

**UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
BEFORE THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION**

COMMISSIONERS: **Edith Ramirez, Chairwoman**
 Julie Brill
 Maureen K. Ohlhausen
 Joshua D. Wright
 Terrell McSweeney

In the Matter of

**NICE-PAK PRODUCTS, INC.,
a corporation, d/b/a NICE-PAK.**

FILE NO. 132 3272

**AGREEMENT CONTAINING
CONSENT ORDER**

The Federal Trade Commission has conducted an investigation of certain acts and practices of Nice-Pak Products, Inc., a corporation, also doing business as Nice-Pak (“proposed respondent”). Proposed respondent, having been represented by counsel, is willing to enter into an agreement containing a consent order resolving the allegations contained in the attached draft complaint. Therefore,

IT IS HEREBY AGREED by and between Nice-Pak Products, Inc., by its duly authorized officers, and counsel for the Federal Trade Commission that:

1. Proposed respondent Nice-Pak Products, Inc. is a New York corporation with its principal office or place of business at Two Nice-Pak Park, Orangeburg, NY 10962-1376.
2. Proposed respondent waives:
 - a. Any further procedural steps;
 - b. The requirement that the Commission’s decision contain a statement of findings of fact and conclusions of law; and
 - c. All rights to seek judicial review or otherwise to challenge or contest the validity of the order entered pursuant to this agreement.
3. This agreement shall not become part of the public record of the proceeding unless and until it is accepted by the Commission. If this agreement is accepted by the Commission, it, together with the draft complaint, will be placed on the public record for a period of thirty (30) days and information about it publicly released. The Commission thereafter may either withdraw its acceptance of this agreement and so notify proposed respondent, in which event it will take such action as it may consider appropriate, or issue and serve its complaint (in such form as the circumstances may require) and decision in disposition of the proceeding.

4. This agreement contemplates that, if it is accepted by the Commission, and if such acceptance is not subsequently withdrawn by the Commission pursuant to the provisions of Section 2.34 of the Commission's Rules, the Commission may, without further notice to proposed respondent, (1) issue its complaint corresponding in form and substance with the attached draft complaint and its decision containing the following order in disposition of the proceeding, and (2) make information about it public. When so entered, the order shall have the same force and effect and may be altered, modified, or set aside in the same manner and within the same time provided by statute for other orders. The order shall become final upon service. Delivery of the complaint and the decision and order to proposed respondent's address as stated in this agreement by any means specified in Section 4.4(a) of the Commission's Rules shall constitute service. Proposed respondent waives any right it may have to any other manner of service. The complaint may be used in construing the terms of the order. No agreement, understanding, representation, or interpretation not contained in the order or in the agreement may be used to vary or contradict the terms of the order.

5. Proposed respondent has read the draft complaint and consent order. It understands that it may be liable for civil penalties in the amount provided by law and other appropriate relief for each violation of the order after it becomes final.

6. Proposed respondent neither admits nor denies the allegations in the draft complaint, except as specifically stated in this order. Only for the purposes of this action, proposed respondent admits the facts necessary to establish jurisdiction.

ORDER

DEFINITIONS

For purposes of this order, the following definitions shall apply:

1. "Commerce" shall mean as defined in Section 4 of the Federal Trade Commission Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.
2. "Covered Product" shall mean all wipes, including but not limited to Kirkland Signature Moist Flushable Wipes, and any moist toilet tissue or cloth.
3. Unless otherwise specified, "respondent" shall mean Nice-Pak Products, Inc., a corporation, its successors and assigns and its officers, agents, representatives, and employees.

I.

IT IS ORDERED that Respondent, directly or through any corporation, partnership, subsidiary, division, trade name, or other device, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, packaging, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of any Covered Product in or affecting commerce, shall not make any representation, in any manner, expressly or by

implication, including through the use of a product name, endorsement, depiction, illustration, trademark, or trade name, that the Covered Product:

