



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Tracey Allen
State of Maine

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Ms. Allen:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action, but suggests that the Commission should consider "a financial penalty" based on Mars Petcare's profit during the time frame covered by the advertising that is the subject of our enforcement action. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

You also encourage the Commission to take a "close examination of the many misleading and false advertising claims" in the pet food industry. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Catherine Cappello
State of Nevada

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Ms. Cappello:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

You do not comment on the provisions of the order, but your comment describes your successful personal experience with feeding your pets Eukanuba brand pet foods. The Commission's complaint alleges that the company did not have adequate substantiation for its longevity claims. Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Patricia Carignan
State of Pennsylvania

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Ms. Carignan:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action and encourages the Commission to investigate the advertising of other pet food companies. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Reva Crump
State of Nevada

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Ms. Crump:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action, but proposes that the Commission impose penalties on Mars Petcare for the conduct described in the proposed complaint. The Commission's proposed consent order, however, includes strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). In addition, please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5 of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Len Diamond
State of California

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Mr. Diamond:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action. Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Lorie Dingacci
State of Washington

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Ms. Dingacci:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action, but encourages the Commission to impose a fine to deter Mars Petcare and other pet food companies from similar acts. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Jane Eagle
State of California

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Ms. Eagle:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action, but suggests imposing a financial penalty on Mars Petcare. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

Your comment also encourages the Commission to "[go] after ... all the other misleading advertising that is rampant in the pet food industry." The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Diane England
State of Nevada

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Ms. England:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action, but proposes that the Commission impose penalties on Mars Petcare for the conduct described in the proposed complaint. The Commission's proposed consent order, however, includes strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). In addition, please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5 of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

You also encourage the Commission to investigate other instances of "misleading and deceptive practices" in the pet food industry. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Cheri Fellingner
State of Washington

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Ms. Fellingner:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action, but proposes that the Commission impose penalties on Mars Petcare for the conduct described in the proposed complaint. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

You also encourage the Commission to take similar action with respect to the advertising practices of other pet food companies. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Commenter Friday
State of Arizona

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Mr./Ms. Friday:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses strong support for this enforcement action. You also encourage the Commission to "continue to enforce" the law with respect to other pet food companies. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Marsha Hix
State of Florida

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Ms. Hix:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action, but suggests imposing a fine on Mars Petcare to "stop other companies" from engaging in misleading claims. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

You also encourage the Commission to "look at other pet food" because of their "misleading and deceptive" claims. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Kris Hixson
State of Florida

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Ms. Hixson:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for the Commission's enforcement action, but proposes that the Commission impose penalties on Mars Petcare for the conduct described in the draft complaint. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

You also note other potential examples of deceptive advertising in the pet food industry. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Commenter Malcolm
State of North Carolina

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Mr. /Ms. Malcolm:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses support for this enforcement action. Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

John Melograno
State of New Jersey

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Mr. Melagrano:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses support for this enforcement action. Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Judy Miller
State of Minnesota

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Ms. Miller:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action and encourages the Commission to investigate the advertising of other pet food companies. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

Office of the Secretary

December 12, 2016

Lise Petroski
State of Florida

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Ms. Petroski:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action and encourages the Commission to "look further" at the advertising and packaging of other pet food companies. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Perrie'Lee Prouty
State of Maryland

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Ms. Prouty:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses strong support for this enforcement action and encourages the Commission to "do more examinations of" the advertising practices of other pet food companies. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

Office of the Secretary

December 12, 2016

Michael Ros
State of Montana

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Mr. Ros:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action, but encourages the Commission to impose a fine to deter Mars Petcare and other pet food companies from similar acts. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Linda Scheuers
State of Wisconsin

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Ms. Scheuers:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action and encourages the Commission to "look at more" activities of other pet food companies. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Commenter Setola
Commonwealth of Massachusetts

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Mr./Ms. Setola:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action, but suggests that the Commission impose a financial penalty on Mars Petcare. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

Office of the Secretary

December 12, 2016

Nancy Stoll
State of New York

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Ms. Stoll:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

You do not comment on the provisions of the order, but your comment suggests that Mars Petcare "needs to be fined for their false advertising..." Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Commenter Stordahl
State of Michigan

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Mr./Ms. Stordahl:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

You do not comment on the provisions of the order, but your comment suggests that the Commission should impose a "heavy monetary penalty" for deceptive advertising in order to create a sufficient deterrent. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Commenter Strait
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Mr./Ms. Strait:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action and encourages the Commission to take similar action with respect to the "rest of the false claims" made by the pet food industry. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Susan Thixton
Association for Truth in Pet Food
State of Florida

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Ms. Thixton:

Thank you for commenting, on behalf of the Association for Truth in Pet Food, on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action, but suggests that the Commission should consider "a financial penalty" based on Mars Petcare's profit during the time frame covered by the advertising that is the subject of our enforcement action. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

You also encourage the Commission to take a "close examination of the many misleading and false advertising claims" in the pet food industry. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Lewis Turner
State of California

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Mr. Turner:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

You do not comment on the provisions of the order, but your comment suggests that the Commission impose a financial penalty on Mars Petcare. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Laura Uran
State of Nebraska

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Ms. Uran:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action and suggests imposing "significant financial penalties" on Mars Petcare. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

You also note that there are "so many misleading claims on pet food containers." The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Kim Williams
State of North Carolina

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Ms. Williams:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action, but suggests that the Commission fine Mars Petcare. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

Office of the Secretary

December 12, 2016

Commenter Willis
Commonwealth of Virginia

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Mr./Ms. Willis:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

You do not comment specifically about the provisions of the order, but your comment proposes that the Commission impose penalties on Mars Petcare for the conduct described in the draft complaint. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

You also encourage the Commission to investigate other instances of deceptive advertising in the pet food industry. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Commenter Wynter
State of Idaho

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Mr./Ms. Wynter:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action. You also encourage the FTC to "extend [its] efforts to the pursuit of other false advertising in dog food." The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Commenter Yaco
State of California

Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599

Dear Mr. /Ms. Yaco:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action, and encourages the Federal Trade Commission to "look into the many 'illegal' ingredients that are being used in pet food." The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment. However, the Commission's authority to prevent unfair and deceptive acts and practices does not extend to regulation of the ingredients of pet foods or other similar products.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary