPOSED MOTION FOR EXTENSION OF TIME FOR VITAMIN COTTAGE NATURAL FOOD MARKETS, INC. TO MOVE TO QUASH OR TO LIMIT SUBPOENA

Non-Party Vitamin Cottage Natural Food Markets, Inc. ("Natural Grocers") moves to further extend the time for Natural Grocers to file a motion to quash or to limit a subpoena served on it by Complaint Counsel for the Federal Trade Commission ("Complaint Counsel"). In support thereof, Natural Grocers states as follows:

- 1. On April 2, 2024, Complaint Counsel sent Natural Grocers, via email, a Subpoena *Duces Tecum* (the "Subpoena") containing requests for documents, with a response date of April 25, 2024.
- 2. By order dated April 17, 2024, the time for Natural Grocers to file a motion to quash or to limit the subpoena was extended to April 22, 2024
- 3. By order dated April 23, 2024, the time for Natural Grocers to file a motion to quash or to limit the subpoena was further extended to May 3, 2024.
- 4. By order dated May 2, 2024, the time for Natural Grocers to file a motion to quash or to limit the subpoena was further extended to May 14, 2024.
- 5. By order dated May 14, 2024, the time for Natural Grocers to file a motion to quash or to limit the subpoena was further extended to May 28, 2024.

6. Counsel for Natural Grocers and Complaint Counsel continue to be engaged in

negotiations regarding the scope of the Subpoena and the time required for Natural

Grocers to produce responsive documents. The parties' counsel first spoke on April 12,

2024, which was the earliest available time to discuss the Subpoena. On April 15, 2024,

Natural Grocers made an initial production to Complaint Counsel. The parties' counsel

met again on April 18, 2024, April 24, 2024, May 3, 2024, May 9, 2024, May 17, 2024,

and May 22, 2024. The parties' counsel have agreed to continue their discussions.

7. To facilitate further negotiations, Natural Grocers requests that this Court grant

Natural Grocers until June 11, 2024, to file a motion to quash or to limit the Subpoena.

Complaint Counsel has extended the return date of the subpoena to June 4, 2024, and does

not oppose this request.

8. This extension has been agreed upon to afford Natural Grocers' counsel sufficient

time to negotiate with Complaint Counsel regarding reasonable limitations and

modifications of the Subpoena to reduce the burden on Natural Grocers of responding and

thereby to potentially avoid the necessity of filing a motion to quash or to limit the

Subpoena.

Dated: May 28, 2024

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Hartmut Schneider

Hartmut Schneider

Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale and Dorr LLP 2100 Pennsylvania Avenue NW

Washington, D.C. 20037

Phone: 202.663.6948

hartmut.schneider@wilmerhale.com

Counsel for Natural Grocers

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on May 28, 2024, pursuant to Federal Trade Commission Rules of Practice 4.2(c) and 4.4(b), I filed the foregoing document electronically using the FTC's E-Filing system, which will send notification of such filing to:

The Honorable D. Michael Chappell
Chief Administrative Law Judge
Office of Administrative Law Judges
Federal Trade Commission
600 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Washington DC 20580
OALJ@ftc.gov and electronicfilings@ftc.gov

James H. Weingarten or designee Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20580 (202) 326-3570

I further certify that on May 28, 2024, I caused the foregoing document to be served via email to:

Charles Dickinson

James H. Weingarten

Emily Blackburn

Paul Frangie

Laura Hall

Janet Kim

Kenneth A. Libby

Eric Olson

Rohan Pai

Harris Rothman

Albert Teng

Elizabeth Arens

Jacob Hamburger

Joshua Smith

Katherine Bies Lily E. Hough Katharine Drummonds Federal Trade Commission Bureau of Competition 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20580 cdickinson@ftc.gov jweingarten@ftc.gov eblackburn@ftc.gov pfrangie@ftc.gov lhall1@ftc.gov jkim3@ftc.gov klibby@ftc.gov eolson@ftc.gov rpai@ftc.gov hrothman@ftc.gov ateng@ftc.gov earens@ftc.gov jhamburger1@ftc.gov jsmith3@ftc.gov kbies@ftc.gov lhough@ftc.gov kdrummonds@ftc.gov

Complaint Counsel

Michael B. Bernstein Matthew Wolf Sonia Pfaffenroth Joshua Davis Michael Kientzle Jason Ewart Yasmine Harik Christina Cleveland Arnold & Porter Kaye Scholer LLP 601 Massachusetts Ave, NW Washington, DC 20001 Telephone: (202) 942-5227 michael.b.bernstein@arnoldporter.com matthew.wolf@arnoldporter.com sonia.pfaffenroth@arnoldporter.com joshua.davis@arnoldporter.com michael.kientzle@arnoldporter.com jason.ewart@arnoldporter.com yasmine.harik@arnoldporter.com

John Holler Arnold & Porter Kaye Scholer LLP 250 West 55th Street New York, NY 10019 Telephone: (212) 836-7739 john.holler@arnoldporter.com

Mark Perry Luke Sullivan Weil, Gotshal & Manges LLP 2001 M Street, NW, Suite 600 Washington, DC 20036 Telephone: (202) 682-7511 mark.perry@weil.com luke.sullivan@weil.com

Luna Barrington Weil, Gotshal & Manges LLP 767 Fifth Avenue New York, NY 10153 Telephone: (212) 310-8421 luna.barrington@weil.com

Bambo Obaro Weil, Gotshal & Manges LLP 201 Redwood Shores Parkway Redwood Shores, CA 94065 Telephone: (650) 802-3083 bambo.obaro@weil.com

Counsel for The Kroger Company

Edward Hassi Debevoise & Plimpton LLP 801 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20004 Telephone: (202) 383-8135 thassi@debevoise.com

Michael Schaper Shannon R. Selden J. Robert Abraham Natascha Born Jaime Freilich-Fried Marieugenia Cardenas Tom E. Buckley Heather T. Mehler

Marie Ventimiglia
Debevoise & Plimpton LLP
66 Hudson Boulevard
New York, NY 10001
Telephone: (212) 909-6737
mschaper@debevoise.com
srselden@debevoise.com
jrabraham@debevoise.com
jmfried@debevoise.com
mcardena@debevoise.com
tebuckley@debevoise.com
htmehler@debevoise.com
msventim@debevoise.com

Mike Cowie
James Fishkin
Dechert LLP
1900 K Street, NW
Washington, DC 20006
Telephone: (202) 261-3339
mike.cowie@dechert.com
james.fishkin@dechert.com

Thomas Miller
Dechert LLP
Cira Centre 2929 Arch Street
Philadelphia, PA 19104
Telephone: (215) 994-2906
thomas.miller@dechert.com

George L. Paul White & Case LLP 701 13th Street, NW Washington, DC 20005 Telephone: (202) 626-3656 gpaul@whitecase.com

Counsel for Albertsons Companies, Inc.

Dated: May 28, 2024 Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Hartmut Schneider

Hartmut Schneider

Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale and Dorr LLP 2100 Pennsylvania Avenue NW Washington, D.C. 20037 Phone: 202.663.6948 hartmut.schneider@wilmerhale.com

Counsel for Natural Grocers

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA BEFORE THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES

In the Matter of: Docket No. 9428 The Kroger Company and Docket No. 9428 The Kroger Companies, Inc. Docket No. 9428 The Kroger Company and Docket No. 9428 The Kroger Company			
The Kroger Company and Albertsons Companies, Inc. PROPOSED ORDER GRANTING UNOPPOSED MOTION FOR EXTENSION OF TIME TO MOVE TO QUASH OR TO LIMIT SUBPOENA DUCES TECUTOR On May 28, 2024, non-party Vitamin Cottage Natural Food Markets, I ("Natural Grocers") filed a motion to further extend its time to move to quash or limit subpoena duces tecum ("Subpoena") issued by Complaint Counsel on April 2, 20 ("Motion"). Complaint Counsel does not oppose the relief requested in the Motion. Under FTC Rule of Practice 3.34(c), any motion to limit or quash a subpoena must be filed within 10 days of receipt of the subpoena. 16 C.F.R. § 3.34(c). Pursuant to F Rule 4.3(b), the Administrative Law Judge, except in circumstances not here present may extend any time limit prescribed by the rules "[f]or good cause shown." 16 C.F.R 4.3(b). Based on the representations in the Motion, Natural Grocers has demonstrate good cause for the requested extension. Accordingly, the Motion is GRANTED and in the Proposed Council of the Subpoena is extended to June 11, 2024. ORDERED: D. Michael Chappell Chief Administrative Law Judge)	
The Kroger Company and Albertsons Companies, Inc. PROPOSED ORDER GRANTING UNOPPOSED MOTION FOR EXTENSION OF TIME TO MOVE TO QUASH OR TO LIMIT SUBPOENA DUCES TECU On May 28, 2024, non-party Vitamin Cottage Natural Food Markets, I ("Natural Grocers") filed a motion to further extend its time to move to quash or limit subpoena duces tecum ("Subpoena") issued by Complaint Counsel on April 2, 20 ("Motion"). Complaint Counsel does not oppose the relief requested in the Motion. Under FTC Rule of Practice 3.34(c), any motion to limit or quash a subpoena me be filed within 10 days of receipt of the subpoena. 16 C.F.R. § 3.34(c). Pursuant to FRule 4.3(b), the Administrative Law Judge, except in circumstances not here present may extend any time limit prescribed by the rules "[f]or good cause shown." 16 C.F.R 4.3(b). Based on the representations in the Motion, Natural Grocers has demonstrated good cause for the requested extension. Accordingly, the Motion is GRANTED and in hereby ORDERED that Natural Grocers' deadline for filing any motion to quash or linthe Subpoena is extended to June 11, 2024. ORDERED: D. Michael Chappell Chief Administrative Law Judge	In the Matter of:)	
PROPOSED ORDER GRANTING UNOPPOSED MOTION FOR EXTENSION OF TIME TO MOVE TO QUASH OR TO LIMIT SUBPOENA DUCES TECUTOR On May 28, 2024, non-party Vitamin Cottage Natural Food Markets, I ("Natural Grocers") filed a motion to further extend its time to move to quash or limit subpoena duces tecum ("Subpoena") issued by Complaint Counsel on April 2, 20 ("Motion"). Complaint Counsel does not oppose the relief requested in the Motion. Under FTC Rule of Practice 3.34(c), any motion to limit or quash a subpoena must be filed within 10 days of receipt of the subpoena. 16 C.F.R. § 3.34(c). Pursuant to F Rule 4.3(b), the Administrative Law Judge, except in circumstances not here present may extend any time limit prescribed by the rules "[f]or good cause shown." 16 C.F.R 4.3(b). Based on the representations in the Motion, Natural Grocers has demonstrated good cause for the requested extension. Accordingly, the Motion is GRANTED and it hereby ORDERED that Natural Grocers' deadline for filing any motion to quash or limit the Subpoena is extended to June 11, 2024. ORDERED: D. Michael Chappell Chief Administrative Law Judge)	Docket No. 9428
[PROPOSED] ORDER GRANTING UNOPPOSED MOTION FOR EXTENSION OF TIME TO MOVE TO QUASH OR TO LIMIT SUBPOENA DUCES TECUTOR On May 28, 2024, non-party Vitamin Cottage Natural Food Markets, I ("Natural Grocers") filed a motion to further extend its time to move to quash or limit subpoena duces tecum ("Subpoena") issued by Complaint Counsel on April 2, 20 ("Motion"). Complaint Counsel does not oppose the relief requested in the Motion. Under FTC Rule of Practice 3.34(c), any motion to limit or quash a subpoena me be filed within 10 days of receipt of the subpoena. 16 C.F.R. § 3.34(c). Pursuant to F Rule 4.3(b), the Administrative Law Judge, except in circumstances not here present may extend any time limit prescribed by the rules "[f]or good cause shown." 16 C.F.R. 4.3(b). Based on the representations in the Motion, Natural Grocers has demonstrate good cause for the requested extension. Accordingly, the Motion is GRANTED and in hereby ORDERED that Natural Grocers' deadline for filing any motion to quash or linthe Subpoena is extended to June 11, 2024. ORDERED: D. Michael Chappell Chief Administrative Law Judge)	
