

1 **James E. Evans**, Va. Bar No. 83866
 2 james.evans@ftc.gov
 (202) 326-2026
 3 **Ian L. Barlow**, D.C. Bar No. 998500
 4 ibarlow@ftc.gov
 (202) 326-3120
 5 **Federal Trade Commission**
 6 600 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, CC-8528
 Washington, DC 20580
 7 (202) 326-3395 (fax)

8 **Thomas J. Syta**, Cal. Bar No. 116286
 9 tsyta@ftc.gov
 (310) 824-4343
 10 Local Counsel
 11 **Federal Trade Commission**
 12 10877 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 700
 Los Angeles, CA 90024
 13 (310) 824-4380 (fax)

14 **Attorneys for Plaintiff**
 15 **Federal Trade Commission**

17 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
 18 **CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

19 **Federal Trade Commission,**
 20
 21 Plaintiff,
 22
 vs.
 23 **Aaron Michael Jones**, also known as
 24 Michael Aaron Jones, also known as
 Mike Jones, individually and as an
 25 owner, officer, or manager, or a *de facto*
 26 owner, officer, or manager of Allorey,
 Inc., Audacity LLC, Data World
 27 Technologies, Inc., Dial Soft
 Technologies, Inc., Digital Marketing
 28 Solutions, Inc., Local Lighthouse Corp.,

No. 8:17-cv-00058

**Stipulation to Entry of
 Final Order for Permanent
 Injunction and Civil Penalty
 Judgment as to Defendants
 Eric Oakley and Richard Paik**

1 Savilo Support Services, Inc., Secure
2 Alliance Corp., Velocity Information
3 Corp., and World Access Media;

4 **Houston Fraley**, individually and as an
5 officer of Local Lighthouse Corp.;

6 **Tyler Hall**, individually and as an
7 officer of Local Lighthouse Corp. and
8 Secure Alliance Corp.;

9 **Kasia Kinaman**, individually and as an
10 officer of Digital Marketing Solutions,
11 Inc.;

12 **Eric Oakley**, individually and as an
13 officer of Local Lighthouse Corp. and
14 Velocity Information Corp.;

15 **Richard Paik**, individually, as an
16 officer of Local Lighthouse Corp. and
17 Secure Alliance Corp., and as an owner,
18 officer, or manager, or *de facto* owner,
19 officer, or manager of Allorey, Inc.,
20 Data World Technologies, Inc., Dial
21 Soft Technologies, Inc., Digital
22 Marketing Solutions, Inc., Savilo
23 Support Services, Inc., and Velocity
24 Information Corp.;

25 **Steven Stansbury**, also known as Steve
26 Stansbury, individually and as an officer
27 of Data World Technologies, Inc., and
28 Dial Soft Technologies, Inc.;

Raymund Verallo, also known as
Raymond Verallo, also known as Ray
Verallo, individually and as an officer of
Allorey, Inc. and Dial Soft
Technologies, Inc.;

1 **Andrew Yoshioka**, individually and as
2 an officer of Audacity LLC and World
3 Access Media;

4 **Allorey, Inc.**, a California corporation;

5 **Audacity LLC**, a California limited
6 liability company;

7 **Data World Technologies, Inc.**, a
8 California corporation;

9 **Dial Soft Technologies, Inc.**, a former
10 Nevada corporation;

11 **Digital Marketing Solutions, Inc.**, a
12 California corporation;

13 **Local Lighthouse Corp.**, a California
14 corporation;

15 **Savilo Support Services, Inc.**, a
16 California corporation;

17 **Secure Alliance Corp.**, a California
18 corporation;

19 **Velocity Information Corp.**, a former
20 California corporation; and

21 **World Access Media**, a California
22 corporation;

23 Defendants.
24

25 Plaintiff, the Federal Trade Commission (“Commission” or “FTC”), filed its
26 Complaint for Civil Penalties, Permanent Injunction and Other Relief
27 (“Complaint”) pursuant to Sections 5(a), 5(m)(1)(A), 13(b), and 16(a) of the
28 Federal Trade Commission Act (“FTC Act”), 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a), 45(m)(1)(A),

1 53(b), and 56(a), and Section 6 of the Telemarketing and Consumer Fraud and
2 Abuse Prevention Act (the “Telemarketing Act”), 15 U.S.C. § 6105. The
3 Commission and Defendants Eric Oakley and Richard Paik (the “Individual
4 Defendants”) stipulate to the entry of a Stipulated Final Order for Permanent
5 Injunction and Civil Penalty Judgment (the “Order”) to resolve all matters in
6 dispute in this action between them, but not as to any other person, such as an
7 indemnitee. A proposed Stipulated Final Order is lodged concurrently with this
8 Stipulation, with the following terms and provisions:

9 **FINDINGS**

10 1. This Court has jurisdiction over this matter.

11 2. The Complaint charges that the Individual Defendants participated in
12 acts or practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45, and the
13 FTC’s Telemarketing Sales Rule (the “TSR” or “Rule”), as amended, 16 C.F.R.
14 Part 310, by assisting and facilitating their clients who were, among other things:
15 (a) placing telemarketing calls to consumers that delivered prerecorded messages;
16 (b) placing telemarketing calls to consumers whose telephone numbers were on the
17 National Do Not Call (“DNC”) Registry; and (c) transmitting inaccurate caller ID
18 numbers and names with their telemarketing calls.

19 3. The Individual Defendants neither admit nor deny any of the
20 allegations in the Complaint, except as specifically stated in this Order. Only for
21 purposes of this action, the Individual Defendants admit the facts necessary to
22 establish jurisdiction.

23 4. The Individual Defendants waive any claim that they may have under
24 the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, concerning the prosecution of
25 this action through the date of this Order, and they agree to bear their own costs
26 and attorney fees.

27 5. The Individual Defendants and the Commission waive all rights to
28 appeal or otherwise challenge or contest the validity of this Order.

1 **DEFINITIONS**

2 For the purpose of this Order, the following definitions apply:

3 A. **“Individual Defendants”** means Defendants Eric Oakley and Richard
4 Paik, individually, collectively, or in any combination.

5 B. **“Caller Identification Service”** means a service that allows a
6 telephone subscriber to have the telephone number, and, where available, name of
7 the calling party transmitted contemporaneously with the telephone call, and
8 displayed on a device in or connected to the subscriber’s telephone.

9 C. **“Lead Generator”** means any person that provides, in exchange for
10 consideration, consumer information to a Seller or Telemarketer for use in the
11 marketing of any goods or services.

12 D. **“National Do Not Call Registry”** means the “do-not-call” registry of
13 telephone numbers maintained by the Commission pursuant to 16 C.F.R.
14 § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B).

15 E. **“Outbound Telephone Call”** means a telephone call initiated by a
16 Telemarketer to induce the purchase of goods or services or to solicit a charitable
17 contribution.

18 F. **“Person”** means any individual, group, unincorporated association,
19 limited or general partnership, corporation, or other business entity.

20 G. **“Representatives”** means a Defendant’s officers, agents, employees,
21 and those persons in active concert or participation with him who receive actual
22 notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise.

23 H. **“Seller”** means any person who, in connection with a Telemarketing
24 transaction, provides, offers to provide, or arranges for others to provide goods or
25 services to the customer in exchange for consideration, whether or not such person
26 is under the jurisdiction of the Commission.

27
28

1 I. **“Telemarketer”** means any person who, in connection with
2 Telemarketing, initiates or receives telephone calls to or from a customer or donor,
3 whether or not such person is under the jurisdiction of the Commission.

4 J. **“Telemarketing”** means a plan, program, or campaign which is
5 conducted to induce the purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution,
6 by use of one or more telephones and which involves more than one interstate
7 telephone call.

8 **ORDER**

9 **I**

10 **Permanent Ban on Robocalls**

11 **It is ordered** that the Individual Defendants, whether acting directly or
12 through an intermediary, are permanently restrained and enjoined from initiating,
13 causing others to initiate, or assisting others in initiating any telephone call that
14 plays or delivers a prerecorded message.

15 *Provided, however,* the Individual Defendants are not permanently restrained
16 and enjoined from placing such calls to a business telephone number to induce the
17 purchase of goods (other than nondurable office or cleaning supplies) or services
18 by the business or to solicit a charitable contribution by the business.

19 **II**

20 **Permanent Ban on Calling Telephone Numbers**

21 **Listed on the National Do Not Call Registry**

22 **It is further ordered** that the Individual Defendants, whether acting directly
23 or through an intermediary, are permanently restrained and enjoined from
24 initiating, causing others to initiate, or assisting others in initiating any telephone
25 call to any telephone number listed on the National Do Not Call Registry.

1 **III**

2 **Prohibition Against Abusive Telemarketing Practices**

3 **It is further ordered** that, in connection with Telemarketing, the Individual
4 Defendants and their Representatives are permanently restrained and enjoined from
5 engaging in, causing others to engage in, or assisting others engaging in, any of the
6 following practices:

7 A. Initiating any Outbound Telephone Call to a person on behalf of a
8 Lead Generator, Seller, Telemarketer, or any other third-party when that person has
9 previously stated that he or she does not wish to receive an Outbound Telephone
10 Call made by or on behalf of that Lead Generator, Seller, Telemarketer, or third-
11 party.

12 B. Initiating any Outbound Telephone Call to a telephone number within
13 a given area code when the annual fee for access to the telephone numbers within
14 that area code that are on the National Do Not Call Registry has not been paid by
15 or on behalf of Individual Defendants.

16 C. Initiating any Outbound Telephone Call in which the Individual
17 Defendants, their Representatives, or the Lead Generator, Telemarketer, or Seller
18 on whose behalf the call is made, fail to disclose truthfully, promptly, and in a clear
19 and conspicuous manner: (i) the identity of the Lead Generator, Telemarketer,
20 and/or Seller, (ii) that the purpose of the call is to sell goods or services, and
21 (iii) the nature of the goods or services.

22 D. Initiating any Outbound Telephone Call in which the Individual
23 Defendants or their Representatives fail to transmit or cause to be transmitted to
24 any Caller Identification Service in use by a recipient of a Telemarketing call
25 either: (i) the telephone number and name of the Telemarketer making the call; or
26 (ii) the name and customer service telephone number of the Seller on whose behalf
27 the call was made.

28

1 E. Violating the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. Part 310, attached
2 as Appendix A.

3 **IV**

4 **Monetary Judgment for Civil Penalty and Partial Suspension**
5 **as to Defendant Eric Oakley**

6 **It is further ordered** that:

7 A. Judgment in the amount of Two Million, Seven Hundred Thousand
8 Dollars (\$2,700,000) is entered in favor of the Commission against Defendant Eric
9 Oakley as a civil penalty.

10 B. Defendant Eric Oakley is ordered to pay to the Commission One
11 Hundred Seventy-Five Thousand Dollars (\$175,000), which, as Defendant Eric
12 Oakley stipulates, undersigned counsel holds in escrow for no purpose other than
13 payment to the Commission. Such payment must be made within seven (7) days of
14 entry of this Order by electronic fund transfer in accordance with instructions
15 previously provided by a representative of the Commission. Upon such payment,
16 the remainder of the judgment is suspended, subject to Subsection C, below, and
17 the Section titled Additional Monetary Provisions.

18 C. The Commission's agreement to the suspension of part of this
19 judgment is expressly premised upon the truthfulness, accuracy, and completeness
20 of Defendant Eric Oakley's sworn financial statements and related documents
21 (collectively, "financial representations") submitted to the Commission, namely:
22 the Financial Statement of Individual Defendant Eric Oakley signed on May 31,
23 2016, including the attachments and documents submitted with the Financial
24 Statement.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

V

**Monetary Judgment for Civil Penalty and Partial Suspension
as to Defendant Richard Paik**

It is further ordered that:

A. Judgment in the amount of Two Million, Seven Hundred Thousand Dollars (\$2,700,000) is entered in favor of the Commission against Defendant Richard Paik as a civil penalty.

B. Defendant Richard Paik is ordered to pay to the Commission Two Hundred Twenty-Five Thousand Dollars (\$225,000), which, as Defendant Richard Paik stipulates, undersigned counsel holds in escrow for no purpose other than payment to the Commission. Such payment must be made within seven (7) days of entry of this Order by electronic fund transfer in accordance with instructions previously provided by a representative of the Commission. Upon such payment, the remainder of the judgment is suspended, subject to Subsection C, below, and the Section titled Additional Monetary Provisions.

C. The Commission's agreement to the suspension of part of this judgment is expressly premised upon the truthfulness, accuracy, and completeness of Defendant Richard Paik's sworn financial statements and related documents (collectively, "financial representations") submitted to the Commission, namely: the Financial Statement of Individual Defendant Richard Paik signed on May 24, 2016, including the attachments and documents submitted with the Financial Statement.

VI

Additional Monetary Provisions

A. The suspension of any judgment entered in Sections IV and V of this Order will be lifted as to the Individual Defendant subject to that judgment if, upon motion by the Commission, the Court finds that such Individual Defendant failed to disclose any material asset, materially misstated the value of any asset, or made

1 any other material misstatement or omission in the Individual Defendant's
2 financial representations identified above.

3 B. If the suspension of any judgment entered in Sections IV and V of this
4 Order is lifted, the judgment becomes immediately due as to the Individual
5 Defendant that is subject to that judgment in the amount specified in Subsection A
6 of the applicable Section above (which the parties stipulate only for purposes of
7 this Section represents the amount of the civil penalty for the violations alleged in
8 the Complaint), less any payment previously made pursuant to the applicable
9 Section, plus interest computed from the date of entry of this Order.

10 C. The Individual Defendants relinquish dominion and all legal and
11 equitable right, title, and interest in all assets transferred pursuant to this Order and
12 may not seek the return of any assets.

13 D. The facts alleged in the Complaint will be taken as true, without
14 further proof, in any subsequent civil litigation by or on behalf of the Commission,
15 including in a proceeding to enforce its rights to any payment or monetary
16 judgment pursuant to this Order.

17 E. The Individual Defendants agree that the judgment represents a civil
18 penalty owed to the government of the United States, is not compensation for
19 actual pecuniary loss, and, therefore, as to the Individual Defendants, it is not
20 subject to discharge under the Bankruptcy Code pursuant to 11 U.S.C. § 523(a)(7).

21 F. The Individual Defendants acknowledge that their Taxpayer
22 Identification Numbers (Social Security Numbers), which they must submit, may
23 be used for collecting and reporting on any delinquent amount arising out of this
24 Order, in accordance with 31 U.S.C. § 7701.

25 VII

26 Cooperation

27 **It is further ordered** that the Individual Defendants must fully cooperate
28 with representatives of the Commission in this case and in any investigation related

1 to or associated with the transactions or the occurrences that are the subject of the
2 Complaint. The Individual Defendants must provide truthful and complete
3 information, evidence, and testimony. The Individual Defendants must appear for
4 interviews, discovery, hearings, trials, and any other proceedings that a
5 Commission representative may reasonably request upon five days written notice,
6 or other reasonable notice, at such places and times as a Commission
7 representative may designate, without the service of a subpoena. Further, to assist
8 the Commission with any investigation related to or associated with the
9 transactions or the occurrences that are the subject of the Complaint, and with
10 monitoring each Individual Defendant's compliance with this order, each
11 Individual Defendant consents, for purposes of the Electronic Communications
12 Privacy Act, to the disclosure, by electronic communications service providers and
13 remote computing service providers of the contents of his auto-dialed,
14 telemarketing, or pre-recorded telephone communications and records or other
15 information pertaining to his auto-dialed, telemarketing, or pre-recorded telephone
16 communications. Each Individual Defendant further agrees to execute, within five
17 days of a request from the Commission, any forms or other documents evidencing
18 his consent that may be required by such electronic communications service
19 providers or remote computing service providers.

20 VIII

21 Order Acknowledgments

22 **It is further ordered** that the Individual Defendants obtain
23 acknowledgments of receipt of this Order:

24 A. Each Individual Defendant, within seven days of entry of this Order,
25 must submit to the Commission an acknowledgment of receipt of this Order sworn
26 under penalty of perjury.

27 B. For five years after entry of this Order, each Individual Defendant, for
28 any business that he or she, individually or collectively with any other defendants,

1 is the majority owner, or controls directly or indirectly, must deliver a copy of this
2 Order to: (1) any individual or business that provides an automated dialing
3 platform to the Individual Defendant's business; and (2) any Lead Generator or
4 entity that provides Telemarketing services to the Individual Defendant's business.
5 Delivery must occur within seven days of entry of this Order for current providers.
6 For all others, delivery must occur before they begin providing services.

7 C. For five years after entry of this Order, each Individual Defendant, for
8 any business that he or she, individually or collectively with any other defendants,
9 is the majority owner, or controls directly or indirectly, must deliver a copy of this
10 Order to: (1) all principals, officers, directors, and LLC managers and members;
11 (2) all employees, agents, and other representatives who participate in conduct
12 related to the subject matter of the Order; and (3) any business entity resulting
13 from any change in structure as set forth the section titled Compliance Reporting.
14 Delivery must occur within seven days of entry of this Order for current personnel.
15 For all others, delivery must occur before they assume their responsibilities.

16 D. From each individual or entity to which an Individual Defendant
17 delivered a copy of this Order, that Individual Defendant must obtain, within 30
18 days, a signed and dated acknowledgment of receipt of this Order.

19 IX

20 Compliance Reporting

21 **It is further ordered** that the Individual Defendants make timely
22 submissions to the Commission:

23 A. One year after entry of this Order, each Individual Defendant must
24 submit a compliance report, sworn under penalty of perjury. Each Individual
25 Defendant must:

- 26 1) Identify all telephone numbers and all physical, postal, email
27 and Internet addresses, including all residences;

28

- 1 2) Identify all business activities, including any business for which
- 2 he or she performs services whether as an employee or
- 3 otherwise and any entity in which he or she has any ownership
- 4 interest;
- 5 3) Describe in detail his involvement in each such business,
- 6 including title, role, responsibilities, participation, authority,
- 7 control, and any ownership;
- 8 4) Identify the primary physical, postal, and email address and
- 9 telephone number, as designated points of contact, which
- 10 representatives of the Commission may use to communicate
- 11 with him;
- 12 5) Identify all of his businesses by all of their names, telephone
- 13 numbers, and physical, postal, email, and Internet addresses;
- 14 6) Describe the activities of each business, including the goods
- 15 and services offered, the means of advertising, marketing, and
- 16 sales;
- 17 7) Describe in detail whether and how he or she is in compliance
- 18 with each Section of this Order; and
- 19 8) Provide a copy of each Order Acknowledgment obtained
- 20 pursuant to this Order, unless previously submitted to the
- 21 Commission.

22 B. For ten years after entry of this Order, each Individual Defendant must
23 submit a compliance notice, sworn under penalty of perjury, within fourteen days
24 of any change in the following:

- 25 1) Name, including aliases or fictitious name, or residence
- 26 address;
- 27 2) Title or role in any business activity, including any business for
- 28 which he or she performs services whether as an employee or

1 otherwise and any entity in which he or she has any ownership
2 interest, and identify the name, physical address, and any
3 Internet address of the business or entity;

4 3) Any designated point of contact; or

5 4) The structure of any entity that he or she has any ownership
6 interest in or controls directly or indirectly that may affect
7 compliance obligations arising under this Order, including:
8 creation, merger, sale, or dissolution of the entity or any
9 subsidiary, parent, or affiliate that engages in any acts or
10 practices subject to this Order.

11 C. Each Individual Defendant must submit to the Commission notice of
12 the filing of any bankruptcy petition, insolvency proceeding, or similar proceeding
13 by or against him within fourteen days of its filing.

14 D. Any submission to the Commission required by this Order to be
15 sworn under penalty of perjury must be true and accurate and comply with 28
16 U.S.C. § 1746, such as by concluding: “I declare under penalty of perjury under
17 the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct.
18 Executed on: _____” and supplying the date, signatory’s full name, title (if
19 applicable), and signature.

20 E. Unless otherwise directed by a Commission representative in writing,
21 all submissions to the Commission pursuant to this Order must be emailed to
22 DEbrief@ftc.gov or sent by overnight courier (not the U.S. Postal Service) to:
23 Associate Director for Enforcement, Bureau of Consumer Protection, Federal
24 Trade Commission, 600 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Washington, DC 20580. The
25 subject line must begin: *FTC v. Eric Oakley*, Matter Number 1523152 or *FTC v.*
26 *Richard Paik*, Matter Number 1523152, as applicable.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

X

Recordkeeping

It is further ordered that the Individual Defendants must create certain records for ten years after entry of the Order, and retain each such record for five years. Specifically, each Individual Defendant, for any business that such Individual Defendant, individually or collectively with any other defendant, is a majority owner or controls directly or indirectly, must create and retain the following records:

A. Accounting records showing the revenues from all goods or services sold;

B. Personnel records showing, for each person providing services, whether as an employee or otherwise, that person's: name, addresses, telephone numbers, job title or position, dates of service, and (if applicable) the reason for termination;

C. Records of all consumer complaints, whether received directly or indirectly, such as through a third party, and any response;

D. All records, including contracts, relating to any person, entity, or Lead Generator from whom the Individual Defendant or the Individual Defendant's business purchased leads or phone numbers;

E. All records relating to automated dialing platforms used by the Individual Defendant or the Individual Defendant's business to initiate telephone calls, including contracts with any individual or business that provides such automated dialing platforms; and

F. All records necessary to demonstrate full compliance with each provision of this Order, including all submissions to the Commission.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

XI

Compliance Monitoring

It is further ordered that, for the purpose of monitoring the Individual Defendants' compliance with this Order, including the financial representations upon which part of the judgments were suspended, and any failure to transfer any assets as required by this Order:

A. Within 14 days of receipt of a written request from a representative of the Commission, each Individual Defendant must: (1) submit additional compliance reports or other requested information, which must be sworn under penalty of perjury; (2) appear for depositions; and (3) produce documents for inspection and copying. The Commission is also authorized to obtain discovery, without further leave of court, using any of the procedures prescribed by Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 29, 30 (including telephonic depositions), 31, 33, 34, 36, 45, and 69.

B. For matters concerning this Order, the Commission is authorized to communicate directly with each Individual Defendant. The Individual Defendants must permit representatives of the Commission to interview anyone employed by or affiliated with any Individual Defendant who has agreed to such an interview. The person interviewed may have counsel present.

C. The Commission may use all other lawful means, including posing, through its representatives as consumers, suppliers, or other individuals or entities to the Individual Defendants or any individual or entity affiliated with one or more of them, without the necessity of identification or prior notice. Nothing in this Order limits the Commission's lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1.

D. Upon written request from a representative of the Commission, any consumer reporting agency must furnish consumer reports concerning Individual

1 Defendants pursuant to Section 604(1) of the Fair Credit Reporting Act, 15 U.S.C.
2 §1681b(a)(1).

3 **XII**

4 **Retention of Jurisdiction**

5 **It is further ordered** that this Court retains jurisdiction of this matter for
6 purposes of construction, modification, and enforcement of this Order.

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

[signatures on following pages]

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

So stipulated and agreed:

for Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission:

David C. Shonka
Acting General Counsel

Dated: January 11, 2017



James E. Evans, Va. Bar No. 83866
Ian L. Barlow, D.C. Bar No. 998500
Federal Trade Commission
600 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, CC-8528
Washington, DC 20580
(202) 326-2026 / james.evans@ftc.gov
(202) 326-3120 / ibarlow@ftc.gov
(202) 326-3395 (fax)


Thomas J. Syta, Cal. Bar No. 116286
Local Counsel
Federal Trade Commission
10877 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 700
Los Angeles, CA 90024
(310) 824-4343 / tsyta@ftc.gov
(310) 824-4380 (fax)

Attorneys for Plaintiff
Federal Trade Commission


1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

for Defendants Oakley and Paik:

Dated: 8/22/16


Eric Oakley, individually

Dated: 8/22/16


Richard Paik, individually

Dated: 8/23/16


Charles L. Kreindler
Sheppard Mullin Richter & Hampton LLP
333 South Hope Street, 43rd Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90071-1422
Tel: (213) 617-4118
Fax: (213) 443-2824
E-mail: CKreindler@sheppardmullin.com

*Attorney for Defendants Richard Paik and
Eric Oakley*

Federal Trade Commission

§ 310.2

**PART 310—TELEMARKETING SALES
RULE 16 CFR PART 310**

- Sec.
- 310.1 Scope of regulations in this part.
- 310.2 Definitions.
- 310.3 Deceptive telemarketing acts or practices.
- 310.4 Abusive telemarketing acts or practices.
- 310.5 Recordkeeping requirements.
- 310.6 Exemptions.
- 310.7 Actions by states and private persons.
- 310.8 Fee for access to the National Do Not Call Registry.
- 310.9 Severability.

AUTHORITY: 15 U.S.C. 6101–6108.

SOURCE: 75 FR 48516, Aug. 10, 2010, unless otherwise noted.

§ 310.1 Scope of regulations in this part.

This part implements the Telemarketing and Consumer Fraud and Abuse Prevention Act, 15 U.S.C. 6101–6108, as amended.

§ 310.2 Definitions.

(a) *Acquirer* means a business organization, financial institution, or an agent of a business organization or financial institution that has authority from an organization that operates or licenses a credit card system to authorize merchants to accept, transmit, or process payment by credit card through the credit card system for money, goods or services, or anything else of value.

§310.2

16 CFR Ch. I (1–1–16 Edition)

(b) *Attorney General* means the chief legal officer of a state.

(c) *Billing information* means any data that enables any person to access a customer's or donor's account, such as a credit card, checking, savings, share or similar account, utility bill, mortgage loan account, or debit card.

(d) *Caller identification service* means a service that allows a telephone subscriber to have the telephone number, and, where available, name of the calling party transmitted contemporaneously with the telephone call, and displayed on a device in or connected to the subscriber's telephone.

(e) *Cardholder* means a person to whom a credit card is issued or who is authorized to use a credit card on behalf of or in addition to the person to whom the credit card is issued.

(f) *Charitable contribution* means any donation or gift of money or any other thing of value.

(g) *Commission* means the Federal Trade Commission.

(h) *Credit* means the right granted by a creditor to a debtor to defer payment of debt or to incur debt and defer its payment.

(i) *Credit card* means any card, plate, coupon book, or other credit device existing for the purpose of obtaining money, property, labor, or services on credit.

(j) *Credit card sales draft* means any record or evidence of a credit card transaction.

(k) *Credit card system* means any method or procedure used to process credit card transactions involving credit cards issued or licensed by the operator of that system.

(l) *Customer* means any person who is or may be required to pay for goods or services offered through telemarketing.

(m) *Debt relief service* means any program or service represented, directly or by implication, to renegotiate, settle, or in any way alter the terms of payment or other terms of the debt between a person and one or more unsecured creditors or debt collectors, including, but not limited to, a reduction in the balance, interest rate, or fees owed by a person to an unsecured creditor or debt collector.

(n) *Donor* means any person solicited to make a charitable contribution.

(o) *Established business relationship* means a relationship between a seller and a consumer based on:

(1) the consumer's purchase, rental, or lease of the seller's goods or services or a financial transaction between the consumer and seller, within the eighteen (18) months immediately preceding the date of a telemarketing call; or

(2) the consumer's inquiry or application regarding a product or service offered by the seller, within the three (3) months immediately preceding the date of a telemarketing call.

(p) *Free-to-pay conversion* means, in an offer or agreement to sell or provide any goods or services, a provision under which a customer receives a product or service for free for an initial period and will incur an obligation to pay for the product or service if he or she does not take affirmative action to cancel before the end of that period.

(q) *Investment opportunity* means anything, tangible or intangible, that is offered, offered for sale, sold, or traded based wholly or in part on representations, either express or implied, about past, present, or future income, profit, or appreciation.

(r) *Material* means likely to affect a person's choice of, or conduct regarding, goods or services or a charitable contribution.

(s) *Merchant* means a person who is authorized under a written contract with an acquirer to honor or accept credit cards, or to transmit or process for payment credit card payments, for the purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution.

(t) *Merchant agreement* means a written contract between a merchant and an acquirer to honor or accept credit cards, or to transmit or process for payment credit card payments, for the purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution.

(u) *Negative option feature* means, in an offer or agreement to sell or provide any goods or services, a provision under which the customer's silence or failure to take an affirmative action to reject goods or services or to cancel the agreement is interpreted by the seller as acceptance of the offer.

Federal Trade Commission**§ 310.2**

(v) *Outbound telephone call* means a telephone call initiated by a telemarketer to induce the purchase of goods or services or to solicit a charitable contribution.

(w) *Person* means any individual, group, unincorporated association, limited or general partnership, corporation, or other business entity.

(x) *Preacquired account information* means any information that enables a seller or telemarketer to cause a charge to be placed against a customer's or donor's account without obtaining the account number directly from the customer or donor during the telemarketing transaction pursuant to which the account will be charged.

(y) *Prize* means anything offered, or purportedly offered, and given, or purportedly given, to a person by chance. For purposes of this definition, chance exists if a person is guaranteed to receive an item and, at the time of the offer or purported offer, the telemarketer does not identify the specific item that the person will receive.

(z) *Prize promotion* means:

(1) A sweepstakes or other game of chance; or

(2) An oral or written express or implied representation that a person has won, has been selected to receive, or may be eligible to receive a prize or purported prize.

(aa) *Seller* means any person who, in connection with a telemarketing transaction, provides, offers to provide, or arranges for others to provide goods or services to the customer in exchange for consideration.

(bb) *State* means any state of the United States, the District of Columbia, Puerto Rico, the Northern Mariana Islands, and any territory or possession of the United States.

(cc) *Telemarketer* means any person who, in connection with telemarketing, initiates or receives telephone calls to or from a customer or donor.

(dd) *Telemarketing* means a plan, program, or campaign which is conducted to induce the purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution, by use of one or more telephones and which involves more than one interstate telephone call. The term does not include the solicitation of sales through the mailing of a catalog

which: contains a written description or illustration of the goods or services offered for sale; includes the business address of the seller; includes multiple pages of written material or illustrations; and has been issued not less frequently than once a year, when the person making the solicitation does not solicit customers by telephone but only receives calls initiated by customers in response to the catalog and during those calls takes orders only without further solicitation. For purposes of the previous sentence, the term "further solicitation" does not include providing the customer with information about, or attempting to sell, any other item included in the same catalog which prompted the customer's call or in a substantially similar catalog.

(ee) *Upselling* means soliciting the purchase of goods or services following an initial transaction during a single telephone call. The upsell is a separate telemarketing transaction, not a continuation of the initial transaction. An "external upsell" is a solicitation made by or on behalf of a seller different from the seller in the initial transaction, regardless of whether the initial transaction and the subsequent solicitation are made by the same telemarketer. An "internal upsell" is a solicitation made by or on behalf of the same seller as in the initial transaction, regardless of whether the initial transaction and subsequent solicitation are made by the same telemarketer.

EFFECTIVE DATE NOTE: At 80 FR 77558, Dec. 14, 2015, §310.2 was amended by redesignating paragraphs (aa) through (ee) as paragraphs (dd) through (hh), redesignating paragraphs (f) through (z) as paragraphs (h) through (bb), and adding new paragraphs (f), (g), and (cc), effective Feb. 12, 2016. For the convenience of the user, the added text is set forth as follows:

§ 310.2 Definitions.

* * * * *

(f) *Cash-to-cash money transfer* means the electronic (as defined in section 106(2) of the Electronic Signatures in Global and National Commerce Act (15 U.S.C. 7006(2))) transfer of the value of cash received from one person to another person in a different location that is

§310.3

16 CFR Ch. I (1–1–16 Edition)

sent by a money transfer provider and received in the form of cash. For purposes of this definition, *money transfer provider* means any person or financial institution that provides cash-to-cash money transfers for a person in the normal course of its business, whether or not the person holds an account with such person or financial institution. The term *cash-to-cash money transfer* includes a remittance transfer, as defined in section 919(g)(2) of the Electronic Fund Transfer Act (“EFTA”), 15 U.S.C. 1693a, that is a cash-to-cash transaction; however it does not include any transaction that is:

- (1) An electronic fund transfer as defined in section 903 of the EFTA;
- (2) Covered by Regulation E, 12 CFR 1005.20, pertaining to gift cards; or
- (3) Subject to the Truth in Lending Act, 15 U.S.C. 1601 *et seq.*

(g) *Cash reload mechanism* is a device, authorization code, personal identification number, or other security measure that makes it possible for a person to convert cash into an electronic (as defined in section 106(2) of the Electronic Signatures in Global and National Commerce Act (15 U.S.C. 7006(2)) form that can be used to add funds to a general-use prepaid card, as defined in Regulation E, 12 CFR 1005.2, or an account with a payment intermediary. For purposes of this definition, a cash reload mechanism is not itself a general-use prepaid debit card or a swipe reload process or similar method in which funds are added directly onto a person’s own general-use prepaid card or account with a payment intermediary.

* * * * *

(cc) *Remotely created payment order* means any payment instruction or order drawn on a person’s account that is created by the payee or the payee’s agent and deposited into or cleared through the check clearing system. The term includes, without limitation, a “remotely created check,” as defined in Regulation CC, Availability of Funds and Collection of Checks, 12 CFR 229.2(fff), but does not include a payment order cleared through an Automated Clearinghouse (ACH) Network or subject to the Truth in Lending Act, 15 U.S.C. 1601 *et seq.*, and Regulation Z, 12 CFR part 1026.

* * * * *

§310.3 Deceptive telemarketing acts or practices.

(a) *Prohibited deceptive telemarketing acts or practices.* It is a deceptive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for any seller or telemarketer to engage in the following conduct:

(1) Before a customer consents to pay⁶⁵⁹ for goods or services offered, failing to disclose truthfully, in a clear and conspicuous manner, the following material information:

(i) The total costs to purchase, receive, or use, and the quantity of, any goods or services that are the subject of the sales offer;⁶⁶⁰

(ii) All material restrictions, limitations, or conditions to purchase, receive, or use the goods or services that are the subject of the sales offer;

(iii) If the seller has a policy of not making refunds, cancellations, exchanges, or repurchases, a statement informing the customer that this is the seller’s policy; or, if the seller or telemarketer makes a representation about a refund, cancellation, exchange, or repurchase policy, a statement of all material terms and conditions of such policy;

(iv) In any prize promotion, the odds of being able to receive the prize, and, if the odds are not calculable in advance, the factors used in calculating the odds; that no purchase or payment is required to win a prize or to participate in a prize promotion and that any purchase or payment will not increase the person’s chances of winning; and the no-purchase/no-payment method of participating in the prize promotion with either instructions on how to participate or an address or local or toll-free telephone number to which customers may write or call for information on how to participate;

⁶⁵⁹ When a seller or telemarketer uses, or directs a customer to use, a courier to transport payment, the seller or telemarketer must make the disclosures required by §310.3(a)(1) before sending a courier to pick up payment or authorization for payment, or directing a customer to have a courier pick up payment or authorization for payment. In the case of debt relief services, the seller or telemarketer must make the disclosures required by §310.3(a)(1) before the consumer enrolls in an offered program.

⁶⁶⁰ For offers of consumer credit products subject to the Truth in Lending Act, 15 U.S.C. 1601 *et seq.*, and Regulation Z, 12 CFR 226, compliance with the disclosure requirements under the Truth in Lending Act and Regulation Z shall constitute compliance with §310.3(a)(1)(i) of this Rule.

Federal Trade Commission**§ 310.3**

(v) All material costs or conditions to receive or redeem a prize that is the subject of the prize promotion;

(vi) In the sale of any goods or services represented to protect, insure, or otherwise limit a customer's liability in the event of unauthorized use of the customer's credit card, the limits on a cardholder's liability for unauthorized use of a credit card pursuant to 15 U.S.C. 1643;

(vii) If the offer includes a negative option feature, all material terms and conditions of the negative option feature, including, but not limited to, the fact that the customer's account will be charged unless the customer takes an affirmative action to avoid the charge(s), the date(s) the charge(s) will be submitted for payment, and the specific steps the customer must take to avoid the charge(s); and

(viii) In the sale of any debt relief service:

(A) the amount of time necessary to achieve the represented results, and to the extent that the service may include a settlement offer to any of the customer's creditors or debt collectors, the time by which the debt relief service provider will make a bona fide settlement offer to each of them;

(B) to the extent that the service may include a settlement offer to any of the customer's creditors or debt collectors, the amount of money or the percentage of each outstanding debt that the customer must accumulate before the debt relief service provider will make a bona fide settlement offer to each of them;

(C) to the extent that any aspect of the debt relief service relies upon or results in the customer's failure to make timely payments to creditors or debt collectors, that the use of the debt relief service will likely adversely affect the customer's creditworthiness, may result in the customer being subject to collections or sued by creditors or debt collectors, and may increase the amount of money the customer owes due to the accrual of fees and interest; and

(D) to the extent that the debt relief service requests or requires the customer to place funds in an account at an insured financial institution, that the customer owns the funds held in

the account, the customer may withdraw from the debt relief service at any time without penalty, and, if the customer withdraws, the customer must receive all funds in the account, other than funds earned by the debt relief service in compliance with § 310.4(a)(5)(i)(A) through (C).

(2) Misrepresenting, directly or by implication, in the sale of goods or services any of the following material information:

(i) The total costs to purchase, receive, or use, and the quantity of, any goods or services that are the subject of a sales offer;

(ii) Any material restriction, limitation, or condition to purchase, receive, or use goods or services that are the subject of a sales offer;

(iii) Any material aspect of the performance, efficacy, nature, or central characteristics of goods or services that are the subject of a sales offer;

(iv) Any material aspect of the nature or terms of the seller's refund, cancellation, exchange, or repurchase policies;

(v) Any material aspect of a prize promotion including, but not limited to, the odds of being able to receive a prize, the nature or value of a prize, or that a purchase or payment is required to win a prize or to participate in a prize promotion;

(vi) Any material aspect of an investment opportunity including, but not limited to, risk, liquidity, earnings potential, or profitability;

(vii) A seller's or telemarketer's affiliation with, or endorsement or sponsorship by, any person or government entity;

(viii) That any customer needs offered goods or services to provide protections a customer already has pursuant to 15 U.S.C. 1643;

(ix) Any material aspect of a negative option feature including, but not limited to, the fact that the customer's account will be charged unless the customer takes an affirmative action to avoid the charge(s), the date(s) the charge(s) will be submitted for payment, and the specific steps the customer must take to avoid the charge(s); or

§ 310.3**16 CFR Ch. I (1–1–16 Edition)**

(x) Any material aspect of any debt relief service, including, but not limited to, the amount of money or the percentage of the debt amount that a customer may save by using such service; the amount of time necessary to achieve the represented results; the amount of money or the percentage of each outstanding debt that the customer must accumulate before the provider of the debt relief service will initiate attempts with the customer's creditors or debt collectors or make a bona fide offer to negotiate, settle, or modify the terms of the customer's debt; the effect of the service on a customer's creditworthiness; the effect of the service on collection efforts of the customer's creditors or debt collectors; the percentage or number of customers who attain the represented results; and whether a debt relief service is offered or provided by a non-profit entity.

(3) Causing billing information to be submitted for payment, or collecting or attempting to collect payment for goods or services or a charitable contribution, directly or indirectly, without the customer's or donor's express verifiable authorization, except when the method of payment used is a credit card subject to protections of the Truth in Lending Act and Regulation Z,⁶⁶¹ or a debit card subject to the protections of the Electronic Fund Transfer Act and Regulation E.⁶⁶² Such authorization shall be deemed verifiable if any of the following means is employed:

(i) Express written authorization by the customer or donor, which includes the customer's or donor's signature;⁶⁶³

(ii) Express oral authorization which is audio-recorded and made available upon request to the customer or donor, and the customer's or donor's bank or other billing entity, and which evidences clearly both the customer's or

donor's authorization of payment for the goods or services or charitable contribution that are the subject of the telemarketing transaction and the customer's or donor's receipt of all of the following information:

(A) The number of debits, charges, or payments (if more than one);

(B) The date(s) the debit(s), charge(s), or payment(s) will be submitted for payment;

(C) The amount(s) of the debit(s), charge(s), or payment(s);

(D) The customer's or donor's name;

(E) The customer's or donor's billing information, identified with sufficient specificity such that the customer or donor understands what account will be used to collect payment for the goods or services or charitable contribution that are the subject of the telemarketing transaction;

(F) A telephone number for customer or donor inquiry that is answered during normal business hours; and

(G) The date of the customer's or donor's oral authorization; or

(iii) Written confirmation of the transaction, identified in a clear and conspicuous manner as such on the outside of the envelope, sent to the customer or donor via first class mail prior to the submission for payment of the customer's or donor's billing information, and that includes all of the information contained in §§310.3(a)(3)(i)(A)-(G) and a clear and conspicuous statement of the procedures by which the customer or donor can obtain a refund from the seller or telemarketer or charitable organization in the event the confirmation is inaccurate; provided, however, that this means of authorization shall not be deemed verifiable in instances in which goods or services are offered in a transaction involving a free-to-pay conversion and preacquired account information.

(4) Making a false or misleading statement to induce any person to pay for goods or services or to induce a charitable contribution.

(b) *Assisting and facilitating.* It is a deceptive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a person to provide substantial assistance or support to any seller or telemarketer when that person knows or consciously

⁶⁶¹ Truth in Lending Act, 15 U.S.C. 1601 *et seq.*, and Regulation Z, 12 CFR part 226.

⁶⁶² Electronic Fund Transfer Act, 15 U.S.C. 1693 *et seq.*, and Regulation E, 12 CFR part 205.

⁶⁶³ For purposes of this Rule, the term "signature" shall include an electronic or digital form of signature, to the extent that such form of signature is recognized as a valid signature under applicable federal law or state contract law.

Federal Trade Commission**§ 310.4**

avoids knowing that the seller or telemarketer is engaged in any act or practice that violates §§ 310.3(a), (c) or (d), or § 310.4 of this Rule.

(c) *Credit card laundering.* Except as expressly permitted by the applicable credit card system, it is a deceptive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for:

(1) A merchant to present to or deposit into, or cause another to present to or deposit into, the credit card system for payment, a credit card sales draft generated by a telemarketing transaction that is not the result of a telemarketing credit card transaction between the cardholder and the merchant;

(2) Any person to employ, solicit, or otherwise cause a merchant, or an employee, representative, or agent of the merchant, to present to or deposit into the credit card system for payment, a credit card sales draft generated by a telemarketing transaction that is not the result of a telemarketing credit card transaction between the cardholder and the merchant; or

(3) Any person to obtain access to the credit card system through the use of a business relationship or an affiliation with a merchant, when such access is not authorized by the merchant agreement or the applicable credit card system.

(d) *Prohibited deceptive acts or practices in the solicitation of charitable contributions.* It is a fraudulent charitable solicitation, a deceptive telemarketing act or practice, and a violation of this Rule for any telemarketer soliciting charitable contributions to misrepresent, directly or by implication, any of the following material information:

(1) The nature, purpose, or mission of any entity on behalf of which a charitable contribution is being requested;

(2) That any charitable contribution is tax deductible in whole or in part;

(3) The purpose for which any charitable contribution will be used;

(4) The percentage or amount of any charitable contribution that will go to a charitable organization or to any particular charitable program;

(5) Any material aspect of a prize promotion including, but not limited to: the odds of being able to receive a prize; the nature or value of a prize; or

that a charitable contribution is required to win a prize or to participate in a prize promotion; or

(6) A charitable organization's or telemarketer's affiliation with, or endorsement or sponsorship by, any person or government entity.

EFFECTIVE DATE NOTE: At 80 FR 77558, Dec. 14, 2015, § 310.3 was amended by redesignating paragraphs (a)(3)(ii)(A) through (G) as paragraphs (a)(3)(ii)(B) through (H) and adding new paragraph (a)(3)(ii)(A), eff. Feb. 12, 2016. For the convenience of the user, the added text is set forth as follows:

§ 310.3 Deceptive telemarketing acts or practices.

(a) * * *

(3) * * *

(ii) * * *

(A) An accurate description, clearly and conspicuously stated, of the goods or services or charitable contribution for which payment authorization is sought;

* * * * *

§ 310.4 Abusive telemarketing acts or practices.

(a) *Abusive conduct generally.* It is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for any seller or telemarketer to engage in the following conduct:

(1) Threats, intimidation, or the use of profane or obscene language;

(2) Requesting or receiving payment of any fee or consideration for goods or services represented to remove derogatory information from, or improve, a person's credit history, credit record, or credit rating until:

(i) The time frame in which the seller has represented all of the goods or services will be provided to that person has expired; and

(ii) The seller has provided the person with documentation in the form of a consumer report from a consumer reporting agency demonstrating that the promised results have been achieved, such report having been issued more than six months after the results were achieved. Nothing in this Rule should be construed to affect the requirement in the Fair Credit Reporting Act, 15 U.S.C. 1681, that a consumer report may only be obtained for a specified permissible purpose;

§ 310.4**16 CFR Ch. I (1–1–16 Edition)**

(3) Requesting or receiving payment of any fee or consideration from a person for goods or services represented to recover or otherwise assist in the return of money or any other item of value paid for by, or promised to, that person in a previous telemarketing transaction, until seven (7) business days after such money or other item is delivered to that person. This provision shall not apply to goods or services provided to a person by a licensed attorney;

(4) Requesting or receiving payment of any fee or consideration in advance of obtaining a loan or other extension of credit when the seller or telemarketer has guaranteed or represented a high likelihood of success in obtaining or arranging a loan or other extension of credit for a person;

(5)(i) Requesting or receiving payment of any fee or consideration for any debt relief service until and unless:

(A) The seller or telemarketer has renegotiated, settled, reduced, or otherwise altered the terms of at least one debt pursuant to a settlement agreement, debt management plan, or other such valid contractual agreement executed by the customer;

(B) The customer has made at least one payment pursuant to that settlement agreement, debt management plan, or other valid contractual agreement between the customer and the creditor or debt collector; and

(C) To the extent that debts enrolled in a service are renegotiated, settled, reduced, or otherwise altered individually, the fee or consideration either:

(1) Bears the same proportional relationship to the total fee for renegotiating, settling, reducing, or altering the terms of the entire debt balance as the individual debt amount bears to the entire debt amount. The individual debt amount and the entire debt amount are those owed at the time the debt was enrolled in the service; or

(2) Is a percentage of the amount saved as a result of the renegotiation, settlement, reduction, or alteration. The percentage charged cannot change from one individual debt to another. The amount saved is the difference between the amount owed at the time the debt was enrolled in the service and the

amount actually paid to satisfy the debt.

(ii) Nothing in § 310.4(a)(5)(i) prohibits requesting or requiring the customer to place funds in an account to be used for the debt relief provider's fees and for payments to creditors or debt collectors in connection with the renegotiation, settlement, reduction, or other alteration of the terms of payment or other terms of a debt, provided that:

(A) The funds are held in an account at an insured financial institution;

(B) The customer owns the funds held in the account and is paid accrued interest on the account, if any;

(C) The entity administering the account is not owned or controlled by, or in any way affiliated with, the debt relief service;

(D) The entity administering the account does not give or accept any money or other compensation in exchange for referrals of business involving the debt relief service; and

(E) The customer may withdraw from the debt relief service at any time without penalty, and must receive all funds in the account, other than funds earned by the debt relief service in compliance with § 310.4(a)(5)(i)(A) through (C), within seven (7) business days of the customer's request.

(6) Disclosing or receiving, for consideration, unencrypted consumer account numbers for use in telemarketing; provided, however, that this paragraph shall not apply to the disclosure or receipt of a customer's or donor's billing information to process a payment for goods or services or a charitable contribution pursuant to a transaction;

(7) Causing billing information to be submitted for payment, directly or indirectly, without the express informed consent of the customer or donor. In any telemarketing transaction, the seller or telemarketer must obtain the express informed consent of the customer or donor to be charged for the goods or services or charitable contribution and to be charged using the identified account. In any telemarketing transaction involving preacquired account information, the requirements in paragraphs (a)(7)(i) through (ii) of this section must be met to evidence express informed consent.

Federal Trade Commission**§ 310.4**

(i) In any telemarketing transaction involving preacquired account information and a free-to-pay conversion feature, the seller or telemarketer must:

(A) Obtain from the customer, at a minimum, the last four (4) digits of the account number to be charged;

(B) Obtain from the customer his or her express agreement to be charged for the goods or services and to be charged using the account number pursuant to paragraph (a)(7)(i)(A) of this section; and,

(C) Make and maintain an audio recording of the entire telemarketing transaction.

(ii) In any other telemarketing transaction involving preacquired account information not described in paragraph (a)(7)(i) of this section, the seller or telemarketer must:

(A) At a minimum, identify the account to be charged with sufficient specificity for the customer or donor to understand what account will be charged; and

(B) Obtain from the customer or donor his or her express agreement to be charged for the goods or services and to be charged using the account number identified pursuant to paragraph (a)(7)(ii)(A) of this section; or

(8) Failing to transmit or cause to be transmitted the telephone number, and, when made available by the telemarketer's carrier, the name of the telemarketer, to any caller identification service in use by a recipient of a telemarketing call; provided that it shall not be a violation to substitute (for the name and phone number used in, or billed for, making the call) the name of the seller or charitable organization on behalf of which a telemarketing call is placed, and the seller's or charitable organization's customer or donor service telephone number, which is answered during regular business hours.

(b) *Pattern of calls.* (1) It is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a telemarketer to engage in, or for a seller to cause a telemarketer to engage in, the following conduct:

(i) Causing any telephone to ring, or engaging any person in telephone conversation, repeatedly or continuously

with intent to annoy, abuse, or harass any person at the called number;

(ii) Denying or interfering in any way, directly or indirectly, with a person's right to be placed on any registry of names and/or telephone numbers of persons who do not wish to receive outbound telephone calls established to comply with §310.4(b)(1)(iii);

(iii) Initiating any outbound telephone call to a person when:

(A) That person previously has stated that he or she does not wish to receive an outbound telephone call made by or on behalf of the seller whose goods or services are being offered or made on behalf of the charitable organization for which a charitable contribution is being solicited; or

(B) That person's telephone number is on the "do-not-call" registry, maintained by the Commission, of persons who do not wish to receive outbound telephone calls to induce the purchase of goods or services unless the seller:

(i) Has obtained the express agreement, in writing, of such person to place calls to that person. Such written agreement shall clearly evidence such person's authorization that calls made by or on behalf of a specific party may be placed to that person, and shall include the telephone number to which the calls may be placed and the signature⁶⁶⁴ of that person; or

(ii) Has an established business relationship with such person, and that person has not stated that he or she does not wish to receive outbound telephone calls under paragraph (b)(1)(iii)(A) of this section; or

(iv) Abandoning any outbound telephone call. An outbound telephone call is "abandoned" under this section if a person answers it and the telemarketer does not connect the call to a sales representative within two (2) seconds of the person's completed greeting.

(v) Initiating any outbound telephone call that delivers a prerecorded message, other than a prerecorded message permitted for compliance with the call

⁶⁶⁴ For purposes of this Rule, the term "signature" shall include an electronic or digital form of signature, to the extent that such form of signature is recognized as a valid signature under applicable federal law or state contract law.

§ 310.4**16 CFR Ch. I (1–1–16 Edition)**

abandonment safe harbor in § 310.4(b)(4)(iii), unless:

(A) In any such call to induce the purchase of any good or service, the seller has obtained from the recipient of the call an express agreement, in writing, that:

(i) The seller obtained only after a clear and conspicuous disclosure that the purpose of the agreement is to authorize the seller to place prerecorded calls to such person;

(ii) The seller obtained without requiring, directly or indirectly, that the agreement be executed as a condition of purchasing any good or service;

(iii) Evidences the willingness of the recipient of the call to receive calls that deliver prerecorded messages by or on behalf of a specific seller; and

(iv) Includes such person's telephone number and signature;⁶⁶⁵ and

(B) In any such call to induce the purchase of any good or service, or to induce a charitable contribution from a member of, or previous donor to, a non-profit charitable organization on whose behalf the call is made, the seller or telemarketer:

(i) Allows the telephone to ring for at least fifteen (15) seconds or four (4) rings before disconnecting an unanswered call; and

(ii) Within two (2) seconds after the completed greeting of the person called, plays a prerecorded message that promptly provides the disclosures required by § 310.4(d) or (e), followed immediately by a disclosure of one or both of the following:

(A) In the case of a call that could be answered in person by a consumer, that the person called can use an automated interactive voice and/or keypress-activated opt-out mechanism to assert a Do Not Call request pursuant to § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(A) at any time during the message. The mechanism must:

(1) Automatically add the number called to the seller's entity-specific Do Not Call list;

(2) Once invoked, immediately disconnect the call; and

⁶⁶⁵ For purposes of this Rule, the term "signature" shall include an electronic or digital form of signature, to the extent that such form of signature is recognized as a valid signature under applicable federal law or state contract law.

(3) Be available for use at any time during the message; and

(B) In the case of a call that could be answered by an answering machine or voicemail service, that the person called can use a toll-free telephone number to assert a Do Not Call request pursuant to § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(A). The number provided must connect directly to an automated interactive voice or keypress-activated opt-out mechanism that:

(1) Automatically adds the number called to the seller's entity-specific Do Not Call list;

(2) Immediately thereafter disconnects the call; and

(3) Is accessible at any time throughout the duration of the telemarketing campaign; and

(iii) Complies with all other requirements of this part and other applicable federal and state laws.

(C) Any call that complies with all applicable requirements of this paragraph (v) shall not be deemed to violate § 310.4(b)(1)(iv) of this part.

(D) This paragraph (v) shall not apply to any outbound telephone call that delivers a prerecorded healthcare message made by, or on behalf of, a covered entity or its business associate, as those terms are defined in the HIPAA Privacy Rule, 45 CFR 160.103.

(2) It is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for any person to sell, rent, lease, purchase, or use any list established to comply with § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(A), or maintained by the Commission pursuant to § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B), for any purpose except compliance with the provisions of this Rule or otherwise to prevent telephone calls to telephone numbers on such lists.

(3) A seller or telemarketer will not be liable for violating § 310.4(b)(1)(ii) and (iii) if it can demonstrate that, as part of the seller's or telemarketer's routine business practice:

(i) It has established and implemented written procedures to comply with § 310.4(b)(1)(ii) and (iii);

(ii) It has trained its personnel, and any entity assisting in its compliance, in the procedures established pursuant to § 310.4(b)(3)(i);

(iii) The seller, or a telemarketer or another person acting on behalf of the

Federal Trade Commission**§ 310.4**

seller or charitable organization, has maintained and recorded a list of telephone numbers the seller or charitable organization may not contact, in compliance with § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(A);

(iv) The seller or a telemarketer uses a process to prevent telemarketing to any telephone number on any list established pursuant to § 310.4(b)(3)(iii) or 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B), employing a version of the “do-not-call” registry obtained from the Commission no more than thirty-one (31) days prior to the date any call is made, and maintains records documenting this process;

(v) The seller or a telemarketer or another person acting on behalf of the seller or charitable organization, monitors and enforces compliance with the procedures established pursuant to § 310.4(b)(3)(i); and

(vi) Any subsequent call otherwise violating § 310.4(b)(1)(ii) or (iii) is the result of error.

(4) A seller or telemarketer will not be liable for violating § 310.4(b)(1)(iv) if:

(i) The seller or telemarketer employs technology that ensures abandonment of no more than three (3) percent of all calls answered by a person, measured over the duration of a single calling campaign, if less than 30 days, or separately over each successive 30-day period or portion thereof that the campaign continues.

(ii) The seller or telemarketer, for each telemarketing call placed, allows the telephone to ring for at least fifteen (15) seconds or four (4) rings before disconnecting an unanswered call;

(iii) Whenever a sales representative is not available to speak with the person answering the call within two (2) seconds after the person’s completed greeting, the seller or telemarketer promptly plays a recorded message that states the name and telephone number of the seller on whose behalf the call was placed⁶⁶⁶; and

(iv) The seller or telemarketer, in accordance with § 310.5(b)-(d), retains records establishing compliance with § 310.4(b)(4)(i)-(iii).

⁶⁶⁶ This provision does not affect any seller’s or telemarketer’s obligation to comply with relevant state and federal laws, including but not limited to the TCPA, 47 U.S.C. 227, and 47 CFR part 64.1200.

(c) *Calling time restrictions.* Without the prior consent of a person, it is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a telemarketer to engage in outbound telephone calls to a person’s residence at any time other than between 8:00 a.m. and 9:00 p.m. local time at the called person’s location.

(d) *Required oral disclosures in the sale of goods or services.* It is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a telemarketer in an outbound telephone call or internal or external upsell to induce the purchase of goods or services to fail to disclose truthfully, promptly, and in a clear and conspicuous manner to the person receiving the call, the following information:

(1) The identity of the seller;

(2) That the purpose of the call is to sell goods or services;

(3) The nature of the goods or services; and

(4) That no purchase or payment is necessary to be able to win a prize or participate in a prize promotion if a prize promotion is offered and that any purchase or payment will not increase the person’s chances of winning. This disclosure must be made before or in conjunction with the description of the prize to the person called. If requested by that person, the telemarketer must disclose the no-purchase/no-payment entry method for the prize promotion; provided, however, that, in any internal upsell for the sale of goods or services, the seller or telemarketer must provide the disclosures listed in this section only to the extent that the information in the upsell differs from the disclosures provided in the initial telemarketing transaction.

(e) *Required oral disclosures in charitable solicitations.* It is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a telemarketer, in an outbound telephone call to induce a charitable contribution, to fail to disclose truthfully, promptly, and in a clear and conspicuous manner to the person receiving the call, the following information:

(1) The identity of the charitable organization on behalf of which the request is being made; and

§310.5

16 CFR Ch. I (1–1–16 Edition)

(2) That the purpose of the call is to solicit a charitable contribution.

[75 FR 48516, Aug. 10, 2010, as amended at 76 FR 58716, Sept. 22, 2011]

EFFECTIVE DATE NOTE: At 80 FR 77558, Dec. 14, 2015, §310.4 was amended by revising paragraphs (a)(3), (b)(1)(ii), (iii)(B), and (3)(vi), effective February 12, 2016, and in paragraph (a)(7)(ii)(B) by removing “or” from the end of the paragraph, in paragraph (a)(8) by removing the final period and adding a semicolon in its place, and by adding paragraphs (a)(9) and (10), effective June 13, 2016. For the convenience of the user, the added and revised text is set forth as follows:

§310.4 Abusive telemarketing acts or practices.

(a) * * *

(3) Requesting or receiving payment of any fee or consideration from a person for goods or services represented to recover or otherwise assist in the return of money or any other item of value paid for by, or promised to, that person in a previous transaction, until seven (7) business days after such money or other item is delivered to that person. This provision shall not apply to goods or services provided to a person by a licensed attorney;

* * * * *

(9) Creating or causing to be created, directly or indirectly, a remotely created payment order as payment for goods or services offered or sold through telemarketing or as a charitable contribution solicited or sought through telemarketing; or

(10) Accepting from a customer or donor, directly or indirectly, a cash-to-cash money transfer or cash reload mechanism as payment for goods or services offered or sold through telemarketing or as a charitable contribution solicited or sought through telemarketing.

(b) * * *

(1) * * *

(ii) Denying or interfering in any way, directly or indirectly, with a person’s right to be placed on any registry of names and/or telephone numbers of persons who do not wish to receive outbound telephone calls established to comply with paragraph (b)(1)(iii)(A) of this section, including, but not limited to, harassing any person who makes such a request; hanging up on that person; failing to honor the request; requiring the person to listen to a sales pitch before accepting the request; assessing a charge or fee for honoring the request; requiring a person to call a different number to submit the request; and requiring the person to identify the seller making the call or on whose behalf the call is made;

(iii) * * *

(B) That person’s telephone number is on the “do-not-call” registry, maintained by the Commission, of persons who do not wish to receive outbound telephone calls to induce the purchase of goods or services unless the seller or telemarketer:

(1) Can demonstrate that the seller has obtained the express agreement, in writing, of such person to place calls to that person. Such written agreement shall clearly evidence such person’s authorization that calls made by or on behalf of a specific party may be placed to that person, and shall include the telephone number to which the calls may be placed and the signature⁶⁶⁴ of that person; or

(2) Can demonstrate that the seller has an established business relationship with such person, and that person has not stated that he or she does not wish to receive outbound telephone calls under paragraph (b)(1)(iii)(A) of this section; or

* * * * *

(3) * * *

(vi) Any subsequent call otherwise violating paragraph (b)(1)(ii) or (iii) of this section is the result of error and not of failure to obtain any information necessary to comply with a request pursuant to paragraph (b)(1)(iii)(A) of this section not to receive further calls by or on behalf of a seller or charitable organization.

* * * * *

§310.5 Recordkeeping requirements.

(a) Any seller or telemarketer shall keep, for a period of 24 months from the date the record is produced, the following records relating to its telemarketing activities:

(1) All substantially different advertising, brochures, telemarketing scripts, and promotional materials;

(2) The name and last known address of each prize recipient and the prize awarded for prizes that are represented, directly or by implication, to have a value of \$25.00 or more;

(3) The name and last known address of each customer, the goods or services purchased, the date such goods or services were shipped or provided, and the

⁶⁶⁴For purposes of this Rule, the term “signature” shall include an electronic or digital form of signature, to the extent that such form of signature is recognized as a valid signature under applicable federal law or state contract law.

Federal Trade Commission**§ 310.6**

amount paid by the customer for the goods or services;⁶⁶⁷

(4) The name, any fictitious name used, the last known home address and telephone number, and the job title(s) for all current and former employees directly involved in telephone sales or solicitations; provided, however, that if the seller or telemarketer permits fictitious names to be used by employees, each fictitious name must be traceable to only one specific employee; and

(5) All verifiable authorizations or records of express informed consent or express agreement required to be provided or received under this Rule.

(b) A seller or telemarketer may keep the records required by § 310.5(a) in any form, and in the same manner, format, or place as they keep such records in the ordinary course of business. Failure to keep all records required by § 310.5(a) shall be a violation of this Rule.

(c) The seller and the telemarketer calling on behalf of the seller may, by written agreement, allocate responsibility between themselves for the recordkeeping required by this Section. When a seller and telemarketer have entered into such an agreement, the terms of that agreement shall govern, and the seller or telemarketer, as the case may be, need not keep records that duplicate those of the other. If the agreement is unclear as to who must maintain any required record(s), or if no such agreement exists, the seller shall be responsible for complying with §§ 310.5(a)(1)-(3) and (5); the telemarketer shall be responsible for complying with § 310.5(a)(4).

(d) In the event of any dissolution or termination of the seller's or telemarketer's business, the principal of that seller or telemarketer shall maintain all records as required under this section. In the event of any sale, assignment, or other change in ownership of the seller's or telemarketer's business, the successor business shall main-

tain all records required under this section.

§ 310.6 Exemptions.

(a) Solicitations to induce charitable contributions via outbound telephone calls are not covered by § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B) of this Rule.

(b) The following acts or practices are exempt from this Rule:

(1) The sale of pay-per-call services subject to the Commission's Rule entitled "Trade Regulation Rule Pursuant to the Telephone Disclosure and Dispute Resolution Act of 1992," 16 CFR part 308, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to the requirements of §§ 310.4(a)(1), (a)(7), (b), and (c);

(2) The sale of franchises subject to the Commission's Rule entitled "Disclosure Requirements and Prohibitions Concerning Franchising," ("Franchise Rule") 16 CFR part 436, and the sale of business opportunities subject to the Commission's Rule entitled "Disclosure Requirements and Prohibitions Concerning Business Opportunities," ("Business Opportunity Rule") 16 CFR part 437, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to the requirements of §§ 310.4(a)(1), (a)(7), (b), and (c);

(3) Telephone calls in which the sale of goods or services or charitable solicitation is not completed, and payment or authorization of payment is not required, until after a face-to-face sales or donation presentation by the seller or charitable organization, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to the requirements of §§ 310.4(a)(1), (a)(7), (b), and (c);

(4) Telephone calls initiated by a customer or donor that are not the result of any solicitation by a seller, charitable organization, or telemarketer, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to any instances of upselling included in such telephone calls;

(5) Telephone calls initiated by a customer or donor in response to an advertisement through any medium, other than direct mail solicitation, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to calls initiated by a customer

⁶⁶⁷ For offers of consumer credit products subject to the Truth in Lending Act, 15 U.S.C. 1601 *et seq.*, and Regulation Z, 12 CFR 226, compliance with the recordkeeping requirements under the Truth in Lending Act, and Regulation Z, shall constitute compliance with § 310.5(a)(3) of this Rule.

§310.7

16 CFR Ch. I (1–16 Edition)

or donor in response to an advertisement relating to investment opportunities, debt relief services, business opportunities other than business arrangements covered by the Franchise Rule or Business Opportunity Rule, or advertisements involving goods or services described in §§310.3(a)(1)(vi) or 310.4(a)(2)-(4); or to any instances of upselling included in such telephone calls;

(6) Telephone calls initiated by a customer or donor in response to a direct mail solicitation, including solicitations via the U.S. Postal Service, facsimile transmission, electronic mail, and other similar methods of delivery in which a solicitation is directed to specific address(es) or person(s), that clearly, conspicuously, and truthfully discloses all material information listed in §310.3(a)(1) of this Rule, for any goods or services offered in the direct mail solicitation, and that contains no material misrepresentation regarding any item contained in §310.3(d) of this Rule for any requested charitable contribution; *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to calls initiated by a customer in response to a direct mail solicitation relating to prize promotions, investment opportunities, debt relief services, business opportunities other than business arrangements covered by the Franchise Rule or Business Opportunity Rule, or goods or services described in §§310.3(a)(1)(vi) or 310.4(a)(2)-(4); or to any instances of upselling included in such telephone calls; and

(7) Telephone calls between a telemarketer and any business, except calls to induce the retail sale of nondurable office or cleaning supplies; *provided*, however, that §310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B) and §310.5 of this Rule shall not apply to sellers or telemarketers of nondurable office or cleaning supplies.

EFFECTIVE DATE NOTE: At 80 FR 77559, Dec. 14, 2015, §310.6 was amended by revising paragraphs (b)(5), (6) and (7), effective Feb. 12, 2016, and by adding paragraphs (b)(5)(ii) and (6)(ii), effective June 13, 2016. For the convenience of the user, the added and revised text is set forth as follows:

§310.6 Exemptions.

* * * * *

(b) * * *

(5) Telephone calls initiated by a customer or donor in response to an advertisement through any medium, other than direct mail solicitation, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to:

(i) Calls initiated by a customer or donor in response to an advertisement relating to investment opportunities, debt relief services, business opportunities other than business arrangements covered by the Franchise Rule or Business Opportunity Rule, or advertisements involving offers for goods or services described in §310.3(a)(1)(vi) or §310.4(a)(2) through (4);

(ii) The requirements of §310.4(a)(9) or (10); or

(iii) Any instances of upselling included in such telephone calls;

(6) Telephone calls initiated by a customer or donor in response to a direct mail solicitation, including solicitations via the U.S. Postal Service, facsimile transmission, electronic mail, and other similar methods of delivery in which a solicitation is directed to specific address(es) or person(s), that clearly, conspicuously, and truthfully discloses all material information listed in §310.3(a)(1), for any goods or services offered in the direct mail solicitation, and that contains no material misrepresentation regarding any item contained in §310.3(d) for any requested charitable contribution; *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to:

(i) Calls initiated by a customer in response to a direct mail solicitation relating to prize promotions, investment opportunities, debt relief services, business opportunities other than business arrangements covered by the Franchise Rule or Business Opportunity Rule, or goods or services described in §310.3(a)(1)(vi) or §310.4(a)(2) through (4);

(ii) The requirements of §310.4(a)(9) or (10); or

(iii) Any instances of upselling included in such telephone calls; and

(7) Telephone calls between a telemarketer and any business to induce the purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution by the business, except calls to induce the retail sale of nondurable office or cleaning supplies; *provided*, however, that §§310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B) and 310.5 shall not apply to sellers or telemarketers of nondurable office or cleaning supplies.

§310.7 Actions by states and private persons.

(a) Any attorney general or other officer of a state authorized by the state to bring an action under the Telemarketing and Consumer Fraud and Abuse Prevention Act, and any private person who brings an action under that Act, shall serve written notice of its

Federal Trade Commission**§ 310.8**

action on the Commission, if feasible, prior to its initiating an action under this Rule. The notice shall be sent to the Office of the Director, Bureau of Consumer Protection, Federal Trade Commission, Washington, DC 20580, and shall include a copy of the state's or private person's complaint and any other pleadings to be filed with the court. If prior notice is not feasible, the state or private person shall serve the Commission with the required notice immediately upon instituting its action.

(b) Nothing contained in this Section shall prohibit any attorney general or other authorized state official from proceeding in state court on the basis of an alleged violation of any civil or criminal statute of such state.

§ 310.8 Fee for access to the National Do Not Call Registry.

(a) It is a violation of this Rule for any seller to initiate, or cause any telemarketer to initiate, an outbound telephone call to any person whose telephone number is within a given area code unless such seller, either directly or through another person, first has paid the annual fee, required by § 310.8(c), for access to telephone numbers within that area code that are included in the National Do Not Call Registry maintained by the Commission under § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B); provided, however, that such payment is not necessary if the seller initiates, or causes a telemarketer to initiate, calls solely to persons pursuant to §§ 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B)(i) or (ii), and the seller does not access the National Do Not Call Registry for any other purpose.

(b) It is a violation of this Rule for any telemarketer, on behalf of any seller, to initiate an outbound telephone call to any person whose telephone number is within a given area code unless that seller, either directly or through another person, first has paid the annual fee, required by § 310.8(c), for access to the telephone numbers within that area code that are included in the National Do Not Call Registry; provided, however, that such payment is not necessary if the seller initiates, or causes a telemarketer to initiate, calls solely to persons pursuant to

§§ 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B)(i) or (ii), and the seller does not access the National Do Not Call Registry for any other purpose.

(c) The annual fee, which must be paid by any person prior to obtaining access to the National Do Not Call Registry, is \$60 for each area code of data accessed, up to a maximum of \$16,482; *provided*, however, that there shall be no charge to any person for accessing the first five area codes of data, and *provided further*, that there shall be no charge to any person engaging in or causing others to engage in outbound telephone calls to consumers and who is accessing area codes of data in the National Do Not Call Registry if the person is permitted to access, but is not required to access, the National Do Not Call Registry under this Rule, 47 CFR 64.1200, or any other Federal regulation or law. Any person accessing the National Do Not Call Registry may not participate in any arrangement to share the cost of accessing the registry, including any arrangement with any telemarketer or service provider to divide the costs to access the registry among various clients of that telemarketer or service provider.

(d) Each person who pays, either directly or through another person, the annual fee set forth in § 310.8(c), each person excepted under § 310.8(c) from paying the annual fee, and each person excepted from paying an annual fee under § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B), will be provided a unique account number that will allow that person to access the registry data for the selected area codes at any time for the twelve month period beginning on the first day of the month in which the person paid the fee ("the annual period"). To obtain access to additional area codes of data during the first six months of the annual period, each person required to pay the fee under § 310.8(c) must first pay \$60 for each additional area code of data not initially selected. To obtain access to additional area codes of data during the second six months of the annual period, each person required to pay the fee under § 310.8(c) must first pay \$30 for each additional area code of data not initially selected. The payment of the additional fee will permit the person to access the additional area codes

§310.9

of data for the remainder of the annual period.

(e) Access to the National Do Not Call Registry is limited to telemarketers, sellers, others engaged in or causing others to engage in telephone calls to consumers, service providers acting on behalf of such persons, and any government agency that has law enforcement authority. Prior to accessing the National Do Not Call Registry, a person must provide the identifying information required by the operator of the registry to collect the fee, and must certify, under penalty of law, that the person is accessing the registry solely to comply with the provisions of this Rule or to otherwise prevent telephone calls to telephone numbers on the registry. If the person is accessing the registry on behalf of sellers, that person also must identify each of the sellers on whose behalf it is accessing the registry, must provide each seller's unique account number for access to the national registry, and must certify, under penalty of law, that the sellers will be using the information gathered from the registry solely to comply with the provisions of this Rule or otherwise to prevent telephone calls to telephone numbers on the registry.

[75 FR 48516, Aug. 10, 2010; 75 FR 51934, Aug. 24, 2010, as amended at 77 FR 51697, Aug. 27, 2012; 78 FR 53643, Aug. 30, 2013; 79 FR 51478, Aug. 29, 2014]

EFFECTIVE DATE NOTE: At 80 FR 77560, Dec. 14, 2015, §310.8 was amended by revising paragraph (c), effective Feb. 16, 2016. For the convenience of the user, the revised text is set forth as follows:

§310.8 Fee for access to the National Do Not Call Registry.

* * * * *

(c) The annual fee, which must be paid by any person prior to obtaining access to the National Do Not Call Registry, is \$60 for each area code of data accessed, up to a maximum of \$16,482; provided, however, that there shall be no charge to any person for accessing the first five area codes of data, and provided further, that there shall be no charge to any person engaging in or causing others to engage in outbound telephone calls to consumers and who is accessing area codes of data in the National Do Not Call Registry if the person is permitted to access, but is not required to access, the National Do Not Call

16 CFR Ch. I (1-1-16 Edition)

Registry under this Rule, 47 CFR 64.1200, or any other Federal regulation or law. No person may participate in any arrangement to share the cost of accessing the National Do Not Call Registry, including any arrangement with any telemarketer or service provider to divide the costs to access the registry among various clients of that telemarketer or service provider.

* * * * *

§310.9 Severability.

The provisions of this Rule are separate and severable from one another. If any provision is stayed or determined to be invalid, it is the Commission's intention that the remaining provisions shall continue in effect.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on January 11, 2017, I served a copy of the foregoing Stipulation to Entry of Final Order for Permanent Injunction and Civil Penalty Judgment as to Defendants Eric Oakley and Richard Paik on the following parties by U.S. Mail:

Aaron Michael Jones
[home address redacted]
Irvine, CA

Steven Stansbury
[home address redacted]
Irvine, CA

Allorey, Inc.
c/o Raymund Verallo, Registered Agent
2312 Park Ave. #123
Irvine, CA 92782

Audacity LLC
c/o Devin Fung, Registered Agent
[home address redacted]
Irvine, CA

Data World Technologies, Inc.
c/o Steve Stansbury, Registered Agent
2701 Harbor Blvd. E2-204
Costa Mesa, CA 92626

Dial Soft Technologies, Inc.
c/o Steve Stansbury, President
P.O. Box 3540
Silver Springs, NV 89429

Digital Marketing Solutions, Inc.
c/o Legalzoom.com, Inc.,
Registered Agent
101 N. Brand Blvd., 11th Floor
Glendale, CA 91203

Savilo Support Services, Inc.
c/o Christina Lee, Registered Agent
15991 Red Hill Ave., Suite 202
Tustin, CA 92780

Secure Alliance Corp.
c/o Legalzoom.com, Inc.,
Registered Agent
101 N. Brand Blvd., 11th Floor
Glendale, CA 91203

Velocity Information Corp.
c/o Legalzoom.com, Inc.,
Registered Agent
101 N. Brand Blvd., 11th Floor
Glendale, CA 91203

World Access Media
c/o Legalzoom.com, Inc.,
Registered Agent
101 N. Brand Blvd., 11th Floor
Glendale, CA 91203

/s/ James Evans
James Evans

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

Federal Trade Commission,

Plaintiff,

vs.

Aaron Michael Jones, also known as Michael Aaron Jones, also known as Mike Jones, individually and as an owner, officer, or manager, or a *de facto* owner, officer, or manager of Allore, Inc., Audacity LLC, Data World Technologies, Inc., Dial Soft Technologies, Inc., Digital Marketing Solutions, Inc., Local Lighthouse Corp., Savilo Support Services, Inc., Secure Alliance Corp., Velocity Information Corp., and World Access Media;

Houston Fraley, individually and as an officer of Local Lighthouse Corp.;

Tyler Hall, individually and as an officer of Local Lighthouse Corp. and Secure Alliance Corp.;

No. 8:17-cv-00058

[Proposed]
**Stipulated Final Order for
Permanent Injunction and
Civil Penalty Judgment as to
Defendants Eric Oakley and
Richard Paik**

1 **Kasia Kinaman**, individually and as an
2 officer of Digital Marketing Solutions,
3 Inc.;

4 **Eric Oakley**, individually and as an
5 officer of Local Lighthouse Corp. and
6 Velocity Information Corp.;

7 **Richard Paik**, individually, as an
8 officer of Local Lighthouse Corp. and
9 Secure Alliance Corp., and as an owner,
10 officer, or manager, or *de facto* owner,
11 officer, or manager of Allorey, Inc.,
12 Data World Technologies, Inc., Dial
13 Soft Technologies, Inc., Digital
14 Marketing Solutions, Inc., Savilo
15 Support Services, Inc., and Velocity
16 Information Corp.;

17 **Steven Stansbury**, also known as Steve
18 Stansbury, individually and as an officer
19 of Data World Technologies, Inc., and
20 Dial Soft Technologies, Inc.;

21 **Raymund Verallo**, also known as
22 Raymond Verallo, also known as Ray
23 Verallo, individually and as an officer of
24 Allorey, Inc. and Dial Soft
25 Technologies, Inc.;

26 **Andrew Yoshioka**, individually and as
27 an officer of Audacity LLC and World
28 Access Media;

Allorey, Inc., a California corporation;

Audacity LLC, a California limited
liability company;

Data World Technologies, Inc., a
California corporation;

1 **Dial Soft Technologies, Inc.**, a former
2 Nevada corporation;

3 **Digital Marketing Solutions, Inc.**, a
4 California corporation;

5 **Local Lighthouse Corp.**, a California
6 corporation;

7 **Savilo Support Services, Inc.**, a
8 California corporation;

9 **Secure Alliance Corp.**, a California
10 corporation;

11 **Velocity Information Corp.**, a former
12 California corporation; and

13 **World Access Media**, a California
14 corporation;

15 Defendants.

16
17 Plaintiff, the Federal Trade Commission (“Commission” or “FTC”), filed its
18 Complaint for Civil Penalties, Permanent Injunction and Other Relief
19 (“Complaint”) pursuant to Sections 5(a), 5(m)(1)(A), 13(b), and 16(a) of the
20 Federal Trade Commission Act (“FTC Act”), 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a), 45(m)(1)(A),
21 53(b), and 56(a), and Section 6 of the Telemarketing and Consumer Fraud and
22 Abuse Prevention Act (the “Telemarketing Act”), 15 U.S.C. § 6105. The
23 Commission and Defendants Eric Oakley and Richard Paik (the “Individual
24 Defendants”) have stipulated to the entry of this Stipulated Final Order for
25 Permanent Injunction and Civil Penalty Judgment (the “Order”) to resolve all
26 matters in dispute in this action between them, but not as to any other person, such
27 as an indemnitee.
28

1 **Therefore, it is ordered** as follows:

2 **FINDINGS**

3 1. This Court has jurisdiction over this matter.

4 2. The Complaint charges that the Individual Defendants participated in
5 acts or practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45, and the
6 FTC’s Telemarketing Sales Rule (the “TSR” or “Rule”), as amended, 16 C.F.R.
7 Part 310, by assisting and facilitating their clients who were, among other things:
8 (a) placing telemarketing calls to consumers that delivered prerecorded messages;
9 (b) placing telemarketing calls to consumers whose telephone numbers were on the
10 National Do Not Call (“DNC”) Registry; and (c) transmitting inaccurate caller ID
11 numbers and names with their telemarketing calls.

12 3. The Individual Defendants neither admit nor deny any of the
13 allegations in the Complaint, except as specifically stated in this Order. Only for
14 purposes of this action, the Individual Defendants admit the facts necessary to
15 establish jurisdiction.

16 4. The Individual Defendants waive any claim that they may have under
17 the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, concerning the prosecution of
18 this action through the date of this Order, and they agree to bear their own costs
19 and attorney fees.

20 5. The Individual Defendants and the Commission waive all rights to
21 appeal or otherwise challenge or contest the validity of this Order.

22 **DEFINITIONS**

23 For the purpose of this Order, the following definitions apply:

24 A. “**Individual Defendants**” means Defendants Eric Oakley and Richard
25 Paik, individually, collectively, or in any combination.

26 B. “**Caller Identification Service**” means a service that allows a
27 telephone subscriber to have the telephone number, and, where available, name of
28

1 the calling party transmitted contemporaneously with the telephone call, and
2 displayed on a device in or connected to the subscriber's telephone.

3 C. **“Lead Generator”** means any person that provides, in exchange for
4 consideration, consumer information to a Seller or Telemarketer for use in the
5 marketing of any goods or services.

6 D. **“National Do Not Call Registry”** means the “do-not-call” registry of
7 telephone numbers maintained by the Commission pursuant to 16 C.F.R.
8 § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B).

9 E. **“Outbound Telephone Call”** means a telephone call initiated by a
10 Telemarketer to induce the purchase of goods or services or to solicit a charitable
11 contribution.

12 F. **“Person”** means any individual, group, unincorporated association,
13 limited or general partnership, corporation, or other business entity.

14 G. **“Representatives”** means a Defendant's officers, agents, employees,
15 and those persons in active concert or participation with him who receive actual
16 notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise.

17 H. **“Seller”** means any person who, in connection with a Telemarketing
18 transaction, provides, offers to provide, or arranges for others to provide goods or
19 services to the customer in exchange for consideration, whether or not such person
20 is under the jurisdiction of the Commission.

21 I. **“Telemarketer”** means any person who, in connection with
22 Telemarketing, initiates or receives telephone calls to or from a customer or donor,
23 whether or not such person is under the jurisdiction of the Commission.

24 J. **“Telemarketing”** means a plan, program, or campaign which is
25 conducted to induce the purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution,
26 by use of one or more telephones and which involves more than one interstate
27 telephone call.

28

1 **ORDER**

2 **I**

3 **Permanent Ban on Robocalls**

4 **It is ordered** that the Individual Defendants, whether acting directly or
5 through an intermediary, are permanently restrained and enjoined from initiating,
6 causing others to initiate, or assisting others in initiating any telephone call that
7 plays or delivers a prerecorded message.

8 *Provided, however,* the Individual Defendants are not permanently restrained
9 and enjoined from placing such calls to a business telephone number to induce the
10 purchase of goods (other than nondurable office or cleaning supplies) or services
11 by the business or to solicit a charitable contribution by the business.

12 **II**

13 **Permanent Ban on Calling Telephone Numbers**

14 **Listed on the National Do Not Call Registry**

15 **It is further ordered** that the Individual Defendants, whether acting directly
16 or through an intermediary, are permanently restrained and enjoined from
17 initiating, causing others to initiate, or assisting others in initiating any telephone
18 call to any telephone number listed on the National Do Not Call Registry.

19 **III**

20 **Prohibition Against Abusive Telemarketing Practices**

21 **It is further ordered** that, in connection with Telemarketing, the Individual
22 Defendants and their Representatives are permanently restrained and enjoined from
23 engaging in, causing others to engage in, or assisting others engaging in, any of the
24 following practices:

25 A. Initiating any Outbound Telephone Call to a person on behalf of a
26 Lead Generator, Seller, Telemarketer, or any other third-party when that person has
27 previously stated that he or she does not wish to receive an Outbound Telephone
28

1 Call made by or on behalf of that Lead Generator, Seller, Telemarketer, or third-
2 party.

3 B. Initiating any Outbound Telephone Call to a telephone number within
4 a given area code when the annual fee for access to the telephone numbers within
5 that area code that are on the National Do Not Call Registry has not been paid by
6 or on behalf of Individual Defendants.

7 C. Initiating any Outbound Telephone Call in which the Individual
8 Defendants, their Representatives, or the Lead Generator, Telemarketer, or Seller
9 on whose behalf the call is made, fail to disclose truthfully, promptly, and in a clear
10 and conspicuous manner: (i) the identity of the Lead Generator, Telemarketer,
11 and/or Seller, (ii) that the purpose of the call is to sell goods or services, and
12 (iii) the nature of the goods or services.

13 D. Initiating any Outbound Telephone Call in which the Individual
14 Defendants or their Representatives fail to transmit or cause to be transmitted to
15 any Caller Identification Service in use by a recipient of a Telemarketing call
16 either: (i) the telephone number and name of the Telemarketer making the call; or
17 (ii) the name and customer service telephone number of the Seller on whose behalf
18 the call was made.

19 E. Violating the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. Part 310, attached
20 as Appendix A.

21 IV

22 Monetary Judgment for Civil Penalty and Partial Suspension 23 as to Defendant Eric Oakley

24 **It is further ordered** that:

25 A. Judgment in the amount of Two Million, Seven Hundred Thousand
26 Dollars (\$2,700,000) is entered in favor of the Commission against Defendant Eric
27 Oakley as a civil penalty.

28

1 B. Defendant Eric Oakley is ordered to pay to the Commission One
2 Hundred Seventy-Five Thousand Dollars (\$175,000), which, as Defendant Eric
3 Oakley stipulates, undersigned counsel holds in escrow for no purpose other than
4 payment to the Commission. Such payment must be made within seven (7) days of
5 entry of this Order by electronic fund transfer in accordance with instructions
6 previously provided by a representative of the Commission. Upon such payment,
7 the remainder of the judgment is suspended, subject to Subsection C, below, and
8 the Section titled Additional Monetary Provisions.

9 C. The Commission's agreement to the suspension of part of this
10 judgment is expressly premised upon the truthfulness, accuracy, and completeness
11 of Defendant Eric Oakley's sworn financial statements and related documents
12 (collectively, "financial representations") submitted to the Commission, namely:
13 the Financial Statement of Individual Defendant Eric Oakley signed on May 31,
14 2016, including the attachments and documents submitted with the Financial
15 Statement.

16 **V**

17 **Monetary Judgment for Civil Penalty and Partial Suspension**
18 **as to Defendant Richard Paik**

19 **It is further ordered that:**

20 A. Judgment in the amount of Two Million, Seven Hundred Thousand
21 Dollars (\$2,700,000) is entered in favor of the Commission against Defendant
22 Richard Paik as a civil penalty.

23 B. Defendant Richard Paik is ordered to pay to the Commission Two
24 Hundred Twenty-Five Thousand Dollars (\$225,000), which, as Defendant Richard
25 Paik stipulates, undersigned counsel holds in escrow for no purpose other than
26 payment to the Commission. Such payment must be made within seven (7) days of
27 entry of this Order by electronic fund transfer in accordance with instructions
28 previously provided by a representative of the Commission. Upon such payment,

1 the remainder of the judgment is suspended, subject to Subsection C, below, and
2 the Section titled Additional Monetary Provisions.

3 C. The Commission's agreement to the suspension of part of this
4 judgment is expressly premised upon the truthfulness, accuracy, and completeness
5 of Defendant Richard Paik's sworn financial statements and related documents
6 (collectively, "financial representations") submitted to the Commission, namely:
7 the Financial Statement of Individual Defendant Richard Paik signed on May 24,
8 2016, including the attachments and documents submitted with the Financial
9 Statement.

10 VI

11 Additional Monetary Provisions

12 A. The suspension of any judgment entered in Sections IV and V of this
13 Order will be lifted as to the Individual Defendant subject to that judgment if, upon
14 motion by the Commission, the Court finds that such Individual Defendant failed
15 to disclose any material asset, materially misstated the value of any asset, or made
16 any other material misstatement or omission in the Individual Defendant's
17 financial representations identified above.

18 B. If the suspension of any judgment entered in Sections IV and V of this
19 Order is lifted, the judgment becomes immediately due as to the Individual
20 Defendant that is subject to that judgment in the amount specified in Subsection A
21 of the applicable Section above (which the parties stipulate only for purposes of
22 this Section represents the amount of the civil penalty for the violations alleged in
23 the Complaint), less any payment previously made pursuant to the applicable
24 Section, plus interest computed from the date of entry of this Order.

25 C. The Individual Defendants relinquish dominion and all legal and
26 equitable right, title, and interest in all assets transferred pursuant to this Order and
27 may not seek the return of any assets.

28

1 D. The facts alleged in the Complaint will be taken as true, without
2 further proof, in any subsequent civil litigation by or on behalf of the Commission,
3 including in a proceeding to enforce its rights to any payment or monetary
4 judgment pursuant to this Order.

5 E. The Individual Defendants agree that the judgment represents a civil
6 penalty owed to the government of the United States, is not compensation for
7 actual pecuniary loss, and, therefore, as to the Individual Defendants, it is not
8 subject to discharge under the Bankruptcy Code pursuant to 11 U.S.C. § 523(a)(7).

9 F. The Individual Defendants acknowledge that their Taxpayer
10 Identification Numbers (Social Security Numbers), which they must submit, may
11 be used for collecting and reporting on any delinquent amount arising out of this
12 Order, in accordance with 31 U.S.C. § 7701.

13 VII

14 Cooperation

15 **It is further ordered** that the Individual Defendants must fully cooperate
16 with representatives of the Commission in this case and in any investigation related
17 to or associated with the transactions or the occurrences that are the subject of the
18 Complaint. The Individual Defendants must provide truthful and complete
19 information, evidence, and testimony. The Individual Defendants must appear for
20 interviews, discovery, hearings, trials, and any other proceedings that a
21 Commission representative may reasonably request upon five days written notice,
22 or other reasonable notice, at such places and times as a Commission
23 representative may designate, without the service of a subpoena. Further, to assist
24 the Commission with any investigation related to or associated with the
25 transactions or the occurrences that are the subject of the Complaint, and with
26 monitoring each Individual Defendant's compliance with this order, each
27 Individual Defendant consents, for purposes of the Electronic Communications
28 Privacy Act, to the disclosure, by electronic communications service providers and

1 remote computing service providers of the contents of his auto-dialed,
2 telemarketing, or pre-recorded telephone communications and records or other
3 information pertaining to his auto-dialed, telemarketing, or pre-recorded telephone
4 communications. Each Individual Defendant further agrees to execute, within five
5 days of a request from the Commission, any forms or other documents evidencing
6 his consent that may be required by such electronic communications service
7 providers or remote computing service providers.

8 VIII

9 Order Acknowledgments

10 **It is further ordered** that the Individual Defendants obtain
11 acknowledgments of receipt of this Order:

12 A. Each Individual Defendant, within seven days of entry of this Order,
13 must submit to the Commission an acknowledgment of receipt of this Order sworn
14 under penalty of perjury.

15 B. For five years after entry of this Order, each Individual Defendant, for
16 any business that he or she, individually or collectively with any other defendants,
17 is the majority owner, or controls directly or indirectly, must deliver a copy of this
18 Order to: (1) any individual or business that provides an automated dialing
19 platform to the Individual Defendant's business; and (2) any Lead Generator or
20 entity that provides Telemarketing services to the Individual Defendant's business.
21 Delivery must occur within seven days of entry of this Order for current providers.
22 For all others, delivery must occur before they begin providing services.

23 C. For five years after entry of this Order, each Individual Defendant, for
24 any business that he or she, individually or collectively with any other defendants,
25 is the majority owner, or controls directly or indirectly, must deliver a copy of this
26 Order to: (1) all principals, officers, directors, and LLC managers and members;
27 (2) all employees, agents, and other representatives who participate in conduct
28 related to the subject matter of the Order; and (3) any business entity resulting

1 from any change in structure as set forth the section titled Compliance Reporting.
2 Delivery must occur within seven days of entry of this Order for current personnel.
3 For all others, delivery must occur before they assume their responsibilities.

4 D. From each individual or entity to which an Individual Defendant
5 delivered a copy of this Order, that Individual Defendant must obtain, within 30
6 days, a signed and dated acknowledgment of receipt of this Order.

7 IX

8 Compliance Reporting

9 **It is further ordered** that the Individual Defendants make timely
10 submissions to the Commission:

11 A. One year after entry of this Order, each Individual Defendant must
12 submit a compliance report, sworn under penalty of perjury. Each Individual
13 Defendant must:

- 14 1) Identify all telephone numbers and all physical, postal, email
15 and Internet addresses, including all residences;
- 16 2) Identify all business activities, including any business for which
17 he or she performs services whether as an employee or
18 otherwise and any entity in which he or she has any ownership
19 interest;
- 20 3) Describe in detail his involvement in each such business,
21 including title, role, responsibilities, participation, authority,
22 control, and any ownership;
- 23 4) Identify the primary physical, postal, and email address and
24 telephone number, as designated points of contact, which
25 representatives of the Commission may use to communicate
26 with him;
- 27 5) Identify all of his businesses by all of their names, telephone
28 numbers, and physical, postal, email, and Internet addresses;

- 1 6) Describe the activities of each business, including the goods
2 and services offered, the means of advertising, marketing, and
3 sales;
- 4 7) Describe in detail whether and how he or she is in compliance
5 with each Section of this Order; and
- 6 8) Provide a copy of each Order Acknowledgment obtained
7 pursuant to this Order, unless previously submitted to the
8 Commission.

9 B. For ten years after entry of this Order, each Individual Defendant must
10 submit a compliance notice, sworn under penalty of perjury, within fourteen days
11 of any change in the following:

- 12 1) Name, including aliases or fictitious name, or residence
13 address;
- 14 2) Title or role in any business activity, including any business for
15 which he or she performs services whether as an employee or
16 otherwise and any entity in which he or she has any ownership
17 interest, and identify the name, physical address, and any
18 Internet address of the business or entity;
- 19 3) Any designated point of contact; or
- 20 4) The structure of any entity that he or she has any ownership
21 interest in or controls directly or indirectly that may affect
22 compliance obligations arising under this Order, including:
23 creation, merger, sale, or dissolution of the entity or any
24 subsidiary, parent, or affiliate that engages in any acts or
25 practices subject to this Order.

26 C. Each Individual Defendant must submit to the Commission notice of
27 the filing of any bankruptcy petition, insolvency proceeding, or similar proceeding
28 by or against him within fourteen days of its filing.

1 D. Any submission to the Commission required by this Order to be
2 sworn under penalty of perjury must be true and accurate and comply with 28
3 U.S.C. § 1746, such as by concluding: “I declare under penalty of perjury under
4 the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct.
5 Executed on: _____” and supplying the date, signatory’s full name, title (if
6 applicable), and signature.

7 E. Unless otherwise directed by a Commission representative in writing,
8 all submissions to the Commission pursuant to this Order must be emailed to
9 DEbrief@ftc.gov or sent by overnight courier (not the U.S. Postal Service) to:
10 Associate Director for Enforcement, Bureau of Consumer Protection, Federal
11 Trade Commission, 600 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Washington, DC 20580. The
12 subject line must begin: *FTC v. Eric Oakley*, Matter Number 1523152 or *FTC v.*
13 *Richard Paik*, Matter Number 1523152, as applicable.

14 **X**

15 **Recordkeeping**

16 **It is further ordered** that the Individual Defendants must create certain
17 records for ten years after entry of the Order, and retain each such record for five
18 years. Specifically, each Individual Defendant, for any business that such
19 Individual Defendant, individually or collectively with any other defendant, is a
20 majority owner or controls directly or indirectly, must create and retain the
21 following records:

22 A. Accounting records showing the revenues from all goods or services
23 sold;

24 B. Personnel records showing, for each person providing services,
25 whether as an employee or otherwise, that person’s: name, addresses, telephone
26 numbers, job title or position, dates of service, and (if applicable) the reason for
27 termination;

28

1 C. Records of all consumer complaints, whether received directly or
2 indirectly, such as through a third party, and any response;

3 D. All records, including contracts, relating to any person, entity, or Lead
4 Generator from whom the Individual Defendant or the Individual Defendant's
5 business purchased leads or phone numbers;

6 E. All records relating to automated dialing platforms used by the
7 Individual Defendant or the Individual Defendant's business to initiate telephone
8 calls, including contracts with any individual or business that provides such
9 automated dialing platforms; and

10 F. All records necessary to demonstrate full compliance with each
11 provision of this Order, including all submissions to the Commission.

12 XI

13 Compliance Monitoring

14 **It is further ordered** that, for the purpose of monitoring the Individual
15 Defendants' compliance with this Order, including the financial representations
16 upon which part of the judgments were suspended, and any failure to transfer any
17 assets as required by this Order:

18 A. Within 14 days of receipt of a written request from a representative of
19 the Commission, each Individual Defendant must: (1) submit additional
20 compliance reports or other requested information, which must be sworn under
21 penalty of perjury; (2) appear for depositions; and (3) produce documents for
22 inspection and copying. The Commission is also authorized to obtain discovery,
23 without further leave of court, using any of the procedures prescribed by Federal
24 Rules of Civil Procedure 29, 30 (including telephonic depositions), 31, 33, 34, 36,
25 45, and 69.

26 B. For matters concerning this Order, the Commission is authorized to
27 communicate directly with each Individual Defendant. The Individual Defendants
28 must permit representatives of the Commission to interview anyone employed by

1 or affiliated with any Individual Defendant who has agreed to such an interview.
2 The person interviewed may have counsel present.

3 C. The Commission may use all other lawful means, including posing,
4 through its representatives as consumers, suppliers, or other individuals or entities
5 to the Individual Defendants or any individual or entity affiliated with one or more
6 of them, without the necessity of identification or prior notice. Nothing in this
7 Order limits the Commission’s lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to
8 Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1.

9 D. Upon written request from a representative of the Commission, any
10 consumer reporting agency must furnish consumer reports concerning Individual
11 Defendants pursuant to Section 604(1) of the Fair Credit Reporting Act, 15 U.S.C.
12 §1681b(a)(1).

13 **XII**

14 **Retention of Jurisdiction**

15 **It is further ordered** that this Court retains jurisdiction of this matter for
16 purposes of construction, modification, and enforcement of this Order.

17
18 **It is so ordered.**

19
20 Dated:

21 _____
United States District Judge

22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Federal Trade Commission

§ 310.2

**PART 310—TELEMARKETING SALES
RULE 16 CFR PART 310**

Sec.

310.1 Scope of regulations in this part.

310.2 Definitions.

310.3 Deceptive telemarketing acts or practices.

310.4 Abusive telemarketing acts or practices.

310.5 Recordkeeping requirements.

310.6 Exemptions.

310.7 Actions by states and private persons.

310.8 Fee for access to the National Do Not Call Registry.

310.9 Severability.

AUTHORITY: 15 U.S.C. 6101–6108.

SOURCE: 75 FR 48516, Aug. 10, 2010, unless otherwise noted.

§ 310.1 Scope of regulations in this part.

This part implements the Telemarketing and Consumer Fraud and Abuse Prevention Act, 15 U.S.C. 6101–6108, as amended.

§ 310.2 Definitions.

(a) *Acquirer* means a business organization, financial institution, or an agent of a business organization or financial institution that has authority from an organization that operates or licenses a credit card system to authorize merchants to accept, transmit, or process payment by credit card through the credit card system for money, goods or services, or anything else of value.

§310.2

16 CFR Ch. I (1–1–16 Edition)

(b) *Attorney General* means the chief legal officer of a state.

(c) *Billing information* means any data that enables any person to access a customer's or donor's account, such as a credit card, checking, savings, share or similar account, utility bill, mortgage loan account, or debit card.

(d) *Caller identification service* means a service that allows a telephone subscriber to have the telephone number, and, where available, name of the calling party transmitted contemporaneously with the telephone call, and displayed on a device in or connected to the subscriber's telephone.

(e) *Cardholder* means a person to whom a credit card is issued or who is authorized to use a credit card on behalf of or in addition to the person to whom the credit card is issued.

(f) *Charitable contribution* means any donation or gift of money or any other thing of value.

(g) *Commission* means the Federal Trade Commission.

(h) *Credit* means the right granted by a creditor to a debtor to defer payment of debt or to incur debt and defer its payment.

(i) *Credit card* means any card, plate, coupon book, or other credit device existing for the purpose of obtaining money, property, labor, or services on credit.

(j) *Credit card sales draft* means any record or evidence of a credit card transaction.

(k) *Credit card system* means any method or procedure used to process credit card transactions involving credit cards issued or licensed by the operator of that system.

(l) *Customer* means any person who is or may be required to pay for goods or services offered through telemarketing.

(m) *Debt relief service* means any program or service represented, directly or by implication, to renegotiate, settle, or in any way alter the terms of payment or other terms of the debt between a person and one or more unsecured creditors or debt collectors, including, but not limited to, a reduction in the balance, interest rate, or fees owed by a person to an unsecured creditor or debt collector.

(n) *Donor* means any person solicited to make a charitable contribution.

(o) *Established business relationship* means a relationship between a seller and a consumer based on:

(1) the consumer's purchase, rental, or lease of the seller's goods or services or a financial transaction between the consumer and seller, within the eighteen (18) months immediately preceding the date of a telemarketing call; or

(2) the consumer's inquiry or application regarding a product or service offered by the seller, within the three (3) months immediately preceding the date of a telemarketing call.

(p) *Free-to-pay conversion* means, in an offer or agreement to sell or provide any goods or services, a provision under which a customer receives a product or service for free for an initial period and will incur an obligation to pay for the product or service if he or she does not take affirmative action to cancel before the end of that period.

(q) *Investment opportunity* means anything, tangible or intangible, that is offered, offered for sale, sold, or traded based wholly or in part on representations, either express or implied, about past, present, or future income, profit, or appreciation.

(r) *Material* means likely to affect a person's choice of, or conduct regarding, goods or services or a charitable contribution.

(s) *Merchant* means a person who is authorized under a written contract with an acquirer to honor or accept credit cards, or to transmit or process for payment credit card payments, for the purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution.

(t) *Merchant agreement* means a written contract between a merchant and an acquirer to honor or accept credit cards, or to transmit or process for payment credit card payments, for the purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution.

(u) *Negative option feature* means, in an offer or agreement to sell or provide any goods or services, a provision under which the customer's silence or failure to take an affirmative action to reject goods or services or to cancel the agreement is interpreted by the seller as acceptance of the offer.

Federal Trade Commission**§ 310.2**

(v) *Outbound telephone call* means a telephone call initiated by a telemarketer to induce the purchase of goods or services or to solicit a charitable contribution.

(w) *Person* means any individual, group, unincorporated association, limited or general partnership, corporation, or other business entity.

(x) *Preacquired account information* means any information that enables a seller or telemarketer to cause a charge to be placed against a customer's or donor's account without obtaining the account number directly from the customer or donor during the telemarketing transaction pursuant to which the account will be charged.

(y) *Prize* means anything offered, or purportedly offered, and given, or purportedly given, to a person by chance. For purposes of this definition, chance exists if a person is guaranteed to receive an item and, at the time of the offer or purported offer, the telemarketer does not identify the specific item that the person will receive.

(z) *Prize promotion* means:

(1) A sweepstakes or other game of chance; or

(2) An oral or written express or implied representation that a person has won, has been selected to receive, or may be eligible to receive a prize or purported prize.

(aa) *Seller* means any person who, in connection with a telemarketing transaction, provides, offers to provide, or arranges for others to provide goods or services to the customer in exchange for consideration.

(bb) *State* means any state of the United States, the District of Columbia, Puerto Rico, the Northern Mariana Islands, and any territory or possession of the United States.

(cc) *Telemarketer* means any person who, in connection with telemarketing, initiates or receives telephone calls to or from a customer or donor.

(dd) *Telemarketing* means a plan, program, or campaign which is conducted to induce the purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution, by use of one or more telephones and which involves more than one interstate telephone call. The term does not include the solicitation of sales through the mailing of a catalog

which: contains a written description or illustration of the goods or services offered for sale; includes the business address of the seller; includes multiple pages of written material or illustrations; and has been issued not less frequently than once a year, when the person making the solicitation does not solicit customers by telephone but only receives calls initiated by customers in response to the catalog and during those calls takes orders only without further solicitation. For purposes of the previous sentence, the term "further solicitation" does not include providing the customer with information about, or attempting to sell, any other item included in the same catalog which prompted the customer's call or in a substantially similar catalog.

(ee) *Upselling* means soliciting the purchase of goods or services following an initial transaction during a single telephone call. The upsell is a separate telemarketing transaction, not a continuation of the initial transaction. An "external upsell" is a solicitation made by or on behalf of a seller different from the seller in the initial transaction, regardless of whether the initial transaction and the subsequent solicitation are made by the same telemarketer. An "internal upsell" is a solicitation made by or on behalf of the same seller as in the initial transaction, regardless of whether the initial transaction and subsequent solicitation are made by the same telemarketer.

EFFECTIVE DATE NOTE: At 80 FR 77558, Dec. 14, 2015, §310.2 was amended by redesignating paragraphs (aa) through (ee) as paragraphs (dd) through (hh), redesignating paragraphs (f) through (z) as paragraphs (h) through (bb), and adding new paragraphs (f), (g), and (cc), effective Feb. 12, 2016. For the convenience of the user, the added text is set forth as follows:

§ 310.2 Definitions.

* * * * *

(f) *Cash-to-cash money transfer* means the electronic (as defined in section 106(2) of the Electronic Signatures in Global and National Commerce Act (15 U.S.C. 7006(2))) transfer of the value of cash received from one person to another person in a different location that is

§310.3

16 CFR Ch. I (1–1–16 Edition)

sent by a money transfer provider and received in the form of cash. For purposes of this definition, *money transfer provider* means any person or financial institution that provides cash-to-cash money transfers for a person in the normal course of its business, whether or not the person holds an account with such person or financial institution. The term *cash-to-cash money transfer* includes a remittance transfer, as defined in section 919(g)(2) of the Electronic Fund Transfer Act (“EFTA”), 15 U.S.C. 1693a, that is a cash-to-cash transaction; however it does not include any transaction that is:

- (1) An electronic fund transfer as defined in section 903 of the EFTA;
- (2) Covered by Regulation E, 12 CFR 1005.20, pertaining to gift cards; or
- (3) Subject to the Truth in Lending Act, 15 U.S.C. 1601 *et seq.*

(g) *Cash reload mechanism* is a device, authorization code, personal identification number, or other security measure that makes it possible for a person to convert cash into an electronic (as defined in section 106(2) of the Electronic Signatures in Global and National Commerce Act (15 U.S.C. 7006(2)) form that can be used to add funds to a general-use prepaid card, as defined in Regulation E, 12 CFR 1005.2, or an account with a payment intermediary. For purposes of this definition, a cash reload mechanism is not itself a general-use prepaid debit card or a swipe reload process or similar method in which funds are added directly onto a person’s own general-use prepaid card or account with a payment intermediary.

* * * * *

(cc) *Remotely created payment order* means any payment instruction or order drawn on a person’s account that is created by the payee or the payee’s agent and deposited into or cleared through the check clearing system. The term includes, without limitation, a “remotely created check,” as defined in Regulation CC, Availability of Funds and Collection of Checks, 12 CFR 229.2(ff), but does not include a payment order cleared through an Automated Clearinghouse (ACH) Network or subject to the Truth in Lending Act, 15 U.S.C. 1601 *et seq.*, and Regulation Z, 12 CFR part 1026.

* * * * *

§310.3 Deceptive telemarketing acts or practices.

(a) *Prohibited deceptive telemarketing acts or practices.* It is a deceptive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for any seller or telemarketer to engage in the following conduct:

(1) Before a customer consents to pay⁶⁵⁹ for goods or services offered, failing to disclose truthfully, in a clear and conspicuous manner, the following material information:

(i) The total costs to purchase, receive, or use, and the quantity of, any goods or services that are the subject of the sales offer;⁶⁶⁰

(ii) All material restrictions, limitations, or conditions to purchase, receive, or use the goods or services that are the subject of the sales offer;

(iii) If the seller has a policy of not making refunds, cancellations, exchanges, or repurchases, a statement informing the customer that this is the seller’s policy; or, if the seller or telemarketer makes a representation about a refund, cancellation, exchange, or repurchase policy, a statement of all material terms and conditions of such policy;

(iv) In any prize promotion, the odds of being able to receive the prize, and, if the odds are not calculable in advance, the factors used in calculating the odds; that no purchase or payment is required to win a prize or to participate in a prize promotion and that any purchase or payment will not increase the person’s chances of winning; and the no-purchase/no-payment method of participating in the prize promotion with either instructions on how to participate or an address or local or toll-free telephone number to which customers may write or call for information on how to participate;

⁶⁵⁹ When a seller or telemarketer uses, or directs a customer to use, a courier to transport payment, the seller or telemarketer must make the disclosures required by §310.3(a)(1) before sending a courier to pick up payment or authorization for payment, or directing a customer to have a courier pick up payment or authorization for payment. In the case of debt relief services, the seller or telemarketer must make the disclosures required by §310.3(a)(1) before the consumer enrolls in an offered program.

⁶⁶⁰ For offers of consumer credit products subject to the Truth in Lending Act, 15 U.S.C. 1601 *et seq.*, and Regulation Z, 12 CFR 226, compliance with the disclosure requirements under the Truth in Lending Act and Regulation Z shall constitute compliance with §310.3(a)(1)(i) of this Rule.

Federal Trade Commission**§ 310.3**

(v) All material costs or conditions to receive or redeem a prize that is the subject of the prize promotion;

(vi) In the sale of any goods or services represented to protect, insure, or otherwise limit a customer's liability in the event of unauthorized use of the customer's credit card, the limits on a cardholder's liability for unauthorized use of a credit card pursuant to 15 U.S.C. 1643;

(vii) If the offer includes a negative option feature, all material terms and conditions of the negative option feature, including, but not limited to, the fact that the customer's account will be charged unless the customer takes an affirmative action to avoid the charge(s), the date(s) the charge(s) will be submitted for payment, and the specific steps the customer must take to avoid the charge(s); and

(viii) In the sale of any debt relief service:

(A) the amount of time necessary to achieve the represented results, and to the extent that the service may include a settlement offer to any of the customer's creditors or debt collectors, the time by which the debt relief service provider will make a bona fide settlement offer to each of them;

(B) to the extent that the service may include a settlement offer to any of the customer's creditors or debt collectors, the amount of money or the percentage of each outstanding debt that the customer must accumulate before the debt relief service provider will make a bona fide settlement offer to each of them;

(C) to the extent that any aspect of the debt relief service relies upon or results in the customer's failure to make timely payments to creditors or debt collectors, that the use of the debt relief service will likely adversely affect the customer's creditworthiness, may result in the customer being subject to collections or sued by creditors or debt collectors, and may increase the amount of money the customer owes due to the accrual of fees and interest; and

(D) to the extent that the debt relief service requests or requires the customer to place funds in an account at an insured financial institution, that the customer owns the funds held in

the account, the customer may withdraw from the debt relief service at any time without penalty, and, if the customer withdraws, the customer must receive all funds in the account, other than funds earned by the debt relief service in compliance with § 310.4(a)(5)(i)(A) through (C).

(2) Misrepresenting, directly or by implication, in the sale of goods or services any of the following material information:

(i) The total costs to purchase, receive, or use, and the quantity of, any goods or services that are the subject of a sales offer;

(ii) Any material restriction, limitation, or condition to purchase, receive, or use goods or services that are the subject of a sales offer;

(iii) Any material aspect of the performance, efficacy, nature, or central characteristics of goods or services that are the subject of a sales offer;

(iv) Any material aspect of the nature or terms of the seller's refund, cancellation, exchange, or repurchase policies;

(v) Any material aspect of a prize promotion including, but not limited to, the odds of being able to receive a prize, the nature or value of a prize, or that a purchase or payment is required to win a prize or to participate in a prize promotion;

(vi) Any material aspect of an investment opportunity including, but not limited to, risk, liquidity, earnings potential, or profitability;

(vii) A seller's or telemarketer's affiliation with, or endorsement or sponsorship by, any person or government entity;

(viii) That any customer needs offered goods or services to provide protections a customer already has pursuant to 15 U.S.C. 1643;

(ix) Any material aspect of a negative option feature including, but not limited to, the fact that the customer's account will be charged unless the customer takes an affirmative action to avoid the charge(s), the date(s) the charge(s) will be submitted for payment, and the specific steps the customer must take to avoid the charge(s); or

§ 310.3**16 CFR Ch. I (1–1–16 Edition)**

(x) Any material aspect of any debt relief service, including, but not limited to, the amount of money or the percentage of the debt amount that a customer may save by using such service; the amount of time necessary to achieve the represented results; the amount of money or the percentage of each outstanding debt that the customer must accumulate before the provider of the debt relief service will initiate attempts with the customer's creditors or debt collectors or make a bona fide offer to negotiate, settle, or modify the terms of the customer's debt; the effect of the service on a customer's creditworthiness; the effect of the service on collection efforts of the customer's creditors or debt collectors; the percentage or number of customers who attain the represented results; and whether a debt relief service is offered or provided by a non-profit entity.

(3) Causing billing information to be submitted for payment, or collecting or attempting to collect payment for goods or services or a charitable contribution, directly or indirectly, without the customer's or donor's express verifiable authorization, except when the method of payment used is a credit card subject to protections of the Truth in Lending Act and Regulation Z,⁶⁶¹ or a debit card subject to the protections of the Electronic Fund Transfer Act and Regulation E.⁶⁶² Such authorization shall be deemed verifiable if any of the following means is employed:

(i) Express written authorization by the customer or donor, which includes the customer's or donor's signature;⁶⁶³

(ii) Express oral authorization which is audio-recorded and made available upon request to the customer or donor, and the customer's or donor's bank or other billing entity, and which evidences clearly both the customer's or

donor's authorization of payment for the goods or services or charitable contribution that are the subject of the telemarketing transaction and the customer's or donor's receipt of all of the following information:

(A) The number of debits, charges, or payments (if more than one);

(B) The date(s) the debit(s), charge(s), or payment(s) will be submitted for payment;

(C) The amount(s) of the debit(s), charge(s), or payment(s);

(D) The customer's or donor's name;

(E) The customer's or donor's billing information, identified with sufficient specificity such that the customer or donor understands what account will be used to collect payment for the goods or services or charitable contribution that are the subject of the telemarketing transaction;

(F) A telephone number for customer or donor inquiry that is answered during normal business hours; and

(G) The date of the customer's or donor's oral authorization; or

(iii) Written confirmation of the transaction, identified in a clear and conspicuous manner as such on the outside of the envelope, sent to the customer or donor via first class mail prior to the submission for payment of the customer's or donor's billing information, and that includes all of the information contained in §§ 310.3(a)(3)(i)(A)-(G) and a clear and conspicuous statement of the procedures by which the customer or donor can obtain a refund from the seller or telemarketer or charitable organization in the event the confirmation is inaccurate; provided, however, that this means of authorization shall not be deemed verifiable in instances in which goods or services are offered in a transaction involving a free-to-pay conversion and preacquired account information.

(4) Making a false or misleading statement to induce any person to pay for goods or services or to induce a charitable contribution.

(b) *Assisting and facilitating.* It is a deceptive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a person to provide substantial assistance or support to any seller or telemarketer when that person knows or consciously

⁶⁶¹ Truth in Lending Act, 15 U.S.C. 1601 *et seq.*, and Regulation Z, 12 CFR part 226.

⁶⁶² Electronic Fund Transfer Act, 15 U.S.C. 1693 *et seq.*, and Regulation E, 12 CFR part 205.

⁶⁶³ For purposes of this Rule, the term "signature" shall include an electronic or digital form of signature, to the extent that such form of signature is recognized as a valid signature under applicable federal law or state contract law.

Federal Trade Commission**§ 310.4**

avoids knowing that the seller or telemarketer is engaged in any act or practice that violates §§ 310.3(a), (c) or (d), or § 310.4 of this Rule.

(c) *Credit card laundering.* Except as expressly permitted by the applicable credit card system, it is a deceptive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for:

(1) A merchant to present to or deposit into, or cause another to present to or deposit into, the credit card system for payment, a credit card sales draft generated by a telemarketing transaction that is not the result of a telemarketing credit card transaction between the cardholder and the merchant;

(2) Any person to employ, solicit, or otherwise cause a merchant, or an employee, representative, or agent of the merchant, to present to or deposit into the credit card system for payment, a credit card sales draft generated by a telemarketing transaction that is not the result of a telemarketing credit card transaction between the cardholder and the merchant; or

(3) Any person to obtain access to the credit card system through the use of a business relationship or an affiliation with a merchant, when such access is not authorized by the merchant agreement or the applicable credit card system.

(d) *Prohibited deceptive acts or practices in the solicitation of charitable contributions.* It is a fraudulent charitable solicitation, a deceptive telemarketing act or practice, and a violation of this Rule for any telemarketer soliciting charitable contributions to misrepresent, directly or by implication, any of the following material information:

(1) The nature, purpose, or mission of any entity on behalf of which a charitable contribution is being requested;

(2) That any charitable contribution is tax deductible in whole or in part;

(3) The purpose for which any charitable contribution will be used;

(4) The percentage or amount of any charitable contribution that will go to a charitable organization or to any particular charitable program;

(5) Any material aspect of a prize promotion including, but not limited to: the odds of being able to receive a prize; the nature or value of a prize; or

that a charitable contribution is required to win a prize or to participate in a prize promotion; or

(6) A charitable organization's or telemarketer's affiliation with, or endorsement or sponsorship by, any person or government entity.

EFFECTIVE DATE NOTE: At 80 FR 77558, Dec. 14, 2015, § 310.3 was amended by redesignating paragraphs (a)(3)(ii)(A) through (G) as paragraphs (a)(3)(ii)(B) through (H) and adding new paragraph (a)(3)(ii)(A), eff. Feb. 12, 2016. For the convenience of the user, the added text is set forth as follows:

§ 310.3 Deceptive telemarketing acts or practices.

(a) * * *

(3) * * *

(ii) * * *

(A) An accurate description, clearly and conspicuously stated, of the goods or services or charitable contribution for which payment authorization is sought;

* * * * *

§ 310.4 Abusive telemarketing acts or practices.

(a) *Abusive conduct generally.* It is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for any seller or telemarketer to engage in the following conduct:

(1) Threats, intimidation, or the use of profane or obscene language;

(2) Requesting or receiving payment of any fee or consideration for goods or services represented to remove derogatory information from, or improve, a person's credit history, credit record, or credit rating until:

(i) The time frame in which the seller has represented all of the goods or services will be provided to that person has expired; and

(ii) The seller has provided the person with documentation in the form of a consumer report from a consumer reporting agency demonstrating that the promised results have been achieved, such report having been issued more than six months after the results were achieved. Nothing in this Rule should be construed to affect the requirement in the Fair Credit Reporting Act, 15 U.S.C. 1681, that a consumer report may only be obtained for a specified permissible purpose;

§ 310.4**16 CFR Ch. I (1–1–16 Edition)**

(3) Requesting or receiving payment of any fee or consideration from a person for goods or services represented to recover or otherwise assist in the return of money or any other item of value paid for by, or promised to, that person in a previous telemarketing transaction, until seven (7) business days after such money or other item is delivered to that person. This provision shall not apply to goods or services provided to a person by a licensed attorney;

(4) Requesting or receiving payment of any fee or consideration in advance of obtaining a loan or other extension of credit when the seller or telemarketer has guaranteed or represented a high likelihood of success in obtaining or arranging a loan or other extension of credit for a person;

(5)(i) Requesting or receiving payment of any fee or consideration for any debt relief service until and unless:

(A) The seller or telemarketer has renegotiated, settled, reduced, or otherwise altered the terms of at least one debt pursuant to a settlement agreement, debt management plan, or other such valid contractual agreement executed by the customer;

(B) The customer has made at least one payment pursuant to that settlement agreement, debt management plan, or other valid contractual agreement between the customer and the creditor or debt collector; and

(C) To the extent that debts enrolled in a service are renegotiated, settled, reduced, or otherwise altered individually, the fee or consideration either:

(1) Bears the same proportional relationship to the total fee for renegotiating, settling, reducing, or altering the terms of the entire debt balance as the individual debt amount bears to the entire debt amount. The individual debt amount and the entire debt amount are those owed at the time the debt was enrolled in the service; or

(2) Is a percentage of the amount saved as a result of the renegotiation, settlement, reduction, or alteration. The percentage charged cannot change from one individual debt to another. The amount saved is the difference between the amount owed at the time the debt was enrolled in the service and the

amount actually paid to satisfy the debt.

(ii) Nothing in § 310.4(a)(5)(i) prohibits requesting or requiring the customer to place funds in an account to be used for the debt relief provider's fees and for payments to creditors or debt collectors in connection with the renegotiation, settlement, reduction, or other alteration of the terms of payment or other terms of a debt, provided that:

(A) The funds are held in an account at an insured financial institution;

(B) The customer owns the funds held in the account and is paid accrued interest on the account, if any;

(C) The entity administering the account is not owned or controlled by, or in any way affiliated with, the debt relief service;

(D) The entity administering the account does not give or accept any money or other compensation in exchange for referrals of business involving the debt relief service; and

(E) The customer may withdraw from the debt relief service at any time without penalty, and must receive all funds in the account, other than funds earned by the debt relief service in compliance with § 310.4(a)(5)(i)(A) through (C), within seven (7) business days of the customer's request.

(6) Disclosing or receiving, for consideration, unencrypted consumer account numbers for use in telemarketing; provided, however, that this paragraph shall not apply to the disclosure or receipt of a customer's or donor's billing information to process a payment for goods or services or a charitable contribution pursuant to a transaction;

(7) Causing billing information to be submitted for payment, directly or indirectly, without the express informed consent of the customer or donor. In any telemarketing transaction, the seller or telemarketer must obtain the express informed consent of the customer or donor to be charged for the goods or services or charitable contribution and to be charged using the identified account. In any telemarketing transaction involving preacquired account information, the requirements in paragraphs (a)(7)(i) through (ii) of this section must be met to evidence express informed consent.

Federal Trade Commission**§ 310.4**

(i) In any telemarketing transaction involving preacquired account information and a free-to-pay conversion feature, the seller or telemarketer must:

(A) Obtain from the customer, at a minimum, the last four (4) digits of the account number to be charged;

(B) Obtain from the customer his or her express agreement to be charged for the goods or services and to be charged using the account number pursuant to paragraph (a)(7)(i)(A) of this section; and,

(C) Make and maintain an audio recording of the entire telemarketing transaction.

(ii) In any other telemarketing transaction involving preacquired account information not described in paragraph (a)(7)(i) of this section, the seller or telemarketer must:

(A) At a minimum, identify the account to be charged with sufficient specificity for the customer or donor to understand what account will be charged; and

(B) Obtain from the customer or donor his or her express agreement to be charged for the goods or services and to be charged using the account number identified pursuant to paragraph (a)(7)(ii)(A) of this section; or

(8) Failing to transmit or cause to be transmitted the telephone number, and, when made available by the telemarketer's carrier, the name of the telemarketer, to any caller identification service in use by a recipient of a telemarketing call; provided that it shall not be a violation to substitute (for the name and phone number used in, or billed for, making the call) the name of the seller or charitable organization on behalf of which a telemarketing call is placed, and the seller's or charitable organization's customer or donor service telephone number, which is answered during regular business hours.

(b) *Pattern of calls.* (1) It is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a telemarketer to engage in, or for a seller to cause a telemarketer to engage in, the following conduct:

(i) Causing any telephone to ring, or engaging any person in telephone conversation, repeatedly or continuously

with intent to annoy, abuse, or harass any person at the called number;

(ii) Denying or interfering in any way, directly or indirectly, with a person's right to be placed on any registry of names and/or telephone numbers of persons who do not wish to receive outbound telephone calls established to comply with §310.4(b)(1)(iii);

(iii) Initiating any outbound telephone call to a person when:

(A) That person previously has stated that he or she does not wish to receive an outbound telephone call made by or on behalf of the seller whose goods or services are being offered or made on behalf of the charitable organization for which a charitable contribution is being solicited; or

(B) That person's telephone number is on the "do-not-call" registry, maintained by the Commission, of persons who do not wish to receive outbound telephone calls to induce the purchase of goods or services unless the seller:

(i) Has obtained the express agreement, in writing, of such person to place calls to that person. Such written agreement shall clearly evidence such person's authorization that calls made by or on behalf of a specific party may be placed to that person, and shall include the telephone number to which the calls may be placed and the signature⁶⁶⁴ of that person; or

(ii) Has an established business relationship with such person, and that person has not stated that he or she does not wish to receive outbound telephone calls under paragraph (b)(1)(iii)(A) of this section; or

(iv) Abandoning any outbound telephone call. An outbound telephone call is "abandoned" under this section if a person answers it and the telemarketer does not connect the call to a sales representative within two (2) seconds of the person's completed greeting.

(v) Initiating any outbound telephone call that delivers a prerecorded message, other than a prerecorded message permitted for compliance with the call

⁶⁶⁴ For purposes of this Rule, the term "signature" shall include an electronic or digital form of signature, to the extent that such form of signature is recognized as a valid signature under applicable federal law or state contract law.

§ 310.4**16 CFR Ch. I (1–1–16 Edition)**

abandonment safe harbor in § 310.4(b)(4)(iii), unless:

(A) In any such call to induce the purchase of any good or service, the seller has obtained from the recipient of the call an express agreement, in writing, that:

(i) The seller obtained only after a clear and conspicuous disclosure that the purpose of the agreement is to authorize the seller to place prerecorded calls to such person;

(ii) The seller obtained without requiring, directly or indirectly, that the agreement be executed as a condition of purchasing any good or service;

(iii) Evidences the willingness of the recipient of the call to receive calls that deliver prerecorded messages by or on behalf of a specific seller; and

(iv) Includes such person's telephone number and signature;⁶⁶⁵ and

(B) In any such call to induce the purchase of any good or service, or to induce a charitable contribution from a member of, or previous donor to, a non-profit charitable organization on whose behalf the call is made, the seller or telemarketer:

(i) Allows the telephone to ring for at least fifteen (15) seconds or four (4) rings before disconnecting an unanswered call; and

(ii) Within two (2) seconds after the completed greeting of the person called, plays a prerecorded message that promptly provides the disclosures required by § 310.4(d) or (e), followed immediately by a disclosure of one or both of the following:

(A) In the case of a call that could be answered in person by a consumer, that the person called can use an automated interactive voice and/or keypress-activated opt-out mechanism to assert a Do Not Call request pursuant to § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(A) at any time during the message. The mechanism must:

(1) Automatically add the number called to the seller's entity-specific Do Not Call list;

(2) Once invoked, immediately disconnect the call; and

⁶⁶⁵ For purposes of this Rule, the term "signature" shall include an electronic or digital form of signature, to the extent that such form of signature is recognized as a valid signature under applicable federal law or state contract law.

(3) Be available for use at any time during the message; and

(B) In the case of a call that could be answered by an answering machine or voicemail service, that the person called can use a toll-free telephone number to assert a Do Not Call request pursuant to § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(A). The number provided must connect directly to an automated interactive voice or keypress-activated opt-out mechanism that:

(1) Automatically adds the number called to the seller's entity-specific Do Not Call list;

(2) Immediately thereafter disconnects the call; and

(3) Is accessible at any time throughout the duration of the telemarketing campaign; and

(iii) Complies with all other requirements of this part and other applicable federal and state laws.

(C) Any call that complies with all applicable requirements of this paragraph (v) shall not be deemed to violate § 310.4(b)(1)(iv) of this part.

(D) This paragraph (v) shall not apply to any outbound telephone call that delivers a prerecorded healthcare message made by, or on behalf of, a covered entity or its business associate, as those terms are defined in the HIPAA Privacy Rule, 45 CFR 160.103.

(2) It is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for any person to sell, rent, lease, purchase, or use any list established to comply with § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(A), or maintained by the Commission pursuant to § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B), for any purpose except compliance with the provisions of this Rule or otherwise to prevent telephone calls to telephone numbers on such lists.

(3) A seller or telemarketer will not be liable for violating § 310.4(b)(1)(ii) and (iii) if it can demonstrate that, as part of the seller's or telemarketer's routine business practice:

(i) It has established and implemented written procedures to comply with § 310.4(b)(1)(ii) and (iii);

(ii) It has trained its personnel, and any entity assisting in its compliance, in the procedures established pursuant to § 310.4(b)(3)(i);

(iii) The seller, or a telemarketer or another person acting on behalf of the

Federal Trade Commission**§ 310.4**

seller or charitable organization, has maintained and recorded a list of telephone numbers the seller or charitable organization may not contact, in compliance with § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(A);

(iv) The seller or a telemarketer uses a process to prevent telemarketing to any telephone number on any list established pursuant to § 310.4(b)(3)(iii) or 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B), employing a version of the “do-not-call” registry obtained from the Commission no more than thirty-one (31) days prior to the date any call is made, and maintains records documenting this process;

(v) The seller or a telemarketer or another person acting on behalf of the seller or charitable organization, monitors and enforces compliance with the procedures established pursuant to § 310.4(b)(3)(i); and

(vi) Any subsequent call otherwise violating § 310.4(b)(1)(ii) or (iii) is the result of error.

(4) A seller or telemarketer will not be liable for violating § 310.4(b)(1)(iv) if:

(i) The seller or telemarketer employs technology that ensures abandonment of no more than three (3) percent of all calls answered by a person, measured over the duration of a single calling campaign, if less than 30 days, or separately over each successive 30-day period or portion thereof that the campaign continues.

(ii) The seller or telemarketer, for each telemarketing call placed, allows the telephone to ring for at least fifteen (15) seconds or four (4) rings before disconnecting an unanswered call;

(iii) Whenever a sales representative is not available to speak with the person answering the call within two (2) seconds after the person’s completed greeting, the seller or telemarketer promptly plays a recorded message that states the name and telephone number of the seller on whose behalf the call was placed⁶⁶⁶; and

(iv) The seller or telemarketer, in accordance with § 310.5(b)-(d), retains records establishing compliance with § 310.4(b)(4)(i)-(iii).

⁶⁶⁶ This provision does not affect any seller’s or telemarketer’s obligation to comply with relevant state and federal laws, including but not limited to the TCPA, 47 U.S.C. 227, and 47 CFR part 64.1200.

(c) *Calling time restrictions.* Without the prior consent of a person, it is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a telemarketer to engage in outbound telephone calls to a person’s residence at any time other than between 8:00 a.m. and 9:00 p.m. local time at the called person’s location.

(d) *Required oral disclosures in the sale of goods or services.* It is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a telemarketer in an outbound telephone call or internal or external upsell to induce the purchase of goods or services to fail to disclose truthfully, promptly, and in a clear and conspicuous manner to the person receiving the call, the following information:

(1) The identity of the seller;

(2) That the purpose of the call is to sell goods or services;

(3) The nature of the goods or services; and

(4) That no purchase or payment is necessary to be able to win a prize or participate in a prize promotion if a prize promotion is offered and that any purchase or payment will not increase the person’s chances of winning. This disclosure must be made before or in conjunction with the description of the prize to the person called. If requested by that person, the telemarketer must disclose the no-purchase/no-payment entry method for the prize promotion; provided, however, that, in any internal upsell for the sale of goods or services, the seller or telemarketer must provide the disclosures listed in this section only to the extent that the information in the upsell differs from the disclosures provided in the initial telemarketing transaction.

(e) *Required oral disclosures in charitable solicitations.* It is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a telemarketer, in an outbound telephone call to induce a charitable contribution, to fail to disclose truthfully, promptly, and in a clear and conspicuous manner to the person receiving the call, the following information:

(1) The identity of the charitable organization on behalf of which the request is being made; and

§310.5

16 CFR Ch. I (1–1–16 Edition)

(2) That the purpose of the call is to solicit a charitable contribution.

[75 FR 48516, Aug. 10, 2010, as amended at 76 FR 58716, Sept. 22, 2011]

EFFECTIVE DATE NOTE: At 80 FR 77558, Dec. 14, 2015, §310.4 was amended by revising paragraphs (a)(3), (b)(1)(ii), (iii)(B), and (3)(vi), effective February 12, 2016, and in paragraph (a)(7)(ii)(B) by removing “or” from the end of the paragraph, in paragraph (a)(8) by removing the final period and adding a semicolon in its place, and by adding paragraphs (a)(9) and (10), effective June 13, 2016. For the convenience of the user, the added and revised text is set forth as follows:

§310.4 Abusive telemarketing acts or practices.

(a) * * *

(3) Requesting or receiving payment of any fee or consideration from a person for goods or services represented to recover or otherwise assist in the return of money or any other item of value paid for by, or promised to, that person in a previous transaction, until seven (7) business days after such money or other item is delivered to that person. This provision shall not apply to goods or services provided to a person by a licensed attorney;

* * * * *

(9) Creating or causing to be created, directly or indirectly, a remotely created payment order as payment for goods or services offered or sold through telemarketing or as a charitable contribution solicited or sought through telemarketing; or

(10) Accepting from a customer or donor, directly or indirectly, a cash-to-cash money transfer or cash reload mechanism as payment for goods or services offered or sold through telemarketing or as a charitable contribution solicited or sought through telemarketing.

(b) * * *

(1) * * *

(ii) Denying or interfering in any way, directly or indirectly, with a person’s right to be placed on any registry of names and/or telephone numbers of persons who do not wish to receive outbound telephone calls established to comply with paragraph (b)(1)(iii)(A) of this section, including, but not limited to, harassing any person who makes such a request; hanging up on that person; failing to honor the request; requiring the person to listen to a sales pitch before accepting the request; assessing a charge or fee for honoring the request; requiring a person to call a different number to submit the request; and requiring the person to identify the seller making the call or on whose behalf the call is made;

(iii) * * *

(B) That person’s telephone number is on the “do-not-call” registry, maintained by the Commission, of persons who do not wish to receive outbound telephone calls to induce the purchase of goods or services unless the seller or telemarketer:

(1) Can demonstrate that the seller has obtained the express agreement, in writing, of such person to place calls to that person. Such written agreement shall clearly evidence such person’s authorization that calls made by or on behalf of a specific party may be placed to that person, and shall include the telephone number to which the calls may be placed and the signature⁶⁶⁴ of that person; or

(2) Can demonstrate that the seller has an established business relationship with such person, and that person has not stated that he or she does not wish to receive outbound telephone calls under paragraph (b)(1)(iii)(A) of this section; or

* * * * *

(3) * * *

(vi) Any subsequent call otherwise violating paragraph (b)(1)(ii) or (iii) of this section is the result of error and not of failure to obtain any information necessary to comply with a request pursuant to paragraph (b)(1)(iii)(A) of this section not to receive further calls by or on behalf of a seller or charitable organization.

* * * * *

§310.5 Recordkeeping requirements.

(a) Any seller or telemarketer shall keep, for a period of 24 months from the date the record is produced, the following records relating to its telemarketing activities:

(1) All substantially different advertising, brochures, telemarketing scripts, and promotional materials;

(2) The name and last known address of each prize recipient and the prize awarded for prizes that are represented, directly or by implication, to have a value of \$25.00 or more;

(3) The name and last known address of each customer, the goods or services purchased, the date such goods or services were shipped or provided, and the

⁶⁶⁴For purposes of this Rule, the term “signature” shall include an electronic or digital form of signature, to the extent that such form of signature is recognized as a valid signature under applicable federal law or state contract law.

Federal Trade Commission**§ 310.6**

amount paid by the customer for the goods or services;⁶⁶⁷

(4) The name, any fictitious name used, the last known home address and telephone number, and the job title(s) for all current and former employees directly involved in telephone sales or solicitations; provided, however, that if the seller or telemarketer permits fictitious names to be used by employees, each fictitious name must be traceable to only one specific employee; and

(5) All verifiable authorizations or records of express informed consent or express agreement required to be provided or received under this Rule.

(b) A seller or telemarketer may keep the records required by § 310.5(a) in any form, and in the same manner, format, or place as they keep such records in the ordinary course of business. Failure to keep all records required by § 310.5(a) shall be a violation of this Rule.

(c) The seller and the telemarketer calling on behalf of the seller may, by written agreement, allocate responsibility between themselves for the recordkeeping required by this Section. When a seller and telemarketer have entered into such an agreement, the terms of that agreement shall govern, and the seller or telemarketer, as the case may be, need not keep records that duplicate those of the other. If the agreement is unclear as to who must maintain any required record(s), or if no such agreement exists, the seller shall be responsible for complying with §§ 310.5(a)(1)-(3) and (5); the telemarketer shall be responsible for complying with § 310.5(a)(4).

(d) In the event of any dissolution or termination of the seller's or telemarketer's business, the principal of that seller or telemarketer shall maintain all records as required under this section. In the event of any sale, assignment, or other change in ownership of the seller's or telemarketer's business, the successor business shall main-

tain all records required under this section.

§ 310.6 Exemptions.

(a) Solicitations to induce charitable contributions via outbound telephone calls are not covered by § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B) of this Rule.

(b) The following acts or practices are exempt from this Rule:

(1) The sale of pay-per-call services subject to the Commission's Rule entitled "Trade Regulation Rule Pursuant to the Telephone Disclosure and Dispute Resolution Act of 1992," 16 CFR part 308, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to the requirements of §§ 310.4(a)(1), (a)(7), (b), and (c);

(2) The sale of franchises subject to the Commission's Rule entitled "Disclosure Requirements and Prohibitions Concerning Franchising," ("Franchise Rule") 16 CFR part 436, and the sale of business opportunities subject to the Commission's Rule entitled "Disclosure Requirements and Prohibitions Concerning Business Opportunities," ("Business Opportunity Rule") 16 CFR part 437, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to the requirements of §§ 310.4(a)(1), (a)(7), (b), and (c);

(3) Telephone calls in which the sale of goods or services or charitable solicitation is not completed, and payment or authorization of payment is not required, until after a face-to-face sales or donation presentation by the seller or charitable organization, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to the requirements of §§ 310.4(a)(1), (a)(7), (b), and (c);

(4) Telephone calls initiated by a customer or donor that are not the result of any solicitation by a seller, charitable organization, or telemarketer, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to any instances of upselling included in such telephone calls;

(5) Telephone calls initiated by a customer or donor in response to an advertisement through any medium, other than direct mail solicitation, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to calls initiated by a customer

⁶⁶⁷ For offers of consumer credit products subject to the Truth in Lending Act, 15 U.S.C. 1601 *et seq.*, and Regulation Z, 12 CFR 226, compliance with the recordkeeping requirements under the Truth in Lending Act, and Regulation Z, shall constitute compliance with § 310.5(a)(3) of this Rule.

§310.7

16 CFR Ch. I (1–16 Edition)

or donor in response to an advertisement relating to investment opportunities, debt relief services, business opportunities other than business arrangements covered by the Franchise Rule or Business Opportunity Rule, or advertisements involving goods or services described in §§310.3(a)(1)(vi) or 310.4(a)(2)-(4); or to any instances of upselling included in such telephone calls;

(6) Telephone calls initiated by a customer or donor in response to a direct mail solicitation, including solicitations via the U.S. Postal Service, facsimile transmission, electronic mail, and other similar methods of delivery in which a solicitation is directed to specific address(es) or person(s), that clearly, conspicuously, and truthfully discloses all material information listed in §310.3(a)(1) of this Rule, for any goods or services offered in the direct mail solicitation, and that contains no material misrepresentation regarding any item contained in §310.3(d) of this Rule for any requested charitable contribution; *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to calls initiated by a customer in response to a direct mail solicitation relating to prize promotions, investment opportunities, debt relief services, business opportunities other than business arrangements covered by the Franchise Rule or Business Opportunity Rule, or goods or services described in §§310.3(a)(1)(vi) or 310.4(a)(2)-(4); or to any instances of upselling included in such telephone calls; and

(7) Telephone calls between a telemarketer and any business, except calls to induce the retail sale of nondurable office or cleaning supplies; *provided*, however, that §310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B) and §310.5 of this Rule shall not apply to sellers or telemarketers of nondurable office or cleaning supplies.

EFFECTIVE DATE NOTE: At 80 FR 77559, Dec. 14, 2015, §310.6 was amended by revising paragraphs (b)(5), (6) and (7), effective Feb. 12, 2016, and by adding paragraphs (b)(5)(ii) and (6)(ii), effective June 13, 2016. For the convenience of the user, the added and revised text is set forth as follows:

§310.6 Exemptions.

* * * * *

(b) * * *

(5) Telephone calls initiated by a customer or donor in response to an advertisement through any medium, other than direct mail solicitation, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to:

(i) Calls initiated by a customer or donor in response to an advertisement relating to investment opportunities, debt relief services, business opportunities other than business arrangements covered by the Franchise Rule or Business Opportunity Rule, or advertisements involving offers for goods or services described in §310.3(a)(1)(vi) or §310.4(a)(2) through (4);

(ii) The requirements of §310.4(a)(9) or (10); or

(iii) Any instances of upselling included in such telephone calls;

(6) Telephone calls initiated by a customer or donor in response to a direct mail solicitation, including solicitations via the U.S. Postal Service, facsimile transmission, electronic mail, and other similar methods of delivery in which a solicitation is directed to specific address(es) or person(s), that clearly, conspicuously, and truthfully discloses all material information listed in §310.3(a)(1), for any goods or services offered in the direct mail solicitation, and that contains no material misrepresentation regarding any item contained in §310.3(d) for any requested charitable contribution; *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to:

(i) Calls initiated by a customer in response to a direct mail solicitation relating to prize promotions, investment opportunities, debt relief services, business opportunities other than business arrangements covered by the Franchise Rule or Business Opportunity Rule, or goods or services described in §310.3(a)(1)(vi) or §310.4(a)(2) through (4);

(ii) The requirements of §310.4(a)(9) or (10); or

(iii) Any instances of upselling included in such telephone calls; and

(7) Telephone calls between a telemarketer and any business to induce the purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution by the business, except calls to induce the retail sale of nondurable office or cleaning supplies; *provided*, however, that §§310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B) and 310.5 shall not apply to sellers or telemarketers of nondurable office or cleaning supplies.

§310.7 Actions by states and private persons.

(a) Any attorney general or other officer of a state authorized by the state to bring an action under the Telemarketing and Consumer Fraud and Abuse Prevention Act, and any private person who brings an action under that Act, shall serve written notice of its

Federal Trade Commission**§ 310.8**

action on the Commission, if feasible, prior to its initiating an action under this Rule. The notice shall be sent to the Office of the Director, Bureau of Consumer Protection, Federal Trade Commission, Washington, DC 20580, and shall include a copy of the state's or private person's complaint and any other pleadings to be filed with the court. If prior notice is not feasible, the state or private person shall serve the Commission with the required notice immediately upon instituting its action.

(b) Nothing contained in this Section shall prohibit any attorney general or other authorized state official from proceeding in state court on the basis of an alleged violation of any civil or criminal statute of such state.

§ 310.8 Fee for access to the National Do Not Call Registry.

(a) It is a violation of this Rule for any seller to initiate, or cause any telemarketer to initiate, an outbound telephone call to any person whose telephone number is within a given area code unless such seller, either directly or through another person, first has paid the annual fee, required by § 310.8(c), for access to telephone numbers within that area code that are included in the National Do Not Call Registry maintained by the Commission under § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B); provided, however, that such payment is not necessary if the seller initiates, or causes a telemarketer to initiate, calls solely to persons pursuant to §§ 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B)(i) or (ii), and the seller does not access the National Do Not Call Registry for any other purpose.

(b) It is a violation of this Rule for any telemarketer, on behalf of any seller, to initiate an outbound telephone call to any person whose telephone number is within a given area code unless that seller, either directly or through another person, first has paid the annual fee, required by § 310.8(c), for access to the telephone numbers within that area code that are included in the National Do Not Call Registry; provided, however, that such payment is not necessary if the seller initiates, or causes a telemarketer to initiate, calls solely to persons pursuant to

§§ 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B)(i) or (ii), and the seller does not access the National Do Not Call Registry for any other purpose.

(c) The annual fee, which must be paid by any person prior to obtaining access to the National Do Not Call Registry, is \$60 for each area code of data accessed, up to a maximum of \$16,482; *provided*, however, that there shall be no charge to any person for accessing the first five area codes of data, and *provided further*, that there shall be no charge to any person engaging in or causing others to engage in outbound telephone calls to consumers and who is accessing area codes of data in the National Do Not Call Registry if the person is permitted to access, but is not required to access, the National Do Not Call Registry under this Rule, 47 CFR 64.1200, or any other Federal regulation or law. Any person accessing the National Do Not Call Registry may not participate in any arrangement to share the cost of accessing the registry, including any arrangement with any telemarketer or service provider to divide the costs to access the registry among various clients of that telemarketer or service provider.

(d) Each person who pays, either directly or through another person, the annual fee set forth in § 310.8(c), each person excepted under § 310.8(c) from paying the annual fee, and each person excepted from paying an annual fee under § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B), will be provided a unique account number that will allow that person to access the registry data for the selected area codes at any time for the twelve month period beginning on the first day of the month in which the person paid the fee ("the annual period"). To obtain access to additional area codes of data during the first six months of the annual period, each person required to pay the fee under § 310.8(c) must first pay \$60 for each additional area code of data not initially selected. To obtain access to additional area codes of data during the second six months of the annual period, each person required to pay the fee under § 310.8(c) must first pay \$30 for each additional area code of data not initially selected. The payment of the additional fee will permit the person to access the additional area codes

§ 310.9

16 CFR Ch. I (1–1–16 Edition)

of data for the remainder of the annual period.

(e) Access to the National Do Not Call Registry is limited to telemarketers, sellers, others engaged in or causing others to engage in telephone calls to consumers, service providers acting on behalf of such persons, and any government agency that has law enforcement authority. Prior to accessing the National Do Not Call Registry, a person must provide the identifying information required by the operator of the registry to collect the fee, and must certify, under penalty of law, that the person is accessing the registry solely to comply with the provisions of this Rule or to otherwise prevent telephone calls to telephone numbers on the registry. If the person is accessing the registry on behalf of sellers, that person also must identify each of the sellers on whose behalf it is accessing the registry, must provide each seller's unique account number for access to the national registry, and must certify, under penalty of law, that the sellers will be using the information gathered from the registry solely to comply with the provisions of this Rule or otherwise to prevent telephone calls to telephone numbers on the registry.

Registry under this Rule, 47 CFR 64.1200, or any other Federal regulation or law. No person may participate in any arrangement to share the cost of accessing the National Do Not Call Registry, including any arrangement with any telemarketer or service provider to divide the costs to access the registry among various clients of that telemarketer or service provider.

* * * * *

§ 310.9 Severability.

The provisions of this Rule are separate and severable from one another. If any provision is stayed or determined to be invalid, it is the Commission's intention that the remaining provisions shall continue in effect.

[75 FR 48516, Aug. 10, 2010; 75 FR 51934, Aug. 24, 2010, as amended at 77 FR 51697, Aug. 27, 2012; 78 FR 53643, Aug. 30, 2013; 79 FR 51478, Aug. 29, 2014]

EFFECTIVE DATE NOTE: At 80 FR 77560, Dec. 14, 2015, § 310.8 was amended by revising paragraph (c), effective Feb. 16, 2016. For the convenience of the user, the revised text is set forth as follows:

§ 310.8 Fee for access to the National Do Not Call Registry.

* * * * *

(c) The annual fee, which must be paid by any person prior to obtaining access to the National Do Not Call Registry, is \$60 for each area code of data accessed, up to a maximum of \$16,482; provided, however, that there shall be no charge to any person for accessing the first five area codes of data, and provided further, that there shall be no charge to any person engaging in or causing others to engage in outbound telephone calls to consumers and who is accessing area codes of data in the National Do Not Call Registry if the person is permitted to access, but is not required to access, the National Do Not Call