



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Tracey Allen  
State of Maine

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Ms. Allen:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action, but suggests that the Commission should consider "a financial penalty" based on Mars Petcare's profit during the time frame covered by the advertising that is the subject of our enforcement action. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

You also encourage the Commission to take a "close examination of the many misleading and false advertising claims" in the pet food industry. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Catherine Cappello  
State of Nevada

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Ms. Cappello:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

You do not comment on the provisions of the order, but your comment describes your successful personal experience with feeding your pets Eukanuba brand pet foods. The Commission's complaint alleges that the company did not have adequate substantiation for its longevity claims. Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Patricia Carignan  
State of Pennsylvania

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Ms. Carignan:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action and encourages the Commission to investigate the advertising of other pet food companies. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Reva Crump  
State of Nevada

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Ms. Crump:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action, but proposes that the Commission impose penalties on Mars Petcare for the conduct described in the proposed complaint. The Commission's proposed consent order, however, includes strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). In addition, please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5 of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Len Diamond  
State of California

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Mr. Diamond:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action. Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

Office of the Secretary

December 12, 2016

Lorie Dingacci  
State of Washington

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Ms. Dingacci:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action, but encourages the Commission to impose a fine to deter Mars Petcare and other pet food companies from similar acts. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Jane Eagle  
State of California

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Ms. Eagle:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action, but suggests imposing a financial penalty on Mars Petcare. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

Your comment also encourages the Commission to "[go] after ... all the other misleading advertising that is rampant in the pet food industry." The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Diane England  
State of Nevada

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Ms. England:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action, but proposes that the Commission impose penalties on Mars Petcare for the conduct described in the proposed complaint. The Commission's proposed consent order, however, includes strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). In addition, please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5 of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

You also encourage the Commission to investigate other instances of "misleading and deceptive practices" in the pet food industry. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Cheri Fellingner  
State of Washington

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Ms. Fellingner:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action, but proposes that the Commission impose penalties on Mars Petcare for the conduct described in the proposed complaint. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

You also encourage the Commission to take similar action with respect to the advertising practices of other pet food companies. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Commenter Friday  
State of Arizona

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Mr./Ms. Friday:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses strong support for this enforcement action. You also encourage the Commission to "continue to enforce" the law with respect to other pet food companies. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

Office of the Secretary

December 12, 2016

Marsha Hix  
State of Florida

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Ms. Hix:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action, but suggests imposing a fine on Mars Petcare to "stop other companies" from engaging in misleading claims. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

You also encourage the Commission to "look at other pet food" because of their "misleading and deceptive" claims. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Kris Hixson  
State of Florida

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Ms. Hixson:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for the Commission's enforcement action, but proposes that the Commission impose penalties on Mars Petcare for the conduct described in the draft complaint. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

You also note other potential examples of deceptive advertising in the pet food industry. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Commenter Malcolm  
State of North Carolina

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Mr. /Ms. Malcolm:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses support for this enforcement action. Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

John Melograno  
State of New Jersey

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Mr. Melagrano:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses support for this enforcement action. Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Judy Miller  
State of Minnesota

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Ms. Miller:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action and encourages the Commission to investigate the advertising of other pet food companies. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

Office of the Secretary

December 12, 2016

Lise Petroski  
State of Florida

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Ms. Petroski:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action and encourages the Commission to "look further" at the advertising and packaging of other pet food companies. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Perrie'Lee Prouty  
State of Maryland

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Ms. Prouty:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses strong support for this enforcement action and encourages the Commission to "do more examinations of" the advertising practices of other pet food companies. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

Office of the Secretary

December 12, 2016

Michael Ros  
State of Montana

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Mr. Ros:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action, but encourages the Commission to impose a fine to deter Mars Petcare and other pet food companies from similar acts. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Linda Scheuers  
State of Wisconsin

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Ms. Scheuers:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action and encourages the Commission to "look at more" activities of other pet food companies. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Commenter Setola  
Commonwealth of Massachusetts

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Mr./Ms. Setola:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action, but suggests that the Commission impose a financial penalty on Mars Petcare. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Nancy Stoll  
State of New York

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Ms. Stoll:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

You do not comment on the provisions of the order, but your comment suggests that Mars Petcare "needs to be fined for their false advertising..." Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Commenter Stordahl  
State of Michigan

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Mr./Ms. Stordahl:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

You do not comment on the provisions of the order, but your comment suggests that the Commission should impose a "heavy monetary penalty" for deceptive advertising in order to create a sufficient deterrent. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Commenter Strait  
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Mr./Ms. Strait:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action and encourages the Commission to take similar action with respect to the "rest of the false claims" made by the pet food industry. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Susan Thixton  
Association for Truth in Pet Food  
State of Florida

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Ms. Thixton:

Thank you for commenting, on behalf of the Association for Truth in Pet Food, on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action, but suggests that the Commission should consider "a financial penalty" based on Mars Petcare's profit during the time frame covered by the advertising that is the subject of our enforcement action. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

You also encourage the Commission to take a "close examination of the many misleading and false advertising claims" in the pet food industry. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Lewis Turner  
State of California

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Mr. Turner:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

You do not comment on the provisions of the order, but your comment suggests that the Commission impose a financial penalty on Mars Petcare. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Laura Uran  
State of Nebraska

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Ms. Uran:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action and suggests imposing "significant financial penalties" on Mars Petcare. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

You also note that there are "so many misleading claims on pet food containers." The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

Office of the Secretary

December 12, 2016

Kim Williams  
State of North Carolina

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Ms. Williams:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action, but suggests that the Commission fine Mars Petcare. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

Office of the Secretary

December 12, 2016

Commenter Willis  
Commonwealth of Virginia

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Mr./Ms. Willis:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

You do not comment specifically about the provisions of the order, but your comment proposes that the Commission impose penalties on Mars Petcare for the conduct described in the draft complaint. Please note that the Commission's proposed complaint alleges violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, and the Commission is not authorized to collect fines or penalties based on such violations. The Commission's proposed consent order does, however, include strong injunctive relief to prevent future violations. Importantly, if Mars Petcare violates this proposed order in the future, it would be liable for civil penalties of up to \$40,000 per violation, pursuant to Section 5(1) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(1). As is the case with all Commission orders, Commission staff will closely monitor Mars Petcare's future activities to determine whether any violations occur.

You also encourage the Commission to investigate other instances of deceptive advertising in the pet food industry. The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Commenter Wynter  
State of Idaho

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Mr./Ms. Wynter:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action. You also encourage the FTC to "extend [its] efforts to the pursuit of other false advertising in dog food." The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary



Office of the Secretary

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20580

December 12, 2016

Commenter Yaco  
State of California

*Re: Mars Petcare US, Inc., File No. 152-3229, Docket No. C-4599*

Dear Mr. /Ms. Yaco:

Thank you for commenting on the Federal Trade Commission's proposed consent agreement in the above-referenced proceeding. The Commission has placed your comment on the public record pursuant to Rule 4.9(b)(6)(ii) of the Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 4.9(b)(6)(ii), and has given it serious consideration.

Your comment expresses general support for this enforcement action, and encourages the Federal Trade Commission to "look into the many 'illegal' ingredients that are being used in pet food." The Commission bases many of its investigations on complaints from consumers and appreciates the information provided in your comment. However, the Commission's authority to prevent unfair and deceptive acts and practices does not extend to regulation of the ingredients of pet foods or other similar products.

Accordingly, the Commission has determined that the public interest would best be served by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification. The final Decision and Order and other relevant materials are available from the Commission's website at <http://www.ftc.gov>. It helps the Commission's analysis to hear from a variety of sources, and we thank you again for your comment.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary