Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 83 Filed 09/30/11 Page 1 of 32

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 81 Filed 09/28/11 Page 1 of 32

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF MARYLAND

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION, Plaintiff, v. RESIDENTIAL RELIEF FOUNDATION, INC., et al., Defendants.

Case No. 1:10-cv-3214-JFM

STIPULATED FINAL ORDER FOR PERMANENT INJUNCTION AND SETTLEMENT OF CLAIMS AS TO DEFENDANTS RESIDENTIAL RELIEF FOUNDATION, LLC, SILVER LINING SERVICES, LLC, JAMES HOLDERNESS, BRYAN MELANSON, MICHAEL VALENTI, AND JILLIAN MELANSON

Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission ("FTC") commenced this civil action on November 15, 2010, pursuant to Sections 13(b) and 19 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 53(b) and 57b, and the Telemarketing and Consumer Fraud and Abuse Prevention Act, 15 U.S.C. § 6101 *et seq.*, to obtain preliminary and permanent injunctive and other equitable relief for Defendants' alleged violations of Section 5 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45, and the Telemarketing Sales Rule ("TSR"), 16 C.F.R. Part 310, in connection with the marketing and sale of mortgage assistance relief services and debt relief services. On November 15, 2010, the Court entered an *ex parte* Temporary Restraining Order ("TRO") that, among other things, appointed a temporary receiver over the corporate defendants. The FTC, the Temporary Receiver, and Defendants Residential Relief Foundation, LLC, Silver Lining Services, LLC, James Holderness, Bryan Melanson, Michael Valenti, and Jillian Melanson hereby stipulate to the entry of this Final Order for Permanent Injunction and Settlement of Claims ("Order").

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 83 Filed 09/30/11 Page 2 of 32 Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 81 Filed 09/28/11 Page 2 of 32

FINDINGS

By stipulation of the parties and being advised of the premises, the Court finds:

- This is an action by the FTC instituted under Sections 13(b) and 19 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§
 53(b) and 57b. The Complaint seeks both permanent injunctive relief and equitable monetary relief for the Settling Defendants' alleged deceptive acts or practices as alleged therein.
- The FTC has the authority under Sections 13(b) and 19 of the FTC Act to seek the relief it has requested, and the Complaint states a claim upon which relief can be granted against the Settling Defendants.
- This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this case and has jurisdiction over the Settling Defendants. Venue in the District of Maryland is proper.
- 4. The activities of the Settling Defendants, as alleged in the Complaint, are in or affecting commerce, as defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.
- 5. The FTC and the Settling Defendants stipulate and agree to entry of this Order, without trial or final adjudication of any issue of fact or law, to settle and resolve all matters in dispute arising from the conduct alleged in the Complaint to the date of entry of this Order. This settlement does not settle and resolve any matters not alleged in the Complaint. This Order is for settlement purposes only, and does not constitute and shall not be interpreted to constitute an admission by any Settling Defendant or a finding that the law has been violated as alleged in the Complaint, or that the facts alleged in the Complaint, other than the jurisdictional facts or as provided in Section VIII.D. of this Order, are true.
- 6. The Settling Defendants waive all rights to seek judicial review or otherwise challenge or contest the validity of this Order. The Settling Defendants also waive any claim that they may have held

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 83 Filed 09/30/11 Page 3 of 32

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 81 Filed 09/28/11 Page 3 of 32

under the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, concerning the prosecution of this action to the date of this Order. Each settling party shall bear its own costs and attorneys fees.

- 7. This action and the relief awarded herein are in addition to, and not in lieu of, other remedies as may be provided by law, including both civil and criminal remedies.
- 8. Entry of this Order is in the public interest.

DEFINITIONS

For the purposes of this Order, the following definitions shall apply:

- 1. "Assisting others" includes, but is not limited to:
 - A. performing customer service functions, including, but not limited to, receiving or responding to consumer complaints;
 - B. formulating or providing, or arranging for the formulation or provision of, any advertising or marketing material, including, but not limited to, any telephone sales script, direct mail solicitation, or the design, text, or use of images of any Internet website, email, or other electronic communication;
 - C. formulating or providing, or arranging for the formulation or provision of, any marketing support material or service, including but not limited to, web or Internet Protocol addresses or domain name registration for any Internet websites, affiliate marketing services, or media placement services;

D. providing names of, or assisting in the generation of, potential customers;

- E. performing marketing, billing, or payment services of any kind; and
- F. acting or serving as an owner, officer, director, manager, or principal of any entity.

Page 3 of 28

- 2. "Competent and reliable evidence" means tests, analyses, research, studies, or other evidence based on the expertise of professionals in the relevant area, that has been conducted and evaluated in an objective manner by persons qualified to do so, using procedures generally accepted in the profession to yield accurate and reliable results.
- 3. **"Consumer"** means any natural person.
- "Customer" means any person who has paid, or may be required to pay, for products, services, plans, or programs offered for sale or sold by any other person.

