

United States District Court
for the
Southern District of Florida

Federal Trade Commission,)
Plaintiff,)
)
v.) Civil Action No. 19-25046-Civ-Scola
)
On Point Global LLC and others,)
Defendants.)

Order Granting Motion for Preliminary Injunction

Plaintiff, the Federal Trade Commission, has filed its Complaint for Permanent Injunction and Other Equitable Relief pursuant to Section 13(b) of the Federal Trade Commission Act (“FTC Act”), 15 U.S.C. § 53(b), and has moved, pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 65(b), for a preliminary injunction, asset freeze, other equitable relief against the Individual Defendants and Corporate Defendants.

FINDINGS OF FACT

On January 10, 2020 and January 13, 2020, the Court conducted an evidentiary hearing on the FTC’s Motion for a Preliminary Injunction. The Court received live testimony from several witnesses and considered the affidavits and declarations of numerous witnesses submitted by the Plaintiff and the Defendants. “At the preliminary injunction stage, a district court may rely on affidavits and hearsay materials which would not be admissible evidence for a permanent injunction, if the evidence is appropriate given the character and objectives of the injunctive proceeding.” *Levi Strauss and Co. b. Sunrise Intern. Trading*, 51 F.3d 982 (11th Cir. 1995).

The Court has considered the Complaint, the briefs, motions, declarations, exhibits, and the testimony provided in support of the Temporary Restraining Order and Preliminary Injunction as well as the briefs, motions, declarations, exhibits, and testimony provided in opposition thereto. The Court finds as follows:

A. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this case, and there is good cause to believe that it will have jurisdiction over all parties hereto and that venue in this district is proper.

B. In numerous instances, Defendants misrepresented on their websites that they would provide government services (*e.g.*, a driver’s license, car

registration, or eligibility determination for public benefits) to consumers who paid money and/or provided personal information.

C. There is good cause to believe that Defendants have engaged in and are likely to engage in acts or practices that violate Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a), and that Plaintiff is therefore likely to prevail on the merits of this action. As demonstrated by the records of undercover purchases; consumer complaints and declarations; expert testing; corporate, banking, and payment processing records; and additional documents filed by the FTC, the FTC has established a likelihood of success in showing that Defendants have deceived consumers by misrepresenting the services they offer, thus inducing consumers to pay money or divulge personal information under false pretenses. The Court need not, as a matter of law, depend on a consumer survey to prove that the websites had a tendency to deceive. *FTC v. Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corp.*, 778 F.2d 35, 40-41 (D.C. Cir. 1985) (“Evidence of consumer reaction usually takes the form of market research or consumer surveys, but a trial court may accord other forms of evidence substantial weight if that evidence appears reliable.”) Although the consumer surveys presented in this case by the FTC had some minor flaws, the results clearly show that consumers were misled by the websites. And, this independent evidence is unnecessary in this case. The Court finds that the websites were patently misleading. The websites were cleverly designed so that even though disclosures appeared on many or most of the pages, consumers attention would be drawn to links and language in larger, more colorful font that directed them to the service they were seeking (such as renewing a driver’s license) and most consumers would likely ignore the disclosures written in relatively smaller and pale-colored font. And, if a consumer did read the disclosures, they would learn they could purchase a guide and would also learn that the site is a privately-owned company selling guides that can be obtained for free elsewhere on governmental sites. But, most importantly, they were not clearly informed that they could **not** obtain the government service they were misled to believe was available to them.

D. There is good cause to believe that immediate and irreparable harm will result from Defendants’ ongoing violations of the FTC Act unless Defendants are restrained and enjoined by order of this Court.

E. There is good cause to believe that immediate and irreparable damage to the Court’s ability to grant effective final relief for consumers – including monetary restitution, rescission, disgorgement or refunds – will occur from the sale, transfer, destruction or other disposition or concealment by Defendants of their assets or records, unless Defendants are immediately restrained and enjoined by order of this Court.

F. Good cause exists for appointing a receiver over the Receivership Entities and freezing Defendants' assets.

G. Weighing the equities and considering Plaintiff's likelihood of ultimate success on the merits, a preliminary injunction with an asset freeze, the appointment of a receiver, and other equitable relief is in the public interest.

H. This Court has authority to issue this Order pursuant to Section 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 53(b); Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 65; and the All Writs Act, 28 U.S.C. § 1651.

I. No security is required of any agency of the United States for issuance of a preliminary injunction. Fed. R. Civ. P. 65(c).

DEFINITIONS

For the purpose of this Order, the following definitions shall apply:

A. **"Asset"** means any legal or equitable interest in, right to, or claim to, any property, wherever located and by whomever held.

B. **"Corporate Defendant"** means On Point Global LLC; On Point Employment LLC; On Point Guides LLC f/k/a Rogue Media Services LLC; DG DMV LLC; On Point Domains LLC; Final Draft Media LLC; Waltham Technologies LLC; Cambridge Media Series LLC f/k/a License America Media Series LLC; Issue Based Media LLC; Bella Vista Media Ltd. also d/b/a BV Media; Carganet S.A. also d/b/a G8 Labs; Dragon Global LLC; Dragon Global Management LLC; Dragon Global Holdings LLC; Direct Market LLC; Bluebird Media LLC; Borat Media LLC; Bring Back the Magic Media LLC; Chametz Media LLC; Chelsea Media LLC; Coinstar Media LLC; Domain Development Studios LLC; Domain Dividends Media LLC; Eagle Media LLC; Falcon Media LLC; GNR Media LLC; Island Media LLC; Leatherback Media Group LLC; Macau Media LLC; CEG Media LLC f/k/a Matzoh Media LLC; MBL Media Ltd. Inc.; Orange and Blue Media LLC; Orange Grove Media LLC; Panther Media LLC; Pirate Media LLC; Pivot Media Group LLC; PJ Groove Media LLC; Sandman Media Group LLC; Shadow Media LLC; Skylar Media LLC; Slayer Billing LLC; Spartacus Media LLC; Very Busy Media LLC; Wasabi Media LLC; Yamazaki Media LLC; Bronco Family Holdings LP a/k/a Bronco Holdings Family LP; BAL Family LP; Cardozo Holdings LLC; 714 Media Ltd.; Mac Media Ltd.; On Point Capital Partners LLC; License America Management LLC; License America Holdings LLC; Blackbird Media LLC; and each of their subsidiaries, affiliates, successors, and assigns.

C. **"Defendant(s)"** means Corporate Defendants and Individual Defendants, individually, collectively, or in any combination.

D. **"Document"** is synonymous in meaning and equal in scope to the usage of "document" and "electronically stored information" in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 34(a), and includes writings, drawings, graphs, charts,

photographs, sound and video recordings, images, Internet sites, web pages, websites, electronic correspondence, including e-mail and instant messages, contracts, accounting data, advertisements, FTP Logs, Server Access Logs, books, written or printed records, handwritten notes, telephone logs, telephone scripts, receipt books, ledgers, personal and business canceled checks and check registers, bank statements, appointment books, computer records, customer or sales databases and any other electronically stored information, including Documents located on remote servers or cloud computing systems, and other data or data compilations from which information can be obtained directly or, if necessary, after translation into a reasonably usable form. A draft or non-identical copy is a separate document within the meaning of the term.

E. **“Electronic Data Host”** means any person or entity in the business of storing, hosting, or otherwise maintaining electronically stored information. This includes, but is not limited to, any entity hosting a website or server, and any entity providing “cloud based” electronic storage.

F. **“Individual Defendant(s)”** means Burton Katz, Brent Levison, Robert Zangrillo, Arlene Mahon, Elisha Rothman, and Christopher Sherman, individually, collectively, or in any combination.

G. **“Receiver”** means the receiver appointed in Section XI of this Order and any deputy receivers that shall be named by the receiver.

H. **“Receivership Entities”** means Corporate Defendants as well as any other entity that has conducted any business related to online marketing of government services or instructional guides, including receipt of Assets derived from any activity that is the subject of the Complaint in this matter, and that the Receiver determines is controlled or owned by any Defendant. Provided, however, that the Assets of Dragon Global Management LLC as of the date of this Order shall remain frozen and in the Receivership estate, but the employees and operations of Dragon Global Management LLC shall otherwise be released from the Receivership. The Receiver shall have no obligation to pay salaries or other costs incurred by Dragon Global Management LLC, provided, however, that this Order is without prejudice to any future motion to release frozen assets to pay such salaries or costs.

ORDER

I. PROHIBITED BUSINESS ACTIVITIES

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that Defendants, Defendants’ officers, agents, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with them, who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or indirectly, in connection with the advertising, marketing, promoting, or offering for sale of any goods or services,

are preliminarily restrained and enjoined from misrepresenting or assisting others in misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, any material fact, including, but not limited to:

A. That consumers can complete state motor vehicle or state licensing transactions or obtain public-benefits eligibility determinations on Defendants' websites;

B. That consumers who submit payment and/or personal information on Defendants' websites will receive a state motor vehicle service or license, or a public-benefits eligibility determination; and

C. Any other fact material to consumers concerning any good or service, such as: the total costs; any material restrictions, limitations, or conditions; or any material aspect of its performance, efficacy, nature, or central characteristics.

II. PROHIBITION ON RELEASE OF CUSTOMER INFORMATION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, Defendants' officers, agents, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, are hereby preliminarily restrained and enjoined from:

A. Selling, renting, leasing, transferring, or otherwise disclosing, the name, address, birth date, telephone number, email address, credit card number, bank account number, Social Security number, or other financial or identifying information of any person that any Defendant obtained in connection with any activity that pertains to the subject matter of this Order; and

B. Benefitting from or using the name, address, birth date, telephone number, email address, credit card number, bank account number, Social Security number, or other financial or identifying information of any person that any Defendant obtained in connection with any activity that pertains to the subject matter of this Order.

Provided, however, that Defendants may disclose such identifying information to a law enforcement agency, to their attorneys as required for their defense, as required by any law, regulation, or court order, or in any filings, pleadings or discovery in this action in the manner required by the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and by any protective order in the case.

III. ASSET FREEZE

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants and their officers, agents, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, are hereby preliminarily restrained and enjoined from:

A. Transferring, liquidating, converting, encumbering, pledging, loaning, selling, concealing, dissipating, disbursing, assigning, relinquishing, spending, withdrawing, granting a lien or security interest or other interest in, or otherwise disposing of any Assets that are:

1. owned or controlled, directly or indirectly, by any Defendant;
2. held, in part or in whole, for the benefit of any Defendant;
3. in the actual or constructive possession of any Defendant; or
4. owned or controlled by, in the actual or constructive possession of, or otherwise held for the benefit of, any corporation, partnership, asset protection trust, or other entity that is directly or indirectly owned, managed or controlled by any Defendant.

B. Opening or causing to be opened any safe deposit boxes, commercial mail boxes, or storage facilities titled in the name of any Defendant or subject to access by any Defendant, except as necessary to comply with written requests from the Receiver acting pursuant to its authority under this Order;

C. Incurring charges or cash advances on any credit, debit, or ATM card issued in the name, individually or jointly, of any Corporate Defendant or any corporation, partnership, or other entity directly or indirectly owned, managed, or controlled by any Defendant or of which any Defendant is an officer, director, member, or manager. This includes any corporate bankcard or corporate credit card account for which any Defendant is, or was on the date that this Order was signed, an authorized signor; and

D. Cashing any checks or depositing any money orders or cash received from consumers, clients, or customers of any Defendant.

The Assets affected by this Section shall include: (1) all Assets of Defendants as of December 13, 2019; and (2) Assets obtained by Defendants after December 13, 2019, if those Assets are derived from any activity that is the subject of the Complaint in this matter or that is prohibited by this Order. This Section does not prohibit any transfers to the Receiver or repatriation of foreign Assets specifically required by this order. Provided, however, that any Assets held solely for the benefit of individuals or entities other than Defendants or Receivership Entities shall be released from the asset freeze upon written agreement of the Federal Trade Commission; or if the parties cannot agree, upon proof that the assets at issue are held solely for the benefit of individuals or entities other than Defendants or the Receivership Entities and subsequent order of the Court. In situations in which the FTC agrees to a release of assets under this provision, no further Order is required, and any financial institution shall accept this Order and the written agreement of the FTC as sufficient to release the frozen assets.

IV. DUTIES OF ASSET HOLDERS AND OTHER THIRD PARTIES

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that any financial or brokerage institution, Electronic Data Host, credit card processor, payment processor, merchant bank, acquiring bank, independent sales organization, third party processor, payment gateway, insurance company, business entity, or person who receives actual notice of this Order (by service or otherwise) that:

(a) has held, controlled, or maintained custody, through an account or otherwise, of any Document on behalf of any Defendant or any Asset that has been owned or controlled, directly or indirectly, by any Defendant; held, in part or in whole, for the benefit of any Defendant; in the actual or constructive possession of any Defendant; or owned or controlled by, in the actual or constructive possession of, or otherwise held for the benefit of, any corporation, partnership, asset protection trust, or other entity that is directly or indirectly owned, managed or controlled by any Defendant;

(b) has held, controlled, or maintained custody, through an account or otherwise, of any Document or Asset associated with credits, debits, or charges made on behalf of any Defendant, including reserve funds held by payment processors, credit card processors, merchant banks, acquiring banks, independent sales organizations, third party processors, payment gateways, insurance companies, or other entities; or

(c) has extended credit to any Defendant, including through a credit card account, shall:

A. Hold, preserve, and retain within its control and prohibit the withdrawal, removal, alteration, assignment, transfer, pledge, encumbrance, disbursement, dissipation, relinquishment, conversion, sale, or other disposal of any such Document or Asset, as well as all Documents or other property related to such Assets, except by further order of this Court; provided, however, that this provision does not prohibit an Individual Defendant from incurring charges on a personal credit card established prior to entry of this Order, up to the pre-existing credit limit;

