

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF FLORIDA**

Case No. 0:14-cv-60143-KMM

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION,

Plaintiff,

vs.

KOBENI INC., a Florida Corporation, and
YAIR SHALEV, individually, and as an officer
or director of KOBENI INC.,

Defendants.

**STIPULATED ORDER FOR PERMANENT INJUNCTION
AND MONETARY JUDGMENT**

Plaintiff, the Federal Trade Commission (“Commission” or “FTC”), filed its Complaint for Permanent Injunction and Other Equitable Relief (“Complaint”) against Kobeni Inc. and Yair Shalev on January 21, 2014, pursuant to Sections 13(b) and 19 of the Federal Trade Commission Act (“FTC Act”), 15 U.S.C. §§ 53(b) and 57b, and Section 7(a) of the Controlling the Assault of Non-Solicited Pornography and Marketing Act of 2003 (“CAN-SPAM Act”), 15 U.S.C. § 7706(a). The Commission and Defendants, having been represented by counsel, and acting by and through said counsel, stipulate to the entry of this Stipulated Order for Permanent Injunction and Monetary Judgment (the “Order”) to resolve all matters in dispute among them in this action.

THEREFORE, Plaintiff and Defendants, having requested the Court to enter this Order, and the Court having considered the Order reached among the parties, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED as follows:

FINDINGS

1. The Court has jurisdiction over this matter.
2. The Complaint charges that Defendants participated in unfair or deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45, and Section 7(a) of the CAN-SPAM Act, 15 U.S.C. § 7706(a), in the course of transmitting or arranging for the transmission of unsolicited commercial electronic mail messages concerning consumers' purported legal obligation to obtain health insurance.
3. Defendants neither admit nor deny any of the allegations in the Complaint, except as specifically stated in this Order. Only for purposes of this action, Defendants admit the facts necessary to establish jurisdiction.
4. Defendants waive any claim that they may have under the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, concerning the prosecution of this action through the date of this Order, and agree to bear their own costs and attorneys' fees.
5. Defendants waive all rights to appeal or otherwise to challenge or to contest the validity of this Order.

DEFINITIONS

For purposes of this Order, the following definitions apply:

1. “Corporate Defendant” means Kobeni Inc. and its successors and assigns.
2. “Defendants” means the Individual Defendant and the Corporate Defendant, individually, collectively, or in any combination.
3. “Individual Defendant” means Yair Shalev.
4. “Person” or “persons” includes a natural person, an organization or other legal entity, including a corporation, partnership, sole proprietorship, limited liability company, association, cooperative, or any other group or combination acting as an entity.
5. “Plaintiff” means the Federal Trade Commission (“FTC” or “Commission”).
6. “Commercial electronic mail message” means any electronic mail message the primary purpose of which is the commercial advertisement or promotion of a commercial product or service (including content on an Internet website operated for a commercial purpose). 15 U.S.C. § 7702(2).
7. “Electronic mail message” (or “email”) means a message sent to a unique electronic mail address. 15 U.S.C. § 7702(6).
8. “Electronic mail address” means a destination, commonly expressed as a string of characters, consisting of a unique user name or mailbox (commonly referred to as the “local part”) and a reference to an Internet domain (commonly referred to as the “domain part”), whether or not displayed, to which an electronic mail message can be sent or delivered. 15 U.S.C. § 7702(5).

9. “Initiate,” when used with respect to a commercial email message, means to originate or transmit such message or to procure the origination or transmission of such message. 15 U.S.C. § 7702(9).

10. “Procure,” when used with respect to the initiation of a commercial email message, means intentionally to pay or provide other consideration to, or induce, another person to initiate such a message on one’s behalf. 15 U.S.C. § 7702(12).

11. “Sender” means a person who initiates a commercial email message and whose product, service, or Internet website is advertised or promoted by the message. 15 U.S.C. § 7702(16).

I.

PROHIBITED MISREPRESENTATIONS

IT IS ORDERED that Defendants, Defendants’ officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, in connection with the advertising, marketing, promotion, offering for sale, or sale of any good or service, are permanently restrained and enjoined from misrepresenting, or assisting others in misrepresenting, any material fact, expressly or by implication, including, but not limited to:

- A. that consumers will violate federal law if they do not select health insurance by a specified date;
- B. that the law requires consumers to select or purchase a good or service;
- C. the total cost to purchase, receive, or use a good or service;

D. any material restrictions, limitations, or conditions to purchase, receive, or use a good or service;

E. any material aspect of the performance, efficacy, nature, or central characteristics of a good or service; and

F. any material aspect of the nature or terms of a refund, cancellation, exchange, or repurchase policy for a good or service.

II.

PROHIBITED CAN-SPAM PRACTICES

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, Defendants' officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, in connection with the advertising, marketing, promotion, offering for sale, or sale of any good or service, are permanently restrained and enjoined from violating Sections 5 and 6 of the CAN-SPAM Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 7704 and 7705, of which a copy of the CAN-SPAM Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 7701-7713, is attached and herein incorporated, by, including but not limited to, initiating, procuring, or transmitting, or assisting others in initiating, procuring, or transmitting, a Commercial Electronic Mail Message that:

A. Does not include a clear and conspicuous notice of the recipient's opportunity to decline to receive further Commercial Electronic Mail Messages from the Sender at the recipient's Electronic Mail Address and describes the means by which the recipient can decline to receive future Commercial Electronic Mail Messages from the Sender; and

B. Does not include the Sender's valid physical postal address.

III.

MONETARY JUDGMENT

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:

- A. Judgment in the amount of three hundred fifty thousand United States dollars (\$350,000 (USD)) is entered in favor of the Commission against the Individual and Corporate Defendant (only one corporation), jointly and severally, as equitable monetary relief;
- B. Defendants are ordered to pay to the Commission three hundred fifty thousand United States dollars (\$350,000 (USD)), which as Defendants stipulate, their undersigned counsel holds in escrow for no purpose other than payment to the Commission. Such payment must be made within seven (7) days of entry of this Order by electronic fund transfer in accordance with instructions previously provided by a representative of the Commission.
- C. Defendants relinquish dominion and all legal and equitable right, title, and interest in all assets transferred pursuant to this Order and may not seek the return of any assets;
- D. The facts alleged in the Complaint will be taken as true, without further proof, in any subsequent civil litigation by or on behalf of the Commission, including in a proceeding to enforce its rights to any payment or monetary judgment pursuant to this Order, such as a nondischargeability complaint in any bankruptcy case;
- E. The facts alleged in the Complaint establish all elements necessary to sustain an action by the Commission pursuant to Section 523(a)(2)(A) of the Bankruptcy Code, 11 U.S.C. § 523(a)(2)(A), and this Order will have collateral estoppel effect for such purposes;
- F. Defendants acknowledge that their Taxpayer Identification Numbers (Social Security Numbers or Employer Identification Numbers), which Defendants previously submitted

to the Commission, may be used for collecting and reporting on any delinquent amount arising out of this Order, in accordance with 31 U.S.C. § 7701; and

G. All money paid to the Commission pursuant to this Order may be deposited into a fund administered by the Commission or its designee to be used for equitable relief, including consumer redress and any attendant expenses for the administration of any redress fund. If a representative of the Commission decides that direct redress to consumers is wholly or partially impracticable or money remains after redress is completed, the Commission may apply any remaining money for such other equitable relief (including consumer information remedies) as it determines to be reasonably related to Defendants' practices alleged in the Complaint. Any money not used for such equitable relief is to be deposited into the U.S. Treasury as disgorgement. Defendants have no right to challenge any actions the Commission or its representatives may take pursuant to this Subsection.

IV.

PROHIBITIONS REGARDING CONSUMER INFORMATION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, Defendants' officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, are permanently restrained and enjoined from directly or indirectly:

A. Disclosing, selling, renting, leasing, transferring, using, or benefiting from customer information, including the name, address, birth date, telephone number, email address, social security number, other identifying information, or any data that enables access to a customer's account (including a credit card, bank account, or other financial account), that any

Defendant obtained prior to entry of this Order in connection with the transmission of commercial email messages marketing or advertising health insurance; and

B. Failing to destroy such customer information in all forms in their possession, custody, or control within thirty (30) days after receipt of written direction to do so from a representative of the Commission.

Provided, however, that customer information need not be disposed of, and may be disclosed, to the extent requested by a government agency or required by a law, regulation, or court order.

V.

ORDER ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants obtain acknowledgments of receipt of this Order:

A. Each Defendant, within seven (7) days of entry of this Order, must submit to the Commission an acknowledgment of receipt of this Order sworn under penalty of perjury;

B. For five (5) years after entry of this Order, Individual Defendant for any business that he, individually or collectively with any other Defendant, is the majority owner or controls directly or indirectly, and the Corporate Defendant, must deliver a copy of this Order to: (1) all principals, officers, directors, and LLC managers and members; (2) all employees, agents, and representatives who participate in conduct related to the subject matter of this Order; and (3) any business entity resulting from any change in structure as set forth in the Section titled Compliance Reporting. Delivery must occur within seven days of entry of this Order for current personnel. For all others, delivery must occur before they assume their responsibilities; and

C. From each individual or entity to which a Defendant delivered a copy of this Order, that Defendant must obtain, within 30 days, a signed and dated acknowledgment of receipt of this Order.

VI.

COMPLIANCE REPORTING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants make timely submissions to the Commission:

A. One year after entry of this Order, each Defendant must submit a compliance report, sworn under penalty of perjury.

1. Each Defendant must: (a) identify the primary physical, postal, and email address and telephone number, as designated points of contact, which representatives of the Commission may use to communicate with Defendant; (b) identify all of that Defendant's businesses by all of their names, telephone numbers, and physical, postal, email, and Internet addresses; (c) describe the activities of each business, including the goods and services offered, the means of advertising, marketing, and sales, and the involvement of any other Defendant (which Individual Defendant must describe if he knows or should know due to his own involvement); (d) describe in detail whether and how that Defendant is in compliance with each Section of this Order; and (e) provide a copy of each Order Acknowledgment obtained pursuant to this Order, unless previously submitted to the Commission.

2. Additionally, Individual Defendant must: (a) identify all telephone numbers and all physical, postal, email and Internet addresses, including all residences; (b) identify all business activities, including any business for which he performs services whether as

an employee or otherwise and any entity in which he has any ownership interest; and (c) describe in detail his involvement in each such business, including title, role, responsibilities, participation, authority, control, and any ownership.

B. For ten (10) years after entry of this Order, each Defendant must submit a compliance notice, sworn under penalty of perjury, within fourteen (14) days of any change in the following:

1. Each Defendant must report any change in: (a) any designated point of contact; or (b) the structure of the Corporate Defendant or any entity that Defendant has any ownership interest in or controls directly or indirectly that may affect compliance obligations arising under this Order, including: creation, merger, sale, or dissolution of the entity or any subsidiary, parent, or affiliate that engages in any acts or practices subject to this Order.

2. Additionally, Individual Defendant must report any change in: (a) name, including aliases or fictitious name, or residence address; or (b) title or role in any business activity, including any business for which he performs services whether as an employee or otherwise and any entity in which he has any ownership interest, and identify the name, physical address, and Internet address of the business or entity.

C. Each Defendant must submit to the Commission notice of the filing of any bankruptcy petition, insolvency proceeding, or any similar proceeding by or against such Defendant within 14 days of its filing.

D. Any submission to the Commission required by this Order to be sworn under penalty of perjury must be true and accurate and comply with 28 U.S.C. §1746, such as by concluding: "I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America

that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on: _____” and supplying the date, signatory’s full name, title (if applicable), and signature.

E. Unless otherwise directed by a Commission representative in writing, all submissions to the Commission pursuant to this Order must be emailed to DEbrief@ftc.gov or sent by overnight courier (not the U.S. Postal Service) to: Associate Director for Enforcement, Bureau of Consumer Protection, Federal Trade Commission, 600 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Washington, DC 20580. The subject line must begin: FTC v. Kobeni Inc., FTC Matter No. X140015.

VII.

RECORDKEEPING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants must create certain records for ten (10) years after entry of the Order, and retain each such record for five years. Specifically, the Corporate Defendant and Individual Defendant for any business in which that Defendant, individually or collectively with any other Defendant, is a majority owner or controls directly or indirectly, must create and retain the following records:

- A. Accounting records showing the revenues from all goods or services sold;
- B. Personnel records showing, for each person providing services, whether as an employee or otherwise, that person’s: name, addresses, and telephone numbers; job title or position; dates of service; and, if applicable, the reason for termination;
- C. Records of all consumer complaints and refund requests, whether received directly or indirectly, such as through a third party, and any response;

D. All records necessary to demonstrate full compliance with each provision of this Order, including all submissions to the Commission; and

E. A copy of each advertisement or other marketing material.

VIII.

COMPLIANCE MONITORING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for the purpose of monitoring Defendants' compliance with this Order:

A. Within 14 days of receipt of a written request from a representative of the Commission, each Defendant must: submit additional compliance reports or other requested information, which must be sworn under penalty of perjury; appear for depositions; and produce documents, for inspection and copying. The Commission is also authorized to obtain discovery, without further leave of court, using any of the procedures prescribed by Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 29, 30 (including telephonic depositions), 31, 33, 34, 36, 45, and 69.

B. For matters concerning this Order, the Commission is authorized to communicate directly with each Defendant. Defendants must permit representatives of the Commission to interview any employee or other person affiliated with any Defendant who has agreed to such an interview. The person interviewed may have counsel present.

C. The Commission may use all other lawful means, including posing, through its representatives, as consumers, suppliers, or other individuals or entities, to Defendants or any individual or entity affiliated with Defendants, without the necessity of identification or prior notice. Nothing in this Order limits the Commission's lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1.

IX.

RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Court retains jurisdiction of this matter for purposes of construction, modification, and enforcement of this Order.

SO ORDERED, this 7th day of August, 2014.

K.M. Moore
HONORABLE K. MICHAEL MOORE
United States District Judge

SO STIPULATED AND AGREED:

John C. Hallerud
JOHN C. HALLERUD
STEVEN M. WERNIKOFF
Federal Trade Commission, Midwest Region
55 West Monroe Street, Suite 1825
Chicago, Illinois 60603
Attorney for Plaintiff
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

Date: 8/4/2014

David S. Almeida
DAVID S. ALMEIDA
DAVID M. POELL
Sheppard Mullin Richter & Hampton LLP
70 West Madison Street, 48th Floor
Chicago, Illinois 60602
Attorneys for Defendants

Date: 5/29/14

Yair Shalev
Yair Shalev
Individually and as an Officer
of Kobeni Inc.

Date: 5/29/2014