

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

JUDGE BUCHWALD

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION,

Plaintiff,

v.

NATIONAL COLLECTOR'S MINT, INC.,
a Delaware corporation, and

AVRAM C. FREEDBERG, individually and as an
officer of National Collector's Mint, Inc.,

Defendants.

Case No. **13 CV 0345**

**STIPULATED PERMANENT
INJUNCTION AND FINAL
ORDER**

JAN 15 2013

Plaintiff, the Federal Trade Commission (the "Commission") filed a Complaint for

Permanent Injunction and Other Equitable Relief, including redress to consumers and disgorgement of ill-gotten gains ("Complaint"), pursuant to Sections 13(b) and 19 of the Federal Trade Commission Act ("FTC Act"), 15 U.S.C. §§ 53(b) and 57b, the Telemarketing and Consumer Fraud Abuse Prevention Act ("Telemarketing Act"), 15 U.S.C. §§ 6101-6108, the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. Part 310, the Unordered Merchandise Statute, 39 U.S.C. § 3009, the Hobby Protection Act, 15 U.S.C. § 2101(b), and the Commission's Rules related thereto, 15 C.F.R. Part 304. The Commission and Defendants, by and through their counsel, hereby stipulate to the entry of, and request the Court to enter, this Stipulated Permanent Injunction and Final Order ("Order"), to resolve all matters of dispute between them in this action.

IT IS THEREFORE STIPULATED, AGREED, AND ORDERED as follows:

FINDINGS

1. This Court has jurisdiction over this matter.

2. In its Complaint, the Commission charges that Defendants violated Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a), the Telemarketing and Consumer Fraud and Abuse Prevention Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 6101-6108, the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. Part 310, the Unordered Merchandise Statute, 39 U.S.C. § 3009, the Hobby Protection Act, 15 U.S.C. § 2101(b), and the Commission's Rules related thereto, 15 C.F.R. Part 304.
3. The parties waive all rights to appeal or otherwise challenge or contest the validity of this Order.
4. Defendants neither admit nor deny any of the allegations in the Complaint, except as specifically stated in this Order, and only for the purposes of this action, Defendants admit the facts necessary to establish jurisdiction.
5. Defendants waive any claim that they may hold under the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, concerning the prosecution of this action through the date of this Order.
6. Each party shall bear its own costs and attorneys' fees.
7. Entry of this Order is in the public interest.

DEFINITIONS

For the purpose of this Order, the following definitions apply:

1. "***Corporate Defendant***" means National Collector's Mint, Inc., and its successors and assigns.
2. "***Defendants***" means Corporate Defendant National Collector's Mint, Inc. and Individual Defendant Avram Freedberg, individually, collectively, or in any combination.
3. "***Imitation Numismatic Item***" means an item which purports to be, but in fact is not, an original numismatic item or which is a reproduction, copy, or counterfeit of an original numismatic item.
4. "***Individual Defendant***" means Avram Freedberg.
5. "***Material***" means likely to affect a person's choice of, or conduct regarding, goods

or services.

6. ***“Original Numismatic Item”*** means anything which has been a part of a coinage or issue which has been used in exchange or has been used to commemorate a person, object, place, or event. Such term includes coins, tokens, paper money, and commemorative medals.
7. The words **“and”** and **“or”** shall be understood to have both conjunctive and disjunctive meanings.

INJUNCTION

I. PROHIBITION AGAINST MISREPRESENTATIONS

IT IS ORDERED that the Defendants, their officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, in connection with the advertising, marketing, promotion, offering for sale, or sale of any good or service, including numismatic items, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from misrepresenting or assisting others in misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, any material fact, including:

- A. Any material aspect of the performance, efficacy, nature, characteristics, benefits, or qualities of any good or service;
- B. The total costs to purchase, receive, or use, and the quantity of, any good or service;
- C. Any material restriction, limitation, or condition to purchase, receive, or use any good or service;
- D. Any material aspect of the nature or terms of any refund, cancellation, exchange, or repurchase policy, including, the likelihood of a consumer obtaining a full or partial refund, or the circumstances in which a full or partial refund will be granted to the consumer; and

- E. That any Defendant is an agency of or affiliated with, endorsed or approved by, or otherwise connected to the Federal government, a state government, or a foreign government.

II. REQUIRED DISCLOSURES

IT IS ORDERED that Defendants, their officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, in connection with the advertising, marketing, promotion, offering for sale, or sale of any good or service, including numismatic items, are hereby permanently enjoined from failing to disclose, clearly and conspicuously, before a customer consents to pay for any good or service:

- A. The total fees and costs associated with the sales transaction;
- B. All material terms and conditions of any cancellation or refund policy, including, whether:
 - 1. In order to receive a refund from Defendants, consumers must pay for insurance and shipping; and
 - 2. Consumers must obtain a RMA number that can only be obtained through a live operator; and
- C. Any material limitation or condition that applies to any "Satisfaction Guarantee" or similar representation.

III. PROHIBITION AGAINST VIOLATING THE UNORDERED MERCHANDISE STATUTE

IT IS ORDERED that Defendants, their officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, in connection with the advertising, offering for sale, sale or distribution of any good or service, including numismatic items, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from violating or assisting others in violating any of the provisions of the Unordered Merchandise Statute, 39 U.S.C. § 3009 (attached hereto as Attachment A), including:

- A. Sending any merchandise without the prior expressed request or consent of the recipient unless such merchandise is clearly and conspicuously marked as a free sample and has attached to it a clear and conspicuous statement that the recipient may treat the merchandise as a gift and may retain, use, discard, or dispose of it in any manner without any obligation whatsoever to the sender; and
- B. Sending any communication, including bills, invoices, reminders, letters, notices, or dunning communications, that in any manner seek to obtain payment for any merchandise shipped without the prior expressed request or consent of the recipient.

IV. PROHIBITION AGAINST DECEPTIVE AND ABUSIVE TELEMARKETING PRACTICES

IT IS ORDERED that Defendants, their officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, in connection with the advertising, marketing, promotion, offering for sale, or sale of any good or service, including numismatic items, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from violating or assisting others in violating, in any manner, any provision of the Commission's Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. Part 310 (attached hereto as Attachment B), as currently promulgated or as it may hereafter be amended, including, any of the following:

- A. Failing to disclose, or disclose adequately, to consumers, the total costs to purchase, receive, or use, and the quantity of, any goods or services that are the subject of a sales offer, in violation of Section 310.3(a)(1)(i) of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. Part 310.3(a)(1)(i);
- B. Failing to disclose, or disclose adequately, to consumers material aspects of any refund policy, in violation of Section 310.3(a)(1)(iii) of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. Part 310.3(a)(1)(iii);
- C. Misrepresenting, directly or indirectly, any material aspect of the central characteristics of goods or services that are the subject of a sales offer, in violation of Section 310.3(a)(2)(iii) of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. Part 310.3(a)(2)(iii);
- D. Causing billing information to be submitted for payment when using a payment method other than a credit card or a debit card, without the consumer's express verifiable authorization, in violation of Section 310.3(a)(3) of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. Part 310.3(a)(3);
- E. Making any false or misleading statements to induce consumers to pay for goods or services or to induce a charitable contribution, in violation of Section 310.3(a)(4) of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. Part 310.3(a)(4); and
- F. Causing billing information to be submitted for payment without the express informed consent of the consumer, in violation of Section 310.4(a)(7) of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. Part 310.4(a)(7).

**V. PROHIBITION AGAINST VIOLATING THE HOBBY PROTECTION
ACT AND ITS RELATED RULES**

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Defendants, their officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, in connection with the manufacture in or importation into the United States, for introduction into or distribution

in commerce of any Imitation Numismatic Item, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from violating the Hobby Protection Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 2101-2106, and from violating any provision of the HPA Rules, 16 C.F.R. Part 304 (attached hereto as Attachment C), including by failing to mark with the word "COPY," plainly, permanently, legibly, conspicuously, and nondeceptively, any Imitation Numismatic Item.

VI. EQUITABLE MONETARY RELIEF

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:

- A. Judgment is hereby entered in favor of the Commission and against Defendants, jointly and severally, in the amount of \$750,000.00, for the payment of equitable monetary relief, including consumer restitution or disgorgement, and for paying any attendant expenses of administration of any redress fund. Funds paid to the Commission pursuant to this Section shall be deposited into a fund administered by the Commission or its designee to be used for equitable relief, including consumer restitution and any attendant expenses for the administration of any redress fund. Defendants will cooperate fully to assist the Commission or its designee in identifying consumers who may be entitled to redress pursuant to this Order. In the event that direct redress to consumers is wholly or partially impracticable or funds remain after redress is completed, the Commission or its designee may apply funds for any other equitable relief (including consumer information remedies) that they determine to be reasonably related to Defendants' practices alleged in the Complaint. Any funds not used for this equitable relief shall be deposited into the U.S. Treasury as disgorgement. Defendants shall have no right to challenge the Commission's choice of remedies under this Section.
- B. Prior to or concurrently with Defendants' execution of this Order, Defendants shall turn over the full amount of the equitable monetary relief to their attorneys, who shall hold the entire sum for no purpose other than payment to the Commission after entry of this Order by the Court. Within five (5) days of receipt of notice of the entry of this Order, Defendants' attorneys shall transfer the

sum of \$750,000.00 in the form of a wire transfer or certified cashier's check made payable to the Federal Trade Commission. The check or written confirmation of the wire transfer shall be delivered in accordance with the instructions provided by a representative of the Commission.

- C. Defendants relinquish all dominion, control, and title to the funds paid to the fullest extent permitted by law. Defendants shall make no claim to or demand return of the funds, directly or indirectly, through counsel or otherwise.
- D. Defendants agree that the facts as alleged in the Complaint filed in this action shall be taken as true without further proof in any bankruptcy case or subsequent civil litigation pursued by the Commission to enforce its rights to any payment or money judgment pursuant to this Order, including but not limited to a nondischargeability complaint in any bankruptcy case. Defendants further stipulate and agree that the facts alleged in the Complaint establish all elements necessary to sustain an action by the Commission pursuant to Section 523(a)(2)(A) of the Bankruptcy Code, 11 U.S.C. § 523(a)(2)(A), and that this Order shall have collateral estoppel effect for such purposes.

VII. ORDER ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants obtain acknowledgments of receipt of this Order:

- A. Each Defendant, within 7 days of entry of this Order, must submit to the Commission an acknowledgment of receipt of this Order sworn under penalty of perjury.
- B. For ten (10) years after entry of this Order, each Individual Defendant for any business that such Defendant, individually or collectively with any other Defendant, is the majority owner or directly or indirectly controls, and each Corporate Defendant, must deliver a copy of this Order to: (1) all principals, officers, directors, and managers; (2) all employees, agents, and representatives who participate in the advertising, marketing, promotion, offering for sale, sale,

manufacture in or importation into the United States, for introduction into or distribution in commerce of any coins, proofs, collectibles, or other numismatic items; and (3) any business entity resulting from any change in structure as set forth in the Section titled Compliance Reporting. Delivery must occur within 7 days of entry of this Order for current personnel. To all others, delivery must occur before they assume their responsibilities.

- C. From each individual or entity to which a Defendant delivered a copy of this Order, that Defendant must obtain, within 30 days, a signed and dated acknowledgment of receipt of this Order.

VIII. COMPLIANCE REPORTING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants make timely submissions to the Commission:

- A. One year after entry of this Order, each Defendant must submit a compliance report, sworn under penalty of perjury.
 - 1. Each Defendant must: (a) designate at least one telephone number and an email, physical, and postal address as points of contact, which representatives of the Commission may use to communicate with Defendant; (b) identify all of that Defendant's businesses by all of their names, telephone numbers, and physical, postal, email, and Internet addresses; (c) describe the activities of each business, including the products and services offered, the means of advertising, marketing, and sales, and the involvement of any other Defendant (which Individual Defendant must describe if they know or should know due to their own involvement); (d) describe in detail whether and how that Defendant is in compliance with each Section of this Order; and (e) provide a copy of each Order Acknowledgment obtained pursuant to this Order, unless previously submitted to the Commission.

2. Additionally, each Individual Defendant must: (a) identify all telephone numbers and all email, Internet, physical, and postal addresses, including all residences; (b) identify all titles and roles in all business activities, including any business for which such Defendant performs services whether as an employee or otherwise and any entity in which such Defendant has any ownership interest; and (c) describe in detail such Defendant's involvement in each such business, including title, role, responsibilities, participation, authority, control, and any ownership.
- B. For twenty (20) years following entry of this Order, each Defendant must submit a compliance notice, sworn under penalty of perjury, within 14 days of any change in the following:
1. Each Defendant must report any change in: (a) any designated point of contact; or (b) the structure of any Corporate Defendant or any entity that Defendant has any ownership interest in or directly or indirectly controls that may affect compliance obligations arising under this Order, including: creation, merger, sale, or dissolution of the entity or any subsidiary, parent, or affiliate that engages in any acts or practices subject to this Order.
 2. Additionally, each Individual Defendant must report any change in: (a) name, including aliases or fictitious name, or residence address; or (b) title or role in any business activity, including any business for which such Defendant performs services whether as an employee or otherwise and any entity in which such Defendant has any ownership interest, and identify its name, physical address, and Internet address, if any.
- C. Each Defendant must submit to the Commission notice of the filing of any bankruptcy petition, insolvency proceeding, or any similar proceeding by or against such Defendant within 14 days of its filing.

- D. Any submission to the Commission required by this Order to be sworn under penalty of perjury must be true and accurate and comply with 28 U.S.C. § 1746, such as by concluding: "I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on: _____" and supplying the date, signatory's full name, title (if applicable), and signature.
- E. Unless otherwise directed by a Commission representative in writing, all submissions to the Commission pursuant to this Order must be emailed to DEbrief@ftc.gov or sent by overnight courier (not the U.S. Postal Service) to: Associate Director for Enforcement, Bureau of Consumer Protection, Federal Trade Commission, 600 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Washington, DC, 20580; RE: FTC v. National Collector's Mint, Inc. and Avram Freedberg, Case No. _____.

IX. RECORDKEEPING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants must create certain records for twenty (20) years after entry of the Order, and retain each such record for five (5) years. Specifically, Corporate Defendant, in connection with telemarketing, and each Individual Defendant for any business in which that Defendant, individually or collectively with any other Defendants, is a majority owner or directly or indirectly controls, must maintain the following records:

- A. Accounting records showing the revenues from all goods or services sold, all costs incurred in generating those revenues, and the resulting net profit or loss;
- B. Personnel records showing, for each person providing services, whether as an employee or otherwise, that person's: name, addresses, and telephone numbers; job title or position; dates of service; and, if applicable, the reason for termination;
- C. Customer files showing the names, addresses, telephone numbers, dollar amounts paid, and the quantity and description of goods or services purchased, to the extent such information is obtained in the ordinary course of business;

- D. Complaints and refund requests, whether received directly or indirectly, such as through a third party, and any response;
- E. All records necessary to demonstrate full compliance with each provision of this Order, including all submissions to the Commission; and
- F. A copy of each advertisement or other marketing material.

X. COMPLIANCE MONITORING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for the purpose of monitoring Defendants' compliance with this Order:

- A. Within 14 days of receipt of a written request from a representative of the Commission, each Defendant must: submit additional compliance reports or other requested information, which must be sworn under penalty of perjury; appear for depositions; and produce documents, for inspection and copying. The Commission is also authorized to obtain discovery, without further leave of court, using any of the procedures prescribed by Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 29, 30 (including telephonic depositions), 31, 33, 34, 36, 45, and 69.
- B. For matters concerning this Order, the Commission is authorized to communicate directly with each Defendant. Defendant must permit representatives of the Commission to interview any employee or other person affiliated with any Defendant who has agreed to such an interview. The person interviewed may have counsel present.
- C. The Commission may use all other lawful means, including posing, through its representatives, as consumers, suppliers, or other individuals or entities, to Defendants or any individual or entity affiliated with Defendants, without the necessity of identification or prior notice. Nothing in this Order limits the Commission's lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1.

XI. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Court retains jurisdiction of this matter for purposes of construction, modification, and enforcement of this Order.

SO ORDERED this ____ day of _____, 2012.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

SO STIPULATED AND AGREED:

FOR PLAINTIFF THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION:

Svetlana S. Gans

Dated: 1-15-2013

Svetlana S. Gans

Gary L. Ivens

Attorneys

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

600 Pennsylvania Ave., NW. Rm. 286

Washington, D.C. 20580

Phone: (202) 326-3708 (Gans); 2330 (Ivens)

Fax: (202) 326-3395

Email: sgans@ftc.gov; givens@ftc.gov

FOR DEFENDANTS NATIONAL COLLECTOR'S MINT, INC., AND AVRAM FREEDBERG:

Sheldon Lustigman

Dated: 11/6/12

Sheldon Lustigman

Andrew Lustigman

Olshan, Grundman, Frome, Rosenzweig & Wolosky, LLP

Counsel for National Collector's Mint, Inc., and Avram Freedberg

FOR DEFENDANTS NATIONAL COLLECTOR'S MINT, INC., AND AVRAM FREEDBERG:

Avram C. Freedberg

Dated: 11/5/12

Avram Freedberg, Individually

and as an Officer of National Collector's Mint, Inc.

Attachment A

(Unordered Merchandise Statute)



§ 3009. Mailing of unordered merchandise.

(a) Except for (1) free samples clearly and conspicuously marked as such, and (2) merchandise mailed by a charitable organization soliciting contributions, the mailing of unordered merchandise or of communications prohibited by subsection (c) of this section constitutes an unfair method of competition and an unfair trade practice in violation of section 45(a)(1) of title 15.

(b) Any merchandise mailed in violation of subsection (a) of this section, or within the exceptions contained therein, may be treated as a gift by the recipient, who shall have the right to retain, use, discard, or dispose of it in any manner he sees fit without any obligation whatsoever to the sender. All such merchandise shall have attached to it a clear and conspicuous statement informing the recipient that he may treat the merchandise as a gift to him and has the right to retain, use, discard, or dispose of it in any manner he sees fit without any obligation whatsoever to the sender.

(c) No mailer of any merchandise mailed in violation of subsection (a) of this section, or within the exceptions contained therein, shall mail to any recipient of such merchandise a bill for such merchandise or any dunning communications.

(d) For the purposes of this section, "un-ordered merchandise" means merchandise mailed without the prior expressed request or consent of the recipient.

(Pub. L. 91-375, Aug. 12, 1970, 84 Stat. 749.)

Attachment B
(Telemarketing Sales Rule)

**PART 310—TELEMARKETING SALES
RULE 16 CFR PART 310**

- Sec.
310.1 Scope of regulations in this part.
310.2 Definitions.
310.3 Deceptive telemarketing acts or practices.
310.4 Abusive telemarketing acts or practices.
310.5 Recordkeeping requirements.
310.6 Exemptions.
310.7 Actions by states and private persons.
310.8 Fee for access to the National Do Not Call Registry.
310.9 Severability.

AUTHORITY: 15 U.S.C. 6101-6108.

SOURCE: 75 FR 48516, Aug. 10, 2010, unless otherwise noted.

§ 310.1 Scope of regulations in this part.

This part implements the Telemarketing and Consumer Fraud and Abuse Prevention Act, 15 U.S.C. 6101-6108, as amended.

§ 310.2 Definitions.

(a) *Acquirer* means a business organization, financial institution, or an agent of a business organization or financial institution that has authority from an organization that operates or

licenses a credit card system to authorize merchants to accept, transmit, or process payment by credit card through the credit card system for money, goods or services, or anything else of value.

(b) *Attorney General* means the chief legal officer of a state.

(c) *Billing information* means any data that enables any person to access a customer's or donor's account, such as a credit card, checking, savings, share or similar account, utility bill, mortgage loan account, or debit card.

(d) *Caller identification service* means a service that allows a telephone subscriber to have the telephone number, and, where available, name of the calling party transmitted contemporaneously with the telephone call, and displayed on a device in or connected to the subscriber's telephone.

(e) *Cardholder* means a person to whom a credit card is issued or who is authorized to use a credit card on behalf of or in addition to the person to whom the credit card is issued.

(f) *Charitable contribution* means any donation or gift of money or any other thing of value.

(g) *Commission* means the Federal Trade Commission.

(h) *Credit* means the right granted by a creditor to a debtor to defer payment of debt or to incur debt and defer its payment.

(i) *Credit card* means any card, plate, coupon book, or other credit device existing for the purpose of obtaining money, property, labor, or services on credit.

(j) *Credit card sales draft* means any record or evidence of a credit card transaction.

(k) *Credit card system* means any method or procedure used to process credit card transactions involving credit cards issued or licensed by the operator of that system.

(l) *Customer* means any person who is or may be required to pay for goods or services offered through telemarketing.

(m) *Debt relief service* means any program or service represented, directly or by implication, to renegotiate, settle, or in any way alter the terms of payment or other terms of the debt between a person and one or more unse-

cured creditors or debt collectors, including, but not limited to, a reduction in the balance, interest rate, or fees owed by a person to an unsecured creditor or debt collector.

(n) *Donor* means any person solicited to make a charitable contribution.

(o) *Established business relationship* means a relationship between a seller and a consumer based on:

(1) the consumer's purchase, rental, or lease of the seller's goods or services or a financial transaction between the consumer and seller, within the eighteen (18) months immediately preceding the date of a telemarketing call; or

(2) the consumer's inquiry or application regarding a product or service offered by the seller, within the three (3) months immediately preceding the date of a telemarketing call.

(p) *Free-to-pay conversion* means, in an offer or agreement to sell or provide any goods or services, a provision under which a customer receives a product or service for free for an initial period and will incur an obligation to pay for the product or service if he or she does not take affirmative action to cancel before the end of that period.

(q) *Investment opportunity* means anything, tangible or intangible, that is offered, offered for sale, sold, or traded based wholly or in part on representations, either express or implied, about past, present, or future income, profit, or appreciation.

(r) *Material* means likely to affect a person's choice of, or conduct regarding, goods or services or a charitable contribution.

(s) *Merchant* means a person who is authorized under a written contract with an acquirer to honor or accept credit cards, or to transmit or process for payment credit card payments, for the purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution.

(t) *Merchant agreement* means a written contract between a merchant and an acquirer to honor or accept credit cards, or to transmit or process for payment credit card payments, for the purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution.

(u) *Negative option feature* means, in an offer or agreement to sell or provide any goods or services, a provision under which the customer's silence or

failure to take an affirmative action to reject goods or services or to cancel the agreement is interpreted by the seller as acceptance of the offer.

(v) *Outbound telephone call* means a telephone call initiated by a telemarketer to induce the purchase of goods or services or to solicit a charitable contribution.

(w) *Person* means any individual, group, unincorporated association, limited or general partnership, corporation, or other business entity.

(x) *Preacquired account information* means any information that enables a seller or telemarketer to cause a charge to be placed against a customer's or donor's account without obtaining the account number directly from the customer or donor during the telemarketing transaction pursuant to which the account will be charged.

(y) *Prize* means anything offered, or purportedly offered, and given, or purportedly given, to a person by chance. For purposes of this definition, chance exists if a person is guaranteed to receive an item and, at the time of the offer or purported offer, the telemarketer does not identify the specific item that the person will receive.

(z) *Prize promotion* means:

(1) A sweepstakes or other game of chance; or

(2) An oral or written express or implied representation that a person has won, has been selected to receive, or may be eligible to receive a prize or purported prize.

(aa) *Seller* means any person who, in connection with a telemarketing transaction, provides, offers to provide, or arranges for others to provide goods or services to the customer in exchange for consideration.

(bb) *State* means any state of the United States, the District of Columbia, Puerto Rico, the Northern Mariana Islands, and any territory or possession of the United States.

(cc) *Telemarketer* means any person who, in connection with telemarketing, initiates or receives telephone calls to or from a customer or donor.

(dd) *Telemarketing* means a plan, program, or campaign which is conducted to induce the purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution, by use of one or more telephones and

which involves more than one interstate telephone call. The term does not include the solicitation of sales through the mailing of a catalog which: contains a written description or illustration of the goods or services offered for sale; includes the business address of the seller; includes multiple pages of written material or illustrations; and has been issued not less frequently than once a year, when the person making the solicitation does not solicit customers by telephone but only receives calls initiated by customers in response to the catalog and during those calls takes orders only without further solicitation. For purposes of the previous sentence, the term "further solicitation" does not include providing the customer with information about, or attempting to sell, any other item included in the same catalog which prompted the customer's call or in a substantially similar catalog.

(ee) *Upselling* means soliciting the purchase of goods or services following an initial transaction during a single telephone call. The upsell is a separate telemarketing transaction, not a continuation of the initial transaction. An "external upsell" is a solicitation made by or on behalf of a seller different from the seller in the initial transaction, regardless of whether the initial transaction and the subsequent solicitation are made by the same telemarketer. An "internal upsell" is a solicitation made by or on behalf of the same seller as in the initial transaction, regardless of whether the initial transaction and subsequent solicitation are made by the same telemarketer.

