DEBRA A. VALENTINE General Counsel

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

THOMAS SYTA (CA BAR #116286)
RAYMOND E. MCKOWN (CA BAR #150975)
KENNETH H. ABBE (CA BAR #172416)
Federal Trade Commission
10877 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 700
Los Angeles, CA 90024
(310) 824-4325; Fax (310) 824-4380

Attorneys for Plaintiff FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

WESTERN DIVISION

00-06507

PSWI

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION,

Plaintiff,

v.

THE KOHL GROUP, LLC, a California limited liability company doing business as Federal Information Services;

GREGORY STEWART HALL, individually and as a member of The Kohl Group, LLC;

BENJAMIN H. KIM, individually and as a member of The Kohl Group, LLC;

DOUGLAS LEE, individually and as a member of The Kohl Group, LLC; and

MARK AARON OSBORNE, individually and as a member of The Kohl Group, LLC,

Defendants.

CIVIL NO.

COMPLAINT FOR INJUNCTIVE AND OTHER EQUITABLE RELIEF

Plaintiff, the Federal Trade Commission ("FTC" or "Commission"), for its complaint alleges:

1. The FTC brings this action under Section 13(b) of the Federal Trade Commission Act ("FTC Act"), 15 U.S.C. § 53(b), to secure a permanent injunction, preliminary

D:\FIS\pleadings\FIScomplaintFNL upd 6/15/00

D:\FIS\pleadings\FIScomplaintFNL.wpd 6/15/00

injunctive relief, rescission of contracts, restitution, disgorgement, appointment of a receiver, and other equitable relief for defendants' deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a).

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

- 2. This Court has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331, 1337(a), and 1345, as well as 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a) and 53(b).
- 3. Venue in the United States District Court for the Central District of California is proper under 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b) and (c), as well as under 15 U.S.C. § 53(b).

THE PARTIES

- 4. Plaintiff, the Federal Trade Commission, is an independent agency of the United States Government created by statute. 15 U.S.C. §§ 41 et seq. The Commission is charged, inter alia, with enforcement of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a), which prohibits unfair or deceptive acts or practices in or affecting commerce. The Commission is authorized to initiate federal district court proceedings, by its own attorneys, to enjoin violations of the FTC Act and to secure such equitable relief as is appropriate in each case, including restitution for injured consumers. 15 U.S.C. § 53(b).
- 5. Defendant The Kohl Group LLC ("Kohl Group"), is a California limited liability company that does business as Federal Information Services ("FIS"), with its principal place of business at 1600 Sawtelle Avenue, Suites 110 and 230, Los Angeles, California 90025. Kohl Group transacts

business in the Central District of California.

- 6. Defendant Gregory Stewart Hall is an owner, member, and principal of Kohl Group. At all times material to this complaint, acting alone or in concert with others, he has formulated, directed, controlled, or participated in the acts and practices of Kohl Group, including the acts and practices set forth in this complaint. He transacts business in the Central District of California.
- 7. Defendant Benjamin H. Kim is an owner, member, and principal of Kohl Group. At all times material to this complaint, acting alone or in concert with others, he has formulated, directed, controlled, or participated in the acts and practices of Kohl Group, including the acts and practices set forth in this complaint. He transacts business in the Central District of California.
- 8. Defendant Douglass Lee is an owner, member, and principal of Kohl Group. At all times material to this complaint, acting alone or in concert with others, he has formulated, directed, controlled, or participated in the acts and practices of Kohl Group, including the acts and practices set forth in this complaint. He transacts business in the Central District of California.
- 9. Defendant Mark Aaron Osborne is an owner, member, and principal of Kohl Group. At all times material to this complaint, acting alone or in concert with others, he has formulated, directed, controlled, or participated in the acts and practices of Kohl Group, including the acts and practices set forth in this complaint. He transacts

business in the Central District of California.

COMMERCE

10. At all times material to this complaint, defendants have maintained a substantial course of trade in or affecting commerce, as "commerce" is defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.

DEFENDANTS' COURSE OF CONDUCT

and telemarketed materials on foreclosed homes and on seized vehicles to consumers throughout the United States.

Defendants' materials on foreclosed homes purportedly include current local listings of foreclosed homes and publications containing general information about purchasing foreclosed homes. Defendants purportedly provide monthly updates of the listings. Defendants' materials on seized vehicles purportedly include current local listings of auctions at which seized vehicles can be purchased and publications containing general information about purchasing auctioned items. Defendants purportedly provide monthly updates of the listings.

Defendants' Marketing Practices

- 12. Defendants have disseminated or have caused the dissemination of advertisements throughout the United States, via print media and the Internet, that advertise to consumers their foreclosed home and seized vehicle materials.
- 13. Defendants' advertisements include, but are not limited to, the following:

D:\FT\$\pleadings\FT\$complaintFNL.wpd 6/15/00

FORECLOSED **HOMES** Low or \$0 down!!

Government and bank repossessions being sold now! Financing available! **Local listings. 800-501-1777 ext. [various numbers] [at times, this advertisement also includes the name "FEDERAL INFORMATION SERVICES"].

FORECLOSED HOMES. LOW OR \$0 DOWN! Gov't & bank repos being sold now! Fantastic \$aving\$!! Financing available. 1-800-501-1777, ext. 2009. Fee [or 1-800-338-0020 ext. 8122].

HOMES FROM \$5,000! Low or \$0 down! Govt & bank repos being sold now! Financing available! Local listings. 1-800-501-1777 X8145.

HOMES FROM \$199/month. 1-3 bedrooms.

Repos and foreclosures. 4% down, OK

credit. For listings, payment details.

1-800-338-0020 ext. 8148.

JEEPS \$500 - up! Honda, Chevy, Toyota & Sport Utility. Police impounds & repossessions. Must sell! Local listings! 1-800-451-0050 Ext. C8142.

D:\FIS\plcadings\FiScomplaintFNL wpd 6/15/00

- 14. Consumers who call the toll-free telephone number provided in the advertisements are connected to defendants' telemarketers, who inform consumers that the materials sell for approximately \$59, plus shipping and handling.
- 15. Consumers who agree to purchase one or both of the foreclosed homes or seized vehicle information materials are asked to provide the telemarketers with their credit card or checking account numbers. The cost for one or both of the items, plus shipping and handling, is then charged or debited to those accounts.
- 16. If consumers have purchased the foreclosed homes materials, defendants then ship those materials to consumers, designated as "FIS Listing Center, Real Estate Owned/Government Foreclosure Properties."
- 17. If consumers have purchased the seized vehicles materials, defendants then ship those materials to consumers, designated as "Buying Smart Auction Edition, The Complete Guide to Purchasing Auction Property At Rock-Bottom Prices" and "FIS Listing Center, Auction Listing Directory for the Month of [current Month]."

Undisclosed Refund Policy

18. In the course of advertising and telemarketing defendants' materials, defendants' telemarketers typically represent, expressly or by implication, that consumers may

- 19. Consumers learn only upon receiving defendants' materials that, under defendants' written refund policy, consumers must satisfy previously undisclosed conditions in order to obtain refunds.
- the following: (1) consumers must use defendants' materials for at least 90 days before applying for a refund; (2) consumers must provide proof that they attempted to use defendants' materials by contacting one or more agencies listed in those materials; (3) consumers must return defendants' materials in resalable condition; (4) consumers must obtain a return authorization number from an FIS customer service representative; (5) consumers must submit one or more auction admission tickets; (6) consumers must identify at least two persons they contacted in their effort to purchase a listed home; and (7) consumers must submit a completed real estate loan application.
- 21. These conditions for the receipt of a refund are not clearly and conspicuously disclosed to consumers when they place their orders. The effect of these refund conditions, which are disclosed for the first time when consumers receive defendants' materials, is to discourage consumers from seeking refunds.

22. In the course of advertising and telemarketing defendants' materials, defendants' telemarketers obtain consumers' credit account or bank account information, and then, as the following examples illustrate, charge consumers' credit accounts or debit their checking accounts without authorization.

- 23. In some instances, consumers agree to a specific charge, but defendants then charge an amount that is higher than what consumers agreed to be charged.
- 24. In some instances, when consumers do not authorize a charge against their accounts but express an interest in either or both of the materials offered, defendants nevertheless charge consumers' accounts.
- 25. Defendants represent to some consumers that consumers will not be charged unless they send checks to defendants. Defendants, however, debit the checking accounts of consumers who do not submit checks to defendants.

Foreclosed Homes

- 26. The telemarketers typically reiterate and expound upon the claims made in the foreclosed home advertisements by telling consumers that foreclosed homes in good condition can be purchased by the public at prices substantially below their market values, including as little as \$5,000.
- 27. Defendants' telemarketers typically also represent that defendants will provide consumers with listings of actual homes that are available for purchase in the

consumers' areas, but consumers who attempt to use defendants' materials frequently find that the listed homes are remote from their residences and that no homes or other property are available for the represented bargains.

VIOLATIONS OF SECTION 5 OF THE FTC ACT

COUNT ONE

- 28. In numerous instances, in the course of offering for sale or selling their materials on foreclosed homes and seized vehicles, defendants have represented, expressly or by implication, that they will provide refunds to consumers upon request.
- 29. In truth and in fact, defendants have failed to disclose that they actually impose additional conditions and restrictions that discourage consumers from seeking refunds or restrict the availability of refunds. These conditions and restrictions would be material to consumers in their decisions to purchase defendants' products.
- 30. In light of the representation made in Paragraph 28, above, the failure to disclose that defendants actually impose additional refund conditions and restrictions was, and is, a deceptive act or practice in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a).

COUNT TWO

31. In numerous instances, in the course of offering for sale or selling their materials on foreclosed homes and seized vehicles, defendants have represented, expressly or by implication, that they will not use consumers' checking account or credit card information for the purpose of

- 32. In truth and in fact, in numerous instances, defendants have proceeded to use consumers' checking account or credit card information for the purpose of debiting consumers' bank accounts or billing consumers' credit card accounts without consumers' authorization.
- 33. Therefore, the representation set forth in Paragraph 31 was, and is, false and misleading and constitutes a deceptive act or practice in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a).

COUNT THREE

- 34. In numerous instances, in the course of offering for sale or selling their materials on foreclosed homes, defendants have represented, expressly or by implication, that consumers who purchase those materials frequently are able to purchase foreclosed homes in reasonably good condition at prices substantially below their market values, including as little as \$5,000.
- 35. In truth and in fact, consumers who purchase defendants' materials on foreclosed homes rarely, if ever, are able to purchase foreclosed homes in reasonably good condition at prices substantially below their market values, including as little as \$5,000.
- 36. Therefore, the representation set forth in Paragraph 34 was, and is, false and misleading and constitutes a deceptive act or practice in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a).

COUNT FOUR

- 37. Defendants have represented, expressly or by implication, that they possessed and relied upon a reasonable basis that substantiated the representation set forth in Paragraph 34, at the time the representation was made.
- 38. In truth and in fact, defendants did not possess and rely upon a reasonable basis that substantiated the representation set forth in Paragraph 34, at the time the representation was made.
- 39. Therefore, the representation set forth in Paragraph 37 was, and is, false and misleading and constitutes a deceptive act or practice in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a).

CONSUMER INJURY

40. Consumers throughout the United States have suffered and continue to suffer substantial monetary loss as a result of defendants' unlawful acts or practices. In addition, defendants have been unjustly enriched as a result of their unlawful practices. Absent injunctive relief by this Court, defendants are likely to continue to injure consumers, reap unjust enrichment, and harm the public interest.

THIS COURT'S POWER TO GRANT RELIEF

41. Section 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 53(b), empowers this Court to grant injunctive and other ancillary relief, including consumer redress, disgorgement, and restitution, to prevent and remedy any violations of any

LEDEKYT LKYDE

provision of law enforced by the Commission.

42. This Court, in the exercise of its equitable jurisdiction, may award other ancillary relief to remedy injury caused by defendants' law violations.

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, plaintiff, the Federal Trade Commission, requests that this Court, as authorized by Section 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 53(b), and pursuant to its own equitable powers:

- Award plaintiff such temporary and preliminary injunctive and ancillary relief as may be necessary to avert the likelihood of consumer injury during the pendency of this action and to preserve the possibility of effective final relief;
- 2. Permanently enjoin defendants from violating the FTC Act as alleged herein;
- 3. Award such relief as the Court finds necessary to redress injury to consumers resulting from defendants' violations of the FTC Act, including but not limited to rescission of contracts, the refund of monies paid, and the disgorgement of ill-gotten monies; and

22 | ///

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23 1///

24 | ///

25 1///

26 ///

27 ///

28 ///

DAFIS\pleudings\FIScomplaintFNLwpd 6/15/00

4. Award plaintiff the costs of bringing this action, as well as such other and additional relief as the Court may determine to be just and proper.

Respectfully Submitted,

DEBRA A. VALENTINE General Counsel

Dated: Kure 15 2000

RAYMOND E. MCKOWN

KENNETH H. ABBE

Federal Trade Commission 10877 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 700 Los Angeles, CA 90024

(310) 824-4343

(310) 824-4380 (fax)