5. "Debt relief product or service" means any product, service, plan, or program represented, expressly or by implication, to renegotiate, settle, or in any way alter the terms of payment or other terms of the debt or obligation, including but not limited to a tax debt or obligation, between a person and one or more unsecured creditors or debt collectors, including but not limited to, a reduction in the balance, interest rate, or fees owed by a person to an unsecured creditor or debt collector.

- 6. "Document" is synonymous in meaning and equal in scope to the usage of the term in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 34(a), and includes writings, drawings, graphs, charts, photographs, audio and video recordings, computer records, and other data compilations from which the information can be obtained and translated, if necessary, through detection devices into reasonably usable form. A draft or non-identical copy is a separate document within the meaning of the term.
- 7. "Federal homeowner relief or financial stability program" means any program (including its sponsoring agencies, telephone numbers, and Internet websites) operated or endorsed by the

Page 4 of 28

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 81 Filed 09/28/11 Page 5 of 32

United States government to provide relief to homeowners or stabilize the economy, including but not limited to:

- A. the Making Home Affordable Program;
- B. the Financial Stability Plan;
- C. the Troubled Asset Relief Program and any other program sponsored or operated by the United States Department of the Treasury;
- D. the HOPE for Homeowners program, any program operated or created pursuant to the Helping Families Save Their Homes Act, and any other program sponsored or operated by the Federal Housing Administration; or
- E. any program sponsored or operated by the United States Department of Housing and Urban Development ("HUD"), the HOPE NOW Alliance, the Homeownership
 Preservation Foundation, or any other HUD-approved housing counseling agency.
- 8. **"Financial related product or service"** means any product, service, plan, or program represented, expressly or by implication, to:
 - A. provide any consumer, arrange for any consumer to receive, or assist any consumer in receiving, credit, debit, or stored value cards;
 - B. improve, or arrange to improve, any consumer's credit record, credit history, or credit rating;
 - C. provide advice or assistance to any consumer with regard to any activity or service the purpose of which is to improve a consumer's credit record, credit history, or credit rating;
 - D. provide any consumer, arrange for any consumer to receive, or assist any consumer in receiving, a loan or other extension of credit; or

Page 5 of 28

a tota

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 83 Filed 09/30/11 Page 6 of 32 Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 81 Filed 09/28/11 Page 6 of 32

- E. provide any consumer, arrange for any consumer to receive, or assist any consumer in receiving any service represented, expressly or by implication, to renegotiate, settle, or in any way alter the terms of payment or other terms of the debt or obligation, including but not limited to a tax debt or obligation, between a consumer and one or more secured creditors, servicers, or debt collectors.
- 9. "Material" means likely to affect a person's choice of, or conduct regarding goods or services.
- 10. "Mortgage assistance relief product or service" means any product, service, plan, or program, offered or provided to the consumer in exchange for consideration, that is represented, expressly or by implication, to assist or attempt to assist the consumer with any of the following:
 - A. stopping, preventing, or postponing any mortgage or deed of trust foreclosure sale for the consumer's dwelling, any repossession of the consumer's dwelling, or otherwise saving the consumer's dwelling from foreclosure or repossession;
 - B. negotiating, obtaining, or arranging a modification of any term of a dwelling loan,
 including a reduction in the amount of interest, principal balance, monthly payments, or
 fees;
 - C. obtaining any forbearance or modification in the timing of payments from any dwelling loan holder or servicer on any dwelling loan;
 - D. negotiating, obtaining, or arranging any extension of the period of time within which the consumer may (i) cure his or her default on a dwelling loan, (ii) reinstate his or her dwelling loan, (iii) redeem a dwelling, or (iv) exercise any right to reinstate a dwelling loan or redeem a dwelling;

Page 6 of 28

- E. obtaining any waiver of an acceleration clause or balloon payment contained in any promissory note or contract secured by any dwelling; or
- F. negotiating, obtaining, or arranging (i) a short sale of a dwelling, (ii) a deed-in-lieu of foreclosure, (iii) or any other disposition of a dwelling loan other than a sale to a third party that is not the dwelling loan holder.

The foregoing shall include any manner of claimed assistance, including, but not limited to, auditing or examining a consumer's mortgage or home loan application.

- 11. "Person" means a natural person, an organization or other legal entity, including a corporation, partnership, sole proprietorship, limited liability company, association, cooperative, or any other group or combination acting as an entity.
- 12. "Receivership Entities" means the Corporate Settling Defendants and MFG Properties, LLC.
- 13. "Related Entities" means Einstein Marketing Corporation, Medici Financial Group, Inc., Medici Financial Group, LLC, MFG Properties, LLC, ReScore Plus, LLC, Noble Title, LLC, Response Direct, LLC, Auto Shield, LLC, Short Sale Direct, LLC, Camden Mortgage Group, Inc., Stop My Sale Date, LLC, This Way Out, LLC, AmeriShieldUS, LLC, American Hope Organization, Clearview Consulting Group, LLC, and Community Credit Solutions, LLC.
- 14. "Settling Defendants" means all of the Individual Settling Defendants and the Corporate Settling Defendants, individually, collectively, or in any combination. "Individual Settling Defendants" means James Holderness, Bryan Melanson, Michael Valenti, and Jillian Melanson.
 "Corporate Settling Defendants" means Residential Relief Foundation, LLC, Silver Lining Services, LLC, and their successors and assigns.

