UNITED STATES OF AMERICA BEFORE THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSIO



In the Matter of

ECM BioFilms, Inc., a corporation, also d/b/a Enviroplastics International Docket No. 9358

PUBLIC DOCUMENT

JOINT MOTION FOR ENTRY OF PROPOSED ORDER BASED ON STIPULATIONS REGARDING CERTAIN EMAIL ATTACHMENTS

Pursuant to Commission Rule of Practice 3.31(f), Complaint Counsel and Respondent ECM Biofilms ("ECM") respectfully request that the Court enter the attached proposed order based on the parties' stipulations regarding certain email attachments. Specifically, both parties stipulate and agree to the following evidentiary presumptions; provided, however, that either party may attempt to rebut the presumption on a case-by-case basis. The parties stipulate and agree that the following presumptions shall apply to all attachments to emails sent after January 1, 2008 by any person who was, at the time of sending the email in question, an ECM employee:

- 1. Regarding any email sent before October 1, 2012, any email attachment that is titled in the Attachment line or described in the body of the email, at least in part, as a "certificate" or "cert" is presumed to be ECM's Certificate of Biodegradability, ECM-FTC-000015.
- Regarding any email sent on or after October 1, 2012, any email attachment that is titled in the Attachment line or described in the body of the email, at least in part, as a "certificate" or "cert" is presumed to be ECM's Certificate of Biodegradability, ECM-FTC-000552.
- Regarding any email sent before October 1, 2012, any email attachment that is titled in the Attachment line or described in the body of the email, at least in part, as a "logo" is presumed to be ECM's logo, ECM-FTC-000066, which states: "ECM Biodegradable".
- 4. Regarding any email sent on or after October 1, 2012, any email attachment that is titled in the Attachment line or described in the body of the email, at least in part, as a "logo" is presumed to be ECM's logo, ECM-FTC-000551, which states: "ECM Biodegradable Plastic Products produced with our additives will biodegrade in

biologically active environments (including most landfills) in some period greater than a year."

As such, the parties jointly ask the Court to enter an order to this effect.

Dated: April 1, 2014

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Elisa Jillson_

Katherine Johnson (kjohnson3@ftc.gov) Jonathan Cohen (jcohen2@ftc.gov) Elisa Jillson (ejillson@ftc.gov) Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W. M-8102B Washington, DC 20580 Phone: 202-326-2185; -2551; -3001 Fax: 202-326-2551

Dated: April 1, 2014

Peter A. Arhangelsky ¹ Jonathan W. Emord (jemord@emord.com) Peter A. Arhangelsky (parhangelsky@emord.com) Lou F. Caputo (lcaputo@emord.com) Emord & Associates, P.C. 11808 Wolf Run Lane Clifton, VA 20124 Phone: (202) 388-8899 Fax: (202) 466-6938

¹ Executed with Mr. Arhangelsky's express authority.

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA BEFORE THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

In the Matter of

ECM BioFilms, Inc., a corporation, also d/b/a Enviroplastics International

Docket No. 9358

[PROPOSED] ORDER ENTERING THE PARTIES' STIPULATIONS REGARDING CERTAIN EMAIL ATTACHMENTS

This matter having come before the Chief Administrative Law Judge on April 1, 2014, upon a Joint Motion for Entry of Proposed Order Based on Stipulations Regarding Certain Email Attachments, it is hereby ORDERED that the Joint Motion Is GRANTED.

It is FURTHER ORDERED that the following evidentiary presumptions shall apply to the proceedings in this matter; provided, however, that either party may attempt to rebut any of the following evidentiary presumptions on a case-by-case basis. The following presumptions shall apply to all attachments to emails sent after January 1, 2008 by any person who was, at the time of sending the email in question, an ECM employee.

- 1. Regarding any email sent before October 1, 2012, any email attachment that is titled in the Attachment line or described in the body of the email, at least in part, as a "certificate" or "cert" is presumed to be ECM's Certificate of Biodegradability, ECM-FTC-000015.
- 2. Regarding any email sent on or after October 1, 2012, any email attachment that is titled in the Attachment line or described in the body of the email, at least in part, as a "certificate" or "cert" is presumed to be ECM's Certificate of Biodegradability, ECM-FTC-000552.
- 3. Regarding any email sent before October 1, 2012, any email attachment that is titled in the Attachment line or described in the body of the email, at least in part, as a "logo" is presumed to be ECM's logo, ECM-FTC-000066, which states: "ECM Biodegradable".
- 4. Regarding any email sent on or after October 1, 2012, any email attachment that is titled in the Attachment line or described in the body of the email, at least in part, as a "logo" is presumed to be ECM's logo, ECM-FTC-000551, which states: "ECM

Biodegradable Plastic Products produced with our additives will biodegrade in biologically active environments (including most landfills) in some period greater than a year."

SO ORDERED:

D. Michael Chappell Chief Administrative Law Judge

Date:

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on April 1, 2014, I caused a true and correct copy of the foregoing to be served as follows:

One electronic copy to the Office of the Secretary, and one copy through the FTC's e-filing system:

Donald S. Clark, Secretary Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Ave., NW, Room H-159 Washington, DC 20580 Email: <u>secretary@ftc.gov</u>

One electronic copy and one hard copy to the Office of the Administrative Law Judge:

The Honorable D. Michael Chappell Administrative Law Judge 600 Pennsylvania Ave., NW, Room H-110 Washington, DC 20580

One electronic copy to **Counsel for the Respondent**:

Jonathan W. Emord Emord & Associates, P.C. 11808 Wolf Run Lane Clifton, VA 20124 Email: jemord@emord.com Peter Arhangelsky Emord & Associates, P.C. 3210 S. Gilbert Road, Suite 4 Chandler, AZ 85286 Email: <u>parhangelsky@emord.com</u>

Lou Caputo Emord & Associates, P.C. 3210 S. Gilbert Road, Suite 4 Chandler, AZ 85286 Email: <u>lcaputo@emord.com</u>

I further certify that I possess a paper copy of the signed original of the foregoing document that is available for review by the parties and the adjudicator.

Date: April 1, 2013

/s/ Elisa Jillson Katherine Johnson (kjohnson3@ftc.gov) Jonathan Cohen (jcohen2@ftc.gov) Elisa Jillson (ejillson@ftc.gov) Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W. M-8102B Washington, DC 20580 Phone: 202-326-2185; -2551; -3001 Fax: 202-326-2551