	COPY		Ţ
1 2 3 4 5	JENNIFER LARABEE, Cal. Bar No. 163 FAYE CHEN BARNOUW, Cal. Bar No. RAYMOND E. MCKOWN, Cal. Bar No KENNETH ABBE, Cal. Bar No. 172416 Federal Trade Commission 10877 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 700 Los Angeles, CA 90024 Tel: (310) 824-4343 Fax: (310) 824-4380		
6 7 8 9	Attorneys for Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission MAR 2.9 20 CLERK US DISTRICT OF CENTRAL DISTRICT OF SOUTHERN DIVISION	DISTRICT COURT	
10 11 12	CENTRAL DISTRIC SOUTHERN	CT OF CALIFORNIA	
12	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION,	Case No. SA CV04-0474 CJC (JWJx)	
14 15	v.	SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND [PROPOSED] FINAL ORDER	The sector
16 17	NATIONAL CONSUMER COUNCIL, INC., et al.,	FOR PERMANENT INJUNCTION WITH DEFENDANT WALTER HAINES	
18	Defendants.	NO HEARING REQUESTED	
19 20			
21			
22 23	•		
24			
25 26			
27			
28			

Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission ("FTC" or "Commission"), pursuant to 1 Sections 13(b) and 19 of the Federal Trade Commission Act ("FTC Act"), 15 U.S.C. 2 § 53(b) and § 57, filed a Complaint alleging violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC 3 Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a), of the Telemarketing Sales Rule ("TSR"), 16 C.F.R. Part 4 5 310, of Subtitle A of Title V of the Gramm-Leach-Bliley Act ("GLB Act") 15 6 U.S.C. §§ 6801 through 6809, and of the FTC's Consumer Financial Information 7 Rule ("Privacy Rule"), 16 C.F.R. Part 313. The Complaint sought an injunction and other equitable relief. Concurrently, the Commission filed an ex parte application 8 for a Temporary Restraining Order with Asset Freeze, Appointment of Temporary 9 Receiver, and Order to Show Cause Why a Preliminary Injunction Should Not Issue 10 And a Permanent Receiver Should Not Be Appointed ("TRO"). 11

On May 3, 2004, the Court granted the ex parte Application, appointed Robb 12 Evans and Associates LLC as Temporary Receiver over Defendants NATIONAL 13 CONSUMER COUNCIL, INC., an Arizona corporation ("NCC-AZ"); 14 NATIONAL CONSUMER COUNCIL, INC., a California corporation ("NCC-15 CA"); NATIONAL CONSUMER COUNCIL, INC., a Nevada corporation 16 ("NCC-NV"); LONDON FINANCIAL GROUP; NATIONAL CONSUMER 17 DEBT COUNCIL, LLC; SOLIDIUM, LLC; J.P. LANDIS, LLC; FINANCIAL 18 **RESCUE SERVICES, INC.; SIGNATURE EQUITIES, LLC; M&L** 19 SPRINGFIELD TRUST; PC HAILEY TRUST; and VIA LIDO TRUST and 20 instituted an asset freeze. On May 14, 2004, by stipulation of the parties, and order 21 of the Court, Defendant UNITED CONSUMERS LAW GROUP was made part of 22 23 the Receivership.

On May 21, 2004 the Court entered Stipulated Preliminary Injunctions and
Orders ("PI") against all of the Defendants which continued the TRO's injunctive
provisions and asset freeze and appointed Robb Evans and Associates LLC as the
Permanent Receiver over NCC-AZ; NCC-CA; NCC-NV; LONDON FINANCIAL
GROUP; NATIONAL CONSUMER DEBT COUNCIL, LLC; SOLIDIUM,

LLC; J.P. LANDIS, LLC; FINANCIAL RESCUE SERVICES, INC.; SIGNATURE EQUITIES, LLC; UNITED CONSUMERS LAW GROUP; M&L SPRINGFIELD TRUST; PC HAILEY TRUST; and VIA LIDO TRUST.

4 Now plaintiff Commission and Defendant WALTER HAINES ("HAINES"),
5 negotiating through their respective counsel, have agreed to a settlement of this
6 action.

Accordingly, the Commission and Defendant HAINES consent to entry of this
Settlement Agreement and [Proposed] Final Order with Defendant WALTER
HAINES ("Order") without adjudication of any issue of fact or law. The parties
further agree that entry of this Order in the docket by the Court will constitute notice
to them of the terms and conditions of the Order. Plaintiff and Defendant HAINES,
having requested the Court to enter this Order, the Court hereby finds and orders as
follows:

14

15

FINDINGS OF FACT

Defendant HAINES was properly served with the Complaint, Summons
 and TRO in this matter.

可能的 化二氟磷酸盐化二甲酸钠 机偏常蜂植的力

Defendant HAINES consented to the entry of the PI against him and
 against Defendants NATIONAL CONSUMER DEBT COUNCIL, LLC,
 SOLIDIUM, LLC, UNITED CONSUMERS LAW GROUP, J.P. LANDIS,
 SIGNATURE EQUITIES, LLC and M&L SPRINGFIELD TRUST and was
 properly served with the PI in this matter.

3. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of the case and
personal jurisdiction over Defendant HAINES. Venue in the Central District of
California is proper.

4. The alleged actions of Defendant HAINES are in or affecting
commerce, as defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.

28 5. The Complaint states a claim upon which relief can be granted against

Defendant HAINES under Sections 5(a) and 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C.
 §§ 45(a) and 53(b); under the TSR, 16 C.F.R. Part 310; under Subtitle A of Title V
 of the GLB Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 6801 through 6809, and under the Privacy Rule, 16
 C.F.R. Part 313.

6. Plaintiff has the authority under Sections 13(b) and 19 of the FTC Act,
15 U.S.C. § 53(b) and § 57, to seek the relief it has requested.

7 7. Defendant HAINES has not admitted to liability as to the charges in the
8 Complaint, and his consent to entry of this permanent injunction shall not be
9 interpreted to constitute an admission that he has engaged in any violations of any
10 law or regulations.

8. Defendant HAINES waives all rights to seek judicial review or
 otherwise challenge or contest the validity of this Order.

9. Defendant HAINES waives any claim that he may hold against the
 Commission, its employees, representatives or agents.

15 10. Defendant HAINES waives any claim that he may hold under the
16 Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412 (as amended), concerning the
17 prosecution of this action to the date of this Order, and any rights to attorneys' fees
18 that may arise under said provision of law.

19

24

25

26

11. All parties shall bear their own costs and attorneys' fees.

20 12. Defendant HAINES enters into this Order freely and acknowledges that
21 he understands the provisions of this Order and is prepared to abide by its terms.

13. This Order is remedial in nature and shall not be construed as the
payment of a fine, penalty, punitive assessment, or forfeiture.

14. Entry of this Order is in the public interest.

DEFINITIONS

1. "<u>Assets</u>" means any legal or equitable interest in, right to, or claim to,
 any real and personal property, including but not limited to chattel, goods,

instruments, equipment, fixtures, general intangibles, effects, leaseholds, mail or
 other deliveries, inventory, checks, notes, accounts, credits, receivables, and all cash,
 wherever located.

2. "Document" is synonymous in meaning and equal in scope to the usage
of the term in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 34(a), and includes writings,
drawings, graphs, charts, photographs, audio and video recordings, electronic mail
("email"), computer records, and other data compilations from which information
can be obtained and translated, if necessary, through detection devices into
reasonably usable form. A draft or non-identical copy is a separate "document"
within the meaning of the term.

3. "Defendant" means WALTER HAINES by whatever names he might
be known.

13 4. "Corporate Defendants" or "Receivership Defendants" means Defendants NCC-AZ; NCC-CA; NCC-NV; LONDON FINANCIAL GROUP; 14 15 NATIONAL CONSUMER DEBT COUNCIL, LLC; SOLIDIUM, LLC; 16 UNITED CONSUMERS LAW GROUP, A PROFESSIONAL CORP.; J.P. 17 LANDIS, LLC; FINANCIAL RESCUE SERVICES, INC.; SIGNATURE EQUITIES, LLC; M&L SPRINGFIELD TRUST; PC HAILEY TRUST; and 18 19 VIA LIDO TRUST, their affiliates, subsidiaries, successors and assigns and any 20 other corporations or businesses under the control of any of them.

5. The terms "and" and "or" have both conjunctive and disjunctive
meanings to make the meaning more inclusive than exclusive.

6. "<u>Person</u>" means any individual, natural person, organization, or other
legal entity, including a corporation, partnership, proprietorship, association,
cooperative, government or governmental subdivision or agency, or any other group
or combination acting as an entity. For purposes of this Order, a "consumer" is a
person.

7. "<u>Debtor</u>" means any person indebted to a creditor or creditors.

28

1 2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

17

18

19

20

8.

"Debt negotiation" means:

a. the business or practice of receiving, in return for consideration, or the scheduled receipt, of a debtor's monies, or evidences thereof, for the purpose of distribution among certain specified creditors in payment, or partial payment, of the debtor's obligations; or

b. the business or practice of acting or offering or attempting to act as an intermediary between a debtor and his creditors for the purpose of settling, negotiating, or in any way altering the terms of payment of any debt of a debtor.

9. "<u>Credit-related products, programs or services</u>" means any product,
 program, or service which is advertised, offered for sale, or sold to consumers as a
 method by which consumers may establish or obtain any extension of credit or credit
 device, including, but not limited to, credit cards, loans, or financing, or as a method
 to consolidate or liquidate debts.

15 10. "<u>Assisting others</u>" means knowingly providing any of the following
16 goods or services to another person or entity:

a. performing customer service functions, including, but not limited to, receiving or responding to consumer complaints; or

b. formulating or providing, or arranging for the formulation or provision of, any telephone sales script or any other marketing material; or

c. providing names of, or assisting in the generation of, potential
customers; or

23

performing marketing services of any kind.

24 11. The "<u>Telemarketing Sales Rule</u>" means the FTC Rule entitled
25 "Telemarketing Sales Rule," 16 C.F.R. § 310.

12. "<u>Telemarketing</u>" means a plan, program, or campaign which is
conducted to induce the purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution,
by use of one or more telephones and which involves more than one interstate

d.

telephone call. The term does not include the solicitation of sales through the 1 2 mailing of a catalog which: contains a written description or illustration of the goods 3 or services offered for sale; includes the business address of the seller; includes multiple pages of written material or illustrations; and has been issued not less 4 5 frequently than once a year, when the person making the solicitation does not solicit 6 customers by telephone but only receives calls initiated by customers in response to 7 the catalog and during those calls takes orders only without further solicitation. For purposes of the previous sentence, the term "further solicitation" does not include 8 9 providing the customer with information about, or attempting to sell, any other item 10 included in the same catalog which prompted the customer's call or in a substantially 11 similar catalog.

12 13. "Outbound telephone call" means a telephone call initiated by a
13 telemarketer to induce the purchase of goods or services or to solicit a charitable
14 contribution.

15 14. "<u>Telemarketer</u>" means any person who, in connection with
16 telemarketing, initiates or receives telephone calls to or from a customer or donor.

17 15. In connection with telemarketing, a "customer" means any person who
18 is or may be required to pay for goods or services offered through telemarketing.

19 16. "Representatives" means successors, assigns, officers, agents, servants
20 and employees of Defendant and those persons in active concert or participation with
21 them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise.

17. "<u>Material</u>" means likely to affect a person's choice of, or conduct,
regarding, goods, services or a charitable contribution.

24 18. "<u>Clearly and Conspicuously</u>" or "<u>Clear and Conspicuous</u>" means
25 that:

a. in print communications, that the message shall be in a type size and location sufficiently noticeable for an ordinary consumer to read and comprehend it, in print that contrasts with the background against which it

26

27

28

appears;

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

b. in communications disseminated orally, that the message shall be delivered in a volume and cadence sufficient for an ordinary consumer to hear and comprehend it;

c. in communications made through an electronic medium (such as television, video, radio, and interactive media such as the Internet, online services and software), that the message shall be presented simultaneously in both the audio and visual portions of the communication;

d. in any communication presented solely through visual or audio means, that the message may be made through the same means in which the communication is presented:

i. Any audio message shall be delivered in a volume and cadence sufficient for an ordinary consumer to hear and comprehend it, and

ii. Any visual message shall be of a size and shade, with a degree of contrast to the background against which it appears and shall appear on the screen for a duration and in a location, sufficiently noticeable for an ordinary consumer to read and comprehend it;
 Regardless of the medium used to disseminate it, the message shall be in

understandable language and syntax. Nothing contrary to, inconsistent with, or in
mitigation of, the message shall be used in any communication.

19. "Established business relationship." means a relationship between the
seller and a person based on: (a) the person's purchase, rental, or lease of the
seller's goods or services or a financial transaction between the person and seller,
within the eighteen months immediately preceding the date of the telemarketing call;
or (b) the person's inquiry or application regarding a product or service offered by
the seller, within the three months immediately preceding the date of a telemarketing
call.

20. "<u>National Do Not Call Registry</u>" means the National Do Not Call
 Registry maintained by the Federal Trade Commission pursuant to 16 C.F.R.
 § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B).

ORDER

I.

PROHIBITION AGAINST MATERIAL MISREPRESENTATIONS

8 IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that Defendant, his successors, assigns, 9 officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and those persons or entities in 10 active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any 11 12 corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, in connection with the advertising. 13 marketing, promoting, offering for sale, or sale of any good or service, are hereby 14 permanently restrained and enjoined from misrepresenting, or assisting others in 15 misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, orally or in writing, any fact material to 16 a consumer's decision to buy or accept the good or service, including but not limited 17 to the ability to reduce the amount owed by a debtor to a creditor or Defendant's ability to have a positive effect on the debtor's credit report or credit history. 18

п.

PROHIBITION AGAINST MATERIAL OMISSIONS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant, his successors, assigns,
 officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and those persons or entities in
 active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this
 Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any
 corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, in connection with the advertising,
 promotion, offering for sale or sale of debt negotiation services or credit-related
 products, programs or services, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from

4

5

6

7

19

20

21

failing to disclose, clearly and conspicuously, prior to the time when a consumer
 purchases a service from Defendant all information material to a consumer's
 decision to buy any debt negotiation services or credit-related products, programs or
 services, including but not limited to the following information:

A. That while the consumer is using the product, program or services, late
fees, penalties, and interest will continue to accrue on the consumer's debt until the
consumer's creditors accept a settlement offer and the settlement is paid;

8 B. That while the consumer is using the product, program or services, the
9 consumer's creditors may still sue to collect on his debts, and further, once a
10 judgment has been obtained, the creditors may garnish the consumer's wages;

C. That while the consumer is using the product, program or services, the
consumer's creditors may raise the interest rates applicable to his debt;

D. That to the extent that Defendant may be able to obtain a favorable settlement with a consumer's creditor of the consumer's debt, the consumer is required to treat that debt savings as income for purposes of federal and state income taxes; and

E. That a debt settled for less than the full amount of the amount owed
may result in a negative notation on the consumer's credit report.

III.

PROHIBITION AGAINST

ABUSIVE TELEMARKETING PRACTICES

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, in connection with telemarketing,
 Defendant is hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from engaging in, or
 causing other persons to engage in, violations of the Telemarketing Sales Rule,
 including but not limited to:

A. Initiating any outbound telephone call to a person's telephone number
on the National Do Not Call Registry to induce the purchase of goods or services

19

20

21

22

1 unless the seller proves:

	Participation of the second participation of the second se	
2	1.	The seller has obtained the express agreement, in writing, of such
3		person to place calls to that person. Such written agreement shall
4		clearly evidence such consumer's authorization that calls made
5		by or on behalf of a specific party may be placed to that person,
6		and shall include the telephone number to which the calls may be
7		placed and the signature of that person; or
8	2.	The seller has an established business relationship with such
9		person and that person has not stated that he does not wish to
10		receive outbound telephone calls from the seller; or
11	B. Abar	doning any outbound telephone call to a person by failing to
12	connect the call to	a representative within two (2) seconds of the person's completed
13	greeting, unless th	e following four (4) conditions are met:
14	en en finsk skrywen i ster skrywen ster ster ster ster ster ster ster ster	Defendant employs technology that ensures abandonment of no
15 <u></u>		more than three (3) percent of all calls answered by a person,
16		measured per day per calling campaign;
17	2.	For each telemarketing call placed, Defendant allows the
18		telephone to ring for at least fifteen (15) seconds or four (4) rings
19		before disconnecting an unanswered call;
20	3.	Whenever a representative is not available to speak with the

3. Whenever a representative is not available to speak with the person answering the call within two (2) seconds after the person's completed greeting, the seller or telemarketer promptly plays a recorded message that states the name and telephone number of the seller on whose behalf the call was placed; and

4. Defendant retains records, in accordance with 16 C.F.R. § 310.5 (b)-(d), establishing compliance with the preceding three conditions; and

C. Initiating any outbound telephone call to a telephone number within a

given area code without first paying the required annual fee for access to the
 telephone numbers, within that area code, that are on the National Do Not Call
 Registry;

Provided, however, that if the Commission promulgates rules that modify or
supersede the Telemarketing Sales Rule, in whole or part, Defendant shall comply
fully and completely with all applicable requirements thereof, on and after the
effective date of any such rules.

IV.

MONITORING TELEMARKETING COMPLIANCE

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, in connection with any business that Defendant directly or indirectly manages, controls or has a majority ownership interest in, that engages in telemarketing, or assists others engaged in telemarketing, Defendant is hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from:

A. Failing to take reasonable steps to ensure that all employees and
independent contractors engaged in telemarketing comply with Paragraph III of this
Order. Such steps shall include:

18 19

20

21

22

23

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

- 1. Establishing a procedure for receiving and responding to consumer complaints of violations of the TSR or this Order; and
- 2. Ascertaining the number and nature of consumer complaints in which each employee or independent contractor is involved;

B. Failing promptly to investigate fully any consumer complaint received by any business to which this Paragraph applies; and

C. Failing to take corrective action with respect to any telemarketer whom
Defendant determines is not complying with this Order, which may include training,
disciplining, and/or terminating such sales person;

27 Provided, however, that this Paragraph does not authorize or require
28 Defendant to take any action that violates any federal, state, or local law.

PROHIBITION ON VIOLATING THE GRAMM-LEACH-BLILEY ACT

v.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, when acting as or on behalf of a financial institution, Defendant is hereby restrained and enjoined from violating any provision of Subtitle A of Title V of the Gramm-Leach-Bliley Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 6801-6809, and implementing regulations promulgated by the Commission at 16 C.F.R. Parts 313 and 314.

VI.

MONETARY RELIEF

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:

A. Within five (5) days after entry of this Order, but in any event no sooner than February 1, 2005, Defendant shall pay six hundred five thousand dollars (\$605,000) by certified or cashier's check made payable to the Federal Trade Commission or through wire transfer to an account designated by the Commission or its agent. Payment by certified or cashier's check shall be remitted to the Federal Trade Commission, Western Region, 10877 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 700, Los Angeles, California 90024;

B. If Defendant fails to make the payments under Paragraph VI A of this
Order within the prescribed time periods, the Commission may apply to the
Court for entry of a judgment against Defendant in the amount of \$84,333,293
(eighty-four million, three hundred thirty-three thousand, two hundred
ninety-three dollars) which amount shall be immediately due and payable,
less any amounts already paid. For purposes of this Paragraph, Defendant
waives any right to contest any of the allegations set forth in the Complaint
filed in this matter or the amount of the judgment and agrees that the Court
shall enter the monetary judgment in the amount of \$84,333,293 (eighty-four

million, three hundred thirty-three thousand, two hundred ninety-three dollars) upon a showing by the Commission that Defendant failed to make the payments as set forth under Paragraph VI A;

provided, that Defendant may cure a late payment by delivering such payment to the
Commission within five (5) days of the original payment date;

C. Defendant hereby assigns and transfers to the Commission all claims and causes of action that he may now have, whether known or unknown, or which he may acquire at a future date, relating to coverage and liability arising out of this specific litigation only, *FTC v. National Consumer Council, et al.*, SACV04-0474 CJC (JWJx), against any corporate insurance policy;

provided, that nothing in this Paragraph shall be interpreted as precluding Defendant
from making a claim against any policy for reimbursement of reasonable defense
fees and costs as may be permitted by the policy;

14 D. All funds paid pursuant to this Paragraph shall be deposited into a fund 15 administered by the Commission or its agent to be used for equitable relief, 16 including but not limited to restitution and any attendant expenses for the 17 administration of any restitution fund. In the event that direct restitution to 18 consumers is wholly or partially impracticable or funds remain after restitution is completed, the Commission may apply any remaining funds for such other 19 20 equitable relief (including consumer information remedies) as it determines to 21 be reasonably related to the practices alleged in the Complaint. Any funds not 22 used for such equitable relief shall be deposited to the Department of the 23 Treasury as disgorgement and not as a fine or penalty. The Commission shall 24 have full and sole discretion to:

25

26

27

28

1

2

3

6

7

8

9

10

1. Determine the criteria for participation by individual claimants in any consumer restitution program implemented pursuant to this Order;

2. Determine the manner and timing of any notices to be given to consumers regarding the existence and terms of such programs; and

3. Delegate any and all tasks connected with such restitution program to any individual, partnerships, or corporations; and pay reasonable fees, salaries, and expenses incurred thereby from the payments made pursuant to this Order;

E. Defendant expressly waives any rights he may possess to litigate the issue of monetary relief. Defendant acknowledges and agrees that all money paid pursuant to this Order is irrevocably paid to the Commission for purposes of settlement between Plaintiff and Defendant; and

F. Defendant shall have no right to challenge the Commission's choice of remedies under this Paragraph.

VII.

RELIANCE ON REPRESENTATIONS

14 If the IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

A. The Commission's agreement to, and the Court's approval of, this Order is expressly premised upon the truthfulness, accuracy, and completeness of Defendant's financial condition, as represented in the financial statement dated May 15, 2004, including attachments and in any other documents submitted by Defendant, including all supplements to that financial statement, all of which the Commission relied upon in negotiating and agreeing to the terms of this Order. If, upon motion by the Commission to the Court, the Court finds that Defendant, in any of the above-referenced materials, failed to disclose any asset with a value in excess of \$1,000, materially misrepresented the value of any asset, or made any other material misrepresentation or omission, monetary judgment will be entered against Defendant in the amount of \$84,333,293 (eighty-four million, three hundred thirty-three thousand, two hundred ninety-three dollars), which represents the approximate amount of payments made by consumers to all of the Defendants

and will become immediately due and payable, less any payments already made.

B. Notwithstanding any other provision of this Order, Defendant agrees that in any subsequent proceedings to enforce payment, including but not limited to a non-dischargeability complaint filed in a bankruptcy proceeding, Defendant waives any right to contest any of the allegations set forth in the Complaint filed in this matter or the \$84,333,293 (eighty-four million, three hundred thirty-three thousand, two hundred ninety-three dollars) judgment referenced above.

VIII.

CUSTOMER LISTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant, his officers, agents, servants, 13 employees, and attorneys, and all other persons or entities in active concert or 14 15 participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service 16 or otherwise, are permanently restrained and enjoined from selling, renting, leasing, 17 transferring, or otherwise disclosing the name, address, telephone number, credit 18 card number, bank account number, e-mail address, or other identifying information 19 of any person who paid any money to any of the Defendants in this litigation, FTC v. 20 National Consumer Council, Inc., et al, SACV04-0474 CJC (JWJx), or paid money 21 to any of the Corporate Defendants, at any time prior to entry of this order, in connection with telemarketing or with the advertising, promotion, offering for sale or 22 sale of debt negotiation services. Provided, however, that such identifying 23 information may be disclosed to a law enforcement agency or as required by any 24 25 law, regulation, or court order. 26 11

27 //

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

- 28 / /

1	IX.	
2	COMPLIANCE MONITORING	
3	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for the purpose of monitoring and	
4	investigating compliance with any provision of this Order:	
5	A. Within ten (10) days of receipt of written notice from a representative of	
6	the Commission, Defendant shall submit additional written reports, sworn to under	
7	penalty of perjury; produce documents for inspection and copying; appear for	ν
8	deposition; and/or provide entry during normal business hours to any business	
9	location in Defendant's possession or direct or indirect control for the purpose of	
10	inspecting the business operation;	
11	B. In addition, the Commission is authorized to monitor compliance with	
12	this Order by all other lawful means, including but not limited to the following:	
13	1. Obtaining discovery from any person, without further leave of	
14	court, using the procedures prescribed by Fed R. Civ. P. 30, 31,	nga bing
15	33, 34, 36, and 45;	
16	2. Posing as consumers and suppliers to Defendant's employees, or	
17	any other entity managed or controlled in whole or in part by	
18	Defendant, without the necessity of identification or prior notice;	
19	and	
20	C. Defendant shall permit representatives of the Commission to interview	
21	any employer, consultant, independent contractor, representative, agent, or employee	
22	who has agreed to such an interview, relating in any way to any conduct subject to	
23	this Order. The person interviewed may have counsel present.	
24	Provided, however, that nothing in this Order shall limit the Commission's	
25	lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15	
26	U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1, to obtain any documentary material, tangible things, testimony,	
27	or information relevant to unfair or deceptive acts or practices in or affecting	
28	commerce (within the meaning of 15 U.S.C. § 45(a)(1)).	

 \bigcirc ·

1	X.
2	COMPLIANCE REPORTING BY DEFENDANT
3	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, in order that compliance with the
4	provisions of this Order may be monitored:
5	A. For a period of five (5) years from the date of entry of this Order,
6	1. Defendant shall notify the Commission of the following:
7	a. Any changes in his residence, mailing addresses, and
8	telephone numbers, within ten (10) days of the date of such
9	changes;
10	b. Any changes in his employment status (including self-
11	employment), and any changes in the ownership of, or
12	interest in, any business entity, within ten (10) days of the
13	date of such change. Such notice shall include the name
14	and address of each business that he is affiliated with,
15	employed by, creates or forms, or performs services for; a
16	statement of the nature of the business; and a statement of
17	his duties and responsibilities in connection with the
18	business or employment; and
19	c. Any changes in Defendant's name or use of any aliases or
20	fictitious names; and
21	2. Defendant shall notify the Commission of any changes in
22	corporate structure of any business entity that he directly or indirectly
23	controls, or has an ownership interest in, that may affect compliance
24	obligations arising under this Order, including but not limited to a dissolution,
25	assignment, sale, merger, or other action that would result in the emergence of
26	a successor entity; the creation or dissolution of a subsidiary, parent, or
27	affiliate that engages in any acts or practices subject to this Order; the filing of
28	a bankruptcy petition; or a change in the corporate name or address, at least

.

thirty (30) days prior to such change, <i>provided</i> that, with respect to any
proposed change in the corporation about which Defendant learns less than
thirty (30) days prior to the date such action is to take place, he shall notify the
Commission as soon as is practicable after obtaining such knowledge.

B. One hundred eighty (180) days after the date of entry of this Order,
Defendant shall provide a written report to the Commission, sworn to under penalty
of perjury, setting forth in detail the manner and form in which he has complied and
is complying with this Order. This report shall include, but not be limited to:

9 10

15

16

17.

18

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

 his then-current residence address, mailing addresses, and telephone numbers;

11
2. his then-current employment and business addresses and
12
13
14
14
2. his then-current employment and business addresses and
15. telephone numbers, a description of the business activities of
16. telephone numbers, a description of the business activities of
17. telephone numbers, a description of the business activities of
18. telephone numbers, a description of the business activities of
19. telephone numbers, a description of the business activities of
19. telephone numbers, a description of the business activities of
19. telephone numbers, a description of the business activities of
19. telephone numbers, a description of the business activities of
19. telephone numbers, a description of the business activities of
19. telephone numbers, a description of the business activities of
19. telephone numbers, a description of the business activities of
19. telephone numbers, a description of the business activities of
19. telephone numbers, a description of the business activities of
19. telephone numbers, a description of the business activities of
19. telephone numbers, a description of the business activities of
19. telephone numbers, a description of the business activities of
19. telephone numbers, a description of the business activities of
19. telephone numbers, a description of telepho

- A copy of each acknowledgment of receipt of this Order,
 obtained pursuant to Paragraph XII, below; and
 - Any other changes required to be reported under Subparagraph A of this Paragraph X, above.

C. For the purposes of this Order, Defendant shall, unless otherwise
directed by the Commission's authorized representatives, mail all written

21 notifications to the Commission to:

Assistant Regional Director
Western Region, Los Angeles
Federal Trade Commission
10877 Wilshire Blvd, Suite 700
Los Angeles, CA 90024
Re: FTC v. National Consumer Council, et al.,
Case No. CV-04-0474 CJC (JWJx)

D. For purposes of the compliance reporting and monitoring required by
this Order, the Commission is authorized to communicate directly with Defendant.

1		XI.
2		RECORD KEEPING PROVISIONS
3	IT IS	FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of eight (8) years from the
4	date of entr	y of this Order, Defendant and his agents, employees, officers,
5	corporation	s, successors, and assigns, and those persons in active concert or
6	participation	n with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal
7	service or o	therwise, in connection with any business where Defendant is the
8	majority ow	mer of the business or directly or indirectly manages or controls the
9	business, ar	e hereby restrained and enjoined from failing to create and retain the
10	following re	ecords:
11	А.	Accounting records that reflect the cost of goods or services sold,
12		revenues generated, and the disbursement of such revenues;
13	B.	Personnel records accurately reflecting: the name, address, email (if
14		any) and telephone number of each person employed in any capacity by
15		such business, including as an independent contractor; that person's job
16		title or position; the date upon which the person commenced work; and
17		the date and reason for the person's termination, if applicable;
18	С.	Customer files containing the names, addresses, phone numbers, dollar
19		amounts paid, quantity of items or services purchased, and description
20		of items or services purchased, to the extent such information is
21		obtained in the ordinary course of business;
22	D.	Complaints and refund requests (whether received directly, indirectly or
23		through any third party) and any responses to those complaints or
24		requests;
25	E.	Copies of all sales scripts, training materials, advertisements, website
26		printouts, or other marketing materials; and
27	F.	All records and documents necessary to demonstrate full compliance
28		with each provision of this Order, including but not limited to copies of

· ··

1		acknowledgments of receipt of this Order required by Paragraph XII,
2		below, and all reports submitted to the FTC pursuant to Paragraph X,
3		above.
4		
5		XII.
6		DISTRIBUTION OF ORDER BY DEFENDANT
7	IT IS	S FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of five (5) years from the
8	date of entr	y of this Order, Defendant shall deliver copies of this Order as directed
9	below:	
10	А.	For any business that he controls, directly or indirectly, or in which he
11		has a majority ownership interest, he must deliver a copy of this Order
12		to all principals, officers, directors, and managers of that business.
. 13	a a tana a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a	Defendant must also deliver copies of this Order to all employees,
3 (0.14	Alfred and and a	agents, and representatives of that business who engage in conduct
15		related to the subject matter of the Order. For current personnel,
16		delivery shall be within (5) days of service of this Order upon each of
17		the Defendants. For new personnel, delivery shall occur prior to them
18		assuming their responsibilities.
19	В.	For any business where Defendant is not a controlling person of a
20		business but he otherwise engages in conduct related to the subject
21		matter of this Order, he must deliver a copy of this Order to his
22		immediate supervisor or manager of such business before engaging in
23		such conduct.
24	C.	Defendant must secure a signed and dated statement acknowledging
25		receipt of the Order, within thirty days of delivery, from all persons
26		receiving a copy of the Order pursuant to this Paragraph.
27		
28		

f.....

21

. •

_	
1	XIII.
2	ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF RECEIPT OF ORDER
3	BY DEFENDANT
4	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, within five (5) business days of receipt
5	of this Order as entered by the Court, Defendant must submit to the Commission a
6	truthful sworn and notarized statement, or a sworn declaration pursuant to 28 U.S.C.
7	§ 1746, acknowledging receipt of this Order.
8	
9	XIV.
10	SEVERABILITY
11	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the provisions of this Order are separate
12	and severable from one another. If any provision is stayed or determined to be
13	invalid, all of the remaining provisions shall remain in full force and effect.
14	That is present to the second s
15	
16	11
17	11
18	11
19	11
20	11
21	11
22	//
23	11
24	//
25	11
26	//
27	11
28	//

1	XV.
2	RETENTION OF JURISDICTION
3	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Court shall retain jurisdiction of this
4	matter for purposes of construction, modification and enforcement of this Order.
5	
б	SO STIPULATED:
7	Dated: March 29, 2005 Jenniter Larabee
8	Faye Chen Bamouw Ray McKown
9	Kenneth Abbe Attorneys for Plaintiff
10	Federal Trade Commission
11	98 and love 2 than
12	Dated: December 2, 2004 WALTER HAUNES, detendant
13	APPROVED AS TO FORM:
14 15	and a second second from the first of the fi
16	Dated: December 28, 2004 Mrchael Mallow, Esq. Attorney for Defendant
10	Attorney for Defendant
18	IT IS SO ORDERED, this day of $,2005, at$
19	IT IS'SO ORDERED, this day of, 2005, atm.
20	
21	Cormac J. Camey United States District Court Judge
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	

23

Proposal Flool sop.HAINES.28dec04