BAN ON MORTGAGE ASSISTANCE RELIEF PRODUCT AND SERVICES

- IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that the Settling Defendants, whether acting directly or through any other person, are permanently restrained and enjoined from:
 - A. Advertising, marketing, promoting, offering for sale, or selling any mortgage assistance product or relief service; and
 - B. Assisting others engaged in advertising, marketing, promoting, offering for sale, or selling any mortgage assistance relief product or service.

Provided, that Sections I.A. and B. shall not prohibit any Settling Defendant who is licensed to practice law from directly rendering routine legal services (1) to clients with whom such Defendant has an attorney-client relationship in connection with new or existing bankruptcy proceedings or with estate planning, or (2) in connection with the closing and execution of real estate transactions. This proviso shall not be construed to limit the licensing or regulatory powers of any federal, state, or local government agency or state bar.

Provided, further, that if any Settling Defendant holds a real estate sales license in good standing from the appropriate state real estate licensing agency, or is employed by a broker that holds a license in good standing from the appropriate state real estate agency, Sections I.A. and I.B. shall not prohibit such Defendant from doing or negotiating to do one or more of the following acts for another or others: selling or offering to sell, buying or offering to buy, soliciting prospective sellers or purchasers of, soliciting or obtaining listings of, or negotiating the purchase, sale or exchange of real property in a purchase money real estate transaction. This proviso shall not be construed to limit the licensing or regulatory powers of any federal, state, or local government agency or other entity regulating real estate agents.

Page 8 of 28

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 83 Filed 09/30/11 Page 9 of 32 Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 81 Filed 09/28/11 Page 9 of 32

BAN ON DEBT RELIEF PRODUCT AND SERVICES

- 11. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Settling Defendants, whether acting directly or through any other person, are permanently restrained and enjoined from:
 - A. Advertising, marketing, promoting, offering for sale, or selling any debt relief product or service; and
 - B. Assisting others engaged in advertising, marketing, promoting, offering for sale, or selling any debt relief product or service.

PROHIBITED MISREPRESENTATIONS RELATING TO FINANCIAL RELATED PRODUCTS OR SERVICES

- III. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Settling Defendants and their officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and those persons or entities in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service, facsimile transmission, email, or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, in connection with the advertising, marketing, promotion, offering for sale or sale of any financial related product or service, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from:
 - A. Misrepresenting or assisting others in misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, any material fact, including but not limited to:
 - 1. The terms or rates that are available for any loan or other extension of credit, including but not limited to:
 - a. closing costs or other fees;
 - b. the payment schedule, the monthly payment amount(s), or other payment terms, or whether there is a balloon payment; interest rate(s), annual

Page 9 of 28

percentage rate(s), or finance charge; the loan amount, the amount of credit, the draw amount, or outstanding balance; the loan term, the draw period, or maturity; or any other term of credit;

- c. the savings associated with the credit;
- d. the amount of cash to be disbursed to the borrower out of the proceeds, or
 the amount of cash to be disbursed on behalf of the borrower to any third
 parties;
- e. whether the payment of the minimum amount specified each month covers both interest and principal, and whether the credit has or can result in negative amortization;
- f. that the credit does not have a prepayment penalty or that no prepayment
 penalty and/or other fees or costs will be incurred if the consumer
 subsequently refinances; and
- g. that the interest rate(s) or annual percentage rate(s) are fixed rather than adjustable or adjustable rather than fixed;
- 2. Any person's ability to improve or otherwise affect a consumer's credit record, credit history, or credit rating or ability to obtain credit;
- 3. That any person can improve any consumer's credit record, credit history, or credit rating by permanently removing negative information from the consumer's credit record, credit history, or credit rating, even where such information is accurate and not obsolete; and
- 4. That a consumer will receive legal representation;

Page 10 of 28

B. Advertising or assisting others in advertising credit terms other than those terms that actually are or will be arranged or offered by a creditor or lender.