- A. is safe for sewer systems;
- B. is safe for septic systems;
- C. breaks apart shortly after flushing;
- D. will not clog household plumbing systems;
- E. will not clog household septic systems;
- F. is safe for plumbing;
- G. is safe to flush;
- H. dissolves or disperses when interacting with water; or
- I. is flushable,

unless the representation is non-misleading, and, at the time the representation is made, Respondent possesses and relies upon competent and reliable evidence, which, when appropriate based on the expertise of professionals in the relevant area must be competent and reliable scientific evidence, that, when considered in light of the entire body of relevant and reliable evidence, is sufficient in quantity and quality based on standards generally accepted in the relevant fields to substantiate that the representation is true. For the purposes of this Part, “competent and reliable evidence” means tests, analyses, research, studies, or other evidence based on the expertise of professionals in the relevant area, that have been conducted and evaluated in an objective manner by qualified persons, using procedures generally accepted in the profession to yield accurate and reliable results. For the purposes of this Part, “competent and reliable scientific evidence” means tests, analyses, research, or studies that have been conducted and evaluated in an objective manner by qualified persons, using procedures generally accepted in the profession to yield accurate and reliable results. Specifically, any tests, analyses, research, studies, or other evidence purporting to substantiate any of the above representations must at least:

A. demonstrate that the Covered Product disperses in a sufficiently short amount of time after flushing to avoid clogging, or other operational problems in, household and municipal sewage lines, septic systems, and other standard wastewater equipment; and

B. substantially replicate the physical conditions of the environment in which the Covered Product is claimed, directly or indirectly, expressly or by implication, to be properly disposed of; or, if no specific environment is claimed, then in all environments in which the product will likely be disposed of.

II.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Respondent, directly or through any corporation, partnership, subsidiary, division, trade name, or other device, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, packaging, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of any moist toilet tissue or cloth, in or affecting commerce, shall not make any representation, other than the representations covered by Part I of this Order, in any manner, expressly or by implication, including through the use of a product name, endorsement, depiction, illustration,

trademark, or trade name, about the benefits, performance, or efficacy of such product or service, unless the representation is non-misleading, and, at the time the representation is made, Respondent possesses and relies upon competent and reliable evidence, which, when appropriate based on the expertise of professionals in the relevant area must be competent and reliable scientific evidence, that, when considered in light of the entire body of relevant and reliable evidence, is sufficient in quantity and quality based on standards generally accepted in the relevant fields to substantiate that the representation is true. For the purposes of this Part, “competent and reliable evidence” means tests, analyses, research, studies, or other evidence based on the expertise of professionals in the relevant area, that have been conducted and evaluated in an objective manner by qualified persons, using procedures generally accepted in the profession to yield accurate and reliable results. For the purposes of this Part, “competent and reliable scientific evidence” means tests, analyses, research, or studies that have been conducted and evaluated in an objective manner by qualified persons, using procedures generally accepted in the profession to yield accurate and reliable results.

III.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Respondent, directly or through any corporation, partnership, subsidiary, division, or other device, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, packaging, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of the Covered Product, or any other product or service in or affecting commerce, shall not provide to others the means and instrumentalities with which to make any representation prohibited by Part I or II above. For the purposes of this Part, “means and instrumentalities” means any information, including, but not necessarily limited to, any advertising, labeling, or promotional, sales training, or purported substantiation materials, for use by trade customers in their marketing of such product or service.

IV.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Nice-Pak Products, Inc. and its successors and assigns shall, for five (5) years after the last date of dissemination of any representation covered by this order, maintain and upon request make available to the Federal Trade Commission for inspection and copying:

- A. All advertisements, labeling, packaging and promotional materials containing the representation;
- B. All materials that were relied upon in disseminating the representation;
- C. All tests, reports, studies, surveys, demonstrations, or other evidence in its possession or control that contradict, qualify, or call into question the representation, or the basis relied upon for the representation, including complaints and other communications with consumers or with governmental or consumer protection organizations; and
- D. All acknowledgments of receipt of this order obtained pursuant to Part V.

V.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Nice-Pak Products, Inc. and its successors and assigns shall, for five (5) years after entry of this order, deliver a copy of this order to all current and future subsidiaries, current and future principals, officers, directors, and managers, and to all current and future employees, agents, and representatives having responsibilities relating to the subject matter of this order, and shall secure from each such person a signed and dated statement acknowledging receipt of the order, with any electronic signatures complying with the requirements of the E-Sign Act, 15 U.S.C. § 7001 et seq. Nice-Pak Products, Inc. and its successors and assigns shall deliver this order to such persons within thirty (30) days after the date of service of this order, and to future such persons within thirty (30) days after such person assumes such position or responsibilities.

