1 2 3 4 5	JENNIFER LARABEE, Cal. Bar No. 163989 FAYE CHEN BARNOUW, Cal. Bar No. 168631 RAYMOND E. MCKOWN, Cal. Bar No. 150975 KENNETH ABBE, Cal. Bar No. 172416 Federal Trade Commission 10877 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 700 Los Angeles, CA 90024 Tel: (310) 824-4343 Fax: (310) 824-4380		
6 7	Attorneys for Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission		
8	ORIGINAL		
	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT		
10	CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA		
11	SOUTHERN DIVISION		
12	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION,   Case No. SA CV04-0474 CJC (JWJx)		
13	Plaintiff,		
14	v. SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT		
15	NATIONAL CONSUMER COUNCIL,   AND [PROPOSED] FINAL ORDER FOR PERMANENT INJUNCTION		
16	INC., et al.,  WITH RECEIVERSHIP DEFENDANTS		
17	Defendants.		
18	NO HEARING REQUESTED		
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
28			

Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission ("FTC" or "Commission"), pursuant to Sections 13(b) and 19 of the Federal Trade Commission Act ("FTC Act"), 15 U.S.C. § 53(b) and § 57, filed a Complaint alleging violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a), of the Telemarketing Sales Rule ("TSR"), 16 C.F.R. Part 310, of Subtitle A of Title V of the Gramm-Leach-Bliley Act ("GLB Act") 15 U.S.C. §§ 6801 through 6809, and of the FTC's Consumer Financial Information Rule ("Privacy Rule"), 16 C.F.R. Part 313. The Complaint sought an injunction and other equitable relief. Concurrently, the Commission filed an *ex parte* application for a Temporary Restraining Order with Asset Freeze, Appointment of Temporary Receiver, and Order to Show Cause Why a Preliminary Injunction Should Not Issue And a Permanent Receiver Should Not Be Appointed ("TRO").

On May 3, 2004, the Court granted the *ex parte* Application, appointed Robb Evans and Associates LLC as Temporary Receiver over Defendants NATIONAL CONSUMER COUNCIL, INC., an Arizona corporation ("NCC-AZ"); NATIONAL CONSUMER COUNCIL, INC., a California corporation ("NCC-CA"); NATIONAL CONSUMER COUNCIL, INC., a Nevada corporation ("NCC-NV"); LONDON FINANCIAL GROUP; NATIONAL CONSUMER DEBT COUNCIL, LLC; SOLIDIUM, LLC; J.P. LANDIS, LLC; FINANCIAL RESCUE SERVICES, INC.; SIGNATURE EQUITIES, LLC; M&L SPRINGFIELD TRUST; PC HAILEY TRUST and VIA LIDO TRUST and instituted an asset freeze. On May 14, 2004, by stipulation of the parties, and order of the Court, Defendant UNITED CONSUMERS LAW GROUP was made part of the Receivership.

On May 21, 2004, the Court entered Stipulated Preliminary Injunctions and Orders ("PI") against all of the Defendants which continued the TRO's injunctive provisions and asset freeze and appointed Robb Evans and Associates LLC as the Permanent Receiver over NCC-AZ; NCC-CA; NCC-NV; LONDON FINANCIAL GROUP; NATIONAL CONSUMER DEBT COUNCIL, LLC; SOLIDIUM,

LLC; J.P. LANDIS, LLC; FINANCIAL RESCUE SERVICES, INC.;
SIGNATURE EQUITIES, LLC; UNITED CONSUMERS LAW GROUP;
M&L SPRINGFIELD TRUST; PC HAILEY TRUST and VIA LIDO TRUST.
On November 1, 2004, the Court entered a Stipulated Order appointing Robb

On November 1, 2004, the Court entered a Stipulated Order appointing Robb Evans and Associates LLC as Permanent Receiver over FINANCIAL RESCUE SERVICES CONSUMER SERVICES, INC. ("FRC Services Inc."), FINANCIAL RESCUE SUPPORT SERVICES, INC. ("FR Support Inc."), MAGICAL AGE ARTS & ENTERTAINMENT COMPANY, INC. ("Magical Age Inc.") and M&M ENTERPRISES, INC. ("M&M Inc."), with all of the same rights, duties and powers as set forth in the PI appointing Robb Evans and Associates LLC as Permanent Receiver over FINANCIAL RESCUE SERVICES and all of the other entities under Receivership in this matter (collectively, the "Receivership Defendants").

