FINDINGS

- 1. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this case and over Defendants Richard Friedberg and Rimona Friedberg pursuant to 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a) and 53(b), and 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331, 1337(a) and 1345.
- 2. This Court has supplemental jurisdiction over Plaintiff State of Arizona's claims against Defendants Richard Friedberg and Rimona Friedberg under 28 U.S.C. § 1367.
- 3. Venue in this District is proper under 15 U.S.C. § 53(b) and 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b) and (c).
- 4. The activities of Defendants Richard Friedberg and Rimona Friedberg, as alleged in the Complaint, are in or affecting commerce, as defined in Section 4 of the Federal Trade Commission Act ("FTC Act"), 15 U.S.C. § 44.
- 5. The Complaint states a claim upon which relief may be granted under Sections 5(a) and 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a) and 53(b), and the Arizona Consumer Fraud Act, A.R.S. § 44-1521, *et seq*, against Defendants Richard Friedberg and Rimona Friedberg.
- 6. Defendants Richard Friedberg and Rimona Friedberg have entered into this Order freely and without coercion. These Defendants further acknowledge that they have read the provisions of this Order and are prepared to abide by them.
- 7. Defendants Richard Friedberg and Rimona Friedberg waive all rights to seek judicial review or otherwise challenge or contest the validity of this Order. These Defendants further waive and release any claim they may have against the Commission and the State of Arizona and their employees, representatives, and agents.
- 8. Defendants Richard Friedberg and Rimona Friedberg waive any claims they may have under the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, concerning the prosecution of this action through the date of the entry of this

1 Order.

- 9. Defendants Richard Friedberg and Rimona Friedberg, in consenting to the entry of this Order, do not admit the allegations of the Complaint other than the jurisdictional facts, and nothing herein shall be deemed an admission of wrongdoing except as provided in Section V.I, below.
 - 10. Defendants Richard Friedberg and Rimona Friedberg agree that for purposes of facilitating resolution of this matter, entry of this Order is in the public interest.

DEFINITIONS

For purposes of this Order, the following definitions shall apply:

- 1. "Asset" means any legal or equitable interest in, right to, or claim to, any real and personal property, including, but not limited to, "goods," "instruments," "equipment," "fixtures," "general intangibles," "inventory," "checks," "notes" (as these terms are defined in the Uniform Commercial Code), and all chattel, leaseholds, contracts, mail or other deliveries, shares of stock, lists of consumer names, accounts, credits, premises, receivables, funds, reserve funds, and cash, wherever located.
- 2. "Assisting others" includes, but is not limited to: (1) performing customer service functions, including, but not limited to, receiving or responding to consumer complaints; (2) formulating or providing, or arranging for the formulation or provision of, any marketing material; (3) providing names of, or assisting in the generation of lists of, potential customers; (4) performing marketing or billing services of any kind; (5) processing credit and debit card payments; or (6) acting or serving as an owner, officer, director, manager, or principal of any entity.
- 3. **"Document"** is synonymous in meaning and equal in scope to the usage of the term in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 34(a), and includes

1	writings, drawings, graphs, charts, Internet sites, webpages, websites, electronic
2	correspondence, including e-mail and instant messages, photographs, audio and
3	video recordings, contracts, accounting data, advertisements (including, but not
4	limited to, advertisements placed on the World Wide Web), FTP Logs, Server
5	Access Logs, USENET Newsgroup postings, World Wide Web pages, books,
6	written or printed records, handwritten notes, telephone logs, telephone scripts,
7	receipt books, ledgers, personal and business canceled checks and check registers
8	bank statements, appointment books, computer records, and other data
9	compilations from which information can be obtained and translated. A draft or
10	non-identical copy is a separate document within the meaning of the term.

- 4. "Employment Product or Service" means any good, service, plan, or program that is represented, expressly or by implication, to assist an individual in any manner to obtain employment and includes, but is not limited to: (a) employment listings; (b) study guides; (c) test preparation; (d) job application processing or preparation assistance; (e) resume preparation; (f) certifications or licenses or assistance in obtaining certifications or licenses; (g) job matching or career counseling services; or (h) facilitating resume distribution and interviews.
 - 5. "FTC" or "Commission" means Federal Trade Commission.
- 6. **"Person"** means a natural person, organization, or other legal entity, including, but not limited to, a corporation, partnership, proprietorship, association, cooperative, or any other group or combination acting as an entity.
- 7. "**Settling Defendants**" means Richard Freidberg and Rimona Friedberg, individually or collectively.
- 8. The words "and" and "or" shall be understood to have both conjunctive and disjunctive meanings.

ORDER

I.

BAN ON EMPLOYMENT PRODUCTS OR SERVICES

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that, after 6 months from the date on which all parties have signed the Stipulation Re: Entry of Final Order, the Settling Defendants, whether acting directly or through any other person, corporation, partnership, subsidiary, division, agent, or other device, are permanently restrained and enjoined from:

- A. Advertising, marketing, promoting, offering for sale, or selling any Employment Product or Service;
- B. Assisting others engaged in advertising, marketing, promoting, offering for sale or selling any Employment Product or Service; and
- C. Offering for sale, selling, or transferring any interest in an entity that advertises, markets, promotes, offers for sale, or sells any Employment Product or Service, including but not limited to Career Systems LLC, also known as Job Search Network LLC, or receiving any compensation for any such interest.

II.

PROHIBITED REPRESENTATIONS RELATING TO ANY GOODS OR SERVICES

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Settling Defendants and their officers, agents, servants, employees, and all persons in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation, partnership, subsidiary, division, agent, or other device, in connection with the advertising, marketing, promotion, offering for sale or sale of any good, service, plan, or program, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from misrepresenting, or assisting others in misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, any material fact, including, but not limited to:

- A. The availability of any good, service, plan, or program;
- B. The necessity of taking a written exam;

Any material restriction, limitation, or condition to purchase, receive,

When the consumers will be billed or charged;

good, service, plan, or program;

27

28

D.

E.

or use the good, service, plan, or program;

- F. Any material aspect of the nature or terms of any refund, cancellation, exchange, or repurchase policy, including, but not limited to, the likelihood of a consumer obtaining a full or partial refund, or the circumstances in which a full or partial refund will be granted to the consumer; and
- G. Any material aspect of the performance, efficacy, nature or other characteristic of the good, service, plan, or program.

IV.

PROHIBITION ON VIOLATING ARIZONA CONSUMER FRAUD ACT

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Settling Defendants and their officers, agents, servants, employees, and all persons in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation, partnership, subsidiary, division, agent, or other device, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from violating the Arizona Consumer Fraud Act, A.R.S. § 44-1521 *et seq*, as currently written or as amended in the future.

V.

MONETARY RELIEF

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:

- A. Judgment is hereby entered in favor of the Commission and the State of Arizona and against the Settling Defendants, jointly and severally, in the amount of three hundred sixty-three thousand, seven hundred sixty-one dollars (\$363,761), as equitable monetary relief for consumer injury; provided, however, that subject to the provisions of Sections V.B and VI below (Right to Reopen), this judgment shall be suspended.
- B. If the Settling Defendants sell, gift, or otherwise transfer, or have sold, gifted, or otherwise transferred, any interest in an entity that advertises, markets, promotes, offers for sale, or sells any Employment Product or Service, including

1	hut not limited	l to Care	er Systems LLC also known as Joh Search Network LLC			
	but not limited to Career Systems LLC, also known as Job Search Network LLC,					
2	or any good that is represented to assist an individual in any manner to obtain					
3		such as st	tudy guides, test preparation materials, or career counselor			
4	handbooks:					
5	1	. The	sale, gift, or transfer must be completed by 6 months from			
6		the	date on which all parties have signed the Stipulation Re:			
7		Ent	ry of Final Order and no payment or compensation for the			
8		sale	may be received after this date;			
9	2	. The	sale, gift, or transfer shall be to an unrelated, third-party,			
10		and				
11	3	. The	sale proceeds shall be disposed of as follows:			
12		a.	The Settling Defendants shall receive \$2,500;			
13		b.	The Settling Defendants may use up to \$3,000 for the			
14			payment of reasonable and necessary transaction costs,			
15			supported by proper documentation, incurred in the sale;			
16		c.	The purchaser in the sale described in Section V.B must			
17			by 6 months after the date on which all parties have			
18			signed the Stipulation Re: Entry of Final Order:			
19			i. pay 50% of the sale proceeds remaining after			
20			subtracting the amounts in Subsections V.B.3.a-b,			
21			above, directly to the Internal Revenue Service or			
22			to any state taxing authority for the Friedbergs'			
23			2011 or earlier tax liabilities; and			
24			ii. pay the other 50% directly to the Federal Trade			
25			Commission, acting on behalf of itself and the			
26			State of Arizona.			
27	C. T	'o ensure	the Settling Defendants' compliance with Subsection V.B			
28	ahove:		-6 =			

14

11

15 16 17

19

18

21 22

20

23 24

27

28

- 1. The Settling Defendants shall provide to Plaintiffs a copy of any sales contract that reflects the complete sale price for the interest or good sold, any payment terms, and the name, phone number, and address of the purchaser within ten (10) days after the contract's signing, or by no later than ten (10) days after the Court's entry of this Order, whichever is later;
- 2. The Settling Defendants shall provide to the Commission and the State of Arizona proof of the payment of any state or federal income taxes by the purchaser within ten (10) days after such payment, or by no later than ten (10) days after the Court's entry of this Order, whichever is later. Such proof shall consist of copies of the front and back of all cancelled checks or electronic payment receipts;
- D. In the event of default on any obligation to make payment under this Order, interest, computed pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1961(a), shall accrue from the date of default to the date of payment. In the event such default continues for ten (10) calendar days beyond the date the payment is due, the entire amount of the judgment set forth in Section V.A, above, less any amounts previously paid pursuant to this Order or by any other Defendant, together with interest, shall immediately become due and payable. The Settling Defendants shall be jointly and severally liable for all payments required by this Order and any interest on such payments.
- E. All monies paid to the Commission and the State of Arizona pursuant to this Order ("joint monies") shall be deposited into a fund administered by the Commission or its agents on behalf of both the Commission and the State of Arizona. This fund shall be used for equitable relief, including, but not limited to, redress to consumers, and any attendant expenses for the administration of such equitable relief. In the event that the Commission determines that direct redress to

F. All joint monies not used for the equitable relief described in Subsection E ("remaining joint monies") shall be distributed among the Commission and the State of Arizona in the following manner:

- 1. The State of Arizona shall receive the lesser amount of all remaining joint monies or \$35,634 as reimbursement for its attorneys' fees and expenses in this matter; after which
- 2. All remaining joint monies shall be divided equally between the Commission and the State of Arizona.
- G. No portion of any payment under the Order herein shall be deemed a payment of any fine, penalty, or punitive assessment.
- H. The Settling Defendants relinquish all dominion, control, and title to the funds paid to the fullest extent permitted by law. The Settling Defendants shall make no claim to or demand for return of the funds, directly or indirectly, through counsel or otherwise.
- I. Settling Defendants agree that the facts as alleged in the Complaint filed in this action shall be taken as true without further proof in any bankruptcy case or subsequent civil litigation pursued by the Commission or the State of Arizona to enforce its rights to any payment or money judgment pursuant to this Order, including but not limited to a nondischargeability complaint in any

bankruptcy case. Settling Defendants further stipulate and agree that the facts alleged in the Complaint establish all elements necessary to sustain an action by the Commission or the State of Arizona pursuant to Section 523(a)(2)(A) of the Bankruptcy Code, 11 U.S.C. § 523(a)(2)(A), and that this Order shall have collateral estoppel effect for such purposes.

VI.

RIGHT TO REOPEN

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that

- A. The Commission's and the State of Arizona's agreement to, and the Court's approval of, this Order, including, but not limited to, the suspension of the monetary judgment against the Settling Defendants, is expressly premised upon the truthfulness, accuracy, and completeness of their financial condition, as represented in the documents listed on Attachment A (collectively "Financial Statements"), all of which the Commission and the State of Arizona relied upon in negotiating and agreeing to the terms of this Order.
- B. If, upon motion by the Commission or the State of Arizona to the Court, the Court finds that any Settling Defendant, in any of the above-referenced Financial Statements, failed to disclose any asset with a value in excess of \$1,000, materially misrepresented the value of any asset, or made any other material misrepresentation or omission, the suspension shall be lifted on the monetary judgment in Section V (Monetary Relief), above, and that judgment amount, less any payments already made to the Commission and the State of Arizona by any Defendant, shall be immediately due and payable.

Provided, however, that in all other respects, this Order shall remain in full force and effect, unless otherwise ordered by the Court; and,

Provided further, that proceedings initiated under this provision would be in addition to, and not in lieu of, any other civil or criminal remedies as may be provided by law, including any proceedings that the Commission or the State of

Arizona may initiate to enforce this Order.

.

VIII.

LIFTING OF ASSET FREEZE

VII.

CONSUMER INFORMATION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Settling Defendants, and their officers, agents, servants, and employees, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, are permanently restrained and enjoined from:

- A. Disclosing, using, or benefitting from customer information, including the name, address, telephone number, email address, social security number, other identifying information, or any data that enables access to a customer's account (including a credit card, bank account, or other financial account), of any person which any Settling Defendant in this matter obtained prior to entry of this Order in connection with the sale of any Employment Product or Service, except in connection with a sale not prohibited by Section I.C; and
- B. Failing to dispose of such customer information in all forms in their possession, custody, or control within 6 months from the date on which all parties have signed the Stipulation Re: Entry of Final Order or 30 days of entry of a final order against the Settling Defendants, whichever is later, or within 30 days of receipt of written direction to do so from a representative of the Commission or the State of Arizona. Disposal shall be by means that protect against unauthorized access to the customer information, such as by burning, pulverizing, or shredding any papers, and by erasing or destroying any electronic media, to ensure that the customer information cannot practicably be read or reconstructed.
- **Provided, however,** that customer information need not be disposed of, and may be disclosed, to the extent requested by a government agency or required by a law, regulation, or court order.

1
 2
 3

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the freeze of the Settling Defendants' assets set forth in the Preliminary Injunction, entered by this Court on February 2, 2010, shall be lifted permanently.

4

IX.

5

6

COMPLIANCE MONITORING

7

8

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for the purpose of monitoring the Settling Defendants' compliance with this Order, including the financial representations upon which the judgment was suspended and any failure to transfer

Within 14 days of receipt of a written request from a representative of

9

any assets as required by this Order:

1011

the Commission or the State of Arizona, each Settling Defendant must: submit

12

additional compliance reports or other requested information, which must be sworn

13

under penalty of perjury; appear for depositions; and produce documents, for

inspection and copying. The Commission and the State of Arizona are also

1415

authorized to obtain discovery, without further leave of court, using any of the

16

procedures prescribed by Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 29, 30 (including

17

telephonic depositions), 31, 33, 34, 36, 45, and 69.

1819

В.

Arizona are authorized to communicate directly with each Settling Defendant. The

For matters concerning this Order, the Commission and the State of

20

Settling Defendants must permit representatives of the Commission and the State

21

of Arizona to interview any employee or other person affiliated with any

2223

Defendant who has agreed to such an interview. The person interviewed may have counsel present.

24

C. The Commission and the State of Arizona may use all other lawful means, including posing, through its representatives, as consumers, suppliers, or other individuals or entities, to Settling Defendants or any individual or entity

2627

25

affiliated with Settling Defendants, without the necessity of identification or prior

28

notice. Nothing in this Order limits the Commission's lawful use of compulsory

process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25 26

27

28

X.

COMPLIANCE REPORTING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Settling Defendants make timely submissions to the Commission:

- A. One hundred eighty (180) days after entry of this Order, each Settling Defendant must submit a compliance report, sworn under penalty of perjury. Each Settling Defendant must: (a) identify all telephone numbers and all email, Internet, physical, and postal addresses, including all residences; (b) identify all titles and roles in all business activities, including any business for which such Defendant performs services whether as an employee or otherwise and any entity in which such Defendant has any ownership interest; and (c) describe in detail such Defendant's involvement in each such business, including title, role, responsibilities, participation, authority, control, and any ownership; (d) designate at least one telephone number and an email, physical, and postal address as points of contact, which representatives of the Commission and the State of Arizona may use to communicate with such Defendant; (e) identify all of that Defendant's businesses by all of their names, telephone numbers, and physical, postal, email, and Internet addresses; (f) describe the activities of each business, including the products and services offered, the means of advertising, marketing, and sales, and the involvement of any other Defendant (which Settling Defendants must describe if they know or should know due to their own involvement); (g) describe in detail whether and how that Defendant is in compliance with each Section of this Order; and (h) provide a copy of each Order Acknowledgment obtained pursuant to this Order, unless previously submitted to the Commission or the State of Arizona.
- В. For 20 years following entry of this Order, each Settling Defendant must submit a compliance notice, sworn under penalty of perjury, within 14 days of any change in the following: (a) name, including aliases or fictitious name, or

1	residence address; or (b) title or role in any business activity, including any		
2	business for which such Defendant performs services whether as an employee or		
3	otherwise and any entity in which such Defendant has any ownership interest, and		
4	identify its name, physical address, and Internet address, if any; (c) any designated		
5	point of contact; (d) any entity that Defendant has any ownership interest in or		
6	directly or indirectly controls that may affect compliance obligations arising under		
7	this Order, including: creation, merger, sale, or dissolution of the entity or any		
8	subsidiary, parent, or affiliate that engages in any acts or practices subject to this		
9	Order.		
10	C. Each Settling Defendant must submit to the Commission and the State		
11	of Arizona notice of the filing of any bankruptcy petition, insolvency proceeding,		
12	or any similar proceeding by or against such Defendant within 14 days of its filing.		
13	D. Any submission to the Commission and the State of Arizona required		

- D. Any submission to the Commission and the State of Arizona required by this Order to be sworn under penalty of perjury must be true and accurate and comply with 28 U.S.C. § 1746, such as by concluding: "I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on:_____" and supplying the date, signatory's full name, title (if applicable), and signature.
- E. Unless otherwise directed by the Commission's or State of Arizona's representatives in writing, all submissions to the Commission or the State of Arizona pursuant to this Order must be emailed to DEbrief@ftc.gov or sent by overnight courier (not the U.S. Postal Service) to both:

Associate Director for Enforcement, Bureau of Consumer Protection, Federal Trade Commission, 600 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Washington, DC 20580 and

Noreen R. Matts Assistant Attorney General Consumer Protection & Advocacy Section 400 West Congress, S-Bldg, Suite 315

2526

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

27

1 Tucson, Arizona 85701 2 The subject line must begin: FTC v. Richard and Rimona Friedberg, X100013. 3 XI. 4 RECORDKEEPING 5 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Settling Defendants must create certain 6 records for 20 years after entry of the Order, and retain each such record for 5 7 years. Specifically, each Settling Defendant for any business in which that 8 Defendant, individually or collectively with any other Defendant, is a majority 9 owner or directly or indirectly controls, must maintain the following records: 10 Accounting records showing the revenues from all goods or services 11 sold, all costs incurred in generating those revenues, and the resulting net profit or 12 loss; 13 Personnel records showing, for each person providing services, B. 14 whether as an employee or otherwise, that person's: name, addresses, and 15 telephone numbers; job title or position; dates of service; and, if applicable, the 16 reason for termination; 17 C. Customer files obtained after entry of this Order and to the extent such 18 information is obtained in the ordinary course of business showing the names, 19 addresses, telephone numbers, dollar amounts paid, and the quantity and 20 description of goods or services purchased; 21 D. Complaints and refund requests, whether received directly or 22 indirectly, such as through a third party, and any response; 23 E. All records necessary to demonstrate full compliance with each 24 provision of this Order, including all submissions to the Commission; and 25 A copy of each sales script, training material, advertisement, or other F. 26 marketing material.

27

28

ORDER ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

XII.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Settling Defendants obtain acknowledgments of receipt of this Order:

- A. Each Settling Defendant, within 7 days of entry of this Order, must submit to the Commission an acknowledgment of receipt of this Order sworn under penalty of perjury.
- B. The Settling Defendants, within 7 days of entry of this Order or within 7 days of any sale described in Section V.B, whichever is later, must deliver a copy of this Order and of the Complaint in this matter to the purchaser described in Section V.B, if any.
- C. For 5 years after entry of this Order, each Settling Defendant for any business that such Defendant, individually or collectively with any other Defendant, is the majority owner or directly or indirectly controls, must deliver a copy of this Order to: (1) all principals, officers, directors, and managers; (2) all employees, agents, and representatives who participate in conduct related to the subject matter of the Order; and (3) any business entity resulting from any change in structure as set forth in the Section titled Compliance Reporting. Delivery must occur within 7 days of entry of this Order for current personnel. To all others, delivery must occur before they assume their responsibilities.
- D. From each individual or entity to which a Settling Defendant delivered a copy of this Order, that Defendant must obtain, within 30 days, a signed and dated acknowledgment of receipt of this Order.

XIII.

RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter for purposes of construction, modification, and enforcement of this Order.

ENTRY OF ORDER

XIV.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that there is no just reason for delay, and the Clerk of the Court is hereby directed to enter this Final Order and Judgment immediately. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, all parties and claims having been resolved by stipulated agreements, this action is CLOSED. DATED this 1st day of March, 2012. United States District Judge

1		ATTACHMENT A					
2	1.	Financial Statement of Individual Defendant Richard S. Friedberg					
3	dated 08/27/2011						
4	2.	Financial Statement of Individual Defendant Rimona Friedberg dated					
5	08/27/2011						
6	3.	Financial Statement of Individual Defendant Richard S. Friedberg					
7	dated 1/8/2010						
8	4.	Financial Statement of Individual Defendant Rimona Friedberg dated					
9	1/8/2010						
10	5.	Richard and Rimona Friedberg's federal tax returns for tax years					
11	2010, 2009,	, 2008, 2007, and 2006					
12							
13							
14							
15							
16							
17							
18							
19							
20							
21							
22							
23							
24							
25							
26							
27							
28							