B. Deny any person, except the Receiver, access to any safe deposit box, commercial mail box, or storage facility that is titled in the name of any Defendant, either individually or jointly, or otherwise subject to access by any Defendant;

C. Immediately provide Plaintiff's counsel and the Receiver, to the extent not already provided pursuant to the TRO, a sworn statement setting forth, for each Asset or account covered by this Section:

1. The identification number of each such account or Asset;

2. The balance of each such account, or a description of the nature and value of each such Asset as of the close of business on the day on which this Order is served, and, if the account or other Asset has been closed or removed, the date closed or removed, the total funds removed in order to close the account, and the name of the person or entity to whom such account or other Asset was remitted; and
3. The identification of any safe deposit box, commercial mail box, or storage facility that is either titled in the name, individually or jointly, of any Defendant, or is otherwise subject to access by any Defendant; and

D. Upon the request of Plaintiff's counsel or the Receiver, promptly provide Plaintiff's counsel and the Receiver with copies of all records or other Documents pertaining to any account covered by this Section or Asset, including originals or copies of account applications, account statements, signature cards, checks, drafts, deposit tickets, transfers to and from the accounts, including wire transfers and wire transfer instructions, all other debit and credit instruments or slips, currency transaction reports, 1099 forms, and all logs and records pertaining to safe deposit boxes, commercial mail boxes, and storage facilities.

Provided, however, that this Section does not prohibit any transfers to the Receiver or repatriation of foreign Assets specifically required by this Order.

V. FINANCIAL DISCLOSURES

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, to the extent not already completed pursuant to the TRO, each Defendant shall immediately prepare and deliver to Plaintiff's counsel and the Receiver:

A. Completed financial statements on the forms attached to this Order as **Attachment A** (Financial Statement of Individual Defendant) for each Individual Defendant, and **Attachment B** (Financial Statement of Corporate Defendant) for each Corporate Defendant; and

B. Completed **Attachment C** (IRS Form 4506, Request for Copy of a Tax Return) for each Individual and Corporate Defendant.

VI. FOREIGN ASSET REPATRIATION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, to the extent not already completed pursuant to the TRO, each Defendant shall immediately:

A. Provide Plaintiff's counsel and the Receiver with a full accounting, verified under oath and accurate as of the date of this Order, of all Assets, Documents, and accounts outside of the United States which are: (1) titled in the name, individually or jointly, of any Defendant; (2) held by any person or

entity for the benefit of any Defendant or for the benefit of any corporation, partnership, asset protection trust, or other entity that is directly or indirectly owned, managed or controlled by any Defendant; or (3) under the direct or indirect control, whether jointly or singly, of any Defendant;

B. Take all steps necessary to provide Plaintiff's counsel and Receiver access to all Documents and records that may be held by third parties located outside of the territorial United States of America, including signing the Consent to Release of Financial Records appended to this Order as **Attachment D**;

C. Transfer to the territory of the United States all Documents and Assets located in foreign countries which are: (1) titled in the name, individually or jointly, of any Defendant; (2) held by any person or entity for the benefit of any Defendant or for the benefit of any corporation, partnership, asset protection trust, or other entity that is directly or indirectly owned, managed, or controlled by any Defendant; or (3) under the direct or indirect control, whether jointly or singly, of any Defendant; and

D. The same business day as any repatriation, (1) notify the Receiver and counsel for Plaintiff of the name and location of the financial institution or other entity that is the recipient of such Documents or Assets; and (2) serve this Order on any such financial institution or other entity.

VII. NON-INTERFERENCE WITH REPATRIATION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, Defendants' officers, agents, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, are hereby preliminarily restrained and enjoined from taking any action, directly or indirectly, which may result in the encumbrance or dissipation of foreign Assets, or in the hindrance of the repatriation required by this Order, including, but not limited to:

A. Sending any communication or engaging in any other act, directly or indirectly, that results in a determination by a foreign trustee or other entity that a "duress" event has occurred under the terms of a foreign trust agreement until such time that all Defendants' Assets have been fully repatriated pursuant to this Order; or

B. Notifying any trustee, protector or other agent of any foreign trust or other related entities of either the existence of this Order, or of the fact that repatriation is required pursuant to a court order, until such time that all Defendants' Assets have been fully repatriated pursuant to this Order.

VIII. CONSUMER CREDIT REPORTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Plaintiff may obtain credit reports concerning any Defendants pursuant to Section 604(a)(1) of the Fair Credit Reporting Act, 15 U.S.C. 1681b(a)(1), and that, upon written request, any credit reporting agency from which such reports are requested shall provide them to Plaintiff.

IX. PRESERVATION OF RECORDS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, Defendants' officers, agents, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, are hereby preliminarily restrained and enjoined from:

A. Destroying, erasing, falsifying, writing over, mutilating, concealing, altering, transferring, or otherwise disposing of, in any manner, directly or indirectly, Documents that relate to: (1) the business, business practices, Assets, telephone records, email account records, or business or personal finances of any Defendant; (2) any webpage or website operated, in whole or in part, on any Defendant's or Defendants' behalf; (3) any electronic communications sent or received by Defendants; (4) the business practices or finances of entities directly or indirectly under the control of any Defendant; or (5) the business practices or finances of entities directly or indirectly under common control with any other Defendant; and

B. Failing to create and maintain Documents that, in reasonable detail, accurately, fairly, and completely reflect Defendants' incomes, disbursements, transactions, and use of Defendants' Assets.

X. REPORT OF NEW BUSINESS ACTIVITY

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, Defendants' officers, agents, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, are hereby preliminarily restrained and enjoined from creating, operating, or exercising any control over any business entity, whether newly formed or previously inactive, including any partnership, limited partnership, joint venture, sole proprietorship, or corporation, without first providing Plaintiff's counsel and the Receiver with a written statement disclosing: (1) the name of the business entity; (2) the address and telephone number of the business entity; (3) the names of the business entity's officers, directors, principals, managers, and employees; and (4) a detailed description of the business entity's intended activities.

XI. RECEIVER

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Melanie Damian is appointed as receiver of the Receivership Entities with full powers of an equity receiver. The Receiver shall be solely the agent of this Court in acting as Receiver under this Order.

XII. DUTIES AND AUTHORITY OF RECEIVER

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Receiver is directed and authorized to accomplish the following:

A. Assume full control of Receivership Entities by removing, as the Receiver deems necessary or advisable, any director, officer, independent contractor, employee, attorney, or agent of any Receivership Entity from control of, management of, or participation in, the affairs of the Receivership Entity;

B. Take exclusive custody, control, and possession of all Assets and Documents of, or in the possession, custody, or under the control of, any Receivership Entity, wherever situated;

C. Take exclusive custody, control, and possession of all Documents or Assets associated with credits, debits, or charges made on behalf of any Receivership Entity, wherever situated, including reserve funds held by payment processors, credit card processors, merchant banks, acquiring banks, independent sales organizations, third party processors, payment gateways, insurance companies, or other entities;

D. Conserve, hold, manage, and prevent the loss of all Assets of the Receivership Entities, and perform all acts necessary or advisable to preserve the value of those Assets. The Receiver shall assume control over the income and profits therefrom and all sums of money now or hereafter due or owing to the Receivership Entities. The Receiver shall have full power to sue for, collect, and receive, all Assets of the Receivership Entities and of other persons or entities whose interests are now under the direction, possession, custody, or control of, the Receivership Entities. Provided, however, that the Receiver shall not attempt to collect any amount from a consumer if the Receiver believes the consumer's debt to the Receivership Entities has resulted from the deceptive acts or practices or other violations of law alleged in the Complaint in this matter, without prior Court approval;

E. Investigate any claims the Receiver on behalf of the Receivership Defendants may possess against third parties, including but not limited to claims seeking imposition of constructive trusts, disgorgement of profits, recovery and/or avoidance of fraudulent transfers, and claims in contract, law, tort, and equity.

F. Obtain, conserve, hold, manage, and prevent the loss of all Documents of the Receivership Entities, and perform all acts necessary or

advisable to preserve such Documents. The Receiver shall: divert mail; preserve all Documents of the Receivership Entities that are accessible via electronic means (such as online access to financial accounts and access to electronic documents held onsite or by Electronic Data Hosts, by changing usernames, passwords or other log-in credentials; take possession of all electronic Documents of the Receivership Entities stored onsite or remotely; take whatever steps necessary to preserve all such Documents; and obtain the assistance of the FTC's Digital Forensic Unit for the purpose of obtaining electronic documents stored onsite or remotely.

G. Choose, engage, and employ attorneys, accountants, appraisers, and other independent contractors and technical specialists, as the Receiver deems advisable or necessary in the performance of duties and responsibilities under the authority granted by this Order;

H. Make payments and disbursements from the receivership estate that are necessary or advisable for carrying out the directions of, or exercising the authority granted by, this Order, and to incur, or authorize the making of, such agreements as may be necessary and advisable in discharging his or her duties as Receiver. The Receiver shall apply to the Court for prior approval of any payment of any debt or obligation incurred by the Receivership Entities prior to the date of entry of this Order, except payments that the Receiver deems necessary or advisable to secure Assets of the Receivership Entities, such as rental payments;

I. Take all steps necessary to secure and take exclusive custody of each location from which the Receivership Entities operate their businesses. Such steps may include, but are not limited to, any of the following, as the Receiver deems necessary or advisable: (1) securing the location by changing the locks and alarm codes and disconnecting any internet access or other means of access to the computers, servers, internal networks, or other records maintained at that location; and (2) requiring any persons present at the location to leave the premises, to provide the Receiver with proof of identification, and/or to demonstrate to the satisfaction of the Receiver that such persons are not removing from the premises Documents or Assets of the Receivership Entities. Law enforcement personnel, including, but not limited to, police or sheriffs, may assist the Receiver in implementing these provisions in order to keep the peace and maintain security. If requested by the Receiver, the United States Marshal will provide appropriate and necessary assistance to the Receiver to implement this Order and is authorized to use any necessary and reasonable force to do so;

J. Take all steps necessary to prevent the modification, destruction, or erasure of any web page or website registered to and operated, in whole or in part, by any Defendants, and to provide access to all such web page or websites

to Plaintiff's representatives, agents, and assistants, as well as Defendants and their representatives;

K. Enter into and cancel contracts and purchase insurance as advisable or necessary;

L. Prevent the inequitable distribution of Assets and determine, adjust, and protect the interests of consumers who have transacted business with the Receivership Entities;

M. Make an accounting, as soon as practicable, of the Assets and financial condition of the receivership and file the accounting with the Court and deliver copies thereof to all parties;

N. Institute, compromise, adjust, appear in, intervene in, defend, dispose of, or otherwise become party to any legal action in state, federal or foreign courts or arbitration proceedings as the Receiver deems necessary and advisable to preserve or recover the Assets of the Receivership Entities, or to carry out the Receiver's mandate under this Order, including but not limited to, actions challenging fraudulent or voidable transfers;

O. Issue subpoenas to obtain Documents and records pertaining to the Receivership, and conduct discovery in this action on behalf of the receivership estate, in addition to obtaining other discovery as set forth in this Order;

P. Open one or more bank accounts at designated depositories for funds of the Receivership Entities. The Receiver shall deposit all funds of the Receivership Entities in such designated accounts and shall make all payments and disbursements from the receivership estate from such accounts. The Receiver shall serve copies of monthly account statements on all parties;

Q. Maintain accurate records of all receipts and expenditures incurred as Receiver;

R. Allow the Plaintiff's representatives, agents, and assistants, as well as

Defendants' representatives and Defendants themselves, reasonable access to the premises of the Receivership Entities, or any other premises where the Receivership Entities conduct business. The purpose of this access shall be to inspect and copy any and all books, records, Documents, accounts, and other property owned by, or in the possession of, the Receivership Entities or their agents. The Receiver shall have the discretion to determine the time, manner, and reasonable conditions of such access;

S. Allow the Plaintiff's representatives, agents, and assistants, as well as Defendants and their representatives reasonable access to all Documents in the possession, custody, or control of the Receivership Entities;

T. Cooperate with reasonable requests for information or assistance from any state or federal civil or criminal law enforcement agency;

U. Suspend business operations of the Receivership Entities if in the judgment of the Receiver such operations cannot be continued legally and profitably;

V. If the Receiver identifies a nonparty entity as a Receivership Entity, promptly notify the entity as well as the parties, and inform the entity that it can challenge the Receiver's determination by filing a motion with the Court. Provided, however, that the Receiver may delay providing such notice until the Receiver has established control of the nonparty entity and its assets and records, if the Receiver determines that notice to the entity or the parties before the Receiver establishes control over the entity may result in the destruction of records, dissipation of assets, or any other obstruction of the Receiver's control of the entity; and

W. If in the Receiver's judgment the business operations cannot be continued legally and profitably, take all steps necessary to ensure that any of the Receivership Entities' web pages or websites relating to the activities alleged in the Complaint cannot be accessed by the public, or are modified for consumer education and/or informational purposes, and take all steps necessary to ensure that any telephone numbers associated with the Receivership Entities cannot be accessed by the public, or are answered solely to provide consumer education or information regarding the status of operations. Provided, however, that if the Receiver believes any of the Receivership Entities' "freemium" or "pay-for-services" websites (as defined in the Receiver's report, ECF No. 108, at 36-37) can be modified to operate lawfully and profitably, the Receiver shall seek the parties' input on such modifications and propose modifications to the Court on or before January 31, 2020. Once the websites are forensically preserved and images provided to the Parties, the Receiver is authorized to make the changes proposed and leave those sites "live" pending ruling from this Court. The parties shall file objections to the Receiver's proposed modifications, if any, within 14 days after the Receiver's filing. Provided further, however, that such submission by the Receiver shall not waive any FTC claim that any website or website template not submitted for the parties' input is deceptive and shall not waive any claims by the Defendants that the prior unmodified websites were not deceptive, misleading or otherwise in violation of Section 5 of the Federal Trade Commission Act.

XIII. RECEIVER'S REPORTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Receiver must:

A. File a summary report with the Court of the receivership by April 20, 2020, and every three months following that report, and include the following information:

1. A summary of the Receiver's operations since the previous report;
2. The known value of Assets and sum of liabilities of the Receivership Entities;
3. A schedule of the Receiver's receipts and disbursements;
4. The steps the Receiver intends to take in the future to protect receivership Assets, recover receivership Assets from third parties, and adjust receivership liabilities;
5. The Receiver's recommendation for a continuation or discontinuation of the Receivership, or for changes to the Receivership, and the reasons for the recommendations; and
6. Any other matters which the Receiver believes should be brought to the Court's attention.

XIV. TRANSFER OF RECEIVERSHIP PROPERTY TO RECEIVER

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants and any other person, with possession, custody or control of property of, or records relating to, the Receivership Entities shall, upon notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, fully cooperate with and assist the Receiver in taking and maintaining possession, custody, or control of the Assets and Documents of the Receivership Entities and immediately transfer or deliver to the Receiver possession, custody, and control of, the following:

- A. All Assets held by or for the benefit of the Receivership Entities;
- B. All Documents or Assets associated with credits, debits, or charges made on behalf of any Receivership Entity, wherever situated, including reserve funds held by payment processors, credit card processors, merchant banks, acquiring banks, independent sales organizations, third party processors, payment gateways, insurance companies, or other entities;
- C. All Documents of or pertaining to the Receivership Entities;
- D. All computers, electronic devices, mobile devices and machines used to conduct the business of the Receivership Entities;
- E. All Assets and Documents belonging to other persons or entities whose interests are under the direction, possession, custody, or control of the Receivership Entities; and
- F. All keys, codes, user names and passwords necessary to gain or to secure access to any Assets or Documents of or pertaining to the Receivership Entities, including access to their business premises, means of communication, accounts, computer systems (onsite and remote), Electronic Data Hosts, or other property.

In the event that any person or entity fails to deliver or transfer any Asset or Document, or otherwise fails to comply with any provision of this Section, the Receiver may file an Affidavit of Non-Compliance regarding the failure and a motion seeking compliance or a contempt citation.

XV. PROVISION OF INFORMATION TO RECEIVER

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, to the extent not already completed pursuant to the TRO, Defendants shall immediately provide to the Receiver:

A. A list of all Assets and accounts of the Receivership Entities that are held in any name other than the name of a Receivership Entity, or by any person or entity other than a Receivership Entity;

B. A list of all agents, employees, officers, attorneys, servants and those persons in active concert and participation with the Receivership Entities, or who have been associated or done business with the Receivership Entities; and

C. A description of any documents covered by attorney-client privilege or attorney work product, including files where such documents are likely to be located, authors or recipients of such documents, and search terms likely to identify such electronic documents.

XVI. COOPERATION WITH THE RECEIVER

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants; Receivership Entities; Defendants' or Receivership Entities' officers, agents, employees, and attorneys, all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, and any other person with possession, custody, or control of property of or records relating to the Receivership entities who receive actual notice of this Order shall fully cooperate with and assist the Receiver. This cooperation and assistance shall include, but is not limited to, providing information to the Receiver that the Receiver deems necessary to exercise the authority and discharge the responsibilities of the Receiver under this Order; providing any keys, codes, user names and passwords required to access any computers, electronic devices, mobile devices, and machines (onsite or remotely) and any cloud account (including specific method to access account) or electronic file in any medium; advising all persons who owe money to any Receivership Entity that all debts should be paid directly to the Receiver; and transferring funds at the Receiver's direction and producing records related to the Assets and sales of the Receivership Entities.

XVII. NON-INTERFERENCE WITH THE RECEIVER

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants; Receivership Entities; Defendants' or Receivership Entities' officers, agents, employees, attorneys, and

all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, and any other person served with a copy of this Order, are hereby restrained and enjoined from directly or indirectly:

A. Interfering with the Receiver's efforts to manage, or take custody, control, or possession of, the Assets or Documents subject to the receivership;

B. Transacting any of the business of the Receivership Entities;

C. Transferring, receiving, altering, selling, encumbering, pledging, assigning, liquidating, or otherwise disposing of any Assets owned, controlled, or in the possession or custody of, or in which an interest is held or claimed by, the Receivership Entities; or

D. Refusing to cooperate with the Receiver or the Receiver's duly authorized agents in the exercise of their duties or authority under any order of this Court.

XVIII. STAY OF ACTIONS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, except by leave of this Court, during the pendency of the receivership ordered herein, Defendants, Defendants' officers, agents, employees, attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, and their corporations, subsidiaries, divisions, or affiliates, and all investors, creditors, stockholders, lessors, customers and other persons seeking to establish or enforce any claim, right, or interest against or on behalf of Defendants, and all others acting for or on behalf of such persons, are hereby enjoined from taking action that would interfere with the exclusive jurisdiction of this Court over the Assets or Documents of the Receivership Entities, including, but not limited to:

A. Filing or assisting in the filing of a petition for relief under the Bankruptcy Code, 11 U.S.C. § 101 *et seq.*, or of any similar insolvency proceeding on behalf of the Receivership Entities;

B. Commencing, prosecuting, or continuing a judicial, administrative, or other action or proceeding against the Receivership Entities, including the issuance or employment of process against the Receivership Entities, except that such actions may be commenced if necessary to toll any applicable statute of limitations;

C. Filing or enforcing any lien on any asset of the Receivership Entities, taking or attempting to take possession, custody, or control of any Asset of the Receivership Entities; or attempting to foreclose, forfeit, alter, or terminate any interest in any Asset of the Receivership Entities, whether such acts are part of a judicial proceeding, are acts of self-help, or otherwise; or

Provided, however, that this Order does not stay: (1) the commencement or continuation of a criminal action or proceeding; (2) the commencement or

continuation of an action or proceeding by a governmental unit to enforce such governmental unit's police or regulatory power; or (3) the enforcement of a judgment, other than a money judgment, obtained in an action or proceeding by a governmental unit to enforce such governmental unit's police or regulatory power.

XIX. COMPENSATION OF RECEIVER

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Receiver and all personnel hired by the Receiver as herein authorized, including counsel to the Receiver and accountants, are entitled to reasonable compensation for the performance of duties pursuant to this Order and for the cost of actual out-of-pocket expenses incurred by them, from the Assets now held by, in the possession or control of, or which may be received by, the Receivership Entities. The Receiver shall file with the Court and serve on the parties, periodic requests for the payment of such reasonable compensation at the time of filing of any report required by Section XIII of this Order. The Receiver shall not increase the hourly rates used as the bases for such fee applications without prior approval of the Court.

XX. DISTRIBUTION OF ORDER BY DEFENDANTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, to the extent not already completed pursuant to the TRO, Defendants shall immediately provide a copy of this Order to each affiliate, telemarketer, marketer, sales entity, successor, assign, member, officer, director, employee, agent, independent contractor, client, attorney, spouse, subsidiary, division, and representative of any Defendant, and shall immediately thereafter provide Plaintiff and the Receiver with a sworn statement that this provision of the Order has been satisfied, which statement shall include the names, physical addresses, phone number, and email addresses of each such person or entity who received a copy of the Order. Furthermore, Defendants shall not take any action that would encourage officers, agents, members, directors, employees, salespersons, independent contractors, attorneys, subsidiaries, affiliates, successors, assigns or other persons or entities in active concert or participation with them to disregard this Order or believe that they are not bound by its provisions.

XXI. SERVICE OF THIS ORDER

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that copies of this Order may be served by any means, including facsimile transmission, electronic mail or other electronic messaging, personal or overnight delivery, U.S. Mail or FedEx, by agents and employees of Plaintiff, by any law enforcement agency, or by private process server, upon any Defendant or any person (including any financial institution)

that may have possession, custody or control of any Asset or Document of any Defendant, or that may be subject to any provision of this Order pursuant to Rule 65(d)(2) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. For purposes of this Section, service upon any branch, subsidiary, affiliate or office of any entity shall effect service upon the entire entity.

XXII. CORRESPONDENCE AND SERVICE ON PLAINTIFF

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for the purpose of Athis Order, all correspondence and service of pleadings on Plaintiff shall be addressed to:

Sarah Waldrop, counsel for Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission
600 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Mailstop CC-9528
Washington, DC 20580
(202) 326-3444 (tel.)
(202) 326-3197 (fax)
swaldrop@ftc.gov

XXIII. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter for all purposes.

Done and ordered in chambers at Miami, Florida on January 14, 2020.



ROBERT N. SCOTT, U.S.

United States District Judge