	Case5:09-cv-03814-RS	Document122	Filed09/29/10 Page1 of 23 *E-Filed 9/29/10*
1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	WILLARD K. TOM General Counsel LISA D. ROSENTHAL, Bar # 179486 KERRY O'BRIEN, Bar # 149264 EVAN ROSE, Bar # 253478 ERIC EDMONDSON, D.C. Bar # 45 Federal Trade Commission 901 Market Street, Ste. 570 San Francisco, CA 94103 (415) 848-5100 (voice) (415) 848-5184 (fax) Irosenthal@ftc.gov kobrien@ftc.gov erose@ftc.gov eedmondson@ftc.gov Attorneys for Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission		
11 12	UNITED	STATES DISTR	PICT COURT
12		N DISTRICT OF	
13		SAN JOSE DIVIS	
15			
16			
17	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION	, Case	e No. C09-03814 RS
18	Plaintiff,		OPOSED] STIPULATED
19		FOI	AL JUDGMENT AND ORDER R PERMANENT INJUNCTION
20	SWISH MARKETING, INC., a corp	REI	D OTHER EQUITABLE LIEF AS TO DEFENDANT
21	MARK BENNING, individually and officer of SWISH MARKETING, IN	as an JAS IC.,	ON STROBER
22	MATTHEW PATTERSON, individu	•	
23	as an officer of SWISH MARKETIN and	IG, INC.,	
24	JASON STROBER, individually and	l as an	
25	officer of SWISH MARKETING, IN		
26	Defendants.		
27			
28	Stipulated Final Judgment and Ord	er - C09-03814 I	RS

1 Plaintiff, the Federal Trade Commission ("FTC" or "Commission"), has filed a First 2 Amended Complaint for Injunctive and Other Equitable Relief ("Complaint") against the 3 defendants in this matter pursuant to Sections 5 and 13(b) of the Federal Trade Commission Act 4 ("FTC Act"), 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a), 53(b). The FTC and Defendant Jason Strober ("Defendant"), 5 by and through his counsel, have agreed to settlement of this action without adjudication of any 6 issue of fact or law, and without Defendant admitting any of the non-jurisdictional facts alleged 7 in the Complaint or liability for any of the violations alleged in the Complaint. To resolve all 8 matters of dispute between them in this action, the FTC and Defendant hereby stipulate to the 9 entry of, and request the Court to enter, this Stipulated Final Judgment and Order for Permanent 10 Injunction and Other Equitable Relief ("Order").

11

12

13

14

17

18

IT IS THEREFORE STIPULATED, AGREED, AND ORDERED as follows:

1. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this case and jurisdiction over all parties pursuant to 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a) and 53(b), and 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331, 1337(a), and 1345;

15 2. Venue in the Northern District of California is proper under 15 U.S.C. § 53(b) and
16 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b) and (c);

3. The acts and practices of Defendant were and are in or affecting commerce, as defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44;

The Complaint states a claim upon which relief can be granted under Section 5(a)
 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a), and the Commission has the authority to seek the relief it has
 requested;

22 5. Defendant has entered into this Order freely and without coercion, and Defendant
23 acknowledges that he has read the provisions of this Order and is prepared to abide by them;

6. The undersigned, individually and by and through their counsel, have agreed that
the entry of this Order resolves all matters of dispute between them arising from the Complaint
in this action, up to the date of entry of this Order;

27 7. Defendant waives all rights to seek judicial review or otherwise challenge or
28 contest the validity of this Order. Defendant also waives any claims that he may have held under

the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, concerning the prosecution of this action to
 the date of this Order;

8. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 65(d), the provisions of this Order are
binding upon Defendant, and his officers, agents, servants, employees, attorneys, and all other
persons or entities in active concert or participation with him, who receive actual notice of this
Order by personal service or otherwise;

7 9. This Order is remedial in nature and shall not be deemed or construed as a fine,
8 damages, penalty, or punitive assessment;

10. Each party shall bear its own costs and attorneys' fees; and

11. Entry of this Order is in the public interest.

<u>ORDER</u>

DEFINITIONS

For purposes of this Order, the following definitions shall apply:

A. "Billing information" means any data that enables any person to access a consumer's account, including but not limited to a credit card, checking, savings, share or similar account, utility bill, mortgage loan account, or debit card.

17 B. "Clearly and conspicuously" means:

9

10

11

12

13

22

23

24

25

26

27

- In textual communications (e.g., printed publications or words displayed on the
 screen of an electronic device), the disclosure shall be of a type size and location
 sufficiently noticeable for an ordinary consumer to read and comprehend the
 disclosure, in print that contrasts with the background on which it appears;
 - In communications disseminated orally or through audible means (e.g., radio or streaming audio), the disclosure shall be delivered in a volume and cadence sufficient for an ordinary consumer to hear and comprehend the disclosure;
 - 3. In communications disseminated through video means (e.g., television or streaming video), the disclosure shall be in writing in a form consistent with Subsection 1 of this definition and shall appear on the screen for a duration sufficient for an ordinary consumer to read and comprehend the disclosure;

Case5:09-cv-03814-RS Document122 Filed09/29/10 Page4 of 23

I

1	4. In communications made through interactive media such as the Internet, online				
2			services, and software:		
3			a. The disclosure shall be unavoidable and presented in a form consistent		
4			with Subsection 1 of this definition in addition to any audio or video		
5			presentation of them; and		
6			b. "In close proximity" shall mean on the same webpage, online service		
7			page, or other electronic page, and proximate to the triggering		
8			representation, and shall not be accessed or displayed through hyperlinks,		
9			pop-ups, interstitials, or other means;		
10		5.	In communications that contain both audio and visual portions, the disclosure		
11			shall be presented simultaneously in both the audio and visual portions of the		
12			communication. <i>Provided however</i> , that in any communication disseminated		
13			solely through visual or audio means, the disclosure may be made through the		
14		same means in which the communication is presented.			
15		6.	In all instances, the disclosure shall be presented prior to the consumer incurring		
16			any financial obligation, in an understandable language and syntax, and with		
17		nothing contrary to, inconsistent with, or in mitigation of the disclosures used in			
18			any communication with the consumer.		
19	C.	"Defe	ndant" means Jason Strober.		
20	D.	"Indiv	vidual Defendants" means Mark Benning, Matthew Patterson, and Jason Strober.		
21	E.	"Marketing Affiliate" means any third party with which Defendant, or any business for			
22		which Defendant is a majority owner, officer, or director, or which Defendant directly or			
23		indirectly controls, has an agreement under which:			
24		1.	Defendant or such business agrees to pay a commission or other compensation to		
25			the Marketing Affiliate because the Marketing Affiliate has driven or referred		
26			customers or potential customers to Defendant or such business; or		
27		2.	The Marketing Affiliate agrees to pay a commission or other compensation to		
28			Defendant or such business because Defendant or such business has driven or		

Case5:09-cv-03814-RS Document122 Filed09/29/10 Page5 of 23

referred customers or potential customers to the Marketing Affiliate.

Provided that, for purposes of this Order, a "Marketing Affiliate" is not a third party who merely displays banner ads, sponsored links, or other like advertisements that are created directly and solely by Defendant, or by any business for which Defendant is a majority owner, officer, or director.

F. **"Material"** means likely to affect a person's choice of, or conduct regarding, goods or services.

G. "Payment Card" means any card that is backed by an account that holds or can hold funds belonging to the cardholder, or offers credit to the cardholder, including but not limited to a prepaid card, credit card, or debit card.

H. **"Period of Inquiry"** means from September of 2006 through August of 2007.

I. **"Swish"** means Swish Marketing, Inc.

I.

PROHIBITION AGAINST MAKING MISREPRESENTATIONS

IT IS ORDERED that Defendant, and his officers, agents, servants, employees, and
attorneys, and those persons in active concert or participation with him who receive actual notice
of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any sole
proprietorship, partnership, limited liability company, corporation, subsidiary, branch, division,
Marketing Affiliate, or other entity, in connection with the advertising, promoting, offering for
sale, or sale of any Payment Card, loan, any financial product or service, or any other product or
service, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from:

22 A. Misrepresenting, or assisting others in misrepresenting, expressly or by implication,

- 1. That such product or service is a bonus, free, a gift, or without cost;
- 2. The cost or price of such product or service;
- 3. The consequences of submitting an application for any such product or service;
- 4. The method by which a consumer will be assessed a fee, charge, debit, or bill; and
- 5. Any other material fact; and
- 28

23

24

25

26

27

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

B. Representing, in any manner, expressly or by implication, that such product or service is a bonus, free, a gift, or without cost, without disclosing clearly and conspicuously, and in close proximity to the representation, all material terms, conditions, and obligations relating to the receipt and retention of such product or service.

II.

EXPRESS INFORMED CONSENT

7 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant, and his officers, agents, servants, 8 employees, and attorneys, and those persons in active concert or participation with him who 9 receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or 10 through any sole proprietorship, partnership, limited liability company, corporation, subsidiary, 11 branch, division, Marketing Affiliate, or other entity, in connection with the advertising, promoting, offering for sale, or sale of any Payment Card, loan, any financial product or service, 12 13 or any other product or service, are hereby enjoined from directly or indirectly using billing 14 information to obtain payment from a consumer, unless, prior to using such billing information 15 to obtain payment:

A. They request that the consumer indicate his or her assent to pay for the product or service using a specified account;

- 18 B. They disclose clearly and conspicuously and in close proximity to the request for the19 consumer's indication of assent the following information:
 - 1. The specific billing information to be used;
 - 2. The amount to be paid;

1

2

3

4

5

6

20

21

22

- 3. The method to be used to assess the payment;
- 4. The entity on whose behalf the payment will be assessed; and
- All material restrictions, limitations, or conditions applicable to the purchase,
 receipt, or use of the product or service that is the subject of the offer; and
- C. The consumer affirmatively indicates assent to pay for the product or service using the
 specified account. In connection with communications made through interactive media
 such as the Internet, online services, and software, the consumer must indicate such
 - Stipulated Final Judgment and Order C09-03814 RS

assent by clicking on a button that is specifically labeled to convey such assent, or by taking substantially similar affirmative action authorizing the transaction.

1

2

3

4

5

III.

MONITORING BY DEFENDANT OF HIS MARKETING AFFILIATES OR OTHER THIRD PARTIES

6 **IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that Defendant, and his officers, agents, servants, 7 employees, and attorneys, whether acting directly or through any sole proprietorship, 8 partnership, limited liability company, corporation, subsidiary, branch, division, Marketing 9 Affiliate, or other entity, in connection with the advertising, promoting, offering for sale, or sale 10 of any Payment Card, loan, or any financial product or service, shall take reasonable steps 11 sufficient to monitor and ensure that Defendant's Marketing Affiliates comply with the 12 requirements of Sections I and II of this Order. Such steps shall include, at a minimum: 13 A. Prior to accepting any prospective Marketing Affiliate, Defendant shall: 14 1. Provide the Marketing Affiliate with a copy of this Order; 15 2. Obtain a signed and dated acknowledgment from such Marketing Affiliate in 16 which the Marketing Affiliate: 17 a. Acknowledges receipt of this Order; 18 b. Expressly agrees to distribute a copy of the Order to the Marketing 19 Affiliate's owners, managers, and division heads; and 20 Expressly agrees to comply with the terms of Sections I and II; and c. 21 3. Provide written notice to such Marketing Affiliate that failing to comply with the 22 terms of Sections I and II will result in immediate termination of Defendant's 23 agreement with the Marketing Affiliate; 24 Β. Within thirty (30) days of service of this Order upon Defendant, Defendant shall: 25 1. Provide any existing Marketing Affiliate with a copy of this Order; 26 2. Obtain a signed and dated acknowledgment from such Marketing Affiliate in 27 which the Marketing Affiliate: 28 Acknowledges receipt of this Order; a. Stipulated Final Judgment and Order - C09-03814 RS Page 7 of 22

1	1 b. Expressly agrees to distribute a copy of the Order to the Max	rketing			
2	2 Affiliate's owners, managers, and division heads; and				
3	3 c. Expressly agrees to comply with the terms of Sections I and	II; and			
4	4 3. Provide written notice to each existing Marketing Affiliate that faili	ng to comply			
5	5 with the terms of Sections I and II will result in immediate terminat	ion of			
6	6 Defendant's agreement with the Marketing Affiliate and the forfeitu	ure of all			
7	7 monies earned or owed;				
8	8 <i>Provided however</i> , that if Defendant terminates a Marketing Affiliate within	n thirty (30)			
9	9 days of service of this Order, Defendant shall not be required to satisfy the	requirements			
10	10 of this Subsection with respect to any such terminated Marketing Affiliate;	and			
11	11 C. Defendant shall terminate, immediately, any Marketing Affiliate or other th	nird party that			
12	12 Defendant reasonably concludes has engaged in or is engaging in acts or pr	ractices			
13	13 prohibited by this Order, whether directly or through another person or entit	ty.			
14	14 <i>Provided however</i> , that this Section does not authorize or require Defendant to tak	e any action			
15	that violates any federal, state, or local law.				
16	IV.				
17	CONSUMER RESTITUTION				
18	18 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:				
19	19 A. Defendant and his counsel represent that, concurrently with their execution	of this Order,			
20	20 Defendant has transferred the sum of eight-hundred fifty thousand dollars (\$850,000)			
21	21 ("Restitution Funds") into an interest bearing trust account controlled by B	aker &			
22	22 Hostetler LLP, which shall hold the entire sum for no purpose other than pa	ayment to the			
23	23 Commission after entry of this Order by the Court. Within five (5) days of	receipt of			
24	24 notice of the entry of this Order, Defendant's counsel shall transfer the Res	titution Funds,			
25	25 not including accrued interest, to the Commission in the form of an electron	nic funds			
26	26 transfer. <i>Provided however that</i> , upon notice that either the FTC or the Co	urt has			
27	27 rejected acceptance or entry of this Order, Baker & Hostetler LLP will be r	elieved of its			
28	28 duties regarding the Restitution Funds and may distribute them as directed	by Defendant.			
20					

Case5:09-cv-03814-RS Document122 Filed09/29/10 Page9 of 23

1 B. All funds paid to or received by the Commission pursuant to this Order shall be deposited 2 into a fund administered by the Commission or its agent to be used for equitable relief, 3 including consumer redress and any attendant expenses for the administration of any redress fund. In the event that direct redress to consumers is wholly or partially 4 5 impracticable or funds remain after redress is completed, the Commission may apply any 6 remaining funds for such other equitable relief (including consumer information 7 remedies) as it determines to be reasonably related to Defendant's practices as alleged in 8 the Complaint. Any funds not used for such equitable relief will be deposited with the 9 United States Treasury as disgorgement. Defendant shall have no right to challenge the 10 Commission's choice of remedies under this Section. Defendant shall have no right to 11 contest the manner of distribution chosen by the Commission.

- 12 C. Subject to Subsection IV.A, Defendant relinquishes all dominion, control, and title to the
 13 funds paid to the fullest extent permitted by law. Defendant shall make no claim to or
 14 demand return of the funds, directly or indirectly, through counsel or otherwise.
- 15 D. Defendant agrees that the facts as alleged in the Complaint filed in this action shall be 16 taken as true without further proof in any bankruptcy case or subsequent civil litigation 17 pursued by the Commission to enforce its rights to any payment or money judgment 18 pursuant to this Order, including but not limited to a nondischargeability complaint in 19 any bankruptcy case. Defendant further stipulates and agrees that the facts alleged in the 20 Complaint establish all elements necessary to sustain an action by the Commission 21 pursuant to Section 523(a)(2)(A) of the Bankruptcy Code, 11 U.S.C. § 523(a)(2)(A), and 22 that this Order shall have collateral estoppel effect for such purposes.

V.

MONETARY JUDGMENT AND COOPERATION WITH FTC IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:

A. In addition to the payment of consumer restitution paid by Defendant pursuant to Section
IV above, judgment in the amount of three hundred fifty thousand dollars (\$350,000) is
hereby entered against Defendant as equitable monetary relief, in favor of the

Stipulated Final Judgment and Order - C09-03814 RS

23

24

Commission. *Provided however*, that this judgment shall be suspended until further order of the Court pursuant to this Section.

- B. If, upon motion by the Commission to the Court, the Court finds that Defendant failed to
 comply fully with Section V, the suspension of judgment shall be lifted and the Court
 may order that the judgment amount, plus interest from the entry date of this Order,
 pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1961, shall be immediately due and payable by Defendant. *Provided however*, that in all other respects, this Order shall remain in full force and
 effect, unless otherwise ordered by the Court.
- 9 C. If no motion pursuant to Subsection V.B has been filed or is pending as of the time of
 10 final resolution of this matter, as defined below, the FTC shall file a satisfaction of
 11 judgment in favor of Defendant as to the suspended judgment described in this Section in
 12 the form shown on Attachment A to this Stipulated Order within thirty (30) days of such
 13 final resolution of this matter. A final resolution of this matter occurs:
 - 1. After all appellate rights have been exhausted; or

1

2

14

15

16

17

18

26

27

28

- 2. Upon the entry of a final stipulated judgment or judgments that resolve all matters of dispute between the FTC and all remaining defendants arising from the Complaint, in which the remaining defendants have waived all rights of judicial review.
- D. Defendant, in connection with this action and any subsequent FTC investigations related
 to or associated with the transactions or the occurrences that are the subject of the FTC's
 Complaint, until such time as a satisfaction of judgment in favor of the Defendant as to
 the suspended judgment described in this Section is filed with the Court, shall cooperate
 in good faith with the FTC, including its attorneys, employees, consultants, and experts,
 to the full extent of his abilities and personal knowledge. Upon request by the FTC,
 Defendant shall:
 - Appear at such places within this Judicial District and times as the FTC shall request upon five (5) days written notice, or otherwise reasonably request, for interviews, conferences, pretrial discovery, review of documents, and for

otherwise providing cooperation consistent with this Section; 1 2. 2 Upon five (5) days written notice, appear and provide truthful testimony in any 3 trial, deposition, or other proceeding related to or associated with the transactions or the occurrences that are the subject of the Complaint, without the service of a 4 5 subpoena; *provided* that for any such trial, deposition, or other FTC proceeding 6 that occurs outside of this District, the Defendant shall be entitled to standard 7 expenses pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1821, but shall appear without the service of a 8 subpoena. 9 3. Cooperate with the FTC to prepare, and then sign under penalty of perjury, a 10 truthful affidavit regarding: Defendant's duties and responsibilities at Swish, as well as those of the 11 a. other Individual Defendants; 12 13 b. Defendant's participation in the transactions or occurrences that are the 14 subject of the Complaint, as well as such participation by the other 15 Individual Defendants; and 16 Defendant's knowledge of the transactions or occurrences that are the c. 17 subject of the Complaint, as well as such knowledge possessed by the 18 other Individual Defendants; 19 4. With respect to documents and electronically stored information produced or 20 generated in connection with this action: 21 Authenticate such documents and electronically stored information by a. 22 testifying truthfully, where Defendant possesses personal knowledge of 23 such facts, as to the place, date, creator, and circumstances of the creation 24 of such documents and electronically stored information; and 25 Certify such documents and electronically stored information that b. 26 constitute records of regularly conducted business activity by testifying 27 truthfully, where Defendant is qualified to do so, that such records were 28 made at or near the time of the occurrence of the matters set forth by (or

1		from information transmitted by) a person with knowledg	e of those
2		matters, were kept in the course of the regularly conducted	d activity of
3		Swish, and were made by the regularly conducted activity	as a regular
4		practice of Swish;	
5	5. With	respect to the creation and appearance of websites operated	by Swish:
6	a.	Assist the FTC, to the extent feasible to do so, in re-gener	ating, and
7		authenticating the appearance of, websites operated by Sw	vish during the
8		Period of Inquiry;	
9	b.	Describe the operation of Swish's servers during the Period	od of Inquiry,
10		including the purposes of such servers, when such servers	were online;
11		and whether, and when, such servers were used in product	tion, testing, or
12		development;	
13	с.	Describe Swish's network topology during the Period of I	nquiry;
14	d.	Describe the manner in which consumers were referred to	websites
15		operated by Swish during the Period of Inquiry;	
16	e.	Describe the roles of Swish employees, including but not	limited to the
17		other Individual Defendants, in designing, programming,	or otherwise
18		changing the appearance of websites operated by Swish d	uring the Period
19		of Inquiry;	
20	f.	Describe Swish's bug-tracking and software development	ticketing
21		systems during the Period of Inquiry; and	
22	g.	Answer questions posed by the FTC related to the re-gene	eration of or the
23		authentication of the appearance of websites operated by	Swish during the
24		Period of Inquiry; and	
25	6. With	respect to conversion rates, or the rates at which consumers	signed up for
26	offers	on websites operated by Swish:	
27	a.	Assist the FTC in calculating conversion rates for all prod	lucts and
28		services during the Period of Inquiry, including offers for	all products and
	Stipulated Final Ju	dgment and Order - C09-03814 RS	Page 12 of 22

services that at any point were defaulted to "Yes;"

2	b. Explain the meanings of the fields and values used in Swish's databases			
3	during the Period of Inquiry and provide an entity relationship diagram or			
4	data dictionary for such databases;			
5	c. Provide a logical data flow for Swish's lead-generating and affiliate-			
6	marketing algorithms during the Period of Inquiry;			
7	d. Describe the accounting mechanisms Swish used to track conversions and			
8	generate conversion rates; and			
9	e. Answer questions posed by the FTC related to the calculation of the			
10	conversion rates.			
11	VI.			
12	COMPLIANCE MONITORING			
13	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for the purpose of monitoring and investigating			
14	compliance with any provision of this Order:			
15	Within ten (10) days of receipt of written notice from a representative of the			
16	Commission, Defendant shall submit additional written reports, which are true and			
17	accurate and sworn to under penalty of perjury; produce documents for inspection and			
18	copying; appear for deposition; and provide entry during normal business hours to any			
19	business location in Defendant's possession or direct or indirect control to inspect the			
20	business operation;			
21	B. In addition, the Commission is authorized to use all other lawful means, including but not			
22	limited to:			
23	1. Obtaining discovery from any person, without further leave of court, using the			
24	procedures prescribed by Fed. R. Civ. P. 30, 31, 33, 34, 36, 45 and 69;			
25	2. Having its representatives pose as consumers and suppliers to Defendant, his			
26	employees, or any other entity managed or controlled in whole or in part by			
27	Defendant, without the necessity of identification or prior notice; and			
28				

Case5:09-cv-03814-RS Document122 Filed09/29/10 Page14 of 23

C. Defendant shall permit representatives of the Commission to interview any employer, consultant, independent contractor, representative, agent, or employee who has agreed to such an interview, relating in any way to any conduct subject to this Order. The person interviewed may have counsel present.

Provided however, that nothing in this Order shall limit the Commission's lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1, to 6 obtain any documentary material, tangible things, testimony, or information relevant to unfair or 8 deceptive acts or practices in or affecting commerce (within the meaning of 15 U.S.C. 9 § 45(a)(1)).

VII.

COMPLIANCE REPORTING

12 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, in order that compliance with the provisions of this 13 Order may be monitored:

14 For a period of five (5) years from the date of entry of this Order, A.

- 1. Defendant shall notify the Commission of the following:
- Any changes in Defendant's residence, mailing addresses, and telephone a. numbers, within ten (10) days of the date of such change; b. Any changes in Defendant's employment status (including self-employment), and any change in Defendant's ownership in any business entity, within ten (10) days of the date of such change. Such notice shall include the name and address of each business that Defendant is affiliated with, employed by, creates or forms, or performs services for; a detailed description of the nature of the business; and a detailed description of Defendant's duties and responsibilities in connection with the business or employment; and
 - Any changes in Defendant's name or use of any aliases or fictitious names c. within ten (10) days of the date of such change;
- 28

1

2

3

4

5

7

10

11

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

Case5:09-cv-03814-RS Document122 Filed09/29/10 Page15 of 23

2. Defendant shall notify the Commission of any changes in structure of any business entity that Defendant directly or indirectly controls, or has an ownership interest in, that may affect compliance obligations arising under this Order, including but not limited to: incorporation or other organization; a dissolution, assignment, sale, merger, or other action; the creation or dissolution of a subsidiary, parent, or affiliate that engages in any acts or practices subject to this Order; or a change in the business name or address, at least thirty (30) days prior to such change, *provided* that, with respect to any such change in the business entity about which Defendant learns less than thirty (30) days prior to the date such action is to take place, Defendant shall notify the Commission as soon as is practicable after obtaining such knowledge.

B. One hundred eighty (180) days after the date of entry of this Order and annually
thereafter for a period of three (3) years, Defendant shall provide a written report to the
FTC, which is true and accurate and sworn to under penalty of perjury, setting forth in
detail the manner and form in which he has complied and is complying with this Order.
This report shall include, but not be limited to:

 Defendant's then-current residence address, mailing addresses, and telephone numbers;

 Defendant's then-current employment status (including self-employment), including the name, addresses, and telephone numbers of each business that Defendant is affiliated with, employed by, or performs services for; a detailed description of the nature of the business; and a detailed description of Defendant's duties and responsibilities in connection with the business or employment;

 A copy of each acknowledgment of receipt of this Order, obtained pursuant to the Section titled "Distribution of Order;" and

4. Any other changes required to be reported under Subsection A of this Section.

- C. 1 Defendant shall notify the Commission of the filing of a bankruptcy petition by 2 Defendant within fifteen (15) days of filing. 3 D. For the purposes of this Order, Defendant shall, unless otherwise directed by the Commission's authorized representatives, send by overnight courier (not the U.S. Postal 4 5 Service) all reports and notifications to the Commission that are required by this Order 6 to: 7 Associate Director for Enforcement Federal Trade Commission 8 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W Washington, D.C. 20580 RE: FTČ v. Swish Marketing, Inc., et al. 9 10 *Provided* that, in lieu of overnight courier, Defendant may send such reports or 11 notifications by first-class mail, but only if Defendant contemporaneously sends an 12 electronic version of such report or notification to the Commission at: DEbrief@ftc.gov. 13 E. For purposes of the compliance reporting and monitoring required by this Order, the 14 Commission shall communicate with Defendant through Defendant's counsel, Barry J. 15 Cutler, Baker Hostetler LLP, 1050 Connecticut Avenue NW, Suite 1100, Washington, 16 D.C. 20036, or Brian M. Grossman, Tesser & Ruttenberg, 12100 Wilshire Boulevard, 17 Suite 220, Los Angeles, CA 90025. Should both such counsel cease representation of 18 Defendant, the Commission may communicate directly with Defendant for such 19 purposes. 20 VIII. 21 **RECORD KEEPING PROVISIONS** 22 **IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that, for a period of eight (8) years from the date of entry 23 of this Order, Defendant, for any business for which he is the majority owner or directly or 24 indirectly controls, is hereby restrained and enjoined from failing to create and retain the following records:
 - Accounting records that reflect the cost of goods or services sold, revenues generated, A. and the disbursement of such revenues:
- 28

27

25

26

Case5:09-cv-03814-RS Document122 Filed09/29/10 Page17 of 23

1	B.	Personnel records accurately reflecting: the name, address, and telephone number of each
2		person employed in any capacity by such business, including as an independent
3		contractor; that person's job title or position; the date upon which the person commenced
4		work; and the date and reason for the person's termination, if applicable;
5	C.	Customer files containing the names, addresses, phone numbers, dollar amounts paid,
6		quantity of items or services purchased, and description of items or services purchased, to
7		the extent such information is obtained in the ordinary course of business;
8	D.	Complaints and refund requests (whether received directly or indirectly, such as through
9		a third party) and any responses to those complaints or requests;
10	E.	Copies of all sales scripts, training materials, advertisements, or other marketing
11		materials;
12	F.	Documents sufficient to demonstrate the experience of consumers on each materially
13		different version of each website on which Defendant, whether acting directly or through
14		any sole proprietorship, partnership, limited liability company, corporation, subsidiary,
15		branch, division, Marketing Affiliate, or other entity, advertise, promote, market, offer
16		for sale, sell, or provide products or services, including, as necessary:
17		1. Screenshots or screen capture recordings of such websites;
18		2. Source code, database records, or log files for such websites; and
19		3. Other documents related to the design and functioning of such websites, including
20		but not limited to feature descriptions, programmer documentation, developer's
21		guides, specification documents, and version histories; and
22	G.	All records and documents necessary to demonstrate full compliance with each provision
23		of this Order, including but not limited to, copies of acknowledgments of receipt of this
24		Order required by the Sections titled "Distribution of Order" and "Acknowledgment of
25		Receipt of Order" and all reports submitted to the FTC pursuant to the Section titled
26		"Compliance Reporting."
27	//	
28	//	

IX.

DISTRIBUTION OF ORDER

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of five (5) years from the date of entry of this Order, Defendant shall deliver copies of the Order as directed below:

5 A. Defendant as Control Person: For any business that Defendant controls, directly or 6 indirectly, or in which Defendant has a majority ownership interest, Defendant must 7 deliver a copy of this Order to (1) all principals, officers, directors, and managers of that 8 business; (2) all employees, agents, and representatives of that business who engage in 9 conduct related to the subject matter of the Order; and (3) any business entity resulting 10 from any change in structure set forth in Subsection A.2 of the Section titled 11 "Compliance Reporting." For current personnel, delivery shall be within five (5) days of service of this Order upon Defendant. For new personnel, delivery shall occur prior to 12 13 them assuming their responsibilities. For any business entity resulting from any change 14 in structure set forth in Subsection A.2 of the Section titled "Compliance Reporting," 15 delivery shall be at least ten (10) days prior to the change in structure.

B. Defendant as employee or non-control person: For any business for which Defendant is
not a controlling person of a business but otherwise engages in conduct related to the
subject matter of this Order, Defendant must deliver a copy of this Order to all principals
and managers of such business before engaging in such conduct.

C. Defendant must secure a signed and dated statement acknowledging receipt of the Order,
within thirty (30) days of delivery, from all persons receiving a copy of the Order
pursuant to this Section.

X.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF RECEIPT OF ORDER

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant, within five (5) business days of receipt of this Order as entered by the Court, must submit to the Commission a truthful sworn statement acknowledging receipt of this Order.

28

23

24

25

26

27

1

2

3

4

XI. **RETENTION OF JURISDICTION** IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter for purposes of construction, modification, and enforcement of this Order. IT IS SO ORDERED, this <u>28th</u>day of <u>September</u>, 2010. SEEBORG UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

Case5:09-cv-03814-RS Docum	nent122 Filed09/29/10 Page20 of 23
SO STIPULATED:	\s\ Jason Strober
WILLARD K. TOM General Counsel	JASON STROBER
JEFFREY A. KLURFELD Regional Director	Dated: July 1, 2010
\s\ Lisa D. Rosenthal	\s\ Barry J. Cutler
LISA D. ROSENTHAL KERRY O'BRIEN EVAN ROSE ERIC D. EDMONDSON Federal Trade Commission 901 Market Street, Ste. 570 San Francisco, CA 94103 (415) 848-5150 (voice) (415) 848-5184 (fax)	BARRY J. CUTLER Baker Hostetler, LLP 1050 Connecticut Avenue NW Suite 1100 Washington, D.C. 20036 (202) 861-1572 (voice) (202) 861-1783 (fax) Attorney for Defendant Jason Strober
Dated: <u>September 27, 2010</u>	Dated: <u>July 1, 2010</u>
ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFF	\s\ Brian M. Grossman BRIAN M. GROSSMAN Tesser & Ruttenberg 12100 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 220 Los Angeles, CA 90025 (310) 207-4022 (voice) (310) 207-4033 (fax)
	Attorney for Defendant Jason Strober
	Dated: <u>July 2, 2010</u>
Stipulated Final Judgment and Order - Co	09-03814 RS Page 20 o

Case5:09-cv-03814-RS Document122 Filed09/29/10 Page21 of 23

		Λ
1	SO STIPULATED:	//
2	WILLARD K. TOM	11 At les
3	General Counsel	JASON STROBER
4	JEFFREY A. KLURFELD	Dated: July 1, 2010
5	Regional Director	Bu Matt.
6		Muy alle
7	LISA D. ROSENTHAL KERRY O'BRIEN	BARRY J. CUTLER Baker Hostetler, LLP
8	EVAN ROSE ERIC D. EDMONDSON	1050 Connecticut Avenue NW Suite 1100
	Federal Trade Commission	Washington, D.C. 20036
9	901 Market Street, Ste. 570	(202) 861-1572 (voice)
10	San Francisco, CA 94103 (415) 848-5150 (voice)	(202) 861-1783 (fax)
11	(415) 848-5184 (fax)	Attorney for Defendant Jason Strober
12	Dated:	Dated: 1991,2010
13	ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFF	AUTO.
14		BRIAN M. GROSSMAN Tesser & Ruttenberg
15		12100 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 220 Los Angeles, CA 90025
16		(310) 207-4022 (voice) (310) 207-4033 (fax)
17		Attorney for Defendant Jason Strober
18		Dated: 7-2-10
19		
20	λ	
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
	Stipulated Final Judgment and Order	- C09-03814 RS Page 20 of 22

	Case5:09-cv-03814-RS Documen	it122 F	Filed09/29/10	Page22 of 23
1	Attach	ment A		
1 2		<u>iniciit A</u>		
	WILLARD K. TOM General Counsel			
3	LISA D. ROSENTHAL, Bar # 179486			
4	KERRY O'BRIEN, Bar # 149264 EVAN ROSE, Bar # 253478			
5	ERIC EDMONDSON, D.C. Bar # 450294 Federal Trade Commission			
6	901 Market Street, Ste. 570 San Francisco, CA 94103			
7	(415) 848-5100 (voice) (415) 848-5184 (fax)			
8	lrosenthal@ftc.gov kobrien@ftc.gov			
9	erose@ftc.gov eedmondson@ftc.gov			
10	Attorneys for Plaintiff			
11	Federal Trade Commission			
12				
13	UNITED STATES NORTHERN DISTRI			
14	San Jose	e Divisior	n	
15		I		
16	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION,	Case I	No. C09-03814	RS
17	Plaintiff,	SATI	SFACTION O	F JUDGMENT
18	V.		O DEFENDAÑ)BER	IT JASON
19	SWISH MARKETING, INC., a corporation,	~		
20	MARK BENNING, individually and as an officer of SWISH MARKETING, INC.,			
21	MATTHEW PATTERSON, individually and			
22	as an officer of SWISH MARKETING, INC.,			
23	and			
24	JASON STROBER, individually and as an officer of SWISH MARKETING, INC.,			
25	Defendants.			
26		JI		
27	On, the Court entere	ed a Stipu	ulated Final Jud	gment and Order for
28	Permanent Injunction and Other Equitable Relie	ef as to D	efendant Jason	Strober (Dkt. #121)
	Stipulated Final Judgment and Order - C09-0	03814 RS	8	Page 21 of 22

Case5:09-cv-03814-RS Document122 Filed09/29/10 Page23 of 23

I

			2		
1	("Final Order"). Pursuant to Subsection V.A of the Final Order, a judgment in the amount of				
2	\$350,000 was entered against Defendant Strober for equitable monetary relief. Subsection V.A				
3	3 further provided, however, that Defendant Strober's	further provided, however, that Defendant Strober's liability for \$350,000 would be suspended			
4	4 upon the conditions specified in Section V.				
5	5 Pursuant to Subsection V.C of the Final Orc	ler, Plaintiff hereby acknowled	ges that the		
6	6 judgment entered against Defendant Strober is satis	fied.			
7	7				
8	8 Respe	ctfully submitted,			
9	9				
10					
11	1 KERR	D. ROSENTHAL Y O'BRIEN			
12	2 ERIC	ROSE D. EDMONDSON			
13	3 901 M	al Trade Commission arket Street, Suite 570			
14	4 (415)	rancisco, CA 94103 848-5100 (phone)			
15	5	848-5184 (facsimile)			
16		eys for Plaintiff RAL TRADE COMMISSION			
17	7				
18	8				
19	9				
20	0				
21	1				
22	2				
23	3				
24	4				
25	5				
26	6				
27					
28					
	Stipulated Final Judgment and Order - C09-038	14 RS	Page 22 of 22		