Now Plaintiff Commission and the Receivership Defendants, negotiating through their respective counsel, have agreed to a settlement of this action.

Accordingly, the Commission and the Receivership Defendants consent to entry of this settlement agreement and [Proposed] Final Order for Permanent Injunction ("Order") without adjudication of any issue of fact or law. The parties further agree that entry of this Order in the docket by the Court will constitute notice to them of the terms and conditions of the Order. Plaintiff and the Receivership Defendants, having requested the Court to enter this Order, the Court hereby finds and orders as follows:

# FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. The Receivership Defendants were properly served with the Complaint, Summons and TRO in this matter.
- 2. The Receivership Defendants consented to the entry of the PI against them and were properly served with the PI in this matter.

- 3. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of the case and personal jurisdiction over the Receivership Defendants. Venue in the Central District of California is proper.
- 4. The alleged actions of the Receivership Defendants are in or affecting commerce, as defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.
- 5. The Complaint states a claim upon which relief can be granted against the Receivership Defendants under Sections 5(a) and 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a) and 53(b); under the TSR, 16 C.F.R. Part 310; under Subtitle A of Title V of the GLB Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 6801 through 6809, and under the Privacy Rule, 16 C.F.R. Part 313.
- 6. Plaintiff has the authority under Sections 13(b) and 19 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 53(b) and § 57, to seek the relief it has requested.
- 7. The Receivership Defendants have not admitted to liability as to the charges in the Complaint, and their consent to entry of this permanent injunction shall not be interpreted to constitute an admission that they have engaged in any violations of any law or regulations.
- 8. In light of the facts that the Receiver is concluding all operations of the entities in the Permanent Receivership and the Receiver intends to completely wind-down the business of the Receivership Defendants pursuant to the PI, it is appropriate for the Receivership Defendants to consent to the entry of this permanent injunction to have a full and final settlement of the action against them.
- 9. The Receivership Defendants waive all rights to seek judicial review or otherwise challenge or contest the validity of this Order.
- 10. The Receivership Defendants waive any claim that they may hold against the Commission, its employees, representatives or agents.
- 11. The Receivership Defendants waive any claim that they may hold under the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412 (as amended), concerning the prosecution of this action to the date of this Order, and any rights to attorneys' fees

that may arise under said provision of law.

- 12. All parties shall bear their own costs and attorneys' fees.
- 13. The Receivership Defendants enter into this Order freely and acknowledge that they understand the provisions of this Order and are prepared to abide by its terms.
- 14. This Order is remedial in nature and shall not be construed as the payment of a fine, penalty, punitive assessment, or forfeiture.
  - 15. Entry of this Order is in the public interest.

# **DEFINITIONS**

- 1. "Assets" means any legal or equitable interest in, right to, or claim to, any real and personal property, including but not limited to chattel, goods, instruments, equipment, fixtures, general intangibles, effects, leaseholds, mail or other deliveries, inventory, checks, notes, accounts, credits, receivables, and all cash, wherever located.
- 2. "Document" is synonymous in meaning and equal in scope to the usage of the term in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 34(a), and includes writings, drawings, graphs, charts, photographs, audio and video recordings, electronic mail ("email"), computer records, and other data compilations from which information can be obtained and translated, if necessary, through detection devices into reasonably usable form. A draft or non-identical copy is a separate "document" within the meaning of the term.
- 3. The "Receivership Defendants" means NCC-AZ; NCC-CA; NCC-NV; LONDON FINANCIAL GROUP; NATIONAL CONSUMER DEBT COUNCIL, LLC; SOLIDIUM, LLC; UNITED CONSUMERS LAW GROUP, A PROFESSIONAL CORP.; J.P. LANDIS, LLC; FINANCIAL RESCUE SERVICES, INC.; SIGNATURE EQUITIES, LLC; M&L SPRINGFIELD TRUST; PC HAILEY TRUST; VIA LIDO TRUST; FRC SERVICES INC.; FR

SUPPORT INC.; MAGICAL AGE INC.; and M&M INC.; and each of them, by whatever names they might be known, and their affiliates, subsidiaries, successors and assigns and any other corporations or businesses under the control of any of them.

- 4. The terms "and" and "or" have both conjunctive and disjunctive meanings to make the meaning more inclusive than exclusive.
- 5. "Person" means any individual, natural person, organization, or other legal entity, including a corporation, partnership, proprietorship, association, cooperative, government or governmental subdivision or agency, or any other group or combination acting as an entity. For purposes of this Order, a "consumer" is a person.
  - 6. "Debtor" means any person indebted to a creditor or creditors.
  - 7. "Debt negotiation" means:
  - a. the business or practice of receiving, in return for consideration, or the scheduled receipt, of a debtor's monies, or evidences thereof, for the purpose of distribution among certain specified creditors in payment, or partial payment, of the debtor's obligations; or
  - b. the business or practice of acting or offering or attempting to act as an intermediary between a debtor and his creditors for the purpose of settling, negotiating, or in any way altering the terms of payment of any debt of a debtor.
- 8. "Credit-related products, programs or services" means any product, program or service which is advertised, offered for sale, or sold to consumers as a method by which consumers may establish or obtain any extension of credit or credit device, including, but not limited to, credit cards, loans, or financing, or as a method to consolidate or liquidate debts.
- 9. "<u>Assisting others</u>" means knowingly providing any of the following goods or services to another person or entity:

- a. performing customer service functions, including, but not limited to, receiving or responding to consumer complaints; or
- b. formulating or providing, or arranging for the formulation or provision of, any telephone sales script or any other marketing material; or
- c. providing names of, or assisting in the generation of, potential customers; or
  - d. performing marketing services of any kind.
- 10. The "<u>Telemarketing Sales Rule</u>" means the FTC Rule entitled "Telemarketing Sales Rule," 16 C.F.R. § 310.
- 11. "Telemarketing" means a plan, program, or campaign which is conducted to induce the purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution, by use of one or more telephones and which involves more than one interstate telephone call. The term does not include the solicitation of sales through the mailing of a catalog which: contains a written description or illustration of the goods or services offered for sale; includes the business address of the seller; includes multiple pages of written material or illustrations; and has been issued not less frequently than once a year, when the person making the solicitation does not solicit customers by telephone but only receives calls initiated by customers in response to the catalog and during those calls takes orders only without further solicitation. For purposes of the previous sentence, the term "further solicitation" does not include providing the customer with information about, or attempting to sell, any other item included in the same catalog which prompted the customer's call or in a substantially similar catalog.
- 12. "Outbound telephone call" means a telephone call initiated by a telemarketer to induce the purchase of goods or services or to solicit a charitable contribution.
- 13. "<u>Telemarketer</u>" means any person who, in connection with telemarketing, initiates or receives telephone calls to or from a customer or donor.

- 14. In connection with telemarketing, a "<u>customer</u>" means any person who is or may be required to pay for goods or services offered through telemarketing.
- 15. "Representatives" means successors, assigns, officers, agents, servants and employees of the Receivership Defendants and those persons in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise.
- 16. "Material" means likely to affect a person's choice of, or conduct, regarding, goods, services or a charitable contribution.
- 17. "Clearly and Conspicuously" or "Clear and Conspicuous" means that:
  - a. in print communications, that the message shall be in a type size and location sufficiently noticeable for an ordinary consumer to read and comprehend it, in print that contrasts with the background against which it appears;
  - b. in communications disseminated orally, that the message shall be delivered in a volume and cadence sufficient for an ordinary consumer to hear and comprehend it;
  - c. in communications made through an electronic medium (such as television, video, radio, and interactive media such as the Internet, online services and software), that the message shall be presented simultaneously in both the audio and visual portions of the communication;
  - d. in any communication presented solely through visual or audio means, that the message may be made through the same means in which the communication is presented:
    - i. Any audio message shall be delivered in a volume and cadence sufficient for an ordinary consumer to hear and comprehend it, and
    - ii. Any visual message shall be of a size and shade, with a degree of

contrast to the background against which it appears and shall appear on the screen for a duration and in a location, sufficiently noticeable for an ordinary consumer to read and comprehend it;

Regardless of the medium used to disseminate it, the message shall be in understandable language and syntax. Nothing contrary to, inconsistent with, or in mitigation of, the message shall be used in any communication.

- 18. "Established business relationship" means a relationship between the seller and a person based on: (a) the person's purchase, rental, or lease of the seller's goods or services or a financial transaction between the person and seller, within the eighteen months immediately preceding the date of the telemarketing call; or (b) the person's inquiry or application regarding a product or service offered by the seller, within the three months immediately preceding the date of a telemarketing call.
- Registry maintained by the Federal Trade Commission pursuant to 16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B).

# **ORDER**

I.

# PROHIBITION AGAINST MATERIAL MISREPRESENTATIONS

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that the Receivership Defendants, their successors, assigns, officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and those persons or entities in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, in connection with the advertising, marketing, promoting, offering for sale, or sale of any good or service, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from misrepresenting, or assisting others in misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, orally or in writing,

any fact material to a consumer's decision to buy or accept the good or service, including but not limited to the ability to reduce the amount owed by a debtor to a creditor or the Receivership Defendants' ability to have a positive effect on the debtor's credit report or credit history.

II.

#### PROHIBITION AGAINST MATERIAL OMISSIONS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Receivership Defendants, their successors, assigns, officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and those persons or entities in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, in connection with the advertising, promotion, offering for sale or sale of debt negotiation services or credit-related products, programs or services, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from failing to disclose, clearly and conspicuously, prior to the time when a consumer purchases a service from the Receivership Defendants all information material to a consumer's decision to buy any debt negotiation services or credit-related products, programs, or services, including but not limited to the following information, where appropriate:

- A. That while the consumer is using the product, program or services, late fees, penalties, and interest will continue to accrue on the consumer's debt until the consumer's creditors accept a settlement offer and the settlement is paid;
- B. That while the consumer is using the product, program or services, the consumer's creditors may still sue to collect on his debts, and further, once a judgment has been obtained, the creditors may garnish the consumer's wages;
- C. That while the consumer is using the product, program or services, the consumer's creditors may raise the interest rates applicable to his debt;
  - D. That to the extent that the Receivership Defendants may be able to

obtain a favorable settlement with a consumer's creditor of the consumer's debt, the consumer is required to treat that debt savings as income for purposes of federal and state income taxes; and

E. That a debt settled for less than the full amount of the amount owed may result in a negative notation on the consumer's credit report.

#### III.

# PROHIBITION AGAINST

#### ABUSIVE TELEMARKETING PRACTICES

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, in connection with telemarketing, the Receivership Defendants are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from engaging in, or causing other persons to engage in, violations of the Telemarketing Sales Rule, including but not limited to:

- A. Initiating any outbound telephone call to a person's telephone number on the National Do Not Call Registry to induce the purchase of goods or services unless the seller proves:
  - 1. The seller has obtained the express agreement, in writing, of such person to place calls to that person. Such written agreement shall clearly evidence such consumer's authorization that calls made by or on behalf of a specific party may be placed to that person, and shall include the telephone number to which the calls may be placed and the signature of that person; or
  - 2. The seller has an established business relationship with such person and that person has not stated that he does not wish to receive outbound telephone calls from the seller; or
- B. Abandoning any outbound telephone call to a person by failing to connect the call to a representative within two (2) seconds of the person's completed greeting, unless the following four (4) conditions are met:

1 |

- 1. The Receivership Defendants employ technology that ensures abandonment of no more than three (3) percent of all calls answered by a person, measured per day per calling campaign;
- For each telemarketing call placed, the Receivership Defendants allow the telephone to ring for at least fifteen (15) seconds or four
   (4) rings before disconnecting an unanswered call;
- 3. Whenever a representative is not available to speak with the person answering the call within two (2) seconds after the person's completed greeting, the seller or telemarketer promptly plays a recorded message that states the name and telephone number of the seller on whose behalf the call was placed; and
- 4. The Receivership Defendants retain records, in accordance with 16 C.F.R. § 310.5 (b)-(d), establishing compliance with the preceding three conditions; and
- C. Initiating any outbound telephone call to a telephone number within a given area code without first paying the required annual fee for access to the telephone numbers, within that area code, that are on the National Do Not Call Registry;

Provided, however, that if the Commission promulgates rules that modify or supersede the Telemarketing Sales Rule, in whole or part, the Receivership Defendants shall comply fully and completely with all applicable requirements thereof, on and after the effective date of any such rules.

#### IV.

## MONITORING TELEMARKETING COMPLIANCE

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, in connection with any business that engages in telemarketing, or assists others engaged in telemarketing, the Receivership Defendants are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from:

1 |

- A. Failing to take reasonable steps to ensure that all employees and independent contractors engaged in telemarketing comply with Paragraph III of this Order. Such steps shall include:
  - 1. Establishing a procedure for receiving and responding to consumer complaints of violations of the TSR or this Order; and
  - 2. Ascertaining the number and nature of consumer complaints in which each employee or independent contractor is involved;
- B. Failing promptly to investigate fully any consumer complaint received by any business to which this Paragraph applies; and
- C. Failing to take corrective action with respect to any telemarketer whom the Receivership Defendants determine is not complying with this Order, which may include training, disciplining, and/or terminating such sales person;

Provided, however, that this Paragraph does not authorize or require the Receivership Defendants to take any action that violates any federal, state, or local law.

V.

# PROHIBITION ON VIOLATING THE GRAMM-LEACH-BLILEY ACT

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, when acting as or on behalf of a financial institution, the Receivership Defendants are hereby restrained and enjoined from violating any provision of Subtitle A of Title V of the Gramm-Leach-Bliley Act, 15 U.S.C. § 6801-6809, and implementing regulations promulgated by the Commission at 16 C.F.R. Parts 313 and 314.

/// ///

# VI.

## MONETARY RELIEF

#### IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:

- A. Monetary judgment is entered in favor of the Commission and against the Receivership Defendants, jointly and severally, in the amount of \$84,333,293 (eighty-four million, three hundred thirty-three thousand, two hundred ninety-three dollars);
- B. All funds paid pursuant to this Paragraph shall be deposited into a fund administered by the Commission or its agent to be used for equitable relief, including but not limited to restitution and any attendant expenses for the administration of any restitution fund. In the event that direct restitution to consumers is wholly or partially impracticable or funds remain after restitution is completed, the Commission may apply any remaining funds for such other equitable relief (including consumer information remedies) as it determines to be reasonably related to the practices alleged in the Complaint. Any funds not used for such equitable relief shall be deposited to the Department of the Treasury as disgorgement and not as a fine or penalty. The Commission shall have full and sole discretion to:
  - Determine the criteria for participation by individual claimants in any consumer restitution program implemented pursuant to this Order;
  - Determine the manner and timing of any notices to be given to consumers regarding the existence and terms of such programs,
     and
  - 3. Delegate any and all tasks connected with such restitution program to any individual, partnerships, or corporations; and pay reasonable fees, salaries, and expenses incurred thereby from the payments made pursuant to this Order;
  - C. The Receivership Defendants expressly waive any rights they may

 possess to litigate the issue of monetary relief. The Receivership Defendants acknowledge and agree that all money paid pursuant to this Order is irrevocably paid to the Commission for purposes of settlement between Plaintiff and the Receivership Defendants; and

D. The Receivership Defendants shall have no right to challenge the Commission's choice of remedies under this Paragraph VI.

#### VII.

## **CUSTOMER LISTS**

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Receivership Defendants, their officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons or entities in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, are permanently restrained and enjoined from selling, renting, leasing, transferring, or otherwise disclosing the name, address, or other identifying information of any person who paid any money to any of the Defendants in this litigation, FTC v. National Consumer Council, Inc. et al, SACV04-0474 CJC (JWJx), or paid money to any of the Receivership Defendants, at any time prior to entry of this order, in connection with telemarketing or with the advertising, promotion, offering for sale or sale of debt negotiation services. Provided, however, that such identifying information may be disclosed to a law enforcement agency or as required by any law, regulation, or court order.

#### VIII.

# COMPLIANCE MONITORING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for the purpose of monitoring and investigating compliance with any provision of this Order:

A. Within ten (10) days of receipt of written notice from a representative of

///

///

///

///

the Commission, the Receivership Defendants shall submit additional written reports, sworn to under penalty of perjury; produce documents for inspection and copying; appear for deposition; and/or provide entry during normal business hours to any business location in the Receivership Defendants' possession or direct or indirect control for the purpose of inspecting the business operation;

- B. In addition, the Commission is authorized to monitor compliance with this Order by all other lawful means, including but not limited to the following:
  - Obtaining discovery from any person, without further leave of court, using the procedures prescribed by Fed. R. Civ. P. 30, 31, 33, 34, 36, and 45;
- 2. Posing as consumers and suppliers to the Receivership

  Defendants' employees, or any other entity managed or

  controlled in whole or in part by the Receivership Defendants,

  without the necessity of identification or prior notice; and
- C. The Receivership Defendants shall permit representatives of the Commission to interview any employer, consultant, independent contractor, representative, agent, or employee who has agreed to such an interview, relating in any way to any conduct subject to this Order. The person interviewed may have counsel present.

Provided, however, that nothing in this Order shall limit the Commission's lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1, to obtain any documentary material, tangible things, testimony, or information relevant to unfair or deceptive acts or practices in or affecting commerce (within the meaning of 15 U.S.C. § 45(a)(1)).

1 |

# COMPLIANCE REPORTING BY RECEIVERSHIP DEFENDANTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, in order that compliance with the provisions of this Order may be monitored:

- A. For a period of five (5) years from the date of entry of this Order, the Receivership Defendants shall notify the Commission of any changes in corporate structure of the Receivership Defendants that may affect compliance obligations arising under this Order, including but not limited to a dissolution, assignment, sale, merger, or other action that would result in the emergence of a successor entity; the creation or dissolution of a subsidiary, parent, or affiliate that engages in any acts or practices subject to this Order; the filing of a bankruptcy petition; or a change in the corporate name or address, at least thirty (30) days prior to such change, provided that, with respect to any proposed change in the corporation about which the Receivership Defendants learn less than thirty (30) days prior to the date such action is to take place, they shall notify the Commission as soon as is practicable after obtaining such knowledge.
- B. One hundred eighty (180) days after the date of entry of this Order, the Receivership Defendants shall provide a written report to the Commission, sworn to under penalty of perjury, setting forth in detail the manner and form in which they have complied and are complying with this Order. This report shall include, but not be limited to:
  - A copy of each acknowledgment of receipt of this Order, obtained pursuant to Paragraph XI, below; and
  - 2. Any other changes required to be reported under Subparagraph A of this Paragraph IX, above.
- C. For the purposes of this Order, the Receivership Defendants shall, unless otherwise directed by the Commission's authorized representatives, mail all written notifications to the Commission to:

Assistant Regional Director Western Region, Los Angeles Federal Trade Commission 10877 Wilshire Blvd, Suite 700 Los Angeles, CA 90024

Re: FTC v. National Consumer Council, et al., Case No. CV-04-0474 CJC (JWJx)

D. For purposes of the compliance reporting and monitoring required by this Order, the Commission is authorized to communicate directly with the Receivership Defendants.

#### X.

## RECORD KEEPING PROVISIONS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of eight (8) years from the date of entry of this Order, the Receivership Defendants and their agents, employees, officers, corporations, successors, and assigns, and those persons in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, while engaging in conduct related to the subject matter of this Order, are hereby restrained and enjoined from failing to create and retain the following records:

- A. Accounting records that reflect the cost of goods or services sold, revenues generated, and the disbursement of such revenues;
- B. Personnel records accurately reflecting: the name, address, email (if any) and telephone number of each person employed in any capacity by such business, including as an independent contractor; that person's job title or position; the date upon which the person commenced work; and the date and reason for the person's termination, if applicable;
- C. Customer files containing the names, addresses, phone numbers, dollar amounts paid, quantity of items or services purchased, and description of items or services purchased, to the extent such information is obtained in the ordinary course of business;

///

///

///

28 ///

- D. Complaints and refund requests (whether received directly, indirectly or through any third party) and any responses to those complaints or requests;
- E. Copies of all sales scripts, training materials, advertisements, website printouts, or other marketing materials; and
- F. All records and documents necessary to demonstrate full compliance with each provision of this Order, including but not limited to, copies of acknowledgments of receipt of this Order, required by Paragraph XI, below, and all reports submitted to the FTC pursuant to Paragraph IX, above.

## XI.

# DISTRIBUTION OF ORDER BY RECEIVERSHIP DEFENDANTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of five (5) years from the date of entry of this Order, the Receivership Defendants shall deliver copies of this Order as directed below:

- A. The Receivership Defendants must deliver a copy of this Order to all of their principals, officers, directors, and managers. The Receivership Defendants must also deliver copies of this Order to all of their employees, agents, and representatives who engage in conduct related to the subject matter of the Order. For current personnel, delivery shall be within (5) days of service of this Order upon the Receivership Defendants. For new personnel, delivery shall occur prior to them assuming their responsibilities.
- B. The Receivership Defendants must secure a signed and dated statement acknowledging receipt of the Order, within thirty days of delivery, from all persons receiving a copy of the Order pursuant to this Paragraph XI.

XII.

# ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF RECEIPT OF ORDER BY RECEIVERSHIP DEFENDANTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, within five (5) business days of receipt of this Order as entered by the Court, the Receivership Defendants must submit to the Commission a truthful sworn statement acknowledging receipt of this Order.

# XIII.

#### **SEVERABILITY**

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the provisions of this Order are separate and severable from one another. If any provision is stayed or determined to be invalid, all of the remaining provisions shall remain in full force and effect.

and the state of t

#### RECEIVERSHIP

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that nothing in this Order shall affect the powers or duties of the Permanent Receiver over the Receivership Defendants established by the PI during the pendency of this action and the powers and duties of the Permanent Receiver as set forth in the PI are hereby incorporated into this Order by this reference as though fully set forth herein. Notwithstanding the provisions of Paragraph VI herein, the Permanent Receiver may retain such funds in the receivership estate as it deems necessary and appropriate to pay ongoing administrative expenses, subject to Court approval when required, to carry out its duties under the PI as incorporated herein.

///

///

/// ///

1	XV.		
2	RETENTION OF JURISDICTION		
3	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Court shall retain jurisdiction of this		
4	matter for purposes of construction, modification and enforcement of this Order.		
5			
6	SO STIPULATED:		
7	Dated: March 29, 2005  Jenniker Larabee		
8	Faye Chen Barnouw Ray McKown		
9	Kenneth Abbe Attorneys for Plaintiff		
10	Federal Trade Commission		
11			
12	Dated: 13,2005 Robb Evans and Associates LLC		
13	Witten Ophnson, EVP		
14	By: Kent Johnson Permanent Receiver		
15	U TOTAL A GITTO FORTA		
16	APPROVED AS TO FORM:		
17	Dated:, 2005		
18 19	Gary O. Caris, Esq. Attorney for Permanent Receiver		
20			
21	IT IS SO ORDERED, this day of, 2005, atm.		
22	11 15 50 Old Elder, and day 01, 2005, atm.		
23			
24	Cormac J. Carney United States District Court Judge		
25	Omiod Diales Dialiet Comi Jungo		
26			
27			
28			

1	XV.		
2	RETENTION OF JURISDICTION		
3	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Court shall retain jurisdiction of this		
4	matter for purposes of construction, modification and enforcement of this Order.		
5			
6	SO STIPULATED:		
7	Dated:, 2005	Jennifer Larabee	
8		Faye Chen Barnouw Ray McKown Kenneth Abbe	
10		Attorneys for Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission	
11	,		
12	Dated:, 2005	Robb Evans and Associates LLC	
13 14		By: Kent Johnson Permanent Receiver	
15		,	
16	APPROVED AS TO FORM:	MAN	
17 18	Dated: January 13, 2005	Gary O. Cans. Esq. Attorgey for Permanent Receiver	
19		Audipoy for 1 crimateric records	
20			
21	IT IS SO ORDERED, this day of	, 2005, atm.	
22			
23	Cormac I.	Carnev	
24	Cormac J. Carney United States District Court Judge		
25			
26	·		
27			
28			