CITE OF THE OUT OF TAXOU

illi 2010) 2011 2011 2011 ania 1101 ania 2011

i	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	İ
12	ı
13	۱
14	Ï
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	ļ
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	1

28

Plaintiff, the Federal Trade Commission ("FTC" or "Commission") has filed a motion for summary judgment as to defendants 9125-8954 Quebec Inc., d.b.a. Global Management Solutions ("Global"); 9125-8947 Quebec Inc., d.b.a. Commutel Marketing and d.b.a. Marketing USA ("Commutel"); Ty Nguyen; Cory Kornelson; and Byron Steczko pursuant to Rule 56 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. This Court, after considering the pleadings, declarations, exhibits, and memoranda of the parties, and now being advised in the premises, it is hereby ordered and adjudged that the FTC's Motion for Summary Judgment is GRANTED. The Court makes the following findings and enters the following Order for Permanent Injunction:

FINDINGS

- 1. This Court has jurisdiction of the subject matter of this action and of the parties hereto. Venue in the Western District of Washington is proper.
 - 2. The Commission has the authority to seek the relief it has requested.
- 3. The acts and practices of defendants Global, Commutel, Ty Nguyen, Cory-Kornelson, and Byron Steezko were in or affecting commerce, as defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.
- 4. The complaint states a claim upon which relief may be granted against defendants and Global, Commutel, Ty Nguyen, Cory-Kornelson, and Byron Steezko under Sections 5(a) and 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a) and 53(b).
- 5. There is no genuine issue as to any material fact concerning the liability of defendants Global, Commutel, Ty Nguyen, Cory Kernelson, and Byron Steezko for the illegal practices charged in the complaint.
- 6. Defendants Commutel, Ty Nguyen, and Byron Steezke falsely represented, directly or by implication, that consumers:
 - had previously authorized the purchase of defendants' business directory
 and/or listing in the directory;
 - had agreed to purchase defendants' business directory and/or listing in the directory; and

- c. could review defendants' business directory on a trial basis without incurring financial obligation.
- 7. Defendants Global, Ty Nguyen, and Cory Kornelson falsely represented, directly or by implication, that consumers owed money for the business directory and/or listing in the directory.
- 8. Uncontroverted evidence establishes that defendants Global, Commutel, Ty Nguyen, Cory Kornelson, and Byron Stoczko violated Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a).
- 9. There is a reasonable likelihood that defendants would continue to engage in the activities alleged in the complaint unless permanently enjoined from such acts and practices.
- 10. The FTC is entitled to judgment as a matter of law pursuant to Rule 56(e) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.
- 11. Plaintiff is entitled to judgment against defendants Global, Commutel, and Ty Nguyen, in the amount of \$7,578,186 (US), for which these defendants are jointly and severally liable.
- 12. Plaintiff is entitled to judgment against defendant Cory Kornelson in the amount of \$2,086,482 (US), for which he is jointly and severally liable with Global and Ty Nguyen.
- 13. Plaintiff is entitled to judgment against defendant Byron Steezke in the amount of \$3,819,481 (US), for which he is jointly and severally liable with Commutel and Ty Nguyen.
 - 12. Entry of this Order is in the public interest.

DEFINITIONS

For purposes of this Order, the following definitions shall apply:

A. "Asset" means any legal or equitable interest in, right to, or claim to, any real and personal property including, but not limited to, chattels, goods, instruments, equipment, fixtures, general intangibles, effects, leaseholds, mail or other deliveries, inventory, checks, notes, accounts, credits, receivables, funds, monies and all cash, wherever located, and shall include both existing assets and assets acquired after the date of entry of this Order.

B. "Assisting" means providing substantial assistance or support to any person while
chowing or consciously avoiding knowing that the person or entity is engaged in any act or
practice that violates this Order, Section 5 of the FTC Act or the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16
C.F.R. 310. For purposes of this Order, providing substantial assistance or support includes, bu
s not limited to: (a) preparing, printing or transmitting invoices; (b) recording or verifying sale
solicitations;
c) performing customer service functions including, but not limited to, receiving or responding

- (c) performing customer service functions including, but not limited to, receiving or responding to consumer complaints, obtaining or receiving identifying and financial information from consumers, and communicating with consumers on behalf of the seller or telemarketer;
 (d) developing, providing or arranging for the development or provision of sales scripts or any other marketing material; (e) verifying, processing, fulfilling or arranging for the fulfillment of orders; (f) developing, providing or arranging for the provision of names of potential customers; (g) collecting or arranging for the collection of accounts receivable or other amounts owed; (h) providing or arranging for the provision of post office boxes or the services of commercial mail receiving agencies; or (i) performing or providing marketing services of any kind.
- C. "Customer" or "Consumer" means any person who is or may be required to pay for goods or services offered for sale or sold by the defendants.
- D. "Defendants" means 9125-8954 Quebec Inc., d.b.a. Global Management
 Solutions; 9125-8947 Quebec Inc., d.b.a. Commutel Marketing and d.b.a. Marketing USA; Ty
 Nguyen, a.k.a. Hiep Manh Nguyen; Gery Kornelson; and Dyron Steezko.
- E. "Document" is synonymous in meaning and equal in scope to the usage of the term in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 34(a), and includes writings, drawings, graphs, charts, photographs, audio and video recordings, computer records, and other data compilations from which information can be obtained and translated, if necessary, through detection devices into reasonably usable form. A draft or non-identical copy is a separate document within the meaning of the term.
 - F. "Financial institution" means any bank, savings and loan institution, credit union

or any other financial depository of any kind including, but not limited to, any brokerage house, trustee, broker-dealer, escrow agent, title company, commodity trading company or precious metal dealer.

- G. "Material" means likely to affect a person's choice of, or conduct regarding, goods or services.
- H. "Person" means any natural person and any organization or other legal entity, including a corporation, partnership, sole proprietorship, limited liability company, association, cooperative, government agency, or any other group or combination acting as an entity.
- I. "Telemarketing" means a plan, program, or campaign which is conducted to induce the purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution, by use of one or more telephones and which involves more than one interstate telephone call.

ORDER

I. PERMANENT BAN

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that defendants are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from engaging, participating or assisting others in the advertising, promoting, telemarketing, offering for sale, selling, or distributing business directories and/or listings in business directories to U.S. residents, or collecting or attempting to collect payment for business directories and/or listings in business directories from U.S. residents.

II. PROHIBITED CONDUCT

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that defendants, their successors and assigns, and their officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and those persons in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any person, trust, corporation, subsidiary, division or other device, in connection with the advertising, promoting, telemarketing, offering for sale, selling or distributing of any good or service to U.S. residents, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from:

A. Misrepresenting, expressly or by implication:

26

27

28

- 1. That consumers have previously authorized the purchase of a good or service:
 - 2. That consumers have agreed to purchase a good or service;
- 3. That consumers have a trial period during which they can review a good or service without incurring financial obligation;
 - 4. That consumers owe money for a good or service;
 - 5. Any material fact regarding a good or service; and
- 6. Any material fact regarding the terms, conditions, and limitations of any refund or guarantee policy;
- B. Failing to disclose in outbound telemarketing calls to consumers, promptly and in a clear and conspicuous manner: (1) the identity of the seller; (2) that the purpose of the call is to sell goods or services; and (3) the nature of the goods or services;
- C. Failing to disclose in outbound telemarketing calls to consumers, in a clear and conspicuous manner, all material terms, conditions, and limitations of any refund or guarantee policy, or any policy of non-refundability;
- D. Violating any provision of the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. Part 310, provided, however, that if the Commission promulgates rules that modify or supersede the Telemarketing Sales Rule, in whole or in part, defendants and their representatives shall comply fully and completely with all applicable requirements thereof, on and after the effective date of any such rules;
 - E. Assisting others who violate any provision of Section II of this Order.

III. CUSTOMER INFORMATION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that defendants, their successors and assigns, and their officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and those persons in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any person, trust, corporation, subsidiary, division or other device, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from selling, renting, leasing,

10

14 15

13

16

17 18

19

20 21

22

2324

25

26 27

28

transferring, or otherwise disclosing the name, address, telephone number, Social Security number, credit card number, bank account number, e-mail address or other identifying information of any person who paid any money to any defendant named in this matter prior to entry of this Order for any business directory and/or any listing in a business directory. *Provided, however*, that defendants may disclose such identifying information to a law enforcement agency or as required by any law, regulation or court order.

IV. CEASING COLLECTION ON ACCOUNTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that defendants, their successors and assigns, and their officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and those persons in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any person, trust, corporation, subsidiary, division or other device, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from collecting or attempting to collect payment for any business directory and/or any listing in any business directory sold by any defendant named in this matter, directly or through any third party, on any account established prior to entry of this Order.

V. RETURN OF UNCASHED CHECKS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the defendants' rights and interests in all uncashed checks and other negotiable instruments sent to defendants in response to defendants' telemarketing of the business directory and/or listing in the business directory to U.S. residents prior to entry of this Order are hereby forfeited. Said uncashed checks and negotiable instruments shall be returned to their makers by the FTC or its agent. In the event the makers of the uncashed checks and negotiable instruments cannot be located, the FTC or its agent shall destroy the uncashed checks and negotiable instruments.

VI. MONETARY JUDGMENT

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:

A. Judgment is hereby entered against defendants Global, Commutel, and Ty Nguyen, in the amount of \$7,578,186 (US), for which these defendants are jointly and severally

2

6

9

11

14

15 16

17 18

19

20 21

> 23 24

22

25 26

27

28

- B. Judgment is hereby entered against defendant Cory Kurnelson in the amount of \$2,086,482 (US), for which he is jointly and severally liable with Global and Ty Nguyen, as -restitution for consumer injury;
- Judgment is hereby entered against defendant Byron Steezko in the amount of C. \$3,819,481 (US), for which he is jointly and severally liable with Commutel and Ty Nguyen as. cestitution for consumer injury:
- Payment shall be made by certified check or other guaranteed funds payable and D. delivered to the Commission, or by wire transfer, in accordance with instructions provided by the Commission; and
- E. All funds paid pursuant to this Order shall be deposited into a fund administered by the Commission or its agent to be used for equitable relief, including, but not limited to consumer redress, and any attendant expenses for the administration of such equitable relief. In the event that direct redress to consumers is wholly or partially impracticable or funds remain after redress is completed, the Commission may apply any remaining funds for such other equitable relief (including consumer information remedies) as it determines to be reasonably related to the defendants' practices alleged in the complaint. Any funds not used for such equitable relief shall be deposited to the U.S. Treasury as disgorgement. Defendants shall have no right to challenge the Commission's choice of remedies under this Section or the manner of distribution chosen by the Commission.

VII. DISSOLUTION OF ASSET FREEZE

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the freeze against defendants' assets pursuant to Section II of the Preliminary Injunction entered by this Court on March 22, 2005, shall be lifted upon entry of this Order.

VIII. NOTICE OF ORDER TO THIRD PARTY ASSET HOLDERS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that within five (5) business days of receipt of this Order as entered by the Court, the defendants shall serve a copy of this Order on all entities, including

financial institutions, that hold or have held assets derived from defendants' marketing of business directories and/or listings in the directories.

IX. TURNOVER OF ASSETS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, in order to satisfy partially the monetary judgment set forth in Section VI of this Order:

- A. Defendants shall forfeit all rights and interests in all funds held in their name or on their behalf in any account previously frozen pursuant to Section II of the Preliminary Injunction entered by this Court on March 22, 2005, including, but not limited to Royal Bank of Canada, Harris Trust and Savings Bank, and Moneris Solutions;
- B. Any law firm, financial or brokerage institution, escrow agent, title company, commodity trading company, business entity or person, whether located within or outside of the United States, that holds, controls or maintains any asset or any account of, or on behalf of, or for the benefit of defendants, shall turn over such account or asset to the Commission within ten (10) business days after receiving notice of this Order by any means including, but not limited to, facsimile transmission; and
- C. Within ten (10) business days after receiving notice of this Order by any means including, but not limited to, facsimile transmission, Moneris Solutions shall return all funds held in the name of or on behalf of defendants to the consumer accounts from which said funds were transferred.

X. COMPLIANCE REPORTING BY DEFENDANTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, in order that compliance with the provisions of this Order may be monitored:

A. Defendants Ty Nguyen, Sery Kornelson, and Byron Steczko, within ten (10) days of service of this Order, each shall notify the Commission in writing of (1) their residence and mailing address; (2) their home telephone number; (3) the name, address, and telephone number of their employer; (4) a description of their employer's activities; and (5) a description of their duties and responsibilities;

- B. For a period of five (5) years from the date of entry of this Order:
- 1. Defendants Ty Nguyen, Cery Kornelson, and Byron Stoczko shall notify the Commission of the following:
 - a. Any changes in residence, mailing addresses, and telephone numbers, within ten (10) days of the date of such change;
 - b. Any changes in employment status (including self-employment) and any change in ownership in any business entity, within ten (10) days of the date of such change. Such notice shall include the name and address of each business that the defendant is affiliated with, employed by, creates or forms, or performs services for; a statement of the nature of the business; and a statement of the defendant's duties and responsibilities in connection with the business or employment; and
 - c. Any changes in name or use of any aliases or fictitious names; and
- 2. Defendants shall notify the Commission of any changes in the corporate structure of defendants Global or Commutel, or any business entity that any individual defendant directly or indirectly controls or has an ownership interest in, that may affect compliance obligations arising under this Order including, but not limited to, a dissolution, assignment, sale, merger or other action that would result in the emergence of a successor entity; the creation or dissolution of a subsidiary, parent or affiliate that engages in any acts or practices subject to this Order; the filing of a bankruptcy petition; or a change in the corporate name and address, at least thirty (30) days prior to such change, provided that, with respect to any proposed change in the corporation about which the defendants learn less than thirty (30) days prior to the date such action is to take place, the defendants shall notify the Commission as soon as practicable after obtaining such knowledge;
- C. One hundred eighty (180) days after the date of entry of this Order, each defendant

XI. COMPLIANCE MONITORING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for the purpose of monitoring and investigating

J AF/46/0000

compliance with any provision of this Order:

25

26

27

- A. Within ten (10) days of receipt of written notice from a representative of the Commission, defendants shall submit additional written reports, sworn to under penalty of perjury; produce documents for inspection and copying; appear for deposition; and/or provide entry during normal business hours to any U.S. business location in defendants' possession, or direct or indirect control, to inspect the business operation;
- B. In addition, the Commission is authorized to monitor compliance with this Order by all other lawful means including, but not limited to, the following:
 - 1. Obtaining discovery from any person, without further leave of court, using the procedures prescribed by Fed. R. Civ. P. 30, 31, 33, 34, 36, and 45; and
 - 2. Posing as consumers and suppliers to defendants, defendants' employees, or any other entity managed or controlled, in whole or in part, by defendants, without the necessity of identification or prior notice; and
- C. Defendants shall permit representatives of the Commission to interview any employer, consultant, independent contractor, representative, agent or employee who has agreed to such an interview, relating in any way to any conduct subject to this Order. The person interviewed may have counsel present.

Provided, however, that nothing in this Order shall limit the Commission's lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49 and 57b-1, to obtain any documentary material, tangible things, testimony, or information relevant to unfair or deceptive acts or practices in or affecting commerce (within the meaning of 15 U.S.C. § 45(a)(1)).

XII. RECORD KEEPING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of eight (8) years from the date of entry of this Order, defendants, in connection with any business where any (1) defendant is the majority owner, or directly or indirectly manages or controls the business, and (2) the business is engaged in telemarketing to U.S. residents, or in assisting others engaged in said business, and their agents, employees, corporations, successors and assigns, and those persons in active concert

20

22

25

28

or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, are hereby restrained and enjoined from failing to create and retain the following records:

- A. Accounting records that reflect the cost of goods or services sold, revenues generated, and the disbursement of such revenues;
- B. Personnel records accurately reflecting: the name, address, and telephone number of each person employed in any capacity by such business, including as an independent contractor; that person's job title or position; the date upon which the person commenced work; and the date and reason for the person's termination, if applicable;
- C. Customer files containing the names, addresses, telephone numbers, dollar amounts paid, quantity of items or services purchased, and description of items or services purchased, to the extent such information is obtained in the ordinary course of business;
- D. Complaints and refund requests (whether received directly, indirectly or through any third party) and any responses to those complaints or requests;
- E. Copies of all sales scripts, training materials, advertisements or other marketing materials; and
- F. All records and documents necessary to demonstrate full compliance with each provision of this Order including, but not limited to, copies of acknowledgments of receipt of this Order required by Section XIII.D of this Order, and all reports submitted to the FTC pursuant to Section X of this Order.

XIII. DISTRIBUTION OF ORDER BY DEFENDANTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of five (5) years from the date of entry of this Order, defendants shall deliver copies of this Order as directed below:

A. Defendants Global and Commutel must deliver a copy of this Order to all of their principals, officers, directors, and managers. Defendants Global and Commutel also must deliver copies of this Order to all of their employees, agents, and representatives who engage in conduct related to the subject matter of this Order. For current personnel, delivery shall be made within

five (5) days of service of this Order upon defendants. For new personnel, delivery shall occur prior to their assuming their responsibilities;

- B. For any business that defendant Ty Nguyen, Cory Kornelson or Byron Steezko controls, directly or indirectly, or has a majority ownership interest in, such defendant must deliver a copy of this Order to all principals, officers, directors, and managers of that business. Such defendant must also deliver copies of this Order to all employees, agents, and representatives of that business who engage in conduct related to the subject matter of this Order. For current personnel, delivery shall be within five (5) days of service of this Order upon defendants. For new personnel, delivery shall occur prior to their assuming their responsibilities;
- C. For any business where defendant Ty Nguyen, Cory Kornelson or Byron Steezko is not a controlling person, but otherwise engages in conduct related to the subject matter of this Order, such defendant must deliver a copy of this Order to all principals and managers of such business before engaging in such conduct; and
- D. Defendants must secure a signed and dated statement acknowledging receipt of this Order, within thirty (30) days of delivery, from all persons receiving a copy of the Order pursuant to this Section.

XIV. ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF RECEIPT OF ORDER BY DEFENDANTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that each defendant, within five (5) business days of receipt of this Order as entered by the Court, must submit to the Commission a truthful sworn statement acknowledging receipt of this Order.

XV. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter for purposes of construction, modification, and enforcement of this Order.

11 SO ORDERED, this 2 3 4 THE HONORABLE THOMAS SU 5 UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE 6 Presented by: 7 8 s/Kathryn C. Decker KATHRYN C. DECKER, WSBA #12389 9 JULIE K. MAYER, WSBA #34638 915 Second Avenue, Suite 2896 10 Scattle, WA 98174 206-220-4486 (Decker) 206-220-4475 (Mayer) 11 206-220-6366 (fax) 12 kdecker@ftc.gov jmayer@ftc.gov 13 Attorneys for Plaintiff 14 Federal Trade Commission 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26

27

28 -