n the United States Attorney's nox. Thank you.

CARY PLESSIAN, AUSA, CIVIL DIVISION -LOS ANGELES

California State Bar No. 101233
Room 7516, Federal Building
300 North Los Angeles Street
Los Angeles, CA 90012
Telephone (213) 894-2474
Facsimile (213) 894-2380
gary plessman@usdoj.gov

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SOUTHERN DIVISION

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

Plaintiff,

V.

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

CREDIT FOUNDATION OF AMERICA, a California corporation; et al,

Defendants.

CV06-3654 ABC(VBK_x)

Case No.

STIPULATED JUDGMENT AND ORDER FOR PERMANENT INJUNCTION AS TO CREDIT SHELTER OF AMERICA, INC., AND BRYAN TAYLOR

Plaintiff, the United States of America, acting upon notification and authorization to the Attorney General by the Federal Trade Commission ("FTC" or "Commission"), has commenced this action by filing the complaint herein, and Defendants Credit Shelter of America, Inc., and Bryan Taylor (collectively "Defendants") have waived service of the summons and the complaint and have agreed to settlement of this action without adjudication of any issue of fact or law.

THEREFORE, on the joint motion of the parties, it is hereby ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED as follows:

ORDER AS TO CREDIT SHELTER ET AL. - Page 1 of 26

FINDINGS

- 1. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter and the parties pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331, 1337(a), 1345 and 1355, and 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(m)(1)(A), 53(b), 56(a), and 57b.
 - 2. Venue is proper as to all parties in this District.
- 3. The activities of Defendants are in or affecting commerce, as defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.
- 4. The complaint states a claim upon which relief may be granted against Defendants under Sections 5(a), 5(m)(1)(A), 13(b) and 19 of the Federal Trade Commission Act ("FTC Act"), 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a), 45(m)(1)(A), 53(b), and 57b.
- 5. Defendants have entered into this Stipulated Judgment and Order for Permanent Injunction ("Order") freely and without coercion. Defendants further acknowledge that they have read the provisions of this Order and are prepared to abide by them.
- 6. By entering into this Stipulation, the Defendants do not admit to the allegations of the complaint, other than the jurisdictional facts.
- 7. This Order does not constitute, nor shall it be interpreted to constitute, either an admission by the Defendants of any wrongdoing or a finding by the Court that the Defendants have engaged in any violations of law.
- 8. Plaintiff and Defendants hereby waive all rights to appeal or otherwise challenge or contest the validity of this Order.
- 9. Defendants have agreed that this Order does not entitle Defendants to seek or to obtain attorneys' fees as a prevailing party under the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, and Defendants further waive any rights to attorneys' fees that may arise under said provision of law.
 - 10. Entry of this Order is in the public interest.

DEFINITIONS

For the purpose of this Order, the following definitions shall apply:

- 1. "Asset" means any legal or equitable interest in, or right or claim to, any real and personal property, including without limitation, chattels, goods, instruments, equipment, fixtures, general intangibles, leaseholds, mail or other deliveries, inventory, checks, notes, accounts, credits, contracts, receivables, shares of stock, and all cash, wherever located.
- 2. "Assisting" means providing assistance or support to any person or entity including, but not limited to: (a) providing names of, or assisting in the generation of, potential customers including, but not limited to, arranging for the automated delivery of messages to potential customers; (b) performing marketing services of any kind; (c) formulating, drafting, providing, or arranging for the formulation, drafting, or provision of any marketing materials, including any script or other document used when talking to customers or potential customers; (d) providing any training or training materials; or (e) providing information, advice, consultation, or materials regarding business operations, processes, or practices; while knowing or consciously avoiding knowing that the person or entity is engaged in any act or practice that violates this Order or the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. Part 310, as amended, 68 Fed. Reg. 4580, 4669.
- 3. "Billing information" means any data that enables any person to access a customer's account, such as a credit card, checking, savings, share or similar account, utility bill, mortgage loan account, or debit card.
- 4. "Credit counseling" means providing individualized financial advice to a consumer about his or her finances or credit that helps the consumer understand the financial alternatives available to him or her, with the goal of improving the consumer's knowledge of personal financial management.

- 5. "Customer" means any person who is or may be required to pay for goods or services offered through telemarketing.
- 6. "Debt management plan," "debt management program," or "DMP" means a plan or program that involves or purports to involve (a) a consumer paying one consolidated periodic payment to the program to cover the debts that are included in the program; and (b) the program disbursing payments to the creditors of the consumer.
 - 7. "Debt management services" means:
- (a) receiving money from a consumer for the purpose of distributing one or more payments to or among one or more creditors of the consumer in full or partial payment of the consumer's obligation;
- (b) arranging or assisting a consumer to arrange for the distribution of one or more payments to or among one or more creditors of the consumer in full or partial payment of the consumer's obligation;
- (c) exercising direct or indirect control, or arranging for the exercise of such control, over funds of a consumer for the purpose of distributing payments to or among one or more creditors of the consumer in full or partial payment of the consumer's obligation; or
- (d) acting or offering to act, for a fee, as an intermediary between a consumer and one or more creditors of the consumer for the purpose of adjusting, settling, discharging, reaching a compromise on or otherwise altering the terms of payment of the consumer's obligation.
- 8. "Defendants" means Credit Shelter of America, Inc., and Bryan Taylor.
- 9. "Established business relationship" means a relationship between the seller and a person based on: (a) the person's purchase, rental, or lease of the seller's goods or services or a financial transaction between the person and the seller, within the eighteen (18) months immediately preceding the date of the

telemarketing call; or (b) the person's inquiry or application regarding a product or service offered by the seller, within the three (3) months immediately preceding the date of a telemarketing call.

- 10. "National Do Not Call Registry" means the National Do Not Call Registry, which is the "do-not-call" registry maintained by the Commission pursuant to 16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B).
- 11. "Seller" means any person who, in connection with a telemarketing transaction, provides, offers to provide, or arranges for others to provide goods or services to the customer in exchange for consideration, whether or not such person is under the jurisdiction of the Commission.
- 12. "Telemarketer" means any person who, in connection with telemarketing, initiates or receives telephone calls to or from a customer or donor.
- 13. The "Telemarketing Sales Rule" or "Rule" means the FTC Rule entitled "Telemarketing Sales Rule," 16 C.F.R. Part 310, attached hereto as Appendix A.
- 14. "Telemarketing" means a plan, program, or campaign which is conducted to induce the purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution, by use of one or more telephones and which involves more than one interstate telephone call. The term does not include the solicitation of sales through the mailing of a catalog which: contains a written description or illustration of the goods or services offered for sale; includes the business address of the seller; includes multiple pages of written material or illustrations; and has been issued not less frequently than once a year, when the person making the solicitation does not solicit customers by telephone but only receives calls initiated by customers in response to the catalog and during those calls takes orders only without further solicitation. For purposes of the previous sentence, the term "further solicitation" does not include providing the customer with information about, or attempting to sell, any other item included in the same catalog which prompted the customer's

call or in a substantially similar catalog. The following acts or practices are exempt from this Rule: telephone calls in which the sale of goods or services or charitable solicitation is not completed, and payment or authorization of payment is not required, until after a face-to-face sales or donations presentation by the seller or charitable organizations, *provided, however*, that this exemption does not apply to the requirements of §§ 310.4(a)(1), (a)(7), (b), and (c).

- 15. "Outbound telephone call" means a telephone call initiated by a telemarketer to induce the purchase of goods or services or to solicit a charitable contribution.
- 16. "Person" means any individual, group, unincorporated association, limited or general partnership, corporation, or other business entity.

ORDER

I. PROHIBITION AGAINST DECEPTIVE MARKETING PRACTICES

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, in connection with the marketing, providing, or assisting in the marketing or providing of debt management programs, debt management services, or credit counseling, whether directly, indirectly, in concert with others, or through any intermediary, business entity or device, Defendants, and each of them, and their successors, assigns, officers, agents, servants, employees, attorneys, joint venturers, and any other persons in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division or other device, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from:

A. Making any false representations that a particular consumer has been pre-approved for participation in a debt management plan with a particular

creditor or is guaranteed acceptance in a debt management plan at a particular interest rate or payment level by a particular creditor;

- B. Making any false representations about the benefits that consumers will receive through enrolling in a debt management plan or the timing in which such benefits will be received. This includes misrepresentations that:
- 1. Consumers who purchase debt management services will receive interest rate reductions from particular creditors or that interest charges on credit card debt will be reduced to as low as zero percent;
- 2. Consumers will save money if they purchase debt management services because they will repay their debts for reduced amounts or in a shorter period of time;
- 3. Consumers will receive debt management services before their next credit card billing cycle;
- 4. Consumers will receive help from credit counselors who will provide them with individual credit counseling;
- 5. Enrolling in a DMP will quickly stop or lessen debt collection efforts by consumers' creditors;
- 6. The interest rate on consumers' debts will be reconfigured to be calculated as simple interest rather than compound interest; and
- 7. Consumers will be able to take a charitable tax deduction for payments made for debt management services;
- C. Making any false representations about the terms and conditions associated with receiving a refund; and
- D. Making any other false or deceptive representation concerning the provision of debt management programs, debt management services, or credit counseling.

