### UNITED STATES OF AMERICA BEFORE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

)

)

)

)

)

In the Matter of TENET HEALTHCARE CORPORATION, a corporation.

File No. 971-0024

### AGREEMENT CONTAINING CONSENT ORDER

The Federal Trade Commission ("Commis sion"), having initiated an investigation into the pro posed acquisition of OrNda Healthcorp ("OrNda") by Tenet Healthcare Corporation ("Tenet"), and it now ap pearing that Tenet ("pro posed re spondent") is willing to enter into an agreement con taining an order to di vest certain as sets, to cease and desist from making certain acquisitions, and provid ing for other relief;

**IT IS HEREBY AGREED** by and between the proposed respon dent by its duly authorized officer and attorney, and counsel for the Commission that:

1. The proposed respondent Tenet is a corporation organized, existing, and doing business under and by virtue of the laws of Nevada, with its prin cipal place of busi ness at 3820 State Street, Santa Barbara, California 93105.

2. The proposed respondent admits all the jurisdictional facts set forth in the draft of complaint here attached.

- 3. The proposed respondent waives:
  - a. any further procedural steps;
  - b. the requir ement that the Commission's decision contain a statement of findings of fact and conclusions of law;
  - c. all rights to seek judicial review or otherwise to challenge or contest the validity of the order entered pursuant to this agreement; and
  - d. any claim under the Equal Access to Justice Act.

4. This agreement shall not become a part of the public record of the proceeding unless and until it is accepted by the Commission. If this agreement is accepted by the Commission it,

together with the draft of complaint contemplated thereby, will be placed on the public record for a period of sixty (60) days and information in respect thereto publicly released. The Commission thereafter may either withdraw its acceptance of this agreement and so notify the proposed respondent, in which event it will take such action as it may consider appropriate, or issue and serve its complaint (in such form as the circumstances may require) and decision, in disposition of the proceeding.

5. This agreement is for settlement purposes only and does not constitute an admission by the proposed respondent that the law has been violated as alleged in the draft of complaint here attached, or that the facts as alleged in the draft of complaint, other than jurisdictional facts, are true.

This agreement contemplates that, if it is accepted by 6. the Commission, and if such acceptance is not subsequently withdrawn by the Commission pursuant to the provisions of Section 2.34 of the Commission's Rules, the Commission may, without further notice to the proposed respondent, (1) issue its complaint corresponding in form and substance with the draft of complaint here attached and its decision containing the following order to divest and to cease and desist, and other relief in disposition of the proceedings, and (2) make information public with respect thereto. When so entered, the order to divest and to cease and desist shall have the same force and effect and may be altered, modified, or set aside in the same manner and within the same time provided by statute for other orders. The order shall become final upon service. Delivery by the U.S. Postal Service of the complaint and decision containing the agreed-to order to proposed respondent's address as stated in this agreement shall constitute service. The proposed respondent waives any right it may have to any other manner of service. The complaint may be used in construing the terms of the order, and no agreement, understanding, representation, or interpretation not contained in the order or this agreement may be used to vary or contradict the terms of the order.

7. The proposed respondent has read the proposed complaint and order contemplated hereby. The proposed respondent understands that once the order has been issued, it will be required to file one or more compliance reports showing that it has fully complied with the order. The proposed respondent further understands that it may be liable for civil penalties in the amount pro vided by law for each viola tion of the order after it be comes final.

#### ORDER

I.

**IT IS ORDERED THAT,** as used in this order, the following definitions shall apply:

A. "Tenet" or "respondent" means Tenet Healthcare Corporation; its directors, officers, employees, agents and representatives, predecessors, successors, and assigns; its subsidiaries, divisions, groups and affil iates controlled by Tenet Healthcare Corporation; and the respective direc tors, officers, employees, agents, and representatives, successors, and assigns of each.

B. "OrNda" means OrNda Healthcorp; its directors, officers, employees, agents and representatives, predecessors, successors, and assigns; its subsidiaries, divisions, groups and affiliates controlled by OrNda Healthcorp; and the respective directors, officers, employees, agents, and representatives, successors, and assigns of each.

C. "Commission" means the Federal Trade Commission.

D. The "Acquisition" means the transaction contemplated by the October 16, 1996 Agreement and Plan of Merger between Tenet and OrNda, pursuant to which OrNda will become a wholly-owned subsidiary of Tenet.

E. "Acute care hospital" means a health care facility, licensed as a hospital, other than a federally-owned facility, having a duly organized governing body with overall administrative and professional responsibili ty, and an organized professional staff, that provides 24-hour inpatient care, that may also provide outpatient services, and having as a primary function the provision of inpatient services for medical diagnosis, treatment, and care of physically injured or sick persons with short term or episodic health problems or infirmities.

F. "Affiliate" means any entity whose management and policies are controlled in any way, directly or indirectly, by the person with which it is affiliated.

G. "Person" means any natural person, partnership, corporation, company, association, trust, joint venture, or other business or legal entity, including any govern mental agency. H. "Relevant area" means the co unty of San Luis Obispo in California.

I. The "Schedule A assets" mean the assets identified in the attached Schedule A.

J. The "Schedule B assets" mean the assets identified in the attached Schedule B.

K. "Monarch Health Systems" or "Monarch" means Monarch Medical Alliance, Inc., doing business as Monarch Health Systems (a corporation with its headquarters in Santa Barbara, California), its subsidiaries, and their successors and assigns.

L. "Assets and Businesses" include, but are not limited to, all assets, properties, businesses, rights, privileges, contractual interests, licenses, and goodwill of whatever nature, tangible and intangible, including, without limitation, the following:

- 1. all real property interests (including fee simple interests and real property leasehold interests, whether as lessor or lessee), together with all buildings, improvements, and fixtures located thereon, all construction in progress thereat, all appurtenances thereto, and all licenses and permits related thereto (collectively, the "Real Property");
- 2. all contracts and agreements with physicians, other health care providers, unions, third party payers, health maintenance organizations and other health plans, customers, suppliers, sales representatives, distributors, agents, personal property lessors, personal property lessees, licensors, licensees, cosigners, and consignees (collectively, the "Contracts");
- 3. all machinery, equipment, fixtures, vehicles, furniture, inventories, and supplies (other than such inventories and supplies as are used in the ordinary course of business during the time that Tenet owns the assets) (collectively, the "Personal Property");
- 4. all research materials, technical information, management information systems, software, software licenses, inventions, trade secrets, technology, knowhow, specifications, designs, drawings, processes, and

quality control data (collectively, the "Intangible Personal Property");

- 5. all books, records, and files, excluding, however, the corporate minute books and tax records of Tenet, OrNda, and their affiliates; and
- 6. all prepaid expenses.

M. To "operate" an acute care hospi tal means to own, lease, manage, or otherwise control or direct the opera tions of an acute care hospital, directly or indirectly.

N. To "acquire" an acute care hospital means, di rectly or indirectly, through subsidiaries, partnerships, or other wise:

- 1. To acquire the whole or any part of the assets used or previously used within the last two years (and still suitable for use) for operat ing an acute care hospital from any per son presently engaged in, or within the two years preceding such acquisition engaged in, operat ing an acute care hospital;
- 2. To acquire the whole or any part of the stock, share capital, equity, or other interest in any person engaged in, or within the two years preceding such acquisition engaged in, operat ing an acute care hospital;
- 3. To acquire or otherwise obtain the right to des ignate, directly or indirectly, directors or trustees of an acute care hospital; or
- 4. To enter into any other arrangement to obtain direct or indirect ownership, management, or control of an acute care hospital or any part thereof, including, but not limited to, a lease of or management contract for an acute care hospital.

II.

#### **IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that:

A. Respondent shall divest, abso lutely and in good faith, on or before August 1, 1997, the Schedule A assets.

B. Respondent shall also divest, abso lutely and in good faith, on or before August 1, 1997, such additional ancillary assets and businesses, and effect such arrangements, as are necessary to assure the marketability, independence, viability, and competitiveness of French Hospital Medical Center.

C. Respondent shall also divest, absolutely and in good faith, on or before August 1, 1997, all of its stock in Monarch Health Systems. The Monarch Health Systems stock may be, but need not be, divested to the same person to whom the Schedule A assets are divested.

D. The purpose of the foregoing divestitures is to ensure the continuation of French Hospital Medical Center as an ongo ing, independent, and viable acute care hospi tal, and to remedy the lessening of competition resulting from the Acquisition as alleged in the Commission's complaint.

E. Respondent shall divest the Schedule A assets, the Monarch Health Systems stock, and any additional assets that must be divested pursuant to Paragraph II.B. above, only to an acquirer that re ceives the prior ap proval of the Commis sion and only in a manner that re ceives the prior approv al of the Commission; provided, however, that respondent may divest the Monarch Health Systems stock, or that stock together with the loan agreement identified in Schedule A, without the prior approval of the Commission, to a person other than respondent in connection with that person's acquisition of all, or substantially all, Monarch Health Systems stock.

F. Respondent shall comply with all terms of the Agreement to Hold Sepa rate concerning the Schedule A assets, the Schedule B assets, and the Monarch Health Systems stock, attached hereto and made a part hereof as Appen dix I. Said Hold Separate shall continue in effect until such time as respondent has fulfilled the divesti ture requirements of this Paragraph II or until such other time as said Hold Separate provides.

G. Pending the divestitures required by this Paragraph II, respondent shall take such actions as are necessary to maintain

the present market ability, viability, and competitiveness of the Schedule A and Schedule B assets, and to prevent the de struction, removal, wasting, deterioration, or impair ment of the Schedule A and Schedule B assets, except for ordinary wear and tear.

H. A condition of approval by the Commission of the divestiture of the Schedule A assets shall be a written agreement by the acquirer(s) of those assets that it will not sell for a period of ten (10) years from the date of divestiture, directly or indirectly, through subsidiaries, partnerships, or otherwise, without prior notification to the Commission in the manner prescribed by Paragraph IV of this Order, any Schedule A asset to any person who operates, or will operate immediately following the sale, any other acute care hospital in the relevant area.

#### III.

#### IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:

A. If the respondent has not divested, absolutely and in good faith and with the Commission's prior approv al, the Schedule A assets, in accor dance with this order, on or before August 1, 1997, the Commission may appoint a trustee to effect the divestiture of the Schedule A assets. The trustee may on his or her initiative, or at the direction of the Commission, also divest some or all of the Schedule B assets, to the extent such additional divestitures are necessary to completely fulfill the purpose, identified in Paragraph II.D. above, of the divestiture of the Schedule A assets.

B. If the respondent has not divested, absolutely and in good faith and with the Commission's prior approv al, its stock in Monarch Health Systems, in accor dance with this order, on or before August 1, 1997, the Commission may appoint a trustee to effect the divestiture of the Monarch Health Systems stock.

C. In the event that the Commission or the Attor ney General brings an action for any failure to comply with this order or in any way relating to the Acquisi tion, pursuant to Section  $5(\underline{1})$  of the Federal Trade Commission Act, 15 U.S.C. §  $45(\underline{1})$ , or any other statute enforced by the Commission, the respondent shall consent to the appointment of a trustee in such action. Neither the appointment of a trustee nor a decision not to appoint a trustee under Paragraph III.A. or Paragraph III.B. shall preclude the Commis sion or the Attorney General from

seeking civil penal ties or any other relief available to them for any failure by the respondent to comply with this order.

D. If a trustee is appointed by the Commission or a court pursuant to Paragraph III.A. or Paragraph III.B. of this order, the respondent shall consent to the following terms and conditions regard ing the tru stee's powers, duties, au thority, and responsibili ties:

- 1. The Commission shall select the trustee, sub ject to the consent of the respondent, which consent shall not be unreasonably withheld. The trustee shall be a person with experience and expertise in acquisitions and divestitures. If respondent has not opposed, in writing, including the reasons for opposing, the selection of any proposed trustee within ten (10) days after notice by the staff of the Com mission to respondent of the identity of any pro posed trustee, respondent shall be deemed to have consented to the selection of the proposed trustee.
- 2. Subject to the prior approval of the Commis sion (except with respect to any divestiture of Monarch Health Systems stock which Paragraph II.E. permits to be made without Commission approval), the trustee shall serve as an agent of the Commission and shall have the exclusive power and authority to divest (a) the Schedule A assets and, as necessary, some or all of the Schedule B assets, if the trustee is appointed pursuant to Paragraph III.A., and (b) respondent's Monarch Health Systems stock, if the trustee is appointed pursuant to Paragraph III.B.
- 3. Within ten (10) days after appointment of the trustee, respondent shall execute a trust agreement that, subject to the prior approval of the Commission and, in the case of a court-appointed trustee, of the court, transfers to the trustee all rights and powers necessary to permit the trustee to effect the divestitures required by this order.
- 4. The trustee shall have twelve (12) months from the date the Commission approves the trust agreement described in Paragraph III.D.3 to ac complish the divestitures, which shall be sub ject to the prior approval of the Commission (with the exception set forth in Paragraph III.D.2). If, however, at the end of the twelve -month

period, the trustee has submitted a plan of divestiture or believes that divestiture can be achieved within a reasonable time, the di vestiture period may be extended by the Commis sion, or in the case of a court-appointed trustee, by the court; provided, however, that the Commission may extend this period only two (2) times , for up to twelve (12) months each time.

- 5. The trustee shall have full and complete access to the personnel, books, records, and facili ties related to the assets he or she is to divest, as well as to any other relevant information as the trust ee may request. Respondent shall develop such finan cial or other information as such trustee may rea sonably request, and shall coop erate with the trustee. Respondent shall take no action to interfere with or im pede the trustee's ac complishment of the dives titures. Any delays in divestiture caused by respondent shall ex tend the time for divesti ture under this Para graph III in an amount equal to the delay, as de termined by the Commission or, for a court-appointed trustee, by the court.
- 6. The trustee shall use his or her best efforts to negotiate the most favorable price and terms available in each contract that is submitted to the Commission, subject to the trustee 's fiduciary duty to the Commission and to respondent's absolute and unconditional obligation to divest at no minimum price. The divestiture shall be made in the manner and to an acquirer as set forth in Paragraph II; pro vided, however, if the trustee re ceives bona fide offers from more than one acquiring entity for the Schedule A assets (along with, if necessary, some or all of the Schedule B assets), or for the Monarch Health Systems stock, and if the Com mission determines to ap prove more than one such acquiring entity (or, for the Monarch Health Systems stock, more than one entity is either approved to acquire the stock, or does not require Commission approval under Paragraph II.E.), the trustee shall divest to the acquir ing entity select ed by respondent from among those ap proved by the Commission.
- 7. The trustee shall serve, without bond or other security, at the cost and expense of the re spondent, on such reasonable and customary terms and conditions as the Commission or a court may set. The trustee shall have the authority to employ, at the cost and expense

of respondent, such consultants, accountants, attorneys, investment bankers, business bro kers, appraisers, and other representatives and assistants as are necessary to carry out the trustee's duties and responsibili ties. The trustee shall account for all monies derived from the sale and all expenses incurred. After approval by the Commission and, in the case of a court-appointed trustee, by the court, of the ac count of the trust ee, including fees for his or her services, all remaining monies shall be paid at the direc tion of the respondent and the trustee's power shall be terminated. The trustee's com pensation shall be based at least in signifi cant part on a commis sion arrangement contin gent on the trustee's divesting the Schedule A assets (if the trustee is appointed pursuant to Paragraph III.A.) and the Monarch Health Systems stock (if the trustee is appointed pursuant to Paragraph III.B.).

- 8. Respondent shall indemnify the trustee and hold the trustee harmless against any losses, claims, damages, liabilities, or expenses aris ing out of, or in connection with, the perfor mance of the trustee's duties, including all reasonable fees of counsel and other expenses incurred in connection with the preparation for, or defense of any claim, whether or not resulting in any liability, except to the extent that such lia bilities, losses, damages, claims, or expenses result from misfeasance, gross negligence, willful or wanton acts, or bad faith by the trustee.
- 9. If the trustee ceases to act or fails to act diligently, a substitute trustee shall be ap pointed in the same manner as provided in Para graph III.A. or Paragraph III.B. of this order.
- 10. The Commission or, in the case of a court-ap pointed trustee, the court, may on its own initiative, or at the request of the trustee, issue such additional orders or directions as may be necessary or appropriate to accomplish the divestitures required by this order.
- 11. The trustee shall also divest such additional ancillary assets and businesses and effect such arrangements as are necessary to assure the marketability and the viability and competitiveness of French Hospital Medical Center.

- 12. The trustee shall have no obligation or author ity to operate or maintain the Schedule A assets, or the Schedule B assets, or to take any actions (other than in furtherance of divestiture) relating to the Monarch Health Systems stock.
- 13. The trustee shall report in writing to the respondent and to the Commission every sixty (60) days concerning the trustee's efforts to accomplish divestiture.

### IV.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of ten (10) years from the date this order becomes final, respondent shall not, without providing advance written notification to the Commission, directly or indirectly, through subsidiaries, partnerships, or otherwise:

A. Acquire any stock, share capital, equity, or other interest in any person, other than respondent, operating an acute care hospital in the relevant area;

B. Acquire any assets of an acute care hospital in the relevant area, or any assets used within the two years preceding such acquisition (and still suitable for use) for operating an acute care hospital in the relevant area;

C. Enter into any agreement or other arrangement to obtain direct or indirect ownership, management, or control of any acute care hospital, or any part thereof, in the relevant area, including but not limited to, a lease of or management contract for any such facility;

D. Acquire or otherwise obtain the right to designat e, directly or indirectly, directors or trustees of any acute care hospital in the relevant area;

E. Permit any acute care hospital it operates in the relevant area to be acquired by any person that operates, or will operate immediately following such ac quisition, any other acute care hospital in the relevant area; or

F. Acquire any stock, share capital, equity, or other interest in Monarch Health Systems.

Said notification shall be given on the Notification and Report Form set forth in the Appendix to Part 803 of Title 16 of the Code of Federal Regulations as amended (hereinafter referred to as "the Notification"), and shall be prepared and transmitted in accordance with the requirements of that part, except that no filing fee will be required for any such notification, notification need not be made to the United States Department of Justice, and notification is required only of respondent and not of any other party to the transaction. Respondent shall provide the Notification to the Commission at least thirty days prior to consummating the trans action (hereinafter referred to as the "first waiting period"). If, within the first waiting period, representatives of the Commission make a written request for additional information or documentary material (within the meaning of 16 C.F.R. § 803.20), respondent shall not consummate the trans action until twenty days after submitting such additional information and documentary material. Early termination of the waiting periods in this paragraph may be requested and, where appropriate, granted by letter from the Bureau of Competition.

Provided, however, that prior notification pursuant to this Paragraph IV, or pursuant to Paragraph II.H. of this order, shall not be required for:

- (1) the establishment by respondent of an acute care hospital in the relevant area: (a) that is a replacement for an existing acute care hospital , if that facility is operated by respondent and is not required to be divested pursuant to Paragraph II of this order; or (b) that is not a replacement for any acute care hospital in the relevant area;
- (2) any transaction otherwise subject to this Paragraph IV of this order if the fair market value of (or, in case of an asset acquisition, the consideration to be paid for) the acute care hospital or part thereof to be acquired does not exceed one million dollars (\$1,000,000); or
- (3) any trans action for which notification is required to be made, and has been made, pursuant to Section 7A of the Clayton Act, 15 U.S.C. § 18a.

v.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of ten (10) years from the date this order becomes final, respondent shall not permit all, or any substantial part of, any acute care hospital it operates in the relevant area to be acquired by any other person (except pursuant to the divestitures required by Paragraph II, or to divestitures by a trustee pursuant to Paragraph III), unless the acquiring person files with the Commission, prior to the closing of such acquisi tion, a written agreement to be bound by the pro visions of this order, which agreement respondent shall require as a condition precedent to the acquisition.

#### VI.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that within sixty (60) days after the date this order becomes final and every sixty (60) days thereafter until the respondent has fully complied with Paragraph II of this order, respondent shall submit to the Commis sion a verified written report setting forth in detail the manner and form in which it intends to comply, is comply ing, and has complied with Paragraph II of this order. Respondent shall include in its com pliance reports, among other things that are required from time to time, a full description of the efforts being made to comply with Paragraph II of the order, including a description of all substantive con tacts or negotiations for the divestitures, and the iden tity of all parties con tacted. Respondent shall include in its compliance reports copies of all written communi cations to and from such parties, all internal memoranda, and all reports and recommenda tions concern ing the divestitures.

#### VII.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that respondent shall notify the Commission at least thirty (30) days prior to any proposed change in the corporate respondent such as dissolution, assignment, sale resulting in the emergence of a successor corporation, or the creation or dissolu tion of subsidi aries or any other change in the corpora tion that may affect compliance obligations arising out of the order.

#### VIII.

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that, for the purpose of determining or securing compliance with this order, the respondent shall permit any duly authorized representa tive of the Commission:

A. Access, during office hours and in the presence of counsel, to inspect and copy all books, ledgers, accounts, correspondence, memoranda, and other records and documents in the possession or under the control of the respondent relating to any matters contained in this order; and

B. Upon five days' notice to respondent and with out restraint or interference from it, to interview officers,

directors, or employees of respondent, who may have counsel present regarding such matters.

Signed this day of January, 1997.

### FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

### LOS ANGELES REGIONAL OFFICE

By:

John D. Jacobs Russell S. Deitch Attorneys

- BUREAU OF COMPETITION
- By:

Oscar M. Voss Steven J. Osnowitz Attorneys

Counsel for the Federal Trade Commission

### APPROVED:

David R. Pender Deputy Assistant Director Ann I. Jones Director Los Angeles Regional Office

Robert F. Leibenluft Assistant Director Health Care Division Bureau of Competition

William J. Baer Director Bureau of Competition

## SCHEDULE A

By: \_ Jeffrey C. Barbakow Chairman and Chief Executive Officer Tenet Healthcare Corporation

TENET HEALTHCARE CORPORATION

By:

Clifford H. Aronson, Esq. Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher & Flom LLP Counsel for Tenet Healthcare Corporation

The "Sched ule A assets" to be divested pursuant to Paragraph II shall include all Assets and Businesses (including all improvements, additions and enhancements made to such assets prior to divestiture) of French Hospital Medical Center, 1911 Johnson Avenue, San Luis Obispo, California, including without limitation OrNda 's ownership, partnership, or leasehold interests in the following properties and businesses in San Luis Obispo County, California:

- 1. Pacific Medical Plaza, 1941 Johnson Avenue, San Luis Obispo, California;
- 2. Pulse Health Services, 1911 Johnson Avenue, San Luis Obispo, California;
- 3. Med Stop Urgent Care Centers, at 283 Madonna Road, San Luis Obispo, California, and 877 Oak Park Boulevard, Pismo Beach, California;
- 4. Central Coast Surgery Center, 1941 Johnson Avenue, Suite 103, San Luis Obispo, California;
- 5. San Luis Recovery Partners, 1575 Bishop, San Luis Obispo, California; and
- 6. La Posada Medical Center, 225 Posada Lane, Templeton, California.

The "Schedule A assets" shall include, in addition, the January 1997 loan agreement between OrNda Investments, Inc. and Monarch Health Systems, including all of OrNda Investments' rights and obligations thereunder, and all promissory notes issued thereunder.

### SCHEDULE B

The "Sched ule B assets" shall consist of all Assets and Businesses (including all improve ments, additions and enhancements made to such assets prior to divestiture) of Valley Community Hospital, 505 East Plaza Drive, Santa Maria, California, including without limitation OrNda 's ownership, partnership, or leasehold interests in the following properties and businesses in Santa Barbara County, California:

- 1. Valley Medical Plaza, 525 East Plaza Drive, Santa Maria, California;
- 2. Valley Medical Courtyard, 505 and 506 East Plaza Drive, Santa Maria, California; and
- 3. Knollwood Business Plaza, 5075 South Bradley Road, Santa Maria, California.

### Appendix I

)

)

)

)

)

In the Matter of TENET HEALTHCARE CORPORATION, a corporation.

File No. 971-0024

#### AGREEMENT TO HOLD SEPARATE

This Agreement to Hold Separate ("Agree ment") is by and between Tenet Healthcare Corpo ration ("Tenet" or "re spondent"), a corporation orga nized, existing, and doing business under and by virtue of the laws of the State of Nevada, with its principal place of business at 3820 State Street, Santa Barbara, California 93105; and the Federal Trade Commis sion ("Com mission"), an independent agency of the United States Government, estab lished under the Federal Trade Commission Act of 1914, 15 U.S.C. § 41, *et seq.* 

#### PREMISES

WHEREAS, on October 16, 1996, Tenet and OrNda Healthcorp ("OrNda") entered into an Agreement and Plan of Merger pursuant to which OrNda will become a wholly-owned subsidiary of Tenet (the "Acqui sition"); and

WHEREAS, Tenet with its principal place of business at 3820 State Street, Santa Barbara, California 93105, owns and operates, among other things, acute care hospi tals in San Luis Obispo County, California, and else where; and

WHEREAS, Tenet through the Acquisition will acquire French Hospital Medical Center and related OrNda assets and businesses in San Luis Obispo County, California; Valley Community Hospital and related OrNda assets and businesses in northern Santa Barbara County, California; about one-third of the outstanding stock of Monarch Medical Alliance, Inc., doing business as Monarch Health Systems ("Monarch"), an integrated health care delivery system which is a major customer of French Hospital Medical Center; and a short-term loan agreement for OrNda to lend funds to Monarch; and

WHEREAS, the Commission is now investigating the Acquisition to determine whether it would violate any of the statutes enforced by the Commission; and

WHEREAS, if the Commission accepts the Agreement Containing Consent Order in this matter, which would require the divestiture of French Hospital Medical Center and certain related assets identified in Schedule A of the Consent Order (the "Schedule A assets") and respondent's Monarch stock, and may require the divestiture of certain other assets identified in Schedule B of the Consent Order (the "Schedule B assets") pursuant to Para graph II of the Consent Order, the Commis sion must place the Consent Order on the public record for a period of at least sixty (60) days and may subsequently withdraw such accep tance pursuant to the provisions of Section 2.34 of the Commission's Rules; and

WHEREAS, the Commission is concerned that if an understanding is not reached, preserving the status quo ante of the Schedule A assets and the Schedule B assets, and preserving the independence of Monarch from Tenet, during the period prior to the final accep tance and issu ance of the Consent Order by the Commission (after the "60-day public comment period"), divestiture resulting from any proceed ing challeng ing the legality of the Acquisition might not be possi ble, or might be less than an effective remedy; and

WHEREAS, if the Commission accepts the Consent Order, and Tenet has not divested with the Commission's prior approv al French Hospital Medical Center, related assets, and its Monarch stock, in accordance with the Consent Order, on or before August 1, 1997, the Commission may appoint a trustee to divest those assets; and

WHEREAS, the Commission is concerned that if the Acquisition is consummated, it will be necessary to preserve the Commission's ability to require the divesti ture of French Hospital Medical Center, related assets, and Monarch stock, and the Commission's right to have French Hospital Medical Center continue as a viable acute care hospital independent of Tenet; and

WHEREAS, the purposes of this Agreement and the Consent Order are to:

(i) preserve French Hospital Medical Center as a viable, competitive, and ongoing acute care hospital, indepen dent of Tenet, pending the divesti ture required under the terms of the Consent Order;

(ii) prevent interim harm to competition from the operation of French Hospital Medical Center pending the divesti ture required under the terms of the Consent Order; and

(iii) remedy any anticompetitive effects of the Acquisi tion;

WHEREAS, respondent's entering into this Agreement shall in no way be construed as an admission by respon dent that the Acquisition is illegal; and

WHEREAS, respondent understands that no act or trans action contemplated by this Agreement shall be deemed immune or exempt from the provisions of the anti trust laws or the Federal Trade Commission Act by reason of anything con tained in this Agreement.

NOW, THEREFORE, the parties agree, upon understand ing that the Commission has not yet determined whether the Acquisition will be challenged, and in consideration of the Commission's agreement that, at the time it accepts the Consent Order for public comment it will grant early termination of the Hart-Scott-Rodino waiting period, and unless the Commission determines to reject the Consent Order, it will not seek further relief from respondent with respect to the Acquisition, except that the Commission may exercise any and all rights to enforce this Agreement and the Consent Order to which it is annexed and made a part thereof, and in the event the divestitures required by the Consent Order are not accom plished on or before August 1, 1997, to appoint a trustee to seek dives titure of French Hospital Medical Center, related assets, and Monarch stock pursuant to the Consent Order, to seek civil penalties, to seek a court appointed trustee, and/or to seek other equitable relief, as follows:

1. Respondent agrees to execute the Agreement Con taining Consent Order and be bound by the attached Con sent Order.

- 2. Respondent agrees that:
- a. from the date this Agreement to Hold Separate is accepted until the earliest of the dates listed in sub

paragraphs 2.a.(i) or 2.a.(ii), it will comply with the provisions of paragraph 3 of this Agreement:

- (i) three (3) business days after the Commis sion withdraws its acceptance of the Con sent Order pursuant to the provisions of Section 2.34 of the Commission's Rules; or
- (ii) the day after the divestitures re quired by Paragraphs II.A. and II.B. of the Con sent Order are completed.
- b. from the date this Agreement to Hold Separate is accepted until the earliest of the dates listed in sub paragraphs 2.b.(i) or 2.b.(ii), it will comply with the provisions of paragraph 4 of this Agreement:
  - (i) three (3) business days after the Commis sion withdraws its acceptance of the Con sent Order pursuant to the provisions of Section 2.34 of the Commission's Rules; or
  - (ii) the day after the divestiture re quired by Paragraph II.C. of the Con sent Order is complet ed, or, if later, the day after all loan agreements between respondent and Monarch expire, are terminated, or are divested in accordance with Paragraph II.A. of the Consent Order.

3. To ensure the complete independence and viabil ity of the Schedule A assets and the Schedule B assets, and to ensure that no competitive infor mation is ex changed between respondent and the managers of the Schedule A assets and the Schedule B assets, respon dent shall hold the Schedule A assets and the Schedule B assets, as they are presently constituted, separate and apart on the follow ing terms and conditions:

a. The Schedule A assets and the Schedule B assets, as they are present ly constituted, shall be held sepa rate and apart and shall be managed and operated independently of respon dent (meaning here and hereinafter, Tenet ex cluding the Schedule A assets and the Schedule B assets), except to the ex tent that respondent must exercise direc tion and control over such assets to assure com pliance with this Agree ment or the Con sent Order, and except as otherwise provid ed in this Agree ment.

- Prior to, or simultaneously with the Ac quisition, b. respondent shall adopt, for the corporations that now own and operate, respectively, French Hospital Medical Center (the "French Company"), and Valley Community Hospital (the "Valley Company"), constituent documents that are not inconsistent with other provisions of this Agreement or the Consent Order. Respondent shall transfer to the French Company all ownership and control of any Schedule A assets it does not already own and control. Respondent shall transfer to the Valley Company all ownership and control of any Schedule B assets it does not already own and control. The French Company and the Valley Company shall hereafter be described collectively as the "Hold Separate Companies."
- The boards of directors of each of the Hol d Separate c. Companies ("Hold Separate Com panies Boards") shall have the same three members for each of the Hold Separate Companies. Respon dent shall elect the mem bers of the Hold Separate Companies Boards. The Hold Separate Com panies Boards shall consist of the following three persons: (i) Michael D. Bakst; (ii) Thomas Sawicki, and (iii) Michael H. Focht Sr., provided they agree, or comparable, knowl edgeable per sons. The Chairman of the Hold Separate Companies Boards shall be Michael D. Bakst, provid ed he agrees, or a compara ble, knowledge able per son, who shall remain inde pendent of Respondent and competent to as sure the con tinued via bility and competitiveness of the Schedule A assets and the Schedule B assets. The Hold Separate Companies Boards shall include no more than one mem ber who is a director, offi cer, employee, or agent of respon dent, who shall be Michael H. Focht Sr., provided he agrees, or a comparable, knowl edgeable person ("the respondent's Hold Separate Companies Boards member"). The Hold Separate Companies Boards shall meet monthly during the course of the Hold Sepa rate, and as other wise necessary. Meet ings of the Hold Separate Companies Boards during the term of this Agree ment shall be audiographically transcribed and the tapes retained for two (2) years after the termina tion of this Agreement.
- d. The operations of the Hold Separate Companies shall, to the extent deemed desirable by the Hold Separate

Companies Boards, coordinate their operations with each other as if they were a single company.

- e. Respondent shall not exercise direction or control over, or influence directly or indirectly, the Schedule A assets, the Schedule B assets, the independent Chairman of the Boards of the Hold Separate Companies, or any of their oper ations or businesses; pro vided, however, that re spondent may exer cise only such direction and control over the Hold Separate Companies as is necessary to as sure compli ance with this Agreement or the Con sent Order, or with all applicable laws.
- f. Respondent shall maintain the viability, competitiveness, and marketability of the Schedule A assets and the Schedule B assets; shall not sell, transfer, or en cumber the Schedule A assets or the Schedule B assets (other than in the nor mal course of business); and shall not cause or permit the de struction, remov al, wasting, or deterioration, or oth erwise impair the viability, com petitiveness, or marketability of the Schedule A assets or the Schedule B assets.
- g. Except for the respondent's Hold Separate Companies Boards member, re spondent shall not permit any director, officer, em ployee, or agent of respondent to also be a direc tor, officer, or employee of the Hold Separate Companies.
- h. The Hold Separate Companies shall be staffed with sufficient employ ees to maintain the via bility and competitiveness of the Schedule A assets and the Schedule B assets, which em ployees shall be select ed from the exist ing employee base of each facili ty or entity and may also be hired from sources other than these facil ities and enti ties.
- i0 Respondent shall not employ, or make offers of employment to, any person employed by the Schedule A assets or the Schedule B assets in any capacity relating to the management or marketing activities of those assets. Respondent shall encourage and facilitate continued employment by the Schedule A assets and the Schedule B assets of such employees; shall not offer any incentive to such employees to cease employment with the Schedule A assets or the

Schedule B assets, or to accept other employment with respondent; and shall take all actions necessary to remove any impediments that may deter such employees from continuing their employment with the Schedule A assets or the Schedule B assets, including but not limited to, the payment, or transfer for the account of the employee, of all accrued bonuses, pensions and other accrued benefits to which such employees would otherwise have been entitled had they remained in the employment of respondent.

- j0 With the exception of the respondent's Hold Separate Companies Boards Mem ber, respondent shall not change the composition of the Hold Separate Companies Boards unless the inde pendent Chairman consents. The independent Chair man shall have power to remove members of the Hold Separate Companies Boards for cause and to require respondent to ap point replacement members to the Hold Separate Companies Boards as provided in Paragraph 3.c. Re spondent shall not change the composition of the man agement of the Hold Separate Companies, except that the Hold Separate Compa nies Boards shall have the power to remove management employees for cause.
- k0 If the independent Chairman ceases to act or fails to act diligently, a substitute Chairman shall be appointed in the same manner as provided in Paragraph 3.c. of this Agreement.
- Except as required by law, and except to the extent 10 that neces sary information is exchanged in the course of evaluating the Acquisition, defending investigations, defending or prosecuting litigation, obtaining legal advice, negotiating agree ments to divest assets, or complying with this Agreement or the Consent Order, re spondent shall not receive or have access to, or use or continue to use, any Materi al Confidential Information not in the public domain about the Hold Separate Companies, the ac tivities of the hospitals operat ed by the Hold Separate Companies Boards, the activities of Monarch, the Schedule A assets, or the Schedule B assets. Nor shall the Hold Separate Companies or the Hold Separate Companies Boards receive or have access to, or use or con tinue to use, any Material Confidential Infor mation not in the public domain about respondent and relating to

respondent's acute care hospi tals. Respondent may receive, on a regu lar basis, aggre gate financial information relating to the Hold Separate Companies necessary and essential to allow respondent to prepare United States consoli dated financial re ports, tax returns, Medicare or Medicaid cost reports, and personnel reports. Any such information that is obtained pursuant to this subpara graph shall be used only for the purposes set forth in this subparagraph. ("Material Confiden tial Information," as used herein, means competitively sensitive or proprietary infor mation not independent ly known to an enti ty from sources other than the entity to which the information pertains, and in cludes, but is not limited to, customer lists, price lists, health plan contracts, market inq methods, patents, technologies, processes, or other trade secrets.)

- Except as permitted by this Agreement, the respondent's m0 Hold Separate Companies Boards member shall not, in his or her capacity as a Hold Separate Companies Boards member, re ceive Mate rial Confidential Informa tion, and shall not dis close any such information received under this Agreement to respondent, or use it to obtain any advantage for respondent. The respondent's Hold Separate Companies Boards member shall enter a confidentiality agree ment prohibit ing disclosure of Material Confidential Information. The respondent's Hold Separate Companies Boards member shall partic ipate in matters that come before the Hold Separate Companies Boards only for the limited purposes of con sidering a capital investment or other transaction exceeding \$250,000, approving any proposed budget and operating plans, and car rying out respondent's respon sibilities under this Agree ment and the Consent Order. Except as permitted by this Agreement, the respondent's Hold Separate Companies Boards member shall not partici pate in any matter, or attempt to in fluence the votes of the other members of the Hold Separate Companies Boards with respect to matters, that would involve a conflict of interest if re spondent and the Hold Separate Companies were separate and independent enti ties.
- n0 Any material transaction of the Hold Separate Companies that is out of the ordinary course of business must be approved by a major ity vote of the Hold Se parate

Companies Boards; pro vided that the Hold Separate Companies shall engage in no trans action, material or otherwise, that is preclud ed by this Agreement.

- o0 If necessary, respondent shall provide the Hold Separate Companies with sufficient working capit tal to operate the Schedule A assets and the Schedule B assets at their current rate of oper ation, to fulfill respondent's obligations under the loan agreement identified in Schedule A of the Consent Order, and to carry out any capital improvement plans for the Schedule A assets and the Schedule B assets that have already been ap proved.
- 0q Respondent shall continue to provide the same support services to the Schedule A assets and the Schedule B assets as are being pro vided to them by OrNda as of the date this Agree ment is signed. Respondent may charge the Hold Separate Companies the same fees, if any, charged by OrNda as of December 1, 1996 for such support ser vices. Respondent 's personnel providing such support services must retain and maintain all Material Confidential Infor mation of the Schedule A assets and the Schedule B assets on a confiden tial basis, and, ex cept as is per mitted by this Agree ment, such per sons shall be prohibited from providing, discussing, exchanging, circulating, or other wise furnishing any such information to or with any person whose employ ment involves any of respondent's businesses. Such per sonnel shall also execute confidentiality agreements prohibiting the disclo sure of any Material Confidential Information of the Schedule A assets and the Schedule B assets.
- During the period commencing on the date this Agree q0 ment is effective and terminat ing on the earlier of (i) August 1, 1997, or (ii) the date contem plated by subpara graph 2.a.(ii) (the "Initial Divestiture Period"), respondent shall make available for use by the Hold Separate Companies funds sufficient to per form all necessary routine maintenance to, and replace ments of, the Schedule A assets and the Schedule B assets ("normal re pair and replacement"). Provided, how ever, that in any event, respondent shall pro vide the Hold Separate Companies with such funds as are nec essary to maintain the viabili ty, competitiveness, and

marketabil ity of the Schedule A assets and the Schedule B assets.

- r0 Respondent shall circulate, to its man agement employees responsible for the operation of acute care hospitals in San Luis Obispo County, California, a no tice of this Hold Sepa rate and Consent Order in the form attached as Attachment A.
- s0 The Hold Separate Companies Boards shall serve at the cost and expense of respondent. Respondent shall indemnify the Hold Separate Companies Boards against any losses or claims of any kind that might arise out of its involvement under this Hold Separate Agreement, except to the ex tent that such losses or claims result from mis feasance, gross negligence, willful or wanton acts, or bad faith by the Hold Separate Companies Boards directors.
- t0 The Hold Separate Companies Boards shall have access to and be in formed about all companies who inquire about, seek, or propose to acquire the Schedule A assets or the Schedule B assets.
- u0 Within thirty (30) days after the date this Agreement is accepted by the Com mission and every thir ty (30) days thereafter until this Agreement ter minates, the Hold Separate Companies Boards shall together report in writing to the Com mission concerning those Boards' efforts to accomplish the purposes of this Hold Separate.

4 To ensure the complete independence of Monarch from respondent (meaning here and hereinaf ter, Tenet ex cluding the Schedule A assets and the Schedule B assets), and to ensure that no competitive Monarch infor mation is disclosed to respondent, respondent shall establish a trust for Tenet's Monarch stock, on the follow ing terms and conditions:

a. Prior to, or simultaneously with the Ac quisition, respondent shall establish a voting trust for Tenet's Monarch stock, for which the Trustee shall be the independent Chairman of the Hold Separate Companies Boards. The Trustee shall exercise any and all voting rights of Tenet's Monarch stock, on all matters (including without limitation the election or removal of directors), voted on by Monarch shareholders,

whether at a regular or special meeting, or pursuant to a unanimous written consent. The Trustee shall vote all shares of Tenet's Monarch stock in the same proportion as all other shares of Monarch's stock are voted with respect to such matters. The Trustee shall also be present, in person or by proxy, at all annual or special meetings of Monarch shareholders, so that Tenet's Monarch stock may be counted for purposes of determining the presence of a quorum at such meetings.

b. Tenet shall not use its holdings of Monarch stock, or any loan agreements with Monarch:

- (i) to control or influence the conduct of Monarch 's business, or Monarch's business relationships with French Hospital Medical Center; or
- (ii) to obtain Material Confiden tial Information of Monarch, except Monarch financial information necessary and essential to allow respondent to prepare United States consoli dated financial reports and tax returns, to allow respondent to prepare Medicare or Medicaid cost reports, or for use by the Hold Separate Companies in order to carry out the loan agreement identified in Schedule A of the Consent Order (which Monarch information shall be used only for the purposes set forth in this subparagraph).
- c. Tenet shall not permit any di rector, officer, employee, agent, or representative of Tenet to serve on Monarch's board of directors.

5 Should the Commission seek in any proceeding to compel respondent to divest the Schedule A assets and/or the Schedule B assets, as provid ed in the Con sent Order, or to seek any other injunctive or equita ble relief for any failure to comply with the Consent Order or this Agreement, or in any way relating to the Acquisition, as defined in the Consent Order, respondent shall not raise any objection based upon the expiration of the applicable Hart-Scott-Rodino Antitrust Improve ments Act waiting period or the fact that the Commission has permitted the Acquisition. Respondent also waives all rights to contest the validity of this Agreement.

6 To the extent that this Agreement requires respondent to take, or prohibits respondent from taking, certain actions that otherwise may be required or prohib ited by contract, respondent shall abide by the terms of this Agreement or the Consent Order and shall not assert as a defense such contract require ments in a civil penal ty action brought by the Commission to enforce the terms of this Agree ment or the Consent Order.

7 For the purposes of determining or securing compliance with this Agreement, and subject to any legal ly recognized privilege, and upon written request with reasonable notice to respondent made to its principal office, respondent shall permit any duly authorized representatives of the Commis sion:

- a0 Access, during office hours of respondent and in the presence of counsel, to inspect and copy all books, ledgers, accounts, correspondence, memoranda, and all other records and documents in the possession or under the control of the respondent relat ing to comp liance with this Agreement;
- b0 Upon five (5) days 'notice to respondent and without restraint or interfer ence from respondent, to interview officers, direc tors, or employees of respondent, who may have counsel present, regarding such mat ters.

8 This Agreement shall not be binding until approved by the Commission.

Dated: January , 1997

### TENET HEALTHCARE CORPORATION

By:

Scott M. Brown, Esq. Senior Vice President, General Counsel and Secretary

### FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

By:

Stephen Calkins General Counsel

Consent Agreement Accepted for Public Comment by the Commission on January 28, 1997

Donald S. Clark Secretary

#### ATTACHMENT A

#### NOTICE OF DIVESTITURE AND REQUIREMENT FOR CONFIDENTIALITY

Tenet Healthcare Corpora tion has entered into a Consent Agree ment and Agree ment to Hold Separate with the Federal Trade Com mission relating to the dives titure of certain assets, in or near San Luis Obispo County, California, that Tenet is to acquire through its acquisition of OrNda Healthcorp.

Until after the divestitures required under the Consent Agreement are completed, OrNda 's hospitals and other businesses in San Luis Obispo County, California, as well as those in Santa Barbara County, California (collectively the "Hold Separate Assets"), must be managed and maintained as a separate, ongoing business, independent of all other Tenet busi nesses. All competitive informa tion relating to the Hold Separate Assets must be retained and main tained by the persons involved in the opera tion of those Assets on a confidential basis, and such persons shall be prohibited from providing, discussing, exchang ing, circu lating, or otherwise furnishing any such infor mation to or with any other person whose employment involves any other Tenet business. Similarly, all such persons involved in Tenet shall be prohibited from provid ing, discussing, exchanging, circulating, or otherwise fur nishing any such information to or with any other person whose em ployment involves any of the Hold Separate Assets. (These confidentiality requirements are subject to limited exceptions, set forth in the Hold Separate Agreement.)

Monarch Health Systems is also to remain independent of Tenet's businesses, other than the Hold Separate Assets, pending Tenet's divestiture of its Monarch stock.

Any violation of the Consent Agreement or the Agreement to Hold Separate (which is incorporated by reference as part of the Consent Order to which Tenet has agreed), may subject Tenet to civil penal ties and other relief as provided by law.

#### UNITED STATES OF AMERICA BEFORE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

)

)

)

)

In the Matter of

TENET HEALTHCARE CORPORATION, a corporation.

Docket No.

#### COMPLAINT

Pursuant to the provisions of the Federal Trade Commission Act, and by virtue of the authority vested in it by said Act, the Federal Trade Commission, having reason to believe that the respondent, Tenet Healthcare Corporation ("Tenet"), a corporation subject to the jurisdiction of the Commission, has entered into an agreement whereby Tenet will acquire the stock of OrNda HealthCorp ("OrNda"); that the acquisition agreement violates Section 5 of the Federal Trade Commission Act, as amended, 15 U.S.C. § 45; that the proposed acquisition, if consummated, would violate Section 7 of the Clayton Act, as amended, 15 U.S.C. § 18, and Section 5 of the Federal Trade Commission Act, as amended, 15 U.S.C. § 45; and it appearing to the Commission that a proceeding by it in respect thereof would be in the public interest, the Commission hereby issues its complaint, pursuant to Section 11(b) of the Clayton Act, 15 U.S.C. § 21(b), and Section 5(b) of the Federal Trade Commission Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(b), stating its charges a s follows:

#### DEFINITIONS

PARAGRAPH ONE: For purposes of this Complaint the following definitions shall apply:

(a) "Acute care hospital" means a health facility, licensed as a hospital, other than a federally owned facility, having a duly organized governing body with overall administrative and professional responsibility, and an organized professional staff, that provides 24 -hour inpatient care, and may also provide outpatient services, and having as a primary function the provision of inpatient services for medical diagnosis, treatment, and care of physically injured or sick persons with short -term or episodic health problems or infirmities.

(b) "Acute care inpatient hospital services" means 24 -hour inpatient health care, and related medical or surgical diagnostic and treatment services, for physically injured or sick persons with short-term or episodic health problems or infirmities.

#### THE PARTIES

PARAGRAPH TWO: Tenet is a corporation organized, existing, and doing business under and by virtue of the laws of Nevada, with its principal place of business at 3820 State Street, Santa Barbara, California 93105. Tenet owns and operates, among other things, over seventy-five acute care hospitals throughout the United States. Included among those hospitals are Sierra Vista Regional Medical Center ("Sierra Vista"), a 195-bed acute care hospital in the city of San Luis Obispo, California, and Twin Cities Community Hospital, an 84-bed acute care hospital in Templeton, California, about twenty-two miles north of the city of San Luis Obispo. In fiscal year 1996, Tenet had total sales of approximately \$5.6 billion, and its two hospitals in San Luis Obispo County, California had total sales of about \$83 million.

PARAGRAPH THREE: OrNda is a corporation organized, existing, and doing business under and by virtue of the laws of Delaware, with its principal place of business at 3401 West End Avenue, Nashville, Tennessee 37203. OrNda owns and operates over fifty acute care hospitals throughout the United States. Included among those hospitals is French Hospital Medical Center ("French Hospital"), a 147-bed acute care hospital in the city of San Luis Obispo, California. In fiscal year 1996, OrNda had total sales of about \$1.8 billion, and French Hospital had total sales of about \$47 million.

#### JURISDICTION

PARAGRAPH FOUR: Tenet and OrNda, at all times relevant herein, have been and are now engaged in or affecting commerce, as "commerce" is defined in Section 1 of the Clayton Act, as amended, 15 U.S.C. § 12. The businesses of Tenet and OrNda, at all times relevant herein, have been and are now in or affecting commerce, as "commerce" is defined in Section 4 of the Federal Trade Commission Act, as amended, 15 U.S.C. § 44.

#### THE PROPOSED ACQUISITION

PARAGRAPH FIVE: On or about October 16, 1996, Tenet and OrNda entered into an agreement whereby Tenet will acquire 100 percent of the voting stock of OrNda, and OrNda stockholders will receive Tenet voting stock in exchange. Tenet will also assume OrNda debt. The total value of the transaction is about \$3.1 billion.

#### NATURE OF TRADE AND COMMERCE

PARAGRAPH SIX: The relevant line of commerce in which to analyze the proposed acquisition is the production and sale of acute care inpatient hospital services and/or any narrower group of services contained therein.

PARAGRAPH SEVEN: The relevant section of the country in which to analyze the proposed acquisition is San Luis Obispo County, California ("San Luis Obispo County"), and/or any narrower area contained therein .

#### MARKET STRUCTURE

PARAGRAPH EIGHT: Tenet currently owns two of the five acute care hospitals in San Luis Obispo County, including Sierra Vista, the largest acute care hospital in the county. Tenet 's acquisition of OrNda would add the largest of its competitors, French Hospital, to its holdings in San Luis Obispo County. Sierra Vista and French each provide a broader range of acute care inpatient hospital services than any of the other three acute care hospitals in San Luis Obispo County, and are each other's principal and most direct competitor. The other providers of acute care inpatient hospital services in San Luis Obispo County are Arroyo Grande Community Hospital, a 79-bed hospital in Arroyo Grande, about thirteen miles south of the city of San Luis Obispo, and San Luis Obispo General Hospital, a 64-bed hospital located in the city of San Luis Obispo and operated by the San Luis Obispo County government. The longterm competitive prospects of San Luis Obispo General Hospital are clouded by its need for expensive capital improvements to, among

other things, meet stringent new state earthquake safety requirements.

PARAGRAPH NINE: The relevant market is highly concentrated, whether measured by the Herfindahl -Hirschman Index ("HHI") or by market share. The proposed acquisition would significantly increase concentration in this market. It would increase Tenet 's market share by at least 17%, to at least 71%. The HHI would increase at least 2000 points, to a post-acquisition level over 5000.

#### ENTRY CONDITIONS

PARAGRAPH TEN: It is unlikely that entry into the relevant market would prevent, or remedy in a timely manner, any anticompetitive effects from the proposed acquisition. Entry is difficult, and likely to take more than two years, due to among other things the time required to obtain necessary government permits, including state architectural review, and to complete construction of an acute care hospital.

#### COMPETITION

PARAGRAPH ELEVEN: Tenet and OrNda are actual and potential competitors in the relevant market.

#### EFFECTS

PARAGRAPH TWELVE: The effects of the aforesaid acquisition, if consummated, may be substantially to lessen competition in the relevant market in the following ways, among others:

(a) it would eliminate actual and potential competition between Tenet and OrNda;

(b) it would significantly increase the already high level of concentration;

(c) it would eliminate OrNda as a substantial, independent and competitive provider;

(d) it may permit Tenet to unilaterally raise prices;

(e) it may result in less favorable prices and other terms for health plans that contract with providers of acute care hospital services;

(f) it may increase the possibility of collusion or interdependent coordination by the remaining providers of acute care inpatient hospital services;

(g) it may deny patients, physicians, third-party payers, and other consumers of acute care inpatient hospital services the benefits of free and open competition based on price, quality, and service; and

(h) it may deny the San Luis Obispo County government the ability to purchase on competitive terms the acute care inpatient hospital services it must provide to certain indigent County residents, as a potentially less costly alternative to providing such services to those residents at its own hospital.

#### VIOLATIONS CHARGED

PARAGRAPH THIRTEEN: The acquisition agreement described in PARAGRAPH FIVE above violates Section 5 of the Federal Trade Commission Act, as amended, 15 U.S.C. § 45.

PARAGRAPH FOURTEEN: The acquisition described in PARAGRAPH FIVE, if consummated, would violate Section 7 of the Clayton Act, as amended, 15 U.S.C. § 18, and Section 5 of the Federal Trade Commission Act, as amended, 15 U.S.C. § 45.

WHEREFORE, THE PREMISES CONSIDERED, the Federal Trade Commission on this \_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_, 1997, issues its complaint against Tenet Healthcare Corporation.

By the Commission

Donald S. Clark Secretary

SEAL

# Analysis of Proposed Consent Order to Aid Public Comment Tenet Healthcare Corp., FTC File No. 971-0024

The Federal Trade Commission has accepted, subject to final approval, a proposed consent order from Tenet Healthcare Corp. ("Tenet"), to resolve antitrust concerns raised by Tenet's proposed acquisition of OrNda Healthcorp ("OrNda"). Tenet would be required to divest, among other things, OrNda's French Hospital and Medical Center in San Luis Obispo, California ("French"), and OrNda's interests in Monarch Health Systems, an integrated health care delivery system in the San Luis Obispo area. Tenet has also agreed to hold French, the Monarch interests, and some additional assets separate from Tenet's other assets, pending the required divestitures.

The proposed consent order has been placed on the public record for sixty (60) days for reception of comments by interested persons. Comments received during this period will become part of the public record. After sixty (60) days, the Commission will again review the agreement and the comments received, and will decide whether it should withdraw from the agreement or make final the agreement's proposed order.

#### The Commission's Complaint

The proposed consent order would settle charges by the Federal Trade Commission that Tenet's proposed acquisition of OrNda Healthcorp would endanger competition in the market for inpatient acute care hospital services in San Luis Obispo County, California, and so would violate Section 7 of the Clayton Act and Section 5 of the Federal Trade Commission Act. This matter involves the same market, and the same principal hospitals, as were at issue in a previous Commission hospital merger case, <u>American Medical</u> <u>International, Inc.</u>, 104 F.T.C. 1, 617 (1984), which resulted in the divestiture of French.

Tenet operates over 75 acute care hos pitals nationwide. In San Luis Obispo County, Tenet operates two acute care hospitals, 195-bed Sierra Vista Regional Medical Center ("Sierra Vista") in the city of San Luis Obispo, and 84-bed Twin Cities Community Hospital ("Twin Cities") in Templeton about 22 miles to the north of San Luis Obispo. OrNda operates over 50 acute care hospitals nationwide, including 147-bed French Hospital Medical Center in the city of San Luis Obispo. OrNda also operates 70-bed Valley Community Hospital in Santa Maria, in northern Santa Barbara County about 30 miles south of the city of San Luis Obispo.

The complaint alleges that Tenet and OrNda are the two leading competitors, out of only four providers, of acute care hospital

services in San Luis Obispo County, California. It further alleges that Tenet's main hospital in the area, Sierra Vista, and OrNda's French hospital, offer broader service complements than any of the other hospitals in the county, and are each other's principal and most direct competitor.

The complaint identifies 79-bed Arroyo Grande Community Hospital in southern San Luis Obispo County, and county-owned 64bed San Luis Obispo General Hospital ("SLO General") in the city of San Luis Obispo, as the only acute care hospitals in San Luis Obispo County that would not be owned by Tenet after the acquisition of OrNda. The complaint further alleges that SLO General's long-term competitive prospects are clouded by its need for major capital improvements, including construction required to bring the hospital into compliance with stringent new state earthquake safety standards.

As stated in the complaint, the proposed acquisition would eliminate competition between Tenet and OrNda, and significantly increase the already high level of concentration for inpatient acute care hospital services in San Luis Obispo County. The complaint also alleges that the proposed merger would increase

the market share of Tenet, already the leading provider of inpatient acute care hospital services in the Tri-Cities area, to over 71%, an increase of at least 17% above its existing market share. The complaint further alleges that, as measured by the Herfindahl-Hirschman Index ("HHI"), market concentration would increase more than 2000 points to a post-acquisition level of over 5000. The HHI is a measure of market concentration used by the Federal antitrust enforcement agencies to estimate, in conjunction with information on other market factors, the likelihood that a merger would endanger competition. As explained in the 1992 Merger Guidelines, the Federal antitrust enforcement agencies consider markets with HHI levels above 1800 (on a scale of 0 to 10,000) to be "highly concentrated," and, where the post-merger HHI would exceed 1800, presume that a merger producing an increase in the HHI of more than 100 points is likely to significantly lessen competition (unless factors other than market concentration indicate that the merger presents no significant threat to competition).

According to the complaint, it is unlikely that entry into San Luis Obispo County by a new acute care hospital will prevent or remedy any anticompetitive price increases or other effects resulting from the ac quisition. This is due to, among other factors, the lengthy lead times required to build new hospitals in

the relevant market, such as those required by California's requirements for advance review of hospital building plans.

The complaint alleges that the proposed acquisition may: substantially lessen competition for inpatient acute care hospital services in San Luis Obispo County; result in less favorable prices and other terms for health plans that contract for such services in the county; increase the possibility of collusion or interdependent coordination by the remaining market competitors; deny patients, physicians, third-party payers, and other consumers of inpatient acute care hospital services, the benefits of free and open competition based on price, quality, and service; and deny the opportunity for the San Luis Obispo County government to purchase, on competitive terms, the hospital care it must provide to certain indigent County residents, as a potentially less costly alternative to providing those services at SLO General.

#### The Proposed Consent and Hold Separate Agreements

The consent order, if issued in final form by the Commission, would require Tenet to divest French and related OrNda assets, after Tenet acquires OrNda. These assets include,

among others, OrNda's interests in a surgery center, two urgent care centers, and two medical office buildings in San Luis Obispo County. (Order, Paragraph II.A. and II.B.)

Tenet would also be required to divest OrNda's holdings of about one-third of the stock of, and also a short-term loan agreement with, Monarch Health Systems ("Monarch"). Monarch is an integrated health delivery system, operating in San Luis Obispo and Santa Barbara Counties. Monarch has a long-term exclusive contract with French, through which French receives a large percentage of its patients. (Order, Paragraph II.C.) As part of the Agreement to Hold Separate accompanying the proposed order, Tenet has agreed -- effective immediately -- to place OrNda's stock in Monarch into a voting trust, and take other measures designed to prevent Tenet from exercising influence or control over Monarch, pending divestiture of the Monarch stock and loan agreement. (Hold Separate, Paragraph 4.) These measures are to prevent Tenet from using the Monarch stock and loan agreement to damage French's business relationship with Monarch, and thereby lessen French's competitiveness and viability.

Under the terms of the proposed order, Tenet must make the foregoing divestitures to an acquirer, and in a manner, approved

by the Commission. (However, Tenet may divest the Monarch stock to someone other than the purchaser of French, and if Monarch is bought in its entirety by a third party, Tenet need not obtain prior approval to divest its Monarch stock to Monarch's new owner.) The approval requirement allows the Commission to make sure that Tenet's divestitures fulfill their purpose, of ensuring the continuation of French as an ongo ing, independent, and viable acute care hospi tal, and remedying the less ening of competition resulting from Tenet's acquisition of OrNda. (Order, Paragraph II.D. and II.E.)

The divestitures must be completed by August 1, 1997; otherwise, Tenet will consent to the appointment of a trustee, who will have twelve additional months to effect the divestitures. If Tenet does not complete a Commission-approved divestiture of French by August 1, 1997, the Commission may appoint a trustee to complete that divestiture. The trustee may divest not only French and related assets, but also OrNda's Valley Community Hospital in Santa Maria, south of San Luis Obispo County, and certain assets relating to Valley, if the additional hospital and assets turn out to be necessary for a

successful divestiture of French. (Order, Paragraphs II.E. and III.)

The Agreement to Hold Separate executed in conjunction with the consent agreement requires Tenet, effective immediately, to maintain French, Valley, the Monarch stock and loan agreement, and related assets separate from Tenet's other operations until the completion of the divestitures, or as otherwise specified. The Agreement to Hold Separate also requires Tenet to comply with the provisions of the proposed consent order, pending its final approval by the Commission.

To assure the complete independence and viability of French and Valley hospitals, and related assets, the Hold Separate Agreement requires Tenet to transfer control of those assets to a three-member board (only one of whom will be a Tenet employee), and to ensure that no competitive information is exchanged between Tenet and those assets. (The Hold Separate Agreement's provisions relating to the Monarch stock have been described above.) Under the Hold Separate Agreement, Tenet may not exercise any direction, control, or influence over the assets to be held separate, except as necessary to ensure compliance with the Consent Order and the Hold Separate Agreement, and to ensure

the continued viability, competitiveness, and marketability of those assets. (Hold Separate, Paragraph 3.)

For ten years after the order is made final, the proposed consent order would prohibit Tenet from combining (through purchase, sale, lease, or otherwise) its acute care hospitals in San Luis Obispo County with any other acute care hospital in that area, or from acquiring Monarch stock, without prior notice to the Federal Trade Commission. Tenet must provide such notice in accordance with procedures similar to those governing premerger notifications required by Section 7A of the Clayton Act, 15 U.S.C. § 18a (unless the merger is already subject to Section 7A's requirements, in which case no notice is necessary over and above that provided pursuant to Section 7A). The order provision supplements Section 7A, to ensure that the Commission receives advance notice of potentially significant Tenet mergers in the relevant market, and to thereby give the Commission an opportunity to block any such merger if it can demonstrate that the merger may substantially lessen competition. The proposed order contains certain limited exceptions to the prior notification requirement for transactions which are unlikely to substantially lessen competition, such as for trans actions under \$1 million. (Order, Paragraph IV)

The proposed consent order also contains provisions concerning its continued application to future owners of French and of Tenet's

acute care hos pitals in San Luis Obispo County. The acquirer of French, pursuant to the divestiture called for by the order, must agree not to transfer the hospital, for ten years from the date of the order, without prior notice to the Commission, to any person already operating an acute care hospital in San Luis Obispo County. (Order, Paragraph II.H.) In addition, the order would prohibit Tenet for ten years from transferring an acute care hospital facility in San Luis Obispo County, other than French (<u>e.g.</u>, Sierra Vista or Twin Cities) to another person, unless the acquiring person first files with the Commission an agreement to be bound by the order. (Order, Paragraph V)

\* \* \* \*

The purpose of this analysis is to invite public comment concerning the proposed order, and to assist the Commission in its determination of whether to make the order final. This analysis is not intended to constitute an official interpretation of the agreement or to modify its terms in any way.