PROHIBITED MISREPRESENTATIONS RELATING TO ANY PRODUCTS OR SERVICES

- IV. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Settling Defendants and their officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and those persons or entities in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service, facsimile transmission, email, or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, in connection with the advertising, marketing, promotion, offering for sale or sale of any product, service, plan, or program are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from:
 - A. misrepresenting or assisting others in misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, any material fact, including but not limited to:
 - Any material aspect of the nature or terms of any refund, cancellation, exchange, or repurchase policy, including, but not limited to, the likelihood of a consumer obtaining a full or partial refund, or the circumstances in which a full or partial refund will be granted to the consumer;
 - That any person is affiliated with, endorsed or approved by, or otherwise connected to any other person; government entity; any federal homeowner relief or financial stability program; public, non-profit, or other non-commercial program; or any other program;
 - 3. That they themselves provide the product, service, plan, or program;
 - 4. That any person providing a testimonial has purchased, received, or used the product, service, plan, or program;

- 5. That the experience represented in a testimonial of the product, service, plan, or program represents the person's actual experience resulting from the use of the product, service, plan, or program under the circumstances depicted in the advertisement;
- 6. The total costs to purchase, receive, or use, or the quantity of, the product, service, plan, or program;
- Any material restriction, limitation, or condition on purchasing, receiving, or using the product, service, plan, or program;
- 8. That any person has implemented reasonable and appropriate measures to protect consumers' non-public personal information against unauthorized access; or
- 9. Any material aspect of the performance, efficacy, nature, or characteristics of the product, service, plan, or program; and
- B. failing to dispose properly of consumer information, maintained or otherwise possessed for a business purpose, by taking reasonable measures to protect against unauthorized access to or use of the information in connection with its disposal, such as by burning, pulverizing, or shredding any papers, and by erasing or destroying any electronic media, to ensure that the customer information cannot practicably be read or reconstructed.

SUBSTANTIATION FOR BENEFIT, PERFORMANCE, AND EFFICACY CLAIMS

V. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Settling Defendants and their officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and those persons or entities in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service, facsimile transmission, email, or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 83 Filed 09/30/11 Page 13 of 32 Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 81 Filed 09/28/11 Page 13 of 32

other device, in connection with the advertising, marketing, promotion, offering for sale, or sale of any financial related product or service are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from making any representation or assisting others in making any representation, expressly or by implication, about the benefits, performance, or efficacy of any financial related product or service, unless at the time such representation is made, the Settling Defendants possess and rely upon competent and reliable evidence that substantiates that the representation is true.

PROHIBITED TELEMARKETING ACTIVITIES

- VI. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Settling Defendants and their successors, assigns, officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and those persons or entities in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, in connection with the telemarketing, advertising, marketing, promotion, offering for sale or sale of any good or service, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from violating, or assisting others in violating, any provision of the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. Part 310, including, but not limited to:
 - A. Section 310.3(a)(2)(iii) of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. § 310.3(a)(2)(iii), by misrepresenting, directly or by implication, any material aspect of the performance, efficacy, nature, or central characteristic of any good or service; and
 - B. Section 310.3(a)(2)(vii) of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. § 310.3(a)(2)(vii), by misrepresenting, directly or by implication, affiliation with, or endorsement by, any government or third-party organization.

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 83 Filed 09/30/11 Page 14 of 32 Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 81 Filed 09/28/11 Page 14 of 32

PROHIBITION ON DISCLOSING CUSTOMER INFORMATION

- VII. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Settling Defendants and their successors, assigns, officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and those persons or entities in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service, facsimile transmission, email, or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, are permanently restrained and enjoined from:
 - A. disclosing, using, or benefitting from customer information, including the name, address, telephone number, email address, social security number, other identifying information, or any data that enables access to a customer's account (including a credit card, bank account, or other financial account) of any person that any Settling Defendant obtained prior to entry of this Order in connection with the advertising, marketing, promotion, offering for sale or sale of any mortgage assistance relief service or any debt relief service, and
 - B. failing to dispose of such customer information in all forms in his possession, custody, or control within thirty (30) days after entry of this Order. Disposal shall be by means that protect against unauthorized access to the customer information, such as by burning, pulverizing, or shredding any papers, and by erasing or destroying any electronic media, to ensure that the customer information cannot practicably be read or reconstructed.

Provided, however, that customer information need not be disposed of, and may be disclosed, to the extent requested by a government agency or required by a law, regulation, or court order.

MONETARY JUDGMENT

VIII. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:

Page 14 of 28

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 83 Filed 09/30/11 Page 15 of 32 Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 81 Filed 09/28/11 Page 15 of 32

- A. Judgment is hereby entered against the Settling Defendants, jointly and severally, in the amount of TEN MILLION FIVE HUNDRED THIRTEEN THOUSAND AND FOUR HUNDRED FORTY DOLLARS (\$10,513,440); *provided, however*, that this judgment shall be suspended, subject to Section IX of this Order, upon the completion of the following:
 - 1. M&T Bank shall, within ten (10) business days from receipt of a copy of this Order, transfer to the Receiver or its designated agent all funds, if any, held by any Related Entity, including but not limited to account numbers xxxx1742 in the name of AmeriShieldUS, xxxx0395 in the name of Ark Financial Group, xxxx9978 in the name of Auto Shield, xxxx2944 in the name of Auto Shield, xxxx6881 in the name of Camden Mortgage Group, xxxx2951 in the name of Einstein Marketing Corporation, xxxx9960 in the name of Einstein Marketing Corporation, xxxx5142 in the name of Medici Financial Group, xxxx3009 in the name of Medici Financial Group, xxxx3058 in the name of MFG Properties, xxxx3033 in the name of Noble Title & Escrow, xxxx1573 in the name of Noble Title & Escrow, xxxx6865 in the name of Response Direct, xxxx0545 in the name of Short Sale Direct, xxxx3686 in the name of Short Sale Direct, and xxxx1734 in the name of This Way Out;

