

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION WASHINGTON, D.C. 20580

Bureau of Consumer Protection Division of Enforcement

> Julia Solomon Ensor Attorney

Email: jensor@ftc.gov Direct Dial: (202) 326-2377

March 22, 2022

## VIA EMAIL

Andrew C. Pacheco, Esq. Ryan Rapp Underwood & Pacheco, PLC 3200 N. Central Ave., Suite 2250 Phoenix, AZ 85012 apacheco@rrulaw.com

Dear Mr. Pacheco:

We received your submissions on behalf of A.F. Lorts Company, Inc., d/b/a Lorts Manufacturing ("Lorts" or the "Company"). During our review, we discussed concerns that marketing materials may have overstated the extent to which the Company's products are made in the United States. Specifically, among other things, although certain Lorts furniture products incorporate significant imported components, for a period, the Lorts website contained a footer on every page displaying an image of the American flag and containing the words, "Made in USA." Additionally, over this same period, Lorts disseminated social media posts advertising multiple product categories that featured #madeinamerica and #madeinusa tags.

As discussed, unqualified U.S.-origin claims in marketing materials – including claims that products are "Made" or "Built" in the USA – likely suggest to consumers that the products advertised in those materials are "all or virtually all" made in the United States.<sup>1</sup> The Commission may analyze a number of different factors to determine whether a product is "all or virtually all" made in the United States, including the proportion of the product's total manufacturing costs attributable to U.S. parts and processing, how far removed any foreign content is from the finished product, and the importance of the foreign content or processing to the overall function of the product. The FTC recently codified the "all or virtually all" standard into a Made in USA Labeling Rule, 16 C.F.R. § 323 (the "MUSA Rule").<sup>2</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> FTC, *Issuance of Enforcement Policy Statement on "Made in USA" and Other U.S. Origin Claims*, 62 Fed. Reg. 63756, 63768 (Dec. 2, 1997) (the "Policy Statement"). Additionally, beyond express "Made in USA" claims, "[d]epending on the context, U.S. symbols or geographic references, such as U.S. flags, outlines of U.S. maps, or references to U.S. locations of headquarters or factories, may, by themselves or in conjunction with other phrases or images, convey a claim of U.S. origin." *Id.* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Effective August 13, 2021, it is a violation of the MUSA Rule to label any covered product "Made in the United States," as the MUSA Rule defines that term, unless the final assembly or processing of the

For a product that is substantially transformed in the United States, but not "all or virtually all" made in the United States, the Policy Statement explains, "any claim of U.S. origin should be adequately qualified to avoid consumer deception about the presence or amount of foreign content . . . Clarity of language, prominence of type size and style, proximity to the claim being qualified, and an absence of contrary claims that could undercut the effectiveness of the qualification will maximize the likelihood that the qualifications and disclosures are appropriately clear and prominent."<sup>3</sup>

The Commission has explained that, unless marketers specify which products are covered or directly link claims to particular products, consumers generally interpret U.S.-origin claims in marketing materials to cover <u>all</u> products advertised in those materials. Accordingly, the Policy Statement provides, "marketers should not represent, either expressly or by implication, that a whole product line is of U.S. origin (*e.g.*, 'Our products are Made in USA') when only some products in the product line are, in fact, made in the United States."<sup>4</sup>

As discussed, it is appropriate for Lorts to promote the fact that it employs workers and performs certain functions in the United States. However, marketing materials should not convey that products are wholly or partially made in the United States unless the Company can substantiate that claim. Accordingly, to avoid deceiving consumers, Lorts implemented a remedial action plan. This plan included: (1) removing claims from website footers; (2) confirming accuracy of claims on product pages; (3) updating social media posts; and (4) providing updated materials to and confirming accuracy of claims by downstream retailers.

FTC staff members are available to work with companies to craft claims that serve the dual purposes of conveying non-deceptive information and highlighting work done in the United States. Based on Lorts' actions and other factors, the staff has decided not to pursue this investigation any further. This action should not be construed as a determination that there was no violation of Section 5 of the Federal Trade Commission Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45. The Commission reserves the right to take such further action as the public interest may require. If you have any questions, please feel free to call.

Sincerely,

Julia Solomon Ensor Staff Attorney

Ancindar H. Freeman

Lashanda Freeman Senior Investigator

product occurs in the United States, all significant processing that goes into the product occurs in the United States, and all or virtually all ingredients or components of the product are made and sourced in the United States. *See* https://www.federalregister.gov/documents/2021/07/14/2021-14610/made-in-usa-labeling-rule. Pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 45(m)(1)(A), the Commission may seek civil penalties of up to \$46,517 per MUSA Rule violation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Policy Statement, 62 Fed. Reg. 63756, 63769.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Policy Statement, 62 Fed. Reg. 63756, 63768 n.111.