DAVID C. SHONKA Acting General Counsel CHARLES A. HARWOOD 2 Regional Director 3 TRACY S. THORLEIFSON tthorleifson@ftc.gov 4 DAVID M. HORN dhorn@ftc.gov MIRY KIM 6 mkim@ftc.gov Attorneys Federal Trade Commission 915 Second Avenue, Suite 2896 Seattle, Washington 98174 (206) 220-6350 (phone) (206) 220-6366 (facsimile) 8 9 Jennifer M. Brennan, Cal Bar No. 225473 10 jmbrennan@ftc.gov 10877 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 700 11 Los Angeles, CA 90024 (310) 824-4343 12ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFF 13 14 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA 15 SOUTHERN DIVISION 16 17 FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION 18 CV09 -3533 AHM (RNBx) Civil Action No. Plaintiff, 19 STIPULATION CONCERNING FINAL JUDGMENT AND 20 AMERICAN VETERANS RELIEF ORDER FOR PERMANENT FOUNDATION, INC., et al., INJUNCTION 21 Defendants. 22 23 Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission ("FTC" or "Commission") has 24 commenced this action by concurrently filing its Complaint, this Stipulation 25 Concerning Final Judgment and Order for Permanent Injunction, and the 26 [Proposed] Final Judgment and Order for Permanent Injunction ("Order") as to 27 defendants Jeffrey Duncan, Kathy Clinkenbeard, William Rose, Coalition of Police 28

 and Sheriffs, Inc. ("COPS"), Disabled Firefighters Fund ("DFF"), and American Veterans Relief Foundation, Inc. ("AVRF"). The Complaint alleges that defendants have engaged in deceptive acts or practices in connection with the solicitation of charitable contributions by telephone in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a) and the Commission's Telemarketing Sales Rules ("TSR"), 16 C.F.R. Part 310.

The Commission and each defendant hereby stipulate and agree to the entry of the Order to resolve all matters in dispute in this action between them and without trial or adjudication of any issue of law or fact herein and without defendants admitting liability for any of the matters alleged in the Complaint. The parties further stipulate and agree that entry of the Order shall constitute a full, complete, and final settlement of this action. Defendants waive service of the Summons and Complaint.

The Commission and each defendant hereby consent to entry of the Order, which shall constitute a final judgment and order in this matter, and which states as follows:

FINDINGS

- 1. This is an action by the Commission under Section 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 53(b) and 57b, the Telemarketing Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 6101-6108, and the TSR, 16 C.F.R. Part 310. Pursuant to these statutes and regulations, the Commission has the authority to seek the relief contained herein.
- 2. The Commission's complaint states a claim upon which relief may be granted against defendants under Sections 5(a), 13(b), and 19 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a), 53(b), and 57b, the Telemarketing Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 6101-6108, and the TSR, 16 C.F.R. Part 310.
- 3. This Court has jurisdiction of the subject matter of this case and all the parties hereto. Venue in the Central District of California is proper.

- 4. The alleged activities of defendants are in or affecting commerce, as defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.
- 5. The parties shall each bear their own costs and attorney's fees incurred in this action and have waived all claims under the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412.
- 6. Defendants have waived all rights to seek appellate review or otherwise challenge or contest the validity of this Order.
- 7. Defendants have waived and released any claims that they may have against the Commission or its employees, agents, or representatives.
 - 8. Entry of this Order is in the public interest.

DEFINITIONS

For purposes of this Order, the following definitions shall apply:

- 1. "And," as well as "or," have both conjunctive and disjunctive meanings.
- 2. "Assisting others" includes, but is not limited to: (a) formulating or providing, or arranging to formulate or provide, any telephone script or any other solicitation materials; (b) formulating or mailing, or arranging to formulate or mail, any solicitation, receipt, invoice, or any other materials sent to donors; (c) providing or arranging to provide the names of donors; (d) arranging for continuing affiliation between any person and any purported nonprofit organization for the purpose of soliciting donations; (e) providing or arranging to provide customer service functions including, but not limited to, receiving or responding to donor questions or complaints, or accepting or handling any refund requests; or (f) providing consultation services to any person engaged in fundraising or telemarketing.

- 3. "Corporate defendants" means Coalition of Police and Sheriffs, Inc., Disabled Firefighters Fund, American Veterans Relief Foundation, Inc., and their successors and assigns.
- 4. "Defendants" means all of the individual defendants and the corporate defendants, individually, collectively, or in any combination.
- 5. "Donation" or "charitable contribution" means any donation or gift of money or any other thing of value.
- 6. "Donor" or "consumer" means any person solicited to make a charitable contribution.
- 7. "Fundraising" means a plan, program, or campaign which is conducted to induce charitable contributions by mail, telephone, electronic mail, or any other means.
- 8. "Individual defendants" means Jeffrey Duncan, Kathy Clinkenbeard, and William Rose.
- 9. "Nonprofit organization" means any person that is, or is represented to be, a nonprofit entity or that has, or is represented to have, a charitable purpose, specifically including any entity that purports to benefit, either in whole or in part, purported law enforcement, firefighting, or veterans' organizations, personnel, or programs, or individuals who suffer from an illness, injury, or handicap.
- 10. "Person" means a natural person, organization or other legal entity, including a corporation, partnership, proprietorship, association, cooperative, government agency, or any other group or combination acting as an entity.
- 11. "Solicitor" means any person who solicits a donation or charitable contribution.
- 12. "Telemarketing" means a plan, program, or campaign which is conducted to induce the purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution,

7

5

11 12

10

13 14

16

15

17 18

19 20

21

23

22

24 25

26

27

28

by use of one or more telephones and which involves more than one interstate telephone call.

ORDER

I. PROHIBITED PRACTICES – REPRESENTATIONS AND OMISSIONS

IT IS ORDERED that defendants, their officers, agents, servants, employees, independent contractors, and those persons in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service, or otherwise, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from the following practices in connection with engaging, participating, or assisting others in fundraising or telemarketing, whether directly, indirectly, in concert with others, or through any corporation, division or other device:

- Α. Making, or assisting others to make, expressly or by implication, orally or in writing, any statement or representation of material fact that is false or misleading including, but not limited to, any false or misleading representation:
- 1. That a donor's contribution, or any portion or amount of a donor's contribution, will be used for any general or specific charitable purpose;
- 2. Concerning the organization, program, or benefits that a donor's contribution will support, including but not limited to any false or misleading representation that donated funds will be used to:
- Assist veterans and/or the families of soldiers by operating a specific, substantial charitable program that provides financial assistance to the families of American soldiers fighting overseas; provides care packages to veterans in Veterans Administration hospitals across the country; or provides financial support to veterans' memorials;
- Ъ. Support police or sheriffs injured in the line of duty by operating a specific, substantial charitable program that (1) assists qualified police officers injured in the line of duty, and their families by paying mortgages, auto

loans, and medical bills, and other costs not covered by their departments; or (2) provides a scholarship program to disabled officers and their families; or

- c. Assist disabled firefighters by operating a specific, substantial charitable program that assists qualified disabled firefighters injured in the line of duty, especially during the interval between the injury and the onset of official government benefits, by providing cash benefits to pay necessary living expenses such as mortgages, rent, medical coverage, and costs not covered by their departments; or provide death benefits to the families of firefighters killed in the line of duty.
- 3. That a donor's contribution will directly benefit individuals or groups in the donor's state or local area, or will otherwise be spent in the donor's state or local area; or
- 4. Concerning a charitable organization's or telemarketer's affiliation with any law enforcement, fire fighting, or veterans' organization or any other person or entity; and
- B. In connection with fundraising, failing to disclose in each script, brochure, or other solicitation material, and failing to ensure that telemarketers disclose during the initial telephone contact with any donor, and in any follow-up contact:
- 1. How the donations raised through the fundraising will be utilized for charitable purposes;
- 2. If asked by any consumer, the percentage or amount of any charitable contribution that will go to a charitable organization or to any particular charitable program;
- 3. That the solicitor is, or is employed by, a professional fundraiser; and
- 4. The city and state of the nonprofit organization's principal place of business.

II. TELEMARKETING SALES RULE COMPLIANCE

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that defendants, their officers, agents, servants, employees, independent contractors, and those persons in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from violating, or assisting others in violating, any provision of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. Part 310, as currently promulgated or as it hereafter may be amended, including, but not limited to:

- A. Section 310.3(b) of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. § 310.3(b), by providing substantial assistance or support to any seller or telemarketer when that person knows or consciously avoids knowing that the seller or telemarketer is engaged in any act or practice that violates Sections 310.3(a), (c) or (d), or Section 310.4 of the Rule;
- B. Section 310.3(a)(4) of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. § 310.3(a)(4), by making a false or misleading statement to induce any person to pay for goods or services or to induce a charitable contribution:
- C. Section 310.3(d)(1) of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. § 310.3(d)(1), by misrepresenting, directly or by implication, the nature, purpose, or mission of any entity on behalf of which a charitable contribution is being requested;
- D. Section 310.3(d)(3) of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. § 310.3(d)(3), by misrepresenting, directly or by implication, the purpose for which any charitable contribution will be used;
- E. Section 310.3(d)(4) of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. § 310.3(d)(4), by misrepresenting, directly or by implication, the percentage or amount of any charitable contribution that will go to a charitable organization or to any particular charitable program; and

1 |

 F. Section 310.3(d)(6) of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. § 310.3(d)(6), by misrepresenting, directly or by implication, a charitable organization's or telemarketer's affiliation with, or endorsement or sponsorship by, any person or government entity.

III. MONITORING COMPLIANCE OF TELEMARKETERS OR FUNDRAISERS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that defendants, their officers, agents, servants, employees, independent contractors, and those persons in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, in connection with any business or other entity engaged in fundraising or telemarketing, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from:

- A. Failing to take reasonable steps sufficient to monitor and ensure that all employees and independent contractors who are engaged in fundraising or telemarketing or otherwise deal with the public comply with the Sections of this Order titled "Prohibited Practices Representations and Omissions" and "Telemarketing Sales Rule Compliance;"
- B. Failing to establish a procedure for receiving and responding to consumer complaints;
- C. Failing to ascertain the number and nature of consumer complaints regarding transactions in which each employee or independent contractor is involved:
- D. Failing to investigate promptly and fully any complaint or inquiry received about a solicitation by any employee or independent contractor and to create and maintain a written record of the investigation and any results; and
- E. Failing to take corrective action with respect to any employee or independent contractor whom defendants determine is not complying with this

 Order, which may include training, disciplining, or terminating any such employee or independent contractor.

IV. SUSPENDED MONETARY JUDGMENT

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:

- A. Judgment, in the form of equitable monetary relief, is hereby entered against defendants Jeffrey Dean Duncan, Kathy Clinkenbeard, DFF, and COPS, jointly and severally, in the amount of THIRTEEN MILLION, ONE HUNDRED FORTY THOUSAND, FIVE HUNDRED THIRTY-EIGHT DOLLARS (\$13,140,538); provided, however, that this judgment shall be suspended subject to the conditions set forth in the Section of this Order titled "Right to Reopen;"
- B. Judgment, in the form of equitable monetary relief, is hereby entered against defendants William Rose, Kathy Clinkenbeard, and AVRF, jointly and severally, in the amount of SIX MILLION, EIGHT HUNDRED FOUR DOLLARS (\$6,000,804); provided, however, that this judgment shall be suspended subject to the conditions set forth in the Section of this Order titled "Right to Reopen;"
- C. All funds paid pursuant to this Order shall be deposited into a fund administered by the Commission or its agent to be used for equitable relief, including, but not limited to, consumer redress, and any attendant expenses for the administration of such equitable relief fund. Defendants shall cooperate fully to assist the Commission in identifying consumers who may be entitled to redress pursuant to this Order. If the Commission determines, in its sole discretion, that redress to consumers is wholly or partially impracticable or funds remain after redress is completed, the Commission may apply any remaining funds for such other equitable relief (including consumer education remedies) as it determines to be reasonably related to defendants' practices alleged in the Complaint. Any funds not used for such equitable relief shall be deposited to the United States Treasury as disgorgement. Defendants shall have no right to challenge the Commission's

1 |

choice of remedies under this Section, and shall have no right to contest the manner of distribution chosen by the Commission. This judgment for equitable monetary relief is solely remedial in nature and is not a fine, penalty, punitive assessment, or forfeiture;

- D. In the event of any default on defendants' obligation to make payment under this Section, interest, computed pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1961, as amended, shall accrue from the date of default to the date of payment, and shall immediately become due and payable;
- E. Defendants relinquish all dominion, control, and title to the funds paid to the fullest extent permitted by law. Defendants shall make no claim to or demand return of the funds, directly or indirectly, through counsel or otherwise;
- F. Defendants agree that the facts as alleged in the Complaint filed in this action shall be taken as true without further proof in any bankruptcy case or subsequent civil litigation pursued by the Commission to enforce its rights to any payment or money judgment pursuant to this Order, including, but not limited to, a nondischargeability complaint in any bankruptcy case. Defendants further stipulate and agree that the facts alleged in the Complaint establish all elements necessary to sustain an action pursuant to, and that this Order shall have collateral estoppel effect for purposes of, Section 523(a)(2)(A) of the Bankruptcy Code, 11 U.S.C. § 523(a)(2)(A);
- G. In accordance with 31 U.S.C. § 7701, defendants are hereby required, unless they already have done so, to furnish to the Commission with taxpayer identifying numbers (social security numbers or employer identification numbers), which shall be used for purposes of collecting and reporting on any delinquent amount arising out of their relationship with the government. Defendants Duncan, Clinkenbeard, and Rose are further required, unless they already have done so, to provide the Commission with clear, legible and full-size photocopies of all valid

driver's licenses they possess, which will be used for reporting and compliance purposes; and

H. Proceedings instituted under this Section are in addition to, and not in lieu of, any other civil or criminal remedies that may be provided by law, including any other proceedings the Commission may initiate to enforce this Order.

V. RIGHT TO REOPEN

- A. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, by agreeing to this Order, defendants reaffirm and attest to the truthfulness, accuracy, and completeness of the Financial Disclosure Forms and related materials transmitted to the FTC on April 22, 2009(defendant Clinkenbeard) and April 24, 2009 (defendants Rose and Duncan). Plaintiff's agreement to this Order is expressly premised upon the truthfulness, accuracy, and completeness of defendants' representations regarding their financial condition in the Financial Disclosure Forms referenced above, which contain material information upon which plaintiff relied in negotiating and agreeing to the terms of this Order.
- B. If, upon motion by the Commission, this Court finds that any defendant failed to disclose any material asset or source of income, or materially misrepresented the value of any asset or source of income, or made any other material misrepresentation in or omission from the Financial Disclosure Forms and related materials, the Court shall enter judgment against that defendant, in favor of the Commission, in the amount as set forth in Subsections A and B of the Section titled "Suspended Monetary Judgment," and the entire amount of the judgment shall become immediately due and payable.
- C. In all other respects, this Order shall remain in full force and effect unless otherwise ordered by the Court.
- D. Proceedings instituted under this Section are in addition to, and not in lieu of, any other civil or criminal remedies as may be provided by law, including

any other proceedings the Commission may initiate to enforce this Order. For purposes of this Section, the defendants waive any right to contest any of the allegations in the Commission's Complaint.

VI. CUSTOMER LISTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that defendants are permanently restrained and enjoined from selling, renting leasing, transferring, or otherwise disclosing the name, address, telephone number, credit card number, bank account number, e-mail address, or other identifying information of any person who paid money to any of the defendants at any time prior to the entry of this Order, in connection with fundraising. Provided, however, that defendants may disclose such identifying information to a law enforcement agency or as required by any law, regulation, or court order.

VII. COMPLIANCE MONITORING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for the purpose of (i) monitoring and investigating compliance with any provision of this Order and (ii) investigating the accuracy of any defendant's financial statements upon which the Commission's agreement to this Order is expressly premised:

- A. Within ten (10) days of receipt of written notice from a representative of the Commission, defendants shall submit additional written reports, which are true and accurate and sworn to under penalty of perjury; produce documents for inspection and copying; appear for deposition; and provide entry during normal business hours to any business location in any defendant's possession or direct or indirect control to inspect the business or other entity's operation;
- B. In addition, the Commission is authorized to use all other lawful means, including but not limited to:

- 1. Obtaining discovery from any person, without further leave of court, using the procedures prescribed by Fed. R. Civ. P. 30, 31, 33, 34, 36, 45, and 69;
- 2. Posing as consumers and suppliers to defendants, their employees, or any other business or entity managed or controlled in whole or in part by any defendant, without necessity of identification or prior notice; and
- C. Defendants each shall permit representatives of the Commission to interview any employer, consultant, independent contractor, representative, agent, or employee who has agreed to such an interview, relating in any way to any conduct subject to this Order. The person interviewed may have counsel present. *Provided however*, that nothing in this Order shall limit the Commission's lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1, to obtain any documentary material, tangible things, testimony, or information relevant to unfair or deceptive acts or practices in or affecting commerce (within the meaning of 15 U.S.C. § 45(a)(1)).

VIII. COMPLIANCE REPORTING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, in order that compliance with the provisions of this Order may be monitored:

- A. For a period of three (3) years from the date of entry of this Order,
- 1. Each individual defendant shall notify the Commission of the following:
- a. Any changes in such defendant's residence, mailing addresses, and telephone numbers, within ten (10) days of the date of such change;
- b. Any changes in such defendant's employment status (including self-employment), and any change in such defendant's ownership in any business or other entity, within ten (10) days of the date of such change. Such notice shall include the name and address of each business or other entity that such

defendant is affiliated with, employed by, creates or forms, or performs services for; a detailed description of the nature of the business or other entity; and a detailed description of such defendant's duties and responsibilities in connection with the business or other entity or employment; and

- c. Any changes in such defendant's name or use of any aliases or fictitious names;
- 2. Defendants shall notify the Commission of any changes in structure of any corporate defendant or any business or other entity that any defendant directly or indirectly controls, or has an ownership interest in, that may affect compliance obligations arising under this Order, including but not limited to: incorporation or other organization; a dissolution, assignment, sale, merger, or other action; the creation or dissolution of a subsidiary, parent, or affiliate that engages in any acts or practices subject to this Order; or a change in the corporate entity's name or address, at least thirty (30) days prior to such change, *provided* that, with respect to any proposed change in the corporate entity about which a defendant learns less than thirty (30) days prior to the date such action is to take place, such defendant shall notify the Commission as soon as is practicable after obtaining such knowledge.
- B. One hundred eighty (180) days after the date of entry of this Order and annually thereafter for a period of three (3) years, defendants each shall provide a written report to the FTC, which is true and accurate and sworn to under penalty of perjury, setting forth in detail the manner and form in which they have complied and are complying with this Order. This report shall include, but not be limited to:
 - 1. For each individual defendant:
- a. Such defendant's then-current residence address, mailing addresses, and telephone numbers;

E. For purposes of the compliance reporting and monitoring required by this Order, the Commission is authorized to communicate directly with each defendant.

IX. RECORD KEEPING PROVISIONS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of six (6) years from the date of entry of this Order, defendants, in connection with fundraising or telemarketing, and their agents, employees, officers, corporations, and those persons in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, are hereby restrained and enjoined from failing to create and retain the following records:

- A. Accounting records that reflect the cost of good or services sold, revenues generated, and the disbursement of such revenues;
- B. Personnel records accurately reflecting: the name, address, and telephone number of each person employed in any capacity by any business or other entity, including as an independent contractor; that person's job title or position; the date upon which the person commenced work; and the date and reason for the person's termination, if applicable;
- C. Records accurately reflecting the names, addresses, and phone numbers of each donor solicited by or on behalf of defendants, amounts paid, and description of donations made, to the extent such information is obtained in the ordinary course of business;
- D. Complaints and refund requests (whether received directly, indirectly, or through any third party) and any responses to those complaints or requests;
- E. Copies of all telephone solicitation scripts, other solicitation materials, and websites;

- F. Records accurately reflecting the name, address, and telephone number of each person that any defendant is "assisting" as that term is defined and any contracts or other documents memorializing the relationship; and
- G. All records and documents necessary to demonstrate full compliance with each provision of this Order, including but not limited to, copies of acknowledgments of receipt of this Order required by the Sections titled "Distribution of Order" and "Acknowledgment of Receipt of Order" and all reports submitted to the FTC pursuant to the Section titled "Compliance Reporting."

X. DISTRIBUTION OF ORDER

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of three (3) years from the date of entry of this Order, defendants shall deliver copies of the Order as directed below:

- A. Corporate defendants: Each corporate defendant must deliver a copy of this Order to (1) all of its principals, officers, directors, and managers; (2) all of its employees, agents, fundraisers, and representatives who engage in conduct related to the subject matter of the Order; and (3) any corporate entity resulting from any change in structure set forth in Subsection A.2 of the Section titled "Compliance Reporting." For current personnel, delivery shall be within five (5) days of service of this Order upon such defendant. For new personnel, delivery shall occur prior to them assuming their responsibilities. For any corporate entity resulting from any change in structure set forth in Subsection A.2 of the Section titled "Compliance Reporting," delivery shall be at least ten (10) days prior to the change in structure.
- B. Individual defendant as control person: For any business or other entity that an individual defendant controls, directly or indirectly, or in which such defendant has a majority ownership interest, such defendant must deliver a copy of this Order to (1) all principals, officers, directors, and managers of that business or

other entity; (2) all employees, agents, and representatives of that business or other entity who engage in conduct related to the subject matter of the Order; and (3) any corporate entity resulting from any change in structure set forth in Subsection A.2 of the Section titled "Compliance Reporting." For current personnel, delivery shall be within five (5) days of service of this Order upon such defendant. For new personnel, delivery shall occur prior to them assuming responsibilities. For any corporate entity resulting from any change in structure set forth in Subsection A.2 of the Section titled "Compliance Reporting," delivery shall be at least ten (10) days prior to the change in structure.

- C. Individual defendant as employee or non-control person: For any business or other entity where an individual defendant is not a controlling person of the business or other entity but otherwise engages in conduct related to the subject matter of this Order, such defendant must deliver a copy of this Order to all principals and managers of such business or other entity before engaging in such conduct.
- D. Defendants must secure a signed and dated statement acknowledging receipt of the Order, within thirty (30) days of delivery, from all persons receiving a copy of the Order pursuant to this Section.

XI. ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF RECEIPT OF ORDER

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, within five (5) business days after receipt of this Order as entered by the Court, each defendant shall submit to the Commission a truthful sworn statement acknowledging receipt of this Order.

XII. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter for the purposes of construction, modification, and enforcement of this Order.

1 | XIII. ENTRY OF THIS JUDGMENT IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, as there is no reason for delay, the Clerk 2 3 of this Court is hereby directed to enter this Order. IT IS SO ORDERED. 4 SO STIPULATED: 5 6 Dated: 5/18 7 FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION DEFEND 8 9 Jennifer M. Brennan Apprecian Veterans Relief Foundation, 10 Attorney for Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission 11 12 Tracy 8)Thorleifson David M. Horn Coalition of Police and Sheriffs, Inc. 13 Miry Kim Attorneys for Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission 14 15 Jeffeey Dean Duncan, individually and as a Director of Coalition of Police and Sheriffs, Inc. and Disabled Firefighters 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 William Rose, individually and as a Director of American Veterans Relief 23 Foundation, Inc. 24 25 Robert C. Moest Attorney for Defendants 26 27

28