Douglas V. Wolfe, DC Bar No. 437476 1 | Federal Trade Commission 2 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Washington, DC 20580 3 (202)326-3113, fax (202)326-33954 Jennifer Larabee, Cal. Bar No. 163989 Local Counsel Federal Trade Commission Fil. 70 cier, ve " 10877 Wilshire Boulevard 6 Suite 700 Los Angeles, CA 90024 JAN 2 Bloss 7 (310)824-4343, fax(310)824-4380 8 Attorneys for Plaintiff 9 10 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE 11 CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA, WESTERN DIVISION 12 13 FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION, 14 Plaintiff, Civil Action 15 v. No. 99-00044 ABC (AJWx) J.K. PUBLICATIONS, INC., a Nevada corporation, 17 KENNETH H. TAVES, 18 a/k/a Ken Till, individually, AMENDED COMPLAINT FOR and as an officer of J.K. INJUNCTIVE AND OTHER 19 Publications, Inc., also RELIEF d/b/a Netfill, netfill.com, 20 xbc.com, N-Bill, Online Billing, Assist Online, 21 Herbal Care, Discreet Bill, KULM Consulting Group, TAL 22 Services 23 | TERESA CALLEI TAVES, individually, and as an officer of J.K. 24 Publications, Inc., also d/b/a Netfill, netfill.com 25 N-Bill, Herbal Care 26 GARY NEAL MITTMAN, individually, and as an officer of Adult Banc, Inc., also d/b/a 27 Adult Bank, netfill.com,

28

adultbank.com

1 DENNIS RAPPAPORT, individually, 2 and as an officer of TAL Services, Inc., Adult Banc 3 Inc., and Discreet Bill, also d/b/a Adult Bank 4 MAURICE O'BANNON, individually, 5 and as an officer of TAL Services, Inc., and MJD 6 Service Corp., also d/b/a MJD Enterprises and Adult 7 Bank 8 MJD SERVICE CORP., a Nevada corporation, 9 TAL SERVICES, INC., 10 a Nevada corporation, 11 DISCREET BILL, INC. a Nevada corporation, 12 ADULT BANC, INC. 13 a California corporation, HERBAL CARE, INC. 14 a California corporation, 15 Defendants. 16

Plaintiff, the Federal Trade Commission ("FTC" or "the Commission"), for its amended complaint alleges as follows:

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

- 1. This Court has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331, 1337(a), and 1345, and 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a) and 53(b).
- 2. Venue in the United States District Court for the Central District of California is proper under 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b) and (c), and 15 U.S.C. §§ 53(b).

2728

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

PLAINTIFF

- 3. Plaintiff, the Federal Trade Commission, is an independent agency of the United States Government created by statute. 15 U.S.C. §§ 41 et seq. The Commission is charged, interallia, with enforcement of Section 5(a) of the Federal Trade Commission Act ("FTC Act"), 15 U.S.C. § 45(a), which prohibits unfair or deceptive acts or practices in or affecting commerce. The Commission is authorized to initiate federal district court proceedings, by its own attorneys, to enjoin violations of the FTC Act in order to secure such equitable relief as may be appropriate in each case. 15 U.S.C.§§ 53(b), 56(a)(2).
- 4. The Commission brings this action under Section 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 53(b), to secure preliminary and permanent injunctive relief, rescission of contracts, restitution, disgorgement, and other equitable relief for defendants' deceptive and unfair acts and practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a).

DEFENDANTS

- 5. Defendant J.K. Publications, Inc. ("J.K. Publications") is a Nevada corporation. J.K. Publications was incorporated in 1995, and transacts business in the Central District of California. J.K. Publications does business as "Netfill" in California. J.K. Publications does business as "xbc.com." J.K. Publications lists its principal address as 3305 W. Spring Mountain Road #60-A, Las Vegas, Nevada 89102.
- 6. Defendant Kenneth H. Taves is a resident of California. His principal address is 19158 Pacific Coast Highway, Malibu,

California 90265. Mr. Taves does business on the Internet as netfill.com. Mr. Taves also does business on the Internet as xbc.com. Mr. Taves does business as "Netfill", "Online Billing", and "N-Bill" in the state of Nevada. Mr. Taves also does business as "Netfill", "Online Billing", "N-Bill" and "Webtel" in California. Mr. Taves also does business in California as the following: "HerbalCare", "Discreet Bill", "Assist Online", "KULM Consulting Group", and "TAL Services, Inc.". Mr. Taves is the president of defendant Herbal Care. Mr. Taves is the secretary and treasurer of defendant J.K. Publications. At all times material to this complaint, acting alone or in concert with others, he has formulated, directed, controlled, or participated in the acts and practices set forth in this complaint. He resides and transacts business within the Central District of California.

- 7. Defendant Teresa Callei Taves is a resident of California. Her principal address is 19158 Pacific Coast Highway, Malibu, CA 90265. Mrs. Taves does business on the Internet as netfill.com. Mrs. Taves does business as business as "Netfill" and "N-Bill" in the state of Nevada. Mrs. Taves also does business as "Netfill", "N-Bill" and "Herbal Care" in California. Mrs. Taves is the president of defendant J.K. Publications. At all times material to this complaint, acting alone or in concert with others, she has formulated, directed, controlled, or participated in the acts and practices set forth in this complaint. She resides and transacts business within the Central District of California.
- 8. Defendant Gary Neal Mittman is a resident of California. His principal address is 309 Broadway Street #17, Venice,

California 90291. Mr. Mittman is an officer of defendant Adult Banc, Inc. Mr. Mittman also does business on the Internet as gary@netfill.com and gary@adultbank.com. Mr. Mittman also does business as "Adult Bank". At all times material to this complaint, acting alone or in concert with others, he has formulated, directed, controlled, or participated in the acts and practices set forth in this complaint. He resides and transacts business within the Central District of California.

- 9. Defendant Dennis Rappaport is a resident of California.
 His principal address is 4535 San Blas Avenue, Woodland Hills, CA.
 Mr. Rappaport is the owner and vice president of defendant Discreet
 Bill, Inc. Mr. Rappaport is an officer of defendant TAL Services,
 Inc. Mr. Rappaport is an officer of defendant Adult Banc, Inc.
 Mr. Rappaport also does business as "Adult Bank". At all times
 material to this complaint, alone or in concert with others, he has
 formulated, directed, controlled, or participated in the acts and
 practices set forth in this complaint. He resides and transacts
 business within the Central District of California.
- 10. Defendant Maurice O'Bannon is a resident of Nevada. His principal address is 3890 S. Nellis Blvd., Las Vegas, NV 89121.

 Mr. O'Bannon is president of defendant MJD Service Corp. Mr.

 O'Bannon is also the president of defendant Discreet Bill, Inc. and the president of defendant TAL Services, Inc. He transacts business within the Central District of California.
- 11. Defendant MJD Service Corp. is a Nevada Corporation. MJD Service Corp. was incorporated in 1998, and transacts business in the Central District of California. MJD Service Corp. does

business as "MJD Enterprises". MJD Service Corp. lists its principal address as 5300 W. Sahara Avenue, #101, Las Vegas, Nevada 89102.

- 12. Defendant TAL Services, Inc. ("TAL Services") is a Nevada Corporation. TAL Services was incorporated in 1998, and transacts business in the Central District of California. TAL Services lists its principal address as 5300 W. Sahara Avenue, #101, Las Vegas, Nevada 89102.
- 13. Defendant Adult Banc, Inc. ("Adult Banc") is a California corporation. Adult Banc was incorporated in September 1998, and transacts business in the Central District of California. Adult Banc does business as "Adult Bank" and "adultbank.com" in California. Adult Banc lists its principal address as: 23852 Pacific Coast Highway, #643, Malibu, California.
- 14. Defendant Discreet Bill, Inc. ("Discreet Bill") is a Nevada corporation. Discreet Bill was incorporated in September 1998, and transacts business in the Central District of California. Discreet Bill does business as "N-Bill", "Online Billing" and "Webtel". Discreet Bill lists its principal address as: 5300 W. Sahara Ave., #101, Las Vegas, NV 89146. Discreet Bill does business as "Online Billing" and "N-Bill" in the state of Nevada.
- 15. Defendant Herbal Care, Inc. ("Herbal Care") is a California corporation. Herbal Care was incorporated in 1997, and transacts business in the Central District of California. Herbal Care lists its principal address as 3305 West Spring Mountain Road, #60A, Las Vegas, Nevada 89102.

2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 |

12 l

16 l

16. At all times material to this complaint, the defendants have maintained a substantial course of trade, advertising, offering, offering for sale, selling, and interstate billing for access to computer-stored images via both the Internet and international and interstate telephone lines, in or affecting commerce, as "commerce" is defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.

DEFENDANTS' COURSE OF BUSINESS

- 17. Since approximately January 1997, defendants have operated web sites on the Internet, including the sites located at netfill.com and xbc.com. The World Wide Web or Web is a system used on the Internet for cross-referencing and retrieving information. A web site is a set of electronic documents, usually a home page and subordinate pages, readily viewable on computer by anyone, with access to the Web and standard software, who searches the Web using relevant key words or who types in the web site's known location or address.
- 18. Since approximately January, 1998, in the course of running their businesses, defendants, without consumers' authorization, have obtained and continue to obtain consumers' credit and debit card account numbers and cause charges to be posted on, or monies to be withdrawn from, those accounts. Defendants at various times place into the charge or debit card system the following identifiers for those charges or debits:

Netfill-Net Access 800-918-8400 CA;

N-Bill 800-533-0424 NV;

3

TAL Services Inc. 800-554-3580 NV.

4 5

Corp., Webtel, and TAL Services and forward mail between various post office boxes and commercial mail drops in California and

6

7

8

9

11

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20 21

23

24

25

26

27

Defendants use the names Netfill, N-Bill, MJD Service Nevada to avoid being detected.

- 20. In numerous instances, consumers have never heard or known of Netfill, N-Bill, MJD Service Corp., Webtel or TAL Services until the charges appear on those consumers' account statements.
- In numerous instances, when consumers call the phone 21. numbers indicated in paragraph 18, above, the line is busy or rings without answer despite several attempts.
- On other occasions, when consumers call the phone numbers indicated, the line is answered by a voice recording that, without identifying the owner of the voice recording, requests the caller to enter her credit card number using the keys on her telephone key pad in order to question a bill. Those consumers have no ability to speak to a representative.
- Often, consumers are forced to write their card issuers 23. to challenge the charges or debits on their statements. When those consumers inquire as to the nature of the charge, the card issuers often reply that the charge is for Internet-related service. Many of these consumers either have no Internet access or have never given their card number to any Internet-related business.
- In numerous instances, defendants repeatedly bill 24. consumers over successive months. Unable to contact defendants,

those consumers ask their card issuers to stop the billing. Card issuers often respond that they cannot stop future charges from appearing on successive bills and tell the consumers to contact the biller directly. Many times, however, the billers have given the card issuer and consumer no identifying information other than the phone numbers indicated in paragraph 18, above.

25. Many consumers are thus unable to contact the defendants, and therefore cannot stop future unauthorized charges. In numerous instances, consumers have canceled their card accounts in order to stop future charges.

VIOLATIONS OF THE FTC ACT

COUNT I

- 26. In numerous instances, in the course of billing, attempting to collect, and collecting money from consumers, defendants represent to consumers, expressly or by implication, that consumers purchased or agreed to purchase goods or services from defendants, and therefore owe money to defendants.
- 27. In truth and in fact, consumers did not purchase or agree to purchase goods or services from defendants, and therefore do not owe money to defendants.
- 28. Therefore, defendants' representations, as set forth in paragraph 26, above, are deceptive, in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §45.

COUNT II

29. In numerous instances, defendants charge or debit the accounts of consumers.

15 |

- 30. Consumers have not contacted, been contacted by, purchased from, agreed to purchase from, or agreed to be billed by defendants or anyone for whom they purport to bill. Consumers have never heard of Netfill, N-Bill, MJD Service Corp., Webtel or TAL Services prior to receiving their account statements, and many consumers cannot contact defendants before they are billed again. Therefore, consumers cannot reasonably avoid defendants' billing for services or products which consumers did not purchase.
- 31. Defendants' practice of charging and debiting consumers' credit or debit card accounts without authorization causes substantial injury to consumers that is not outweighed by countervailing benefits to consumers or competition.
- 32. Therefore, defendants' practice, as outlined above, is unfair and violates Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a).

COMMON ENTERPRISE

33. The corporate defendants, individual defendants and the several d/b/a entities have operated as a common business enterprise while engaging in the deceptive and unfair acts and practices alleged above in paragraphs 26 through 32.

CONSUMER INJURY

34. Consumers throughout the United States and in foreign countries have suffered monetary losses as a result of the defendants' unlawful acts or practices. Absent injunctive relief by this Court, defendants are likely to continue to injure consumers and harm the public interest.

2 3

1

- 5
- 7

6

- 8
- 10
- 11
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 17
- 18
- 19 20
- 21
- 22 23
- 24
- 25 26
- 27

28

35. Section 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 53(b), empowers this Court to grant injunctive and other ancillary relief, including consumer redress, disgorgement and restitution, to prevent and remedy any violations of any provision of law enforced by the FTC.

This Court, in the exercise of its equitable 36. jurisdiction, may award other ancillary relief to remedy injury caused by defendants' law violations.

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, plaintiff, the Federal Trade Commission, requests that this Court, as authorized by Section 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 53(b), and pursuant to its own equitable powers:

- 1. Award plaintiff such preliminary injunctive and ancillary relief as may be necessary to avert the likelihood of consumer injury during the pendency of this action and to preserve the possibility of effective final relief;
- Permanently enjoin the defendants from violating the FTC Act, as alleged herein;
- Award such relief as the Court finds necessary to redress injury to consumers resulting from the defendants' violations of the FTC Act, including but not limited to, the refund of monies paid, and the disgorgement of ill-gotten monies; and
- Award plaintiff the costs of bringing this action, as well as such other and additional relief as the Court may determine to be just and proper.

1	Date: <u>January</u> 19, 1999
3	Respectfully Submitted,
4	
5	Debra A. Valentine
6	General Counsel
7	Machouse
8	Douglas V. Wolfe DC Bar No. 437476
9	Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
10	Suite H-238 Washington, D.C. 20580
11	(202)326-3113 (phone) (202)326-3395 (fax)
12	Attorneys for Plaintiff
13	Federal Trade Commission .
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	,
22	·
23	
24	
25	

Jennifer Larabee
Cal. Bar No. 163989
Federal Trade Commission
10877 Wilshire Boulevard
Suite 700
Los Angeles, CA 90024
(310) 824-4343 (phone)
(310) 824-4380 (fax)

2 Respectfully Submitted, 3 4 Debra A. Valentine 5 General Counsel 6 7 Douglas V. Wolfe DC Bar No. 437476 8 Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Suite H-238 20580 Washington, D.C. 10 (202) 326-3113 (phone) (202) 326-3395 (fax) 11 12 Attorneys for Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26

27

28

Jennifer Larasee Cal. Bar No. 163989 Federal Trade Commission 10877 Wilshire Boulevard Suite 700 Los Angeles, CA 90024 (310) 824-4343 (phone) (310) 824-4380 (fax)