

**SEMIANNUAL FEDERAL COURT  
LITIGATION STATUS REPORT**

Office of the General Counsel  
Bureau of Competition  
Bureau of Consumer Protection  
Regional Offices

June 30, 2019

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

SUMMARY OF CASES ..... ii

PETITIONS FOR REVIEW ..... 1

    A) Orders to Cease and Desist ..... 1

    B) Rulemakings ..... 2

INJUNCTION AND CONSUMER REDRESS CASES ..... 3

    A) Preliminary Injunctions (Mergers/Acquisitions) ..... 3

    B) Preliminary Injunctions (Other) ..... 4

    C) Permanent Injunctions/Consumer Redress ..... 4

CIVIL PENALTY AND ENFORCEMENT CASES ..... 68

    A) Consumer Protection ..... 68

    B) Competition ..... 73

SUBPOENA AND CID ENFORCEMENT PROCEEDINGS ..... 74

SUITS TO ENJOIN FTC ACTION AND OTHER DEFENSIVE LITIGATION ..... 74

AMICUS CURIAE BRIEFS ..... 78

## SUMMARY OF CASES

	Dist. Ct.	Ct. App.*	S.Ct.	Total
PETITIONS FOR REVIEW	0	4	0	4
INJUNCTION AND CONSUMER REDRESS CASES	54	19	0	73
CIVIL PENALTY AND ENFORCEMENT CASES	10	1	0	11
SUBPOENA AND CID ENFORCEMENTS	4	0	0	4
SUITS TO ENJOIN FTC ACTION AND OTHER DEFENSIVE LITIGATION	6	2	0	8
AMICUS CURIAE BRIEFS	1	1	1	4 <sup>†</sup>
TOTALS	75	27	1	104

---

\* Includes all cases in which appellate proceedings have taken place during the reporting period or are pending; these cases are not counted in the District Court column, even if such proceedings are occurring simultaneously.

<sup>†</sup> Includes one state court case (*In re Paplauskas, Jr.*, see p. 79 herein).

**PETITIONS FOR REVIEW**

**(A) Orders to Cease and Desist**

***1-800 CONTACTS v. FTC***, No. 18-3848 (2d Cir.)

Parties: 1-800 Contacts, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Imad Dean Abyad (OGC)

Nature of Action: Petition for review of final Commission order.

Status: Petition for review filed 12/28/18.  
Petitioner's opening brief filed 6/7/19.  
Commission's answering brief due 9/6/19.

***LABMD, INC. v. FTC***, No. 16-16270 (11th Cir.)

Parties: LabMD, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Jack Metzler (OGC)  
Matthew Hoffman  
Joel Marcus

Nature of Action: Petition for review of final Commission order.

Status: Petition for review filed 9/29/16.  
Order granting stay entered 11/10/16.  
Petitioner's opening brief filed 12/27/16.  
Commission's brief filed 2/9/17.  
Petitioner's reply brief filed 3/9/17.  
Oral argument heard 6/21/17.  
Opinion in favor of petitioner, vacating Commission's order, entered 6/6/18.  
Petitioner's application for attorneys' fees filed 10/4/18; FTC's opposition filed 11/19/18; petitioner's reply filed 1/4/19; order directing Northern District of Georgia to appoint a special master to recommend proper disposition of petitioner's application entered 5/6/19.

**LOUISIANA REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS BOARD v. FTC**, No. 18-60291 (5th Cir.)

Parties: Louisiana Real Estate Appraisers Board

Assigned Attorneys: Mark Hegedus (OGC)  
Michele Arington  
Joel Marcus

Alleged Conduct: Petition for review of Commission's order denying LREAB's motion to dismiss administrative complaint and granting Complaint Counsel's motion for partial summary decision.

Status: Petition for review filed 4/19/18.  
Petitioner's motion to stay administrative proceedings pending appeal filed 6/11/18; Commission's response in opposition filed 6/21/18; petitioner's reply filed 6/28/18; order granting motion to stay entered 7/17/18.  
Petitioner's opening brief filed 7/5/18; Commission's brief filed 8/6/18; reply brief filed 8/20/18.  
Oral argument heard 2/7/19.  
Judgment dismissing for lack of jurisdiction entered 2/28/19.  
Petition for rehearing *en banc* filed 3/18/19; order denying petition entered 4/10/19.

**IMPAX LABORATORIES, INC. v. FTC**, No. 19-60394 (5th Cir.)

Parties: Impax Laboratories, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Bradley Grossman (OGC)

Nature of Action: Petition for review of Commission's opinion and order against Impax Laboratories, Inc.

Status: Petition for review filed 6/6/19.

**(B) Rulemakings**

(None Pending)

**INJUNCTION AND CONSUMER REDRESS CASES**

**(A) Preliminary Injunctions (Mergers/Acquisitions)**

***FTC v. SANFORD HEALTH***, No. 17-3783 (8th Cir.); No. 1:17-cv-00133 (D.N.D.)

Parties:                   Sanford Health  
                              Sanford Bismarck  
                              Mid Dakota Clinic, P.C.  
                              State of North Dakota (Plaintiff)

Assigned Attorneys: Kevin Hahm (BC/Mergers IV)  
                              Elizabeth Arens  
                              Emily Bowne  
                              Christopher John Caputo  
                              Stephanie Cummings  
                              Thomas Dillickrath  
                              Jamie France  
                              Melissa Hill  
                              Laura Krachman  
                              David Owyang  
                              Rohan Pai  
                              Cathleen Williams  
                              Alexander Bryson  
                              Michele Arington (OGC)

Alleged Conduct:       Action for preliminary injunction of Sanford Health’s proposed acquisition of Mid Dakota clinic as a violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act and Section 7 of the Clayton Act.

Status:                   Complaint filed 6/22/17.  
                              TRO entered 6/22/17.  
                              Evidentiary hearing held 10/30/17-11/3/17.  
                              Order granting preliminary injunction entered 12/13/17.  
                              Notice of appeal filed 12/15/17.  
                              Appellants’ opening brief filed 1/29/18; Commission’s answering brief filed 3/5/18; appellants’ reply brief filed 3/22/18.  
                              Oral argument held 11/13/18.  
                              Opinion affirming district court’s grant of a preliminary injunction entered 6/13/19.

**(B) Preliminary Injunctions (Other)**

(None Pending)

**(C) Permanent Injunctions/Consumer Redress\***

***FTC v. 8 FIGURE DREAM LIFESTYLE LLC***, No. 8:19-cv-01165 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: 8 Figure Dream Lifestyle, LLC  
JL Net Bargains, Inc.  
Kappy Enterprises, LLC  
Millionaire Mind Enterprises, LLC  
OEA, LLC d/b/a Online Entrepreneur Academy d/b/a 14 Day Champion  
Challenge d/b/a 14 Day Challenge, LLC  
Spirit Consulting Group, Inc.  
John Bain  
Alex Dee, f/k/a Alex S. Dowlatshahi  
Brian Kaplan  
Jerrold Maurer a/k/a Jerry Maurer

Assigned Attorneys: Dorothy Emily Wu (WRLA)  
P. Connell McNulty (BCP/MP)  
Thomas L. Harris

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the marketing and sale of fraudulent money-making opportunities to consumers.

Status: Complaint filed 6/12/19.  
TRO with asset freeze entered 6/13/19.  
Stipulated order extending TRO until preliminary injunction hearing entered 6/24/19.  
Preliminary injunction hearing set for 7/8/19.

***FTC v. A1 JANITORIAL SUPPLY CORP.***, No. 1:17-cv-07790 (N.D. Ill.)

Parties: A1 Janitorial Supply Corp. d/b/a A One Janitorial  
Century Manufacturing Corp. d/b/a A-1 Janitorial Supply  
Commercial Maintenance Chemical Corp. d/b/a CMC  
Global Direct Resources, Inc. d/b/a A-1 Janitorial d/b/a Century

---

\* Unless otherwise noted, cases involve suits for permanent injunction and other equitable relief. Post-judgment proceedings in district court are not generally reported.

Manufacturing d/b/a Commercial Maintenance Chemical d/b/a  
Target Supplies

Eric Sternberg  
Matthew Sternberg

Assigned Attorneys: John C. Hallerud (MWR)  
Guy G. Ward  
Roberto C. Menjivar  
Nathaniel Al-Najjar

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, the FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule, and the Unordered Merchandise Statute in connection with the telemarketing of nondurable office and cleaning supplies.

Status: Complaint filed 10/30/17.  
TRO entered 11/1/17.  
Stipulated preliminary injunction entered 11/21/17.  
Joint motion to stay discovery pending settlement negotiations granted 12/10/18; order granting motion filed 12/13/18.  
Stipulated final judgment and order for permanent injunction and other equitable relief entered 4/10/19.

***FTC v. ABBVIE, INC.***, Nos. 18-2621, 18-2748, 18-2758 (3d Cir.); No. 2:14-cv-05151 (E.D. Pa.)

Parties: AbbVie, Inc.  
Abbott Laboratories  
Unimed Pharmaceuticals, LLC  
Besins Healthcare, Inc.  
Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Markus Meier (BC)  
Patricia M. McDermott  
Kara Monahan  
Peter Taylor  
Matthew Hoffman (OGC)  
Mark Hegedus  
Joel Marcus

Alleged Conduct: Unfair methods of competition in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act arising from baseless patent infringement lawsuits against potential generic competitors.

Status: Complaint filed 9/8/14.



Defendants' motion to dismiss filed 11/12/14; Commission's brief in opposition filed 12/12/14; order granting motion to dismiss as to Count II of the complaint (thereby dismissing defendant Teva from the case) entered 5/6/15.

Commission's motion for entry of judgment under Rule 54(b) filed 6/5/15; response in opposition by Abbott Laboratories, Abbvie, Inc. and Unimed Pharmaceuticals filed 6/25/15; Commission's reply filed 7/2/15; order holding pending Rule 54(b) motion in abeyance entered 7/8/15; motion to direct entry denied 8/26/15.

Commission's motion for reconsideration of dismissal filed 7/20/15; defendant's response filed 7/31/15; reply filed 8/7/15; motion for reconsideration denied 8/25/15.

Defendants' motion for summary judgment on Count 1 of complaint filed 6/5/17; Commission's response in opposition filed 7/11/17; reply filed 7/26/17; order denying motion entered 9/15/17.

Commission's motion for partial summary judgment filed 6/5/17; defendants' response in opposition filed 7/10/17; reply filed 7/27/17; order granting motion entered 9/15/17.

Trial held 2/7/18- 3/1/18.

Defendants' motion for reconsideration of 9/15/17 order filed 3/23/18; Commission's response filed 4/4/18; reply filed 4/8/18; order denying motion for reconsideration entered 6/27/18.

Monetary judgment in favor of Commission entered 7/18/18.

Commission's notice of appeal from dismissal of pay-for-delay count and declination of an injunction (Case No. 18-2621) filed 7/23/18.

Defendants AbbVie, Inc, Abbott Laboratories, and Unimed Pharmaceuticals, LLC's notice of appeal from finding of sham litigation and monetary judgment (Case No. 18-2748) filed 8/8/18.

Defendant Besins Healthcare, Inc's notice of appeal from finding of sham litigation and monetary judgment (Case No. 18-2758) filed 8/13/18.

Order granting joint motion to dismiss Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc. as a party to the appeal entered 3/12/19.

Commission's opening brief filed 3/28/19; Abbvie's response/opening brief in its cross-appeal filed 6/5/19; Commission's reply/response brief due 7/19/19.

***FTC v. ACDI GROUP LLC***, No. 3:17-cv-00340 (W.D.N.C.)

Parties:                   ACDI Group LLC  
                              Solutions to Portfolios LLC  
                              Anthony Swatsworth

Assigned Attorneys:  Nikhil Singhvi (BCP/FP)  
                              Michael White

**Alleged Conduct:** Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act in connection with defendants' debt collection practices.

**Status:** Complaint filed 6/22/17.  
Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 11/16/17; response in opposition filed 12/22/17; reply to response filed 1/12/18;  
Commission's and defendants' supplemental briefs as to motion filed 5/16/18.  
Order granting in part and denying in part Commission's motion for summary judgment entered 8/22/18.

***FTC v. ACTAVIS, INC. (formerly WATSON PHARMS., INC.)***, No. 12-416 (S. Ct.); Nos. 12-16488, 10-12729 (11th Cir.); No. 1:09-cv-00955 (N.D. Ga.), formerly No. 2:09-cv-00598 (C.D. Cal.)

**Parties:** Actavis, Inc. (formerly Watson Pharmaceuticals, Inc.)  
Par Pharmaceuticals Companies, Inc.  
Paddock Laboratories, Inc.  
Solvay Pharmaceuticals, Inc.

**Assigned Attorneys:** Markus Meier (BC)  
Saralisa Brau  
Cynthia A. Liebes (SER)  
Mark S. Hegedus (OGC)

**Alleged Conduct:** Action for a permanent injunction and other equitable relief for violations of the Sections 1 and 2 of the Sherman Act and Section 5 of the FTC Act in connection with agreement between brand name drug manufacturer and generic manufacturers delaying entry of generic drug.

**Status:** Complaint in C.D. Cal. filed 1/27/09.  
Amended complaint filed 2/12/09.  
Defendants' motion to transfer case to N.D. Ga. filed 2/27/09;  
Commission's opposition filed 3/16/09; defendants' reply filed 3/23/09; order transferring case to N.D. Ga. entered 4/9/09.  
Second amended complaint filed 5/28/09.  
Commission's motion to stay proceeding filed 6/15/09; defendants' opposition filed 6/17/09; Commission's reply filed 7/6/09; order denying motion entered 7/17/09.  
Defendants' motions to dismiss second amended complaint filed 7/20/09;  
Commission's opposition filed 8/21/09; defendants' replies filed 9/11/09.  
Order granting motion to dismiss Commission's second amended complaint entered 2/22/10.  
Judgment dismissing Commission's claims with prejudice entered 4/21/10

Notice of appeal filed 6/10/10.  
Commission's opening brief filed 7/26/10; defendants' answering brief filed 11/10/10. Commission's reply brief filed 12/15/10.  
Oral argument heard 5/13/11.  
Opinion affirming district court issued on 4/25/12.  
Commission's petition for rehearing *en banc* filed 6/11/12; order denying petition for rehearing *en banc* entered 7/18/12.  
Commission's petition for writ of certiorari filed 10/4/12; petition granted 12/7/12.  
Commission's petition to district court to unseal document filed 12/10/12; motion granted and temporary stay pending appeal entered 12/19/12.  
Notice of appeal of order unsealing document by AbbVie Products filed 12/21/12; emergency motion to expedite briefing and stay unsealing order filed 12/26/12; granted 1/10/13.  
Commission's Supreme Court merits brief filed 1/22/13.  
AbbVie Products' opening brief in 11th Circuit filed 1/31/13; Commission's response filed 2/7/13; AbbVie Products' reply filed 2/19/13.  
Respondents' Supreme Court briefs filed 2/21/13. Commission's Supreme Court reply brief filed 3/18/13.  
Oral argument in 11th Circuit held 3/20/13.  
11th Circuit opinion affirming district court order lifting seal and dissolving stay filed 3/21/13.  
Supreme Court grant of Solicitor General's motion to lift seal on sealed volume of joint appendix entered 3/22/13.  
Supreme Court oral argument heard 3/25/13.  
Supreme Court decision in favor of the FTC, reversing the Eleventh Circuit Court of Appeals and remanding the case for further proceedings consistent with its opinion entered 6/17/13.  
Eleventh Circuit order vacating the district court judgment and remanding the case to the district court entered 9/9/13.  
Order making Eleventh Circuit's mandate the judgment of the district court entered 11/15/13.  
Motion to dismiss for failure to state a claim filed 1/15/14; Commission's opposition filed 2/14/14; defendant's reply brief filed 3/3/14.  
Order denying motion to dismiss entered 4/21/14.  
Motion for interlocutory appeal by Paddock Laboratories, Inc. and Par Pharmaceutical Companies, Inc. filed 4/22/14; Commission's opposition filed 5/6/14; oral argument heard 5/9/14; motion denied 5/9/14.  
Motion for summary judgment by Actavis Holdco U.S. filed 10/4/16; Commission's opposition filed 12/1/16; reply filed 12/9/16; order denying motion entered 6/2/17.  
Commission's unopposed motion to dismiss with prejudice as to defendants Par Pharmaceutical Companies, Inc. and Paddock

Holdings LLC entered 2/2/17; order granting motion entered 2/7/17.

Defendant Solvay Pharmaceuticals, Inc's motion for summary judgment filed 9/29/17; notice of joinder by defendants Actavis Holdco U.S., Inc. and Actavis, Inc. filed 9/29/17; response in opposition filed 1/18/18; reply filed 2/20/18.

Order denying defendant's motion for summary judgment entered 6/14/18. Defendant Solvay Pharmaceuticals, Inc's motion for reconsideration filed 7/12/18; Commission's response in opposition filed 7/26/18; reply filed 8/9/18; hearing held and motion for reconsideration denied on 10/1/18.

Stipulated order dismissing with prejudice the Commission's claims against defendants Actavis, Inc. and Actavis Holdco US, Inc. entered 2/25/19.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction as to defendants AbbVie Products LLC (f/k/a Solvay Pharmaceuticals, Inc.) and AbbVie Inc. entered 2/28/19.

***FTC v. ADEPT MANAGEMENT, INC.***, No. 1:16-cv-00720 (D. Ore.)

Parties:

Adept Management, Inc.  
Anchor Publishing Group, Inc.  
Associated Publishers Network, Inc.  
Atlas Business Consulting, LLC  
Clarity Group, LLC  
Consolidated Publishers Exchange, Inc. d/b/a Premier Subscription Services, Processing Express Solutions  
Crown Resource Management, LLC  
Customer Access Services, Inc.  
Express Publishers Service, Inc. d/b/a Associated Billing Service, Associated Periodical Network, Associated Publishers Readership, Billing Services of Circulation, Circulation Billing Marketplace, Circulation Network Services d/b/a Global Billing Service d/b/a Lakeshore Publishers Billing, Magazine Billing Network, Magazine Distribution Marketplace, Magazine Payment Processing, National Magazine Network, Publication Network Services, Publishers Billing Marketplace, Publishers Distribution Network, Publishers Magazine Services, Readers Magazine Services, Readers Payment Network, Subscription Billing Agency, Subscription Billing Network, United Billing Service, United Publishers Agency  
HCG, Inc.  
Henry Cricket Group, LLC  
Hoyal & Associates, Inc.  
Liberty Publishers Service, Inc. d/b/a Allied Publishing Services, American Consumer Publishers Association, Associated Publishers Services, Billing Services of America, Bradford Publishing Service,

Circulation Billing Services, Global Publishers Center, Lakeshore Publishers Service, Magazine Billing Services, Magazine Distribution Service, Magazine Payment Services, Magazine Subscriber Services, Magazine Subscriptions Center, National Magazine Services, Periodical Billing Services, Platinum Subscription Service, Publication Service Networks, Publishers Access Services, Publishers Billing Services, Publishers Consolidated Subscription Services, Publishers Distribution Center, Publishers Education Services, Publishers Magazine Billing, Publishers Magazine Payment, Publishers Marketplace Services, Publishers Network Exchange, Publishers Payment Services, Publishers Periodical Service, Publishers Processing Service, Publishers Services Exchange, Readers Billing Services, Readers Payment Service, Seascope Publishers Network, Slo Call Center, Subscription Billing Service, Subscription Payment Exchange, Subscription Payment Services, United Publishers Services

Magazine Clearing Exchange

Magazine Link, Inc.

Maximillian, Inc. d/b/a Maxmillian, Inc.

Northwest Data Services, LLC

PPP Magazines, Inc.

Publishers Payment Processing, Inc.

Reality Kats, LLC

Specialties, Inc.

Subscription House Agency, Inc.

United Publishers Exchange, Inc. d/b/a Associated Publishers Network, Circulation Billing Network, Magazine Billing Associates, Premier Subscription Network, Publishers Billing Network, Publishers Magazine Exchange

Wineoceros Wine Club, Inc.

Linda Babb

Shannon Bacon a/k/a Shannon Balero, Shannon Gordon

Jeffrey Hoyal

Lori Hoyal

Colleen Kaylor

Laura Lovrien a/k/a Laura Babb

Noel Parducci a/k/a Noel Littlefield, Noelle Littlefield

Lydia Pugsley a/k/a Lydia Babb

Dennis Simpson

William Strickler

Assigned Attorneys: Krista Bush (NWR)

Laura Solis

Richard McKewen

Connor Shively

Sophia Calderón

Stephen Fairchild

W. Stuart Hirschfield

**Alleged Conduct:** Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in connection with a nationwide campaign relying on misrepresentations to solicit newspaper renewals and new subscriptions from consumers.

**Status:** Complaint filed 4/27/16.  
Motion to dismiss for failure to state a claim filed 6/27/16; Commission's opposition filed 7/11/16; order denying motion to dismiss entered 11/3/16.  
Motions for stay pending resolution of criminal proceedings filed 1/27/17; Commission's response filed 1/31/17; replies filed 2/17/17; motions denied 2/23/17.  
Motion for summary judgment filed 4/14/17; Commission's opposition filed 5/4/17; reply filed 5/26/17; motion deferred 6/13/17.  
Default judgment as to defendants Adept Management, Inc., Anchor Publishing Group, Inc., Associated Publishers Network, Inc., Atlas Business Consulting LLC, Clarity Group, Inc., Consolidated Publishers Exchange, Inc., Crown Resource Management LLC, Customer Access Services, Inc., Express Publishers Service, Inc., HCG, Inc., Henry Cricket Group, LLC, Liberty Publishers Service, Inc., Magazine Clearing Exchange, Inc., Magazine Link, Inc., Maximillian, Inc., North West Data Services LLC, PPP Magazines, Inc., Publishers Payment Processing, Inc., Publishers Payment Processing, Inc., Specialties, Inc., Subscription House Agency, Inc., United Publishers Exchange, Inc., and Wineoceros Wine Club, Inc. ("Defaulting Defendants") entered 8/7/17.  
Commission's motion for default judgment and permanent injunction order as to Defaulting Defendants filed 3/13/18; response in opposition to motion by defendants Jeffrey Hoyal, Lori Hoyal, Hoyal & Associates, Inc. filed 3/27/18; Commission's reply filed 3/30/18; response in opposition to motion by defendants Reality Kats, LLC, Dennis Simpson filed 4/6/18; Commission's reply filed 4/12/18.  
Motions for summary judgement by defendants Linda Babb, Colleen Kaylor, William Strickler, Noel Parducci, Reality Kats, LLC, Dennis Simpson, Shannon Bacon, Jeffrey Hoyal, Lori Hoyal, Hoyal & Associates, Inc, Laura Lovrien, Lydia Pugsley filed 8/17/18; Commission's response in opposition filed 8/31/18; defendants' reply filed 9/7/18.  
Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 8/17/18; response in opposition by defendants Colleen Kaylor, Jeffrey Hoyal, Hoyal & Associates, Inc, Noel Parducci, Lori Hoyal, Linda Babb, Shannon Bacon, William Strickler, Reality Kats, LLC, Dennis Simpson, Publishers Payment Processing, Inc, Lydia Pugsley, Laura Lovrien filed 8/31/18.

Order granting in part and denying in part Commission's motion for summary judgment and denying defendants' motion for summary judgment entered 9/25/18.

Trial held 11/6/18 through 12/5/18.

Order denying defendants Hoyal & Associates, Jeffrey Hoyal, and Lori Hoyal's motion for stay pending resolution of appeal in *FTC v. AMG* (Case. No. 16-17197, 9th Cir.) entered 2/19/19.

Order denying defendants Dennis Simpson and Reality Kats, LLC's motion for reconsideration of court's summary judgment in favor of the Commission entered 4/18/19.

Order for permanent injunction against all defendants and monetary judgment against defendants Dennis Simpson, Jeffrey Hoyal, and Lori Hoyal entered 6/10/19.

Defendant Noel Parducci's motion for reconsideration of court's order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment filed 6/24/19; defendant Bacon joined 6/25/19.

***FTC v. ALLIEDWALLET, INC.***, No. 2:19-cv-04355 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: AlliedWallet, Inc. d/b/a Allied Wallet  
Allied Wallet, Ltd.  
GTBill, LLC  
GTBill, Ltd.  
Ahmad Khawaja a/k/a Andy Khawaja  
Mohammad Diab a/k/a Moe Diab  
Amy Rountree a/k/a Amy Ringler

Assigned Attorneys: Andrew Hudson (BCP/MP)  
Karen Hobbs  
Delilah Vinzon

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in connection with the defendants' payment facilitating and processing business.

Status: Complaint filed 5/20/19.  
Stipulated final orders for permanent injunction and monetary judgment against defendant Mohammad Diab and defendants Ahmad Khawaja, AlliedWallet, Inc., Allied Wallet, Ltd., GTBill, LLC, and GTBill, Ltd. entered 6/7/19.

***FTC v. AMERICAN FINANCIAL BENEFITS CENTER***, No. 4:18-cv-00806 (N.D. Cal.)

Parties: American Financial Benefits Center  
Ameritech Financial  
Financial Education Benefits Center

Brandon Demond Frere

Assigned Attorneys: Sarah Schroeder (WRSF)  
Roberta Tonelli  
Evan Rose

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in connection with the marketing of student loan debt relief.

Status: Complaint filed 2/7/18.  
Commission's motion for preliminary injunction filed 3/2/18; opposition filed 3/30/18; order granting preliminary injunction entered 11/29/18.  
Defendants' motion to dismiss filed 4/23/18; Commission's opposition filed 5/16/18; defendant's reply filed 5/30/18; order denying defendants' motion entered 8/8/18.  
Order granting joint stipulation for a nine-month stay as to defendant Brandon Frere entered 2/4/19.  
Order granting joint stipulation for a nine-month stay as to all defendants entered 5/17/19.

***FTC v. AMERICAN HOME SERVICING CENTER, LLC***, No. 8:18-cv-00597 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: American Home Servicing Center, LLC  
Capital Home Advocacy Center  
National Advocacy Center, LLC  
Jaime Aburto  
Marcus Fierro, Jr.  
Eve Christine Rodriguez  
Sergio Lorenzo Rodriguez

Assigned Attorneys: Barbara Chun (WRLA)  
Elsie B Kappler (BCP/ENF)  
Sangjoon Han

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the Mortgage Assistance Relief Services Rule in connection with the marketing and sale of mortgage assistance relief services.

Status: Complaint filed 4/12/18.  
Ex parte TRO with asset freeze and appointment of temporary receiver entered 4/13/18.  
Preliminary injunction as to defendants American Home Servicing Center, LLC; Capital Home Advocacy Center; National Advocacy Center, LLC; and Marcus Fierro entered 4/27/18.  
Preliminary injunction as to defendants Eve Christine Rodriguez and



Sergio Lorenzo Rodriguez entered 6/12/18.  
Motion to dismiss by defendants National Advocacy Center, LLC, Eve Christine Rodriguez, and Sergio Lorenzo Rodriguez filed 7/13/18; response in opposition filed 7/19/18; reply to opposition filed 8/17/18; order denying motion entered 9/12/18.  
Commission's motion for default judgment against defendants Marcus Fierro, American Home Servicing Center, LLC, National Advocacy Center, LLC, and Capital Home Advocacy Center; motion for summary judgment as to all counts filed 2/15/19; order taking motion for summary judgment under submission and continuing hearing on motion for default judgment entered 5/23/19.  
Final pre-trial conference set for 8/9/19.

***FTC v. AMERICAN VETERANS FOUNDATION, INC.***, No. 8:19-cv-00744 (M.D. Fla.)

Parties: American Veterans Foundation, Inc.  
Paul K. Monville  
State of Florida (Plaintiff)

Assigned Attorneys: Michael Lane Morgan  
Sarah Shifley  
Tracy Thorleifson

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act and the Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with sham charity fundraising activities.

Status: Complaint filed 3/27/19.  
Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment entered 3/28/19.

***FTC v. AMG SERVICES, INC.***, Nos. 16-17197, 14-16468 (9th Cir.); No. 2:12-cv-00536 (D. Nev.)

Parties: AMG Services, Inc.  
Red Cedar Services, Inc., d/b/a 500FastCash  
SFS, Inc., d/b/a OneClickCash  
Tribal Financial Services, Inc., d/b/a Ameriloan, d/b/a UnitedCashLoan,  
d/b/a USFastCash, d/b/a Miami Nation Enterprises.  
AMG Capital Management, LLC  
Level 5 Motorsports, LLC  
Lead Flash Consulting, LLC  
Black Creek Capital Corporation  
Broadmoor Capital Partners, LLC  
Muir Law Firm, LLC

Scott A. Tucker  
Blaine A. Tucker  
Timothy J. Muir  
Don E. Brady  
Robert D. Campbell  
Troy L. LittleAxe  
Park 269 LLC  
Kim C. Tucker

Assigned Attorneys: Nikhil Singhvi (BCP/FP)  
Iona Rusu  
Jason Schall  
Jack Metzler (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5, the Truth in Lending Act, and the Electronic Fund Transfer Act, in connection with offering and extending credit, payday loans, and the collection of those loans.

Status: Complaint filed 4/2/12.  
Motion to dismiss by all defendants filed 5/25/12; Commission's response filed 6/11/12.  
Partial withdrawals of motions to dismiss filed 10/15/12 and 10/16/12.  
Stipulated preliminary injunction entered 12/27/12.  
Commission's amended motion for partial summary judgment filed 3/7/13; defendants' responses filed 3/25/13.  
Motion for legal determination on tribal sovereign immunity by defendants AMG Services, Inc., Red Cedar Services, Inc., SFS, Inc., and Tribal Financial Services filed 4/8/13; cross-motion for legal determination by defendant Troy Little Axe filed 4/10/13; Commission's response filed 4/19/13.  
Commission's amended complaint filed 4/12/13.  
Report and recommendation by magistrate that Commission's motion for partial summary judgment and defendant's motion for legal determination on tribal sovereign immunity be granted in part and denied in part entered 7/16/13.  
Joint motion for permanent injunction and judgment as to defendants AMG Services, SFS, Inc., MNE Services, Inc., AMG Capital Management, LLC, Level 5 MotorSports, LLC, LeadFlash Consulting, LLC, Black Creek Capital Corp., Broadmoor Capital Partners, LLC, Scott A. Tucker, Blaine A. Tucker, Don E. Brady, Robert D. Campbell, and Troy L. Little Axe, Jr. filed 7/18/13.  
Motion for summary judgment by Commission filed 9/30/13; Muir defendants' opposition filed 11/29/13; remaining defendants' opposition filed 12/4/13; Commission's reply filed 12/20/13.

Motions for summary judgment by defendants filed 9/30/13;  
Commission's opposition filed 12/4/13; defendants' reply filed  
12/20/13.

Order granting joint motion for permanent injunction and judgment as to  
defendants AMG Services, SFS, Inc., MNE Services, Inc., AMG  
Capital Management, LLC, Level 5 MotorSports, LLC, LeadFlash  
Consulting, LLC, Black Creek Capital Corp., Broadmoor Capital  
Partners, LLC, Scott A. Tucker, Blaine A. Tucker, Don E. Brady,  
Robert D. Campbell, and Troy L. Little Axe, Jr. entered 10/8/13.

Report and recommendation by magistrate that Commission's motion for  
summary judgment be granted in part and denied in part, and that  
defendant's motion for summary judgment be denied, entered  
1/28/14; defendant's objections filed 2/14/14; Commission's  
response filed 3/2/14.

Order adopting magistrate's 7/16/13 report and recommendations entered  
3/7/14.

Order adopting magistrate's 1/28/14 report and recommendations entered  
5/29/14.

Stipulation and order to dismiss defendants Timothy J. Muir and the Muir  
Law Firm, LLC entered 9/8/14.

Order denying defendants' motion to enforce settlement entered 7/16/14;  
notice of appeal filed 7/30/14; Ninth Circuit order dismissing  
appeal for lack of jurisdiction entered 10/30/14.

Stipulated permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to defendants  
AMG Services and MNE Services, Inc. entered 1/23/15.

Stipulated permanent injunction and monetary judgment against  
defendants Troy Little Axe, Jr., Don Brady and Robert Campbell  
entered 3/17/15.

Motion for preliminary injunction by the Commission filed 5/8/15;  
responses filed 5/26/15.

Stipulated orders for permanent injunction and equitable monetary relief  
as to defendants Red Cedar Services, Inc. and SFS, Inc. entered  
11/25/15.

Motion for summary judgment by Commission filed 1/20/16; defendants'  
opposition filed 2/26/16; Commission's reply filed 3/18/16.

Motion for summary judgment by defendants filed 1/20/16; Commission's  
opposition filed 2/26/16; defendants' reply filed 3/18/16.

Order granting Commission's motion for summary judgment, denying  
defendants' motion for summary judgment, and awarding  
permanent injunction and monetary relief of \$1.3 billion entered  
9/30/16.

Notice of appeal filed 11/29/16.

Appellant's opening brief filed 7/21/17; Commission's answering brief  
filed 12/11/17; reply brief filed 1/16/18.

Oral argument held 8/15/18.

Panel opinion, affirming district court's summary judgment and relief order, entered 12/3/18.

Order denying appellant's motion for rehearing *en banc* entered 6/20/19.

***FTC v. APARTMENT HUNTERS, INC.***, No. 8:18-cv-01636 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Apartment Hunters, Inc. d/b/a  
WeTakeSection8.com d/b/a ApartmentHunterz.com d/b/a  
FeaturedRentals.com  
Real Estate Data Solutions, Inc.  
Rental Home Listings Inc.  
Uab Apartment Hunters LT  
Steven Shayan  
Kevin Shayan a/k/a Kaveh Shayan

Assigned Attorneys: Stacy Procter (WRLA)  
Amanda Grier (BCP/MP)  
Rhonda Perkins

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5 of the  
FTC Act in connection with the sale of access to listings of purportedly  
available rental units.

Status: Complaint filed 9/11/18.  
TRO entered 9/13/18.  
Hearing conducted and oral order granting preliminary injunction entered  
9/24/18; preliminary injunction entered 9/28/18.  
Commission's application for contempt against all defendants filed  
9/27/18; opposition filed 9/28/18; reply to opposition filed 10/1/18;  
order holding defendants in contempt entered 10/10/18.  
Trial set for 11/5/19.

***FTC v. APEX CAPITAL GROUP, LLC***, No. 2:18-cv-09573 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Apex Capital Group, LLC  
Capstone Capital Solutions Limited  
Clik Trix Limited  
Empire Partners Limited  
Interzoom Capital Limited  
Lead Blast Limited  
Mountain Venture Solutions Limited  
Nutra Global Limited  
Omni Group Limited  
Rendezvous it Limited  
Sky Blue Media Limited  
Tactic Solutions Limited

Phillip Peikos  
David Barnett  
SIA Transact Pro  
Mark Moskvins

Assigned Attorneys: Laura Zuckerwise (NER)  
Brian Lasky  
Darren H. Lubetzky

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, the Restore Online Shoppers' Confidence Act, and the Electronic Fund Transfer Act in connection with the marketing of supposedly "free trial" offers for personal care products and dietary supplements online.

Status: Complaint filed 11/14/18.  
Ex parte TRO entered 11/16/18.  
Stipulated preliminary injunctions entered 12/19/18.  
Amended complaint naming SIA Transact Pro and Mark Moskvins filed 5/30/19.  
Trial set for 12/10/19.

***FTC v. AT&T MOBILITY LLC***, No. 15-16585 (9th Cir.); No. 3:14-cv-04785 (N.D. Cal.)

Parties: AT&T Mobility, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Evan Rose (WRSF)  
Matthew D. Gold  
Laura Fremont  
Emily Burton  
Colin Hector  
Maricela Segura (WRLA)  
Emily Wu  
Dominique Alepin  
Joel Marcus (OGC)  
Matthew Hoffman

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive and unfair acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in connection with the marketing of wireless broadband internet access service for smartphones.

Status: Complaint filed 10/28/14.  
Motion to dismiss by AT&T Mobility filed 1/5/15.  
Order denying motion to dismiss entered 3/31/15.  
AT&T Mobility's motion for leave to take interlocutory appeal filed 4/9/15; Commission's response filed 4/23/15; AT&T Mobility's reply filed 4/30/15.

Order granting AT&T Mobility's motion to appeal entered 5/15/15.  
Petition to Ninth Circuit for permission to appeal by AT&T Mobility filed 5/26/15; Commission's response filed 6/8/15.  
Order granting interlocutory review entered 8/10/15.  
Motion to stay pending appeal filed 8/18/15; order denying stay entered 9/25/15.  
Appellant's opening brief filed 11/18/15; Commission's answering brief filed 2/3/16; appellant's reply brief filed 2/22/16.  
Oral argument heard 6/17/16.  
Opinion reversing the district court and ordering that the Commission's complaint be dismissed entered 8/29/16.  
Commission's petition for rehearing *en banc* filed 10/13/16; AT&T's response filed 11/8/16; petition granted 5/9/17.  
Oral argument held 9/19/17.  
*En banc* opinion affirming district court's denial of AT&T's motion to dismiss and remanding for further proceedings entered 2/26/18.

***FTC v. AVANT, LLC***, No. 1:19-cv-02517 (N.D. Ill.)

Parties: Avant, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Daniel O. Hanks (BCP/FP)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, the Telemarketing Sales Rule, and the Electronic Fund Transfer Act in connection with the defendant's advertising, marketing, and distribution of personal loans.

Status: Complaint filed 4/15/19.  
Permanent injunction entered 5/17/19.

***FTC v. AWS, LLC***, No. 2:18-cv-00442 (D. Nev.)

Parties: Adam S. Bowser  
Christopher F. Bowser  
Jeffrey A. Gomez  
Jody L. Marshall  
Adams Consulting, LLC  
AWS, LLC  
FBA Distributors, LLC  
FBA Stores, LLC  
Global Marketing Services LLC  
Info Pros, LLC  
Info Solutions, LLC  
Online Auction Learning Center, Inc. (Mass. Corp.)  
Online Auction Learning Center, Inc. (Nev. Corp.)

Bank of America, N.A. (Intervenor)

Assigned Attorneys: Roberto Anguizola (BCP/MP)  
Miry Kim  
Gregory Evans

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act and the Business Opportunity Rule by, among other things: making false or unsubstantiated earnings claims regarding defendants' business opportunities; and failing to furnish prospective purchasers of defendants' business opportunities with the required disclosure documents.

Status: Complaint filed 3/12/18.  
TRO entered 3/14/18.  
Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to defendants AWS, LLC, FBA Distributors, LLC, FBA Stores, LLC, Info Pros, LLC, Info Solutions, LLC, Online Auction Learning Center, Inc. (Mass. Corp.), and Online Auction Learning Center, Inc. (Nev. Corp.), Christopher F. Bowser, Adam S. Bowser, and Jody L. Marshall entered 6/15/18.  
Intervenor complaint by Bank of America, N.A. filed 9/28/18.  
Stipulated permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to defendants Adams Consulting, LLC, Global Marketing Services, LLC, and Jeffrey A. Gomez entered 10/10/18.

***FTC v. BLUEHIPPO FUNDING, LLC***, Nos. 11-374, 16-1599, 17-1587, 17-669 (2d Cir.); No. 1:08-cv-01819 (S.D.N.Y.); No. 9:19-cv-80001 (S.D. Fla.); 9:17-ap-01185 (S.D. Fla.)

Parties: BlueHippo Funding, LLC  
BlueHippo Capital LLC  
Joseph K. Rensin

Assigned Attorneys: Amanda C. Basta (BCP/ENF)  
Michael P. Mora  
Michele Arington (OGC)  
Jack Metzler  
Mariel Goetz

Alleged Conduct: Contempt proceeding for violations of a permanent injunction in connection with the sale of personal computers, televisions, and other consumer electronics.

Status: Complaint filed 2/22/08.  
Stipulated final judgment and order for permanent injunction entered 4/9/08.  
Motions for contempt and to modify permanent injunction against

BlueHippo Funding, LLC, BlueHippo Capital LLC, and Joseph K. Rensin filed 11/17/09.

Order to show cause why defendants should not be held in contempt entered 11/16/09; modified 11/18/09.

Defendants' memoranda of law filed 12/7/09 and 12/11/09; Commission's reply memoranda of law filed 12/11/09 and 12/12/09.

Trial held 2/9/10-2/11/10; closing argument held 2/19/10.

Order granting motion for contempt entered 7/27/10; judgment entered 7/30/10.

Commission's motion to amend/correct judgment and order filed 8/27/10; defendants' opposition filed 9/24/10; Commission's reply filed 10/8/10.

Order denying Commission's motion to amend/correct judgment and order entered 12/1/10.

Commission's notice of appeal re contempt order filed 1/28/11.

Notice of appeal filed 2/1/11.

Commission's brief filed 5/16/11.

Appellee's brief filed 8/15/11.

Commission's reply brief filed 9/12/11.

Argument held 2/23/12.

Opinion vacating the district court's judgment and remanding the case to the district court entered 8/12/14.

Appellee Joseph Rensin's petition for rehearing filed 9/25/14.

Order denying Joseph Rensin's petition for rehearing entered 11/17/14.

Oral argument before the district court concerning applicability of presumption of reliance held 6/4/15.

Opinion and order ruling that Commission is entitled to presumption of consumer reliance entered 11/6/15.

Final judgment imposing compensatory contempt sanctions entered 4/19/16.

Notice of appeal by Rensin filed 5/18/16.

Appellant's opening brief filed 8/29/16; Commission's answering brief filed 11/28/16; appellant's reply brief filed 12/9/16.

Suggestion of bankruptcy and automatic stay by Rensin filed 2/15/17; Commission's opposition filed 2/16/17; reply filed 2/27/17.

Order rejecting application of automatic bankruptcy stay entered 3/6/17.

Notice of appeal filed 3/7/17.

Motion to stay contempt proceeding pending appeal filed 3/10/17; Commission's opposition filed 3/23/17; reply filed 3/29/17; temporary stay entered 3/27/17; motion for stay granted 5/2/17.

District court order finding defendant Rensin in contempt, but staying order due to appeals court's temporary stay order entered 3/28/17.

Second Circuit opinion affirming district court judgment imposing compensatory contempt sanctions entered 4/12/17.

Notice of appeal of 3/28/17 order filed by Joseph Rensin on 5/16/17; order holding appeal in abeyance entered 5/31/17.



Appellant's opening brief (No. 17-669) filed 4/10/17; Commission's answering brief filed 6/9/17; reply brief filed 7/6/17.  
Oral argument heard on 2/15/18.  
Supplemental briefs filed 2/19/18.  
Order compelling appellant Joseph Rensin to respond to Commission's suggestion in its 2/15/18 brief that this case might be consolidated with Case No. 17-1587 entered 12/6/18; appellant's response filed 12/7/18.  
Order consolidating appeals 17-669 and No. 17-1587 entered 1/16/19.  
Rensin's notice of appeal of bankruptcy court's ruling that his compensatory contempt sanction debt to the FTC is not dischargeable filed 12/28/18.  
Appellant Joseph Rensin's brief in contempt appeal filed 2/14/19; Commission's brief filed 3/18/19; appellant's reply brief filed 4/1/19.  
Appellant Rensin's opening brief in bankruptcy appeal filed 3/29/19; Commission's brief filed 5/13/19; Rensin's reply brief filed 5/31/19.  
Second Circuit decision in consolidated appeals vacating district court's judgment entered 6/26/19.

***FTC v. CAMPBELL CAPITAL LLC***, No. 1:18-cv-01163 (W.D.N.Y.)

Parties: Campbell Capital LLC d/b/a United Processing Services  
Kahl, Heidenreich, and Nemmer LLC  
Urban, Heidenreich, Melendez, and Associates, LLC d/b/a Capital Assets, Securities, and Holdings Group  
J & V Receivables LLC  
Rich Financial LLC  
BCH & Associates Ltd.  
Robert Heidenreich  
State of New York (Plaintiff)

Assigned Attorneys: Christopher Y. Miller (NER)  
Karen Dahlberg O'Connell

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act in connection with the collection of debt.

Status: Complaint filed 10/23/18.  
Ex parte TRO entered 10/25/18.  
Stipulated preliminary injunctions entered 12/4/18.  
Clerk's entry of default as to all defendants entered 3/19/19.

*FTC v. CARDIFF*, No. 5:18-cv-02104 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Jason Cardiff  
Eunjung Cardiff  
Danielle Cadiz  
Redwood Scientific Technologies, Inc. (California Corp.) d/b/a Rengalife  
Redwood Scientific Technologies, Inc. (Nevada Corp.)  
Redwood Scientific Technologies, Inc. (Delaware Corp.)  
Identify, LLC  
Advanced Mens Institute Prolongz LLC d/b/a AMI  
Runway Products, LLC  
Carols Place Limited Partnership  
Jacques Poujade (third party)

Assigned Attorneys: Stacy Rene Procter (WRLA)  
Edwin Rodriguez (BCP/DAP)  
Elizabeth Sanger  
James Prunty  
Shira Modell

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Sections 5(a) and 12 of the FTC Act, the Restore Online Shoppers' Confidence Act, the Electronic Fund Transfer Act, and the FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the advertising and marketing of smoking cessation, weight-loss, and sexual-performance aids.

Status: Complaint filed 10/10/18.  
Preliminary injunction with asset freeze and other equitable relief as to defendants Redwood Scientific Technologies, Inc. (California), Redwood Scientific Technologies, Inc. (Nevada), Redwood Scientific Technologies, Inc. (Delaware), Indentify, LLC, Advanced Mens Institute Prolongz LLC, Runway Products, LLC, and Carols Place Limited Partnership entered 10/24/18.  
Stipulated preliminary injunction as to defendant Danielle Cadiz entered 11/2/18.  
Preliminary injunction with asset freeze and other equitable relief as to defendants Jason Cardiff and Eunjung Cardiff entered 11/8/18.  
Clerk's entry of default as to defendants Redwood Scientific Technologies, Inc., a California corporation, Redwood Scientific Technologies, Inc., a Nevada corporation, and Redwood Scientific Technologies, Inc., a Delaware corporation, Advanced Mens Institute Prolongz, LLC, and Runway Products, LLC, entered 3/5/19.  
Clerk's entry of default as to defendant Identify, LLC entered 3/7/19.  
Order granting joint stipulation for permanent injunction as to defendant Danielle Cadiz entered 5/16/19.

Commission's application for contempt against defendants Eunjung Cardiff, Jason Cardiff, and Jacques Poujade for violations of the TRO and preliminary injunction filed 6/17/19.  
Contempt hearing set for 7/30/19.

***FTC v. CONSUMER DEFENSE, LLC***, No. 18-15462 (9th Cir.); No. 2:18-cv-00030 (D. Nev.)

Parties: Consumer Defense, LLC  
Consumer Link, Inc.  
Preferred Law, PLLC  
American Home Loan Counselors  
Consumer Defense Group, LLC (formerly known as Modification Review Board, LLC)  
Consumer Defense, LLC  
Brown Legal, Inc.  
AM Property Management, LLC  
Fmg Partners, LLC  
Zinly, LLC  
Jonathan P. Hanley  
Benjamin R. Horton  
Sandra X. Hanley  
American Home Loans, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Adam Wesolowski (BCP/FP)  
Gregory Ashe  
Imad Abyad (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the Mortgage Assistance Relief Service Rule in connection with the marketing and sale of mortgage assistance relief.

Status: Complaint filed 1/8/18.  
TRO entered 1/10/18.  
Preliminary injunction entered 2/20/18.  
Defendant Benjamin R Horton's motion to dismiss filed 1/22/18;  
Commission's response to motion filed 2/5/18; reply filed 2/15/18;  
motion denied 6/7/18.  
Receiver Thomas W. McNamara's motion for order authorizing sale of real property and vehicles filed 4/16/18. Commission's non-opposition filed 4/30/18.  
Response in opposition to motion for authorizing order on behalf of defendants AM Property Management, LLC, American Home Loan Counselors, American Home Loans, LLC, Brown Legal, Inc, Consumer Defense Group, LLC, Consumer Defense LLC, Consumer Defense, LLC, Consumer Link Inc., FMG Partners,

LLC, Jonathan P. Hanley, Sandra X. Hanley, Preferred Law, OLLC, and Zinly, LLC filed 4/30/18.

Defendants AM Property Management, LLC, American Home Loan Counselors, American Home Loans, LLC, Brown Legal, Inc, Consumer Defense Group, LLC, Consumer Defense, LLC, FMG Partners, LLC, Jonathan P. Hanley, Sandra X. Hanley, Preferred Law, PLLC, Zinly, LLC's motions to dismiss filed 2/12/18; Commission's responses to motions filed 2/26/18; replies filed 3/5/18; motion denied 6/7/18.

Notice of appeal of preliminary injunction filed 03/21/18.

Appellants' opening brief filed 4/18/18; Commission's answering brief filed 5/16/18; reply brief filed 6/6/18.

Order granting stipulated consent judgment for permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to defendant Benjamin Horton entered 6/5/18.

Commission's motion for entry of clerk's default as to defendants Consumer Defense, LLC (Nevada) and Consumer Link, Inc. filed 8/7/18.

Ninth Circuit oral argument held 9/14/18.

Clerk's entry of default as to Consumer Defense, LLC (Nevada) and Consumer Link Inc. entered 1/18/19; default set aside on 6/14/19.

Default judgment against defendants Consumer Defense, LLC, Preferred Law, PLLC, American Home Loan Counselors, Consumer Defense Group, LLC, American Home Loans, LLC, AM Property Management, LLC, FMG Partners, LLC, Brown Legal, Inc., and Zinly, LLC entered 4/30/19.

Commission's motion for default judgment against defendants Consumer Defense, LLC (Nevada), Consumer Link, Inc., Preferred Law, PLLC, American Home Loan Counselors, Consumer Defense Group, LLC, Consumer Defense, LLC (Utah), Brown Legal, Inc., AM Property Management, LLC, FMG Partners, LLC, and Zinly, LLC filed 5/7/19; Defendant Hanley's response filed 5/28/19.

Decision by 9th Circuit affirming district court's grant of a preliminary injunction freezing defendants' assets entered 6/17/19.

***FTC v. CONSUMER HEALTH BENEFITS ASS'N***, No. 1:10-cv-03551 (E.D.N.Y.)

Parties:	Consumer Health Benefits Association	John Schwartz
	Jeffery Burman	Barbara Taube
	Century Senior Services	Rita B. Werner
	Guarantee Trust Life Insurance	Ronald K. Werner
	Richard Holson III	Vantage America Solutions
	Louis Leo	Windi Tow
	National Association for Americans	
	National Benefits Consultants, LLC	
	National Benefits Solutions, LLC	

Assigned Attorneys: Karen Dahlberg O'Connell (NER)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5 and the Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with defendants' marketing, distribution, and sale of medical discount plans.

Status: Complaint filed 8/03/10.  
Stipulation and order modifying ex parte TRO as to defendant Louis Leo entered 8/25/10.  
Stipulation and order modifying ex parte TRO as to defendants Ron Werner and Rita Werner entered 8/25/10.  
Stipulated preliminary injunction order as to defendant Louis J. Leo entered 9/21/10.  
Stipulated preliminary injunction as to defendants Ron Werner and Rita Werner entered 10/01/10.  
Preliminary injunction as to corporate defendants entered 10/5/10.  
Clerk's entry of default as to corporate defendants 11/15/10.  
Stipulation and order modifying the preliminary injunction order as to defendants Louis Leo, Rita and Ronald Werner entered 3/31/11.  
Commission's motion for leave to amend complaint naming additional defendants filed 5/06/11; magistrate judge's decision granting motion entered 8/18/11.  
Appeals of magistrate judge's decision by proposed defendants filed 9/06/11.  
Commission's amended complaint filed 10/13/11.  
Motions to dismiss by filed 11/22/11; Commission's response in opposition filed 12/13/11.  
Orders denying all motions to dismiss entered 5/23/12 & 5/24/12.  
Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 7/23/2013; opposition by John Schwartz and Wendi Tow filed 8/30/13 and 11/7/13; partial oppositions by Rita Brum Werner, Ronald Kent Werner, Jeffrey Burman, Century Senior Services, Guarantee Trust Life Insurance Company, Richard Holson, III, Barbara Taube, Vantage America Solutions, Inc. filed 11/6/13; cross-motions for summary judgment by Rita Werner, GTL, Vantage, Century, Rick Holson, Jeff Burman, and Barbara Taube filed 9/4/13, 9/5/13 and 9/6/13.  
Order granting motion by the Commonwealth of Massachusetts to modify the stipulated order of preliminary injunction entered 12/5/13.  
Transfer of frozen funds completed and receiver discharged 6/21/19.

***FTC v. CREDIT BUREAU CENTER, LLC***, Nos. 18-3310, 18-2847 (7th Cir.); No. 1:17-cv-00194 (N.D. Ill.)

Parties: Credit Bureau Center, LLC, f/k/a MyScore, LLC d/b/a efreescor.com, credit updates.com, and freecreditnation.com

Michael Brown  
Danny Pierce  
Andrew Lloyd

Assigned Attorneys: Guy Ward (MWR)  
Douglas McKenney  
Michael Bergman (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, the Restore Online Shoppers' Confidence Act, and the Fair Credit Reporting Act in connection with the marketing of credit monitoring services.

Status: Complaint filed 1/10/17.  
Ex parte TRO entered 1/11/17.  
Stipulated preliminary injunction as to defendants Danny Pierce and Andrew Lloyd entered 2/8/17.  
Stipulated preliminary injunction as to defendants Michael Brown and Credit Bureau Center entered 2/21/17.  
Order finding defendant Michael Brown in civil contempt entered 6/28/17.  
Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to defendants Danny Pierce and Andrew Lloyd entered 10/26/17.  
Commission's motion for summary judgment against remaining defendants Michael Brown and Credit Bureau Center, LLC filed 3/2/18; defendants' response filed 3/12/18; order granting motion for summary judgment entered 6/26/18.  
Notice of appeal by defendants Michael Brown and Credit Bureau Center, LLC filed 8/22/18.  
Motion by defendants Michael Brown, Credit Bureau Center, LLC to stay district court's final injunction pending appeal filed 8/31/18; response in opposition filed 9/17/18; district court order granting motion to stay in part, barring Commission from distributing funds recovered to consumers pending conclusion of appeal, but otherwise denying, entered 9/26/18.  
Amended notice of appeal of post-judgment order denying defendants' request to pay their attorneys from the receivership estate filed 10/26/18.  
Order consolidating appeals entered 11/16/18.  
Appellants' brief filed 12/5/18.  
Order denying defendants Michael Brown and Credit Bureau Center, LLC's motion for stay of judgment pending appeal entered 1/8/19.  
Commission's brief filed 3/12/19; appellants' reply brief filed 4/1/19.  
Oral argument heard 4/17/19.

***FTC v. CURE ENCAPSULATIONS, INC.***, No. 1:19-cv-0982 (E.D.N.Y.)

Parties: Cure Encapsulations, Inc.  
Naftula Jacobowitz a/k/a Nate Jacobs a/k/a Nat Jacobs

Assigned Attorneys: Michael Ostheimer (BCP/AP)  
Savvas Diacosavvas (NER)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Sections 5(a) and 12 of the FTC Act in connection with the labeling advertising, marketing, distribution, and sale a product that purportedly causes weight loss.

Status: Complaint filed 2/19/19.  
Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment entered 6/3/19.

***FTC v. DIGITAL ALTITUDE LLC***, No. 2:18-cv-00729 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Digital Altitude LLC  
Digital Altitude Limited  
Aspire Processing LLC  
Aspire Processing Limited  
Aspire Ventures Ltd  
Disc Enterprises Inc.  
RISE Systems & Enterprise LLC, a Utah LLC  
RISE Systems & Enterprise LLC, a Nevada LLC  
Soar International Limited Liability Company  
The Upside, LLC  
Thermography for Life, LLC d/b/a Living Exceptionally, Inc.  
Michael Force  
Mary Dee  
Morgan Johnson  
Alan Moore  
Sean Brown

Assigned Attorneys: Andrew Hudson (BCP/MP)  
Jody Goodman  
Laura Basford

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in connection with the marketing, advertising, promotion, and sale of an online business-coaching scheme.

Status: Complaint filed 1/29/18.  
Stipulated preliminary injunctions against defendants Sean Brown, Morgan Johnson, and Alan Moore entered 3/1/18.

Stipulated preliminary injunction against defendant The Upside, LLC entered 3/6/18.

Preliminary injunction against defendants Michael Force, Mary Dee, Thermography For Life, and Digital Attitude entered 3/9/18.

Stay to allow Commission approval of proposed settlements with defendants The Upside, LLC and Morgan Johnson entered 5/3/18.

Motion for default judgements against corporate defendants filed 5/14/18

Application for court approval of stipulated final orders for permanent injunction and monetary judgment against defendants The Upside LLC and Morgan Johnson filed 6/29/18.

Commission's motion for default judgment against Digital Altitude, LLC filed 8/28/18.

Joint motion to stay case pending Commissioners' review of final settlement agreement with defendant Alan Moore filed 9/18/18; motion granted 9/19/18; joint motion to continue stay filed 12/10/18; motion granted 12/11/18.

Joint motion to stay case pending Commissioners' review of final settlement agreement with defendant Mary Dee filed 10/31/18; motion granted 11/5/18.

Commission's motion for default judgment against defendants Digital Altitude LLC, Aspire Processing LLC, Disc Enterprises Inc, RISE Systems & Enterprise LLC (Utah), RISE Systems & Enterprise LLC (Nevada), Soar International Limited Liability Company, Digital Altitude Limited, Aspire Processing Limited, and Aspire Ventures Ltd filed 11/8/18; order granting motion in part, taking under submission request for entry of a final order and permanent injunction, entered 11/15/18.

Order granting Commission's application to stay case pending approval of proposed settlement entered 2/5/19.

Stipulated orders for permanent injunction and monetary judgment against defendants Alan Moore, Thermography for Life, LLC, Mary Dee, and Michael Force entered 3/4/19.

Default judgment and permanent injunction against defendants Digital Altitude, LLC, Aspire Processing LLC, Disc Enterprises, Inc., Rise Systems and Enterprise LLC (Utah), Rise Systems and Enterprise LLC (Nevada), Soar International Limited Liability Company, Digital Altitude Limited, Aspire Processing Limited, and Aspire Ventures Ltd entered 3/6/19.

***FTC v. DISABLED POLICE & SHERIFFS FOUNDATION***, No. 4:19-cv-00667 (E.D. Mo.)

Parties: Disabled Police and Sheriffs Foundation, Inc. d/b/a The American Police and Sheriffs Association d/b/a Police Officers Safety Association  
David Kenik  
State of Missouri (Plaintiff)



Assigned Attorneys: Tracy Thorleifson (NWR)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act and the Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with sham charity fundraising activities.

Status: Complaint filed 3/27/19.  
Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment entered 4/30/19.

***FTC v. D-LINK SYSTEMS, INC.***, No. 3:17-cv-00039 (N.D. Cal.)

Parties: D-Link Corporation  
D-Link Systems, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Kevin Moriarty (BCP/DPIP)  
Cathlin Tully  
Jarad Brown  
Katherine McCarron  
Brian Berggren

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in connection with the design, marketing, and sale of routers and internet protocol cameras.

Status: Complaint filed 1/5/17.  
Defendant D-Link System's motion to dismiss filed 1/31/17;  
Commission's opposition filed 2/14/17; reply filed 2/14/17; order granting in part and denying in part entered 9/19/17.  
Defendant D-Link Corporation's motion to dismiss for lack of jurisdiction filed 4/3/17; Commission's opposition filed 4/17/17; reply filed 4/24/17.  
Stipulated order dismissing defendant D-Link Corporation without prejudice entered 5/15/17.  
Cross-motions for summary judgment by Commission and defendant D-Link Systems filed 9/21/18; order denying motions entered 11/5/18.  
Order granting joint stipulation to continue trial date at least ninety days pending settlement approval entered 5/10/19.

***FTC v. DLUCA***, No. 0:18-cv-60379 (S.D. Fla.)

Parties: Thomas Dluca  
Louis Gatto  
Eric Pinkston  
Scott Chandler

Assigned Attorneys: Jason Moon (SWR)  
M. Hasan Aijaz

Nature of Action: Deceptive cryptocurrency chain referral scheme and earnings representations in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act.

Status: Complaint filed 2/20/18.  
TRO entered 3/12/18.  
Preliminary injunction as to defendants Dluca, Gatto, and Chandler entered 4/16/18; order modifying the preliminary injunction as to defendant Gatto entered 10/11/18.  
Defendants Chandler and Gatto's motion to dismiss filed 4/19/18; order denying motion entered 9/5/18.  
Stipulated preliminary injunction as to defendant Pinkston entered 4/20/18.  
Motion for order to show cause as to why defendant Chandler should not be held in contempt for violating the preliminary injunction filed 10/5/18; order denying motion entered 11/16/18.  
Order granting joint motion for sanctions for violation of preliminary injunction as to defendant Dluca entered 10/29/18.  
Preliminary injunction entered 2/16/19.  
Notice of settlement filed by defendant Eric Pinkston 5/29/19.  
Order staying proceedings until 9/5 entered 6/10/19.

***FTC v. ECOLOGICAL FOX, LLC***, No. 1:18-cv-03309 (D. Md.)

Parties: Ecological Fox, LLC  
Luke Chadwick  
Andris Pukke a/k/a Marc Romeo a/k/a Andy Storm  
Peter Baker  
Global Property Alliance, Inc. d/b/a Sanctuary Bay, Sanctuary Belize, The Reserve, Kanantik, Laguna Palms, Bamboo Springs, Eco Futures, Eco Futures Development, Eco Futures Belize, Sittee River Wildlife Reserve, Buy Belize, Buy International  
Sittee River Wildlife Reserve d/b/a Sanctuary Bay d/b/a Sanctuary Belize d/b/a The Reserve  
Buy Belize, Llc d/b/a Sanctuary Bay d/b/a Sanctuary Belize d/b/a The Reserve d/b/a Kanantik d/b/a Laguna Palms d/b/a Bamboo Springs  
Buy International, Inc. d/b/a Sanctuary Bay d/b/a Sanctuary Belize d/b/a The Reserve d/b/a Kanantik d/b/a Laguna Palms d/b/a Bamboo Springs  
Foundation Development Management Inc.  
Eco-Futures Development d/b/a Sanctuary Bay d/b/a Sanctuary Belize d/b/a The Reserve

Eco-Futures Belize Limited d/b/a Sanctuary Bay d/b/a Sanctuary Belize  
d/b/a The Reserve  
Power Haus Marketing  
Brandi Greenfield  
BG Marketing, LLC  
Prodigy Management Group, LLC  
John Usher  
Rod Kazazi  
Foundation Partners f/k/a Red Crane Advisors, Inc.  
Frank Costanzo a/k/a Frank Green a/k/a Frank Peerless Green a/k/a Frank  
Connelly a/k/a Frank Connelly-Costanzo  
Belize Real Estate Affiliates, LLC d/b/a Coldwell Banker Belize d/b/a  
Coldwell Banker Southern Belize  
Exotic Investor, LLC d/b/a Coldwell Banker Belize d/b/a Coldwell Banker  
Southern Belize  
Southern Blaze Realty, LLC d/b/a Coldwell Banker Belize d/b/a Coldwell  
Banker Southern Belize  
Sanctuary Belize Property Owners' Association d/b/a The Reserve  
Property Owners' Association  
Atlantic International Bank, Ltd.  
Angela Chittenden  
Beach Bunny Holdings, LLC  
The Estate of John Pukke a/k/a The Estate of Janis Pukke a/k/a The Estate  
of John Andris Pukke  
John Vipulis  
Deborah Connelly  
Newport Land Group, LLC a/k/a Laguna Palms a/k/a Sanctuary Belize  
a/k/a Bamboo Springs a/k/a The Reserve  
Michael Santos

Assigned Attorneys: Jonathan Cohen (BCP/ENF)  
Amanda Kostner  
Benjamin Theisman  
Elizabeth Averill  
Khouryanna DiPrima  
Theodore (Jack) Metzler (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and  
the Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the marketing and sale of  
real estate investments and related services.

Status: Complaint filed 10/31/18.  
TRO entered 11/11/18.  
Motion for interim preliminary injunction filed 11/15/18; response in  
opposition filed 11/16/18; reply filed 11/18/18.

Order extending TRO, to remain in effect as an interim preliminary injunction through the conclusion of a show cause hearing, entered 11/20/18.

Defendant Atlantic International Bank, LTD's motion to dismiss filed 12/14/18; response in opposition filed 1/22/19; defendant's response filed 1/31/19.

Defendant Andris Pukke's motion to transfer case to the Central District of California filed 12/14/18.

Notice of appeal from 11/20/18 order by defendant Atlantic National Bank filed 12/19/18.

Commission's amended complaint filed 1/15/19.

Order denying defendant Atlantic International Bank's motion to dismiss entered 2/1/19.

Order denying defendant Andris Pukke's motion to dismiss certain claims in the amended complaint entered 3/4/19.

Commission's motion to hold defendants John Vipulis, Peter Baker, Andris Pukke, and John Usher in contempt filed 3/5/19; response in opposition filed by defendant Peter Baker 3/7/19.

Preliminary injunction hearing held 3/11/19-3/22/19.

Motion to dismiss for failure to state a claim by defendant Michael Santos filed 3/18/19; Commission's response filed 4/1/19.

Order modifying interim preliminary injunction entered 3/28/19.

Order granting Commission's motion to stay proceedings as to defendants Frank Costanzo, Ecological Fox, LLC, and Deborah Connelly entered 4/4/19.

Motion to dismiss for lack of jurisdiction by defendant Atlantic International Bank, LTD filed 4/4/19; Commission's response filed 6/7/19.

Order denying defendant Anris Pukke's motion to dismiss entered 4/30/19.

Appellant Atlantic International Bank, LTD's opening brief filed 5/14/19; Commission's response brief filed 6/12/19.

***FTC v. ELECTRONIC PAYMENT SOLUTIONS OF AMERICA, INC.***, No. 2:17-cv-02535  
(D. Ariz)

Parties:                    Electronic Payment Solutions of America, Inc.  
                                  Electronic Payment Services, Inc.  
                                  KMA Merchant Services, LLC  
                                  Dynasty Merchants, LLC  
                                  Jay Wigdore  
                                  Michael Abelmessseh aka Michael Stewart  
                                  Nikolas Mihilli  
                                  Electronic Payment Systems, LLC  
                                  Electronic Payment Transfer, LLC  
                                  John Dorsey

Thomas McCann  
Michael Peterson

Assigned Attorneys: Bikram Bandy (BCP/MP)  
James Evans  
Jody Goodman  
Karen Hobbs  
Michelle Chua

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with telemarketing scheme that told consumers they could earn thousands of dollars by lending money to small businesses.

Status: Complaint filed 7/28/17.  
First amended complaint filed 3/9/18.  
Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment against defendants KMA Merchant Services LLC and Michael Abdelmesseh entered 6/13/18.  
Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment against Dynasty Merchants, LLC and Nikolas Mihilli entered 1/9/19.  
Motion to dismiss FTC's claim for monetary relief by Electronic Payment Systems, LLC, and Electronic Payment Transfer, LLC filed 4/24/19; Commission's opposition filed 5/8/19; defendants' reply filed 5/24/19.  
Joint motion to approve consent judgment against defendant Michael Peterson filed 5/9/19; defendants Electronic Payment Systems, LLC and Electronic Payment Transfer, LLC's response to motion filed 5/23/19; Commission's reply filed 5/29/19.

***FTC v. ELITE IT PARTNERS***, No. 2:19-cv-00125 (D. Utah)

Parties: Elite IT Partners d/b/a Elite IT Home  
James Michael Martinos

Assigned Attorneys: Amanda R. Grier (BCP/MP)  
Colleen Robbins  
Elsie Kappler

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, the Telemarketing Sale Rule, and Section 4 of the Restore Online Shoppers' Confidence Act in connection with computer technical support scheme.

Status: Complaint filed 2/25/19.  
TRO entered 2/26/19.  
Preliminary injunction entered 5/6/19.

***FTC v. F9 ADVERTISING LLC***, No. 3:19-cv-01174 (D.P.R.)

Parties: F9 Advertising LLC  
Gopalkrishna Pai  
Ace Initiative Group, LLC  
Connected AD Station LLC  
Fastlane Sales, LLC  
Hyper Marketing Solutions LLC  
Media Redefined LLC  
Primed Marketing LLC  
Responsive Media LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Michael Schaefer (BCP/ENF)  
Gregory J. Madden

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of the Restore Online Shoppers' Confidence Act in connection with "free trial" and negative option online marketing.

Status: Complaint filed 2/21/19.  
Order granting Commission's motion for entry of default against defendants Ace Initiative Group, LLC, Connected AD Station LLC, Fastlane Sales LLC, Hyper Marketing Solutions, LLC, Media Redefined, LLC, Primed Marketing, LLC, and Responsive Media, LLC entered 3/25/19.  
Order staying case pending the resolution of the ongoing criminal proceedings entered 5/16/19.

***FTC v. FAT GIRAFFE MARKETING GROUP***, No. 2:19-cv-00063 (D. Utah)

Parties: Fat Giraffe Marketing Group, LLC  
Cloud Click, LLC  
Elevate Consulting International, LLC  
Cove Solutions, LLC  
Lake View Holdings, LLC  
Gregory W. Anderson  
Garrett P. Robins

Assigned Attorneys: Savvas S. Diacosavvas (NER)  
Darren H. Lubetzky

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the Telemarketing Act, and the Business Opportunity Rule in connection with the defendants' promotion of business opportunities to consumers.

Status: Complaint filed 1/29/19.  
Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment against  
all defendants entered 2/12/19.

***FTC v. FEDERAL CHECK PROCESSING, INC.***, Nos. 16-3805, 16-3811 (2nd Cir.); No. 1:14-  
cv-00122 (W.D.N.Y.)

Parties: Federal Check Processing, Inc.  
Federal Recoveries, LLC  
Federal Processing Services, Inc.  
Federal Processing, Inc.  
United Check Processing, Inc.  
Central Check Processing, Inc.  
Central Processing Services, Inc.  
Nationwide Check Processing, Inc.  
American Check Processing, Inc.  
State Check Processing, Inc.  
Check Processing, Inc.  
US Check Processing, Inc.  
Flowing Streams, F.S., Inc.  
Mark Briandi  
William Moses  
Empowered Racing, LLC, Relief Defendant

Assigned Attorneys: Katherine M. Worthman (BCP/FP)  
Colin A. Hector  
Michele Arington (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5 and the Fair Debt  
Collection Practices Act in connection with debt collection operation.

Status: Complaint filed 2/24/14.  
Ex parte TRO entered 3/24/14.  
Stipulated preliminary injunction entered 3/25/14.  
Motion for summary judgment by Commission filed 8/27/15; opposition  
by William Moses filed 11/4/15; opposition by Mark Briandi filed  
12/3/15; Commission's reply filed 1/12/16.  
Order granting Commission's motion for summary judgment entered  
8/12/16.  
Judgment and permanent injunction entered 10/13/16.  
Notices of appeal filed 11/8/16.  
Briandi's opening brief filed 5/24/17; Commission's brief filed 8/23/17.  
Oral argument heard 10/3/18.  
Opinion affirming the district court's judgment entered 1/11/19.

***FTC v. FIRST CHOICE HORIZON LLC***, No. 6:19-cv-01028 (M.D. Fla.)

Parties: First Choice Horizon LLC  
First Southern Trust LLC  
First United Mutual LLC  
Premier Union Trust LLC d/b/a Second Choice Horizon  
South Premier Trust LLC  
Suncoast Mutual LLC  
Raymond Gonzalez  
Carlos S. Guerrero d/b/a CSG Solutions  
Joshua Hernandez

Assigned Attorneys: Barbara Bolton (SER)  
Michael A. Boutros

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the marketing and sale of credit rate reduction services.

Status: Complaint filed 6/3/19.  
TRO entered 6/3/19.  
Preliminary injunction hearing held 6/28/19.

***FTC v. GERBER PRODUCTS, CO.***, No. 2:14-cv-06771 (D. N.J.)

Parties: Gerber Products Co., d/b/a Nestle Nutrition, d/b/a Nestle Infant Nutrition,  
d/b/a Nestle Nutrition North America

Assigned Attorneys: Andrew David Wone (BCP/AP)  
Michelle K. Rusk  
Sarah Emily Botha

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Sections 5(a) and 12 of the FTC Act in connection with the marketing of an infant formula purporting to prevent allergies.

Status: Complaint filed 10/29/14.  
Case stayed until 2/25/16.  
Order extending stay of case entered 3/1/16.  
Defendant's motion to dismiss for lack of subject matter jurisdiction or to stay pending decision in *FTC v. Shire ViroPharma* (3d Cir.) filed 11/9/18; Commission's opposition filed 12/3/18; reply filed 12/10/18; motion withdrawn 4/3/19.  
Order administratively terminating action for 60 days, pending consummation of settlement, entered 4/30/19.  
Joint motion for entry of stipulated final judgment filed 6/28/19.



**FTC v. GLOBAL ASSET FINANCIAL SERVICES GROUP, LLC**, No. 3:19-cv-00055  
(W.D.N.C.)

Parties: Global Asset Financial Services Group, LLC  
Regional Asset Maintenance LLC  
Midwestern Alliance, LLC  
10D Holdings, Inc.  
Trans America Consumer Solutions, LLC  
LLI Business Innovations, LLC  
Tacs I, LLC  
Tacs II, LLC  
TacsIII, LLC  
Cedar Rose Holdings & Development, Inc.  
Ankh Ali  
Aziza Ali  
Kenneth Moody  
David Carr  
Jeremy Scinta  
Omar Hussain

Assigned Attorneys: Gregory Ashe (BCP/FP)  
Quinn Roman Martin  
Jesse Hubbard

Nature of Action: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act in connection with the defendants' debt collection practices, including attempts to harass consumers into paying debts that they do not actually owe.

Status: Complaint filed 2/4/19.  
TRO entered 2/4/19.  
Preliminary injunction as to defendants Omar Hussain, Cedar Rose Holdings & Development, Inc., Global Asset Financial Services Group, LLC, Ankh Ali, Aziza Ali, and Kenneth Moody entered 2/15/19.  
Preliminary injunction as to defendants 10D Holdings, Inc, Trans America Consumer Solutions, LLC, Midwestern Alliance, LLC, Tacs I, LLC, Tacs II, LLC, Tacs III, LLC, and David Carr entered 2/25/19.  
Preliminary injunction as to defendant Regional Asset Maintenance, LLC, entered 2/28/19.  
Preliminary injunction as to defendants LLI Business Innovations, LLC and Jeremy Scinta entered 3/5/19.

Stipulated final order for permanent injunction and settlement of claims as to defendants Ankh Ali, Aziza Ali, Kenneth Moody, and Global Asset Financial Services Group, LLC, entered 6/12/19.

***FTC v. GLOBAL COMMUNITY INNOVATIONS, LLC***, No. 5:19-cv-00788 (N.D. Ohio)

Parties: Global Community Innovations, LLC  
Innovated Health LLC  
Emerging Nutrition Inc.  
Premium Health Supplies, LLC  
Buddha My Bread LLC  
Innovated Fulfillment, LLC  
Ship Smart LLC  
Vista Media LLC  
Ash Abbas LLC  
DCT Marketing, Inc.  
RNA Enterprise, Inc.  
ROS Marketing & Consulting, LLC  
Fred Richard Guerra, III  
Lanty Paul Gray, Jr.  
Rafat Abbas  
Robby O. Salaheddine

Assigned Attorneys: Kristin Williams (BCP/AP)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Sections 5(a) and 12 of the FTC Act in connection with defendants' marketing and sale of purported cognitive enhancement products.

Status: Complaint filed 4/10/19.  
Amended complaint filed 4/29/19.  
Stipulated final judgments and orders for permanent injunction and other equitable relief against all defendants entered 4/30/19.

***FTC v. GRAND TETON PROFESSIONALS, LLC***, No. 3:19-cv-00933 (D. Conn.)

Parties: Grand Teton Professionals, LLC  
99<sup>th</sup> Floor, LLC  
Mait Management Inc.  
Demand Dynamics LLC  
Atomium Corps Inc. (WY)  
Atomium Corps Inc. (CO)  
Startup Masters NJ Inc. (WY)  
Startup Masters NJ Inc. (NJ)  
First Incorporation Services Inc. (WY)  
First Incorporation Services Inc. (FL)

Douglas C. Filter  
Marcio G. Andrade

Assigned Attorneys: Gregory Ashe (BCP/FP)  
Ioana Rusu Gorecki  
Elizabeth Kwok

Alleged Conduct: Unfair and deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, the Credit Repair Organizations Act, the Telemarketing Sales Rule, the Consumer Review Fairness Act, the Truth in Lending Act, and the Electronic Funds Transfer Act in connection with the marketing and sale of credit repair services.

Status: Complaint filed 6/17/19.  
TRO entered 6/18/19.

***FTC v. HIGHER GOALS MARKETING LLC***, No. 6:17-cv-02048 (M.D. Fla.)

Parties: Higher Goals Marketing LLC  
Sunshine Freedom Services LLC  
Brandun L Anderson  
Lea A. Brownell  
Melissa M. Deese  
Gerald D. Starr, Jr.  
Travis L. Teel  
Wayne T. Norris

Assigned Attorneys: Tejasvi Srimushnam (BCP/MP)  
Joshua A. Doan  
Rhonda Perkins

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the sale of interest-rate-reduction services to consumers struggling with credit card debt.

Status: Complaint filed 11/29/17.  
Stipulated preliminary injunctions against all defendants and order appointing receiver entered 12/28/17.  
Order granting motion to stay proceedings pending Commission approval of proposed settlements entered 6/8/18.  
Unopposed motion for entry of stipulated orders for permanent injunction and monetary relief as to defendants Brandun Anderson, Lea Brownell, Wayne Norris, Gerald Starr, Jr, Sunshine Freedom Services LLC, Travis Teel, and Melissa Deese filed 8/9/18.  
Stipulated orders for permanent injunction and monetary relief against

defendants Sunshine Freedom Services, LLC, Brandun Anderson, Lea Brownell, Melissa Deese, Wayne Norris, Gerald Starr, and Travis Teel entered 3/18/19.

***FTC v. HITE MEDIA GROUP LLC***, No. 2:18-cv-02221 (D. Ariz.)

Parties: Hite Media Group LLC d/b/a Premium Grants d/b/a PremiumGrants.com  
Premium Business Solutions LLC d/b/a Premium Grants d/b/a  
PremiumGrants.com d/b/a Premium Services  
Premium Domain Services LLC d/b/a Premium Grants d/b/a  
PremiumGrants.com d/b/a Premium Services  
2 Unique LLC d/b/a Unique Services d/b/a Unique Grants d/b/a  
UniqueGrants.com d/b/a Grant Support  
Amazing App LLC  
Michael Ford Hilliard  
Michael De Rosa  
Shawn Stumbo  
Tiffany Hoffman  
Jeremy Silvers

Assigned Attorneys: Ronnie Brooke (BCP/MP)  
Russell Deitch

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the sale and offering for sale of grants services.

Status: Complaint filed 7/16/18.  
Ex parte TRO with asset freeze entered 7/17/18.  
Stipulated preliminary injunction as to defendants Hilliard, Hoffman, De Rosa, Hite Media Group, LLC, 2 Unique, LLC, and Amazing App, LLC entered 7/31/18.  
Preliminary injunction as to unstipulated defendants Shawn Stumbo, Jeremy Silvers, Premium Business Solutions, and Premium Domain Services entered 7/31/18.  
Application for entry of default against defendants Shawn Stumbo, Premium Domain Services, Jeremy Silvers, and Premium Business Solutions filed 8/28/18; clerk's entry of default entered 8/29/18.  
Joint motion to stay for 60 days pending filing of stipulated orders for permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to defendants Michael Ford Hilliard, Amazing APP, LLC, Hite Media Group, LLC, Michael De Rosa, Tiffany Hoffman, and 2 Unique LLC filed 11/9/18; order granting motion entered 11/19/18.  
Stipulated orders for permanent injunction and monetary judgments against defendants 2 Unique, LLC, Tiffany Hoffman, Hite Media Group, LLC, Amazing App, LLC, Michael Ford Hilliard, and

Michael De Rosa entered 2/26/19.  
Commission's motion for default judgment as to defendants Shawn Stumbo, Jeremy Silvers, Premium Business Solutions, LLC, and Premium Domain Services, LLC filed 3/18/19.

***FTC v. HORNBEAM SPECIAL SITUATIONS, LLC***, No. 1:17-cv-03094 (N.D. Ga.)

Parties: Hornbeam Special Situations, LLC  
Cardinal Points Holdings, LLC  
Cardinal Points Management, LLC d/b/a Clear Compass Digital Group  
Gyroscope Management Holdings, LLC  
EDebitPay, LLC  
Platinum Online Group, LLC d/b/a Premier Membership Clubs  
Clickxchange Media, LLC  
iStream Financial Services, Inc.  
Jerry L. Robinson  
Earl G. Robinson  
James McCarter  
Keith Merrill  
Mark Ward  
Dale Paul Cleveland  
William R. Wilson  
Kris Axberg  
Richard Joachim  
Chet Andrews  
Patricia Brandmeier Robinson [executor of estate of Jerry L. Robinson]

Assigned Attorneys: R. Michael Waller (BCP/ENF)  
Korin Felix  
Elizabeth J. Averill  
Omolara Joseney  
Reenah L. Kim  
Hong Park  
Amanda C. Basta  
Kimberly L. Nelson  
Anna M. Burns

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, Section 4 of Restore Online Shoppers' Confidence Act, and the FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the marketing of various products or services, including memberships in online discount clubs, to consumers seeking payday, cash advance, or other subprime loans.

Status: Complaint filed 8/15/17.  
Consent motion to stay case for 90 days as to defendant Keith Merrill filed 10/6/17; order granting stay entered 10/11/17.

Consent motion to stay case and suspend filing obligations upon the death of defendant Jerry L. Robinson filed 11/15/17; order granting consent motion entered 11/21/17.

Motions to dismiss by defendants Mark Ward, Dale Paul Cleveland, EDebitPay, LLC, William Wilson, Kris Axberg, Richard Joachim, iStream Financial Services, Inc, and Earl Robinson filed 2/9/18; response in opposition 2/23/18; opinion and order denying motion entered 4/16/18.

Motion to dismiss by defendant by Patricia Brandmeier Robinson filed 3/22/18; response in opposition 4/5/18; order denying motion entered 4/16/18.

Motion to dismiss complaint for lack of subject matter jurisdiction by defendants Chet Andrews, Kris Axberg, Dale Paul Cleveland, EDebitPay,LLC, Richard Joachim, James McCarter, Earl G. Robinson, Patricia Brandmeier Robinson, Mark Ward, William R. Wilson, iStream Financial Services, Inc. filed 4/20/18; Commission's opposition filed 5/4/18; reply filed 5/11/18; order denying motion, but ordering supplemental briefing on part of the court's 4/16/18 opinion, entered 7/11/18.

Defendants' response to court's 7/11/18 request for supplemental briefing filed 7/23/18; Commission's response to court's request filed 7/30/18.

Order vacating part of court's 4/16/18 opinion and granting Commission leave to file an amended complaint entered 10/15/18.

Amended complaint filed 11/5/18.

Motions to dismiss for failure to state a claim by defendants iStream Financial Services, Inc, Chet Andrews, Patricia Brandmeier Robinson, Dale Paul Cleveland, EDebitPay, LLC, William Wilson, James McCarter, Mark Ward, and Earl Robinson filed 11/15/18; Commission's opposition filed 12/13/18; defendants' reply filed 2/8/19; order denying motions to dismiss entered 2/12/19.

***FTC v. HYLAN ASSET MANAGEMENT LLC***, No. 1:18-cv-00710 (W.D.N.Y.)

Parties: Hylan Asset Management LLC  
Worldwide Processing Group LLC d/b/a Worldwide Processing d/b/a  
Forward Movement Recovery d/b/a FMR  
Andrew Shaevel  
Frank A Ungaro, Jr.  
Bobalew Management Corporation  
Bobalew, LLC  
6P Management Corporation  
6P LLC  
Jon Purizhansky  
State of New York (Plaintiff)

Assigned Attorneys: Michael White (BCP/FP)  
Matthew Wilshire

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act in connection with the collection, marketing, and sale of phony and unauthorized debt portfolios.

Status: Complaint filed 6/26/18.  
Stipulated TRO entered 6/29/18.  
Stipulated preliminary injunction entered 7/9/18.  
Order granting joint motion to stay proceedings pending the Commission's approval of settlement with all defendants entered 4/26/19.  
Stipulated orders for permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to all defendants entered 6/27/19.

***FTC v. IBACKPACK OF TEXAS LLC***, No. 3:19-cv-00160 (S.D. Tex.)

Parties: iBackPack of Texas, LLC  
Douglas Monahan

Assigned Attorneys: Patrick Roy (BCP/FP)  
Daniel Hanks

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in connection with the defendants' deceptive practices in the course of multiple crowdfunding campaigns.

Status: Complaint filed 5/6/19.  
Order denying motion for permanent injunction as moot entered 5/21/19.

***FTC v. IMPETUS ENTERPRISE, INC.***, No. 8:18-cv-01987 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Impetus Enterprise, Inc. d/b/a Aiding Student Relief d/b/a Aiding Student and Teachers d/b/a Aidnest d/b/a Avec Staffing d/b/a National Education Student and Teacher  
Fig Tree and Co., LLC d/b/a Aiding Student Relief d/b/a Aiding Students and Teacher d/b/a Aiding Students and Teachers  
Tuan Dinh Duong a/k/a Thomas Duong a/k/a Thomas Dinh  
Brenda Avitia-Pena  
Brian Colombana d/b/a Futero  
Noel Solutions, LLC  
Jimmy Calderon  
Premier Capital Investments  
Capital Sun Investments

Assigned Attorneys: Barbara Chun (WRLA)  
Brian Welke (BCP/ENF)  
Joshua Millard

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the marketing and sale of student loan debt relief services.

Status: Complaint filed 11/6/18.  
Ex parte TRO with asset freeze and other relief entered 11/13/18.  
Preliminary injunction with asset freeze and other relief entered 11/29/18.  
Superseding preliminary injunction (adding defendants Capital Sun and Jimmy Calderon) entered 4/2/19.  
First amended complaint against Defendants Brenda Avitia-Pena, Jimmy Calderon, Capital Sun Investments, Brian Colombana, Tuan Dinh Duong, Fig Tree and Co., LLC, Impetus Enterprise, Inc., and Noel Solutions, LLC filed 4/3/19.  
Order staying proceedings as to defendants Jimmy Calderon and Capital Sun Investments, LLC pending Commission vote on settlement entered 5/6/19.  
Clerk's entry of default as to defendants Fig Tree and Co., LLC, Impetus Enterprise, Inc., and Noel Solutions, LLC entered 5/17/19.  
Order dismissing defendant Tuan Dinh Duong with prejudice entered 6/5/19.  
Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to defendants Capital Sun Investments, LLC, and Jimmy Calderon entered 6/18/19.  
Order staying proceedings as to defendant Brenda Avitia-Pena pending Commission vote on settlement entered 6/20/19.

***FTC v. INNOVATIVE DESIGNS, INC.***, No. 2:16-cv-01669 (W.D. Pa.)

Parties: Innovative Designs, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Alejandro Rosenberg (BCP/ENF)  
Omolara Bewaji Joseney

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in connection with the advertising of Insultex House Wrap.

Status: Complaint filed 11/3/16.  
Trial set for 7/29/19.

***FTC v. INTERBILL, LTD.***, No. 09-16179 (9th Cir.); No. 2:06-cv-01644 (D. Nev.)

Parties: Priority Payout, Corp. (successor to defendant InterBill, Ltd.)



Thomas Wells

Assigned Attorneys: Karen Hobbs (BCP/MP)  
Andrew Hudson  
Simon Han (BCP/ENF)

Alleged Conduct: Contempt proceeding for violations of a 2009 court order in connection with defendants' unauthorized debiting of consumers' checking accounts.

Status: Complaint filed 12/26/06.  
Permanent injunction entered 4/30/09.  
Notice of appeal by defendant Interbill, Ltd. filed 5/30/09.  
Order affirming the judgment of the District Court entered 6/28/10.  
Stipulated final judgment and orders for compensatory contempt relief, supplemental permanent injunction, and other equitable relief as to Thomas Wells, InterBill, Ltd., and Priority Payout Corp entered 4/10/19.

*FTC v. DAMIAN KUTZNER*, Nos. 17-56455, 17-56476 (9th Cir.); No. 8:16-cv-00999 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Damian Kutzner  
Vito Torchia, Jr.  
Jonathan Tarkowski  
R. Geoffrey Broderick  
Charles T. Marshall  
Brookstone Law P.C. d/b/a Brookstone Law Group (California)  
Brookstone Law P.C. d/b/a Brookstone Law Group (Nevada)  
Advantis Law P.C.  
Advantis Law Group P.C.  
Jeremy Foti

Assigned Attorneys: Benjamin Theisman (BCP/ENF)  
Gregory Madden  
Thomas Syta (WRLA)  
Michael Bergman (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the Mortgage Relief Services Rule in connection with the marketing of mortgage assistance relief services.

Status: Complaint filed 5/31/16.  
Ex parte TRO with asset freeze, appointment of receiver, limited expedited discovery, and other equitable relief entered 6/1/16.  
Stipulated preliminary injunction as to Vito Torchia Jr. entered 6/24/16.

Stipulated preliminary injunction as to Damian Kutzner, Charles Marshall, Jonathan Tarkowski, Advanits Law P.C. and Advantis Law Group P.C. entered 6/24/16.

Preliminary injunction as to Geoffrey Broderick, Brookstone Law P.C. (California and Nevada) entered 6/27/16.

Amended complaint filed 7/6/16.

Preliminary injunction as to Jeremy Foti entered 8/25/16.

Clerk's entry of default as to Brookstone Law (California), Brookstone Law PC (Nevada), Advantis Law, Advantis Law Group entered 9/8/16.

TRO with appointment of temporary receiver entered 10/19/16.

Preliminary injunction with appointment of receiver as to Jeremy Foti entered 11/15/16.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and other equitable relief as to Jonathan Tarkowski entered 1/6/17.

Order dismissing Damian Kutzner entered 2/1/17.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and other equitable relief as to Vito Torchia entered 2/15/17.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and other equitable relief as to R. Geoffrey Broderick entered 4/14/17.

Order granting Commission's motion for default judgment against defendants Brookstone Law P.C. (California), Brookstone Law P.C. (Nevada), Advantis Law P.C., and Advantis Law Group P.C. entered 8/28/17.

Order granting Commission's motion for summary judgment as to defendants Jeremy Foti and Charles T. Marshall entered 9/5/17.

Final judgment and order for permanent injunction as to defendants Brookstone Law P.C. (California), Brookstone Law P.C. (Nevada), Advantis Law P.C., and Advantis Law Group P.C. entered 9/8/17.

Final judgment and order for permanent injunction as to defendants Jeremy Foti and Charles T. Marshall entered 9/21/17.

Defendant Jeremy Foti's notice of appeal filed 9/25/17; amended notice of appeal filed 12/19/17.

Defendant Charles T. Marshall's notice of appeal filed 9/28/17.

Appellant Jeremy Foti's motion to dismiss appeal voluntarily filed 4/6/18; order dismissing appeal entered 4/9/18.

Appellant Charles T. Marshall's opening brief filed 9/14/18; Commission's answering brief filed 11/14/18; appellant's reply filed 4/25/19.

***FTC v. LENDING CLUB CORP.***, No. 3:18-cv-02454 (N.D. Cal.)

Parties: Lending Club Corporation d/b/a Lending Club

Assigned Attorneys: Katharine Roller (BCP/FP)  
Matthew Wilshire

David Lincicum (BCP/DPIP)  
Leah Frazier

**Alleged Conduct:** Deceptive and unfair acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the Privacy of Consumer Financial Information Rule in connection with the advertising, promotion, and sale of unsecured loans.

**Status:** Complaint filed 4/25/18.  
Motion to dismiss complaint filed 6/18/18; response in opposition filed 7/18/18; reply in support of motion filed 8/1/18; order granting motion in part and denying in part entered 10/3/18.  
First amended complaint filed 10/22/18.

***FTC v. LIFE MANAGEMENT SERVICES OF ORANGE COUNTY, INC.***, No. 6:16-cv-00982 (M.D. Fla.)

**Parties:** Life Management Services of Orange County, Inc.  
Loyal Financial and Credit Services LLC d/b/a FOC Credit and Reward Services  
IVD Recovery LLC  
KWP Services LLC  
KWP Services of Florida LLC  
LPSOFFLA LLC  
LPSOFFLORIDA LLC  
PW&F Consultants of Florida LLC  
UAD Secure Services LLC  
UAD Secure Service of Florida LLC  
URB Management LLC  
YCC Solutions LLC  
YFP Solutions LLC  
Kevin Guice  
Chase Jackowski  
Linda McNealy  
Clarence Wahl a/k/a Harry Wahl  
Karen Wahl  
Robert Guice (Relief Defendant)  
Timothy Woods (Relief Defendant)  
State of Florida (Plaintiff)

**Assigned Attorneys:** Tejasvi Srimushnam (BCP/MP)  
Joshua Doan

**Alleged Conduct:** Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, the Telemarketing Sales Rule, and the Florida Deceptive and Unfair Trade Practices Act in connection with the sale of debt relief services.

Status: Complaint filed 6/7/16.  
Stipulated preliminary injunction entered 6/30/16.  
Motion for summary judgment as to defendant Kevin Guice filed 5/1/17;  
opposition filed 5/30/17; Commission's reply filed 6/14/17; order  
granting summary judgment and permanent injunction entered  
12/7/18.  
Notice of stipulated proposed orders for permanent injunction and  
monetary judgment against all defendants except Kevin Guice filed  
9/1/17.  
Order for permanent injunction and monetary relief against Kevin Guice  
entered 12/7/18.  
Order granting summary judgment, with permanent injunction and  
monetary relief, against Kevin Guice entered 12/10/18.  
Stipulated final orders against defendants Chase Jackowski, Linda  
McNealy, Clarence Wahl, Karen Wahl, and corporate defendants  
Life Management Services of Orange County, LLC, Loyal  
Financial & Credit Services, LLC, IVD Recovery, LLC, KWP  
Services, LLC, KWP Services of Florida LLC, LPSOFFLA LLC,  
LPSOFFLORIDA L.L.C., PW&F Consultants of Florida LLC,  
UAD Secure Services LLC, UAD Secure Service of FL LLC, URB  
Management, LLC, YCC Solutions LLC, and YFP Solutions LLC  
entered 4/23/19.  
Stipulated final orders against relief defendants Robert Guice and Timothy  
Woods entered 4/23/19.

***FTC v. LIFEWATCH***, No. 16-2310 (7th Cir.); No. 1:15-cv-05781 (N.D. Ill.)

Parties: Lifewatch Inc. d/b/a Lifewatch USA and Medical Alarm Systems  
Evan Sirlin  
Safe Home Security, Inc.  
Medguard Alert, Inc.  
Michael May  
David Roman

Assigned Attorneys: David O'Toole (MWR)  
Samantha Gordon  
Roberto Menjivar

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive and unfair acts and practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the  
FTC Act, the Telemarketing Act, and the Telemarketing Sales Rule in  
connection with robocalls that pitched seniors "free" medical alert  
systems.

Status: Complaint filed 6/30/15.  
Motion for preliminary injunction filed 7/6/15.  
Preliminary injunction hearing held 12/14/15.

Preliminary injunction entered 3/31/16.  
Notice of appeal filed 5/31/16.  
Amended complaint filed 7/14/16.  
Order suspending appeal pending court-ordered mediation entered  
7/26/16.  
Defendants David Roman, Safe Home Security, Inc. and Medguard Alert,  
Inc.'s and defendant Mitchel May's motions for summary  
judgment filed 12/27/17; Commission's response in opposition to  
motions filed 2/26/18.  
Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 12/27/17; defendants'  
opposition filed 2/26/18; Commission's reply filed 3/19/18.  
Order denying parties' cross-motions for summary judgment entered  
9/24/18.  
Order denying Commission's motion to stay entered 4/23/19.  
Order granting the Commission and the State of Florida's renewed motion  
for stay entered 5/22/19.  
Joint motion for entry of stipulated order for permanent injunction and  
monetary judgment filed 6/24/19.

***FTC v. MAIL TREE***, No. 0:15-cv-61034 (S.D. Fla.)

Parties: Awards Research Consultant, LLC  
John Leon  
MCP Marketing Activities, LLC d/b/a Magellan Mail and Magellan  
Marketing  
Mail Tree Inc.  
Mailpro Americas Corp.  
Masterpiece Marketing, LLC d/b/a Affiliated Opportunities Group  
d/b/a Corporate Accounting Authority d/b/a Dispatch Notifications  
Services d/b/a Information Reporting Group d/b/a Priority  
Information Exchange  
Michael McKay Co.  
Matthew Pisoni  
Serena Pisoni  
Marcus Pradel  
Victor Ramirez  
Romeria Global, LLC d/b/a Lowenstein Varick and Nagel  
Spin Mail, Inc.  
Supreme Media, LLC  
Trans National Concepts, Inc.  
Vernier Holdings, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Guy Ward (MWR)  
Douglas McKenney

**Alleged Conduct:** Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in connection with sweepstakes scam.

**Status:** Complaint filed 5/18/15.  
Ex parte TRO entered 5/19/15.  
Preliminary injunction against all defendants except Marcus Pradel and Trans National Concepts entered 6/12/15.  
Stipulated preliminary injunction as to defendants Marcus Pradel and Trans National Concepts entered 6/12/15.  
Order staying case entered 6/12/15.

***FTC v. MOBE LTD.***, Nos. 18-13715, 18-13716 (11th Cir.); No. 6:18-cv-00862 (M.D. Fla.)

**Parties:** MOBE Ltd.  
MOBEProcessing.com, Inc.  
Transaction Management USA, Inc.  
MOBETraining.com, Inc.  
MOBE Pro Limited  
MOBE Online Ltd.  
9336-0311 Quebec, Inc. d/b/a Business Education Training  
MattLloydPublishing.com Pty Ltd.  
MOBE Inc.  
Matthew Lloyd McPhee a/k/a Matt Lloyd  
Russell W. Whitney, Jr.  
Susan Zanghi

**Assigned Attorneys:** Bikram Bandy (BCP/MP)  
Sung Kim  
Benjamin Davidson

**Alleged Conduct:** Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in connection with the marketing and sale of an online business education program.

**Status:** Complaint filed 6/4/18.  
Ex parte TRO entered 6/5/18; order extending TRO entered 6/19/18.  
Emergency motion for relief from TRO and, to extent necessary, to intervene by Qualpay, Inc. filed 6/22/18  
Motion to approve stipulated preliminary injunction as to Defendant Susan Zanghi filed 6/25/18; order granting motion entered 8/20/18.  
Motion to approve stipulated preliminary injunction as to Defendant Russell Whitney filed 7/3/18; order granting motion entered 8/20/18.  
Motion by interested party Synovus Bank for emergency relief from TRO and to intervene filed 7/10/18.

Ordering denying motion for emergency relief by intervenor Qualpay, Inc. and Synovus Bank entered 8/8/18.

Motion by Synovus Bank for clarification regarding order filed 8/13/18; order denying motion for clarification entered 8/16/18.

Notice of appeal (No. 18-13715), as to 8/8/18 court order, by Synovus Bank filed 8/31/18; order granting motion to voluntarily dismiss appeal entered 11/13/18.

Notice of appeal (No. 18-13716), as to 8/16/18 court order, by intervenor Qualpay, Inc. filed 8/31/18.

Order granting consent motion to stay all proceedings as to defendant Susan Zanghi filed 10/24/18.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment against defendant Susan Zanghi entered 12/6/18.

Clerk's entry of default against defendants 9336-0311 Quebec Inc., MOBE Inc., MOBE Ltd., MOBE Pro Limited, MOBEProcessing.com, Inc., MOBETraining.com, Inc., Matt Lloyd Publishing.com Pty Ltd., Matthew Lloyd McPhee, Mobe Online Ltd., and Transaction Management USA, Inc. entered 2/1/19.

Commission's motion for entry of default judgment and permanent injunction against 9336-0311 Quebec Inc., MOBE Inc., MOBE Ltd., MOBE Pro Limited, MOBEProcessing.com, Inc., MOBETraining.com, Inc., Matt Lloyd Publishing.com Pty Ltd., Matt Lloyd McPhee, Mobe Online Ltd., and Transaction Management USA, Inc., filed 3/15/19; response filed 4/15/19; order denying motion as moot entered 4/19/19.

Order granting Matthew Lloyd McPhee's motion to set aside clerk's default entered 4/19/19.

Commission's amended motion for entry of default judgment and permanent injunction against 9336-0311 Quebec Inc., MOBE Inc., MOBE Ltd., MOBE Pro Limited, MOBEProcessing.com, Inc., MOBETraining.com, Inc., Matt Lloyd Publishing.com Pty Ltd., Mobe Online Ltd., and Transaction Management USA, Inc. filed 5/2/19.

Order substituting Ingrid Whitney, in her capacity as the personal representative of the estate of deceased defendant Russell Whitney, as defendant entered 5/10/19; order granting motion to stay all proceedings against Ingrid Whitney entered 6/3/19.

Order granting appointment of a Special Receiver to investigate claims against Qualpay and Synovus Bank entered 5/23/19.

Intervener Synovus Bank's counterclaims and defenses filed 6/3/19; Commission's motion to limit intervention and set aside Synovus Bank's counterclaims and defenses filed 6/3/19; special receiver's motion to dismiss or strike Synovus Bank's counterclaims and defenses filed 6/24/19; intervenor Qualpay's answer, defenses, and cross-claim filed 6/24/19.

**FTC v. NATIONAL UROLOGICAL GROUP, INC.**, No. 10-125 (S. Ct); Nos. 17-15695, 14-13131, 14-13972, 09-10617 (11th Cir.); No. 1:04-cv-03294 (N.D. Ga.)

Parties: National Urological Group, Inc., d/b/a Warner Laboratories  
National Institute for Clinical Weight Loss, Inc.  
Hi-Tech Pharmaceuticals, Inc.  
Jared Wheat  
Thomasz Holda  
Michael Howell  
Stephen Smith  
Terrill Mark Wright, M.D.

Assigned Attorneys: Sydney M. Knight (BCP/AP)  
Tawana E. Davis  
Edward Glennon  
Mary Johnson  
Jack Metzler (OGC)  
Amanda Basta (BCP/ENF)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive practices in violation of Sections 5 and 12 of the FTC Act in connection with the sale of a purported weight loss product.

Status: Complaint filed 11/10/04.  
Final judgment entered 12/16/08.  
Notice of appeal filed 2/4/09.  
Opinion affirming district court order entered 12/15/09.  
Petition for rehearing *en banc* filed 1/29/10; order denying petition entered 4/26/10.  
Appellant's petition for a writ of certiorari filed 7/23/10; Commission's opposition filed 9/24/10; appellant's petition denied 11/1/10.  
Commission's motion to hold defendants Hi-Tech Pharmaceuticals, Stephen Smith and Jared Wright in contempt filed 11/1/11; defendant's opposition filed 12/2/11.  
Commission's motion to hold defendant Terrill Mark Wright in contempt filed 3/21/12.  
Order to show cause why defendants Wright, Hi-Tech Pharmaceuticals, Stephen Smith, and Jared Wright should not be held in contempt entered 5/11/12; response filed 11/13/12.  
Motion for contempt judgment filed 10/22/12; defendants' response filed 2/14/12; Commission's reply brief filed 1/10/13.  
Order finding defendants liable for contempt and ordering further proceedings on remedy entered 8/8/13.  
Trial on contempt remedies held on 1/21/14 - 1/24/14.  
Order holding defendants liable for contempt and directing compensatory sanctions to redress consumers entered 5/14/14.  
Defendants' notices of appeal filed 7/11/14 and 7/14/14.



Order by district court imposing coercive contempt sanction and directing that defendants Jared Wheat and Stephen Smith be incarcerated until they comply with product recall entered 9/2/14.

Petition for mandamus by defendants Wheat and Smith seeking to overturn coercive contempt order filed 9/4/14; denied 9/4/14.

Notice of appeal from coercive contempt order and emergency motion for a stay by defendants Wheat and Smith filed 9/4/14; Commission's opposition filed 9/5/14; motion for stay denied 9/5/14; motion to voluntarily dismiss appeal filed 9/8/14; appeal no. 14-13972 dismissed 10/15/14.

Motion to purge contempt defendants of contempt filed 9/26/14; Commission's opposition filed 9/26/14.

Second motion to purge contempt defendants or release contempt defendants pending determination of less restrictive mean to purge contempt filed 10/16/14; Commission's response filed 1/13/15; granted 1/20/15.

Motion to stay execution of judgment pending appeal entered 10/30/14; denied 1/23/15.

Appellants' briefs (No. 14-13131) filed 10/30/14.

Order that the US Marshal's Service release Jared Wheat and Stephen Smith from incarceration entered 11/10/14.

Commission's answering brief (No. 14-13131) filed 1/9/15; appellants' reply briefs filed 2/17/15.

Oral argument in Eleventh Circuit held 4/17/15.

Opinion vacating district court's judgment of contempt and remanding case to district court for further proceedings entered 5/5/15.

Commission's motion for clarification filed 6/4/15; Hi-Tech Pharmaceuticals response filed 6/18/15.

Commission's motion for entry of contempt judgement relating to Hi-Tech Pharmaceuticals, Inc., Jared Wheat, and Stephen Smith's violation of section VI and motion for compensatory sanctions filed 8/20/15; opposition filed 10/9/15; Commission's reply filed 10/26/15; order denying motion with leave to refile entered 11/4/15.

Contempt hearing held 3/27/17 - 4/7/17.

Final judgment against defendants Hi-Tech Pharmaceuticals, Inc., Jared Wheat, and Stephen Smith, and Terrill Mark Wright entered 10/31/17.

Defendants Hi-Tech Pharmaceuticals, Inc., Stephen Smith and Jared Wheat's notice of appeal filed 12/21/17; appellants' briefs filed 3/30/18; Commission's answering brief filed 6/14/18; reply briefs filed 7/30/18.

Oral argument scheduled for 7/26/19.

**FTC v. NEXT-GEN, INC.**, No. 4:18-cv-00128 (W.D. Mo.)

**Parties:** Next-Gen, Inc. d/b/a Award Notification Services d/b/a Cash Claim Advisors d/b/a Central Award Distribution d/b/a International Award Services d/b/a National Award Commission d/b/a Prize Notification Services Foundation d/b/a Security Dispatch, Ltd. Westport Enterprises, Inc. d/b/a Cash Claim Advisors d/b/a Security Dispatch, Ltd. d/b/a Award Prize Advisory d/b/a Award Review Board d/b/a National Awards Commission Opportunities Unlimited Publications, Inc. d/b/a Entertainment Awards Center d/b/a International Award Payment Center d/b/a North American Awards Center d/b/a Puzzle Mania Opportunities Management Co. Summit Management Team, LLC Contest America Publishers, Inc. d/b/a Entertainment Award Company d/b/a International Awards Payment Center Reveal Publications, LLC d/b/a National Research Company d/b/a Fortune Research Bureau d/b/a Financial Report Services Aosr Corporation d/b/a Subscription Reporter Corporation (formerly known as Sweepstakes Reporter Co., Inc.) d/b/a American Sweepstakes Publisher d/b/a National Bureau Lighthouse Fla Enterprises, LLC Gamer Designs, LLC Kevin R. Brandes William J. Graham Charles Floyd Anderson Montelago Marketing, Inc. State of Missouri (Plaintiff)

**Assigned Attorneys:** Sarah Shifley (NWR) Richard McKewen

**Alleged Conduct:** Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in connection with the worldwide distribution of deceptive sweepstakes and other prize mailers.

**Status:** Complaint filed 2/20/18. Motion for TRO filed 2/20/18; Commission's brief in support of motion filed 2/23/18; brief in opposition filed 3/8/18; reply filed 3/22/18; order granting TRO entered 7/17/18. Motion to dismiss case filed 3/29/18; brief in support filed 3/29/18; Commission's brief in opposition filed 4/1/18; reply filed 4/26/18; order denying motion entered 9/10/18. Amended complaint adding defendants Anderson and Montelago Marketing, Inc. filed 9/24/18. Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment entered

3/13/19.

***FTC v. OFFICE DEPOT, INC.***, No. 9:19-cv-80431 (S.D. Fla.)

Parties: Office Depot, Inc.  
Support.com, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Colleen Robbins (BCP/MP)  
Sung Wan Kim  
Thomas M. Biesty  
Clore Wack

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in connection with the defendants' marketing, offering for sale, or sale of computer security or technical support services.

Status: Complaint filed 3/27/19.  
Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment against Support.com, Inc. entered 3/28/19.  
Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment against Office Depot, Inc. entered 3/29/19.

***FTC v. OMICS GROUP, INC.***, No. 19-12538 (9th Cir.), No. 2:16-cv-02022 (D. Nev.)

Parties: OMICS Group, Inc. d/b/a OMICS Publishing Group  
iMedPub, LLC  
Conference Series, LLC  
Srinubabu Gedela

Assigned Attorneys: Iona Rusu (BCP/FP)  
Gregory Ashe  
Mariel Goetz (OGC)  
Joel Marcus

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act in connection with the publishing of online publications styled as academic journals.

Status: Complaint filed 8/25/16.  
Commission's motion for preliminary injunction filed 9/8/16.  
Defendants' motion to dismiss or, in alternative, summary judgment, filed 1/6/17; Commission's opposition filed 1/19/17; reply filed 2/2/17.  
Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 5/1/18; response to motion filed 6/22/18; reply filed 7/6/18.  
Defendants' motion for summary judgment filed 5/1/18; Commission's response to motion filed 5/22/18; reply filed 6/22/18.

Order granting Commission's motion for summary judgment and denying defendants' motion for summary judgment entered 3/29/19.  
Notice of appeal filed 4/11/19.  
Appellants' opening brief due 7/31/19.

***FTC v. PASSPORT IMPORTS, INC.***, No. 8:18-cv-03118 (D. Md.)

Parties: Passport Imports, Inc. d/b/a Passport Toyota  
Passport Motorcars, Inc. d/b/a Passport Infiniti of Alexandria d/b/a  
Passport Nissan of Alexandria d/b/a Passport Nissan of Marlow  
Heights  
Autos International, Inc. d/b/a Passport Infiniti of Suitland Jay A. Klein  
Everett A Hellmuth, III  
Temecula Equity Group, LLC d/b/a Overflowworks.com  
Jeffrey R Bush

Assigned Attorneys: Thomas Kane (BCP/FP)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in connection with the mailing tens of thousands of fake "urgent recall" notices to consumers to lure them to visit car dealerships.

Status: Complaint filed 10/10/18.  
Stipulated orders for permanent injunction as to defendants Passport Imports Inc.; Passport Motorcars, Inc; Autos International, Inc.; Temecula Equity Group, LLC; and Jeffrey Bush entered 11/27/18.

***FTC v. PETERSON***, No. 4:18-cv-00049 (D. Utah)

Parties: Travis Deloy Peterson a/k/a Travis Peterson a/k/a T. D. Peterson d/b/a  
Veterans of America d/b/a Telefunding d/b/a Vehicles for Veterans  
d/b/a Saving Our Soldiers d/b/a Donate Your Car d/b/a Donate  
That Car d/b/a Act of Valor d/b/a Medal of Honor

Assigned Attorneys: Fil M. de Banate (ECR)  
Adrienne Jenkins

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act and FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with soliciting contributions to a purported charity for veterans.

Status: Complaint filed 7/10/18.  
TRO entered 7/10/18.  
Stipulated preliminary injunction entered 7/20/18.  
Stipulated permanent injunction and monetary relief entered 4/1/19.

**FTC v. POINTBREAK MEDIA, LLC**, No. 0:18-cv-61017 (S.D. Fla.)

Parties: PointBreak Media, LLC d/b/a Point Break Media d/b/a Point Break Solutions d/b/a Kivanni Marketing  
DCP Marketing, LLC d/b/a Point Break  
Modern Spotlight Group LLC Modern Spotlight  
Modern Spotlight LLC  
Modern Internet Marketing LLC  
Modern Source Media, LLC Modern Source  
Perfect Image Online LLC  
Dustin Pillonato  
Justin Ramsey  
Aaron Michael Jones aka Michael Aaron Jones aka Mike Jones  
Ricardo Diaz  
Michael Pocker  
Steffan Molina  
Allstar Data, LLC  
National Business Listings, LLC  
Pinnacle Presence LLC  
Vincent Yates  
Daniel Carver  
Stephanie Watt (Relief Defendant)  
Jennefer Ramsey (Relief Defendant)

Assigned Attorneys: Brian M. Welke (BCP/ENF)  
Christopher J. Erickson  
Evan M. Mendelson

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in the course of marketing, offering for sale, and selling Google listing or search engine optimization services.

Status: Complaint filed 5/7/18.  
TRO entered 5/8/18.  
Preliminary injunction as to defendant Ricardo Diaz entered 5/25/18.  
Preliminary injunction as to defendants Steffan Molina and Perfect Image Online LLC entered 6/6/18.  
Clerk's entry of default as to defendants PointBreak Media; DCP Marketing, LLC; Modern Source Media, LLC; and Aaron Michael Jones entered 6/28/18.  
Order granting Commission's motion for preliminary injunction as to defendants Allstar Data, LLC, National Business Listings, LLC, Pinnacle Presence LLC, Vincent Yates, and Daniel Carver, and relief defendants Stephanie Watt and Jennefer Ramsey entered 8/13/18.

Motion to vacate and/or set aside preliminary injunction by relief defendants Jennefer Ramsey and Stephanie Watts filed 8/13/18; order granting motion, giving defendants time to respond to Commission's motion for preliminary injunction, entered 8/14/18. Defendants' response to Commission's motion for a preliminary injunction filed 8/16/18; Commission's reply file 8/23/18. Order granting preliminary injunction entered 8/30/18. Stipulated preliminary injunction as to relief defendants Stephanie Watt and Jennefer Ramsey entered 8/31/18. Commission's motion for summary judgment as to defendants Dustin Pillonato and Justin Ramsey filed 12/18/18; response in opposition filed 1/2/19; Commission's reply filed 2/4/19. Notice of settlement as to defendants Ricardo Diaz, Michael Pocker, Modern Spotlight LLC, Modern Spotlight Group LLC, Modern Internet Marketing LLC, Steffan Molina, Perfect Image Online LLC, and Pinnacle Presence LLC filed 3/5/19. Magistrate's report and recommendation that the Commission's motion for summary judgment be granted entered 3/11/19; defendants' objections filed 3/18/19; Commission's response filed 3/21/19; order granting Commission's motion for summary judgment entered 4/5/19. Notice of settlement and request for entry of stipulated orders against relief defendants Jennefer Ramsey and Stephanie Watt filed 4/4/19. Joint motion to set aside default and enter stipulated order of permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to defendant Daniel Carver filed 4/4/19; order granting joint motion entered 4/5/19. Commission's motion for default judgment and permanent injunction against defendants Aaron Michael Jones, Vincent Yates, Pointbreak Media, LLC, Modern Source Media, LLC, Allstar Data, LLC, DCP Marketing, LLC, and National Business Listings, LLC, filed 4/8/19; order granting motion for default judgment entered 4/25/19. Stipulated orders of permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to defendants Jennefer Ramsey, Stephanie Watt, Daniel Carver, Steffan Molina, Ricardo Diaz, Michael Pocker, Modern Spotlight, LLC, Modern Spotlight Group, LLC, Modern Internet Marketing, LLC, Dustin Pillonato, and Justin Ramsey entered 4/25/19.

***FTC v. PUBLISHERS BUSINESS SERVICES, INC.***, Nos. 17-15600; 11-17270 (9th Cir.); No. 2:08-cv-00620 (D. Nev.)

Parties: Publishers Business Services, Inc.  
Ed Dantuma Enterprises, Inc. d/b/a Publishers Direct Services d/b/a  
Publishers Business Services  
Persis Dantuma

Brenda Dantuma Schang  
Dries Dantuma  
Dirk Dantuma  
Jeffrey Dantuma  
Edward Fred Dantuma

Assigned Attorneys: Faye Chen Barnouw (WRLA)  
Maricela Segura  
Karen Goff (WRSF)  
Joel Marcus (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of section 5(a) and the Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the marketing and sale of magazine subscriptions.

Status: Complaint filed 5/14/08.  
Amended complaint filed 2/5/09.  
Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 7/31/09; opposition filed 11/23/09; reply filed 12/7/09.  
Order granting the Commission's motion for summary judgment entered 4/7/10.  
Order for permanent injunction as to all defendants entered 4/7/10.  
Commission's opening brief on the issue of damages filed 4/20/10.  
Final judgment as to all defendants entered 7/25/11.  
Commission's opening brief filed 2/13/12; defendants' answering brief filed 4/13/12; reply brief filed 5/11/12.  
Memorandum disposition remanding case to district court entered 9/19/13.  
Petition for writ of certiorari filed 2/27/14.  
Petition for writ of certiorari denied 6/9/14.  
Commission's motion for monetary judgment filed 5/31/16; defendants' brief on damages filed 7/19/16; Commission's reply filed 8/9/16.  
Order granting Commission's motion for judgment entered 3/2/17.  
Notice of appeal filed 3/31/17.  
Appellants' opening brief filed 8/30/17; Commission's answering brief filed 10/30/17; reply brief filed 12/20/17.  
Oral argument held 8/15/18.  
Opinion affirming judgment of the district court entered 8/31/18.  
Appellants' petition for rehearing filed 10/15/18; Commission's opposition filed 12/20/18.  
Order denying appellants' petition for rehearing *en banc* entered 6/19/19.

***FTC v. QUALCOMM, INC.***, No. 19-16122 (9th Cir.); 5:17-cv-00220 (N.D. Cal.)

Parties: Qualcomm, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: J. Alexander Ansaldo (BC/ACP)  
Dana Abrahamsen  
Joseph Baker  
Wesley Carson  
Kente Cox  
Rajesh James  
Philip Kehl  
Lin Kahn (WRSF)  
Jennifer Milici  
Michele Arington (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Unfair methods of competition in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in connection with defendant's maintenance of a monopoly in baseband processors and semiconductor devices.

Status: Complaint filed 1/17/17.  
Motion to dismiss filed 4/3/17; Commission's opposition filed 5/12/17; reply filed 5/16/17; order denying motion entered 6/26/17.  
Commission's motion for partial summary judgment filed 8/30/18; Qualcomm's opposition filed 9/24/18; reply filed 10/4/18.  
Order granting Commission's motion for partial summary judgment entered 11/6/18.  
Commission's pretrial brief filed 12/28/18; defendant's pretrial brief filed 12/28/18.  
Trial held 1/4- 1/29/19.  
Findings of fact and conclusions of law and final judgment in favor of the Commission, with a permanent injunction, entered 5/21/19.  
Notice of appeal filed 5/31/19.  
Motion for stay pending appeal by Qualcomm filed 5/28/19; Commission's opposition filed 6/11/19; Qualcomm's reply filed 6/18/19.

***FTC v. QUINCY BIOSCIENCE HOLDING CO., INC.***, No. 17-3745 (2nd Cir.); No. 17-3791 (2<sup>nd</sup> Cir); No. 1:17-cv-00124 (S.D.N.Y.)

Parties: Quincy Bioscience Holding Company, Inc.  
Quincy Bioscience, LLC  
Prevagen, Inc. d/b/a Sugar River Supplements  
Quincy Bioscience Manufacturing, LLC  
Mark Underwood  
Michael Beaman  
State of New York (Plaintiff)



Assigned Attorneys: Michelle Rusk (BCP/AP)  
Annette Soberatas  
Edward Glennon  
Bradley D. Grossman (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5(a) and 12 of the FTC Act, the New York Executive Law, and the New York General Business Law, in connection with the marketing of defendants' purported memory improvement supplement, Prevagen.

Status: Complaint filed 1/9/17.  
Motion to dismiss for failure to state a claim filed 4/6/17; Commission's opposition filed 4/25/17; reply filed 5/5/17; order granting motion entered 9/29/17.  
Commission's notice of appeal filed 11/21/17.  
Commission's opening brief filed 2/28/18; appellees' brief filed 5/30/18; Commission's reply filed 6/13/18; appellees' corrected brief filed 6/15/18; Commission's corrected brief filed 7/17/18.  
Oral argument held 2/8/19.  
Order vacating the judgment of the District Court and remanding the case for further proceedings entered 2/21/19.  
Corporate defendants' supplemental brief on motions to dismiss filed 6/17/19.  
Individual defendants' supplemental brief on motions to dismiss filed 6/18/19.

***FTC v. SHIRE VIROPHARMA, INC.***, No. 18-1807 (3rd Cir.); No. 1:17-cv-00131 (D. Del.)

Parties: Shire ViroPharma, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Bradley Albert (BC/HC)  
June Im  
Meredyth Andrus  
Joseph Matthias  
Steve Vieux  
James Weingarten  
Matthew Hoffman (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Unfair methods of competition in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in connection with Defendant's serial, sham petitioning to the FDA to delay generic competition to its branded prescription drug, Vancocin HCl Capsules.

Status: Complaint filed 2/7/17.  
Motion to dismiss filed 4/10/17; Commission's opposition filed 5/25/17;

reply filed 6/26/17.  
Order granting motion to dismiss entered 3/20/18.  
Commission's notice of appeal filed 4/11/18.  
Commission opening brief filed 6/19/18; appellee's brief filed 8/2/18;  
Commission's reply brief filed 8/30/18.  
Oral argument held 12/11/18.  
Opinion affirming the judgment of the district court entered 2/25/19.

***FTC v. SIMPLE HEALTH PLANS, LLC***, No. 19-10840, No. 19-11932 (11<sup>th</sup> Cir.), No. 18-cv-62593 (S.D. Fla.)

Parties: Simple Health Plans, LLC  
Health Benefits One LLC d/b/a Health Benefits Center d/b/a Simple Health d/b/a Simple Health Plans d/b/a Simple Insurance d/b/a Simple Insurance Plans d/b/a Simple Auto d/b/a Simple Home d/b/a Simple Home Plans d/b/a Simple Care d/b/a Simple Life d/b/a National Dental Savings  
Health Center Management LLC  
Innovative Customer Care LLC  
Simple Insurance Leads LLC d/b/a Health Insurance Services  
Senior Benefits One LLC  
Steven J. Dorfman

Assigned Attorneys: Elizabeth Scott (MWR)  
James Davis  
Joannie Wei  
Kenneth Hawkins  
Roberto Menjivar  
Nathaniel Al-Najjar

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the sale and marketing of limited benefit insurance plans and medical discount memberships.

Status: Complaint filed 10/29/18  
TRO entered 10/31/18; order extending TRO entered 12/21/18.  
Notice of appeal by defendant Steven J. Dorfman as to order on motion for temporary restraining order, order on motion to appoint receiver, order on motions for order to show cause, and order on motion to strike filed 3/4/19.  
Order of dismissal from USCA for lack of jurisdiction entered 4/16/19.  
Preliminary injunction hearing held 4/16/19.  
Preliminary injunction entered 5/14/19.  
Notice of appeal of preliminary injunction filed 5/15/19.

Order by district court denying defendants' motion to stay proceedings pending appeal entered 5/31/19.  
Order by 11<sup>th</sup> Circuit denying appellant Steven Dorfman's motion to stay lower court proceedings entered 6/11/19.  
Defendant Steven Dorfman's motion to dissolve preliminary injunction filed 6/4/19; Commission's opposition filed 6/17/19.  
Appellant Steven Dorfman's opening brief filed 5/24; Commission's brief due 7/24/19.

***FTC v. STARWOOD CONSULTING, LLC***, No. 4:18-cv-02368 (S.D. Tex.)

Parties: Star Wood Consulting, LLC d/b/a Corporate Compliance Services  
Thomas Henry Fred, Jr.  
State of Florida (Plaintiff)

Assigned Attorneys: Luis Gallegos (SWR)  
Reid Tepfer

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Florida Deceptive and Unfair Trade Practices Act in connection posing as a government entity or authority in the sale of labor law posters.

Status: Complaint filed 7/10/18.  
Order granting joint motion for preliminary injunction entered 9/6/18.  
Amended complaint against all defendants filed 3/27/19.

***FTC v. SURESCRIPTS, LLC***, No. 1:19-cv-01080 (D.D.C.)

Parties: Surescripts, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Bradley Albert (BC/HC)  
Markus Meier  
D. Patrick Huyett  
David B. Schwartz  
Joseph P. Mathias  
Tanya O'Neil

Alleged Conduct: Unfair methods of competition in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, in connection with the defendants' anticompetitive scheme to maintain its monopolies over two separate, complementary markets: electronic prescription routing and eligibility.

Status: Complaint filed 4/17/19.

***FTC v. TATE'S AUTO CENTER***, No. 3:18-cv-008176 (D. Ariz.)

Parties: Tate's Auto Center of Winslow Inc.  
Tates Automotive Inc.  
Tate Ford Lincoln Mercury Inc. d/b/a Tate's Auto Center  
Tate's Auto Center of Gallup Inc.  
Richard Berry  
Linda Tate

Assigned Attorneys: Katherine Worthman (BCP/FP)  
Naomi Takagi  
Stephanie Cox

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act and the Truth in Lending Act and its implementing regulations in connection with the marketing, sale, and financing of motor vehicles.

Status: Complaint filed 7/31/18.  
Defendant's notice of filing bankruptcy filed 3/19/19; Commission's response filed 3/27/19.

***FTC v. TRIANGLE MEDIA CORP.***, No. 18-56161 (9th Cir.); No. 3:18-cv-01388 (S.D. Cal.)

Parties: Triangle Media Corporation aka Triangle CRM aka Phenom Health aka Beauty and Truth aka E-Cigs  
Jasper Rain Marketing, LLC aka Phenom Health aka Cranium Power  
Hardwire Interactive, Inc. aka Phenom Health aka Beauty and Truth aka E-Cigs  
Global Northern Trading Limited  
Devin Keer  
Brian Phillips

Assigned Attorneys: Samantha Gordon (MWR)  
Matthew Wernz  
Douglas McKenney  
Michele Arington (OGC)  
Olga Vaytsman

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, the Restore Online Shoppers' Confidence Act, and the Electronic Fund Transfer Act in connection with the online advertising and sale of skincare products, e-cigarettes, and dietary supplements.

Status: Complaint filed 6/25/18.  
Ex parte TRO with asset freeze and receivership entered 6/29/18; order extending TRO entered 7/9/18.

Preliminary injunction entered 8/24/18.  
Notice of appeal of preliminary injunction by Hardwire Interactive filed 8/27/18.  
Opening brief by appellant filed 9/25/18; answering brief by FTC filed 10/23/18; reply brief filed 11/13/18.  
Oral argument held 3/7/19.  
Opinion affirming the district court's grant of a preliminary injunction entered 3/19/19.  
Order granting joint motion to stay as to all defendants entered 4/8/19.  
Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to all defendants entered 5/30/19.

***FTC v. VYLAH TEC LLC***, No. 17-13481 (11th Cir.); No. 2:17-cv-00228 (M.D. Fla.)

Parties: Vylah Tec LLC d/b/a VTec Support  
Express Tech Help LLC  
Tech Crew Support LLC  
Angelo J. Cupo  
Robert Cupo  
Dennis Cupo  
State of Florida (Plaintiff)

Assigned Attorneys: Robin Rock (SER)  
Sana Chriss  
Mark Hegedus (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in connection with the advertising, marketing, distribution, and sale of computer technical support services and security software.

Status: Complaint filed 5/1/17.  
TRO entered 5/12/17.  
Preliminary injunction order entered 6/4/17.  
Notice of appeal to 11th Cir. filed 8/1/17.  
Appellants' opening brief filed 9/25/17; appellee's brief filed 11/7/17; reply filed 11/21/17; opinion affirming entry of preliminary injunction, but partially vacating and remanded for additional findings on application of asset freeze to individual defendants, entered 3/8/18.  
Defendant Dennis Cupo's motion for summary judgment filed 6/5/18; Commission's response filed 6/20/18; Dennis Cupo's objection to Commission's response filed 6/27/18.  
Commission's motion to dismiss defendant Dennis Cupo filed 9/19/19; order granting motion for voluntary dismissal with prejudice of defendant Dennis Cupo entered 9/20/19; Cupo's motion for summary judgment denied as moot 9/20/19.

Motion for partial summary judgment by defendants Angelo J. Cupo, Robert Cupo, Express Tech Help LLC, Tech Crew Support LLC, and Vylah Tec LLC filed 10/17/18; response in opposition filed 11/2/18; reply filed 11/7/18.

Commission's motion for summary judgment against defendants Vylah Tec LLC, Express Tech Help LLC, Tech Crew Support LLC, Angelo Cupo, and Robert Cupo filed 10/17/18; response in opposition filed 11/8/18; reply filed 11/15/18.

Order denying defendants Angelo J. Cupo, Robert Cupo, Express Tech Help LLC, Tech Crew Support LLC, and Vylah Tec LLC's motion for partial summary judgment, granting in part and denying in part the Commission's motion for summary judgment, and granting a permanent injunction against defendants Angelo Cupo and Robert Cupo entered 1/9/19.

Notice of appeal by defendants filed 1/25/19.

Order by district court vacating in part its order pertaining to the permanent injunctive relief entered against defendants Angelo Cupo and Robert Cupo and denying as moot motion to stay pending appeal entered 2/11/19.

Appellants' motion to stay lower court proceedings filed 2/12/19. Commission's opposition filed 2/15/19; order denying stay and remanding to allow district court to vacate its permanent injunction order entered 2/26/19.

Order by the district court vacating in part its order pertaining to the permanent injunctive relief entered against defendants Angelo and Robert Cupo entered 3/5/19.

Trial held 3/5/19-3/8/19.

Order dismissing appeal for lack of jurisdiction entered 5/6/19.

Final judgment with permanent injunction entered 6/7/19.

***FTC v. WORLDWIDE EXECUTIVE JOB SEARCH SOLUTIONS, LLC***, No. 4:19-cv-00495  
(S.D. Tex.)

Parties: Worldwide Executive Job Search Solutions, LLC d/b/a WWEJSS,  
Seven Figure Careers, 7FigRecruiters, 7FC, Finnborg Switzer,  
ResumeterPro, Creating Job Opportunity, Confidential Jobs Only,  
CJOnly, and CJO Private Equity  
PrivateEquityHeadhunters.com LLC, also d/b/a Private Equity  
Headhunters, PE Headhunters, and PEHHS.com, LLC  
Craig N. Chrest

Assigned Attorneys: Ann D. LeJeune (SWR)  
James R. Golder  
Eric Nelson Roberson

Nature of Action: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with job placement and resume repair services.

Status: Complaint filed 2/13/19.  
TRO entered 2/22/19.  
Preliminary injunction entered 3/25/19.

**CIVIL PENALTY AND ENFORCEMENT CASES\***

**(A) Consumer Protection**

***UNITED STATES v. BARTOLI***, No. 6:19-cv-01160 (M.D. Fla.)

Parties: Derek Jason Bartoli a/k/a Derek Bartoli d/b/a Phoenix Innovative Solutions, LLC, Marketing Consultation Solutions LLC, and KimRain Marketing LLC.

Assigned Attorneys: Lacy Harwell (AUSA)  
Rachel Baron (DOJ/CPB)

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the operation of autodialer to initiate illegal robocalls, calls to numbers on the Do-Not-Call registry, and calls with spoofed caller IDs.

Status: Complaint filed 6/21/19.  
Stipulated permanent injunction and monetary relief entered 6/27/19.

***FTC v. CHRISTIANO***, No. 8:18-cv-00936 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: James Christiano  
NetDotSolutions, Inc.  
TeraMESH Networks, Inc.  
Andrew Salisbury  
World Connection, LLC  
World Connection USA, LLC  
World Connection, SA

Assigned Attorneys: James Evans (BCP/MP)

---

\* Includes all suits in which civil penalties are sought; consumer redress, injunctions, and ancillary equitable relief may also be sought.

Ian Barlow

**Alleged Conduct:** Violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with defendants' facilitating of robocalls, calls to phone numbers on the National Do-Not-Call Registry, calls with spoofed caller IDs, and abandoned calls.

**Status:** Complaint filed 5/31/2018.  
Stipulated final order for permanent injunction and civil penalty judgment as to defendants Andrew Salisbury, World Connection LLC, World Connection, S.A. entered 9/18/18.  
Stipulated final order for permanent injunction and civil penalty judgment as to defendants James Christiano, NetDot Solutions, Inc., and TerMESH Networks, Inc. entered 3/26/19.  
Default judgment and final order for permanent injunction as to defendant World Connection USA, LLC, entered 4/1/19.

***FTC v. DAY PACER LLC***, No. 1:19-cv-01984 (N.D. Ill.)

**Parties:** Day Pacer LLC, f/k/a College Criteria LLC, d/b/a Edutrek, EdSoup, Our School Search, College Info and Degree Spots  
Edutrek L.L.C. d/b/a EdSoup  
Raymond Fitzgerald  
Ian Fitzgerald  
David Cumming

**Assigned Attorneys:** Jason Schall (BCP/FP)  
Leah Frazier  
Patrick Roy  
William Joseph Hodor

**Alleged Conduct:** Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the defendants' telemarketing business.

**Status:** Complaint filed 3/22/19.  
Status hearing held 6/10/19.

***UNITED STATES v. DISH NETWORK LLC***, No. 17-3111 (7th Cir.); 13-2282 (7th Cir.); 3:09-CV-3073 (C.D. Ill.)

**Parties:** Dish Network L.L.C.

**Assigned Attorneys:** Russell Deitch (BCP/MP)  
Patrick Runkle (DOJ/CPB)  
Lisa Hsiao



Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5 and the Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with abandoned calls and telephone calls to consumers on the National Do Not Call registry.

Status: Complaint filed 3/25/09.  
Defendant's motion to dismiss filed 5/21/09; plaintiff's response in opposition filed 7/17/09; defendant's reply filed 7/27/09; plaintiff's sur-reply filed 9/11/09.  
Order denying motion to dismiss entered 11/2/09.  
Defendant's motion for reconsideration or interlocutory appeal filed 11/19/09; plaintiff's response filed 12/22/09; order denying motion entered 2/4/10.  
Memorandum in opposition to motion/petition filed 5/21/10.  
Motion to compel 7/30/10; memorandum in opposition to motion 8/16/10; memorandum in support of motion filed 9/24/10; order on motion to compel entered 12/9/10.  
Appeal of magistrate judge decision to district court filed 12/29/10.  
Defendants' motion to stay action under doctrine of primary jurisdiction filed 12/21/10; opposition filed 1/12/11.  
Order directing the parties to file an administrative complaint with the FCC, to obtain its interpretation of statutory language entered 2/4/11.  
Order vacating magistrate's decision denying Commission's motion for leave to file second amended complaint entered 3/12/13.  
Amended complaint filed 3/12/13.  
Petition for writ of mandamus by Dish Network filed 6/12/13.  
Order denying petition for mandamus entered 7/3/13.  
United States' motion for summary judgment filed 12/23/13; opposition filed 3/6/14.  
Motion for summary judgment by Dish Network filed 1/6/14; opposition filed 5/30/14.  
United States' motion for summary judgment filed 5/30/14.  
Order directing parties to file memoranda addressing issue of deference to agency's interpretation of its regulations entered 7/8/14; parties' memoranda of law filed 8/8/14; parties' responses to each other's memoranda filed 8/22/14.  
Order granting partial summary judgment for United States and partial summary judgment for Dish Network entered 12/12/14.  
Motion for sanctions by United States and state plaintiffs filed 7/20/15; memorandum in opposition filed 8/21/15; reply filed 9/10/15; order granting motion in part and denying in part entered 10/13/15.  
Trial on civil penalties held 1/19/16-2/17/16.  
Trial on permanent injunctive relief held 10/25/16-11/2/16.  
Stipulated order for permanent injunction and civil penalty judgment entered 6/5/17.

Defendant's notice of appeal filed 10/6/17.  
Appellant-defendant's brief filed 2/22/18; United States' brief filed  
6/22/18; reply brief filed 8/10/18.  
Oral argument held 9/17/18.

***FTC v. GOTRA***, No. 1:18-cv-10548 (D. Mass.)

Parties: Jasjit Gotra  
Alliance Security Inc. f/k/a Versatile Marketing Solutions, Inc. f/k/a VMS  
Alarms f/k/a VMS f/k/a Alliance Home Protection f/k/a AH  
Protection  
Jessica Merrick a/k/a Jessica Bright a/k/a Jessica Dudlicek  
Defend America LLC  
Kevin Klink  
Power Marketing Promotions LLC d/b/a J Tele Alarms

Assigned Attorneys: Danielle M. Estrada (BCP/MP)  
Ian L. Barlow

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC, the  
FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule, and the Fair Credit Reporting Act in  
connection with the marketing and sale of home security systems and  
monthly alarm monitoring services.

Status: Complaint filed 3/22/18.  
Consent motions to approve stipulated final orders for permanent  
injunctions and civil penalty judgments as to defendants Kevin  
Klink and Power Marketing Promotions LLC, and as to Jessica  
Merrick and Defend America LLC filed 3/22/2018.  
Motion for preliminary injunction as to defendants Jasit Gotra and  
Alliance Security filed 3/23/18.  
Defendant Jasit Gotra's motion to dismiss filed 5/14/18; Commission's  
opposition filed 5/24/18.  
Stipulated final order for permanent injunction and civil penalty judgment  
as to defendants Power Marketing Promotions, Kevin Klink,  
Defend America, and Jessica Merrick entered 5/16/19.  
Joint opposition by defendants Gotra and Alliance Security, Inc. to the  
Commission's motion for preliminary injunction filed 6/3/19;  
Commission's reply filed 6/17/19.

***UNITED STATES v. ISPRING WATER SYSTEMS, LLC***, No. 1:19-cv-01620 (N.D. Ga.)

Parties: Ispring Water Systems, LLC  
Zhuangyong Chen a/k/a John Chen  
Pearl Cai a/k/a Yunzhu Cai

Assigned Attorneys: Julia Ensor (BCP/ENF)

Alleged Conduct: False, deceptive, or unsubstantiated U.S.-origin claims for imported products in violation of an order previously issued by the Commission.

Status: Complaint filed 4/10/19.  
Stipulated order for civil penalties, permanent injunction, and other relief entered 4/19/19.

***UNITED STATES v. MEDIA MIX 365, LLC***, No. 8:19-cv-01243 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Media Mix 365, LLC d/b/a Solar Research Group and Solar Nation  
Nicolas Long  
Nicole J. Long a/k/a Nicole Leonard a/k/a Nicole Leonard-Long

Assigned Attorneys: Rachel Baron (DOJ)  
Barbara Chun (WRLA)

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with defendants' harassing telemarketing calls and calls to numbers on the Do-Not-Call registry.

Status: Complaint filed 6/21/19.  
Stipulation for order for permanent injunction and civil penalties filed 6/21/19.

***UNITED STATES v. MUSICAL.LY***, No. 2:19-cv-01439 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Musical.Ly  
Musical.Ly, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Kendrack Lewis (DOJ/CP)

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the Children's Online Privacy Protection Rule in connection with the advertising, marketing, and distribution of mobile applications.

Status: Complaint filed 2/27/19.  
Stipulated order for civil penalties, permanent injunction, and other relief entered 3/27/19.

***UNITED STATES v. UNIXIZ, INC.***, No. 5:19-cv-02222 (N.D. Cal.)

Parties: Unixiz, Inc. d/b/a i-Dressup.com  
Zhijun Liu  
Xichen Zhang

Assigned Attorneys: Kendrack Danquel Lewis (DOJ/CP)

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the Children's Online Privacy Protection Rule in connection with the advertising, marketing, and distribution of online content and website activities.

Status: Complaint filed 4/24/19.  
Stipulated order for civil penalties, permanent injunction, and other relief entered 5/2/19.

**(B) Competition**

***UNITED STATES v. CANON INC.***, No. 1:19-cv-01680 (D.D.C.)

Parties: Canon Inc.  
Toshiba Corporation

Assigned Attorneys: Kenneth Libby (BC/Compliance)

Alleged Conduct: Violation of the notice and waiting requirements of the Hart-Scott-Rodino Antitrust Improvements Act of 1976, with respect to the acquisition of Toshiba Medical Systems Corporation from Toshiba Corporation.

Status: Complaint filed 6/10/19.

***UNITED STATES v. DOLAN***, No. 1:18-cv-02858 (D.D.C.)

Parties: James L. Dolan

Assigned Attorneys: Kenneth A. Libby (BC/Compliance)

Alleged Conduct: Violation of the notice and waiting requirements of the Hart-Scott-Rodino Antitrust Improvements Act of 1976, with respect to the acquisition of voting securities of the Madison Square Garden Company.

Status: Complaint filed 12/6/18.  
Order and final judgment entered 4/17/19.

**SUBPOENA AND CID ENFORCEMENT PROCEEDINGS**

***FTC v. FULLY ACCOUNTABLE, LLC***, No. 5:19-mc-00021 (N.D. Ohio)

Parties: Fully Accountable, LLC  
Sarah Scava

Assigned Attorneys: Burke W. Kappler (OGC)

Nature of Action: Petition to enforce CIDs seeking testimony.

Status: Petition filed 2/4/19.  
Order to show cause entered 5/7/19.  
Show cause hearing held 5/20/19.  
Order compelling compliance with CIDs entered 5/28/19.

***FTC v. FULLY ACCOUNTABLE, LLC***, No. 5:18-mc-00054 (N.D. Ohio)

Parties: Fully Accountable, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Burke W. Kappler (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Petition to enforce a CID.

Status: Petition filed 6/8/18.  
Order to show cause entered 6/13/18.  
Show cause hearing held 8/9/18.  
Order compelling compliance with CID entered 8/13/18.  
Petition by Fully Accountable to overturn Commission's denial of a  
petition to quash or limit CIDs seeking testimony filed 11/28/18;  
Commission's opposition filed 2/4/19.

**SUITS TO ENJOIN FTC ACTION AND OTHER DEFENSIVE LITIGATION**

***AMERICAN FINANCIAL BENEFITS CENTER v. FTC***, No. 18-16034 (9th Cir.); No. 4:17-cv-4817 (N.D. Cal.)

Parties: American Financial Benefits Center  
Ameritech Financial  
Financial Education Benefits Center  
Brandon Frere

Assigned Attorneys: Imad Abyad (OGC)

Roberta Tonelli (WRSF)  
Sarah Schroeder  
Evan Rose

Nature of Action: Action seeking a judicial declaration that the debt relief provision of the Telemarketing Sales Rule (TSR) will not apply to plaintiffs' businesses or, alternatively, that plaintiffs are fully complying with the legal requirements outlined by the TSR.

Status: Complaint filed 8/18/17; amended complaint filed 11/2/17.  
Commission's motion to dismiss for lack of jurisdiction filed 10/20/17;  
motion to dismiss amended complaint filed 11/16/17; response in  
opposition to motion filed 11/30/17; reply to opposition filed  
12/7/17; order granting motion to dismiss entered 5/29/18.  
Defendants' notice of appeal filed 6/5/18.  
Appellants' opening brief filed 10/31/18; Commission's answering brief  
filed 2/28/19; appellants' reply brief filed 4/22/19.

***CAUSE OF ACTION INSTITUTE v. FTC***, No. 1:18-cv-00580 (D.D.C.)

Parties: Cause of Action Institute

Assigned Attorneys: Melanie Hendry (DOJ)

Alleged Conduct: Action under the Freedom of Information Act seeking access to agency records withheld by the Commission.

Status: Complaint filed 3/15/18.  
Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 6/21/19.  
Order suspending briefing schedule pending potential settlement of issues  
entered 7/18/19.

***COLE v. AICS***, No. 1:18-cv-00011 (D. Alaska)

Parties: Stephen Cole  
Alaska Island Community Services, Inc. (AICS) (Defendant)  
Southeast Alaska Regional Health Consortium (Defendant)  
U.S. Attorney's Office (Alaska) (Defendant)  
Department of Health and Human Services (Defendant)  
Federal Trade Commission (Defendant)

Assigned Attorneys: Joel Marcus (OGC)

Nature of Action: Action seeking an order compelling the FTC to investigate a pharmacy program for anticompetitive action.

Status: Amended complaint adding FTC filed 5/9/19.  
Plaintiff's motion for order requiring FTC to initiate antitrust review of  
340B pharmacy program filed 5/9/19; denied 6/6/19.

***CONSUMERS FOR AUTO RELIABILITY & SAFETY v. FTC***, No. 1:17-cv-00540 (D.D.C.)

Parties: Consumers for Auto Reliability and Safety  
Center for Auto Safety  
U.S. Public Interest Research Group, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Bradley Grossman (OGC)

Michele Arington

Nature of Action: Action for declaratory and injunctive relief under the Administrative  
Procedure Act in connection with the Commission's consent orders with  
General Motors and two dealerships regarding the advertising of used  
motor vehicles.

Status: Complaint filed 3/24/17.  
Amended complaint filed 5/2/17.  
Commission's motion to hold case in abeyance or, in the alternative, for  
an extension of time filed 5/16/17; opposition filed 5/30/17;  
motion to stay granted 6/13/17.  
Commission's motion dismiss filed 9/8/17; response in opposition filed  
10/5/17; Commission's reply filed 10/27/17.  
Motion hearing held 9/18/18.

***DOE v. FTC***, No. 4:16-cv-00071 (W.D. Mo.)

Parties: John Doe  
Jane Doe

Assigned Attorneys: Jeffrey Ray (AUSA)  
Burke Kappler (OGC)

Nature of Action: Action seeking damages under the Privacy Act in connection with the  
disclosure of private and sensitive identifying information.

Status: Complaint filed 1/28/16.  
Amended complaint filed 10/21/16.  
Commission's motion to dismiss for failure to state a claim filed  
11/22/16; plaintiff's opposition filed 12/21/16; reply filed 1/17/17;  
order denying motion entered 9/11/17.  
Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 12/7/18; suggestions in  
opposition filed 2/13/19; Commission's reply filed 2/27/19.

***ELECTRONIC PRIVACY INFORMATION CENTER v. FTC***, No. 1:18-cv-00942 (D.D.C.)

Parties: Electronic Privacy Information Center

Assigned Attorneys: William Nebeker (DOJ)

Alleged Conduct: Action under the Freedom of Information Act for injunctive and other relief to secure the release of agency records.

Status: Complaint filed 4/20/18.  
Joint status report filed 11/19/18.  
Joint status report filed 3/7/19.  
Joint status report filed 4/12/19.  
Facebook's motion to intervene filed 5/3/19; EPIC's opposition filed 6/14/19; Facebook's reply due 7/12/19.

***LOUISIANA REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS BOARD v. FTC***, No. 3:19-cv-00214 (M.D. La.)

Parties: Louisiana Real Estate Appraisers Board

Assigned Attorneys: Mark Hegedus (OGC)  
John J. Gaupp (DOJ)

Nature of Action: Action seeking declaratory judgment that the LREAB is exempt from antitrust laws under the state action doctrine.

Status: Complaint filed 4/11/19.  
Plaintiff's motion to stay administrative proceedings pending judicial review and for expedited treatment filed 4/22/19; Commission's opposition filed 5/13/19; plaintiff's reply filed 5/17/19.  
Commission's motion to dismiss filed 6/7/19; plaintiff's opposition filed 6/18/19; Commission's reply filed 6/25/19.

***SOUNDBOARD ASSOCIATION v. FTC***, No.17-5093 (D.C. Cir.); No. 1:17-cv-00150 (D.D.C.)

Parties: Soundboard Association

Assigned Attorneys: Bradley Grossman (OGC)  
Matthew Hoffman

Nature of Action: Action seeking declaratory judgment, challenging an FTC staff opinion letter advising that the TSR's restrictions on "prerecorded messages" apply to soundboard technology.

Status: Complaint filed 1/23/17.



Motion for preliminary injunction by Soundboard Association filed 1/24/17; Commission's opposition filed 2/17/17; reply filed 2/24/17.  
Hearing held 3/3/17.  
Order granting summary judgment in favor of the Commission entered 4/24/17.  
Notice of appeal filed 4/27/17.  
Appellant's opening brief filed 6/28/17; Commission's answering brief filed 7/28/17; appellant's reply brief filed 8/11/17.  
Oral argument held 11/6/17.  
Opinion and order vacating district court's decision and dismissing complaint, entered 4/27/18.  
Appellant's corrected petition for rehearing *en banc* filed 6/8/18; Commission's response filed 7/16/18; per curiam order denying petition entered 8/3/18.  
Petition for certiorari filed 11/30/18; Commission's opposition filed 2/6/19; petitioner's reply filed 2/21/19.  
Order denying petition for certiorari entered 4/15/19.

***RICHARD ZEITLIN v. FTC***, No. 2:19-cv-00698 (D. Nev.)

Parties: Richard Zeitlin  
Unified Data Services, LLC  
Compliance Consultants, LLC  
American Technology Services, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Bradley Grossman (OGC)  
Brian W. Irvin (DOJ)

Nature of Action: Action seeking declaratory judgment, challenging an FTC staff opinion letter advising that the TSR's restrictions on "prerecorded messages" apply to soundboard technology.

Status: Complaint filed 4/24/19.  
Commission's motion to dismiss filed 6/28/19.

**AMICUS CURIAE BRIEFS or PARTIAL INTERVENTIONS**

***APPLE INC. v. ROBERT PEPPER***, No. 17-204 (S. Ct.)

Assigned Attorney: Michael Bergman (OGC)  
Mark Hegedus

Nature of Action: Private action raising question whether indirect purchasers of app

distribution services that Apple provided directly to app developers have standing to sue for damages under Section 4 of the Clayton Act.

Status: Brief for the United States as amicus curiae supporting petition for certiorari filed 5/8/18.  
Petition for writ of cert granted 6/18/18.  
Brief of petitioner Apple Inc. filed 8/10/18.  
Brief of United States as amicus curiae filed 8/17/18.  
Brief of respondents Robert Pepper, et al. filed 9/24/18.  
Reply of petitioner Apple Inc. filed 10/29/18.  
Oral argument held 11/26/18.  
Opinion holding that the iPhone owners are direct purchasers who may sue Apple for alleged monopolization entered 5/13/19.

***INTELLECTUAL VENTURES I LLC v. CAPITAL ONE FINANCIAL CORP.***, No. 18-1367  
(Fed. Cir.)

Assigned Attorney: Mark Hegedus (OGC)  
John Dubiansky (OPP)

Nature of Action: Private action alleging patent infringement claims and antitrust counterclaims, raising question of *Noerr-Pennington* doctrine's application to allegedly anticompetitive conduct that includes patent-litigation activity.

Status: Corrected brief of the Justice Department and the Commission as amici curiae filed in support of in support of neither party filed 5/11/18.  
Corrected brief for appellants filed 7/19/18.  
Brief for appellees filed 8/28/18.  
Reply for appellants filed 9/25/18.  
Motion of the United States for leave to participate in oral argument filed 10/22/18; order granting the motion entered 4/24/19.  
Oral argument held 6/3/19.

***IN RE PAPLAUSKAS, JR.***, No. SU-2018-161-M.P (S. Ct. R.I.)

Assigned Attorneys: Joel Marcus (OGC)

Nature of Action: Action raising the question of whether a non-attorney notary public engaged in the unauthorized practice of law while participating in a real estate closing.

Status: Brief for the United States and the Commission as amicus curiae supporting respondent filed 9/17/18.

**TAKEDA PHARMACEUTICAL COMPANY LTD. v. ZYDUS PHARMACEUTICALS (USA)  
INC., No. 3:18-cv-1994 (D.N.J.)**

Assigned Attorney: Kara Monahan (BC/HC)

Nature of Action: Action alleging patent infringement and counterclaims alleging patent-infringement lawsuit is a sham, and raising issue about the application of the *Noerr-Pennington* doctrine in the pharmaceutical industry.

Status: Commission's motion for leave to file an amicus brief filed 6/6/18.  
Stipulation and proposed order of partial dismissal filed 7/25/18; order granting stipulation entered 7/26/18.  
Order denying as moot the Commission's motion for leave to file an amicus brief entered 1/28/19.