

Section 5 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a), and the FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule ("TSR"), 16 C.F.R. Part 310, promulgated pursuant to the Telemarketing Act. Plaintiff filed a motion for summary judgment pursuant to Rule 56(a) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure against all Defendants on August 15, 2011.

On April 20, 2012, the Court granted the FTC's motion. Accordingly, the Court makes the following findings and enters an Order for Permanent Injunction and Other Equitable Relief ("Order") as follows:

FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- This court has jurisdiction of the subject matter of this case and each of the parties. Venue lies properly with this Court.
- 2. Pursuant to Section 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 53(b), the Commission has the authority to seek the relief contained herein.
- 3. The acts and practices of Defendants, as alleged in the Complaint, are in or affecting commerce, as defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.
- 4. The Complaint states a claim upon which relief may be granted against Defendants under Sections 5(a) and 13 (b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a) and 53(b).
- 5. There is no genuine issue as to any material fact concerning the liability of the Defendants, individually and collectively, for deceptive and abusive acts and practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a), and the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. Part 310, or the amount of consumer losses caused by Defendants' deceptive acts and practices.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

15

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

-2-

¹ Individual defendants Gary Hewitt, Douglas Gravink, John Beck, John Alexander, and Jeff Paul, and corporate defendants Mentoring of America, LLC; Family Products, LLC; John Beck Amazing Profits, LLC; Jeff Paul, LLC; and John Alexander, LLC are collectively referred to herein as "Defendants."

- 6. Uncontroverted evidence establishes that Defendants, individually or collectively, misrepresented the likelihood of consumers who purchased and used the system sold by defendant John Beck being able to purchase homes at government tax sales in their area, "free and clear" of all mortgages and liens, for just "pennies on the dollar"; misrepresented the ability of consumers to earn substantial amounts of money renting or selling homes they purchase at government tax sales; and misrepresented the ability of consumers to quickly and easily earn substantial amounts of money with little financial investment.
- 7. Uncontroverted evidence establishes that Defendants, individually or collectively, misrepresented the likelihood of consumers who purchased and used the system that was sold by defendant John Alexander being able to quickly and easily earn substantial amounts of money with no financial investment.
- 8. Uncontroverted evidence establishes that Defendants, individually or collectively, misrepresented the likelihood of consumers who purchased and used the system that was sold by defendant Jeff Paul being able to quickly and easily earn substantial sums of money from proven, turnkey Internet businesses.
- 9. Uncontroverted evidence establishes that Defendants, individually or collectively, failed to disclose or failed to disclose adequately to consumers who purchased the various systems offered by Defendants that they would be automatically enrolled in continuity membership plans that cost \$39.95 per month and that they would be charged that amount each month unless affirmative action was taken to cancel their memberships.
- 10. Uncontroverted evidence establishes that Defendants, individually or collectively, in conjunction with the sale of coaching programs for the various systems sold by Defendants misrepresented that consumers who purchased the coaching program would quickly earn back the cost or substantially more than the

cost of the coaching program.

- 11. Uncontroverted evidence establishes that Defendants, individually or collectively, in conjunction with the sale of continuity membership programs, caused consumers' billing information to be submitted for payment without the express informed consent of the customers.
- 12. Uncontroverted evidence establishes that Defendants, individually or collectively, initiated or caused a telemarketer to initiate outbound telephone calls to consumers who had previously stated that they did not wish to receive outbound telephone calls made by or on behalf of the Defendants.
- 13. The FTC is entitled to judgment as a matter of law pursuant to Rule 56(a) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.
- 14. There is a reasonable likelihood that Defendants would continue to engage in the activities alleged in the Complaint unless permanently enjoined from such acts and practices. In the case of Defendants Gary Hewitt and Douglas Gravink, there is good cause to impose an order banning them from engaging in certain activities.
- 15. Entry of this Order is in the public interest. There being no just reason for delay, the Clerk is directed to enter judgment immediately.

DEFINITIONS

For purposes of this Order, the following definitions shall apply:

- 1. "Assisting others" includes but is not limited to:
- a. performing customer service functions, including but not
 limited to receiving or responding to consumer complaints;
- b. formulating or providing, or arranging for the formulation or provision of, any sales script or other marketing material;
 - c. providing names of, or assisting in the generation of, potential

-4-

1 customers; performing or providing marketing or billing services of any 2 d. kind; 3 acting as an officer or director of a business entity; 4 e. 5 f. providing telemarketing services; or providing a merchant account for processing charges. 6 g. 7 "Billing information" means any data, including but not limited to 2. name, address, telephone number, email address, account number, routing number, date of birth, or social security number, that enables any person to access a 9 consumer's or donor's account, including but not limited to credit card, debit card, 10 11 prepaid card, checking, savings, mortgage loan, share draft, or similar accounts. "Clearly and conspicuously," or "clear and conspicuous," means: 12 3. In textual communications (e.g., printed publications or words 13 a. displayed on the screen of an electronic device), the required disclosures are of a type, size, and location sufficiently noticeable for an ordinary consumer to read and comprehend them, in print that contrasts with the background against which they 17 appear; In communications disseminated orally or through audible 18 means (e.g., radio or streaming audio), the required disclosures are delivered in a 19 volume and cadence sufficient for an ordinary consumer to hear and comprehend 20 21 them; In communications disseminated through an electronic medium 22 C. (such as television, video, and interactive media such as the internet, online 23 services and software), the required disclosures shall be presented simultaneously in both the audio and the visual portions of the communication. In any communication presented solely through visual or audio means, the required 26 27

- d. In all instances, the required disclosures shall be presented prior to the consumer incurring any financial obligation, in an understandable language and syntax, and with nothing contrary to, inconsistent with, or in mitigation of the disclosures used in any communication with them.
- 4. "Commerce" means commerce among the several States or with foreign nations, or in any Territory of the United States or in the District of Columbia, or between any such Territory and another, or between any such Territory and any State or foreign nation, or between the District of Columbia and any State or Territory or foreign nation, as defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.
- 5. "Corporate Defendants" means John Beck Amazing Profits, LLC; John Alexander, LLC; Jeff Paul, LLC d/b/a Shortcuts to Millions, LLC; Mentoring of America, LLC; Family Products, LLC; and their successors and assigns.
- 6. "Defendants" means all of the Individual Defendants and the Corporate Defendants, individually, collectively, or in any combination.
- 7. "Document" is synonymous in meaning and equal in scope to the usage of the term in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 34(a), and includes writings, drawings, graphs, charts, photographs, audio and video recordings, computer records, and any other data compilations from which information can be obtained

3

4

5

7

8

11

12

15

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- 8. "Endorsement" is synonymous in meaning and equal in scope to the usage of the term in the FTC's "Guides Concerning Use of Endorsements and Testimonials in Advertising," 16 C.F.R. § 255.0(b), and includes any advertising message (including verbal statements, demonstrations, or depictions of the name, signature, likeness or other identifying personal characteristics of an individual or the name or seal of an organization) which message consumers are likely to believe reflects the opinions, beliefs, findings, or experience of a party other than the sponsoring advertiser. The party whose opinions, beliefs, findings, or experience the message appears to reflect will be called the endorser and may be an individual, group or institution.
 - 9. "FTC" or "Commission" means the Federal Trade Commission.
- "Individual Defendants" means Douglas Gravink, Gary Hewitt, John Beck, Jeff Paul, and John Alexander.
- 11. "Infomercial" means any written or verbal statement, illustration, or depiction that is one hundred twenty (120) seconds or longer in duration that is designed to effect a sale or create interest in the purchasing of any product or service, which appears in any media, including but not limited to radio, television, and the internet.
- 12. "Material" means likely to affect a person's choice of, or conduct regarding, products or services or a charitable contribution.
- 13. "Negative option feature" means, in an offer or agreement to sell or provide any product or service, a provision under which the consumer's silence or failure to take an affirmative action to reject products or services or to cancel the

4

7

8

9

10 11

12

13

14

16

10

17

18 19

20

21

25

23

26

27 28 agreement is interpreted by the **seller** or provider as acceptance or continuing acceptance of the offer. Offers or agreements with **negative option features** include, but are not limited to:

- a. Free or introductory price trial offers in which the consumer receives a product or service for free or at a nominal or introductory price for an initial period and will incur an obligation to pay or pay a greater amount for the product or service if he or she does not take affirmative action to cancel, reject, or return the product or service before the end of that period;
- b. Continuity plans in which, subsequent to the consumer's agreement to the plan, the **seller** or provider automatically ships products or provides services to a consumer unless the consumer contacts the **seller** or provider within a certain time and requests that the **seller** or provider not to ship the products or provide the services; and
- c. Automatic renewal plans in which the seller or provider automatically renews the agreement and charges the consumer unless the consumer cancels before renewal.
- "Person" means any individual, group, unincorporated association,
 limited or general partnership, corporation, or other business entity.
 - 15. "Plaintiff" means the Federal Trade Commission.
- 16. "Seller" means any person who, in connection with a telemarketing transaction, provides, offers to provide, or arranges for others to provide, products or services to a consumer in exchange for consideration.
- 17. "Telemarketer" means any person who, in connection with telemarketing, initiates or receives telephone calls to or from a consumer or donor.
 - 18. "Telemarketing" means a plan, program, or campaign, whether or

	Case 2:09-cv-04719-JHN-CW Document 643 Filed 08/21/12 Page 9 of 31 Page ID #:19810
1	not covered by the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. Part 310, that is conducted
2	to induce the purchase of products or services or a charitable contribution by use of
3	one or more telephones and that involves more than one interstate telephone call.
4	
5	<u>ORDER</u>
6	I.
7	Ban on Infomercials
8	IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Defendant Douglas Gravink, Defendant
9	Gary Hewitt, and Defendant Family Products, LLC, whether acting directly or
10	through any other person or entity, and each such person, are permanently
11	restrained and enjoined from engaging or participating in the production or
12	dissemination of any infomercial, and also from assisting others engaged in the
13	production or dissemination of any infomercial. Nothing in any other provision of
14	this Order shall be read as an exception to this Section.
15	п.
16	Ban on Telemarketing
17	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Douglas Gravink, Defendant
18	Gary Hewitt, Defendant Family Products, LLC, and Defendant Mentoring of
19	America, LLC, whether acting directly or through any other person or entity, and
20	each such person, are permanently restrained and enjoined from engaging or
21	participating in telemarketing, and from assisting others engaged in
22	telemarketing. Nothing in any other provision of this Order shall be read as an
23	exception to this Section.
24	III.
25	Prohibited Conduct
26	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:
27	-9-

FINAL JUDGMENT FOR PERMANENT INJUNCTION AND OTHER EQUITABLE RELIEF AGAINST ALL DEFENDANTS

- A. **Defendants** as well as their officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and all other **persons** or entities in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation or other entity, subsidiary, division, or other device, including but not limited to fictitious business names, and each such **person**, in connection with the advertising, promoting, offering for sale, or sale of any product or service, including through the use of **endorsements**, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from:
- misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, that consumers who purchase any product or service will likely be able to earn money;
- 2. representing, expressly or by implication, that consumers who purchase any product or service will likely be able to earn money, unless **Defendants** possess and rely upon a reasonable basis to substantiate the representation at the time the representation is made;
- 3. misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, that consumers who purchase any product or service will likely be able to earn money quickly;
- 4. representing, expressly or by implication, that consumers who purchase any product or service will likely be able to earn money quickly, unless **Defendants** possess and rely upon a reasonable basis to substantiate the representation at the time the representation is made;
- 5. misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, that consumers who purchase any product or service will likely be able to earn money easily;
- 6. representing, expressly or by implication, that consumers who purchase any product or service will likely be able to earn money easily, unless **Defendants** possess and rely upon a reasonable basis to substantiate the representation at the time the representation is made;

 7. misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, that consumers who purchase any product or service will likely be able to make use of, or make money from, such product or service with little or no financial investment;

- 8. representing, expressly or by implication, that consumers who purchase any product or service will likely be able to make use of, or make money from, such product or service with little or no financial investment; unless

 Defendants possess and rely upon a reasonable basis to substantiate the representation at the time the representation is made; and
- 9. misrepresenting any other fact material to consumers concerning any product or service.
- B. Defendant John Beck, Defendant Douglas Gravink, Defendant Gary Hewitt, and the Corporate Defendants, as well as their officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons or entities in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation or other entity, subsidiary, division, or other device, including but not limited to fictitious business names, and each such person, in connection with the advertising, promoting, offering for sale, or sale of any product or service, including through the use of endorsements, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from:
- misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, that consumers will likely be able to purchase homes or other properties at tax sales;
- representing, expressly or by implication, that consumers will likely be able to purchase homes or other properties at tax sales, unless such
 Defendants possess and rely upon a reasonable basis to substantiate the representation at the time the representation is made;
 - misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, that consumers

- 4. representing, expressly or by implication, that consumers will likely be able to purchase homes or other properties at tax sales in their area, unless such Defendants possess and rely upon a reasonable basis to substantiate the representation at the time the representation is made;
- 5. misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, that consumers will likely be able to purchase homes or other properties at tax sales for "pennies on the dollar" or for substantially less than their market value;
- 6. representing, expressly or by implication, that consumers will likely be able to purchase homes or other properties at tax sales for "pennies on the dollar" or for substantially less than their market value, unless such Defendants possess and rely upon a reasonable basis to substantiate the representation at the time the representation is made;
- 7. misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, that consumers will likely be able to purchase homes or other properties at tax sales "free and clear" of all mortgages or liens;
- 8. representing, expressly or by implication, that consumers will likely be able to purchase homes or other properties at tax sales "free and clear" of all mortgages or liens, unless such Defendants possess and rely upon a reasonable basis to substantiate the representation at the time the representation is made;
- misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, that consumers who purchase any product or service will likely be able to earn money by selling or renting homes or other properties purchased at tax sales;
- 10. representing, expressly or by implication, that consumers who purchase any product or service will likely be able to earn money selling or renting homes or other properties purchased at government tax sales, unless such

12 13

15

14

17

18 19

20 21

23 24

22

25

26

27

Defendants possess and rely upon a reasonable basis to substantiate the representation at the time the representation is made;

- misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, that consumers are able to purchase deeds at tax sales;
- 12. failing to disclose, prominently and conspicuously, in connection with the advertising, marketing, promotion, offering for sale, or sale, of any product or service related to tax-foreclosure sales, that in many if not most tax jurisdictions, consumers are not able to purchase deeds at tax-foreclosure sales;
- misrepresenting that consumers will be able to earn money by purchasing liens or tax certificates at tax sales;
- misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, the financial success, wealth, or income that any Defendant has ever earned or achieved;
- misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, the financial success, wealth, or income that any other person has achieved;
- 16. representing, expressly or by implication, that any person has achieved any level of financial success, or any level of income or wealth, unless such Defendants possess and rely upon a reasonable basis to substantiate the representation at the time the representation is made; and
- misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, any other material 17. fact in connection with the sale of any product or service related to buying, selling or renting real property, or acquiring or selling any interest or lien in real property.
- Defendant John Alexander, Defendant Douglas Gravink, Defendant Gary Hewitt, and the Corporate Defendants, as well as their officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and all other **persons** or entities in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation

- D. Defendant Jeff Paul, Defendant Douglas Gravink, Defendant Gary Hewitt, and the Corporate Defendants, as well as their officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons or entities in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation or other entity, subsidiary, division, or other device, including but not limited to fictitious business names, and each such person, in connection with the advertising, promoting, offering for sale, or sale of any product or service, including through the use of endorsements, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from:
- misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, that consumers are likely to earn money from internet businesses;
- representing, expressly or by implication, that consumers are likely to earn money from internet businesses, unless such Defendants possess and rely upon a reasonable basis to substantiate the representation at the time the representation is made;
- misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, that consumers are likely to receive proven or turnkey businesses;
- 4. representing, expressly or by implication, that consumers are likely to receive proven or turnkey businesses, unless such **Defendants** possess

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- 5. misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, in connection with the advertising, promoting, offering for sale, or sale of any product or service related to teaching marketing techniques, principles, or skills, any other material fact.
- E. Defendant Douglas Gravink; Defendant Gary Hewitt; and the Corporate Defendants as well as their officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons or entities in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation or other entity, subsidiary, division, or other device, including but not limited to fictitious business names, and each such person, in connection with the advertising, promoting, offering for sale, or sale of any product or service, including through the use of endorsements, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from representing that a product or service is offered on a "free," "trial," or "no obligation" basis, or words of similar import, denoting or implying the absence of any obligation on the part of the recipient of the offer to affirmatively act in order to avoid charges if, in fact, a charge will be assessed pursuant to the offer unless the consumer takes affirmative action to cancel.
- F. Defendant Douglas Gravink, Defendant Gary Hewitt, and the Corporate Defendants, as well as their officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons or entities in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation or other entity, subsidiary, division, or other device, including but not limited to fictitious business

- misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, that consumers who purchase any product or service will earn back the cost or more than the cost of such product or service; and
- 2. representing, expressly or by implication, that consumers who purchase any product or service will earn back the cost or more than the cost of such product or service, unless such Defendants possess and rely upon a reasonable basis to substantiate the representation at the time the representation is made.
- G. Defendant Gary Hewitt; Defendant Douglas Gravink; and the Corporate Defendants, as well as its officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons or entities in active concert or participation with it who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation or other entity, subsidiary, division, or other device, including but not limited to fictitious business names, and each such person, in connection with the advertising, marketing, telemarketing, promoting, offering for sale, or sale of any product or service, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from violating or assisting others in violating any provision of the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. Part 310, as currently promulgated or as hereinafter may be amended, including but not limited to:
- 1. violating Section 310.3(a)(1)(vii), of the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. § 310.3(a)(1)(vii), by failing to disclose, or to disclose clearly and conspicuously, before a consumer pays for goods or services offered, all **material** terms and conditions of any **negative option feature** included in the offer, including but not limited to the fact that the customer's account will be charged

- 2. violating Section 310.4(a)(6) of the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. § 310.4(a)(6), by causing billing information to be submitted for payment, directly or indirectly, without the express informed consent of the customer or donor. In any **telemarketing** transaction, such Defendants shall obtain the customer's or donor's express informed consent to be charged for the goods or services or charitable contribution, and consent to be charged using the identified account; and
- 3. violating Section 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(A) of the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(A), by initiating or causing a telemarketer to initiate an outbound telephone call to any consumer who has previously stated that he or she does not wish to receive outbound telephone calls made by or on behalf of such Defendants.

IV.

Required Disclosures

telemarketing, promotion, offering for sale or sale of any product or service, by telephone or otherwise in commerce, Defendant Gary Hewitt, Defendant Douglas Gravink, and the Corporate Defendants, as well as their officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons or entities in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation or other entity, subsidiary, division, or other device, including but not limited to, fictitious business names, and each such person, shall disclose, clearly and conspicuously,

12

13

15

16

17

19

20 21

22 23

25 26

27

-18-

- before consumers are asked to pay money, reveal billing information, or submit consideration, or before any charge is incurred:
 - All fees and costs;
- B. All material restrictions, limitations, or conditions applicable to the purchase, receipt, or use of the product or service that is the subject of the offer (including but not limited to any promotion associated with free products or services, or products or services available on a trial basis);
- All material terms and conditions of any cancellation or refund policy, including but not limited to informing consumers if no cancellations or refunds are permitted; and
- All material terms and conditions of any offer with a negative option D. feature, including but not limited to:
- 1. The dollar amount of the first payment and when it will be charged, withdrawn, or become due; the dates or frequency (e.g., monthly, quarterly) of all subsequent charges or payment(s); and the dollar amount or range of costs of all subsequent charges or payment(s);
- If a withdrawal will be made or a charge assessed at the end of 2. a trial period unless the consumer cancels: this fact; when the trial period begins; the length of the trial period; the specific steps and means by which a cancellation request must be submitted; and the date by or time period within which a cancellation request must be received to avoid a charge;
- If products are automatically shipped to a consumer, or a 3. membership, subscription, or agreement for products or services that are offered on a periodic basis is automatically renewed unless the consumer provides notification within a certain time not to ship or renew: this fact; the length of the subsequent renewal period; the manner in which a notice not to ship or renew must be

submitted; the date by or time period within which a notice not to ship or renew must be received to avoid shipment or renewal (e.g., two weeks after the consumer is advised of an upcoming shipment); and the telephone number, email address, or street address to which such notice must be directed;

- 4. All material conditions, limitations and restrictions on the ability of the consumer to use any product or service that is offered as "free," "riskfree," "without obligation," or using words of similar import denoting or implying the absence of any obligation; and
- 5. The minimum number of purchases or minimum service period required by such Defendants, if any.

V.