II. PROHIBITION AGAINST DECEPTIVE TELEMARKETING PRACTICES

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, in connection with telemarketing, Defendants, and each of them, and their successors, assigns, officers, agents, servants, employees, attorneys, joint venturers, and any other persons in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division or other device, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from engaging in, or assisting other persons to engage in:

- A. Making false or misleading statements concerning the provision of debt management programs, debt management services, or credit counseling;
- B. Failing to disclose all material restrictions, limitations, or conditions associated with enrolling in a debt management plan prior to collecting any fee, security deposit or other payment from any consumer. This includes disclosing that reductions in interest rate and/or minimum payments are not approved or guaranteed before they have been approved by particular creditors who may approve, modify or reject any particular concession proposed by Defendants for that particular consumer; and
- C. Making any other false or misleading statements to induce consumers to pay for services or to induce a charitable contribution in violation of the deceptive practices prohibitions of the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. § 310.3.
- **Provided, however,** that if the Commission promulgates rules that modify or supersede the Telemarketing Sales Rule, in whole or in part, the Defendants must comply fully and completely with all applicable requirements thereof, on and after the effective date of any such rules.

III. PROHIBITION AGAINST ABUSIVE TELEMARKETING PRACTICES

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, in connection with telemarketing, Defendants, and each of them, and their successors, assigns, officers, agents, servants, employees, attorneys, joint venturers, and any other persons in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division or other device, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from engaging in, or assisting other persons to engage in:

- A. Initiating any outbound telephone call to a person's telephone number on the National Do Not Call Registry of persons who do not wish to receive outbound telephone calls to induce the purchase of goods or services unless:
- 1. The seller has obtained the express agreement, in writing, of such person to place calls to that person. Such written agreement must clearly evidence such person's authorization that calls made by or on behalf of a specific party may be placed to that person, and must include the telephone number to which the calls may be placed and the signature of that person; or
- 2. The seller has an established business relationship with such person and that person has not stated that he or she does not wish to receive outbound telephone calls from the seller;
- B. Initiating any outbound telephone call to telephone numbers within given area codes without first paying the required annual fees for access to the telephone numbers within those area codes that are included in the National Do Not Call Registry when Defendants do not have the established business relationship or express authorization described in Section III.A of this Order;
- C. Initiating any outbound telephone call to a person when that person has previously stated that he or she does not wish to receive an outbound telephone call made by or on behalf of the seller whose goods or services are

- D. Engaging in any act or practice that has the effect of denying or interfering, directly or indirectly, with a person's right to be placed on any entity-specific do-not-call list; and
- E. Engaging in any other act or practice that violates the prohibitions on abusive telemarketing acts or practices in the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. § 310.4, the recordkeeping requirements, 16 C.F.R. § 310.5, or the provisions governing fees for access to the National Do Not Call Registry, 16 C.F.R. § 310.8. *Provided, however*, that this Section III shall not apply to any situation where Defendants are engaged in assisting any person that is exempt from complying with the Do Not Call requirements under the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(A) and (B).

IV. MONITORING CUSTOMER CONTACTS AND SERVICE

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, and each of them, and their successors, assigns, officers, agents, servants, employees, attorneys, joint venturers, and any other persons in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division or other device, in connection with the marketing, providing, or assisting in any manner or in any capacity whatsoever in the marketing or providing of debt management programs, debt management services, or credit counseling, whether directly, indirectly, in concert with others, or through any intermediary, business entity or device, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from:

A. Failing to ensure that, prior to enrolling customers in a debt management program, each telemarketer, whether employed directly by Defendants or by Defendants' agents, is provided with initial and rebuttal scripts

and sales materials that are authorized by the debt management services provider and that comply with this Order. Defendants shall require and ensure that each telemarketer uses such scripts and sales materials;

- B. Failing to take reasonable steps sufficient to monitor and ensure that telemarketers and other personnel, whether employed directly by Defendants or by Defendants' agents, who are engaged in sales or customer service functions, comply with this Order. Such monitoring shall include ensuring that lists of phone numbers that are used to contact consumers include only numbers that are authorized to be called under the Telemarketing Sales Rule. Such monitoring shall also include using non-commissioned employees to listen to a representative sample of the oral presentations made by persons engaged in sales or other customer service functions and keep records regarding any misrepresentations; *provided, however*, that this Section does not authorize or require Defendants to take any steps that violate any federal, state or local laws;
- C. Failing to maintain and provide personnel, whether employees or independent contractors, who are adequately trained and certified to meet standards that are generally acceptable in the credit counseling profession;
- D. Failing to maintain and provide adequate procedures for receiving and promptly investigating and responding to consumer complaints;
- E. Failing to ascertain the number and nature of consumer complaints regarding potentially violative telephone calls or sales practices in which each employee or independent contractor is involved; and
- F. Failing to take corrective action with respect to any employee or independent contractor who Defendants determine, whether as a result of monitoring or through consumer complaints, is not complying with this Order; such corrective action may include training, disciplining or terminating such employee or independent contractor.

27 | 28 |

V. USE OF CUSTOMER DATA

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, and each of them, and their successors, assigns, officers, agents, servants, employees, attorneys, joint venturers, and any other persons in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division or other device, and persons or entities in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from:

- A. Selling, renting, leasing, transferring, or otherwise disclosing the name, address, telephone number, billing information, e-mail address or other identifying information of any person who submitted such information to any Defendant in connection with debt management plans, programs, or services, at any time prior to entry of this Order; and
- B. Using or benefitting from, for commercial purposes, the name, address, telephone number, billing information, e-mail address or other identifying information of any person who submitted such information to any Defendant in connection with debt management plans, programs, or services, at any time prior to entry of this Order;
- **Provided, however**, that Defendants may disclose such identifying information (i) for the purpose of making payments on debts on behalf of consumers; (ii) with the express written consent of the person whose information is disclosed; (iii) to a law enforcement agency; or (iv) as required or authorized by any law, regulation or court order.

VI. MONETARY JUDGMENT

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:

A. A judgment for equitable monetary relief in the amount of \$102,540.00 is hereby entered against Defendants, jointly and severally, as

restitution for consumer injury; *provided*, *however*, that this judgment shall be 1 suspended subject to the conditions set forth in Section VII of this Order. In the 2 event that a monetary payment under this Order becomes due, all funds paid 3 pursuant to this Paragraph shall be deposited into a fund administered by the 4 Commission or its agent to be used for equitable relief, including but not limited to 5 consumer redress, and any attendant expenses for the administration of such 6 equitable relief. Defendants shall cooperate in identifying and locating consumers 7 entitled to restitution under this Order. The Commission will use reasonable 8 9 efforts to distribute restitution funds to consumers. In the event that the use of any funds paid pursuant to this Order for direct redress to consumers is wholly or 10 partially impracticable or funds remain after redress is completed, the Commission 11 may apply any remaining funds for such other equitable relief (including consumer 12 information remedies) as it determines to be reasonably related to the Defendants' 13 practices alleged in the Complaint. Funds not used for such equitable relief, if 14 any, shall be deposited to the U.S. Treasury as disgorgement. Defendants shall 15 have no right to challenge the Commission's choice of remedies under this 16 Section. Defendants shall have no right to contest the manner of distribution 17 chosen by the Commission. 18

B. In the event of default on any payment required to be made by this Section, the entire unpaid amount, together with interest computed under 28 U.S.C. § 1961 -- accrued from the date of default until the date of payment -- shall be immediately due and payable. Defendants agree that, in such event, the facts as alleged in the complaint filed in this action shall be taken as true in any subsequent litigation filed by Plaintiff or the Commission to enforce their rights pursuant to this Order, including but not limited to a nondischargeability complaint in any subsequent bankruptcy proceeding. Proceedings instituted under this Section are in addition to, and not in lieu of, any other civil or criminal

27

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- C. Defendants shall cooperate fully with Plaintiff and the Commission and their agents in all attempts to collect the amount due pursuant to this Section if Defendants fail to pay fully the amount due at the time specified herein. In such an event, Defendants agree to provide Plaintiff and the Commission with their federal and state tax returns for the preceding two years, and to complete new standard-form financial disclosure forms fully and accurately within ten (10) business days of receiving a request from Plaintiff or the Commission to do so. Defendants further authorize Plaintiff and the Commission to verify all information provided on their financial disclosure forms with all appropriate third parties, including but not limited to financial institutions.
- D. In accordance with 31 U.S.C. § 7701, Defendants are hereby required, unless they have done so already, to furnish to Plaintiff and the Commission their taxpayer identifying number(s) (social security numbers or employer identification numbers) which shall be used for purposes of collecting and reporting on any delinquent amount arising out of Defendants' relationship with the government.

VII. RIGHT TO REOPEN AND TERMINATE SUSPENSION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, Plaintiff's and the Commission's agreement to and the Court's approval of this Order are expressly premised upon the truthfulness, accuracy, and completeness of the financial disclosure forms and other financial information ("financial statements") relating to Defendants' financial condition and relating to payments made by and refunds made to Defendants' current and former customers, previously submitted by Defendants to the Commission. If, upon motion by the Plaintiff, this Court finds that any Defendant failed to disclose any material asset, materially misrepresented the value of any asset, or made any other material misrepresentation in or omission

from the financial statements relating to their financial condition, the Court shall 1 enter judgment against the offending Defendant, in favor of the Plaintiff, in the amount of \$102,540.00, and the entire amount shall become immediately due and payable. If, upon motion by the Plaintiff, this Court finds that any of Defendants' financial statements materially misstated the amount of any customer payments or refunds, the Plaintiff may request that this Order be reopened for the purpose of requiring additional restitution from each Defendant who made such misrepresentation or omission; *provided*, *however*, that in all other respects this Order shall remain in full force and effect unless otherwise ordered by this Court; and provided further, that proceedings instituted under this Paragraph are in addition to, and not in lieu of, any other civil or criminal remedies available by law. Solely for the purposes of reopening or enforcing this Paragraph, Defendants waive any right to contest any of the allegations set forth in the complaint filed in this matter.

15

16

17

18

19

2

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

VIII. ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF RECEIPT OF ORDER

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that each Defendant, within five (5) business days of receipt of this Order as entered by the Court, must submit to the Commission a truthful sworn statement acknowledging receipt of this Order.

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

IX. DISTRIBUTION OF ORDER BY DEFENDANTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of three (3) years from the date of entry of this Order, Defendants shall deliver copies of the Order as directed below:

Α. Credit Shelter must deliver a copy of this Order to all of its principals, officers, directors, and managers. Credit Shelter also must deliver a copy of this Order to all of its employees, agents, and representatives who engage in conduct related to the subject matter of this Order. For current personnel, delivery shall be

within five (5) days of service of the Order upon Credit Shelter. For new personnel, delivery shall occur prior to them assuming their responsibilities;

- B. For any business engaged in conduct related to the subject matter of this Order that Bryan Taylor controls, directly or indirectly, or in which that individual Defendant has a majority ownership interest, Bryan Taylor must deliver a copy of this Order to all principals, officers, directors, and managers of that business. Bryan Taylor must also deliver a copy of this Order to all employees, agents, and representatives of that business who engage in conduct related to the subject matter of this Order. For current personnel, delivery shall be within five (5) days of service of this Order upon Bryan Taylor. For new personnel, delivery shall occur prior to them assuming their responsibilities;
- C. For any business where Bryan Taylor is not a controlling person of a business but otherwise engages in conduct related to the subject matter of this Order, Bryan Taylor must deliver a copy of this Order to all principals and managers of such business before engaging in such conduct; and
- D. Defendants must secure a signed and dated statement acknowledging receipt of the Order, within thirty (30) days of delivery, from all persons receiving a copy of this Order pursuant to this Section.

X. COMPLIANCE REPORTING BY DEFENDANTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, in order that compliance with the provisions of this Order may be monitored:

- A. For a period of three (3) years from the date of entry of this Order, Bryan Taylor shall notify the Commission of the following:
- 1. Any changes in residence, mailing addresses, and telephone numbers of Bryan Taylor, within ten (10) days of the date of such change;
- 2. Any changes in employment status (including selfemployment) of Bryan Taylor, and any change in the ownership of Bryan Taylor

in any business entity, within ten (10) days of the date of such change. Such notice shall include the name and address of each business that Bryan Taylor is affiliated with, employed by, creates or forms, or performs services for; a statement of the nature of the business; and a statement of Bryan Taylor's duties and responsibilities in connection with the business or employment; and

- 3. Any changes in Bryan Taylor's name or use of any aliases or fictitious names; and
- 4. Any changes in the corporate structure of Credit Shelter or any business entity that Bryan Taylor directly or indirectly controls, or has an ownership interest in, that may affect compliance obligations arising under this Order including, but not limited to, a dissolution, assignment, sale, merger, or other action that would result in the emergence of a successor entity; the creation or dissolution of a subsidiary, parent, or affiliate that engages in any acts or practices subject to this Order; the filing of a bankruptcy petition; or a change in the corporate name or address, at least thirty (30) days prior to such change, *provided* that, with respect to any proposed change in the corporation about which Bryan Taylor learns less than thirty (30) days prior to the date such action is to take place, Bryan Taylor shall notify the Commission as soon as is practicable after obtaining such knowledge;
- B. One hundred eighty (180) days after the date of entry of this Order, Defendants shall provide a written report to the Commission, sworn to under penalty of perjury, setting forth in detail the manner and form in which they have complied and are complying with this Order. This report shall include, but not be limited to:
 - 1. For Bryan Taylor:

ORDER AS TO CREDIT SHELTER ET AL. - Page 17 of 26

a. The then-current residence address, mailing addresses, and telephone numbers of Bryan Taylor;

- B. In addition, the Commission is authorized to monitor compliance with this Order by all other lawful means including, but not limited to, the following:
- 1. Obtaining discovery from any person, without further leave of court, using the procedures prescribed by Fed. R. Civ. P. 30, 31, 33, 34, 36, and 45; and
- 2. Posing as consumers or suppliers to any Defendant or any Defendant's employees, or any other entity managed or controlled in whole or in part by any Defendant, without the necessity of identification or prior notice; and
- C. Each Defendant shall permit representatives of the Commission to interview any employer, consultant, independent contractor, representative, agent, or employee who has agreed to such an interview, relating in any way to any conduct subject to this Order. The person interviewed may have counsel present. *Provided, however*, that nothing in this Order shall limit the Commission's lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1, to obtain any documentary material, tangible things, testimony, or information relevant to unfair or deceptive acts or practices in or affecting commerce (within the meaning of 15 U.S.C. § 45(a)(1)).

XII. RECORD KEEPING PROVISIONS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of six (6) years from the date of entry of this Order, Defendants, in connection with the provision of debt management programs, debt management services, or credit counseling, are hereby restrained and enjoined from failing to create and retain the following records:

A. Accounting records that reflect the cost of goods or services sold, revenues generated, and the disbursement of such revenues;

B. Personnel records accurately reflecting: the name, address, and telephone number of each person employed in any capacity by such business, including as an independent contractor; that person's job title or position; the date upon which the person commenced work; and the date and reason for the person's termination, if applicable;

- C. Customer files containing the names, addresses, telephone numbers, dollar amounts paid, quantity of items or services purchased, and description of items or services purchased, to the extent such information is obtained in the ordinary course of business;
- D. Complaints and refund requests (whether received directly, indirectly or through any third party) and any responses to those complaints or requests;
- E. Copies of all sales scripts, training materials, advertisements, or other marketing materials; and
- F. All records and documents necessary to demonstrate full compliance with each provision of this Order including, but not limited to, copies of acknowledgments of receipt of this Order, required by Section IX, and all reports submitted to the Commission pursuant to Section X.

XIII. COMPLETE SETTLEMENT

The undersigned parties, by their respective counsel, hereby consent to entry of the foregoing Order which shall constitute a final judgment and order in this matter. These parties further stipulate and agree that the entry of the foregoing Order shall constitute a full, complete and final settlement of this action.

1	XIV. RETENTION	ON OF JURISDICTION
2	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED	that this Court shall retain jurisdiction of
3	this matter for purposes of construction	on, modification, and enforcement of this
4	Order.	
5		
6	JUDGMENT IS THEREFOR	RE ENTERED in favor of Plaintiff and
7	against Defendants, pursuant to all the	e terms and conditions recited above.
8	SO ORDERED this day of	, 2006.
9		
10		
11		United States District Judge
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		

1	FOR THE PLAINTIFF:
2	FOR THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
3 4 5	PETER D. KEISLER Assistant Attorney General, Civil Division U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
6 7 8	DEBRA W. YANG United States Attorney LEON W. WEIDMAN Assistant United States Attorney Chief, Civil Division
9	
10 11	GARY PLESSMAN Assistant United States Attorney Chief, Civil Fraud Section Room 7516, Federal Building 300 North Los Angeles Street
12	Room 7516, Federal Building 300 North Los Angeles Street
13 14	Los Angeles, CA 90012 Telephone (213) 894-2474 Facsimile (714) 894-2380 gary.plessman@usdoj.gov
15 16 17	EUGENE M. THIROLF Director Office of Consumer Litigation
18	Llenghyn Item ELIZABETH STEIN
19 20	Trial Attorney Office of Consumer Litigation U.S. Department of Justice
21	P.O. Box 386
22	Washington, D.C. 20044 Telephone (202) 307-0066 Facsimile (202) 514-8742
23	1 405111110 (202) 511 0712
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	·

FOR THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION 1 2 3 4 Tracy S. Thorleifson Federal Trade Commission 5 915 Second Avenue, Suite 2896 Seattle, WA 98174 206-220-6350 206-220-6366 (fax) 6 7 8 9 Kathryn C. Decker 10 Federal Trade Commission 915 Second Avenue, Suite 2896 Seattle, WA 98174 206-220-6350 11 12 206-220-6366 (fax) 13 14 15 Robert J. Schroeder 16 Federal Trade Commission 17 915 Second Avenue, Suite 2896 Seattle, WA 98174 206-220-6350 18 206-220-6366 (fax) 19 20 21 Charles A. Harwood 22 Federal Trade Commission 23 915 Second Avenue, Suite 2896 Seattle, WA 98174 206-220-6350 24 206-220-6366 (fax) 25 26 27 28

1	FOR DEFENDANTS:
2	
3	Bay
4	
5	Bryan Taylor
6	Man
7	Credit Shelter of America, Inc.
8	
9	Miles Ladatin
10	Melissa Landau Steinman
11	Venable LLP 575 7th Street, N.W.
12	Melissa Landau Steinman Venable LLP 575 7th Street, N.W. Washington, DC 20004-1601 202-344-4972 Attorney for Defendants
13	Attorney for Defendants
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	

REASONS FOR SETTLEMENT

1 |

This statement accompanies the three Stipulated Judgments and Orders for Permanent Injunction ("stipulated orders") in full settlement of an action brought to recover penalties and other equitable relief from defendants for engaging in acts and practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a), and the Commission's Telemarketing Sales Rule ("TSR"), 16 C.F.R. Part 310. The stipulated orders are with three separate groups of defendants: (1) Credit Foundation of America, Inc., TTT Marketing Services, Inc., Sure Guard Credit Corporation, Inc., Anthony Cara, Walter Villaume, and Todd Rodriguez (the "CFA defendants"); (2) Credit Defenders of America, Inc., and Robert Brown (the "Credit Defenders defendants"); and (3) Credit Shelter of America, Inc., and Bryan Taylor (the "Credit Shelter defendants").

Pursuant to Section 5(m)(3) of the Federal Trade Commission Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(m)(3), the Commission hereby sets forth its reasons for settlement by entry of the stipulated orders:

The order with the CFA defendants holds them liable for \$606,745.00 as restitution for consumer injury. The order with the Credit Defenders defendants holds Credit Defenders of America, Inc. liable for \$70,000 as restitution for consumer injury. The order with the Credit Shelter defendants holds them liable for \$102,540.00, which is suspended based on financial information provided by these defendants. Together, these judgments will provide substantial restitution for consumers who have been injured by the defendants' alleged practices.

In addition, the order with the CFA defendants holds them liable for payment of \$250,000 in civil penalties for their alleged violations of the Commission's TSR. Using this amount as the basis for the civil penalty is appropriate in light of the factors set forth in 15 U.S.C. § 45(m)(1). In addition, the Commission believes that this penalty will serve as an effective deterrent in this context for future violations of the TSR.

Moreover, the strong injunctive provisions in the stipulated orders will help protect consumers from future harm. For example, the stipulated orders include comprehensive injunctive relief relating to: (1) deceptive practices in the debt management and credit counseling context; and (2) compliance with the TSR provisions relating to abusive telemarketing practices, including the Do Not Call provisions.

¹If, however, either of the Credit Shelter defendants are found to have made a material misrepresentation or omission in their financial disclosures, then the entire judgment amount will become immediately due and payable. *See* Section VII of the Credit Shelter order.

For the foregoing reasons, the Commission believes that settlement by entry of the attached stipulated orders is justified and within the public interest.