§ 310.3 Deceptive telemarketing acts or practices.

(a) *Prohibited deceptive telemarketing acts or practices.* It is a deceptive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for any seller or telemarketer to engage in the following conduct:

(1) Before a customer consents to pay⁶⁵⁹ for goods or services offered, failing to disclose truthfully, in a clear and conspicuous manner, the following material information:

(i) The total costs to purchase, receive, or use, and the quantity of, any goods or services that are the subject of the sales offer;⁶⁶⁰

(ii) All material restrictions, limitations, or conditions to purchase, receive, or use the goods or services that are the subject of the sales offer;

(iii) If the seller has a policy of not making refunds, cancellations, exchanges, or repurchases, a statement informing the customer that this is the seller's policy; or, if the seller or telemarketer makes a representation about a refund, cancellation, exchange, or repurchase policy, a statement of all material terms and conditions of such policy;

(iv) In any prize promotion, the odds of being able to receive the prize, and, if the odds are not calculable in advance, the factors used in calculating the odds: that no purchase or payment is required to win a prize or to participate in a prize promotion and that any purchase or payment will not increase the person's chances of winning; and the no-purchase/no-payment method of participating in the prize promotion with either instructions on how to participate or an address or local or toll-free telephone number to which customers may write or call for information on how to participate;

⁶⁵⁹ When a seller or telemarketer uses, or directs a customer to use, a courier to transport payment, the seller or telemarketer must make the disclosures required by §310.3(a)(1) before sending a courier to pick up payment or authorization for payment, or directing a customer to have a courier pick up payment or authorization for payment. In the case of debt relief services, the seller or telemarketer must make the disclosures required by §310.3(a)(1) before the consumer enrolls in an offered program.

⁶⁶⁰ For offers of consumer credit products subject to the Truth in Lending Act, 15 U.S.C. 1601 et seq., and Regulation Z, 12 CFR 226, compliance with the disclosure requirements under the Truth in Lending Act and Regulation Z shall constitute compliance with §310.3(a)(1)(i) of this Rule.

(v) All material costs or conditions to receive or redeem a prize that is the subject of the prize promotion;

(vi) In the sale of any goods or services represented to protect, insure, or otherwise limit a customer's liability in the event of unauthorized use of the customer's credit card, the limits on a cardholder's liability for unauthorized use of a credit card pursuant to 15 U.S.C. 1643;

(vii) If the offer includes a negative option feature, all material terms and conditions of the negative option feature, including, but not limited to, the fact that the customer's account will be charged unless the customer takes an affirmative action to avoid the charge(s), the date(s) the charge(s) will be submitted for payment, and the specific steps the customer must take to avoid the charge(s); and

(viii) In the sale of any debt relief service:

(A) the amount of time necessary to achieve the represented results, and to the extent that the service may include a settlement offer to any of the customer's creditors or debt collectors, the time by which the debt relief service provider will make a bona fide settlement offer to each of them;

(B) to the extent that the service may include a settlement offer to any of the customer's creditors or debt collectors, the amount of money or the percentage of each outstanding debt that the customer must accumulate before the debt relief service provider will make a bona fide settlement offer to each of them;

(C) to the extent that any aspect of the debt relief service relies upon or results in the customer's failure to make timely payments to creditors or debt collectors, that the use of the debt relief service will likely adversely affect the customer's creditworthiness, may result in the customer being subject to collections or sued by creditors or debt collectors, and may increase the amount of money the customer owes due to the accrual of fees and interest; and

(D) to the extent that the debt relief service requests or requires the customer to place funds in an account at an insured financial institution, that the customer owns the funds held in

the account, the customer may withdraw from the debt relief service at any time without penalty, and, if the customer withdraws, the customer must receive all funds in the account, other than funds earned by the debt relief service in compliance with § 310.4(a)(5)(i)(A) through (C).

(2) Misrepresenting, directly or by implication, in the sale of goods or services any of the following material information:

(i) The total costs to purchase, receive, or use, and the quantity of, any goods or services that are the subject of a sales offer;

(ii) Any material restriction, limitation, or condition to purchase, receive, or use goods or services that are the subject of a sales offer;

(iii) Any material aspect of the performance, efficacy, nature, or central characteristics of goods or services that are the subject of a sales offer;

(iv) Any material aspect of the nature or terms of the seller's refund, cancellation, exchange, or repurchase policies;

(v) Any material aspect of a prize promotion including, but not limited to, the odds of being able to receive a prize, the nature or value of a prize, or that a purchase or payment is required to win a prize or to participate in a prize promotion;

(vi) Any material aspect of an investment opportunity including, but not limited to, risk, liquidity, earnings potential, or profitability;

(vii) A seller's or telemarketer's affiliation with, or endorsement or sponsorship by, any person or government entity;

(viii) That any customer needs offered goods or services to provide protections a customer already has pursuant to 15 U.S.C. 1643;

(ix) Any material aspect of a negative option feature including, but not limited to, the fact that the customer's account will be charged unless the customer takes an affirmative action to avoid the charge(s), the date(s) the charge(s) will be submitted for payment, and the specific steps the customer must take to avoid the charge(s); or

(x) Any material aspect of any debt relief service, including, but not limited to, the amount of money or the percentage of the debt amount that a customer may save by using such service; the amount of time necessary to achieve the represented results; the amount of money or the percentage of each outstanding debt that the customer must accumulate before the provider of the debt relief service will initiate attempts with the customer's creditors or debt collectors or make a bona fide offer to negotiate, settle, or modify the terms of the customer's debt; the effect of the service on a customer's creditworthiness; the effect of the service on collection efforts of the customer's creditors or debt collectors; the percentage or number of customers who attain the represented results; and whether a debt relief service is offered or provided by a non-profit entity.

(3) Causing billing information to be submitted for payment, or collecting or attempting to collect payment for goods or services or a charitable contribution, directly or indirectly, without the customer's or donor's express verifiable authorization, except when the method of payment used is a credit card subject to protections of the Truth in Lending Act and Regulation Z,⁶⁶¹ or a debit card subject to the protections of the Electronic Fund Transfer Act and Regulation E.⁶⁶² Such authorization shall be deemed verifiable if any of the following means is employed:

(i) Express written authorization by the customer or donor, which includes the customer's or donor's signature;⁶⁶³

(ii) Express oral authorization which is audio-recorded and made available upon request to the customer or donor, and the customer's or donor's bank or other billing entity, and which evidences clearly both the customer's or donor's authorization of payment for

⁶⁶¹ Truth in Lending Act, 15 U.S.C. 1601 et seq., and Regulation Z, 12 CFR part 226.

⁶⁶² Electronic Fund Transfer Act, 15 U.S.C. 1693 et seq., and Regulation E, 12 CFR part 205.

⁶⁶³ For purposes of this Rule, the term "signature" shall include an electronic or digital form of signature, to the extent that such form of signature is recognized as a valid signature under applicable federal law or state contract law.

the goods or services or charitable contribution that are the subject of the telemarketing transaction and the customer's or donor's receipt of all of the following information:

- (A) The number of debits, charges, or payments (if more than one);
 - (B) The date(s) the debit(s), charge(s), or payment(s) will be submitted for payment;
 - (C) The amount(s) of the debit(s), charge(s), or payment(s);
 - (D) The customer's or donor's name;
 - (E) The customer's or donor's billing information, identified with sufficient specificity such that the customer or donor understands what account will be used to collect payment for the goods or services or charitable contribution that are the subject of the telemarketing transaction;
 - (F) A telephone number for customer or donor inquiry that is answered during normal business hours; and
 - (G) The date of the customer's or donor's oral authorization; or
- (iii) Written confirmation of the transaction, identified in a clear and conspicuous manner as such on the outside of the envelope, sent to the customer or donor via first class mail prior to the submission for payment of the customer's or donor's billing information, and that includes all of the information contained in §310.3(a)(3)(i)(A)-(G) and a clear and conspicuous statement of the procedures by which the customer or donor can obtain a refund from the seller or telemarketer or charitable organization in the event the confirmation is inaccurate; provided, however, that this means of authorization shall not be deemed verifiable in instances in which goods or services are offered in a transaction involving a free-to-pay conversion and preacquired account information.
- (4) Making a false or misleading statement to induce any person to pay for goods or services or to induce a charitable contribution.

(b) *Assisting and facilitating.* It is a deceptive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a person to provide substantial assistance or support to any seller or telemarketer when that person knows or consciously avoids knowing that the seller or tele-

marketer is engaged in any act or practice that violates §§310.3(a), (c) or (d), or §310.4 of this Rule.

(c) *Credit card laundering.* Except as expressly permitted by the applicable credit card system, it is a deceptive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for:

(1) A merchant to present to or deposit into, or cause another to present to or deposit into, the credit card system for payment, a credit card sales draft generated by a telemarketing transaction that is not the result of a telemarketing credit card transaction between the cardholder and the merchant;

(2) Any person to employ, solicit, or otherwise cause a merchant, or an employee, representative, or agent of the merchant, to present to or deposit into the credit card system for payment, a credit card sales draft generated by a telemarketing transaction that is not the result of a telemarketing credit card transaction between the cardholder and the merchant; or

(3) Any person to obtain access to the credit card system through the use of a business relationship or an affiliation with a merchant, when such access is not authorized by the merchant agreement or the applicable credit card system.

(d) *Prohibited deceptive acts or practices in the solicitation of charitable contributions.* It is a fraudulent charitable solicitation, a deceptive telemarketing act or practice, and a violation of this Rule for any telemarketer soliciting charitable contributions to misrepresent, directly or by implication, any of the following material information:

- (1) The nature, purpose, or mission of any entity on behalf of which a charitable contribution is being requested;
- (2) That any charitable contribution is tax deductible in whole or in part;
- (3) The purpose for which any charitable contribution will be used;
- (4) The percentage or amount of any charitable contribution that will go to a charitable organization or to any particular charitable program;
- (5) Any material aspect of a prize promotion including, but not limited to: the odds of being able to receive a prize; the nature or value of a prize; or

that a charitable contribution is required to win a prize or to participate in a prize promotion; or

(6) A charitable organization's or telemarketer's affiliation with, or endorsement or sponsorship by, any person or government entity.

§ 310.4 Abusive telemarketing acts or practices.

(a) *Abusive conduct generally.* It is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for any seller or telemarketer to engage in the following conduct:

(1) Threats, intimidation, or the use of profane or obscene language;

(2) Requesting or receiving payment of any fee or consideration for goods or services represented to remove derogatory information from, or improve, a person's credit history, credit record, or credit rating until:

(i) The time frame in which the seller has represented all of the goods or services will be provided to that person has expired; and

(ii) The seller has provided the person with documentation in the form of a consumer report from a consumer reporting agency demonstrating that the promised results have been achieved, such report having been issued more than six months after the results were achieved. Nothing in this Rule should be construed to affect the requirement in the Fair Credit Reporting Act, 15 U.S.C. 1681, that a consumer report may only be obtained for a specified permissible purpose;

(3) Requesting or receiving payment of any fee or consideration from a person for goods or services represented to recover or otherwise assist in the return of money or any other item of value paid for by, or promised to, that person in a previous telemarketing transaction, until seven (7) business days after such money or other item is delivered to that person. This provision shall not apply to goods or services provided to a person by a licensed attorney;

(4) Requesting or receiving payment of any fee or consideration in advance of obtaining a loan or other extension of credit when the seller or telemarketer has guaranteed or represented a high likelihood of success in

obtaining or arranging a loan or other extension of credit for a person;

(5)(i) Requesting or receiving payment of any fee or consideration for any debt relief service until and unless:

(A) The seller or telemarketer has renegotiated, settled, reduced, or otherwise altered the terms of at least one debt pursuant to a settlement agreement, debt management plan, or other such valid contractual agreement executed by the customer;

(B) The customer has made at least one payment pursuant to that settlement agreement, debt management plan, or other valid contractual agreement between the customer and the creditor or debt collector; and

(C) To the extent that debts enrolled in a service are renegotiated, settled, reduced, or otherwise altered individually, the fee or consideration either:

(1) Bears the same proportional relationship to the total fee for renegotiating, settling, reducing, or altering the terms of the entire debt balance as the individual debt amount bears to the entire debt amount. The individual debt amount and the entire debt amount are those owed at the time the debt was enrolled in the service; or

(2) Is a percentage of the amount saved as a result of the renegotiation, settlement, reduction, or alteration. The percentage charged cannot change from one individual debt to another. The amount saved is the difference between the amount owed at the time the debt was enrolled in the service and the amount actually paid to satisfy the debt.

(ii) Nothing in § 310.4(a)(5)(i) prohibits requesting or requiring the customer to place funds in an account to be used for the debt relief provider's fees and for payments to creditors or debt collectors in connection with the renegotiation, settlement, reduction, or other alteration of the terms of payment or other terms of a debt, provided that:

(A) The funds are held in an account at an insured financial institution;

(B) The customer owns the funds held in the account and is paid accrued interest on the account, if any;

(C) The entity administering the account is not owned or controlled by, or in any way affiliated with, the debt relief service;

§310.4

16 CFR Ch. I (1-1-12 Edition)

(D) The entity administering the account does not give or accept any money or other compensation in exchange for referrals of business involving the debt relief service; and

(E) The customer may withdraw from the debt relief service at any time without penalty, and must receive all funds in the account, other than funds earned by the debt relief service in compliance with §310.4(a)(5)(i)(A) through (C), within seven (7) business days of the customer's request.

(6) Disclosing or receiving, for consideration, unencrypted consumer account numbers for use in telemarketing; provided, however, that this paragraph shall not apply to the disclosure or receipt of a customer's or donor's billing information to process a payment for goods or services or a charitable contribution pursuant to a transaction;

(7) Causing billing information to be submitted for payment, directly or indirectly, without the express informed consent of the customer or donor. In any telemarketing transaction, the seller or telemarketer must obtain the express informed consent of the customer or donor to be charged for the goods or services or charitable contribution and to be charged using the identified account. In any telemarketing transaction involving preacquired account information, the requirements in paragraphs (a)(7)(i) through (ii) of this section must be met to evidence express informed consent.

(i) In any telemarketing transaction involving preacquired account information and a free-to-pay conversion feature, the seller or telemarketer must:

(A) Obtain from the customer, at a minimum, the last four (4) digits of the account number to be charged;

(B) Obtain from the customer his or her express agreement to be charged for the goods or services and to be charged using the account number pursuant to paragraph (a)(7)(i)(A) of this section; and,

(C) Make and maintain an audio recording of the entire telemarketing transaction.

(ii) In any other telemarketing transaction involving preacquired account information not described in paragraph

(a)(7)(i) of this section, the seller or telemarketer must:

(A) At a minimum, identify the account to be charged with sufficient specificity for the customer or donor to understand what account will be charged; and

(B) Obtain from the customer or donor his or her express agreement to be charged for the goods or services and to be charged using the account number identified pursuant to paragraph (a)(7)(i)(A) of this section; or

(8) Failing to transmit or cause to be transmitted the telephone number, and, when made available by the telemarketer's carrier, the name of the telemarketer, to any caller identification service in use by a recipient of a telemarketing call; provided that it shall not be a violation to substitute (for the name and phone number used in, or billed for, making the call) the name of the seller or charitable organization on behalf of which a telemarketing call is placed, and the seller's or charitable organization's customer or donor service telephone number, which is answered during regular business hours.

(b) *Pattern of calls.* (1) It is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a telemarketer to engage in, or for a seller to cause a telemarketer to engage in, the following conduct:

(i) Causing any telephone to ring, or engaging any person in telephone conversation, repeatedly or continuously with intent to annoy, abuse, or harass any person at the called number;

(ii) Denying or interfering in any way, directly or indirectly, with a person's right to be placed on any registry of names and/or telephone numbers of persons who do not wish to receive outbound telephone calls established to comply with §310.4(b)(1)(iii);

(iii) Initiating any outbound telephone call to a person when:

(A) That person previously has stated that he or she does not wish to receive an outbound telephone call made by or on behalf of the seller whose goods or services are being offered or made on behalf of the charitable organization for which a charitable contribution is being solicited; or

(B) That person's telephone number is on the "do-not-call" registry, maintained by the Commission, of persons who do not wish to receive outbound telephone calls to induce the purchase of goods or services unless the seller:

(i) Has obtained the express agreement, in writing, of such person to place calls to that person. Such written agreement shall clearly evidence such person's authorization that calls made by or on behalf of a specific party may be placed to that person, and shall include the telephone number to which the calls may be placed and the signature⁶⁶⁴ of that person; or

(ii) Has an established business relationship with such person, and that person has not stated that he or she does not wish to receive outbound telephone calls under paragraph (b)(1)(iii)(A) of this section; or

(iv) Abandoning any outbound telephone call. An outbound telephone call is "abandoned" under this section if a person answers it and the telemarketer does not connect the call to a sales representative within two (2) seconds of the person's completed greeting.