Express Informed Consent

telemarketing, promotion, offering for sale or sale of any product or service, by telephone or otherwise in commerce, Defendant Gary Hewitt, Defendant Douglas Gravink, and the Corporate Defendants, as well as their officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons or entities in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation or other entity, subsidiary, division, or other device, including but not limited to, fictitious business names, and each such person, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from directly or indirectly using a consumer's billing information to obtain payment without first obtaining the consumer's express informed consent, which shall include express informed consent to be charged for the product or service using a specified billing account, and the clear and conspicuous disclosure of the information identified in the Section titled Required Disclosures, in close

- 2. For any transaction involving a service, within the lesser of ten (10) days after the date of the transaction or half the time of any trial period, the consumer must be sent written confirmation of the transaction that includes all of the information required by the Section titled Required Disclosures and a **clear** and conspicuous statement of the procedures by which the consumer can cancel or obtain a refund. The written confirmation shall be sent via first class mail in an envelope that **clearly and conspicuously** identifies the sender of the confirmation and the service the consumer ordered;
- 3. For any transaction involving a product, the first product shipment must contain written confirmation of the transaction that includes all of the information that is required to be disclosed pursuant to the Section titled Required Disclosures, and a clear and conspicuous statement of the procedures by which the consumer can cancel or obtain a refund;
- 4. In the case of a membership, subscription, or agreement whose term is less than sixty (60) days, at least fifteen (15) days prior to renewing a consumer's membership, subscription, or agreement to purchase for any service and prior to the submission for payment of a consumer's billing information for such services, the consumer must be sent written confirmation of such renewal. The written confirmation shall include all of the information required by the Section titled Required Disclosures and a clear and conspicuous statement of the procedures by which the consumer can cancel such renewal, and shall be sent via first class mail in an envelope that clearly and conspicuously identifies the sender of the confirmation and the service the consumer ordered; and
 - 5. In the case of a membership, subscription, or agreement whose

term is more than sixty (60) days, at least thirty (30) days prior to renewing a consumer's membership, subscription, or agreement to purchase for any service and prior to the submission for payment of a consumer's billing information for such services, the consumer must be sent written confirmation of such renewal. The written confirmation shall include all of the information required by the Section titled Required Disclosures and a clear and conspicuous statement of the procedures by which the consumer can cancel such renewal, and shall be sent via first class mail in an envelope that clearly and conspicuously identifies the sender of the confirmation and the service the consumer ordered.

B. With respect to previous customers, **Defendants** shall not bill any consumer or accept payment from any consumer who, as of the date of this Order, has already been enrolled as a trial or paying customer of John Beck's "Property Vault," John Alexander's "John's Club," or Jeff Paul's "Big League" or "Internet Millionaires Club," unless and until **Defendants** obtain, after entry of this Order, the consumer's express informed consent, as described in this Section.

VI.

Order Provision Regarding Customer Information

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, as well as their officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons or entities in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, and each such person, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from:

A. Disclosing, using, or benefitting from customer information, including name, address, telephone number, email address, Social Security number, other identifying information, or any data that enables access to a customer's account (including a credit card, bank account, or other financial account), of any **person**

21

22

23

24

25 26

27

28

that was obtained by any **Defendant** prior to entry of this Order in connection with the sale of any product or service; and

Failing to dispose of such customer information in all forms in their possession, custody, or control within thirty (30) days after entry of this Order. Disposal shall be by means that protect against unauthorized access to the customer information, such as by burning, pulverizing, or shredding any papers, and by erasing or destroying any electronic media, to ensure that the customer information cannot practicably be read or reconstructed.

Provided, however, that customer information need not be disposed of, and may be disclosed, to the extent requested by a government agency or required by a law, regulation, or court order.

VII.

Monetary Judgment and Consumer Restitution

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:

- Judgment is hereby entered in favor of the **Commission** and against Defendant John Beck, Defendant Douglas Gravink, Defendant Gary Hewitt, and the Corporate Defendants, jointly and severally, for equitable monetary relief, including but not limited to consumer redress, in the amount of one hundred thirteen million, three hundred seventy-four thousand, three hundred five dollars (\$113,374,305), which is the amount of injury suffered by consumers, or unjust enrichment obtained by Defendants, in connection with the practices alleged in Count 1 of the Complaint. Judgment shall be paid to the Commission within thirty (30) days of entry of this Order.
- Judgment is hereby entered in favor of the Commission and against B. Defendant John Alexander, Defendant Douglas Gravink, Defendant Gary Hewitt, and the Corporate Defendants, jointly and severally, for equitable monetary

- C. Judgment is hereby entered in favor of the **Commission** and against Defendant Jeff Paul, Defendant Douglas Gravink, Defendant Gary Hewitt, and the **Corporate Defendants**, jointly and severally, for equitable monetary relief, including but not limited to consumer redress, in the amount of thirty-three million, eight hundred three thousand, three hundred thirty-seven dollars (\$33,803,337), which is the amount of injury suffered by consumers, or unjust enrichment obtained by Defendants, in connection with the practices alleged in Count 5 of the Complaint. Judgment shall be paid to the **Commission** within thirty (30) days of entry of this Order.
- D. Judgment is hereby entered in favor of the **Commission** and against Defendant Douglas Gravink, Defendant Gary Hewitt, and the **Corporate Defendants**, jointly and severally, for equitable monetary relief, including but not limited to consumer redress, in the amount of forty million, nine thousand, six hundred forty-eight dollars (\$40,009,648), which is the amount of injury suffered by consumers, or unjust enrichment obtained by Defendants, in connection with the practices alleged in Counts 2, 4, and 6 of the Complaint. Judgment shall be paid to the **Commission** within thirty (30) days of entry of this Order.
- E. Judgment is hereby entered in favor of the **Commission** and against Defendant Douglas Gravink, Defendant Gary Hewitt, and the **Corporate Defendants**, jointly and severally, for equitable monetary relief, including but not

5

6

7

10

11

12

13

15

16

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

limited to consumer redress, in the amount of two hundred eighty million, sixty-seven thousand, five hundred thirty-five dollars (\$280,067,535), which is the amount of injury suffered by consumers, or unjust enrichment obtained by Defendants, in connection with the practices alleged in Count 7 of the Complaint. Judgment shall be paid to the **Commission** within thirty (30) days of entry of this Order.

F. All funds paid to or received by the **Commission** pursuant to this Section shall be deposited into a fund administered by the **Commission** or its agent. In the event that direct restitution to consumers is wholly or partially impracticable or funds remain after restitution is completed, the Commission may apply any remaining funds for such other equitable relief (including consumer information remedies) as it determines to be reasonably related to **Defendants**' practices as alleged in the Complaint. Any funds not used for such equitable relief will be deposited with the United States Treasury as disgorgement. **Defendants** shall have no right to challenge the **Commission's** choice of remedies under this Section. **Defendants** shall have no right to contest the manner of distribution chosen by the **Commission**.

VIII.

Order Acknowledgments

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants obtain acknowledgments of receipt of this Order:

- A. Each **Defendant**, within ten (10) days of entry of this Order, must submit to the **Commission** an acknowledgment of receipt of this Order sworn under penalty of perjury.
- B. For twenty (20) years after entry of this Order, Defendants Gravink and Hewitt, and for ten (10) years after entry of this Order, Defendants Beck, Paul,

-25-

1	and Alexander, for any business that such Defendant , individually or collectively
2	with any other Defendant, is the majority owner or directly or indirectly controls,
3	and each Corporate Defendant, must deliver a copy of this Order to:
4	 all principals, officers, directors, and managers;
5	2. all employees, agents, and representatives who participate in
6	conduct related to the subject matter of the Order; and
7	 any business entity resulting from any change in structure as set
8	forth in the Section titled Compliance Reporting. Delivery must occur within ten
9	(10) days of entry of this Order for current personnel. To all others, delivery must
10	occur before they assume their responsibilities.
11	C. From each individual or entity to which a Defendant delivered a copy
12	of this Order, such Defendant must obtain, within thirty (30) days, a signed and
13	dated acknowledgment of receipt of this Order.
14	IX.
15	Compliance Reporting
16	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants make timely submissions to
17	the Commission:
18	A. One hundred eighty (180) days after entry of this Order, each
19	Defendant must submit a compliance report, sworn under penalty of perjury.
20	1. Each Defendant must:
21	 a. designate at least one telephone number and an email,
22	physical, and postal address as points of contact, which representatives of the
23	Commission may use to communicate with such Defendant ;
24	b. identify all of such Defendant's businesses by all of their
25	names, telephone numbers, and physical, postal, email, and internet addresses;
26	c. describe the activities of each business, including the
27	-26-
28	FINAL HIDGMENT FOR PERMANENT INHINCTION AND

1	products and services offered, the means of advertising, marketing, and sales, and
2	the involvement of any other Defendant (which Individual Defendants must
3	describe if they know or should know due to their own involvement);
4	d. describe in detail whether and how such Defendant is in
5	compliance with each Section of this Order; and
6	e. provide a copy of each Order Acknowledgment obtained
7	pursuant to this Order, unless previously submitted to the Commission;
8	Additionally, each Individual Defendant must:
9	 a. identify all telephone numbers and all email, internet,
10	physical, and postal addresses, including all residences;
11	 identify all titles and roles in all business activities,
12	including any business for which such Defendant performs services, whether as an
13	employee or otherwise, and any entity in which such Defendant has any
14	ownership interest; and
15	c. describe in detail such Defendant's involvement in each
6	such business, including title, role, responsibilities, participation, authority, control,
7	and any ownership.
8	B. For twenty (20) years following entry of this Order, Gravink and
9	Hewitt, and for ten (10) years following entry of this Order, Beck, Paul, and
20	Alexander, must submit a compliance notice, sworn under penalty of perjury,
21	within fourteen (14) days of any change in the following:
22	 Each Defendant must report any change in:
23	 a. any designated point of contact; or
24	b. the structure of any Corporate Defendant or any entity
25	that such Defendant has any ownership interest in or directly or indirectly controls
26	that may affect compliance obligations arising under this Order, including:
27	-27-
28	EINAL HIDGMENT FOR DEPMANENT INHINCTION AND

Case 2:09-cv-04719-JHN-CW Document 643 Filed 08/21/12 Page 28 of 31 Page ID

2

X. Recordkeeping

3

7 8

9

10 11

12

13

16

17

18 19

20

21

22 23

24

25

26

27

28

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Gravink and Hewitt must create certain records for twenty (20) years after entry of this Order, and Beck, Paul, and Alexander must create records for ten (10) years after entry of this Order, and retain each such record for five (5) years. Specifically, each Corporate Defendant and each Individual Defendant, for any business in which such **Defendant**, individually or collectively with any other **Defendants**, is a majority owner or directly or indirectly controls, must maintain the following records:

- Accounting records showing the revenues from all goods or services sold, all costs incurred in generating those revenues, and the resulting net profit or loss;
- B. Personnel records showing, for each person providing services, 14 whether as an employee or otherwise, that person's: name, addresses, and telephone numbers; job title or position; dates of service; and, if applicable, the reason for termination;
 - C. Customer files obtained after entry of this Order showing the names, addresses, telephone numbers, dollar amounts paid, and the quantity and description of goods or services purchased;
 - D. Complaints and refund requests, whether received directly or indirectly, such as through a third party, and any response;
 - E. All records necessary to demonstrate full compliance with each provision of this Order, including all submissions to the Commission; and
 - A copy of each advertisement or other marketing material. F.

XI.

Compliance Monitoring

-29-

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that for the purpose of monitoring **Defendants'** compliance with this Order:

- A. Within fourteen (14) days of receipt of a written request from a representative of the **Commission**, each **Defendant** must: submit additional compliance reports or other requested information, which must be sworn under penalty of perjury; appear for depositions; and produce documents, for inspection and copying. The Commission is also authorized to obtain discovery, without further leave of court, using any of the procedures prescribed by Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 29, 30 (including telephonic depositions), 31, 33, 34, 36, 45, and 69.
- B. For matters concerning this Order, the **Commission** is authorized to communicate directly with each **Defendant**. **Defendants** must permit representatives of the **Commission** to interview any employee or other **person** affiliated with any **Defendant** who has agreed to such an interview. The **person** interviewed may have counsel present.
- C. The **Commission** may use all other lawful means, including posing, through its representatives, as consumers, suppliers, or other individuals or entities, to **Defendants** or any individual or entity affiliated with **Defendants**, without the necessity of identification or prior notice. Nothing in this Order limits the **Commission's** lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1.

22 ///

23 ///

24 ///

25 ///

26 ///

	Case 2:09-cv-04719-JHN-CW Document 643 Filed 08/21/12 Page 31 of 31 Page ID #:19832
1	XII.
2	Retention of Jurisdiction
3	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Court retains jurisdiction of this
4	matter for purposes of construction, modification, and enforcement of this Order.
5	
6	IT IS SO ORDERED.
7	DATED: August 21, 2012
8	HON. JACQUELINE H. NGUYEN*
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16 17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	* Circuit Judge, U.S. Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit, sitting by designation.
26	Judge Nguyen presided over this case from December 16, 2009 to May 14, 2012 as a United States District Judge.
27	-31-
28	FINAL JUDGMENT FOR PERMANENT INJUNCTION AND