DEBRA A. VALENTINE 1 General Counsel Federal Trade Commission 2 3 JOHN D. JACOBS (CA Bar No. 134154) :DEC | 4 200; JENNIFER LARABEE (CA Bar No. 163989) Federal Trade Commission 4 10877 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 700 CERK, U.S. SHERVER COLLEY 5 Los Angeles, California 90024 CENTRAL EDEVICT OF CALFTERNIA (310) 824-4360 or 824-4343 (ph.) (310) 824-4380 (fax) 6 Attorneys for Plaintiff 7 8 c : IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT LOBGED FOR THE CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA WESTERN DIVISION 12 $M_{\rm e}$ Case No. CV-99-12837 R (AIJx) 13 FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION, 14 Plaintiff, STIPULATED FINAL JUDGMENT AND ORDER 15 v. 10000 db 16 DAVID MORENO, an individual doing 17 business as Continental Business Systems, and 18 doing business as United Products, 19 Defendant. 20 21 Plaintiff, the Federal Trade Commission ("FTC" or 22 "Commission"), commenced this action by filing a Complaint 23 pursuant to Sections 13(b) and 19 of the Federal Trade Commission 24 Act ("FTC Act"), 15 U.S.C. §§ 53(b) and 57b, and the Telemarketing 25 26 and Consumer Fraud and Abuse Prevention Act, 15 U.S.C. § 6101 et 27 seq., charging Defendant Moreno with engaging in unfair or deceptive acts or practices in connection with the sale, offering 28 - 1 -

1 for sale, or distribution of nondurable office supplies, including 2 photocopier toner, in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act, 15 3 U.S.C. § 45, and the FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. 4 Part 310.

Now the Commission and Defendant Moreno agree to a settlement 5 б of this action without trial or adjudication of any issue of law 7 or fact herein and without Defendant Moreno admitting liability for any of the violations alleged in the Complaint or for any 8 wrongdoing whatsoever. The Commission and Defendant Moreno 9 10 consent to entry of this Stipulated Final Judgment and Order ("Order") without trial or adjudication of any issue of law or 11 fact herein. 12

FINDINGS

13

14

28

This is an action by the Commission instituted under
 Sections 13(b) and 19 of the Federal Trade Commission Act, 15
 U.S.C. §§ 53(b), and 57b, and the Telemarketing and Consumer Fraud
 and Abuse Prevention Act, 15 U.S.C. § 6101 et seq. The Complaint
 seeks permanent injunctive relief against Defendant Moreno in
 connection with the sale of nondurable office supplies.

21 2. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of
22 this case and over Defendant Moreno. Venue in the Central
23 District of California is proper.

3. The Complaint states a claim upon which relief may be
granted against Defendant Moreno under Sections 5(a), 13(b) and 19
of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a) 53(b) and 57b, and the
Commission's Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. Part 310.

- 2 -

4. The Commission has the authority under Sections 13(b)
 and 19 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 53(b) and 57b, and the
 Telemarketing and Consumer Fraud and Abuse Prevention Act, 15
 U.S.C. § 6101 et seq., to seek the relief it has requested.

5 5. The activities of Defendant Moreno charged in the
6 Complaint are in or affecting commerce, as defined in Section 4 of
7 the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.

8 6. By stipulating and consenting to the entry of this
9 Order, Defendant Moreno does not admit any of the allegations in
10 the Complaint, except those contained in Paragraphs 1 through 5
11 herein. Likewise, by executing this Order, the FTC does not admit
12 that any defense to the Complaint is valid.

This action and the relief awarded herein is in addition
to, and not in lieu of, other remedies as may be provided by law,
including both civil and criminal remedies.

8. Defendant Moreno enters into this Order freely and
 without coercion, and acknowledges that he understands the
 provisions of this Order and is prepared to abide by its terms.
 At all times, the defendant has been represented by counsel,
 including the negotiations that led to this Order.

9. Entry of this Order is in the public interest.

21

22

23

24

ORDER

Definitions

1. "Document" is synonymous in meaning and equal in scope
 to the usage of the term in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 34(a),
 and includes writings, drawings, graphs, charts, photographs,
 audio and video recordings, computer records, and other data

- 3 -

compilations from which information can be obtained and
 translated, if necessary, through detection devices into
 reasonably usable form. A draft or non-identical copy is a
 separate document within the meaning of the term.

5 2. "Defendant" means Defendant David Moreno and his agents, 6 servants, employees, attorneys, and all persons or entities 7 directly or indirectly under his control, and all other persons or 8 entities in active concert or participation with him who receive 9 actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, and 10 each such person.

3. "Consumer" means any person, including any individual,
 group, unincorporated association, limited or general partnership,
 corporation or other business entity.

4. "Receivership defendant" means the business assets and
operations of any and every business owned by Defendant Moreno
that has been operated under the name Continental Business
Systems, United Products or United Products, Inc.

18 5. The terms "and" and "or" have both conjunctive and19 disjunctive meanings.