(v) Initiating any outbound telephone call that delivers a prerecorded message, other than a prerecorded message permitted for compliance with the call abandonment safe harbor in § 310.4(b)(4)(iii), unless:

(A) In any such call to induce the purchase of any good or service, the seller has obtained from the recipient of the call an express agreement, in writing, that:

(i) The seller obtained only after a clear and conspicuous disclosure that the purpose of the agreement is to authorize the seller to place prerecorded calls to such person;

(ii) The seller obtained without requiring, directly or indirectly, that the agreement be executed as a condition of purchasing any good or service;

(iii) Evidences the willingness of the recipient of the call to receive calls that deliver prerecorded messages by or on behalf of a specific seller; and

(iv) Includes such person's telephone number and signature;⁶⁶⁵ and

(B) In any such call to induce the purchase of any good or service, or to induce a charitable contribution from a member of, or previous donor to, a non-profit charitable organization on whose behalf the call is made, the seller or telemarketer:

(i) Allows the telephone to ring for at least fifteen (15) seconds or four (4) rings before disconnecting an unanswered call; and

(ii) Within two (2) seconds after the completed greeting of the person called, plays a prerecorded message that promptly provides the disclosures required by § 310.4(d) or (e), followed immediately by a disclosure of one or both of the following:

(A) In the case of a call that could be answered in person by a consumer, that the person called can use an automated interactive voice and/or keypress-activated opt-out mechanism to assert a Do Not Call request pursuant to § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(A) at any time during the message. The mechanism must:

(1) Automatically add the number called to the seller's entity-specific Do Not Call list;

(2) Once invoked, immediately disconnect the call; and

(3) Be available for use at any time during the message; and

(B) In the case of a call that could be answered by an answering machine or voicemail service, that the person called can use a toll-free telephone number to assert a Do Not Call request pursuant to § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(A). The number provided must connect directly to an automated interactive voice or keypress-activated opt-out mechanism that:

(1) Automatically adds the number called to the seller's entity-specific Do Not Call list;

(2) Immediately thereafter disconnects the call; and

(3) Is accessible at any time throughout the duration of the telemarketing campaign; and

⁶⁶⁴ For purposes of this Rule, the term "signature" shall include an electronic or digital form of signature, to the extent that such form of signature is recognized as a valid signature under applicable federal law or state contract law.

⁶⁶⁵ For purposes of this Rule, the term "signature" shall include an electronic or digital form of signature, to the extent that such form of signature is recognized as a valid signature under applicable federal law or state contract law.

(iii) Complies with all other requirements of this part and other applicable federal and state laws.

(C) Any call that complies with all applicable requirements of this paragraph (v) shall not be deemed to violate §310.4(b)(1)(iv) of this part.

(D) This paragraph (v) shall not apply to any outbound telephone call that delivers a prerecorded healthcare message made by, or on behalf of, a covered entity or its business associate, as those terms are defined in the HIPAA Privacy Rule, 45 CFR 160.103.

(2) It is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for any person to sell, rent, lease, purchase, or use any list established to comply with §310.4(b)(1)(iii)(A), or maintained by the Commission pursuant to §310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B), for any purpose except compliance with the provisions of this Rule or otherwise to prevent telephone calls to telephone numbers on such lists.

(3) A seller or telemarketer will not be liable for violating §310.4(b)(1)(ii) and (iii) if it can demonstrate that, as part of the seller's or telemarketer's routine business practice:

(i) It has established and implemented written procedures to comply with §310.4(b)(1)(ii) and (iii);

(ii) It has trained its personnel, and any entity assisting in its compliance, in the procedures established pursuant to §310.4(b)(3)(i);

(iii) The seller, or a telemarketer or another person acting on behalf of the seller or charitable organization, has maintained and recorded a list of telephone numbers the seller or charitable organization may not contact, in compliance with §310.4(b)(1)(iii)(A);

(iv) The seller or a telemarketer uses a process to prevent telemarketing to any telephone number on any list established pursuant to §310.4(b)(3)(iii) or 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B), employing a version of the "do-not-call" registry obtained from the Commission no more than thirty-one (31) days prior to the date any call is made, and maintains records documenting this process;

(v) The seller or a telemarketer or another person acting on behalf of the seller or charitable organization, monitors and enforces compliance with the

procedures established pursuant to §310.4(b)(3)(i); and

(vi) Any subsequent call otherwise violating §310.4(b)(1)(ii) or (iii) is the result of error.

(4) A seller or telemarketer will not be liable for violating §310.4(b)(1)(iv) if:

(i) The seller or telemarketer employs technology that ensures abandonment of no more than three (3) percent of all calls answered by a person, measured over the duration of a single calling campaign, if less than 30 days, or separately over each successive 30-day period or portion thereof that the campaign continues.

(ii) The seller or telemarketer, for each telemarketing call placed, allows the telephone to ring for at least fifteen (15) seconds or four (4) rings before disconnecting an unanswered call;

(iii) Whenever a sales representative is not available to speak with the person answering the call within two (2) seconds after the person's completed greeting, the seller or telemarketer promptly plays a recorded message that states the name and telephone number of the seller on whose behalf the call was placed⁵⁶⁶; and

(iv) The seller or telemarketer, in accordance with §310.5(b)-(d), retains records establishing compliance with §310.4(b)(4)(i)-(iii).

(c) *Calling time restrictions.* Without the prior consent of a person, it is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a telemarketer to engage in outbound telephone calls to a person's residence at any time other than between 8:00 a.m. and 9:00 p.m. local time at the called person's location.

(d) *Required oral disclosures in the sale of goods or services.* It is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a telemarketer in an outbound telephone call or internal or external upsell to induce the purchase of goods or services to fail to disclose truthfully, promptly, and in a clear and conspicuous manner to the person receiving the call, the following information:

⁵⁶⁶ This provision does not affect any seller's or telemarketer's obligation to comply with relevant state and federal laws, including but not limited to the TCPA, 47 U.S.C. 227, and 47 CFR part 64.1200.

- (1) The identity of the seller;
- (2) That the purpose of the call is to sell goods or services;
- (3) The nature of the goods or services; and
- (4) That no purchase or payment is necessary to be able to win a prize or participate in a prize promotion if a prize promotion is offered and that any purchase or payment will not increase the person's chances of winning. This disclosure must be made before or in conjunction with the description of the prize to the person called. If requested by that person, the telemarketer must disclose the no-purchase/no-payment entry method for the prize promotion; provided, however, that, in any internal upsell for the sale of goods or services, the seller or telemarketer must provide the disclosures listed in this section only to the extent that the information in the upsell differs from the disclosures provided in the initial telemarketing transaction.

(e) *Required oral disclosures in charitable solicitations.* It is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a telemarketer, in an outbound telephone call to induce a charitable contribution, to fail to disclose truthfully, promptly, and in a clear and conspicuous manner to the person receiving the call, the following information:

- (1) The identity of the charitable organization on behalf of which the request is being made; and
- (2) That the purpose of the call is to solicit a charitable contribution.

[75 FR 48516, Aug. 10, 2010, as amended at 76 FR 58716, Sept. 22, 2011]

§ 310.5 Recordkeeping requirements.

(a) Any seller or telemarketer shall keep, for a period of 24 months from the date the record is produced, the following records relating to its telemarketing activities:

- (1) All substantially different advertising, brochures, telemarketing scripts, and promotional materials;
- (2) The name and last known address of each prize recipient and the prize awarded for prizes that are represented, directly or by implication, to have a value of \$25.00 or more;
- (3) The name and last known address of each customer, the goods or services

purchased, the date such goods or services were shipped or provided, and the amount paid by the customer for the goods or services;⁶⁶⁷

(4) The name, any fictitious name used, the last known home address and telephone number, and the job title(s) for all current and former employees directly involved in telephone sales or solicitations; provided, however, that if the seller or telemarketer permits fictitious names to be used by employees, each fictitious name must be traceable to only one specific employee; and

(5) All verifiable authorizations or records of express informed consent or express agreement required to be provided or received under this Rule.

(b) A seller or telemarketer may keep the records required by § 310.5(a) in any form, and in the same manner, format, or place as they keep such records in the ordinary course of business. Failure to keep all records required by § 310.5(a) shall be a violation of this Rule.

(c) The seller and the telemarketer calling on behalf of the seller may, by written agreement, allocate responsibility between themselves for the recordkeeping required by this Section. When a seller and telemarketer have entered into such an agreement, the terms of that agreement shall govern, and the seller or telemarketer, as the case may be, need not keep records that duplicate those of the other. If the agreement is unclear as to who must maintain any required record(s), or if no such agreement exists, the seller shall be responsible for complying with §§ 310.5(a)(1)-(3) and (5); the telemarketer shall be responsible for complying with § 310.5(a)(4).

(d) In the event of any dissolution or termination of the seller's or telemarketer's business, the principal of that seller or telemarketer shall maintain all records as required under this section. In the event of any sale, assignment, or other change in ownership

⁶⁶⁷ For offers of consumer credit products subject to the Truth in Lending Act, 15 U.S.C. 1601 et seq., and Regulation Z, 12 CFR 226, compliance with the recordkeeping requirements under the Truth in Lending Act, and Regulation Z, shall constitute compliance with § 310.5(a)(3) of this Rule.

§310.6

16 CFR Ch. I (1-1-12 Edition)

of the seller's or telemarketer's business, the successor business shall maintain all records required under this section.

§310.6 Exemptions.

(a) Solicitations to induce charitable contributions via outbound telephone calls are not covered by §310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B) of this Rule.

(b) The following acts or practices are exempt from this Rule:

(1) The sale of pay-per-call services subject to the Commission's Rule entitled "Trade Regulation Rule Pursuant to the Telephone Disclosure and Dispute Resolution Act of 1992," 16 CFR Part 308, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to the requirements of §§310.4(a)(1), (a)(7), (b), and (c);

(2) The sale of franchises subject to the Commission's Rule entitled "Disclosure Requirements and Prohibitions Concerning Franchising," ("Franchise Rule") 16 CFR Part 436, and the sale of business opportunities subject to the Commission's Rule entitled "Disclosure Requirements and Prohibitions Concerning Business Opportunities," ("Business Opportunity Rule") 16 CFR Part 437, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to the requirements of §§310.4(a)(1), (a)(7), (b), and (c);

(3) Telephone calls in which the sale of goods or services or charitable solicitation is not completed, and payment or authorization of payment is not required, until after a face-to-face sales or donation presentation by the seller or charitable organization, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to the requirements of §§310.4(a)(1), (a)(7), (b), and (c);

(4) Telephone calls initiated by a customer or donor that are not the result of any solicitation by a seller, charitable organization, or telemarketer, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to any instances of upselling included in such telephone calls;

(5) Telephone calls initiated by a customer or donor in response to an advertisement through any medium, other than direct mail solicitation, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to calls initiated by a customer

or donor in response to an advertisement relating to investment opportunities, debt relief services, business opportunities other than business arrangements covered by the Franchise Rule or Business Opportunity Rule, or advertisements involving goods or services described in §§310.3(a)(1)(vi) or 310.4(a)(2)-(4); or to any instances of upselling included in such telephone calls;

(6) Telephone calls initiated by a customer or donor in response to a direct mail solicitation, including solicitations via the U.S. Postal Service, facsimile transmission, electronic mail, and other similar methods of delivery in which a solicitation is directed to specific address(es) or person(s), that clearly, conspicuously, and truthfully discloses all material information listed in §310.3(a)(1) of this Rule, for any goods or services offered in the direct mail solicitation, and that contains no material misrepresentation regarding any item contained in §310.3(d) of this Rule for any requested charitable contribution; *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to calls initiated by a customer in response to a direct mail solicitation relating to prize promotions, investment opportunities, debt relief services, business opportunities other than business arrangements covered by the Franchise Rule or Business Opportunity Rule, or goods or services described in §§310.3(a)(1)(vi) or 310.4(a)(2)-(4); or to any instances of upselling included in such telephone calls; and

(7) Telephone calls between a telemarketer and any business, except calls to induce the retail sale of nondurable office or cleaning supplies; *provided*, however, that §310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B) and §310.5 of this Rule shall not apply to sellers or telemarketers of nondurable office or cleaning supplies.

§310.7 Actions by states and private persons.

(a) Any attorney general or other officer of a state authorized by the state to bring an action under the Telemarketing and Consumer Fraud and Abuse Prevention Act, and any private person who brings an action under that Act, shall serve written notice of its action on the Commission, if feasible,

prior to its initiating an action under this Rule. The notice shall be sent to the Office of the Director, Bureau of Consumer Protection, Federal Trade Commission, Washington, DC 20580, and shall include a copy of the state's or private person's complaint and any other pleadings to be filed with the court. If prior notice is not feasible, the state or private person shall serve the Commission with the required notice immediately upon instituting its action.

(b) Nothing contained in this Section shall prohibit any attorney general or other authorized state official from proceeding in state court on the basis of an alleged violation of any civil or criminal statute of such state.

§ 310.8 Fee for access to the National Do Not Call Registry.

(a) It is a violation of this Rule for any seller to initiate, or cause any telemarketer to initiate, an outbound telephone call to any person whose telephone number is within a given area code unless such seller, either directly or through another person, first has paid the annual fee, required by § 310.8(c), for access to telephone numbers within that area code that are included in the National Do Not Call Registry maintained by the Commission under § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B); provided, however, that such payment is not necessary if the seller initiates, or causes a telemarketer to initiate, calls solely to persons pursuant to §§ 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B)(i) or (ii), and the seller does not access the National Do Not Call Registry for any other purpose.

(b) It is a violation of this Rule for any telemarketer, on behalf of any seller, to initiate an outbound telephone call to any person whose telephone number is within a given area code unless that seller, either directly or through another person, first has paid the annual fee, required by § 310.8(c), for access to the telephone numbers within that area code that are included in the National Do Not Call Registry; provided, however, that such payment is not necessary if the seller initiates, or causes a telemarketer to initiate, calls solely to persons pursuant to §§ 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B)(i) or (ii), and the

seller does not access the National Do Not Call Registry for any other purpose.

(c) The annual fee, which must be paid by any person prior to obtaining access to the National Do Not Call Registry, is \$56 for each area code of data accessed, up to a maximum of \$15,503; *provided*, however, that there shall be no charge to any person for accessing the first five area codes of data, and *provided further*, that there shall be no charge to any person engaging in or causing others to engage in outbound telephone calls to consumers and who is accessing area codes of data in the National Do Not Call Registry if the person is permitted to access, but is not required to access, the National Do Not Call Registry under this Rule, 47 CFR 64.1200, or any other Federal regulation or law. Any person accessing the National Do Not Call Registry may not participate in any arrangement to share the cost of accessing the registry, including any arrangement with any telemarketer or service provider to divide the costs to access the registry among various clients of that telemarketer or service provider.

(d) Each person who pays, either directly or through another person, the annual fee set forth in § 310.8(c), each person excepted under § 310.8(c) from paying the annual fee, and each person excepted from paying an annual fee under § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B), will be provided a unique account number that will allow that person to access the registry data for the selected area codes at any time for the twelve month period beginning on the first day of the month in which the person paid the fee ("the annual period"). To obtain access to additional area codes of data during the first six months of the annual period, each person required to pay the fee under § 310.8(c) must first pay \$56 for each additional area code of data not initially selected. To obtain access to additional area codes of data during the second six months of the annual period, each person required to pay the fee under § 310.8(c) must first pay \$28 for each additional area code of data not initially selected. The payment of the additional fee will permit the person to access the additional area codes

§ 310.9

16 CFR Ch. I (1–1–12 Edition)

of data for the remainder of the annual period.

(e) Access to the National Do Not Call Registry is limited to telemarketers, sellers, others engaged in or causing others to engage in telephone calls to consumers, service providers acting on behalf of such persons, and any government agency that has law enforcement authority. Prior to accessing the National Do Not Call Registry, a person must provide the identifying information required by the operator of the registry to collect the fee, and must certify, under penalty of law, that the person is accessing the registry solely to comply with the provisions of this Rule or to otherwise prevent telephone calls to telephone numbers on the registry. If the person is accessing the registry on behalf of sellers, that person also must identify each of the sellers on whose behalf it is accessing the registry, must provide each seller's unique account number for access to the national registry, and must certify, under penalty of law, that the sellers will be using the information gathered from the registry solely to comply with the provisions of this Rule or otherwise to prevent telephone calls to telephone numbers on the registry.

[75 FR 48516, Aug. 10, 2010; 75 FR 51934, Aug. 24, 2010, as amended at 76 FR 53637, Aug. 29, 2011]

§ 310.9 Severability.

The provisions of this Rule are separate and severable from one another. If any provision is stayed or determined to be invalid, it is the Commission's intention that the remaining provisions shall continue in effect.

Attachment C

(Hobby Protection Act Rules)

Federal Trade Commission

§ 304.5

PART 304—RULES AND REGULATIONS UNDER THE HOBBY PROTECTION ACT

Sec.

- 304.1 Terms defined.
- 304.2 General requirement.
- 304.3 Applicability.
- 304.4 Application of other law or regulation.
- 304.5 Marking requirements for imitation political items.
- 304.6 Marking requirements for imitation numismatic items.

AUTHORITY: 15 U.S.C. 2101 et seq.

SOURCE: 40 FR 5496, Feb. 6, 1975, unless otherwise noted.

§ 304.1 Terms defined.

(a) *Act* means the Hobby Protection Act (approved November 29, 1973; Pub. L. 93-167, 87 Stat. 686, (15 U.S.C. 2101 et seq.)).

(b) *Commerce* has the same meanings as such term has under the Federal Trade Commission Act.

(c) *Commission* means the Federal Trade Commission.

(d) *Imitation numismatic item* means an item which purports to be, but in fact is not, an original numismatic item or which is a reproduction, copy, or counterfeit of an original numismatic item. Such term includes an original numismatic item which has been altered or modified in such a manner that it could reasonably purport to be an original numismatic item other than the one which was altered or modified. The term shall not include any re-issue or re-strike of any original numismatic item by the United States or any foreign government.

(e) *Imitation political item* means an item which purports to be, but in fact is not, an original political item, or which is a reproduction, copy or counterfeit of an original item.

(f) *Original numismatic item* means anything which has been a part of a coinage or issue which has been used in exchange or has been used to commemorate a person, object, place, or event. Such term includes coins, tokens, paper money, and commemorative medals.

(g) *Original political item* means any political button, poster, literature, sticker, or any advertisement produced for use in any political cause.

(h) *Person* means any individual, group, association, partnership, or any other business entity.

(i) *Regulations* means any or all regulations prescribed by the Federal Trade Commission pursuant to the Act.

(j) *United States* means the States, the District of Columbia, and the Commonwealth of Puerto Rico.

(k) *Diameter of a reproduction* means the length of the longest possible straight line connecting two points on the perimeter of the reproduction.

[40 FR 5496, Feb. 6, 1975, as amended at 53 FR 38942, Oct. 4, 1988]

§ 304.2 General requirement.

Imitation political or numismatic items subject to the Act shall be marked in conformity with the requirements of the Act and the regulations promulgated thereunder. Any violation of these regulations shall constitute a violation of the Act and of the Federal Trade Commission Act.

§ 304.3 Applicability.

Any person engaged in the manufacturing, or importation into the United States for introduction into or distribution in commerce, of imitation political or imitation numismatic items shall be subject to the requirements of the Act and the regulations promulgated thereunder.

§ 304.4 Application of other law or regulation.

The provisions of these regulations are in addition to, and not in substitution for or limitation of, the provisions of any other law or regulation of the United States (including the existing statutes and regulations prohibiting the reproduction of genuine currency) or of the law or regulation of any State.

§ 304.5 Marking requirements for imitation political items.

(a) An imitation political item which is manufactured in the United States, or imported into the United States for introduction into or distribution in commerce, shall be plainly and permanently marked with the calendar year in which such item was manufactured.

§ 304.6

16 CFR Ch. I (1-1-12 Edition)

(b) The calendar year shall be marked upon the item legibly, conspicuously and nondeceptively, and in accordance with the further requirements of these regulations.

(1) The calendar year shall appear in arabic numerals, shall be based upon the Gregorian calendar and shall consist of four digits.

(2) The calendar year shall be marked on either the obverse or the reverse surface of the item. It shall not be marked on the edge of the item.

(3) An imitation political item of incusable material shall be incused with the calendar year in sans-serif numerals. Each numeral shall have a vertical dimension of not less than two millimeters (2.0 mm) and a minimum depth of three-tenths of one millimeter (0.3 mm) or one-half ($\frac{1}{2}$) the thickness of the reproduction, whichever is the lesser. The minimum total horizontal dimension for the four numerals composing the calendar year shall be six millimeters (6.0 mm).

(4) An imitation political button, poster, literature, sticker, or advertisement composed of nonincusable material shall be imprinted with the calendar year in sans-serif numerals. Each numeral shall have a vertical dimension of not less than two millimeters (2.0 mm). The minimum total horizontal dimension of the four numerals composing the calendar year shall be six millimeters (6.0 mm).

§ 304.6 Marking requirements for imitation numismatic items.

(a) An imitation numismatic item which is manufactured in the United States, or imported into the United States for introduction into or distribution in commerce, shall be plainly and permanently marked "COPY".

(b) The word "COPY" shall be marked upon the item legibly, conspicuously, and nondeceptively, and in accordance with the further requirements of these regulations.

(1) The word "COPY" shall appear in capital letters, in the English language.

(2) The word "COPY" shall be marked on either the obverse or the reverse surface of the item. It shall not be marked on the edge of the item.

(3) An imitation numismatic item of incusable material shall be incused with the word "COPY" in sans-serif letters having a vertical dimension of not less than two millimeters (2.0 mm) or not less than one-sixth of the diameter of the reproduction, and a minimum depth of three-tenths of one millimeter (0.3 mm) or to one-half ($\frac{1}{2}$) the thickness of the reproduction, whichever is the lesser. The minimum total horizontal dimension of the word "COPY" shall be six millimeters (6.0 mm) or not less than one-half of the diameter of the reproduction.

(4) An imitation numismatic item composed of nonincusable material shall be imprinted with the word "COPY" in sans-serif letters having a vertical dimension of not less than two millimeters (2.0 mm) or not less than one-sixth of the diameter of the reproduction. The minimum total horizontal dimension of the word "COPY" shall be six millimeters (6.0 mm) or not less than one-half of the diameter of the reproduction.

[40 FR 5496, Feb. 6, 1975, as amended at 53 FR 38942, Oct. 4, 1988]

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION,

Plaintiff,

v.

NATIONAL COLLECTOR'S MINT, INC.,

a Delaware corporation, and

AVRAM C. FREEDBERG, individually and
as an officer of National Collector's Mint,
Inc.,

Defendants.

**ACKNOWLEDGMENT BY
AFFIDAVIT OF RECEIPT OF FINAL
ORDER BY DEFENDANTS NATIONAL
COLLECTOR'S MINT, INC. AND
AVRAM FREEDBERG**

1. My name is Avram Freedberg and my job title is President of National Collector's Mint, Inc., ("NCM") and I am authorized to accept service of process on NCM. I am a U.S. citizen over the age of eighteen, and I have personal knowledge of the facts set forth in this Acknowledgment.

2. I was a Defendant and NCM was a Defendant in *FTC v. National Collector's Mint, Inc. and Avram Freedberg*, which is the court case listed near the top of this page.

3. On [_____, 201__], NCM and I received a copy of the Final Order, which was signed by the Honorable Judge _____ and entered by the Court on [Month ___, 201__].

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on [Month ___, 201__].

Avram C. Freedberg
Individually and as an officer of NCM

State of _____, City of _____

Subscribed and sworn to before me
this _____ day of _____, 201__.

Notary Public

My commission expires:

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION,

Plaintiff,

v.

NATIONAL COLLECTOR'S MINT, INC.,

a Delaware corporation, and

AVRAM C. FREEDBERG, individually and
as an officer of National Collector's Mint,
Inc.,

Defendants.

**ACKNOWLEDGMENT BY
DECLARATION OF RECEIPT OF
FINAL ORDER BY A NON-PARTY**

I, _____, received a copy of the Final Order in *FTC v. National Collector's Mint, Inc. and Avram Freedberg* on _____, 20__.

I was not a Defendant in that court case. My title or relationship with Defendant(s)

_____ is _____.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on _____, 20__.

Signed:
