

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
DISTRICT OF KANSAS

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION, and the  
STATES OF ILLINOIS, KANSAS,  
MINNESOTA, and NORTH CAROLINA,

Plaintiffs,

v.

AFFILIATE STRATEGIES, INC., *et al.*

Defendants.

**Case No. 5:09-CV-04104-JAR-KGS**

**STIPULATED ORDER FOR  
PERMANENT INJUNCTION AND  
MONETARY JUDGMENT  
AGAINST ALICIA NOSSOV**

On July 20, 2009, original Plaintiffs, the Federal Trade Commission (“FTC”), and the States of Kansas, Minnesota and North Carolina filed a Complaint for Injunction and Other Equitable Relief to obtain temporary, preliminary, and permanent injunctive relief. The original Complaint was amended on December 9, 2009, adding one new Plaintiff, the State of Illinois (collectively with the original Plaintiffs, “Plaintiffs”), several new Defendants and new Counts. A Second Amended Complaint was filed on June 21, 2010, adding several additional facts and citations to evidence. The Second Amended Complaint (the “Complaint”) brings claims pursuant to Sections 13(b) and 19 of the Federal Trade Commission Act (“FTC Act”), 15 U.S.C. §§ 53(b) and 57b, the Telemarketing and Consumer Fraud and Abuse Prevention Act (“Telemarketing Act”), 15 U.S.C. §§ 6101–6108; the Kansas Consumer Protection Act, K.S.A. 50-623, *et seq.*; Minn. Stat. §§ 8.01 & 8.31; the Minnesota Uniform Deceptive Trade Practices Act, Minn. Stat. §§ 325D.43-325D.48; Minn. Stat. § 325F.67; the Minnesota Prevention of Consumer Fraud Act, Minn. Stat. §§ 325F.68-325F.70; and Minn. Stat. § 325F.71, subd. 2 (2008); the North Carolina Unfair and Deceptive Trade Practices Act, N.C. Gen. Stat. §§ 75-1.1,

*et seq.*; and the Illinois Consumer Fraud and Deceptive Business Practices Act, 815 ILCS 505/2  
*et seq.*

The Plaintiffs and Defendant Alicia Nossov (“Defendant”) have agreed to settle the instant litigation by joining in this Stipulated Permanent Injunction and Final Judgment Order (the “Order” or “Final Order”). The Plaintiffs, and Defendant, having been represented by counsel and acting by and through said counsel have consented to the entry of this Order without trial or adjudication of any issue of law or fact herein and without Defendant admitting liability for any of the violations alleged in the Complaint.

**NOW THEREFORE**, Plaintiffs and Defendant, requesting that the Court enter this Order, and the Court, having considered the Order reached between the settling parties, **IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED** as follows:

**FINDINGS**

1. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this case and the parties hereto pursuant to 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a), 53(b), 57b, 6102(c), and 6105(b), and 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331, 1337(a), and 1345.
2. Venue in the District of Kansas is proper as to Defendant.
3. Defendant’s activities are in or affecting commerce, as defined in the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.
4. The Complaint states a claim upon which relief may be granted against Defendant under Sections 5(a), 13(b), and 19 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a), 53(b) and 57b, the Telemarketing Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 6101–6108, and the Kansas Consumer Protection Act, K.S.A. 50-623, *et seq.*; Minn. Stat. §§ 8.01 & 8.31; the Minnesota Uniform Deceptive Trade Practices Act, Minn. Stat. §§ 325D.43-325D.48; Minn.

Stat. § 325F.67; the Minnesota Prevention of Consumer Fraud Act, Minn. Stat. §§ 325F.68-325F.70; and Minn. Stat. § 325F.71, subd. 2 (2008); the North Carolina Unfair and Deceptive Trade Practices Act, N.C. Gen. Stat. §§ 75-1.1, *et seq.*; and the Illinois Consumer Fraud and Deceptive Business Practices Act, 815 ILCS 505/2 *et seq.*

5. Defendant waives all rights to seek judicial review or otherwise challenge or contest the validity of this Final Order.
6. Defendant further waives any claim, including any claim for attorneys' fees under the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, *amended by* Pub. L. 104-121, 110 Stat. 847, 863-64 (1996), and any claims she may have against the Plaintiffs, their employees, representatives, or agents.
7. The Plaintiffs and Defendant shall each bear their own costs and attorneys' fees incurred in this action.
8. Defendant enters into this Final Order freely and without coercion and acknowledges that she has read, understands, and is prepared to abide by the provisions of this Final Order.
9. This Final Order is in addition to, and not in lieu of, any other civil or criminal remedies that may be provided by law.
10. Entry of this Order is in the public interest.

#### **DEFINITIONS**

For the purpose of this Order, the following definitions shall apply:

1. “**Assisting others**” includes, but is not limited to, providing any of the following goods or services to another entity: (1) performing customer service functions,

including, but not limited to, receiving or responding to consumer complaints; (2) formulating or providing, or arranging for the formulation or provision of, any promotional material; (3) providing names of, or assisting in the generation of, potential customers; (4) performing promotional or marketing services of any kind; or (5) providing fulfillment services.

2. **“Clear and conspicuous”** manner means:

- a. in print communications, the message shall be in a type size and location sufficiently noticeable for an ordinary consumer to read and comprehend it, in print that contrasts with the background against which it appears;
- b. in oral communications, the message shall be delivered in a volume and cadence sufficient for an ordinary consumer to hear and comprehend it;
- c. in communications made through an electronic medium (including but not limited to television, video, radio, and interactive media, including but not limited to the Internet, online services, and software), the message shall be presented simultaneously in both the audio and visual portions of the communication. In any communication presented solely through visual or audio means, the message may be made through the same means in which the communication is presented. In any communication disseminated by means of an interactive electronic medium, including but not limited to software, the Internet, or online services, a disclosure must be unavoidable and presented prior to the consumer incurring any financial obligation. Any audio message shall be delivered in a volume and cadence sufficient for an ordinary consumer to hear and comprehend it. Any visual message

shall be of a size and shade, with a degree of contrast to the background against which it appears, and shall appear on the screen for a duration and in a location sufficiently noticeable for an ordinary consumer to read and comprehend it; and

d. regardless of the medium used to disseminate it, the message shall be in understandable language and syntax. Nothing contrary to, inconsistent with, or in mitigation of the message shall be used in any communication.

3. **“Document”** is synonymous in meaning and equal in scope to the usage of the term in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 34(a), and includes writings, drawings, graphs, charts, Internet sites, Webpages, Websites, electronic correspondence, including e-mail and instant messages, photographs, audio and video recordings, contracts, accounting data, advertisements (including, but not limited to, advertisements placed on the World Wide Web), FTP Logs, Server Access Logs, USENET Newsgroup postings, World Wide Web pages, books, written or printed records, handwritten notes, telephone logs, telephone scripts, receipt books, ledgers, personal and business canceled checks and check registers, bank statements, appointment books, computer records, and other data compilations from which information can be obtained and translated. A draft or non-identical copy is a separate document within the meaning of the term.
4. **“Grant-Related Products and Services”** means any product or service, including a plan or program, that is represented, directly or by implication, to assist a consumer in any manner in obtaining a grant, free money, scholarship, or similar financial assistance from the government or any other source.

5. “**Plaintiffs**” means the Federal Trade Commission, and the States of Kansas, Minnesota, North Carolina, and Illinois.
6. “**Representatives**” shall have the same scope as Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 65(d)(2), and means Defendant’s agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and any other person or entity in active concert or participation with them who receives actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise.
7. “**Telemarketing**” means a plan, program, or campaign which is conducted to induce the purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution, by use of one or more telephones and which involves more than one interstate telephone call, whether or not covered by the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. Part 310.

**I.**

**PROHIBITED REPRESENTATIONS**

**IT IS ORDERED** that the Defendant and her Representatives, whether acting directly or through any person, corporation, partnership, subsidiary, division, agent, or other device, in connection with the advertising, marketing, promotion, offering for sale, or sale of any good or service, specifically including, but not limited to, any Grant-Related Product or Service, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from misrepresenting or assisting others in misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, any material fact, including but not limited to:

- A. Any material aspect of the nature or terms of any refund, cancellation, exchange, or repurchase policy, including, but not limited to, the likelihood of a consumer obtaining a full or partial refund, or the circumstances in which a full or partial refund will be granted to the consumer;

- B. The total costs to purchase, receive, or use, and the quantity of, the good or service;
- C. Any material restriction, limitation, or condition to purchase, receive, or use the good or service;
- D. Any material term, condition, or limitation, of any offer with a negative option feature; and
- E. Any material aspect of the performance, efficacy, nature, or characteristics of the good or service.

**II.**

**PROHIBITION ON VIOLATION OF TELEMARKETING SALES RULE**

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that Defendant and her Representatives, whether acting directly or through any person, corporation, partnership, subsidiary, division, agent, or other device, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from:

- A. engaging in or assisting others in engaging in violations of the Telemarketing Sales Rule, attached hereto as Attachment A, by, including but not limited to:
  - 1. misrepresenting, directly or by implication, in the sale of goods or services any material information about the goods or services Defendant or her Representatives sell;
  - 2. failing to disclose truthfully and in a clear and conspicuous manner, before a customer pays for goods or services offered, material information related to the offer;
  - 3. making a false or misleading statement to induce any person to pay for goods or services; and

- B. if the Commission amends the Telemarketing Sales Rule, in whole or part, failing to comply fully and completely with all applicable requirements of the amended Rule, on and after the effective date of any such amended Rule.

**III.**

**PROHIBITION ON VIOLATION OF CERTAIN STATE LAWS**

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that Defendant and her Representatives, whether acting directly or through any person, corporation, partnership, subsidiary, division, agent, or other device, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from violating:

- A. Illinois laws, including the Illinois Consumer Fraud and Deceptive Business Practices Act, 815 ILCS 505/2 *et seq.*;
- B. Kansas laws, including the Kansas Consumer Protection Act, K.S.A. § 50-623 *et seq.*;
- C. Minnesota laws, including:
  - 1. the Minnesota Uniform Deceptive Trade Practices Act, Minn. Stat. §§ 325D.43 - 325D.48;
  - 2. Minn. Stat. §§ 325F.67;
  - 3. the Prevention of Consumer Fraud Act, Minn. Stat. §§ 325F.68 - 325F.70;
  - and
  - 4. Minn. Stat. § 325F.71.; and
- D. North Carolina laws, including the North Carolina Unfair and Deceptive Trade Practices Act, N.C. Gen. Stat. § 75-1.1, *et seq.*

**IV.**

**CUSTOMER INFORMATION**

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that Defendant and her Representatives, whether acting directly or through any person, corporation, partnership, subsidiary, division, agent, or other device, are permanently restrained and enjoined from:

A. disclosing, using, or benefitting from customer information, including the name, address, telephone number, email address, social security number, other identifying information, or any data that enables access to a customer's account (including a credit card, bank account, or other financial account), of any person which was obtained by any defendant named in the Complaint prior to entry of this Order in connection with the marketing and sale of grant-related goods and services; and

B. failing to dispose of such customer information in all forms in their possession, custody, or control within thirty (30) days after entry of this Order. Disposal shall be by means that protect against unauthorized access to the customer information, such as by burning, pulverizing, or shredding any papers, and by erasing or destroying any electronic media, to ensure that the customer information cannot practicably be read or reconstructed. *Provided, however,* that customer information need not be disposed of, and may be disclosed, to the extent requested by a government agency or required by a law, regulation, or court order.

**V.**

**MONETARY JUDGMENT AND SUSPENSION**

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that:

A. Judgment is hereby entered in favor of the Plaintiffs and against Defendant, jointly and severally with Defendants Real Estate Buyers Financial Network and Martin Nossov,

in the amount of Five Million Five Hundred Thousand Dollars (\$5,500,000) as equitable monetary relief for consumer injury.

B. Defendant is ordered to pay to the Plaintiffs a total of One Hundred Twenty-Six Thousand Eight Hundred Ninety-Four Dollars (\$126,894), which, as Defendant stipulates, her undersigned counsel holds in escrow for no purpose other than payment to the Plaintiffs. Such payment shall be made within seven (7) days of entry of this Order by authorizing electronic fund transfers in accordance with instructions previously provided by representatives of Plaintiffs, or by delivering certified or cashier's checks to Plaintiffs, in the following amounts: \$25,378.80 to the Commission; \$25,378.80 to the State of Illinois; \$25,378.80 to the State of Kansas; \$25,378.80 to the State of Minnesota; and \$25,378.80 to the State of North Carolina. Upon such payment, the remainder of the judgment shall be suspended subject to the Subsections below.

C. Within seven (7) days after the date of entry of this Order by the Court, Defendant shall submit to the Commission a truthful sworn statement (in the form shown on Attachment B of this Order), that shall reaffirm and attest to the truthfulness, accuracy, and completeness of the sworn financial statements and related documents (collectively, "financial representations") previously submitted to the Commission, namely the Financial Statement of Individual Defendants Martin and Alicia Nossov signed on May 10, 2011, including the attachments, and the sworn statement signed by Defendant Alicia Nossov on August 11, 2011. The Plaintiffs' agreement to this Order is expressly premised upon the truthfulness, accuracy, and completeness of Defendant's financial representations, which contain material information upon which Plaintiffs relied in negotiating and agreeing to the terms of this Order;

D. If, upon motion by the Commission to the Court, the Court finds that Defendant failed to disclose any material asset, materially misrepresented the value of any asset, or made any other material misrepresentation or omission in Defendant's financial representations, the suspension of the monetary judgment as to Defendant will be terminated and the entire judgment amount of Five Million Five Hundred Thousand Dollars (\$5,500,000) less any amounts paid by Defendant, shall become immediately due and payable by Defendant, and interest computed at the rate prescribed under 28 U.S.C. § 1961, as amended, shall begin immediately to accrue on the unpaid balance.

E. Proceedings to lift the suspension of the judgment instituted under this Section are in addition to, and not in lieu of, any other civil or criminal remedies that may be provided by law, including any other proceedings the Plaintiffs may initiate to enforce this Order.

F. Defendant relinquishes all dominion, control, and title to the funds paid to the fullest extent permitted by law. Defendant shall make no claim to or demand for return of the funds, directly or indirectly, through counsel or otherwise.

G. Defendant agrees that the facts as alleged in the Complaint filed in this action shall be taken as true without further proof in any bankruptcy case or subsequent civil litigation pursued by Plaintiffs to enforce their rights to any payment or money judgment pursuant to this Order, including but not limited to a nondischargeability complaint in any bankruptcy case. Defendant further stipulates and agrees that the facts alleged in the Complaint establish all elements necessary to sustain an action by Plaintiffs pursuant to Section 523(a)(2)(A) of the Bankruptcy Code, 11 U.S.C. § 523(a)(2)(A), and that this Order shall have collateral estoppel effect for such purposes.

H. Defendant acknowledges and agrees that the judgment entered pursuant to this Section is equitable monetary relief, solely remedial in nature, and is not a fine, penalty, punitive assessment, or forfeiture.

I. Defendant is hereby required, in accordance with 31 U.S.C. § 7701, to furnish to the Commission her taxpayer identifying numbers (social security number or employer identification number), which shall be used for purposes of collecting and reporting on any delinquent amount arising out of Defendant's relationship with the government.

J. Any funds paid to the Plaintiffs pursuant to this Section shall be deposited into a fund administered by the Plaintiffs or their designees to be used for equitable relief, including, but not limited to, consumer restitution and any attendant expenses for the administration any redress fund. Defendant will cooperate fully to assist the Plaintiffs in identifying consumers who may be entitled to redress pursuant to this Order. In the event that direct redress to consumers is wholly or partially impracticable or funds remain after redress is completed, the Plaintiffs may apply funds for any other equitable relief (including consumer information remedies) that they determine to be reasonably related to Defendant's practices alleged in the Complaint. Any funds paid to the Commission not used for equitable relief shall be deposited into the U.S. Treasury as disgorgement and/or into each State Co-Plaintiff's treasury fund designated for such deposits. Any funds paid to any State Plaintiff not used for equitable relief may be used by that State Plaintiff to the full extent authorized by that State's laws, including, but not limited to, as payment for that State's costs of investigating and litigating the instant case. Defendant shall have no right to challenge Plaintiffs' choice of remedies under this Section.

**VI.**

**COMPLIANCE MONITORING**

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that, for the purpose of (i) monitoring and investigating compliance with any provision of this Order, and (ii) investigating the accuracy of Defendant's Financial Statements upon which the Plaintiffs' agreement to this Order is expressly premised:

A. Within ten (10) business days of receipt of written notice from a representative of the Commission, Defendant shall submit additional written reports, which are true and accurate and sworn to under penalty of perjury; produce documents for inspection and copying; appear for deposition; and provide entry during normal business hours to any business location in her possession or direct or indirect control to inspect the business operation;

B. In addition, the Commission is authorized to use all other lawful means, including but not limited to:

1. obtaining discovery from any person, without further leave of court, using the procedures prescribed by Fed. R. Civ. P. 30, 31, 33, 34, 36, 45 and 69;
2. having its representatives pose as consumers and suppliers to Defendant, her employees, or any other entity managed or controlled in whole or in part by Defendant, without the necessity of identification or prior notice; and

C. Defendant shall permit representatives of the Commission to interview any employer, consultant, independent contractor, representative, agent, or employee who has agreed to such an interview, relating in any way to any conduct subject to this Order. The person interviewed may have counsel present.

*Provided however*, that nothing in this Order shall limit the Commission's lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1, to obtain any documentary material, tangible things, testimony, or information relevant to unfair or deceptive acts or practices in or affecting commerce (within the meaning of 15 U.S.C. § 45(a)(1)).

## VII.

### COMPLIANCE REPORTING

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that, in order that compliance with the provisions of this Order may be monitored:

- A. For a period of three (3) years from the date of entry of this Order,
  1. Defendant shall notify the Commission of the following:
    - a. Any changes in Defendant's residence, mailing addresses, and telephone numbers, within ten (10) business days of the date of such change;
    - b. Any changes in Defendant's employment status (including self-employment), and any change in her ownership in any business entity, within ten (10) business days of the date of such change. Such notice shall include the name and address of each business that Defendant is affiliated with, employed by, creates or forms, or performs services for; a detailed description of the nature of the business; and a detailed description of her duties and responsibilities in connection with the business or employment; and

c. Any changes in Defendant's name or use of any aliases or fictitious names within ten (10) business days of the date of such change;

2. Defendant shall notify the Commission of any changes in structure of any business entity that she directly or indirectly controls, or has an ownership interest in, that may affect compliance obligations arising under this Order, including but not limited to: incorporation or other organization; a dissolution, assignment, sale, merger, or other action; the creation or dissolution of a subsidiary, parent, or affiliate that engages in any acts or practices subject to this Order; or a change in the business name or address, at least thirty (30) days prior to such change, *provided* that, with respect to any such change in the business entity about which Defendant learns less than thirty (30) days prior to the date such action is to take place, Defendant shall notify the Commission as soon as is practicable after obtaining such knowledge.

B. One hundred eighty (180) days after the date of entry of this Order and annually thereafter for a period of three (3) years, Defendant shall provide a written report to the FTC, which is true and accurate and sworn to under penalty of perjury, setting forth in detail the manner and form in which she has complied and is complying with this Order. This report shall include, but not be limited to:

1. Defendant's then-current residence address, mailing addresses, and telephone numbers;

2. Defendant's then-current employment status (including self-employment), including the name, addresses, and telephone numbers of each business that she is affiliated with, employed by, or performs services for; a detailed description of the nature of the business; and a detailed description of her duties and responsibilities in connection with the business or employment;
3. A copy of each acknowledgment of receipt of this Order, obtained pursuant to the Section titled "Distribution of Order;" and
4. Any other changes required to be reported under Subsection A of this Section.

C. Defendant shall notify the Commission of the filing of a bankruptcy petition by her within fifteen (15) days of filing.

D. For the purposes of this Order, Defendant shall, unless otherwise directed by the Commission's authorized representatives, send by overnight courier (not the U.S. Postal Service) all reports and notifications required by this Order to:

Associate Director for Enforcement  
Bureau of Consumer Protection  
Federal Trade Commission  
600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20580

*Re: FTC v. Affiliate Strategies et al., FTC case no. X090073*

***Provided that***, in lieu of overnight courier, Defendant may send such reports or notifications by first-class mail, but only if Defendant contemporaneously sends an electronic version of such report or notification to the Commission at [DEBrief@ftc.gov](mailto:DEBrief@ftc.gov).

E. For purposes of the compliance reporting and monitoring required by this Order, the Commission is authorized to communicate directly with Defendant.

## VIII.

### RECORDKEEPING

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that, for a period of six (6) years from the date of entry of this Order, Defendant, for any business for which she, individually or in concert with others, is the majority owner or directly or indirectly controls, is hereby restrained and enjoined from failing to create and retain the following records:

A. Accounting records that reflect the cost of goods or services sold, revenues generated, and the disbursement of such revenues;

B. Personnel records accurately reflecting: the name, address, and telephone number of each person employed in any capacity by such business, including as an independent contractor; that person's job title or position; the date upon which the person commenced work; and the date and reason for the person's termination, if applicable;

C. Customer files containing the names, addresses, phone numbers, dollar amounts paid, quantity of items or services purchased, and description of items or services purchased, to the extent such information is obtained in the ordinary course of business;

D. Complaints and refund requests (whether received directly or indirectly, such as through a third party) and any responses to those complaints or requests;

E. Copies of all sales scripts, training materials, advertisements, or other marketing materials; and

F. All records and documents necessary to demonstrate full compliance with each provision of this Order, including but not limited to, copies of acknowledgments of receipt of this Order required by the Sections titled "Distribution of Order" and "Acknowledgment of

Receipt of Order” and all reports submitted to the FTC pursuant to the Section titled “Compliance Reporting.”

**IX.**

**DISTRIBUTION OF ORDER**

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that, for a period of three (3) years from the date of entry of this Order, Defendant shall deliver copies of the Order as directed below:

A. Defendant as control person: For any business that Defendant controls, directly or indirectly, or in which she has a majority ownership interest, she must deliver a copy of this Order to (1) all principals, officers, directors, and managers of that business; (2) all employees, agents, and representatives of that business who engage in telemarketing; and (3) any business entity resulting from any change in structure set forth in Subsection A.2 of the Section titled “Compliance Reporting.” For current personnel, delivery shall be within five (5) business days of service of this Order upon Defendant. For new personnel, delivery shall occur prior to them assuming their responsibilities. For any business entity resulting from any change in structure set forth in Subsection A.2 of the Section titled “Compliance Reporting,” delivery shall be at least ten (10) business days prior to the change in structure.

B. Defendant as employee or non-control person: For any business where Defendant is not a controlling person of a business but otherwise engages in telemarketing, she must deliver a copy of this Order to all principals and managers of such business before engaging in such conduct.

C. Defendant must secure a signed and dated statement acknowledging receipt of the Order, within thirty (30) days of delivery, from all persons receiving a copy of the Order pursuant to this Section.

**X.**

**ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF RECEIPT OF ORDER**

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that Defendant, within five (5) business days of receipt of this Order as entered by the Court, must submit to the Commission a truthful sworn statement acknowledging receipt of this Order.

**XI.**

**COOPERATION WITH PLAINTIFFS' COUNSEL**

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that Defendant shall, in connection with this action or any subsequent investigations related to or associated with the transactions or the occurrences that are the subject of the Complaint, cooperate in good faith with Plaintiffs' counsel and appear at such places and times as any Plaintiff shall reasonably request, after written notice, for interviews, conferences, pretrial discovery, review of documents, and for such other matters as may be reasonably requested by any Plaintiff. If requested in writing by a Plaintiff, Defendant shall appear and provide truthful testimony in any trial, deposition, or other proceeding related to or associated with the transactions or the occurrences that are the subject of the Complaint, without the service of a subpoena.

**XII.**

**RETENTION OF JURISDICTION**

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that this Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter for purposes of construction, modification, and enforcement of this Order.

**XIII.**

**ENTRY OF ORDER**

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that there is no just reason for delay, and the Clerk of

Court is hereby directed to enter this Order immediately.

**SO ORDERED**, this 18th day of August, 2011.

s/ Julie A. Robinson

---

**JULIE A. ROBINSON**  
**UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE**

**SO STIPULATED:**

FOR PLAINTIFFS:

FOR SETTLING DEFENDANT:

*SI D. Brad Bailey*

\_\_\_\_\_  
D. Brad Bailey, Esq.  
Assistant United States Attorney  
Federal Building, Suite 290  
444 SE Quincy Street  
Topeka, KS 66683-3592  
*Local Counsel for Plaintiff Federal Trade  
Commission*

*Alicia Nossov*

\_\_\_\_\_  
Alicia Nossov, individually

*SI Gary L. Ivens*

\_\_\_\_\_  
Gary L. Ivens, Esq.  
Sara DePaul, Esq.  
Federal Trade Commission  
600 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., Rm. 286  
Washington, DC 20580  
*Attorneys for Plaintiff FTC*

*Daniel T. Blue*

\_\_\_\_\_  
Daniel T. Blue, Jr.  
Dhamian A. Blue  
Blue Stephens & Fellers LLP  
205 ~~Fayette~~ **FAYETTEVILLE** Street  
Raleigh, NC 27601

*Signatures continue . . .*

*SI Meghan E. Stoppel*

---

Meghan E. Stoppel, Esq.  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Kansas Attorney General  
120 SW 10th Ave., 4th Floor  
Topeka, KS 66612  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Kansas and  
Local Counsel for Co-Plaintiff States*

*SI Philip I. Heimlich*

---

Philip I. Heimlich  
Illinois Attorney General's Office  
500 S. Second Street  
Springfield, IL 62706  
(217) 782-4436  
(217) 782-1097 *fax*  
pheimlich@atg.state.il.us  
*Attorney for State of Illinois*

*SI Shannon M. Harmon*

---

Shannon M. Harmon  
Assistant Attorney General  
445 Minnesota Street, Suite 1200  
St. Paul, Minnesota 55101-2130  
(651) 296-3854 (Voice)  
(651) 296-1410 (TTY)  
Shannon.Harmon@state.mn.us  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Minnesota*

*SI David Kirkman*

---

David Kirkman  
Assistant Attorney General  
N.C. Department of Justice  
P.O. Box 629  
Raleigh, NC 27602  
(919) 716-6030  
DKirkman@ncdoj.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of  
North Carolina*

# **ATTACHMENTS**

ATTACHMENT A THE TELEMARKETING SALES RULE

Pt. 310

16 CFR Ch. I (1–1–11 Edition)

**PART 310—TELEMARKETING SALES  
RULE 16 CFR PART 310**

Sec.

310.1 Scope of regulations in this part.

310.2 Definitions.

310.3 Deceptive telemarketing acts or practices.

310.4 Abusive telemarketing acts or practices.

310.5 Recordkeeping requirements.

310.6 Exemptions.

310.7 Actions by states and private persons.

310.8 Fee for access to the National Do Not Call Registry.

310.9 Severability.

AUTHORITY: 15 U.S.C. 6101–6108.

SOURCE: 75 FR 48516, Aug. 10, 2010, unless otherwise noted.

**§ 310.1 Scope of regulations in this part.**

This part implements the Telemarketing and Consumer Fraud and Abuse Prevention Act, 15 U.S.C. 6101–6108, as amended.

## Federal Trade Commission

## § 310.2

## § 310.2 Definitions.

(a) *Acquirer* means a business organization, financial institution, or an agent of a business organization or financial institution that has authority from an organization that operates or licenses a credit card system to authorize merchants to accept, transmit, or process payment by credit card through the credit card system for money, goods or services, or anything else of value.

(b) *Attorney General* means the chief legal officer of a state.

(c) *Billing information* means any data that enables any person to access a customer's or donor's account, such as a credit card, checking, savings, share or similar account, utility bill, mortgage loan account, or debit card.

(d) *Caller identification service* means a service that allows a telephone subscriber to have the telephone number, and, where available, name of the calling party transmitted contemporaneously with the telephone call, and displayed on a device in or connected to the subscriber's telephone.

(e) *Cardholder* means a person to whom a credit card is issued or who is authorized to use a credit card on behalf of or in addition to the person to whom the credit card is issued.

(f) *Charitable contribution* means any donation or gift of money or any other thing of value.

(g) *Commission* means the Federal Trade Commission.

(h) *Credit* means the right granted by a creditor to a debtor to defer payment of debt or to incur debt and defer its payment.

(i) *Credit card* means any card, plate, coupon book, or other credit device existing for the purpose of obtaining money, property, labor, or services on credit.

(j) *Credit card sales draft* means any record or evidence of a credit card transaction.

(k) *Credit card system* means any method or procedure used to process credit card transactions involving credit cards issued or licensed by the operator of that system.

(l) *Customer* means any person who is or may be required to pay for goods or services offered through telemarketing.

(m) *Debt relief service* means any program or service represented, directly or by implication, to renegotiate, settle, or in any way alter the terms of payment or other terms of the debt between a person and one or more unsecured creditors or debt collectors, including, but not limited to, a reduction in the balance, interest rate, or fees owed by a person to an unsecured creditor or debt collector.

(n) *Donor* means any person solicited to make a charitable contribution.

(o) *Established business relationship* means a relationship between a seller and a consumer based on:

(1) the consumer's purchase, rental, or lease of the seller's goods or services or a financial transaction between the consumer and seller, within the eighteen (18) months immediately preceding the date of a telemarketing call; or

(2) the consumer's inquiry or application regarding a product or service offered by the seller, within the three (3) months immediately preceding the date of a telemarketing call.

(p) *Free-to-pay conversion* means, in an offer or agreement to sell or provide any goods or services, a provision under which a customer receives a product or service for free for an initial period and will incur an obligation to pay for the product or service if he or she does not take affirmative action to cancel before the end of that period.

(q) *Investment opportunity* means anything, tangible or intangible, that is offered, offered for sale, sold, or traded based wholly or in part on representations, either express or implied, about past, present, or future income, profit, or appreciation.

(r) *Material* means likely to affect a person's choice of, or conduct regarding, goods or services or a charitable contribution.

(s) *Merchant* means a person who is authorized under a written contract with an acquirer to honor or accept credit cards, or to transmit or process for payment credit card payments, for the purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution.

(t) *Merchant agreement* means a written contract between a merchant and an acquirer to honor or accept credit cards, or to transmit or process for payment credit card payments, for the

**§310.2****16 CFR Ch. I (1-1-11 Edition)**

purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution.

(u) *Negative option feature* means, in an offer or agreement to sell or provide any goods or services, a provision under which the customer's silence or failure to take an affirmative action to reject goods or services or to cancel the agreement is interpreted by the seller as acceptance of the offer.

(v) *Outbound telephone call* means a telephone call initiated by a telemarketer to induce the purchase of goods or services or to solicit a charitable contribution.

(w) *Person* means any individual, group, unincorporated association, limited or general partnership, corporation, or other business entity.

(x) *Preacquired account information* means any information that enables a seller or telemarketer to cause a charge to be placed against a customer's or donor's account without obtaining the account number directly from the customer or donor during the telemarketing transaction pursuant to which the account will be charged.

(y) *Prize* means anything offered, or purportedly offered, and given, or purportedly given, to a person by chance. For purposes of this definition, chance exists if a person is guaranteed to receive an item and, at the time of the offer or purported offer, the telemarketer does not identify the specific item that the person will receive.

(z) *Prize promotion* means:

(1) A sweepstakes or other game of chance; or

(2) An oral or written express or implied representation that a person has won, has been selected to receive, or may be eligible to receive a prize or purported prize.

(aa) *Seller* means any person who, in connection with a telemarketing transaction, provides, offers to provide, or arranges for others to provide goods or services to the customer in exchange for consideration.

(bb) *State* means any state of the United States, the District of Columbia, Puerto Rico, the Northern Mariana

Islands, and any territory or possession of the United States.

(cc) *Telemarketer* means any person who, in connection with telemarketing, initiates or receives telephone calls to or from a customer or donor.

(dd) *Telemarketing* means a plan, program, or campaign which is conducted to induce the purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution, by use of one or more telephones and which involves more than one interstate telephone call. The term does not include the solicitation of sales through the mailing of a catalog which: contains a written description or illustration of the goods or services offered for sale; includes the business address of the seller; includes multiple pages of written material or illustrations; and has been issued not less frequently than once a year, when the person making the solicitation does not solicit customers by telephone but only receives calls initiated by customers in response to the catalog and during those calls takes orders only without further solicitation. For purposes of the previous sentence, the term "further solicitation" does not include providing the customer with information about, or attempting to sell, any other item included in the same catalog which prompted the customer's call or in a substantially similar catalog.

(ee) *Upselling* means soliciting the purchase of goods or services following an initial transaction during a single telephone call. The upsell is a separate telemarketing transaction, not a continuation of the initial transaction. An "external upsell" is a solicitation made by or on behalf of a seller different from the seller in the initial transaction, regardless of whether the initial transaction and the subsequent solicitation are made by the same telemarketer. An "internal upsell" is a solicitation made by or on behalf of the same seller as in the initial transaction, regardless of whether the initial transaction and subsequent solicitation are made by the same telemarketer.

## Federal Trade Commission

## § 310.3

## § 310.3 Deceptive telemarketing acts or practices.

(a) *Prohibited deceptive telemarketing acts or practices.* It is a deceptive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for any seller or telemarketer to engage in the following conduct:

(1) Before a customer consents to pay<sup>659</sup>/≤ for goods or services offered, failing to disclose truthfully, in a clear and conspicuous manner, the following material information:

(i) The total costs to purchase, receive, or use, and the quantity of, any goods or services that are the subject of the sales offer;<sup>660</sup>/≤

(ii) All material restrictions, limitations, or conditions to purchase, receive, or use the goods or services that are the subject of the sales offer;

(iii) If the seller has a policy of not making refunds, cancellations, exchanges, or repurchases, a statement informing the customer that this is the seller's policy; or, if the seller or telemarketer makes a representation about a refund, cancellation, exchange, or repurchase policy, a statement of all material terms and conditions of such policy;

(iv) In any prize promotion, the odds of being able to receive the prize, and, if the odds are not calculable in advance, the factors used in calculating the odds; that no purchase or payment is required to win a prize or to participate in a prize promotion and that any purchase or payment will not increase the person's chances of winning; and the no-purchase/no-payment method of

participating in the prize promotion with either instructions on how to participate or an address or local or toll-free telephone number to which customers may write or call for information on how to participate;

(v) All material costs or conditions to receive or redeem a prize that is the subject of the prize promotion;

(vi) In the sale of any goods or services represented to protect, insure, or otherwise limit a customer's liability in the event of unauthorized use of the customer's credit card, the limits on a cardholder's liability for unauthorized use of a credit card pursuant to 15 U.S.C. 1643;

(vii) If the offer includes a negative option feature, all material terms and conditions of the negative option feature, including, but not limited to, the fact that the customer's account will be charged unless the customer takes an affirmative action to avoid the charge(s), the date(s) the charge(s) will be submitted for payment, and the specific steps the customer must take to avoid the charge(s); and

(viii) In the sale of any debt relief service:

(A) the amount of time necessary to achieve the represented results, and to the extent that the service may include a settlement offer to any of the customer's creditors or debt collectors, the time by which the debt relief service provider will make a bona fide settlement offer to each of them;

(B) to the extent that the service may include a settlement offer to any of the customer's creditors or debt collectors, the amount of money or the percentage of each outstanding debt that the customer must accumulate before the debt relief service provider will make a bona fide settlement offer to each of them;

(C) to the extent that any aspect of the debt relief service relies upon or results in the customer's failure to make timely payments to creditors or debt collectors, that the use of the debt relief service will likely adversely affect the customer's creditworthiness, may result in the customer being subject to collections or sued by creditors or debt collectors, and may increase the amount of money the customer owes

<sup>659</sup> When a seller or telemarketer uses, or directs a customer to use, a courier to transport payment, the seller or telemarketer must make the disclosures required by § 310.3(a)(1) before sending a courier to pick up payment or authorization for payment, or directing a customer to have a courier pick up payment or authorization for payment. In the case of debt relief services, the seller or telemarketer must make the disclosures required by § 310.3(a)(1) before the consumer enrolls in an offered program.

<sup>660</sup> For offers of consumer credit products subject to the Truth in Lending Act, 15 U.S.C. 1601 et seq., and Regulation Z, 12 CFR 226, compliance with the disclosure requirements under the Truth in Lending Act and Regulation Z shall constitute compliance with § 310.3(a)(1)(i) of this Rule.

**§ 310.3****16 CFR Ch. I (1–1–11 Edition)**

due to the accrual of fees and interest; and

(D) to the extent that the debt relief service requests or requires the customer to place funds in an account at an insured financial institution, that the customer owns the funds held in the account, the customer may withdraw from the debt relief service at any time without penalty, and, if the customer withdraws, the customer must receive all funds in the account, other than funds earned by the debt relief service in compliance with § 310.4(a)(5)(i)(A) through (C).

(2) Misrepresenting, directly or by implication, in the sale of goods or services any of the following material information:

(i) The total costs to purchase, receive, or use, and the quantity of, any goods or services that are the subject of a sales offer;

(ii) Any material restriction, limitation, or condition to purchase, receive, or use goods or services that are the subject of a sales offer;

(iii) Any material aspect of the performance, efficacy, nature, or central characteristics of goods or services that are the subject of a sales offer;

(iv) Any material aspect of the nature or terms of the seller's refund, cancellation, exchange, or repurchase policies;

(v) Any material aspect of a prize promotion including, but not limited to, the odds of being able to receive a prize, the nature or value of a prize, or that a purchase or payment is required to win a prize or to participate in a prize promotion;

(vi) Any material aspect of an investment opportunity including, but not limited to, risk, liquidity, earnings potential, or profitability;

(vii) A seller's or telemarketer's affiliation with, or endorsement or sponsorship by, any person or government entity;

(viii) That any customer needs offered goods or services to provide protections a customer already has pursuant to 15 U.S.C. 1643;

(ix) Any material aspect of a negative option feature including, but not limited to, the fact that the customer's account will be charged unless the customer takes an affirmative action to

avoid the charge(s), the date(s) the charge(s) will be submitted for payment, and the specific steps the customer must take to avoid the charge(s); or

(x) Any material aspect of any debt relief service, including, but not limited to, the amount of money or the percentage of the debt amount that a customer may save by using such service; the amount of time necessary to achieve the represented results; the amount of money or the percentage of each outstanding debt that the customer must accumulate before the provider of the debt relief service will initiate attempts with the customer's creditors or debt collectors or make a bona fide offer to negotiate, settle, or modify the terms of the customer's debt; the effect of the service on a customer's creditworthiness; the effect of the service on collection efforts of the customer's creditors or debt collectors; the percentage or number of customers who attain the represented results; and whether a debt relief service is offered or provided by a non-profit entity.

(3) Causing billing information to be submitted for payment, or collecting or attempting to collect payment for goods or services or a charitable contribution, directly or indirectly, without the customer's or donor's express verifiable authorization, except when the method of payment used is a credit card subject to protections of the Truth in Lending Act and Regulation Z,<sup>661/≤</sup> or a debit card subject to the protections of the Electronic Fund Transfer Act and Regulation E,<sup>662/≤</sup> Such authorization shall be deemed verifiable if any of the following means is employed:

(i) Express written authorization by the customer or donor, which includes the customer's or donor's signature;<sup>663/≤</sup>

<sup>661</sup> Truth in Lending Act, 15 U.S.C. 1601 et seq., and Regulation Z, 12 CFR part 226.

<sup>662</sup> Electronic Fund Transfer Act, 15 U.S.C. 1693 et seq., and Regulation E, 12 CFR part 205.

<sup>663</sup> For purposes of this Rule, the term "signature" shall include an electronic or digital form of signature, to the extent that such form of signature is recognized as a valid signature under applicable federal law or state contract law.

**Federal Trade Commission****§ 310.3**

(ii) Express oral authorization which is audio-recorded and made available upon request to the customer or donor, and the customer's or donor's bank or other billing entity, and which evidences clearly both the customer's or donor's authorization of payment for the goods or services or charitable contribution that are the subject of the telemarketing transaction and the customer's or donor's receipt of all of the following information:

(A) The number of debits, charges, or payments (if more than one);

(B) The date(s) the debit(s), charge(s), or payment(s) will be submitted for payment;

(C) The amount(s) of the debit(s), charge(s), or payment(s);

(D) The customer's or donor's name;

(E) The customer's or donor's billing information, identified with sufficient specificity such that the customer or donor understands what account will be used to collect payment for the goods or services or charitable contribution that are the subject of the telemarketing transaction;

(F) A telephone number for customer or donor inquiry that is answered during normal business hours; and

(G) The date of the customer's or donor's oral authorization; or

(iii) Written confirmation of the transaction, identified in a clear and conspicuous manner as such on the outside of the envelope, sent to the customer or donor via first class mail prior to the submission for payment of the customer's or donor's billing information, and that includes all of the information contained in §§310.3(a)(3)(ii)(A)-(G) and a clear and conspicuous statement of the procedures by which the customer or donor can obtain a refund from the seller or telemarketer or charitable organization in the event the confirmation is inaccurate; provided, however, that this means of authorization shall not be deemed verifiable in instances in which goods or services are offered in a transaction involving a free-to-pay conversion and preacquired account information.

(4) Making a false or misleading statement to induce any person to pay for goods or services or to induce a charitable contribution.

(b) *Assisting and facilitating.* It is a deceptive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a person to provide substantial assistance or support to any seller or telemarketer when that person knows or consciously avoids knowing that the seller or telemarketer is engaged in any act or practice that violates §§310.3(a), (c) or (d), or §310.4 of this Rule.

(c) *Credit card laundering.* Except as expressly permitted by the applicable credit card system, it is a deceptive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for:

(1) A merchant to present to or deposit into, or cause another to present to or deposit into, the credit card system for payment, a credit card sales draft generated by a telemarketing transaction that is not the result of a telemarketing credit card transaction between the cardholder and the merchant;

(2) Any person to employ, solicit, or otherwise cause a merchant, or an employee, representative, or agent of the merchant, to present to or deposit into the credit card system for payment, a credit card sales draft generated by a telemarketing transaction that is not the result of a telemarketing credit card transaction between the cardholder and the merchant; or

(3) Any person to obtain access to the credit card system through the use of a business relationship or an affiliation with a merchant, when such access is not authorized by the merchant agreement or the applicable credit card system.

(d) *Prohibited deceptive acts or practices in the solicitation of charitable contributions.* It is a fraudulent charitable solicitation, a deceptive telemarketing act or practice, and a violation of this Rule for any telemarketer soliciting charitable contributions to misrepresent, directly or by implication, any of the following material information:

(1) The nature, purpose, or mission of any entity on behalf of which a charitable contribution is being requested;

(2) That any charitable contribution is tax deductible in whole or in part;

(3) The purpose for which any charitable contribution will be used;

(4) The percentage or amount of any charitable contribution that will go to

**§ 310.4****16 CFR Ch. I (1–11 Edition)**

a charitable organization or to any particular charitable program;

(5) Any material aspect of a prize promotion including, but not limited to: the odds of being able to receive a prize; the nature or value of a prize; or that a charitable contribution is required to win a prize or to participate in a prize promotion; or

(6) A charitable organization's or telemarketer's affiliation with, or endorsement or sponsorship by, any person or government entity.

**§ 310.4 Abusive telemarketing acts or practices.**

(a) *Abusive conduct generally.* It is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for any seller or telemarketer to engage in the following conduct:

(1) Threats, intimidation, or the use of profane or obscene language;

(2) Requesting or receiving payment of any fee or consideration for goods or services represented to remove derogatory information from, or improve, a person's credit history, credit record, or credit rating until:

(i) The time frame in which the seller has represented all of the goods or services will be provided to that person has expired; and

(ii) The seller has provided the person with documentation in the form of a consumer report from a consumer reporting agency demonstrating that the promised results have been achieved, such report having been issued more than six months after the results were achieved. Nothing in this Rule should be construed to affect the requirement in the Fair Credit Reporting Act, 15 U.S.C. 1681, that a consumer report may only be obtained for a specified permissible purpose;

(3) Requesting or receiving payment of any fee or consideration from a person for goods or services represented to recover or otherwise assist in the return of money or any other item of value paid for by, or promised to, that person in a previous telemarketing transaction, until seven (7) business days after such money or other item is delivered to that person. This provision shall not apply to goods or services provided to a person by a licensed attorney;

(4) Requesting or receiving payment of any fee or consideration in advance of obtaining a loan or other extension of credit when the seller or telemarketer has guaranteed or represented a high likelihood of success in obtaining or arranging a loan or other extension of credit for a person;

(5) (i) Requesting or receiving payment of any fee or consideration for any debt relief service until and unless:

(A) The seller or telemarketer has renegotiated, settled, reduced, or otherwise altered the terms of at least one debt pursuant to a settlement agreement, debt management plan, or other such valid contractual agreement executed by the customer;

(B) The customer has made at least one payment pursuant to that settlement agreement, debt management plan, or other valid contractual agreement between the customer and the creditor or debt collector; and

(C) To the extent that debts enrolled in a service are renegotiated, settled, reduced, or otherwise altered individually, the fee or consideration either:

(1) Bears the same proportional relationship to the total fee for renegotiating, settling, reducing, or altering the terms of the entire debt balance as the individual debt amount bears to the entire debt amount. The individual debt amount and the entire debt amount are those owed at the time the debt was enrolled in the service; or

(2) Is a percentage of the amount saved as a result of the renegotiation, settlement, reduction, or alteration. The percentage charged cannot change from one individual debt to another. The amount saved is the difference between the amount owed at the time the debt was enrolled in the service and the amount actually paid to satisfy the debt.

(ii) Nothing in § 310.4(a)(5)(i) prohibits requesting or requiring the customer to place funds in an account to be used for the debt relief provider's fees and for payments to creditors or debt collectors in connection with the renegotiation, settlement, reduction, or other alteration of the terms of payment or other terms of a debt, provided that:

(A) The funds are held in an account at an insured financial institution;

**Federal Trade Commission****§ 310.4**

(B) The customer owns the funds held in the account and is paid accrued interest on the account, if any;

(C) The entity administering the account is not owned or controlled by, or in any way affiliated with, the debt relief service;

(D) The entity administering the account does not give or accept any money or other compensation in exchange for referrals of business involving the debt relief service; and

(E) The customer may withdraw from the debt relief service at any time without penalty, and must receive all funds in the account, other than funds earned by the debt relief service in compliance with § 310.4(a)(5)(i)(A) through (C), within seven (7) business days of the customer's request.

(6) Disclosing or receiving, for consideration, unencrypted consumer account numbers for use in telemarketing; provided, however, that this paragraph shall not apply to the disclosure or receipt of a customer's or donor's billing information to process a payment for goods or services or a charitable contribution pursuant to a transaction;

(7) Causing billing information to be submitted for payment, directly or indirectly, without the express informed consent of the customer or donor. In any telemarketing transaction, the seller or telemarketer must obtain the express informed consent of the customer or donor to be charged for the goods or services or charitable contribution and to be charged using the identified account. In any telemarketing transaction involving preacquired account information, the requirements in paragraphs (a)(6)(i) through (ii) of this section must be met to evidence express informed consent.

(i) In any telemarketing transaction involving preacquired account information and a free-to-pay conversion feature, the seller or telemarketer must:

(A) Obtain from the customer, at a minimum, the last four (4) digits of the account number to be charged;

(B) Obtain from the customer his or her express agreement to be charged for the goods or services and to be charged using the account number pursuant to paragraph (a)(6)(i)(A) of this section; and,

(C) Make and maintain an audio recording of the entire telemarketing transaction.

(ii) In any other telemarketing transaction involving preacquired account information not described in paragraph (a)(6)(i) of this section, the seller or telemarketer must:

(A) At a minimum, identify the account to be charged with sufficient specificity for the customer or donor to understand what account will be charged; and

(B) Obtain from the customer or donor his or her express agreement to be charged for the goods or services and to be charged using the account number identified pursuant to paragraph (a)(6)(ii)(A) of this section; or

(8) Failing to transmit or cause to be transmitted the telephone number, and, when made available by the telemarketer's carrier, the name of the telemarketer, to any caller identification service in use by a recipient of a telemarketing call; provided that it shall not be a violation to substitute (for the name and phone number used in, or billed for, making the call) the name of the seller or charitable organization on behalf of which a telemarketing call is placed, and the seller's or charitable organization's customer or donor service telephone number, which is answered during regular business hours.

(b) *Pattern of calls.* (1) It is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a telemarketer to engage in, or for a seller to cause a telemarketer to engage in, the following conduct:

(i) Causing any telephone to ring, or engaging any person in telephone conversation, repeatedly or continuously with intent to annoy, abuse, or harass any person at the called number;

(ii) Denying or interfering in any way, directly or indirectly, with a person's right to be placed on any registry of names and/or telephone numbers of persons who do not wish to receive outbound telephone calls established to comply with § 310.4(b)(1)(iii);

(iii) Initiating any outbound telephone call to a person when:

(A) That person previously has stated that he or she does not wish to receive an outbound telephone call made by or

**§ 310.4****16 CFR Ch. I (1–1–11 Edition)**

on behalf of the seller whose goods or services are being offered or made on behalf of the charitable organization for which a charitable contribution is being solicited; or

(B) That person's telephone number is on the "do-not-call" registry, maintained by the Commission, of persons who do not wish to receive outbound telephone calls to induce the purchase of goods or services unless the seller:

(i) Has obtained the express agreement, in writing, of such person to place calls to that person. Such written agreement shall clearly evidence such person's authorization that calls made by or on behalf of a specific party may be placed to that person, and shall include the telephone number to which the calls may be placed and the signature<sup>664/≤</sup> of that person; or

(ii) Has an established business relationship with such person, and that person has not stated that he or she does not wish to receive outbound telephone calls under paragraph (b)(1)(iii)(A) of this section; or

(iv) Abandoning any outbound telephone call. An outbound telephone call is "abandoned" under this section if a person answers it and the telemarketer does not connect the call to a sales representative within two (2) seconds of the person's completed greeting.

(v) Initiating any outbound telephone call that delivers a prerecorded message, other than a prerecorded message permitted for compliance with the call abandonment safe harbor in § 310.4(b)(4)(iii), unless:

(A) In any such call to induce the purchase of any good or service, the seller has obtained from the recipient of the call an express agreement, in writing, that:

(i) The seller obtained only after a clear and conspicuous disclosure that the purpose of the agreement is to authorize the seller to place prerecorded calls to such person;

(ii) The seller obtained without requiring, directly or indirectly, that the

agreement be executed as a condition of purchasing any good or service;

(iii) Evidences the willingness of the recipient of the call to receive calls that deliver prerecorded messages by or on behalf of a specific seller; and

(iv) Includes such person's telephone number and signature;<sup>665/≤</sup> and

(B) In any such call to induce the purchase of any good or service, or to induce a charitable contribution from a member of, or previous donor to, a non-profit charitable organization on whose behalf the call is made, the seller or telemarketer:

(i) Allows the telephone to ring for at least fifteen (15) seconds or four (4) rings before disconnecting an unanswered call; and

(ii) Within two (2) seconds after the completed greeting of the person called, plays a prerecorded message that promptly provides the disclosures required by § 310.4(d) or (e), followed immediately by a disclosure of one or both of the following:

(A) In the case of a call that could be answered in person by a consumer, that the person called can use an automated interactive voice and/or keypress-activated opt-out mechanism to assert a Do Not Call request pursuant to § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(A) at any time during the message. The mechanism must:

(1) Automatically add the number called to the seller's entity-specific Do Not Call list;

(2) Once invoked, immediately disconnect the call; and

(3) Be available for use at any time during the message; and

(B) In the case of a call that could be answered by an answering machine or voicemail service, that the person called can use a toll-free telephone number to assert a Do Not Call request pursuant to § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(A). The number provided must connect directly to an automated interactive voice or keypress-activated opt-out mechanism that:

<sup>664</sup> For purposes of this Rule, the term "signature" shall include an electronic or digital form of signature, to the extent that such form of signature is recognized as a valid signature under applicable federal law or state contract law.

<sup>665</sup> For purposes of this Rule, the term "signature" shall include an electronic or digital form of signature, to the extent that such form of signature is recognized as a valid signature under applicable federal law or state contract law.

**Federal Trade Commission****§ 310.4**

(1) Automatically adds the number called to the seller's entity-specific Do Not Call list;

(2) Immediately thereafter disconnects the call; and

(3) Is accessible at any time throughout the duration of the telemarketing campaign; and

(iii) Complies with all other requirements of this part and other applicable federal and state laws.

(C) Any call that complies with all applicable requirements of this paragraph (v) shall not be deemed to violate § 310.4(b)(1)(iv) of this part.

(D) This paragraph (v) shall not apply to any outbound telephone call that delivers a prerecorded healthcare message made by, or on behalf of, a covered entity or its business associate, as those terms are defined in the HIPAA Privacy Rule, 45 CFR 160.103.

(2) It is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for any person to sell, rent, lease, purchase, or use any list established to comply with § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(A), or maintained by the Commission pursuant to § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B), for any purpose except compliance with the provisions of this Rule or otherwise to prevent telephone calls to telephone numbers on such lists.

(3) A seller or telemarketer will not be liable for violating § 310.4(b)(1)(ii) and (iii) if it can demonstrate that, as part of the seller's or telemarketer's routine business practice:

(i) It has established and implemented written procedures to comply with § 310.4(b)(1)(ii) and (iii);

(ii) It has trained its personnel, and any entity assisting in its compliance, in the procedures established pursuant to § 310.4(b)(3)(i);

(iii) The seller, or a telemarketer or another person acting on behalf of the seller or charitable organization, has maintained and recorded a list of telephone numbers the seller or charitable organization may not contact, in compliance with § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(A);

(iv) The seller or a telemarketer uses a process to prevent telemarketing to any telephone number on any list established pursuant to § 310.4(b)(3)(iii) or 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B), employing a version of the "do-not-call" registry obtained from the Commission no more than

thirty-one (31) days prior to the date any call is made, and maintains records documenting this process;

(v) The seller or a telemarketer or another person acting on behalf of the seller or charitable organization, monitors and enforces compliance with the procedures established pursuant to § 310.4(b)(3)(i); and

(vi) Any subsequent call otherwise violating § 310.4(b)(1)(ii) or (iii) is the result of error.

(4) A seller or telemarketer will not be liable for violating § 310.4(b)(1)(iv) if:

(i) The seller or telemarketer employs technology that ensures abandonment of no more than three (3) percent of all calls answered by a person, measured over the duration of a single calling campaign, if less than 30 days, or separately over each successive 30-day period or portion thereof that the campaign continues.

(ii) The seller or telemarketer, for each telemarketing call placed, allows the telephone to ring for at least fifteen (15) seconds or four (4) rings before disconnecting an unanswered call;

(iii) Whenever a sales representative is not available to speak with the person answering the call within two (2) seconds after the person's completed greeting, the seller or telemarketer promptly plays a recorded message that states the name and telephone number of the seller on whose behalf the call was placed<sup>666</sup>; and

(iv) The seller or telemarketer, in accordance with § 310.5(b)-(d), retains records establishing compliance with § 310.4(b)(4)(i)-(iii).

(c) *Calling time restrictions.* Without the prior consent of a person, it is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a telemarketer to engage in outbound telephone calls to a person's residence at any time other than between 8:00 a.m. and 9:00 p.m. local time at the called person's location.

(d) *Required oral disclosures in the sale of goods or services.* It is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a telemarketer in

<sup>666</sup> This provision does not affect any seller's or telemarketer's obligation to comply with relevant state and federal laws, including but not limited to the TCPA, 47 U.S.C. 227, and 47 CFR part 64.1200.

**§310.5****16 CFR Ch. I (1-1-11 Edition)**

an outbound telephone call or internal or external upsell to induce the purchase of goods or services to fail to disclose truthfully, promptly, and in a clear and conspicuous manner to the person receiving the call, the following information:

- (1) The identity of the seller;
- (2) That the purpose of the call is to sell goods or services;
- (3) The nature of the goods or services; and
- (4) That no purchase or payment is necessary to be able to win a prize or participate in a prize promotion if a prize promotion is offered and that any purchase or payment will not increase the person's chances of winning. This disclosure must be made before or in conjunction with the description of the prize to the person called. If requested by that person, the telemarketer must disclose the no-purchase/no-payment entry method for the prize promotion; provided, however, that, in any internal upsell for the sale of goods or services, the seller or telemarketer must provide the disclosures listed in this section only to the extent that the information in the upsell differs from the disclosures provided in the initial telemarketing transaction.

(e) *Required oral disclosures in charitable solicitations.* It is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a telemarketer, in an outbound telephone call to induce a charitable contribution, to fail to disclose truthfully, promptly, and in a clear and conspicuous manner to the person receiving the call, the following information:

- (1) The identity of the charitable organization on behalf of which the request is being made; and
- (2) That the purpose of the call is to solicit a charitable contribution.

**§310.5 Recordkeeping requirements.**

(a) Any seller or telemarketer shall keep, for a period of 24 months from the date the record is produced, the following records relating to its telemarketing activities:

- (1) All substantially different advertising, brochures, telemarketing scripts, and promotional materials;
- (2) The name and last known address of each prize recipient and the prize

awarded for prizes that are represented, directly or by implication, to have a value of \$25.00 or more;

(3) The name and last known address of each customer, the goods or services purchased, the date such goods or services were shipped or provided, and the amount paid by the customer for the goods or services;<sup>667/≤</sup>

(4) The name, any fictitious name used, the last known home address and telephone number, and the job title(s) for all current and former employees directly involved in telephone sales or solicitations; provided, however, that if the seller or telemarketer permits fictitious names to be used by employees, each fictitious name must be traceable to only one specific employee; and

(5) All verifiable authorizations or records of express informed consent or express agreement required to be provided or received under this Rule.

(b) A seller or telemarketer may keep the records required by §310.5(a) in any form, and in the same manner, format, or place as they keep such records in the ordinary course of business. Failure to keep all records required by §310.5(a) shall be a violation of this Rule.

(c) The seller and the telemarketer calling on behalf of the seller may, by written agreement, allocate responsibility between themselves for the recordkeeping required by this Section. When a seller and telemarketer have entered into such an agreement, the terms of that agreement shall govern, and the seller or telemarketer, as the case may be, need not keep records that duplicate those of the other. If the agreement is unclear as to who must maintain any required record(s), or if no such agreement exists, the seller shall be responsible for complying with §§310.5(a)(1)-(3) and (5); the telemarketer shall be responsible for complying with §310.5(a)(4).

(d) In the event of any dissolution or termination of the seller's or telemarketer's business, the principal of

<sup>667</sup> For offers of consumer credit products subject to the Truth in Lending Act, 15 U.S.C. 1601 et seq., and Regulation Z, 12 CFR 226, compliance with the recordkeeping requirements under the Truth in Lending Act, and Regulation Z, shall constitute compliance with §310.5(a)(3) of this Rule.

**Federal Trade Commission****§ 310.7**

that seller or telemarketer shall maintain all records as required under this section. In the event of any sale, assignment, or other change in ownership of the seller's or telemarketer's business, the successor business shall maintain all records required under this section.

**§ 310.6 Exemptions.**

(a) Solicitations to induce charitable contributions via outbound telephone calls are not covered by § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B) of this Rule.

(b) The following acts or practices are exempt from this Rule:

(1) The sale of pay-per-call services subject to the Commission's Rule entitled "Trade Regulation Rule Pursuant to the Telephone Disclosure and Dispute Resolution Act of 1992," 16 CFR Part 308, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to the requirements of §§ 310.4(a)(1), (a)(7), (b), and (c);

(2) The sale of franchises subject to the Commission's Rule entitled "Disclosure Requirements and Prohibitions Concerning Franchising," ("Franchise Rule") 16 CFR Part 436, and the sale of business opportunities subject to the Commission's Rule entitled "Disclosure Requirements and Prohibitions Concerning Business Opportunities," ("Business Opportunity Rule") 16 CFR Part 437, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to the requirements of §§ 310.4(a)(1), (a)(7), (b), and (c);

(3) Telephone calls in which the sale of goods or services or charitable solicitation is not completed, and payment or authorization of payment is not required, until after a face-to-face sales or donation presentation by the seller or charitable organization, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to the requirements of §§ 310.4(a)(1), (a)(7), (b), and (c);

(4) Telephone calls initiated by a customer or donor that are not the result of any solicitation by a seller, charitable organization, or telemarketer, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to any instances of upselling included in such telephone calls;

(5) Telephone calls initiated by a customer or donor in response to an adver-

tisement through any medium, other than direct mail solicitation, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to calls initiated by a customer or donor in response to an advertisement relating to investment opportunities, debt relief services, business opportunities other than business arrangements covered by the Franchise Rule or Business Opportunity Rule, or advertisements involving goods or services described in §§ 310.3(a)(1)(vi) or 310.4(a)(2)-(4); or to any instances of upselling included in such telephone calls;

(6) Telephone calls initiated by a customer or donor in response to a direct mail solicitation, including solicitations via the U.S. Postal Service, facsimile transmission, electronic mail, and other similar methods of delivery in which a solicitation is directed to specific address(es) or person(s), that clearly, conspicuously, and truthfully discloses all material information listed in § 310.3(a)(1) of this Rule, for any goods or services offered in the direct mail solicitation, and that contains no material misrepresentation regarding any item contained in § 310.3(d) of this Rule for any requested charitable contribution; *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to calls initiated by a customer in response to a direct mail solicitation relating to prize promotions, investment opportunities, debt relief services, business opportunities other than business arrangements covered by the Franchise Rule or Business Opportunity Rule, or goods or services described in §§ 310.3(a)(1)(vi) or 310.4(a)(2)-(4); or to any instances of upselling included in such telephone calls; and

(7) Telephone calls between a telemarketer and any business, except calls to induce the retail sale of non-durable office or cleaning supplies; *provided*, however, that § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B) and § 310.5 of this Rule shall not apply to sellers or telemarketers of non-durable office or cleaning supplies.

**§ 310.7 Actions by states and private persons.**

(a) Any attorney general or other officer of a state authorized by the state to bring an action under the Telemarketing and Consumer Fraud and

**§ 310.8**

Abuse Prevention Act, and any private person who brings an action under that Act, shall serve written notice of its action on the Commission, if feasible, prior to its initiating an action under this Rule. The notice shall be sent to the Office of the Director, Bureau of Consumer Protection, Federal Trade Commission, Washington, DC 20580, and shall include a copy of the state's or private person's complaint and any other pleadings to be filed with the court. If prior notice is not feasible, the state or private person shall serve the Commission with the required notice immediately upon instituting its action.

(b) Nothing contained in this Section shall prohibit any attorney general or other authorized state official from proceeding in state court on the basis of an alleged violation of any civil or criminal statute of such state.

**§ 310.8 Fee for access to the National Do Not Call Registry.**

(a) It is a violation of this Rule for any seller to initiate, or cause any telemarketer to initiate, an outbound telephone call to any person whose telephone number is within a given area code unless such seller, either directly or through another person, first has paid the annual fee, required by § 310.8(c), for access to telephone numbers within that area code that are included in the National Do Not Call Registry maintained by the Commission under § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B); provided, however, that such payment is not necessary if the seller initiates, or causes a telemarketer to initiate, calls solely to persons pursuant to §§ 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B)(i) or (ii), and the seller does not access the National Do Not Call Registry for any other purpose.

(b) It is a violation of this Rule for any telemarketer, on behalf of any seller, to initiate an outbound telephone call to any person whose telephone number is within a given area code unless that seller, either directly or through another person, first has paid the annual fee, required by § 310.8(c), for access to the telephone numbers within that area code that are included in the National Do Not Call Registry; provided, however, that such payment

**16 CFR Ch. I (1–1–11 Edition)**

is not necessary if the seller initiates, or causes a telemarketer to initiate, calls solely to persons pursuant to §§ 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B)(i) or (ii), and the seller does not access the National Do Not Call Registry for any other purpose.

(c) The annual fee, which must be paid by any person prior to obtaining access to the National Do Not Call Registry, is \$55 for each area code of data accessed, up to a maximum of \$15,058; provided, however, that there shall be no charge to any person for accessing the first five area codes of data, and provided further, that there shall be no charge to any person engaging in or causing others to engage in outbound telephone calls to consumers and who is accessing area codes of data in the National Do Not Call Registry if the person is permitted to access, but is not required to access, the National Do Not Call Registry under this Rule, 47 CFR 64.1200, or any other Federal regulation or law. Any person accessing the National Do Not Call Registry may not participate in any arrangement to share the cost of accessing the registry, including any arrangement with any telemarketer or service provider to divide the costs to access the registry among various clients of that telemarketer or service provider.

(d) Each person who pays, either directly or through another person, the annual fee set forth in § 310.8(c), each person excepted under § 310.8(c) from paying the annual fee, and each person excepted from paying an annual fee under § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B), will be provided a unique account number that will allow that person to access the registry data for the selected area codes at any time for the twelve month period beginning on the first day of the month in which the person paid the fee ("the annual period"). To obtain access to additional area codes of data during the first six months of the annual period, each person required to pay the fee under § 310.8(c) must first pay \$55 for each additional area code of data not initially selected. To obtain access to additional area codes of data during the second six months of the annual period, each person required to pay the fee under § 310.8(c) must first pay \$27 for each additional area code of data

### **Federal Trade Commission**

not initially selected. The payment of the additional fee will permit the person to access the additional area codes of data for the remainder of the annual period.

(e) Access to the National Do Not Call Registry is limited to telemarketers, sellers, others engaged in or causing others to engage in telephone calls to consumers, service providers acting on behalf of such persons, and any government agency that has law enforcement authority. Prior to accessing the National Do Not Call Registry, a person must provide the identifying information required by the operator of the registry to collect the fee, and must certify, under penalty of law, that the person is accessing the registry solely to comply with the provisions of this Rule or to otherwise prevent telephone calls to telephone numbers on the registry. If the person is accessing the registry on behalf of sellers, that person also must identify each of the sellers on whose behalf it is accessing the registry, must provide each seller's unique account number for access to the national registry, and must certify, under penalty of law, that the sellers will be using the information gathered from the registry solely to comply with the provisions of this Rule or otherwise to prevent telephone calls to telephone numbers on the registry.

[75 FR 48516, Aug. 10, 2010; 75 FR 51934, Aug. 24, 2010]

#### **§ 310.9 Severability.**

The provisions of this Rule are separate and severable from one another. If any provision is stayed or determined to be invalid, it is the Commission's intention that the remaining provisions shall continue in effect.

ATTACHMENT B

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
DISTRICT OF KANSAS

<p>FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION <i>et al.</i>,</p> <p>Plaintiffs,</p> <p>v.</p> <p>AFFILIATE STRATEGIES, INC., <i>et al.</i></p> <p>Defendants.</p>
---

Case No. 5:09-CV-04104-JAR-KGS

**AFFIDAVIT OF DEFENDANT  
ATTESTING TO  
TRUTHFULNESS OF  
INDIVIDUAL FINANCIAL  
STATEMENTS**

I, \_\_\_\_\_, hereby state that the information contained in the  
Financial Statement of Defendant \_\_\_\_\_, dated \_\_\_\_\_, was  
to the best of my information, knowledge, and belief, true, accurate, and complete at  
such time.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States that the  
foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on \_\_\_\_\_ [date] at \_\_\_\_\_ [city and state].

[Signature of Defendant]

[Print Full Name]

State of \_\_\_\_\_, City of \_\_\_\_\_

Subscribed and sworn to before me this \_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_, 2011.

Notary Public

My Commission Expires: