1	The Honorable Ricardo S. Martinez		
2			
3			
4			
5			
6			
7			
8 9	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON AT SEATTLE		
10			
11	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION,	CIVIL ACTION NO.: CV04-1852RSM	
12	Plaintiff,		
13	v.	AMENDED PRELIMINARY	
14	JOHN STEFANCHIK, individually and as an officer and director of Beringer Corporation,	INJUNCTION AND ORDER FOR OTHER EQUITABLE RELIEF AS TO	
15 16	SCOTT B. CHRISTENSEN, individually and as an officer and director of Atlas Marketing, Inc.,	DEFENDANTS JOHN STEFANCHIK AND THE BERINGER CORPORATION	
17 18	BERINGER CORPORATION, dba The Stefanchik Organization, a Washington corporation, and		
19 20	ATLAS MARKETING, INC., also dba The Stefanchik Organization, a Nevada Corporation,		
21	Defendants.		
22			
23	Plaintiff, the Federal Trade Commission ("Commission" or "FTC"), has filed a Complaint		
24			
25			
26			
27	Stefanchik Organization," with deceptive acts and		
28	2001 and Commencer, with deceptive dets and	p-1111111 in connection with the effect than the	

Internet marketing and telemarketing of course materials, in-person workshops, videotapes, audio tapes and other products and services that purport to teach consumers how to make money brokering, purchasing, and/or reselling privately held mortgages or promissory notes that are secured by real property. The Commission's Complaint alleges that these defendants' deceptive acts and practices violate Section 5(a) of the Federal Trade Commission Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a), and the FTC's Trade Regulation Rule entitled "Telemarketing Sales Rule" ("TSR" or "Rule"), 16 C.F.R. Part 310, as amended.

The Commission also has filed a Motion for a Preliminary Injunction and Other Equitable Relief ("Motion") against defendants John Stefanchik, Scott B. Christensen, Beringer Corporation, and Atlas Marketing, Inc., seeking preliminary relief in connection with the acts and practices alleged in the Complaint. Since then, defendants Scott B. Christensen and Atlas Marketing, Inc., stipulated to a preliminary injunction, which the Court entered on October 20, 2004, and a hearing was held on December 9, 2004, to determine whether a preliminary injunction should be entered against the remaining defendants, John Stefanchik and Beringer Corporation (hereinafter "Defendants").

The Court, being advised in the premises, finds as follows:

# **FINDINGS**

- 1. This is an action by the Commission instituted under Sections 13(b) and 19 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 53(b) and 57b. Pursuant to this section, the Commission has the authority to seek the relief contained herein.
- 2. The Commission's Complaint states claims upon which relief may be granted against Defendants under Sections 5(a), 13(b), and 19 of the Federal Trade Commission Act ("FTC Act"), 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a), 53(b), and 57b, and the Telemarketing and Consumer Fraud and Abuse Prevention Act ("Telemarketing Act"), 15 U.S.C. § 6101 *et seq*.
- 3. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this case and all parties hereto. Venue in the Western District of Washington is proper.

- 4. The acts and practices of the Defendants are in or affecting commerce, as defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.
- 5. This Court has the authority to grant a preliminary injunction and other appropriate relief pursuant to Section 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 53(b) and Rule 65 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. FTC v. Gem Merch. Corp., 87 F.3d 466, 468-69 (11<sup>th</sup> Cir. 1996); FTC v. World Travel Vacation Brokers, Inc., 861 F.2d 1020, 1025-26 (7<sup>th</sup> Cir. 1988).
- 6. Section 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 53(b), authorizes the issuance of such preliminary relief upon a proper showing that, weighing the equities and considering the Commission's likelihood of ultimate success, such action would be in the public interest.
- 7. Section 5(a) of the FTC Act prohibits deceptive acts and practices in or affecting commerce. To be deceptive, an act or practice must be one that is likely to mislead consumers acting reasonably under the circumstances, and is material. <u>FTC v. Pantron I Corp.</u>, 33 F.3d 1088, 1095 (9<sup>th</sup> Cir. 1994), *citing* <u>Cliffdale Assocs.</u>, Inc., 103 F.T.C. 110, 164-65 (1984).
- 8. The Telemarketing Sales Rule prohibits telemarketers and sellers from misrepresenting directly or by implication, any material aspect of the performance, efficacy, nature or central characteristics of goods or services that are the subject of a sales offer, 16 C.F.R. §310.3(a)(2)(iii), and from making a false or misleading statement to induce any person to pay for goods and services, 16 C.F.R. §310.3(a)(4).
- 9. Defendants are "sellers" or "telemarketers" engaged in "telemarketing" as those terms are defined in the Telemarketing Sales Rule. 16 C.F.R. § 310.2(cc).
- 10. The FTC has demonstrated a likelihood of success on the merits under Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and under the TSR. As demonstrated by the excerpts taken from Defendants' direct mail pieces, Internet web site, telemarketing scripts, and sworn consumer declarations, the Defendants have claimed that consumers who purchase Defendants' products or services will quickly make large amounts of money in their spare time by learning and using the methods taught therein, and that Defendants' personal coaching service is staffed by persons substantially experienced in the paper business who are readily available by telephone to assist consumers in finding and completing paper transactions. As demonstrated by the declarations of

consumers and Manoj Hastak, Ph.D., and the results of the survey Dr. Hastak has conducted of Defendants' purchasers, these claims are likely to be false and/or unsubstantiated and in violation of both Section 5(a)of the FTC Act and the TSR.

11. Weighing the equities and considering the FTC's likelihood of success, entry of this Preliminary Injunction and Order for Other Equitable Relief ("Order") is in the public interest.

## **DEFINITIONS**

- 1. "**Defendants**" means John Stefanchik and Beringer Corporation, doing business collectively with the other defendants in this action as "The Stefanchik Organization," and each of them, by whatever names each might be known, as well as their successors and assigns, whether acting directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division or other device.
- 2. "Assisting others" means knowingly providing any of the following goods or services to another entity: (1) performing customer service functions, including, but not limited to, receiving or responding to consumer complaints; (2) formulating or providing, or arranging for the formulation or provision of, any telephone sales script or any other marketing material; (3) providing names of, or assisting in the generation of, potential customers; (4) providing the fulfillment services for the marketing or sale of any product or service; or (5) performing marketing services of any kind.
- 3. "Document" is synonymous in meaning and equal in scope to the usage of the term in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 34(a), and includes writings, drawings, graphs, charts, photographs, audio and video recordings, computer records, and other data compilations from which information can be obtained and translated, if necessary, through detection devices into reasonably usable form. A draft or non-identical copy is a separate document within the meaning of the term.
- 4. "**Paper Business**" means the business of finding, brokering, creating, purchasing, and/or selling privately held mortgages or promissory notes that are secured by real property.
- 5. "**Person**" means any individual, group, unincorporated association, limited or general partnership, corporation or other business entity.

6. "Target product or service" means course materials, in-person workshops, seminars, videotapes, audio tapes, personal coaching services, and other products and services that purport to teach consumers how to find, broker, create, purchase, and/or sell privately held mortgages or promissory notes that are secured by real property.

#### I. PROHIBITED PRACTICES

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that Defendants and their officers, agents, directors, employees, salespersons, independent contractors, subsidiaries, affiliates, successors, assigns, and all other persons or entities in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, including by facsimile, in connection with the advertising, promotion, marketing, offering for sale, or sale of any target product or service, are hereby restrained and enjoined from:

- A. Misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, that consumers who purchase Defendants' products or services will make a substantial amount of money;
- B. Misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, the income, profit, or sales volume that consumers who purchase Defendants' products or services may or are likely to achieve;
- C. Misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, the income, profit, or sales volume achieved by consumers who previously purchased Defendants' products or services;
- D. Misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, that any services offered by Defendants are provided by persons substantially experienced in the paper business, or that such persons are readily available to assist consumers in finding or completing transactions in the paper business;
- E. Representing, expressly or by implication, that consumers who purchase Defendants' products or services will make a substantial amount of money, unless Defendants possess and rely upon a reasonable basis to substantiate the representation at the time the representation is made;
- F. Misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, any fact material to a consumer's decision to purchase any product or service;

- G. In connection with telemarketing, as defined in the Telemarketing Sales Rule, violating or assisting others to violate any provision of the Rule, including, but not limited to:
  - 1. Misrepresenting, directly or by implication, any material aspect of the performance, efficacy, nature, or central characteristics of goods or services that are the subject of the sales offer, in violation of Section 310.3(a)(2)(iii) of the Rule, 16 C.F.R. § 310.3(a)(2)(iii); and
  - 2. Making a false or misleading statement to induce any person to pay for any good or service in violation of Section 310.3(a)(4) of the Rule, 16 C.F.R. § 310.3(a)(4).

#### II. NOTICE OF CORPORATE OR PERSONAL ASSET TRANSACTIONS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants and their officers, agents, directors, employees, salespersons, independent contractors, subsidiaries, affiliates, successors, assigns, and all other persons or entities in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, including by facsimile, are hereby restrained and enjoined from any transfer of any money or tangible or intangible assets or any expenditure with a value of over ten thousand dollars (\$10,000.00) from the date of entry of this Order, without disclosing to the Commission, at least five (5) business days prior to the transfer or expenditure, the purpose and recipient of such transfer or expenditure. The funds, property, and assets affected by this Part shall include both existing assets and assets acquired after the date of entry of this Order, including, without limitation, those acquired by loan or gift.

# III. PROHIBITED DISCLOSURE OF CONSUMER LISTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants and their officers, agents, directors, employees, salespersons, independent contractors, subsidiaries, affiliates, successors, assigns, and all other persons or entities in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, including by facsimile, are hereby restrained and enjoined from selling, renting, leasing, transferring, or otherwise disclosing the name, address,

# 

telephone number, credit card number, bank account number, e-mail address, or other identifying information of any person who has paid any money to any Defendant in connection with promoting, offering for sale, selling, or participating in the sale of, directly or indirectly, any target product or service. *Provided*, however, that Defendants may disclose such identifying information to a law enforcement agency or as required by any law, regulation, or court order.

## IV. RECORD KEEPING/BUSINESS OPERATIONS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, and their officers, agents, directors, employees, salespersons, independent contractors, subsidiaries, affiliates, successors, assigns, and all other persons or entities in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, including by facsimile, in connection with the advertising, promotion, marketing, offering for sale, or sale of any target product or service, are hereby restrained and enjoined from:

- A. Failing to create and maintain documents that, in reasonable detail, accurately, fairly, and completely reflect the Defendants' incomes, disbursements, transactions, and use of money, beginning as of the date of entry of this Order;
- B. Failing to make and keep books, records, accounts, bank statements, current accountants' reports, general ledgers, general journals, cash receipt ledgers, cash disbursement ledgers and source documents, documents indicating title to real or personal property, and any other documents or electronic data which, in reasonable detail, accurately and fairly reflect the transactions and dispositions of the assets of defendants;
- C. Destroying, mutilating, concealing, altering, transferring, or otherwise disposing of, in any manner, any books, records, tapes, discs, accounting data, checks (fronts and backs), correspondence, forms, advertisements, brochures, manuals, electronically stored data, banking records, customer lists, customer files, invoices, telephone records, ledgers, payroll records, or other documents of any kind, including information stored in computer-maintained form, in their possession, custody or control, and other documents or records of any kind that relate to the business practices or finances of the Defendants;

D. Failing to maintain complete records of any consumer complaints and disputes, whether coming from the consumer or any intermediary, such as a government agency or Better Business Bureau, and any responses made to those complaints or disputes; and

E. Creating, operating or exercising any control over any business entity, including any partnership, limited partnership, joint venture, sole proprietorship, or corporation, without first providing the Commission with a written statement disclosing: (1) the name of the business entity; (2) the address and telephone number of the business entity; (3) the names of the business entity's officers, directors, principals, managers, and employees; and (4) a detailed description of the business entity's intended activities.

#### V. MONITORING COMPLIANCE OF SALES PERSONNEL

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, in connection with any business where (1) a Defendant is the majority owner of the business or directly or indirectly manages or controls the business, and (2) the business is engaged in telemarketing or marketing or assisting others engaged in telemarketing or marketing of the target product or service, or seminar or other tool purported to teach consumers how to succeed in the paper business, are hereby restrained and enjoined from:

A. Failing to take reasonable steps sufficient to monitor and ensure that all employees and independent contractors engaged in sales or other customer service functions comply with Part I of this Order. Such steps shall include reviewing telemarketing scripts, adequate monitoring of sales presentations or other calls with customers and, shall also include, at a minimum, the following: (1) listening to the oral representations made by persons engaged in sales or other customer service functions; (2) establishing a procedure for receiving and responding to consumer complaints; and (3) ascertaining the number and nature of consumer complaints regarding transactions in which each employee or independent contractor is involved; *provided* that this Part does not authorize or require the Defendants to take any steps that violate any federal, state, or local laws;

- B. Failing promptly to investigate fully any consumer complaint received by any business to which this Part applies; and
- C. Failing to take corrective action with respect to any sales person whom Defendants determine is not complying with this Order, which may include training, disciplining, and/or terminating such sales person.

## VI. DISTRIBUTION OF ORDER BY DEFENDANTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants shall immediately provide a copy of this Order to each affiliate, partner, subsidiary, division, sales entity, successor, assign, officer, director, employee, independent contractor, agent, attorney, fulfillment house, call center, and representative of the Defendants, and within ten (10) calendar days following service of this Order by the Commission, shall serve upon Nadine Samter, Esq., 915 Second Avenue, Suite 2896, Seattle, WA 98174, an affidavit identifying the names, titles, addresses, and telephone numbers of the persons and entities that Defendants have served with a copy of this Order in compliance with this provision.

## VII. SERVICE OF THIS ORDER BY PLAINTIFF

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that copies of this Order may be served by facsimile transmission, personal or overnight delivery, or U.S. Mail, by agents and employees of the Commission or any state or federal law enforcement agency, on (1) the Defendants, or (2) any other person or entity that may be subject to any provision of this Order. Service upon any branch or office of any entity shall effect service upon the entire entity.

## VIII. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that this Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter for all purposes.

1	<b>SO ORDERED</b> , this3 day of, 2005.	
2	_/S/ Ricardo S. Martinez	
3	The Honorable Ricardo S. Martinez United States District Judge	
4		
5		
6		
7	Respectfully presented by:	
8 9	<u>s/Nadine Samter</u> Nadine S. Samter, WSBA # 23881 Eleanor Durham, Member MD Bar	
10	Kial Young, Mass Bar # 633515 Federal Trade Commission	
11	915 Second Ave., Suite 2896 Seattle, WA 98174	
12	(206) 220-6350 FAX (206) 220-6366	
13	EMAIL: nsamter@ftc.gov edurham@ftc.gov	
14	kyoung@ftc.gov	
<ul><li>15</li><li>16</li></ul>	ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFF FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION	
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		