

**UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES**

In the Matter of)	
The North Carolina Board of)	
Dental Examiners,)	
Respondent.)	

DOCKET NO. 9343

SCHEDULING ORDER

- August 23, 2010 - Complaint Counsel provides preliminary witness list (not including experts), not to exceed 50 witnesses, with a brief summary of the proposed testimony.

- August 30, 2010 - Respondent's Counsel provides preliminary witness list (not including experts), not to exceed 50 witnesses, with a brief summary of the proposed testimony.

- October 12, 2010 - Deadline for issuing document requests, requests for admission, interrogatories and subpoenas *duces tecum*, except for discovery for purposes of authenticity and admissibility of exhibits.

- October 12, 2010 - Complaint Counsel provides revised witness list, not to exceed 35 witnesses, including preliminary rebuttal witnesses, with a brief summary of the proposed testimony.

- October 18, 2010 - Respondent's Counsel provides revised witness list, not to exceed 35 witnesses, including preliminary sur-rebuttal witnesses, with a brief summary of the proposed testimony.

- November 2, 2010 - Deadline for filing "[m]otions to dismiss filed before the evidentiary hearing, motions to strike, and motions for summary decision" pursuant to Rule 3.22(a).

- November 5, 2010 - Complaint Counsel provides expert witness list, not to exceed 3 expert witnesses.

- November 18, 2010 - Close of discovery, other than discovery permitted under Rule 3.24(a)(4), depositions of experts, and discovery for purposes of authenticity and admissibility of exhibits.
- November 19, 2010 - Respondent's Counsel provides expert witness list, not to exceed 3 expert witnesses.
- November 26, 2010 - Deadline for Complaint Counsel to provide expert witness reports.
- December 7, 2010 - Complaint Counsel provides to Respondent's Counsel its final proposed witness list, not to exceed 20 witnesses, and final proposed exhibit list, including designated testimony to be presented by deposition, copies of all exhibits (except for demonstrative, illustrative or summary exhibits and expert related exhibits), Complaint Counsel's basis of admissibility for each proposed exhibit, and a brief summary of the testimony of each witness.

Complaint Counsel serves courtesy copies on ALJ of its final proposed witness and exhibit lists, its basis of admissibility for each proposed exhibit, and a brief summary of the testimony of each witness. In addition, Complaint Counsel serves a courtesy copy of testimony to be submitted by deposition.
- December 10, 2010 - Deadline for Respondent's Counsel to provide expert witness reports.
- December 14, 2010 - Respondent's Counsel provides to Complaint Counsel its final proposed witness list, not to exceed 20 witnesses, and final proposed exhibit list, including designated testimony to be presented by deposition and copies of all exhibits (except for demonstrative, illustrative or summary exhibits and expert related exhibits), Respondent's basis of admissibility for each proposed exhibit, and a brief summary of the testimony of each witness.

Respondent's Counsel serves courtesy copies on ALJ its final proposed witness and exhibit lists, its basis of admissibility for each proposed exhibit, and a brief summary of the testimony of each witness.
- December 20, 2010 - Complaint Counsel to identify rebuttal expert(s) and provide rebuttal expert report(s). Any such reports are to

be limited to rebuttal of matters set forth in Respondent's expert reports. If material outside the scope of fair rebuttal is presented, Respondent will have the right to seek appropriate relief (such as striking Complaint Counsel's rebuttal expert reports or seeking leave to submit sur-rebuttal expert reports on behalf of Respondent).

- December 21, 2010 - Parties that intend to offer confidential materials of an opposing party or non-party as evidence at the hearing must provide notice to the opposing party or non-party, pursuant to 16 C.F.R. § 3.45(b).
- December 30, 2010 - Deadline for depositions of experts (including rebuttal experts) and exchange of expert related exhibits.
- January 7, 2011 - Exchange deposition transcript counter-designations.
- January 7, 2011 - Deadline for filing motions *in limine*.
- January 7, 2011 - Deadline for filing motions for *in camera* treatment of proposed trial exhibits.
- January 14, 2011 - Deadline for filing responses to motions *in limine*.
- January 14, 2011 - Deadline for filing responses to motions for *in camera* treatment of proposed trial exhibits.
- January 19, 2011 - Complaint Counsel files pretrial brief supported by legal authority.
- January 24, 2011 - Exchange proposed stipulations of law, facts, and authenticity.
- January 26, 2011 - Exchange and serve courtesy copy on ALJ objections to final proposed witness lists and exhibit lists.

Exchange objections to the designated testimony to be presented by deposition and counter designations.
- January 27, 2011 - Respondent's Counsel files pretrial brief supported by legal authority.
- February 8, 2011 - File final stipulations of law, facts, and authenticity. Any subsequent stipulations may be offered as agreed by the parties.

February 15, 2011 - Final prehearing conference to begin at 10:00 a.m. in room 532, Federal Trade Commission Building, 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, Washington, DC 20580.

The parties are to meet and confer prior to the conference regarding trial logistics and proposed stipulations of law, facts, and authenticity and any designated deposition testimony. To the extent the parties stipulate to certain issues, the parties shall prepare a Joint Exhibit which lists the agreed-to stipulations.

Counsel may present any objections to the final proposed witness lists and exhibits, including the designated testimony to be presented by deposition. Trial exhibits will be admitted or excluded to the extent practicable. To the extent the parties agree to the admission of each other's exhibits, the parties shall prepare a Joint Exhibit which lists the exhibits to which neither side objects. Any Joint Exhibit will be signed by each party with no signature for the judge required.

February 17, 2011 - Commencement of Hearing, to begin at 10:00 a.m. in room 532, Federal Trade Commission Building, 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, Washington, DC 20580.

ADDITIONAL PROVISIONS

1. For all papers that are required to be filed with the Office of the Secretary, the parties shall serve a courtesy copy on the Administrative Law Judge by electronic mail to the following email address: oyalj@ftc.gov by 5:00 p.m. on the designated date. This email account is to be used only for courtesy copies of pleadings filed with the Office of the Secretary and for documents specifically requested of the parties by the Office of Administrative Law Judges. All submissions shall bear the words "Docket 9343" in the re line. Service by email shall be followed promptly by delivery of one hard copy by the next business day. In any instance in which a courtesy copy of a pleading for the Administrative Law Judge cannot be effectuated by electronic mail, counsel shall hand deliver a hard copy to the Office of Administrative Law Judges.

2. The parties shall serve each other by electronic mail as follows and shall include "Docket 9343" in the re line and all attached documents in .pdf format. Where email service cannot be promptly effectuated, service shall be by facsimile on the designated date of service of a hard copy of the document(s) to be served including all

attachments and an electronically recorded copy of the document(s) and attachments. The parties waive their rights to service as prescribed by 16 C.F.R. § 4.4(a)-(b).

For Complaint Counsel: William L. Lanning
wlanning@ftc.gov

Melissa Westman-Cherry
mwestman@ftc.gov

Michael J. Bloom
mjbloom@ftc.gov

Geoffrey Green
ggreen@ftc.gov

Stephanie Langley
slangley@ftc.gov

For Respondent's Counsel: Noel Allen
nla@allen-pinnix.com

3. Each pleading that cites to unpublished opinions or opinions not available on LEXIS or WESTLAW shall include such copies as exhibits.

4. Each motion (other than a motion to dismiss or a motion for summary decision) shall be accompanied by a signed statement representing that counsel for the moving party has conferred with opposing counsel in an effort in good faith to resolve by agreement the issues raised by the motion and has been unable to reach such an agreement. Motions that fail to include such statement may be denied on that ground.

5. If papers filed with the Office of the Secretary contain *in camera* or confidential material, the filing party shall mark any such material in the complete version of their submission with **{bold font and braces}**. 16 C.F.R. § 3.45(e). Parties shall be aware of the rules for filings containing such information, including 16 C.F.R. § 4.2.

6. Motions for *in camera* treatment for evidence to be introduced at trial must meet the strict standards set forth in 16 C.F.R. § 3.45 and explained in *In re Dura Lube Corp.*, 1999 FTC LEXIS 255 (Dec. 23, 1999); *In re Hoechst Marion Roussel, Inc.*, 2000 FTC LEXIS 157 (Nov. 22, 2000) and 2000 FTC LEXIS 138 (Sept. 19, 2000); *In re Basic Research, Inc.*, 2006 FTC LEXIS 14 (Jan. 25, 2006). Motions also must be supported by a declaration or affidavit by a person qualified to explain the confidential nature of the documents. *In re North Texas Specialty Physicians*, 2004 FTC LEXIS 66 (April 23,

2004). Each party or non-party that files a motion for *in camera* treatment shall provide one copy of the documents for which *in camera* treatment is sought to the Administrative Law Judge.

7. Compliance with the scheduled end of discovery requires that the parties serve subpoenas and discovery requests sufficiently in advance of the discovery cut-off and that all responses and objections will be due on or before that date, unless otherwise noted. Any motion to compel responses to discovery requests shall be filed within 5 days of impasse if the parties are negotiating in good faith and are not able to resolve their dispute.

8. Each party is limited to 50 document requests, 25 interrogatories, and 50 requests for admissions, except that there shall be no limit on the number of requests for admission for authentication and admissibility of exhibits. Any single interrogatory inquiring as to a request for admissions response may address only a single such response. There is no limit to the number of sets of discovery requests the parties may issue, so long as the total number of each type of discovery request, including all subparts, does not exceed these limits.

9. The deposition of any person may be recorded by videotape, provided that the deposing party notifies the deponent and all parties of its intention to record the deposition by videotape at least five days in advance of the deposition. No deposition, whether recorded by videotape or otherwise, may exceed a single, seven-hour day, unless otherwise agreed to by the parties or ordered by the Administrative Law Judge.

10. The parties shall serve upon one another, at the time of issuance, copies of all subpoenas *duces tecum* and subpoenas *ad testificandum*. For subpoenas *ad testificandum*, the party seeking the deposition shall consult with the other parties before the deposition date is scheduled.

11. Non-parties shall provide copies or make available for inspection and copying of documents requested by subpoena to the party issuing the subpoena. The party that has requested documents from non-parties shall provide copies of the documents received from non-parties to the opposing party within three business days of receiving the documents. No deposition of a non-party shall be scheduled between the time a non-party provides documents in response to a subpoena *duces tecum* to a party, and 3 days after the party provides those documents to the other party, unless a shorter time is required by unforeseen logistical issues in scheduling the deposition, or a non-party produces those documents at the time of the deposition as agreed to by all parties involved.

12. The revised and final witness lists shall represent counsels' good faith designation of all potential witnesses who counsel reasonably expect may be called in their case-in-chief. Parties shall notify the opposing party promptly of changes in witness lists to facilitate completion of discovery within the dates of the scheduling order. The

final proposed witness list may not include additional witnesses not listed in the preliminary or revised preliminary witness lists previously exchanged unless by agreement of the parties or by order of the Administrative Law Judge upon a showing of good cause.

13. The final exhibit lists shall represent counsels' good faith designation of all trial exhibits other than demonstrative, illustrative, or summary exhibits. Additional exhibits may be added after the submission of the final lists only by agreement of the parties or by order of the Administrative Law Judge upon a showing of good cause.

14. Witnesses shall not testify to a matter unless evidence is introduced sufficient to support a finding that the witness has personal knowledge of the matter. F.R.E. 602.

15. Witnesses not properly designated as expert witnesses shall not provide opinions beyond what is allowed in F.R.E. 701.

16. (a) At the time an expert is first listed as a witness by a party, that party shall provide to the other party:

(i) materials fully describing or identifying the background and qualifications of the expert, all publications authored by the expert within the preceding ten years, and all prior cases in which the expert has testified or has been deposed within the preceding four years; and

(ii) transcripts of such testimony in the possession, custody, or control of the producing party or the expert.

(b) At the time an expert report is produced, the producing party shall provide to the other party all documents and other written materials relied upon by the expert in formulating an opinion in this case. Unless otherwise agreed by the parties, the experts' notes and drafts of expert reports need not be produced. Likewise, communications between experts and with counsel or consultants need not be produced unless relied upon by the expert in formulating an opinion in this case.

(c) Each expert report shall include a complete statement of all opinions to be expressed and the basis and reasons therefore; the data or other information considered by the expert in forming the opinions; any exhibits to be used as a summary of or support for the opinions; the qualifications of the expert; and the compensation to be paid for the study and testimony.

(d) It shall be the responsibility of a party designating an expert witness to ensure that the expert witness is reasonably available for deposition in keeping with this Scheduling Order. Unless otherwise agreed to by the parties or ordered by the Administrative Law Judge, expert witnesses shall be deposed only once and each expert deposition shall be limited to one day for seven hours.

(e) A party may not discover facts known or opinions held by an expert who has been retained or specially employed by another party in anticipation of litigation or preparation for hearing and who is not designated by a party as a testifying witness.

17. Properly admitted deposition testimony and properly admitted investigational hearing transcripts are part of the record and need not be read in open court. Videotape deposition excerpts that have been admitted in evidence may be presented in open court only upon prior approval by the Administrative Law Judge.


18. The parties shall provide one another, and the Administrative Law Judge, no later than 48 hours in advance, not including weekends and holidays, a list of all witnesses to be called on each day of hearing, subject to possible delays or other unforeseen circumstances.

19. The parties shall provide one another with copies of any demonstrative, illustrative or summary exhibits (other than those prepared for cross-examination) 24 hours before they are used with a witness.

20. Complaint Counsel's exhibits shall bear the designation CX and Respondent's exhibits shall bear the designation RX or some other appropriate designation. Both sides shall number the first page of each exhibit with a single series of consecutive numbers. When an exhibit consists of more than one piece of paper, each page of the exhibit must bear a consecutive control number or some other consecutive page number. Additionally, parties must account for all their respective exhibit numbers. Any number not actually used at the hearing shall be designated "intentionally not used."

21. At the final prehearing conference, counsel will be required to introduce all exhibits they intend to introduce at trial. Additional exhibits may be added after the final prehearing conference only by agreement of the parties or by order of the Administrative Law Judge upon a showing of good cause. Counsel shall contact the court reporter regarding submission of exhibits.

ORDERED:



D. Michael Chappell
Chief Administrative Law Judge

Date: July 15, 2010