

1 TAWANA E. DAVIS (DC 435896)

2 tdavis@ftc.gov; 202-326-2755

3 AMBER LEE (VA 93625)

4 alee5@ftc.gov; 202-326-2764

5 Federal Trade Commission

6 600 Pennsylvania Ave., NW

7 Washington, DC 20580

8 Fax: (202) 326-3259

9 JOHN D. JACOBS (Local Counsel)

10 Cal Bar No. 134154; jjacobs@ftc.gov

11 Federal Trade Commission

12 10990 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 400

13 Los Angeles, CA 90024

14 Tel: (310) 824-4300; Fax: (310) 824-4380

15 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**

16 **CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

17 **FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION,**

) Case No.: 2:20-cv-3775

18 Plaintiff,

)

)

19 v.

)

)

)

)

)

)

)

)

)

)

)

20 **MARC CHING**, individually and also
21 doing business as **WHOLE LEAF**
22 **ORGANICS,**

23 Defendant.

)

)

)

)

)

)

)

)

1 Plaintiff, the Federal Trade Commission (“FTC” or “Commission”), filed its
2 Complaint for Temporary Restraining Order and Preliminary Injunction Pursuant
3 to Sections 13(a) and (b) of the Federal Trade Commission Act (“FTC Act”), 15
4 U.S.C. §§ 53(a) and (b), and applied for a Temporary Restraining Order and an
5 Order to Show Cause Why a Preliminary Injunction Should Not Issue Pursuant to
6 Rule 65 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.

7 The FTC and Defendant Marc Ching, individually and also doing business
8 as Whole Leaf Organics (“Defendant”), have now stipulated and agreed to entry of
9 this Stipulated Preliminary Injunction. The Court, having considered the
10 Complaint, and accompanying declaration, exhibits, and memorandum of law in
11 support of such application, and being otherwise advised, finds that:

12 **FINDINGS**

13 1. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this case, and there is
14 good cause to believe it will have jurisdiction over the parties and that venue in this
15 district is proper.

16 2. The FTC asserts in its Complaint and other filings that:

17 a. The Commission has issued an administrative complaint alleging
18 that Defendant has engaged in, and is likely to engage in the future,
19 acts and practices that violate Sections 5(a) and 12 of the FTC Act,
20 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a), 52, which complaint remains pending with the
21 Commission.

22 b. There is good cause to believe that Defendant has disseminated
23 claims in connection with the labeling, advertising, marketing,
24 distribution, and sale of: 1) Thrive, a product that purportedly
25 treats, prevents or reduces the risk of Coronavirus disease 2019
26 (“COVID-19”), a potentially deadly disease for which there is no
27 current treatment; and 2) CBD-EX, CBD-RX, and CBD-Max,
28

1 products that purportedly treat cancer. These advertisements,
2 disseminated on the website wholeleaforganics.com to promote the
3 sale of said products, claim that Thrive treats, prevents or reduces
4 the risk of COVID-19, and that CBD-EX, CBD-RX, and CBD-
5 Max treat cancer. In numerous instances, Defendant also has
6 claimed in advertising that the efficacy of Thrive, CBD-EX, CBD-
7 RX, and CBD-Max for the advertised purposes is scientifically or
8 clinically proven.

9 c. There is good cause to believe that immediate and irreparable harm
10 will result from Defendant's ongoing violations of Section 5(a) and
11 12 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a), 52, unless Defendant is
12 restrained and enjoined by order of the Court.

13 d. Weighing the equities and considering Plaintiff's likelihood of
14 ultimate success on the merits in its administrative proceeding, the
15 enjoining of Defendant from violating Sections 5(a) and 12 of the
16 FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a), 52, pending the final resolution of
17 the Commission's administrative complaint, is in the public
18 interest.

19 3. Defendant has not admitted to liability as to the causes of action in the
20 Complaint filed in this Court or in Commission's administrative complaint, and
21 Defendant's consent to entry of this Stipulated Preliminary Injunction shall not be
22 interpreted to constitute an admission that Defendant has engaged in violations of
23 the FTC Act or any law or regulation.

24 4. This Court has authority to issue this Order pursuant to Sections 13(a) and
25 (b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 53(a), (b); Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 65(a);
26 and the All Writs Act, 28 U.S.C. § 1651.

1 5. No security is required of any agency of the United States for issuance of a
2 preliminary injunction. Fed. R. Civ. P. 65(c).

3 **DEFINITIONS**

4 For purposes of this Order, the following definitions apply:

5 A. “Covered Product” means Thrive, CBD-EX, CBD-RX, or CBD-Max or any
6 other Drug, Food, or Dietary Supplement.

7 B. “Dietary Supplement” means:

8 1. any product labeled as a dietary supplement or otherwise represented as a
9 dietary supplement; or

10 2. any pill, tablet, capsule, powder, softgel, gelcap, liquid, or other similar
11 form containing one or more ingredients that are a vitamin, mineral, herb
12 or other botanical, amino acid, probiotic, or other dietary substance for
13 use by humans to supplement the diet by increasing the total dietary
14 intake, or a concentrate, metabolite, constituent, extract, or combination
15 of any ingredient described above, that is intended to be ingested, and is
16 not represented to be used as a conventional food or as a sole item of a
17 meal or the diet.

18 C. “Drug” means: (a) articles recognized in the official United States
19 Pharmacopoeia, official Homoeopathic Pharmacopoeia of the United States, or
20 official National Formulary, or any supplement to any of them; (b) articles
21 intended for use in the diagnosis, cure, mitigation, treatment, or prevention of
22 disease in humans or other animals; (c) articles (other than Food) intended to affect
23 the structure or any function of the body of humans or other animals; and (d)
24 articles intended for use as a component of any article specified in (a), (b), or (c);
25 but does not include devices or their components, parts, or accessories.

26 D. “Essentially equivalent product” means a product that contains the identical
27 ingredients, except for inactive ingredients (e.g., inactive binders, colors, fillers,
28

1 excipients), in the same form and dosage, and with the same route of
2 administration (e.g., orally, sublingually), as the Covered Products; provided that
3 the Covered Products may contain additional ingredients if reliable scientific
4 evidence generally accepted by experts in the field indicates that the amount and
5 combination of additional ingredients are unlikely to impede or inhibit the
6 effectiveness of the ingredients in the essentially equivalent product.

7 E. “Food” means: (a) any article used for food or drink for humans or other
8 animals; (b) chewing gum; and (c) any article used for components of any such
9 article.

10 F. “Defendant” means Marc Ching, also doing business as Whole Leaf
11 Organics.

12 I. PROHIBITED DISEASE CLAIMS

13 IT IS ORDERED that Defendant and Defendant’s agents, employees, and
14 attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them,
15 who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, in
16 connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for
17 sale, or sale of any Covered Product must not make any representation, expressly
18 or by implication, that such product (1) treats, prevents or reduces the risk of
19 COVID-19; or (2) treats cancer; or (3) cures, mitigates, or treats any disease,
20 unless the representation is non-misleading, including that, at the time such
21 representation is made, they possess and rely upon competent and reliable
22 scientific evidence that substantiates that the representation is true. For purposes
23 of this Provision, “competent and reliable scientific evidence” means human
24 clinical testing of the Covered Product or of an Essentially Equivalent Product that
25 is sufficient in quality and quantity, based on standards generally accepted by
26 experts in the relevant disease, condition, or function to which the representation
27 relates, when considered in light of the entire body of relevant and reliable
28

1 scientific evidence, to substantiate that the representation is true. Such testing
2 must (1) be randomized, double-blind, and placebo-controlled; and (2) be
3 conducted by researchers qualified by training and experience to conduct such
4 testing. In addition, all underlying or supporting data and documents generally
5 accepted by experts in the relevant field as relevant to an assessment of such
6 testing as described in the Provision titled Preservation of Records Relating to
7 Competent and Reliable Human Clinical Tests or Studies must be available for
8 inspection and production to the Commission. Defendant will have the burden of
9 proving that a product satisfies the definition of an Essentially Equivalent Product.

10 **II. PROHIBITED HEALTH BENEFIT CLAIMS**

11 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant and Defendant's agents,
12 employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation
13 with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly
14 or indirectly, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising,
15 promotion, offering for sale, or sale of any Covered Product must not make any
16 representation, other than representations covered under the Provision titled
17 Prohibited Disease Claims, expressly or by implication, about the health benefits,
18 performance, or efficacy of such product, unless the representation is non-
19 misleading, including that, at the time such representation is made, they possess
20 and rely upon competent and reliable scientific evidence that is sufficient in quality
21 and quantity based on standards generally accepted by experts in the relevant
22 disease, condition, or function to which the representation relates, when considered
23 in light of the entire body of relevant and reliable scientific evidence, to
24 substantiate that the representation is true. For purposes of this Provision,
25 "competent and reliable scientific evidence" means tests, analyses, research, or
26 studies (1) that have been conducted and evaluated in an objective manner by
27 experts in the relevant disease, condition, or function to which the representation
28

1 relates; (2) that are generally accepted by such experts to yield accurate and
2 reliable results; and (3) that are randomized, double-blind, and placebo-controlled
3 human clinical testing of the Covered Product, or of an Essentially Equivalent
4 Product, when such experts would generally require such human clinical testing to
5 substantiate that the representation is true. In addition, when such tests or studies
6 are human clinical tests or studies, all underlying or supporting data and documents
7 generally accepted by experts in the field as relevant to an assessment of such
8 testing as described in the Provision of this Order titled Preservation of Records
9 Relating to Competent and Reliable Human Clinical Tests or Studies must be
10 available for inspection and production to the Commission. Defendant will have
11 the burden of proving that a product satisfies the definition of an Essentially
12 Equivalent Product.

13 **III. PROHIBITED MISREPRESENTATIONS REGARDING TESTS,**
14 **STUDIES, OR OTHER RESEARCH**

15 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant and Defendant's agents,
16 employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation
17 with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly
18 or indirectly, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising,
19 promotion, offering for sale, or sale of any product must not make any
20 misrepresentation, expressly or by implication:

21 A. About the existence, contents, validity, results, conclusions, or
22 interpretations of any test, study, or other research, including that studies, research,
23 or trials prove that any Covered Product (1) treats, prevents or reduces the risk of
24 COVID-19, or (2) treats cancer; or

25 B. That any benefit of such product is scientifically or clinically proven
26 or otherwise established.

27
28

1 **IV. FDA APPROVED CLAIMS**

2 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that nothing in this Order prohibits Defendant,
3 or Defendant’s agents, employees, and attorneys, or all other persons in active
4 concert or participation with any of them, from:

5 A. For any Drug, making a representation that is approved in labeling for
6 such Drug under any tentative final or final monograph promulgated by the Food
7 and Drug Administration (“FDA”), or under any new Drug application approved
8 by the FDA; and

9 B. For any product, making a representation that is specifically
10 authorized in labeling for such product by regulations promulgated by the FDA
11 pursuant to the Nutrition Labeling and Education Act of 1990 or authorized under
12 Sections 303-304 of the Food and Drug Administration Modernization Act of
13 1997.

14 **V. PROHIBITION ON RELEASE OF CUSTOMER**
15 **INFORMATION**

16 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant, Defendant’s agents,
17 employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation
18 with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly
19 or indirectly, are hereby temporarily restrained and enjoined from:

20 A. Selling, renting, leasing, transferring, or otherwise disclosing, the
21 name, address, birth date, telephone number, email address, credit card number,
22 bank account number, Social Security number, or other financial or identifying
23 information of any person that Defendant obtained in connection with any activity
24 that pertains to the subject matter of this Order; and

25 B. Benefitting from or using the name, address, birth date, telephone
26 number, email address, credit card number, bank account number, Social Security
27 number, or other financial or identifying information of any person that Defendant
28

1 obtained in connection with any activity that pertains to the subject matter of this
2 Order.

3 Provided, however, that Defendant may disclose such identifying
4 information to a law enforcement agency, to his attorneys as required for his
5 defense in this or the pending administrative action, as required by any law,
6 regulation, or court order, or in any filings, pleadings or discovery in this action in
7 the manner required by the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and by any protective
8 order in the case.

9 **VI. PRESERVATION OF RECORDS**

10 **IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that Defendant, Defendant's agents,
11 employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation
12 with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly
13 or indirectly, are hereby temporarily restrained and enjoined from:

14 A. Destroying, erasing, falsifying, writing over, mutilating, concealing,
15 altering, transferring, or otherwise disposing of, in any manner, directly or
16 indirectly, documents that relate to: (1) the business or business practices of
17 Defendant; or (2) the business practices of entities directly or indirectly under the
18 control of Defendant; and

19 B. Failing to create and maintain documents that, in reasonable detail,
20 accurately, fairly, and completely reflect Defendant's business transactions.

21 **VII. SERVICE OF THIS ORDER**

22 **IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that copies of this Order as well as all other
23 pleadings, documents, and exhibits filed contemporaneously with that application
24 (other than the complaint and summons), may be served by any means, including
25 facsimile transmission, electronic mail or other electronic messaging, personal or
26 overnight delivery, U.S. Mail or FedEx, by agents and employees of Plaintiff, by
27 any law enforcement agency, or by private process server, upon Defendant or any
28

1 person (including any financial institution) that may have possession, custody or
2 control of any document of Defendant, or that may be subject to any provision of
3 this Order pursuant to Rule 65(d)(2) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. For
4 purposes of this Section, service upon any branch, subsidiary, affiliate or office of
5 any entity shall effect service upon the entire entity.

6 **VIII. CORRESPONDENCE AND SERVICE ON PLAINTIFF**

7 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for the purpose of this Order, all
8 correspondence and service of pleadings on Plaintiff shall be sent via email to:

9
10 TAWANA E. DAVIS
11 tdavis@ftc.gov; (202) 326-2755
12 AMBER LEE
13 alee5@ftc.gov; (202) 326-2764
14 Federal Trade Commission
15 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
16 Washington, DC 20580
17 Fax: (202) 326-3259

18 JOHN D. JACOBS
19 jjacobs@ftc.gov; (310) 824-4300
20 Federal Trade Commission
21 10990 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 400
22 Los Angeles, CA 90024
23 Fax: (310) 824-4380

24 **IX. DURATION OF THE ORDER**

25 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Order shall remain in effect until the
26 Commission’s administrative complaint is dismissed by the Commission, set aside
27 by an appeals court on review, or the Commission has issued a final order pursuant
28 to 15 U.S.C. § 45.

X. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter for all purposes.

SO ORDERED, this _____ day of _____, 2020, at _____m.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28