 Bank of America shall, within ten (10) business days from receipt of a copy of this Order, transfer to the FTC or its designated agent all funds, if any, held in account numbers xxxx9447 in the name of Michael Valenti and xxxx6609 in the name of Michael and Sarah Valenti;

- M&T Bank shall, within ten (10) business days from receipt of a copy of this
 Order, transfer to the FTC or its designated agent all funds, if any, held in account
 number xxxx0528 in the name of Bryan Melanson;
- Point Brecze Credit Union shall, within ten (10) business days from receipt of a copy of this Order, transfer to the FTC or its designated agent all funds, if any, held in account number xxxx3950 in the name of Jillian Melanson;
- 5. Bank of America shall, within ten (10) business days from receipt of a copy of this Order, transfer to the FTC or its designated agent all funds, if any, held in account number xxxx8687 in the name of Erika Silverman Holderness, but in no event to exceed \$214,963;
- Fidelity Investments shall, within ten (10) business days from receipt of a copy of this Order, liquidate all assets in account xxx1310 in the name of James
 Holderness and transfer the proceeds of such liquidation to the FTC or its designated agent;
- B. Any funds received by the FTC pursuant to this Section or Section XI shall be deposited into a fund administered by the FTC or its agent to be used for equitable relief, including but not limited to consumer redress and any attendant expenses for the administration of any redress funds. In the event that direct redress to consumers is wholly or partially impracticable or funds remain after redress is completed, the FTC may apply any remaining funds for such other equitable relief, including but not limited to consumer

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 83 Filed 09/30/11 Page 17 of 32 Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 81 Filed 09/28/11 Page 17 of 32

information remedies, as the FTC determines to be reasonably related to the practices alleged in the Complaint. Any funds not used for such equitable relief shall be deposited to the U.S. Treasury as equitable disgorgement. The Settling Defendants shall have no right to challenge the FTC's choice of remedies or the manner of distribution.

- C. The Settling Defendants relinquish all dominion, control, and title to the funds paid to the fullest extent permitted by law. The Settling Defendants shall make no claim to or demand for return of the funds, directly or indirectly, through counsel or otherwise.
- D. The Settling Defendants agree that the facts as alleged in the Complaint filed in this action shall be taken as true without further proof: (1) in any bankruptcy case filed by or against all or any of the Settling Defendants, including but not limited to a nondischargeability complaint in any such bankruptcy case; or (2) any civil action pursued by the FTC against all or any of the Settling Defendants to enforce its rights to any payment or money judgment pursuant to this Order. The Settling Defendants further stipulate and agree that the facts alleged in the Complaint establish all elements necessary to sustain an action by the FTC pursuant to Section 523(a)(2)(A) of the Bankruptcy Code, 11 U.S.C. § 523(a)(2)(A), and that this Order shall have collateral estoppel effect for such purposes. Notwithstanding anything to the contrary in this Order, the Settling Defendants expressly retain the right and ability to contest all or any of the facts alleged in the Complaint filed in this action in: (1) any criminal proceeding; and (2) any civil or administrative proceeding to which the FTC is not a party.

- E. The judgment entered pursuant to this Section is equitable monetary relief, solely remedial and restitutionary in nature, and not a fine, penalty, punitive assessment or forfeiture.
- F. Upon request, the Settling Defendants are hereby required, in accordance with 31 U.S.C.
 § 7701, to furnish to the FTC their tax identification numbers, which shall be used for purposes of collecting and reporting on any delinquent amount arising out of this Order.
- G. Pursuant to Section 604(a)(1) of the Fair Credit Reporting Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1681b(a)(1), any consumer reporting agency may furnish a consumer report concerning any Settling Defendant to the FTC, which shall be used for purposes of collecting and reporting on any delinquent amount arising out of this Order.

RIGHT TO REOPEN

IX. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, the FTC's agreement to, and the Court's approval of, this Order is expressly premised on the truthfulness, accuracy and completeness of each Settling Defendant's financial statement previously submitted to the FTC. If, upon motion by the FTC, the Court finds that the financial statement of any Settling Defendant contains any material misrepresentation or omission, the judgment entered in Section VIII of this Order shall be reinstated and become immediately due and payable as to that defendant, less any amounts turned over to the FTC or its designated agent pursuant to Sections VIII and XI of this Order; *provided, however*, that in all other respects this Order shall remain in full force and effect unless otherwise ordered by the Court; and, *provided further*, that proceedings instituted under this provision would be in addition to, and not in lieu of, any other civil or criminal remedies as may be provided by law, including any other proceedings that the FTC may initiate to enforce this Order. For purposes of this Section, the Settling Defendants waive any right to contest any of the allegations in the Complaint. Notwithstanding anything to the contrary in this Order, the Settling Defendants expressly retain the right and ability to contest all or any of the facts alleged in the Complaint filed in this action in: (1) any criminal proceeding; and (2) any civil or administrative proceeding to which the FTC is not a party.

ASSET FREEZE

X. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, upon entry of this Order and the transfer of all assets as required by Section VIII, the freeze of the Settling Defendants' assets shall be dissolved.

CONTINUATION OF RECEIVERSHIP

XI. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Peter E. Keith, Esq. shall continue as a permanent receiver over the Receivership Entitics with full powers of a permanent receiver, including but not limited to those powers set forth in the Temporary Restraining Order issued in this matter, and including full liquidation powers. The Receiver is directed to wind up the Receivership Entities and liquidate all assets. Upon termination of the receivership and final payment to the Receiver of all approved fees, costs, and expenses, the Receiver shall turn over to the FTC or its designated agent all remaining assets in the receivership estate.

COMPLIANCE MONITORING

XII. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for the purpose of (i) monitoring and investigating compliance with any provision of this Order, and (ii) investigating the accuracy of any Settling Defendants' financial statements upon which the FTC's agreement to this Order is expressly premised: Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 83 Filed 09/30/11 Page 20 of 32 Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 81 Filed 09/28/11 Page 20 of 32

- A. Within ten (10) days of receipt of written notice from a representative of the FTC, the Settling Defendants each shall submit additional written reports, which are true and accurate and sworn to under penalty of perjury; produce documents for inspection and copying; appear for deposition; and provide entry during normal business hours to any business location in each Settling Defendant's possession or direct or indirect control to inspect the business operation;
- B. In addition, the FTC is authorized to use all other lawful means, including but not limited to:
 - obtaining discovery from any person, without further leave of court, using the procedures prescribed by Fed. R. Civ. P. 30, 31, 33, 34, 36, 45 and 69;
 - having its representatives pose as consumers and suppliers to Settling Defendants, their employees, or any other entity managed or controlled in whole or in part by any Settling Defendant, without the necessity of identification or prior notice; and
- C. The Settling Defendants each shall permit representatives of the FTC to interview any employer, consultant, independent contractor, representative, agent, or employee who has agreed to such an interview, relating in any way to any conduct subject to this Order.

The person interviewed may have counsel present.

Provided however, that nothing in this Order shall limit the FTC's lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1, to obtain any documentary material, tangible things, testimony, or information relevant to unfair or deceptive acts or practices in or affecting commerce (within the meaning of 15 U.S.C. § 45(a)(1)).

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 83 Filed 09/30/11 Page 21 of 32 Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 81 Filed 09/28/11 Page 21 of 32

COMPLIANCE REPORTING

XIII. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, in order that compliance with the provisions of this Order may be monitored:

- A. For a period of five (5) years from the date of entry of this Order,
 - 1. The Individual Settling Defendants each shall notify the FTC of the following:
 - a. Any changes in such Defendant's residence, mailing addresses, and telephone numbers, within ten (10) days of the date of such change;
 - b. Any changes in such Defendant's employment status (including self-employment), and any change in such Defendant's ownership in any business entity, within ten (10) days of the date of such change. Such notice shall include the name and address of each business that such Defendant is affiliated with, employed by, creates or forms, or performs services for; a detailed description of the nature of the business; and a detailed description of such Defendant's duties and responsibilities in connection with the business or employment; and
 - c. Any changes in such Defendant's name or use of any aliases or fictitious names within ten (10) days of the date of such change;
 - 2. The Settling Defendants shall notify the FTC of any changes in structure of the Corporate Settling Defendants or any business entity that any Settling Defendant directly or indirectly controls, or has an ownership interest in, that may affect compliance obligations arising under this Order, including but not limited to: incorporation or other organization; a dissolution, assignment, sale, merger, or

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 83 Filed 09/30/11 Page 22 of 32 Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 81 Filed 09/28/11 Page 22 of 32

other action; the creation or dissolution of a subsidiary, parent, or affiliate that engages in any acts or practices subject to this Order; or a change in the business name or address, at least thirty (30) days prior to such change, *provided* that, with respect to any such change in the business entity about which a Settling Defendant learns less than thirty (30) days prior to the date such action is to take place, such Defendant shall notify the FTC as soon as is practicable after obtaining such knowledge.

B. One hundred eighty (180) days after the date of entry of this Order and annually thereafter for a period of five (5) years, the Settling Defendants each shall provide a written report to the FTC, which is true and accurate and sworn to under penalty of perjury, setting forth in detail the manner and form in which they have complied and are complying with this Order. This report shall include, but not be limited to:

- 1. For the Individual Settling Defendants:
 - a. such Defendant's then-current residence address, mailing addresses, and telephone numbers;
 - such Defendant's then-current employment status (including selfemployment), including the name, addresses, and telephone numbers of each business that such Defendant is affiliated with, employed by, or performs services for; a detailed description of the nature of the business; and a detailed description of such Defendant's duties and responsibilities in connection with the business or employment; and

Page 22 of 28

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 83 Filed 09/30/11 Page 23 of 32 Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 81 Filed 09/28/11 Page 23 of 32

- c. Any other changes required to be reported under Subsection A of this Section.
- 2. For all Settling Defendants:
 - a. A copy of each acknowledgment of receipt of this Order, obtained pursuant to the Section titled "Distribution of Order;" and
 - Any other changes required to be reported under Subsection A of this Section.
- C. Each Settling Defendant shall notify the FTC of the filing of a bankruptcy petition by such Defendant within fifteen (15) days of filing.
- D. For the purposes of this Order, the Settling Defendants shall, unless otherwise directed by the FTC's authorized representatives, send by overnight courier (not the U.S. Postal Service) all reports and notifications to the FTC that are required by this Order to:

Associate Director for Enforcement Bureau of Consumer Protection Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20580 RE: FTC v. Residential Relief Foundation, X110004.

Provided that, in lieu of overnight courier, the Settling Defendants may send such reports or notifications by first-class mail, but only if the Settling Defendants contemporaneously send an electronic version of such report or notification to the FTC at DEbrief@ftc.gov.

E. For purposes of the compliance reporting and monitoring required by this Order, the FTC is authorized to communicate directly with each Settling Defendant.

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 83 Filed 09/30/11 Page 24 of 32 Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 81 Filed 09/28/11 Page 24 of 32

RECORDKEEPING

- XIV. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of eight (8) years from the date of entry of this Order, the Corporate Settling Defendants, and the Individual Settling Defendants for any business for which they, individually or collectively, is the majority owner or directly or indirectly controls, are hereby restrained and enjoined from failing to create and retain the following records:
 - A. Accounting records that reflect the cost of goods or services sold, revenues generated, and the disbursement of such revenues;
 - B. Personnel records accurately reflecting: the name, address, and telephone number of each person employed in any capacity by such business, including as an independent contractor; that person's job title or position; the date upon which the person commenced work; and the date and reason for the person's termination, if applicable;
 - C. Customer files containing the names, addresses, phone numbers, dollar amounts paid,
 quantity of items or services purchased, and description of items or services purchased, to
 the extent such information is obtained in the ordinary course of business;
 - D. Complaints and refund requests (whether received directly or indirectly, such as through a third party,) and any responses to those complaints or requests;
 - E. Copies of all sales scripts, training materials, advertisements, or other marketing materials; and
 - F. All records and documents necessary to demonstrate full compliance with each provision of this Order, including but not limited to, copies of acknowledgments of receipt of this Order required by the Sections titled "Distribution of Order" and "Acknowledgment of

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 83 Filed 09/30/11 Page 25 of 32 Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 81 Filed 09/28/11 Page 25 of 32

Receipt of Order" and all reports submitted to the FTC pursuant to the Section titled "Compliance Reporting."

DISTRIBUTION OF ORDER

- XV. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of five (5) years from the date of entry of this Order, the Settling Defendants shall deliver copies of the Order as directed below:
 - A. Corporate Settling Defendants: Each Corporate Settling Defendant must deliver a copy of this Order to (1) all of its principals, officers, directors, and managers; (2) all of its employees, agents, and representatives who engage in conduct related to the subject matter of the Order; and (3) any business entity resulting from any change in structure set forth in Subsection A.2 of the Section titled "Compliance Reporting." For current personnel, delivery shall be within five (5) days of service of this Order upon such Defendant. For new personnel, delivery shall occur prior to them assuming their responsibilities. For any business entity resulting from any change in structure set forth in Subsection A.2 of the Section titled "Compliance Reporting," delivery shall be at least ten (10) days prior to the change in structure.
 - B. Individual Settling Defendant as control person: For any business that an Individual Settling Defendant controls, directly or indirectly, or in which such Defendant has a majority ownership interest, such Defendant must deliver a copy of this Order to (1) all principals, officers, directors, and managers of that business; (2) all employees, agents, and representatives of that business who engage in conduct related to the subject matter of the Order; and (3) any business entity resulting from any change in structure set forth in Subsection A.2 of the Section titled "Compliance Reporting." For current personnel, delivery shall be within five (5) days of service of this Order upon such Defendant. For

Page 25 of 28

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 83 Filed 09/30/11 Page 26 of 32 Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 81 Filed 09/28/11 Page 26 of 32

new personnel, delivery shall occur prior to them assuming their responsibilities. For any business entity resulting from any change in structure set forth in Subsection A.2 of the Section titled "Compliance Reporting," delivery shall be at least ten (10) days prior to the change in structure.

- C. Individual Settling Defendant as employee or non-control person: For any business where an Individual Settling Defendant is not a controlling person of a business but otherwise engages in conduct related to the subject matter of this Order, such Defendant must deliver a copy of this Order to all principals and managers of such business before engaging in such conduct.
- D. The Settling Defendants must secure a signed and dated statement acknowledging receipt of the Order, within thirty (30) days of delivery, from all persons receiving a copy of the Order pursuant to this Section.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF RECEIPT OF ORDER

XVI. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that each Settling Defendant, within five (5) business days of receipt of this Order as entered by the Court, must submit to the FTC a truthful sworn statement acknowledging receipt of this Order.

RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

XVII. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter for purposes of construction, modification, and enforcement of this Order.

ENTRY OF THIS JUDGMENT

XVIII. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that there is no just reason for delay of entry of this judgment, and that, pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 54(b), the Clerk shall enter this Order immediately.

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 83 Filed 09/30/11 Page 27 of 32

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 81 Filed 09/28/11 Page 27 of 32

SO STIPULATED:

JAMES HOLDERNESS, Defendant

BRYAN MELANSON, Defendant

MICHAEL VALENTI, Defendant

JILLIAN MELANSON, Defendant

ROGER A. COLAIZZI, ESQ. PETER J. CURTIN, ESQ. Venable, LLP Attorneys for the Settling Defendants

Page 27 of 28

ļ

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 83 Filed 09/30/11 Page 28 of 32 05/31/2011 2:28PM FAX Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 81 Filed 09/28/11 Page 28 of 32

SO STIPULATED;

RESIDENTIAL RELIEF FOUNDATION, LLC, Defendant By:

SILVER LINING SERVICES, LLC, Defendant By: James Holderness

JAMES HOLDERNESS, Defendant

BRYAN MELANSON, Defendant <

MICHAEL VALENTI, Defendant

JILLIAN MELANSON, Defendant

ROGER A. COLAIZZI, ESQ. PETER J. CURTIN, ESQ. Venable, LLP Attorneys for the Settling Defendants

Page 27 of 28

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 83 Filed 09/30/11 Page 29 of 32 Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 81 Filed 09/28/11 Page 29 of 32

SO STIPULATED: RESI IEF, FOUNDATION, LLC, Defendant oryan Nelanon By: 1

SILVER LINING SERVICES, LLC, Defendant By: James Holderness

JAMES HOLDERNESS, Defendant BRYAN MELANSON, Defendant

MICHAEL VALENTI, Defendant

JILLIAN MELANSON, Defendant

ROGER A. COLAIZZI, ESQ. PETER J. CURTIN, ESQ. Venable, LLP Attorneys for the Settling Defendants

Page 27 of 28

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 83 Filed 09/30/11 Page 30 of 32 05/31/2011 2:34PM FAX Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 81 Filed 09/28/11 Page 30 of 32

SO STIPULATED:

RESIDENTIAL RELIEF FOUNDATION, LLC, Defendant By:

SILVER LINING SERVICES, LLC, Defendant By: James Holderness

JAMES HOLDERNESS, Defendant

BRYAN MELANSON, Defendant

MICHAEL VALENTI, Defendant

JILLIAN MELANSON, Defendant

ROGER A. COLAIZZI, ESQ. PETER J. CURTIN, ESQ. Venable, LLP Attorneys for the Settling Defendants

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 83 Filed 09/30/11 Page 31 of 32

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 81 Filed 09/28/11 Page 31 of 32

SO STIPULATED:

RESIDENTIAL RELIEF FOUNDATION, LLC, Defendant By:

SILVER LINING SERVICES, LLC, Defendant By James Holderness

JAMES HOLDERNESS, Defendant

BRYAN MELANSON, Defendant

MICHAEL VALENTL Defendant

JILLIAN MELANSON, Defendant

ROGER A. COLAIZZI, ESQ. PETER J. CORTIN, ESQ. Venable, LLP Attorneys for the Settling Defendants

Page 27 of 28

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 83 Filed 09/30/11 Page 32 of 32

Case 1:10-cv-03214-JFM Document 81 Filed 09/28/11 Page 32 of 32

E Keith Temporary Racenter PETER E. KEITH, ESQ.

Temporary Receiver for the Receivership Entities

MARK S. SAUDEK, ESQ.

Gallagher Evelius & Jones LLP Attorney for the Temporary Receiver

GREGORYA. ASHE, ESQ.

ROBIN F. THURSTON, ESQ. Federal Trade Commission Attorneys for Plaintiff

IT IS SO ORDERED this 291 day of _____ 2011.

J. FREDERICK MOTZ œ ∽ United States District Judge



יבףיודץ

Page 28 of 28