

✓  
FILED  
RECEIVED  
FEDERAL BUREAU OF INVESTIGATION  
2004 AUG 30 A 9 22  
U.S. DISTRICT COURT  
DISTRICT OF NEVADA  
F. B. I. U.S. DEPT. OF JUSTICE

1 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
PETER D. KEISLER, JR.  
2 Assistant Attorney General  
Civil Division  
3 U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE  
DANIEL G. BOGDEN  
4 United States Attorney  
District of Nevada  
5 ROGER W. WENTHE  
Assistant United States Attorney  
6 333 Las Vegas Blvd. So., #5000  
Las Vegas, Nevada 89101  
7 Ph: (702) 388-6336  
Fax: (702) 388-6787

8 Attorneys for United States.

9  
10 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
11 DISTRICT OF NEVADA

12 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,  
13 Plaintiff,

CV-S-04-1209-DWH-PAL

14 v.  
BRAGLIA MARKETING GROUP,  
15 LLC, a Nevada limited liability company,  
FRANK BRAGLIA, individually and as an  
16 owner and manager of Braglia Marketing  
Group, LLC, and KATE BRAGLIA,  
17 individually and as an owner and manager  
of Braglia Marketing Group, LLC,  
18 Defendants.

COMPLAINT FOR CIVIL PENALTIES,  
PERMANENT INJUNCTION, AND OTHER  
RELIEF

19  
20 Plaintiff, the United States of America, acting upon notification and authorization to the  
21 Attorney General by the Federal Trade Commission ("FTC" or "Commission"), pursuant to  
22 Section 16(a)(1) of the Federal Trade Commission Act ("FTC Act"), 15 U.S.C. § 56(a)(1), for its  
23 complaint alleges:

- 24 1. Plaintiff brings this action under Sections 5(a), 5(m)(1)(A), 13(b), 16(a) and 19 of the  
25 FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a), 45(m)(1)(A), 53(b), 56(a) and 57b, and Section 6 of the  
26 Telemarketing and Consumer Fraud and Abuse Prevention Act (the "Telemarketing

1 Act”), 15 U.S.C. § 6105, to obtain monetary civil penalties, a permanent injunction, and  
2 2. other equitable relief for defendants’ violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C.  
3 § 45(a), and the FTC’s Telemarketing Sales Rule (the “TSR” or “Rule”), 16 C.F.R.  
4 Part 310, as amended by 68 Fed. Reg. 4580, 4669 (January 29, 2003).

5 **JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

6 3. This Court has subject matter jurisdiction over this action pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331,  
7 1337(a), 1345, and 1355, and 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(m)(1)(A), 53(b), 56(a) and 57b. This  
8 action arises under 15 U.S.C. § 45(a).

9 4. Venue is proper in this District under 28 U.S.C. §§ 1391(b)-(c) and 1395(a), and 15  
10 U.S.C. § 53(b).

11 **DEFENDANTS**

12 5. Defendant Braglia Marketing Group, LLC (“BMG”) is a Nevada limited liability  
13 company with its principal place of business at 4495 W. Hacienda Ave., Las Vegas,  
14 Nevada 89118. BMG is a telemarketer that initiates outbound telephone calls to induce  
15 consumers to purchase goods or services from sellers, including but not limited to the  
16 Atlantic City, New Jersey timeshare resort properties of Flagship Resort Development  
17 Corporation and Atlantic Palace Development, LLC. BMG transacts or has transacted  
18 business in this District.

19 6. Defendant Frank Braglia is a fifty-percent owner and one of the two managers of BMG.  
20 He is the spouse of defendant Kate Braglia. In connection with the matters alleged  
21 herein, he resides or has transacted business in this District. At all times material to this  
22 complaint, acting alone or in concert with others, he has formulated, directed, controlled,  
23 or participated in the acts and practices of BMG, including the acts and practices set forth  
24 in this complaint.

25 7. Defendant Kate Braglia is the other fifty-percent owner of and the other manager of  
26

1 BMG. She is the spouse of defendant Frank Braglia. In connection with the matters  
2 alleged herein, she resides or has transacted business in this District. At all times material  
3 to this complaint, acting alone or in concert with others, she has formulated, directed,  
4 controlled, or participated in the acts and practices of BMG, including the acts and  
5 practices set forth in this complaint.

6 **THE TELEMARKETING SALES RULE**  
7 **AND THE NATIONAL DO NOT CALL REGISTRY**

- 8 8. In 1994, Congress directed the FTC to prescribe rules prohibiting abusive and deceptive  
9 telemarketing acts or practices pursuant to the Telemarketing Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 6101-  
10 6108. On August 16, 1995, the FTC adopted the Telemarketing Sales Rule  
11 9. (the "Original TSR"), 16 C.F.R. Part 310, which became effective on December 31, 1995.  
12 On January 29, 2003, the FTC amended the TSR by issuing a final amended TSR and a  
13 Statement of Basis and Purpose (the "Amended TSR"). 68 Fed. Reg. 4580, 4669.  
14 10. Among other things, the Amended TSR established a "do-not-call" registry, maintained  
15 by the Commission (the "National Do Not Call Registry" or "Registry"), of consumers  
16 who do not wish to receive certain types of telemarketing calls. Consumers register their  
17 telephone numbers on the Registry without charge either through a toll-free telephone call  
18 or over the Internet at donotcall.gov.  
19 11. Sellers, telemarketers, and other permitted organizations can access the Registry over the  
20 Internet at telemarketing.donotcall.gov to download the registered numbers, after paying  
21 the appropriate annual fee as set forth in 16 C.F.R. § 310.8(c).  
22 12. It is a violation of the Amended TSR for sellers and telemarketers subject to the FTC's  
23 jurisdiction to call numbers on the Registry. 16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B). In addition,  
24 sellers and telemarketers are prohibited from abandoning any outbound telephone call by  
25 not connecting the call to a representative within two (2) seconds of the consumer's  
26

1 completed greeting. 16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(iv). Finally, sellers and telemarketers are  
2 also prohibited from calling any telephone number within a given area code, unless the  
3 seller has first paid the annual fee for access to the telephone numbers, within that area  
4 code, that are included in the Registry. 16 C.F.R. § 310.8(a) and (b).

5 13. Consumers who receive telemarketing calls to their registered numbers can complain of  
6 Registry violations the same way they registered, through a toll-free telephone call or  
7 over the Internet at [donotcall.gov](http://donotcall.gov), or by otherwise contacting law enforcement  
8 authorities.

9 14. On or after September 2, 2003, the FTC opened access for sellers and telemarketers to  
10 begin registering, paying the fee(s) for, and accessing the Registry.

11 15. On or after October 1, 2003, the FTC began enforcement of the Amended TSR's  
12 prohibition against sellers and telemarketers abandoning outbound calls to consumers.

13 16. On or after October 17, 2003, the FTC began enforcement of the National Do Not Call  
14 Registry against sellers and telemarketers.

15 17. Pursuant to Section 3(c) of the Telemarketing Act, 15 U.S.C. § 6102(c), and Section  
16 18(d)(3) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 57a(d)(3), a violation of the TSR constitutes an  
17 unfair or deceptive act or practice in or affecting commerce, in violation of Section 5(a)  
18 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a).

19 **DEFENDANTS' BUSINESS ACTIVITIES**

20 18. BMG is a "telemarketer" engaged in "telemarketing," as defined by the Amended TSR,  
21 16 C.F.R. § 310.2.

22 19. On or after October 17, 2003, in connection with telemarketing, BMG has placed, or  
23 caused others to place, more than 300,000 calls to consumers' telephone numbers that are  
24 on the National Do Not Call Registry.

25 20. On or after October 17, 2003, in connection with telemarketing, BMG has placed, or  
26

1 caused others to place, more than 10,000 calls to telephone numbers in various area codes  
2 without the seller on whose behalf BMG was calling first paying the annual fee for access  
3 to the telephone numbers, within that area code, that are on the National Do Not Call  
4 Registry.

5 21. On or after October 1, 2003, in connection with telemarketing, BMG has abandoned, or  
6 caused others to abandon, outbound telephone calls to consumers by failing to connect  
7 the call to a representative within two (2) seconds of the consumer's completed greeting.

8 22. At all times relevant to this complaint, BMG has maintained a substantial course of trade  
9 or business in the offering for sale and sale of goods or services via the telephone, in or  
10 affecting commerce, as "commerce" is defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C.  
11 § 44.

12 **VIOLATIONS OF THE TELEMARKETING SALES RULE**

13 **Count I**

14 **(Violating the National Do Not Call Registry)**

15 23. In numerous instances, in connection with telemarketing, defendants have initiated, or  
16 caused others to initiate, an outbound telephone call to a person's telephone number on  
17 the National Do Not Call Registry in violation of the TSR, 16 C.F.R.  
18 § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B).

19 **Count II**

20 **(Abandoning Calls)**

21  
22 24. In numerous instances, in connection with telemarketing, defendants have abandoned, or  
23 caused others to abandon, an outbound telephone call by failing to connect the call to a  
24 sales representative within two (2) seconds of the completed greeting of the person  
25 answering the call, in violation of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(iv) and § 310.4(b)(4).  
26

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26

**Count III**

**(Failing to Pay the Fee to Access the National Do Not Call Registry)**

25. In numerous instances, in connection with telemarketing, defendants have initiated, or caused others to initiate, an outbound telephone call to a telephone number within a given area code without defendants' seller first paying the required annual fee for access to the telephone numbers, within that area code, that are on the National Do Not Call Registry, in violation of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. § 310.8.

**CONSUMER INJURY**

26. Consumers in the United States have suffered and will suffer injury as a result of defendants' violations of the TSR. Absent injunctive relief by this Court, defendants are likely to continue to injure consumers and harm the public interest.

**THIS COURT'S POWER TO GRANT RELIEF**

27. Section 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 53(b), empowers this Court to grant injunctive and other ancillary relief to prevent and remedy any violation of any provision of law enforced by the FTC.

28. Section 5(m)(1)(A) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(m)(1)(A), as modified by Section 4 of the Federal Civil Penalties Inflation Adjustment Act of 1990, 28 U.S.C. § 2461, as amended, and as implemented by 16 C.F.R. § 1.98(d) (1997), authorizes this Court to award monetary civil penalties of not more than \$11,000 for each violation of the TSR. Defendants' violations of the TSR were committed with the knowledge required by Section 5(m)(1)(A) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(m)(1)(A).

29. This Court, in the exercise of its equitable jurisdiction, may award ancillary relief to remedy injury caused by defendants' violations of the Rule and the FTC Act.

**PRAYER FOR RELIEF**

WHEREFORE, plaintiff requests that this Court, as authorized by Sections 5(a),

1 5(m)(1)(A), 13(b) and 19 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a), 45(m)(1)(A), 53(b) and 57b, and  
2 pursuant to its own equitable powers:

- 3 1. Enter judgment against defendants and in favor of plaintiff for each violation alleged in  
4 this complaint;
- 5 2. Award plaintiff monetary civil penalties from defendants for every violation of the TSR;
- 6 3. Permanently enjoin defendants from violating the TSR and the FTC Act;
- 7 4. Order defendants to pay the costs of this action; and
- 8 5. Award plaintiff such other and additional relief as the Court may determine to be just and  
9 proper.

10  
11 Dated: August 30, 2004


12 OF COUNSEL  
13 EILEEN HARRINGTON  
14 Associate Director for Marketing Practices  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

15 Michael J. Davis  
16 Attorney  
17 Federal Trade Commission  
600 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., Rm. 238  
18 Washington, DC 20580  
PHONE: 202-326-2458  
FAX: 202-326-3395

Respectfully submitted,

FOR THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
PETER D. KEISLER, JR.  
Assistant Attorney General  
Civil Division  
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE

DANIEL G. BOGDEN  
United States Attorney

  
ROGER W. WENTHE  
Assistant United States Attorney

EUGENE M. THIROLF  
Director  
Office of Consumer Litigation

ELIZABETH STEIN  
Trial Attorney  
Office of Consumer Litigation  
U.S. Department of Justice  
P.O. Box 386  
Washington, D.C. 20044  
PHONE: 202-307-0486  
FAX: 202-514-8742  
Elizabeth.Stein2@usdoj.gov