20 6. "Assisting others" means knowingly providing any of the following goods or services to another entity: (1) performing 21 customer service functions, including, but not limited to, 22 receiving or responding to consumer complaints; (2) formulating or 23 providing, or arranging for the formulation or provision of, any 24 telephone sales script or any other marketing material; 25 (3) providing names of, or assisting in the generation of, 26 potential customers; or (4) performing marketing services of any 27 kind. 28

- 4 -

I. RESTRICTIONS ON SALE OF OFFICE SUPPLIES AND TELEMARKETING
 IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Defendant Moreno, whether acting
 directly or through any corporation, limited liability company,
 subsidiary, division or other device, is hereby permanently
 restrained and enjoined from either:

A. Engaging or participating in the advertising, offering
for sale, sale or distribution of nondurable office supplies, or
assisting others who are engaging or participating in the
advertising, offering for sale, sale or distribution of nondurable
office supplies, unless the transactions are completed after a
face-to-face contact between the seller or solicitor and the
consumers solicited; or

Engaging or participating, or assisting others who are 13 в. engaging or participating, in any business activity (including but 14 not limited to (i) initiating or receiving telephone calls; 15 (ii) managing others who initiate or receive telephone calls; 16 17 (iii) operating an enterprise that initiates or receives telephone calls; (iv) owning or serving as an officer or director of an 18 enterprise that initiates or receives telephone calls; or 19 (v) otherwise working as an employee or independent contractor 20 21 with a unit or division of an enterprise that initiates or receives telephone calls) that involves attempts to induce 22 consumers to purchase any item, good, service, partnership 23 interest, trust interest or other beneficial interest, or to enter 24 25 a contest for a prize, by means of telephone sales presentations, either exclusively or in conjunction with the use of other forms 26 27 of marketing, unless such transaction is not completed until after

28

- 5 -

a face-to-face contact between the seller or solicitor and the consumers solicited.

1

2

3

28

II. PROHIBITED BUSINESS ACTIVITIES

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, in connection with the 4 Α. 5 advertising, marketing, promoting, offering for sale, or sale of any good or service, Defendant Moreno, and his agents, servants, 6 7 employees, attorneys, and all persons or entities directly or 8 indirectly under his control, and all other persons or entities in active concert or participation with him who receive actual notice 9 of this Order by personal service or otherwise, and each such 10 11 person, whether acting directly or through any corporation, limited liability company, subsidiary, division or other device, 12 are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from: 13

Misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, that
 any consumer, or any consumer's employee or other representative,
 ordered any good or service that was shipped, provided, and/or
 billed to the consumer by Defendant;

2. Misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, that Defendant is, or is associated with, a consumer's regular supplier or provider of the good or service, or is associated with the manufacturer of any product or equipment used by the consumer in conjunction with the good or service;

3. Misrépresenting to any consumer, or any consumer's
employee or representative, expressly or by implication, that
Defendant has previously transacted business with the consumer;

4. Making any misrepresentation, expressly or by
implication, regarding a consumer's obligation to make payment; or

- 5 -

15. Making any misrepresentation, expressly or by2implication, regarding the price of the product or service.

3 Β. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, in connection with the 4 advertising, marketing, promoting, offering for sale, or sale of 5 any good or service, Defendant Moreno, and his agents, servants, employees, attorneys, and all persons or entities directly or б indirectly under his control, and all other persons or entities in 7 8 active concert or participation with him who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, and each such 9 10 person, whether acting directly or through any corporation, limited liability company, subsidiary, division or other device, 11 are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from 12 misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, any other fact 13 material to a consumer's decision to buy or accept the good or 14 service from Defendant. 15

C. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Moreno, and his 16 agents, servants, employees, attorneys, and all persons or 17 entities directly or indirectly under his control, and all other 18 persons or entities in active concert or participation with him 19 who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or 20 21 otherwise, and each such person, whether acting directly or 22 through any corporation, limited liability company, subsidiary, division or other device, are hereby permanently restrained and 23 24 enjoined from:

Violating Section 310.3(a) (4) of the Telemarketing
 Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. § 310.3(a) (4), by making false or misleading
 statements to induce a consumer to pay for any product or service,
 including, but not limited to, misrepresenting directly or by

- 7 -

1 implication that (a) Defendant is, or is associated with, a
2 consumer's regular supplier or provider of the good or service, or
3 is associated with the manufacturer of any product or equipment
4 used by the consumer in conjunction with the good or service, or
5 (b) the consumer ordered any good or service that was shipped,
6 provided, and/or billed to the consumer by Defendant;

7 2. Violating Section 310.4(d)(2) of the Telemarketing
8 Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. § 310.4(d)(2), by failing to disclose
9 promptly and in a clear and conspicuous manner to the person
10 receiving the call, in "outbound telephone calls," as that term is
11 defined in the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. § 310.2(n),
12 that the purpose of the call is to sell goods;

3. Violating Section 310.4(d)(1) of the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. § 310.4(d)(1), by failing to disclose the identity of the seller to the person receiving the call, promptly and in a clear and conspicuous manner, in "outbound telephone calls," as that term is defined in the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. § 310.2(n);

4. Violating Section 310.3(b) of the Telemarketing
Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. § 310.3(b), by providing substantial
assistance or support to any seller or telemarketer when Defendant
Moreno knows or consciously avoids knowing that the seller or
telemarketer is engaged in any act or practice that violates
Section 310.3(a), 310.3(c), or Section 310.4, of the Telemarketing
Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R §§ 310.3(a), 310.3(c) or 310.4; or

26 5. Violating or assisting others in violating any
27 other provision of the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. Part
28 310.

- 8 -

Provided, however, that nothing in this Section shall be construed to nullify the prohibitions set forth in Section I above.

A copy of the Telemarketing Sales Rule is appended to this Order as Attachment A and is incorporated herein as if fully rewritten. In the event that the Telemarketing Sales Rule is amended by the Commission in a manner which would create a new or different standard applicable to Defendant's obligations under this Order, Defendant's compliance with the Telemarketing Sales Rule as so amended shall not be deemed a violation of this Order.

10

1

2

III. PROHIBITIONS AGAINST DISTRIBUTION OF CUSTOMER LISTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Moreno, and his agents, 11 servants, employees, attorneys, and all persons or entities 12 directly or indirectly under his control, and all other persons or 13 14 entities in active concert or participation with him who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, and 15 each such person, whether acting directly or through any 16 corporation, limited liability company, subsidiary, division or 17 other device, are permanently restrained and enjoined from 18 selling, renting, leasing, transferring or otherwise disclosing 19 20 the name, address, telephone number, credit card number, bank account number or other identifying information of any person who 21 paid any money to Defendant Moreno doing business as Continental 22 23 Business Systems, United Products, or United Products, Inc., at any time, in connection with the offering for sale or sale of any 24 good or service; provided, however, that Defendant may disclose 25 such identifying information to a law enforcement agency or as 26 required by any law, regulation or court order, and shall disclose 27

q

28

such identifying information to the Commission pursuant to this
 Order.

3 IV. PROHIBITION ON TRANSFERRING BUSINESS INFORMATION IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Moreno, and his agents, 4 5 servants, employees, attorneys, and all persons or entities directly or indirectly under his control, and all other persons or 6 entities in active concert or participation with him who receive 7 8 actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, and each such person, whether acting directly or through any 9 corporation, limited liability company, subsidiary, division or 10 11 other device, are hereby restrained and enjoined from transferring 12 or in any other way providing to any person (other than a federal, state or local law enforcement agency or pursuant to a court 13 order), directly or indirectly, any books, records, tapes, disks, 14 accounting data, manuals, electronically stored data, banking 15 records, invoices, telephone records, ledgers, payroll records, or 16 other documents of any kind, including information stored in 17 computer-maintained form, in the possession, custody or control of 18 Defendant Moreno, or any trade secrets or knowledge, whether 19 recorded or otherwise, that are in any way related to Continental 20 21 Business Systems, United Products, or United Products, Inc., or any business Defendant Moreno has owned or controlled individually 22 or jointly that has sold any nondurable office supplies. 23

24

28

V. SUSPENDED JUDGMENT

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that judgment is hereby entered against Defendant Moreno in the amount of \$2,500,000 (TWO MILLION FIVE HUNDRED THOUSAND DOLLARS); provided, however, that this judgment

- 10 -

shall be suspended subject to the conditions set forth in Section VI of this Order.

VI. RIGHT TO REOPEN AND TERMINATE SUSPENSION 3 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Commission's agreement to this 4 Order is expressly premised upon the truthfulness, accuracy and 5 completeness of Defendant Moreno's December 14, 1999 financial 6 7 statement and testimony he provided in his February 16, 2000 8 deposition. Said financial statement and testimony contain material information upon which the FTC has relied in negotiating 9 10 and agreeing to the terms of this Order. If, upon motion by the Commission to the Court, the Court finds that Defendant Moreno 11 failed to disclose any material asset with a value exceeding 12 13 \$1,000, or materially misrepresented the value of any asset, or made any other material misrepresentation in or omission from his 14 financial statement or deposition testimony, the suspension of the 15 monetary judgment will be terminated and the entire judgment 16 amount of \$2,500,000 (TWO MILLION FIVE HUNDRED THOUSAND DOLLARS), 17 18 less any amounts paid to the Commission by the Receiver pursuant to Section IX of this Order, will be immediately due and payable. 19 For purposes of this Section, and any subsequent proceedings to 20 21 enforce payment, including but not limited to a nondischargeability complaint filed in a bankruptcy proceeding, 22 Defendant Moreno stipulates to all of the allegations in the 23 Commission's Complaint. 24

25 26

27

28

1

2

VII. ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF RECEIPT OF ORDER

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, within five (5) business days after entry of this Order, Defendant Moreno shall submit to the

- ,11 -

Commission a truthful sworn and notarized statement, in the form shown on Appendix 1, that shall acknowledge receipt of this Order as entered.

Ξ.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

VIII. LIFT OF ASSET FREEZE

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the freeze of Defendant Moreno's assets, imposed in the Preliminary Injunction entered in this proceeding, shall be lifted upon the entry of this Order.

IX. RECEIVERSHIP

9 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the receivership imposed in the Preliminary Injunction entered in this proceeding shall be 10 11 continued until such time as the Receiver has taken the necessary 12 steps to wind down the business of the receivership defendant. 13 Such necessary steps shall include canceling the receivership 14 defendant's contracts, liquidating the receivership defendant's 15 assets, and taking such other steps as may be necessary to terminate the receivership defendant efficiently. 16 The Receiver shall also seek and carry out the Court's instructions as to 17 18 disposition of checks received by the receivership defendant on or 19 after the date on which the Receiver took control of the 20 receivership defendant. The Receiver is directed, promptly upon completion of the steps taken to wind down the business of the 21 22 receivership defendant, to provide a report to the Court which details the steps taken to dissolve the receivership estate. The 23 24 report shall include an inventory of the receivership estates and 25 an accounting of the receivership estate's finances. Upon completion of the requirements of this Section, the Receiver shall 26 move that this Court order termination of this receivership. 27 At 28 such time, the Receiver shall make a final request for payment of

- 12 -

compensation for the performance of duties pursuant to the 1 Preliminary Injunction entered in this proceeding and pursuant to 2 this Section and for the cost of actual out-of-pocket expenses 3 incurred. Once the Receiver has been compensated in an amount 4 approved by the Court, the Receiver shall transfer all remaining 5 funds of the receivership defendant to the Commission for consumer б redress or disgorgement as provided for in Section X of this 7 8 Order. The Receiver shall promptly return all other records of the receivership defendant in his possession relating to its 9 10 financial operation to Defendant Moreno so that he may prepare and file all necessary income tax returns. 11

12

13

X. USE OF CONSUMER REDRESS AND DISGORGEMENT FUNDS IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:

A. The Commission shall deposit funds received from the
Receiver pursuant to this Order in an interest-bearing account.
The funds shall be used to provide redress to injured consumers
and to pay expenses of administering the redress fund, or in
accordance with Paragraph B of this Section;

B. If the Commission determines, in its sole discretion, that redress to consumers is wholly or partially impracticable, any funds not so used shall be deposited into the United States Treasury, or may be used to educate consumers affected by the practices set forth in the Commission's Complaint in this matter. Defendant Moreno shall have no right to contest the manner of distribution chosen by the Commission;

C. If the Commission determines that payment of redress to consumers is not impracticable, the Commission shall submit a plan for the disbursement of funds to the Court for review and

- 13 -

1 approval. In establishing this plan, the Commission shall have
2 full and sole discretion to determine the criteria and parameters
3 for participation by injured consumers in a redress program, and
4 may delegate any and all tasks connected with such redress program
5 to any individuals, partnerships, or corporations, and pay the
6 fees, salaries, and expenses incurred thereby in carrying out said
7 tasks from the funds received pursuant to this Order.

8

28

XI. RECORD KEEPING PROVISIONS

9 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of five (5) years 10 from the date of entry of this Order, Defendant Moreno, in connection with any and every business entity of which he is a 11 majority owner, or which he otherwise manages or controls, is 12 13 hereby restrained and enjoined from failing to create, and to 14 retain, in a location under his control, for a period of three (3) 15 years following the date of such creation, unless otherwise specified: 16

A. Books, records and accounts that, in reasonable detail,
accurately and fairly reflect the cost of goods or services sold,
revenues generated, and the disbursement of such revenues;

Records accurately reflecting: the name, address, and 20 в. telephone number of each person employed in any capacity by such 21 business, including as an independent contractor; that person's 22 job title or position; the date upon which the person commenced 23 work; and the date and reason for the person's termination, if 24 applicable. The businesses subject to this Paragraph shall retain 25 such records for any terminated employee for a period of three (3) 26 years following the date of termination; 27

- 14 -

1 C. Records containing the names, addresses, phone numbers, 2 dollar amounts paid, quantity of items or services purchased, and 3 description of items or services purchased, for all consumers to 4 whom such business has sold, invoiced or shipped any goods or 5 services, or from whom such business accepted money or other items 6 of value;

D. Records that reflect, for every consumer complaint or
refund request, whether received directly or indirectly or through
any third party:

- 10 (1) the consumer's name, address, telephone number and the
 11 dollar amount paid by the consumer;
 - (2) the written complaint or refund request, if any, and the date of the complaint or refund request;
- 14 (3) the basis of the complaint, including the name of any 15 salesperson complained against, and the nature and 16 result of any investigation conducted concerning any 17 complaint;
- 18 (4) each response and the date of the response;

12

13

28

(5) any final resolution and the date of the resolution; and
(6) in the event of a denial of a refund request, the reason
for the denial; and

E. Copies of all sales scripts, training materials,
advertisements, or other marketing materials utilized; provided
that copies of all sales scripts, training materials,
advertisements, or other marketing materials utilized shall be
retained for three (3) years after the last date of dissemination
of any such materials.

- 15 -

XII. COMPLIANCE REPORTING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, in order that compliance with the
provisions of this Order may be monitored, for a period of five
(5) years commencing with the date of entry of this Order,
Defendant Moreno shall notify the Commission of the following:
A. Any change of residence, mailing address or telephone

A. Any change of residence, mailing address or telephone
number-within ten (10) days of the date of such change;

B. Any change in employment status—including
self-employment—within ten (10) business days of such change; such
notice shall include the name and address of each business with
which Defendant Moreno is affiliated or employed, a statement of
the nature of the business, and a statement of Defendant Moreno's
duties and responsibilities in connection with the business; and

C. Any proposed change in the structure of any business 14 entity owned or controlled by Defendant Moreno, such as creation, 15 incorporation, dissolution, assignment, sale, creation or 16 dissolution of subsidiaries, or any other changes that may affect 17 compliance obligations arising out of this Order-within thirty 18 19 (30) days prior to the effective date of any proposed change; 20 provided, however, that with respect to any proposed change in 21 structure of such business about which Defendant Moreno learns less than thirty (30) days prior to the date such action is to 22 take place, he shall notify the Commission as soon as practicable 23 24 after learning of such proposed change.

25

1

XIII. ACCESS TO BUSINESS PREMISES

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of five (5) years from the date of entry of this Order, for the purpose of further determining compliance with this Order, Defendant Moreno shall

- 16 -

permit representatives of the Commission, within three (3)
 business days of receipt of written notice from the Commission:

3 Access during normal business hours to any office, or Α. facility storing documents, of any business where Defendant Moreno 4 is the majority owner of the business or directly or indirectly 5 manages or controls the business. In providing such access, 6 Defendant Moreno shall permit representatives of the Commission to 7 inspect and copy all documents relevant to any matter contained in 8 9 this Order; and shall permit Commission representatives to remove 10 documents relevant to any matter contained in this Order for a 11 period not to exceed five (5) business days so that the documents may be inspected, inventoried, and copied; and 12

To interview the officers, directors, and employees, 13 Β. including all personnel involved in responding to consumer 14 complaints or inquiries, and all sales personnel, whether 15 designated as employees, consultants, independent contractors or 16 17 otherwise, of any business to which Paragraph A of this Section applies, concerning matters relating to compliance with the terms 18 of this Order. The person interviewed may have counsel present. 19 Provided that, upon application of the Commission and for good 20 21 cause shown, the Court may enter an ex parte order granting immediate access to all premises at which Defendant Moreno 22 conducts business or stores documents, for the purposes of 23 inspecting and copying all documents relevant to any matter 24 contained in this Order. 25

17 -

- 26
- 27 28

XIV. FTC'S AUTHORITY TO MONITOR COMPLIANCE IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Commission is authorized to monitor Defendant's compliance with this Order by all lawful means-including, but not limited to, the following:

1

2

3

4

22

28

5 The Commission is authorized-without further leave of Α. this Court, but on notice to counsel for Defendant Moreno as 6 7 required by the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure-to obtain 8 discovery from any person in the manner provided by Chapter V of 9 the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, Fed. R. Civ. P. 26-37, 10 including the use of compulsory process pursuant to Federal R. Civ. P. 45, for the purpose of investigating compliance with any 11 provision of this Order; 12

B. The Commission is authorized—without the necessity of
prior notice—to use representatives posing as consumers to
Defendant Moreno, his employees, or any other entity managed or
controlled in whole or in part by Defendant Moreno;

17 C. Nothing in this Order shall limit the Commission's 18 lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of 19 the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1, for the purpose of 20 investigation compliance with this Order or Section 5 of the FTC 21 Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45.

XV. ORDER DISTRIBUTION

23IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of five (5) years24from the date of entry of this Order, Defendant Moreno shall:

A. Immediately provide a copy of this Order to, and obtain
a signed and dated acknowledgment of receipt of the same, from
each officer, director and managing agent in any company or other

- 18 -

business entity directly or indirectly owned, operated or, 1 controlled by Defendant Moreno; and 2

4

5

6

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

Maintain, and upon reasonable notice make available to 3 в. the FTC's representatives, the original and dated acknowledgments of the receipts required by this Section of this Order.

XVI. NOTICES

7 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that for purposes of this Order, 8 Defendant Moreno shall, unless otherwise directed by the Commission's authorized representatives, mail all written 9 10 notifications to the Commission to:

> ASSISTANT REGIONAL DIRECTOR Federal Trade Commission Western Region-Los Angeles 10877 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 700 Los Angeles, CA 90024 Re: FTC_v. Moreno

WAIVER OF CLAIMS XVII.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Moreno waives all claims under the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, as amended by Pub. L. 104-121, 110 Stat. 847, 863-64 (1996), and all rights to seek appellate review or otherwise challenge or contest the validity of this Order, or the temporary or preliminary orders entered in this proceeding, and further waives and releases any claim he may have against the FTC, the Receiver, or their employees, agents, or representatives, and the Receiver waives all claims against Defendant Moreno.

INDEPENDENCE OF OBLIGATIONS XVIII.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the expiration of any requirements imposed by this Order shall not affect any other obligation arising under this Order.

- 19 -

1	XIX. COSTS AND ATTORNEYS FEES
2	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that each party to this Order bear its
3	own costs and attorneys fees incurred in connection with this
4	action.
5	XX. CONTINUED JURISDICTION
6	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Court shall retain
7	jurisdiction of this matter for all purposes.
8	XXI. ENTRY BY CLERK
9	There being no just reason for delay, the Clerk of the Court
10	is hereby directed to enter this Order.
11	
12	SO STIPULATED:
13	Dated: D_{CC} , 12, 2000 FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
14	John Di Jacobs
15	Jennifer Larabee Attorneys for Plaintiff
16	
17	Dated: 12/07/00, 2000 David Moreno
18	Defendant 📝
19	
20	APPROVED AS TO FORM
21	Dated: $12 07 00$, 2000
22	Alan B. Pick Pick & Boydston, LLP
23	Attorney for Defendant David Moreno
24	
25	IT IS SO ORDERED.
26	Dated:DEC14_2000 MANUEL L. REAL
27	United States District Judge
28	

- 20 -

			ļ
2	•		
-	1	[APPENDIX 1]	
	2		
	3		· · ·
	4		
	5		
	6		
	7		
	8	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT	
	9	FOR THE CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA	
1	.0	WESTERN DIVISION	•
1	.1		
1	.2) Case No. CV-99-12837 R (AIJx)	
1	.3	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION,)	
-1	.4	Plaintiff,) AFFIDAVIT OF DEFENDANT DAVID) MORENO ACKNOWLEDGING RECEIPT OF	
1	.5	v.) STIPULATED FINAL JUDGMENT AND) ORDER	
1	.6	DAVID MORENO,) an individual doing)	
1	7	business as Continental) Business Systems, and) doing business as United)	
1	.8	Products,	
1	.9	Defendant.	
2	0		
2	i	I, David Moreno, hereby declare as follows:	•
2	2	1. I am a defendant in the action <u>FTC v. Moreno</u> (United	
2	3	States District Court, Central District of California, CV-99-12837	
2	24	R (AIJx)). My current residence address is	
2	25		
2	26	I am a citizen of the United States and over the age of eighteen.	
2	27	I have personal knowledge of the facts set forth in this	
2	28	Affidavit.	
		- 21 -	

[APPENDIX 1]

:

1

Τ.	[APPENDIX I]
2	2. I agreed to entry of a Stipulated Final Judgment and
3	Order ("Stipulated Order") against me to settle the charges in the
4	Commission's Complaint. I read the provisions of the Stipulated
5	Order, including Attachment A (the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16
6	C.F.R. Part 310) before signing it. I understand all the
7	provisions of the Stipulated Order. By signing the Stipulated
8	Order I agreed to be bound by those provisions.
9	3. On, 20, I received a copy of the
10	Stipulated Order which was signed by a United States District
11	Judge and entered by the Court on, 20,
12	A true and correct copy of the Stipulated Order that I received,
13	including Attachment A (the Telemarketing Sales Rule), is appended
14	to this affidavit. The Stipulated Order, including Attachment A
15	(the Telemarketing Sales Rule), was pages in length. I
16	111
17	
18	
19	
20	Э.
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
	- 22 -

., ,	
1	[APPENDIX 1]
2	reviewed the document and confirmed it was the document I had
3	previously signed.
4	I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the
5	United States that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on
6	, 20, at, California.
7	
8	David Moreno
9	State of, City of
10.	
11	Subscribed and sworn to before me
12 13	this day of, 20
13 14	
15	Notary Public My Commission Expires:
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
	- 23 -

-

Federal Trade Commission

(c) *Credit* means the right granted by a creditor to a debtor to defer payment of debt or to incur debt and defer its payment.

d) Credit card means any card, plate, coupon book, or other credit device existing for the purpose of obtaining money, property, labor, or services on credit.

(g) Credit card sales draft means any record or evidence of a credit card transaction.

(b) Credit card system means anymethod or procedure used to process credit card transactions involving credit cards issued or licensed by the operator of that system.

(i) Customer means any person who is or may be required to pay for goods or services offered through telemarketing.

(j) Investment opportunity means anything, tangible or intangible, that is offered, offered for sale, sold, or traded based wholly or in part on representations, either express or implied, about past, present, or future income, profit, or appreciation

(k) Material means likely to affect a person's choice of, or conduct regarding, goods or services.

(1) Merchant means a person who is authorized under a written contract with an acquirer to honor or accept credit cards, or to transmit or process for payment credit card payments, for the purchase of goods or services.

(m) Merchant agreement means a written contract between a merchant and an acquirer to honor or accept credit cards, or to transmit or process for payment credit card payments, for the purchase of goods or services.

(n) Outbound telephone call means a telephone call initiated by a telemarketer to induce the purchase of goods or services.

(0) *Person* means any individual, group, unincorporated association, limited or general partnership, corporation, or other business entity.

(p) Prize means anything offered, or purportedly offered, and given, or purportedly given, to a person by chance. For purposes of this definition, chance exists if a person is guaranteed to receive an item and, at the time of the offer or purported offer, the tele marketer does not identify the specific item that the person will receive.

§ 310.2

(q) Prize promotion means:

(1) A sweepstakes or other game of chance; or

(2) An oral or written express or im , plied representation that a person has won, has been selected to receive, or may be eligible to receive a prize or purported prize.

(r) Seller means any person who, in connection with a telemarketing trans action, provides, offers to provide, or arranges for others to provide goods or services to the customer in exchange for consideration.

(s) State means any State of United States, the District of Colubia, Puerto Rico, the Northern Mariana Islands, and any territory or possession of the United States.

(t) Telemarketer means any person who, in connection with telemarketing initiates or receives telephone calls to or from a customer.

(u) Telemarketing means a plan, program, or campaign which is conducted to induce the purchase of goods or services by use of one or more telephones and which involves more than one interstate telephone call. The term does not include the solicitation of sales through the mailing of a catalog which: Contains a written description or illustration of the goods or service offered for sale; includes the business address of the seller, includes multiple pages of written material or illustrations; and has been issued not less quently than once a year, when the

person making the solicitation does not solicit customers by telephone but only receives calls initiated by cus tomers in response to the catalog and during those calls takes orders only without further solicitation. For pur poses of the previous sentence, the term further solicitation does not in clude providing the customer with un formation about, or attempting to sell, any other item included in the same catalog which prompted the customer's call or in a substantially similar ratalog.

. .

PART 310-TELEMARKETING SALES RULE

....

40.1 Scope of regulations in this part 40.2 Definition.

40.3 Deceptive relemanded ing as he of place

tiers

(0) F. Abustye, telemarketing acts or practices (0.5) Record Respire requirements.

40.6 Exemptions

40.0 - A choirs by States and private persons

(10) Several data y

AUTHORITY IN US C 6001 6008

Solacts 60 FR 13961 Ang 23, 1995 anless otherwise noted

\$310.1 Scope of regulations in this part.

This part implements the Telemarketing and Consumer Frand and

§310.2 Definitions.

(a) Acquirer means a business organization. financial institution, or an agent of a business organization or financial institution that has authority from an organization that operates or licenses a credit card system to authorize merchants to accept. transmit, or process payment by credit card through the credit card system for money, goods or services, or anything else of value.

(h) Attorney General means the chief legal officer of a State.

(c) Cardholder means a person to whom a credit card is issued or who is authorized to use a credit card on behalf of or in addition to the person to whom the credit card is issued.

(d) Commission means the Federal Trade Commission

16 CFR Ch. I (1-1-00 Edition)

\$319.3 Deceptive telemarketing acts or practices.

(a) Prohibited deceptive telemarketing as a practices It is a deceptive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for any seller or telemarketer to engage in the following conduct.

(1) Before a customer pays) for goods of setvices offered, tailing to disclose, in a clear and conspirious manner, the following material information:

(i) The total costs to purchase, receive, or use, and the quantity of, any goods or services that are the subject of the sales ofter."

(ii) All material restrictions, limita tions of conditions to purchase, receive of use the goods or services that ite the subject of the sales offer.

(iii) If the seller has a policy of notmaking refunds, cancellations, exchanges, or repurchases, a statement informing the customer that this is the seller's policy, or, if the seller or telemarketer markes a representation about a refund, cancellation, exchange, or repurchase policy, a statement of all material terms and conditions of such policy.

(iv) In any prize promotion, the odds of being able to receive the prize, and if the odds are not calculatile in advance, the factors used in calculating the odds, that no purchase or payment is required to win a prize or to participate in a prize promotion; and the no purchase no payment method of participating in the prize promotion with either instructions on how to participate or an address or local or toll free telephone number to which customers may write or call for information on how to participate, and

⁴When a seller or telemarketer uses, or directs a customer to use a courter to trusport payment, the seller or telemarketer must make the disclosures required by \$30036ard) before significal courter to pick up payment or authorization for payment, or directing a customer to have a courier pick up payment or authorization for payment. ⁵ For others of consumer credits products subject to the Truth in Lending Act. 15 USC 1600 et ser, and Regulation Z. 12 CFR part 256, compliance with the disclosure requirements under the Truth in Lending Act, and Reculation Z, shall constitute complimany with \$400 et or or this Rule.

(v) All material costs or conditions to receive or redeem a prize that is the subject of the prize promotion.

(2) Misrepresenting, directly or by implication, any of the following mate rial information

(i) The total costs to purchase, receive, or use, and the quantity of, any goods or services that are the subject of a sales offer. $\frac{1}{2}$

(ii) Any material restriction, limitation, or condition to purchase, receive, or use goods or services that are the subject of a sales offer.

oii) Any material aspect of the performance, efficacy, nature, or central characteristics of goods or services that are the subject of a sales offer:

(iv) Any material aspect of the nature or terms of the seller's refund, cancellation, exchange, or repurchase policies,

(v) Any material aspect of a prize promotion including, but not limited to, the olds of being able to recrive a prize, the nature or value of a prize, or that a purchase or payment is required to win a prize or to participate in 3, prize promotion:

(vi) Any material aspect of an investment opportunity including, but notlimited to, risk, liquidity, earnings potential, or profitability, or

(vit) A seller's or telemarketer's alfiliation with, or endorsement by, any government or third party organization.

(3) Obtaining or submitting for payment a check, draft, or other form of negotiable paper drawn on a person's checking, savings, share, or similar account, without that person's express verifiable authorization. Such authorization shall be deemed verifiable if any of the following means are employed:

(i) Express written authorization by the customer, which may include the customer's signature on the negotiable instrument, or

(ii) Express oral authorization which is tape recorded and made available upon request to the customer's bank and which evidences clearly both the customer's authorization of payment for the goods and services that are the subject of the sales offer and the customer's receipt of all of the following information.

Federal Trade Commission

(A) The date of the draft(s);

(B) The amount of the draft(s);

(C) The payor's name:

(D) The number of draft payments (if more than one);

 $({\rm E})$ A telephone number for customer inquiry that is answered during normal business hours; and

(F) The date of the customer's oral authorization; or

(iii) Written confirmation of the transaction, sent to the customer prior to submission for payment of the customer's check, draft, or other form of negotiable paper, that includes:

(A) All of the information contained in \S 310.3(a)(3)(ii)(A) (F); and

(B) The procedures by which the customer can obtain a refund from the seller or telemarketer in the event the confirmation is inaccurate; and

(4) Making a false or misleading statement to induce any person to pay for goods or services.

(b) Assisting and facilitating. It is a deceptive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a person to provide substantial assistance or support to any seller or telemarketer when that person knows or consciously avoids knowing that the seller or telemarketer is engaged in any act or practice that violates §§310.3 (a) or (c), or §310.4 of this Rule.

(c) Credit card laundering. Except as expressly permitted by the applicable credit card system, it is a deceptive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for:

(1) A merchant to present to or deposit into, or cause another to present to or deposit into, the credit card system for payment, a credit card sales draft generated by a telemarketing transaction that is not the result of a telemarketing credit card transaction between the cardholder and the merchant;

(2) Any person to employ, solicit, or otherwise cause a merchant or an employee, representative, or agent of the merchant, to present to or deposit into the credit card system for payment, a credit card sales draft generated by a telemarketing transaction that is not the result of a telemarketing credit card transaction between the cardholder and the merchant; or (3) Any person to obtain access to the credit card system through the use of , business relationship or an affiliation with a merchant, when such access 1 not authorized by the merchant agree ment or the applicable credit card sys tem.

\$310.4 Abusive telemarketing acts or practices.

(a) Abusive conduct generally. It is an abusive telemarketing act or practicand a violation of this Rule for an's seller or telemarketer to engage in the following conduct:

(1) Threats, intimidation, or the use of profane or obscene language;

(2) Requesting or receiving pays of of any fee or consideration for goo a services represented to remove deroga tory information from, or improve, person's credit history, credit record or credit rating until:

(i) The time frame in which the selle has represented all of the goods or services will be provided to that person has expired; and

(ii) The seller has provided the person with documentation in the form of . consumer report from a consumer reporting agency demonstrating that the promised results have been achieved such report having been issued morthan six months after the results werachieved. Nothing in this Rule shoulbe construed to affect the requirement in the Fair Credit Reporting Act. 1: U.S.C. 1681, that a consumer report may only be obtained for a specific permissible purpose:

(3) Requesting or receiving pay (1) of any fee or consideration from k (1) son, for goods or services represented to recover or otherwise assist in the return of money or any other item of value paid for by, or promised to, that person in a previous telemarketing transaction, until seven (2) business days after such money or other item (1) delivered to that person. This provision shall not apply to goods or service provided to a person by a licensed at torney; or

(4) Requesting or receiving payment of any fee or consideration in advance of obtaining a loan or other extension of credit when the seller or telmarketer has guaranteed or represented a high likelihood of success B do Pathemorically dielt is an abusive fomarketing act of practice and a solution of this Rule for a tele collected to engage in, or for a seller solution a telemarketer to engage in, he following conduct

to Causing any telephone to ring, or as using any person in telephone conservation repeatedly or continuously with intent to annoy, abuse, or harass to person at the called number, or

are hortalting an outbound telephone off to a person when that person preequily has stated that he or she does as w_i is to receive an outbound teledone call made by or on behalf of the other who e could or services are being streed.

3) A other of telemarketer will not a bable for violating \$310 information to b has established and implemented written procedures to comply.

with §410 (choose) in the cash it has trained its personnel in the

procedures established pursuant to (40 februari

out) The adder, or the telemarketer e-ting on behalf of the seller, has maintained and recorded lists of perons who may not be contacted, in compliance with §310.4(lorphil), and

(b) Any subsequent call is the result of error

(c) Calling time restrictions. Without the prior consent of a person, it is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this flule for a telemarketer to engage in outbound telephone calls to a person's residence at any time other than between 8 a.m. and 9 p.m. local time at the called person's location.

of) Required and disclosures. If is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a telemarketer in an outbound telephone call to fail to disclose promptly and in a clear and conspicuous manner to the person receiving the call, the following information:

(1) The identity of the seller;

(2) That the purpose of the call is to sell goods or services;

(3) The nature of the goods or services; and

(4) That no purchase or payment is necessary to be able to win a prize or

2346

participate in a prize promotion if a prize promotion is offered. This disclosure must be made before or in conjunction with the description of the prize to the person called. If requested by that person, the telemarketer must disclose the no-purchase no-payment entry method for the prize promotion.

§310.5 Recordkeeping requirements.

(a) Any seller or telemarketer shall keep, for a period of 21 months from the date the record is produced, the following records relating to 18 felemarketing activities

(d) All substantially different advertising, brochares, telemarketing scripts, and promotional materials.

(2) The name and last known address of each prize recipient and the prize awarded for prizes that are represented, directly or by implication, to have a value of \$25,00 of more.

(3) The name and last known address of each customer, the goods or services purchased, the date such goods or services tees were shipped or provided, and the amount paid by the customer for the goods or services.⁴

ch The name, any fictitious name used, the last known home address and telephone number, and the job title(s) for all current and former employees directly involved in telephone sales, provided, however, that if the seller or telemarketer permits fictitious fiames to be used by employees, each fictatious name must be traceable to only one specific employee, and

(5) All verifiable authorizations required to be provided or received under this Rule.

the A seller or telemarketer may keep the records required by §310.5(a) in any form, and in the manner, for mat, or place as they keep such records in the ordinary course of business. Failure to keep all records required by §310.5(a) shall be a violation of this Rule.

(c) The seller and the telemarketer calling on behalf of the seller may, by

For offers of constiner credit products subject to the Truth in Leinding Act. 15 U.S.C. 1601 et seq., and Regulation Z. 12 CFR part 226, compliance with the recordscepting requirements under the Truth in Lending Act, and Regulation Z, shall constitute compliance with §310 based of this Rule.

Federal Trade Commission

written agreement, allocate responsibility between themselves for the recordkeeping required by this section. When a seller and telemarketer have entered into such an agreement, the terms of that agreement shall govern. and the seller or telemarketer, as the case may be, need not keep records that duplicate those of the other. If the agreement is unclear as to who must maintain any required record(s), or if no such agreement exists, the seller shall be responsible for complying with 66310.5(a)(1) (3) and (5). the tele marketer shall be responsible for com plying with \$310.5(a)(4).

(d) In the event of any dissolution or termination of the seller's or tele marketer's business, the principal of that seller or telemarketer shall maintain all records as required under this section. In the event of any sale, as summent, or other change in ownership of the seller's or telemarketer's business, the successor business shall main tain all records required under this section.

§310.6 Exemptions.

The following acts or practices are exemption this Rule.

(a) The sale of pay per call services subject to the Commission's "Trade Regulation Rule Pursuant to the Tele phone Disclosure and Dispute Resolution Act of 1992," 16 CFR part 308;

the Commission's Rule entitled "Disclosure Requirements and Prohibitions Concerning Franchising and Business Opportunity Ventures," 16 CFR part 436;

(c) Telephone calls in which the sale of goods or services is not completed, and payment or authorization of payment is not required, until after a faceto-face sales presentation by the seller;

(d) Telephone calls initiated by a customer that are not the result of any solicitation by a seller or telemarketer:

(e) Telephone calls initiated by a customer in response to an advertisement through any media, other than directmail solicitations; provided, however, that this exemption does not apply to calls initiated by a customer in response to an advertisement relating to investment opportunities, goods or services described in §§310.4(a) (2) or (3), or advertisements that guarantee or represent a high likelihood of success in obtaining or arranging for extensions of credit, if payment of a fee is required in advance of obtaining the extension of credit;

(f) Telephone calls initiated by a cus tomer in response to a direct mail so licitation that clearly, conspicuously and truthfully discloses all material information listed in §310.3(a)(1) of this Rule for any item offered in the direct mall solicitation; provided, however, that this exemption does not apply to calls initiated by a customer in pe sponse to a direct mail solicitation relating to prize promotions, investment opportunities, goods or services de scribed in §§310.4(a) (2) or (3), or d⁽⁾ mail solicitations that guarantee represent a high likelihood of success. in obtaining or arranging for exten sions of credit, it payment of a fee is required in advance of obtaining the extension of credit, and

(g) Telephone calls between a tele inarketer and any basiness, except calls involving the retail sale of nondurable office or cleaning supplies, provided, however, that §310.5 of this Rule shall not apply to sollers or telemarketers of nondurable office of cleaning supplies

§310.7 Actions by States and private persons.

(a) Any attorney general or other of ficer of a State authorized by the State to bring an action under the Tele marketing and Consumer Fraud and Abuse Prevention Act, and any private person who brings an action under

Act, shall serve written notice of an action on the Commission, if feasible prior to its initiating an action under this Rule. The notice shall be sent to the Office of the Director, Bureau of Consumer Protection, Federal Trade Commission, Washington, DC 20580, and shall include a copy of the Stata's of private person's complaint and any other pleadings to be filed 'with the court. If prior notice is not feasible the State or private person shall serve the Commission with the required no tice immediately upon instituting its action.

(b) Nothing contained in this section shall prohibit any attorney generation

§310.8

other authorized State official from proceeding in State court on the basis of an alleged violation of any civil or criminal statute of such State.

The provisions of this Rule are sepa-rate and severable from one another. If any provision is stayed or determined to be invalid, it is the Commission's in rention that the remaining provisions shall continue in effect

§310.8 Severability.

•

.....