OF TIME TO MOVE TO QUASH OR TO LIMIT SUBPOENA DUCES TECU On May 28, 2024, non-party Vitamin Cottage Natural Food Markets, I ("Natural Grocers") filed a motion to further extend its time to move to quash or limit subpoena duces tecum ("Subpoena") issued by Complaint Counsel on April 2, 20 ("Motion"). Complaint Counsel does not oppose the relief requested in the Motion. Under FTC Rule of Practice 3.34(c), any motion to limit or quash a subpoena m be filed within 10 days of receipt of the subpoena. 16 C.F.R. § 3.34(c). Pursuant to F Rule 4.3(b), the Administrative Law Judge, except in circumstances not here present may extend any time limit prescribed by the rules "[f]or good cause shown." 16 C.F.R 4.3(b). Based on the representations in the Motion, Natural Grocers has demonstrate good cause for the requested extension. Accordingly, the Motion is GRANTED and in hereby ORDERED that Natural Grocers' deadline for filing any motion to quash or limit the Subpoena is extended to June 11, 2024. ORDERED: D. Michael Chappell Chief Administrative Law Judge	Albertsons Companies, Inc.)	
OF TIME TO MOVE TO QUASH OR TO LIMIT SUBPOENA DUCES TECU On May 28, 2024, non-party Vitamin Cottage Natural Food Markets, I ("Natural Grocers") filed a motion to further extend its time to move to quash or limit subpoena duces tecum ("Subpoena") issued by Complaint Counsel on April 2, 20 ("Motion"). Complaint Counsel does not oppose the relief requested in the Motion. Under FTC Rule of Practice 3.34(c), any motion to limit or quash a subpoena m be filed within 10 days of receipt of the subpoena. 16 C.F.R. § 3.34(c). Pursuant to F Rule 4.3(b), the Administrative Law Judge, except in circumstances not here present may extend any time limit prescribed by the rules "[f]or good cause shown." 16 C.F.R 4.3(b). Based on the representations in the Motion, Natural Grocers has demonstrate good cause for the requested extension. Accordingly, the Motion is GRANTED and in hereby ORDERED that Natural Grocers' deadline for filing any motion to quash or limit the Subpoena is extended to June 11, 2024. ORDERED: D. Michael Chappell Chief Administrative Law Judge)	
("Natural Grocers") filed a motion to further extend its time to move to quash or limit subpoena duces tecum ("Subpoena") issued by Complaint Counsel on April 2, 20 ("Motion"). Complaint Counsel does not oppose the relief requested in the Motion. Under FTC Rule of Practice 3.34(c), any motion to limit or quash a subpoena m be filed within 10 days of receipt of the subpoena. 16 C.F.R. § 3.34(c). Pursuant to F Rule 4.3(b), the Administrative Law Judge, except in circumstances not here present may extend any time limit prescribed by the rules "[f]or good cause shown." 16 C.F.R 4.3(b). Based on the representations in the Motion, Natural Grocers has demonstrate good cause for the requested extension. Accordingly, the Motion is GRANTED and in hereby ORDERED that Natural Grocers' deadline for filing any motion to quash or limit the Subpoena is extended to June 11, 2024. ORDERED: D. Michael Chappell Chief Administrative Law Judge	•		
be filed within 10 days of receipt of the subpoena. 16 C.F.R. § 3.34(c). Pursuant to F Rule 4.3(b), the Administrative Law Judge, except in circumstances not here present may extend any time limit prescribed by the rules "[f]or good cause shown." 16 C.F.R 4.3(b). Based on the representations in the Motion, Natural Grocers has demonstrated good cause for the requested extension. Accordingly, the Motion is GRANTED and it hereby ORDERED that Natural Grocers' deadline for filing any motion to quash or limit the Subpoena is extended to June 11, 2024. ORDERED: D. Michael Chappell Chief Administrative Law Judge	("Natural Grocers") filed a motion to furt subpoena <i>duces tecum</i> ("Subpoena") iss ("Motion"). Complaint Counsel does not	ther extend sued by (t oppose t	d its time to move to quash or limit the Complaint Counsel on April 2, 2024 he relief requested in the Motion.
good cause for the requested extension. Accordingly, the Motion is GRANTED and is hereby ORDERED that Natural Grocers' deadline for filing any motion to quash or lint the Subpoena is extended to June 11, 2024. ORDERED: D. Michael Chappell Chief Administrative Law Judge	be filed within 10 days of receipt of the s Rule 4.3(b), the Administrative Law Judg may extend any time limit prescribed by	subpoena. ge, excep	16 C.F.R. § 3.34(c). Pursuant to FTC t in circumstances not here presented.
D. Michael Chappell Chief Administrative Law Judge	good cause for the requested extension. A hereby ORDERED that Natural Grocers'	According deadline	ly, the Motion is GRANTED and it is
Chief Administrative Law Judge	ORDERED:		
-			
Date:	_	Chief	Administrative Law Judge
	Date:		