VI.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Nice-Pak Products, Inc. and its successors and assigns shall send as soon as practicable, but in no event later than thirty (30) days after entry of this order, by first-class mail, postage prepaid and return receipt requested, an exact copy of the notice attached hereto as Attachment A, showing the date of mailing, to all of its trade customers, wholesalers, and retailers for or to whom it has manufactured, labeled, packaged, advertised, promoted, offered for sale, sold, or distributed any Covered Product that was advertised, promoted, offered for sale, sold, or distributed, with any of the representations, expressly or by implication, including through the use of a product name, endorsement, depiction, illustration, trademark, or trade name, enumerated in Part I A through I of this Order. The notice required by this paragraph shall include a copy of this order, but shall not include any other document or enclosures and shall be sent to the principal place of business of each entity.

VII.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Nice-Pak Products, Inc., and its successors and assigns shall notify the Commission at least thirty (30) days prior to any change in the corporation(s) that may affect compliance obligations arising under this order, including but not limited to a dissolution, assignment, sale, merger, or other action that would result in the emergence of a successor corporation; the creation or dissolution of a subsidiary, parent, or affiliate that engages in any acts or practices subject to this order; the proposed filing of a bankruptcy petition; or a change in the corporate name or address. Provided, however, that, with respect to any proposed change in the corporation about which Nice-Pak Products, Inc. and its successors and assigns learn less than thirty (30) days prior to the date such action is to take place, it shall notify the Commission as soon as is practicable after obtaining such knowledge.

Unless otherwise directed by a representative of the Commission in writing, all notices required by this Part shall be emailed to Debrief@ftc.gov or sent by overnight courier (not the U.S. Postal Service) to: Associate Director for Enforcement, Bureau of Consumer Protection, Federal Trade Commission, 600 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Washington, DC 20580. The subject line must begin: In the Matter of Nice-Pak Products, Inc., FTC File Number 132 3272.

VIII.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Nice-Pak Products, Inc., and its successors and assigns, within sixty (60) days after the date of service of this order, shall each file with the Commission a true and accurate report, in writing, setting forth in detail the manner and form of their own compliance with this order. Within ten (10) days of receipt of written notice from a representative of the Commission, they shall submit additional true and accurate written reports.

Unless otherwise directed by a representative of the Commission in writing, all notices required by this Part shall be emailed to Debrief@ftc.gov or sent by overnight courier (not the U.S. Postal Service) to: Associate Director for Enforcement, Bureau of Consumer Protection, Federal Trade Commission, 600 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Washington, DC 20580. The subject line must begin: "Nice-Pak Products, Inc., Docket No. _____, File No. 132 3272."

IX.

This order will terminate twenty (20) years from the date of its issuance, or twenty (20) years from the most recent date that the United States or the Federal Trade Commission files a complaint (with or without an accompanying consent decree) in federal court alleging any violation of the order, whichever comes later; provided, however, that the filing of such a complaint will not affect the duration of:

- A. Any Part in this order that terminates in less than twenty (20) years;
- B. This order's application to any respondent that is not named as a defendant in such complaint; and
- C. This order if such complaint is filed after the order has terminated pursuant to this Part.

Provided, further, that if such complaint is dismissed or a federal court rules that the respondent did not violate any provision of the order, and the dismissal or ruling is either not appealed or upheld on appeal, then the order will terminate according to this Part as though the complaint had never been filed, except that the order will not terminate between the date such complaint is filed and the later of the deadline for appealing such dismissal or ruling and the date such dismissal or ruling is upheld on appeal.

NICE-PAK PRODUCTS, INC.

Date: _____

By: _____
[Name]
[Title]
Nice-Pak Products, Inc.

Date: _____

Trenton Norris, Esq.
ARNOLD & PORTER
Attorneys for Respondent

Date: _____

SYLVIA KUNDIG
KENNETH H. ABBE
LAURA FREMONT
Counsel for the Federal Trade Commission

APPROVED:

THOMAS N. DAHDOUH
Director
Western Region

JESSICA L. RICH
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection