# UNITED STATES OF AMERICA BEFORE THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

**COMMISSIONERS:** 

Edith Ramirez, Chairwoman Julie Brill Maureen K. Ohlhausen Joshua D. Wright Terrell McSweeny



In the Matter of

ECM BioFilms, Inc., a corporation, also d/b/a Enviroplastics International Docket No. 9358

PUBLIC

## COMPLAINT COUNSEL'S CORRECTION REGARDING STATEMENTS MADE DURING ORAL ARGUMENT

Pursuant to Commission Rule 3.54, Complaint Counsel provides the following very brief clarification, necessitated by a complexity in the record that Complaint Counsel did not explain in its May 14, 2015 presentation.

During oral argument, Commissioner Ohlhausen asked about the apparently small delta between the answers to Dr. Frederick's control questions and his test questions. This small delta results from an understandable but incorrect comparison. Comparing the control to the actual claim, the delta for consumers who believed plastic containers and bags would decompose within five years was truly significant: 35% and 32%, respectively.<sup>1</sup> The delta between the control and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Specifically, 21% of respondents gave a five-year answer for the control about plastic containers (3O), and 56% gave a five-year answer for the claim (3J). 25% of respondents gave a five-year answer for the control about plastic bags (3P), and 57% gave a five-year answer for the claim (3K).

the claim for those who believed plastic containers and bags would decompose within one year was 18% and 25%, respectively.<sup>2</sup>

Dr. Frederick asked questions (3O) and (3P), which displayed a plastic container and plastic bag, respectively, without any claim. These questions should be compared to questions (3J) and (3K), which displayed ECM's biodegradable logo on the same product and stated that the logo (which was otherwise illegible) read "ECM Biodegradable." The control questions should <u>not</u> be compared to questions (3H) and (3I), because these questions displayed products whose logo was illegible to survey respondents. *See* Tr. 1151, 1153-54.

Respectfully Submitted,

Dated: May 19, 2015

.

<u>/s/ Katherine Johnson</u> Katherine Johnson Elisa Jillson

Federal Trade Commission Bureau of Consumer Protection Division of Enforcement 600 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., CC-9528 Washington, D.C. 20580 Telephone: (202) 326-2185; -3001 Facsimile: (202) 326-3259

### **Counsel Supporting the Complaint**

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Specifically, 16% of respondents gave a one-year answer for the control about plastic containers (3O), and 34% gave a one-year answer for the claim (3J). 13% of respondents gave a one-year answer for the control about plastic bags (3P), and 38% gave a one-year answer for the claim (3K).

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on May 19, 2015, I caused a true and correct copy of the foregoing to be served as follows:

One electronic copy, one copy through the FTC's e-filing system, and twelve hard copies to the **Office of the Secretary**:

Donald S. Clark, Secretary Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Ave., NW, Room H-159 Washington, DC 20580 Email: secretary@ftc.gov

One electronic copy to the Office of the Administrative Law Judge:

The Honorable D. Michael Chappell Administrative Law Judge 600 Pennsylvania Ave., NW, Room H-110 Washington, DC 20580

#### One electronic copy to Counsel for the Respondent:

Jonathan W. Emord Emord & Associates, P.C. 11808 Wolf Run Lane Clifton, VA 20124 Email: jemord@emord.com

Eric J. Awerbuch Emord & Associates, P.C. 3210 S. Gilbert Road, Suite 4 Chandler, AZ 85286 Email: eawerbuch@emord.com Peter Arhangelsky Emord & Associates, P.C. 3210 S. Gilbert Road, Suite 4 Chandler, AZ 85286 Email: parhangelsky@emord.com

Bethany Kennedy Emord & Associates, P.C. 3210 S. Gilbert Road, Suite 4 Chandler, AZ 85286 Email: bkennedy@emord.com

I further certify that I possess a paper copy of the signed original of the foregoing document that is available for review by the parties and the adjudicator.

Date: May 19, 2015

10

<u>/s/Katherine Johnson</u> Katherine Johnson (kjohnson3@ftc.gov) Elisa Jillson (ejillson@ftc.gov) Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W. CC-9528 Washington, DC 20580 Phone: 202-326-2185;-3001 Fax: 202-326-3197