

(216) 263-3455

United States of America FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION East Central Region

Jon Miller Steiger Director

May 10, 2022 Via Federal Express

Callvox LLC c/o Julia Marques, Registered Agent 247 Water Street, Suite 4 Brooklyn, NY 11201

Warning Regarding Assisting and Facilitating Illegal Robocalls

We have determined that Callvox LLC is apparently routing and transmitting illegal robocall traffic, directly or indirectly, for entities involved in the following campaigns:

- Social Security Administration imposter
- U.S. Customs and Border Protection imposter
- PayPal imposter
- Amazon imposter
- AT&T/DirecTV imposter
- Microsoft imposter
- Marriott Hotels and Hilton Hotels imposter
- Utility disconnection
- Credit card interest rate reduction

More specifically, our investigation revealed that Callvox LLC apparently routed and transmitted illegal robocalls, as set forth in Attachment A.

The Federal Trade Commission (FTC) works closely with USTelecom's Industry Traceback Group (ITG), which is the registered industry consortium selected pursuant to the TRACED Act to conduct tracebacks.¹ Between January 21, 2021, and January 14, 2022, ITG investigated 43 prerecorded voice message calls that law enforcement, voice service providers using honeypots (i.e., unassigned numbers held by providers to detect illegal robocalls), and customers of YouMail had flagged as illegal robocalls made without consent of the called party.² ITG conducted tracebacks and determined that Callvox LLC routed and transmitted the calls. ITG previously notified you of these calls and provided you access to supporting data identifying

¹ See Pallone-Thune Telephone Robocall Abuse Criminal Enforcement and Deterrence Act, Pub. L. No. 116-105, 133 Stat. 3274, Sec. 13(d) (2019) (TRACED Act).

² See 16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v).

each call—including a recording of the illegal robocall—as indicated in Attachment A. Further, the numerous traceback notices directed to Callvox LLC indicate that you are apparently routing and transmitting illegal robocall traffic knowingly.

Callvox LLC's activities described above may subject Callvox LLC to legal liability. This letter is to provide you with information about laws and regulations enforced by the FTC that may bear upon your business activities as a Voice over Internet Protocol (VoIP) service provider, including the activities described above.

The FTC, the nation's consumer protection agency, enforces the Federal Trade Commission Act (FTC Act), 15 U.S.C. § 45 et seq., which prohibits unfair or deceptive acts or practices in or affecting commerce. The FTC also enforces the Telemarketing Sales Rule (TSR), 16 C.F.R. Part 310, which prohibits deceptive and abusive telemarketing practices. Section 310.3(b) of the TSR prohibits "assisting and facilitating" certain specified conduct. Under that provision, it is unlawful for any person or entity to "provide substantial assistance or support to any seller or telemarketer when that person knows or consciously avoids knowing that the seller or telemarketer is engaged in any act or practice that violates Sections 310.3(a), (c), or (d), or Section 310.4 of this Rule." These Sections prohibit, among others, the following conduct:

- Making a false or misleading statement to induce any person to pay for goods or services or to induce a charitable contribution (16 C.F.R. § 310.3(a)(4));
- Misrepresenting a seller or telemarketer's affiliation with any government entity (16 C.F.R. § 310.3(a)(2)(vii));
- Transmitting false or deceptive caller ID numbers (16 C.F.R. § 310.4(a)(8));
- Initiating or causing the initiation of calls that deliver prerecorded messages,⁴ unless the person called provided the seller express written permission to call (16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)); and
- Initiating or causing the initiation of telemarketing calls to numbers listed on the National Do Not Call Registry, unless the person called provided express written permission to receive calls from the seller or the seller had an existing business relationship with the person called (16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B)).

The FTC can obtain civil penalties for TSR violations. Each illegal call is subject to a maximum civil penalty of \$46,517. See 16 C.F.R. § 1.98. In addition, a violation of the TSR is a violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act. See 15 U.S.C. §§ 6102(c), 57a(d)(3), 45(a). Accordingly, the FTC has authority to seek both preliminary and permanent injunctive relief to address TSR violations. See 15 U.S.C. § 53(b). The FTC may also seek the refund of money or payment of damages to address TSR violations. See 15 U.S.C. § 57b(b).

Combatting illegal telemarketing is a top priority for the FTC, with a special emphasis on halting illegal robocalls.⁵ We want you to be aware that the FTC has, for example, brought

³ A copy of the TSR is attached as Attachment B.

⁴ These calls are often referred to as "robocalls."

 $^{^{5}}$ In fiscal year 2021, the FTC received more than 5 million complaints about unwanted calls,

assisting and facilitating claims against technology companies that knowingly provided software and servers used by illegal robocallers, even though these technology companies did not contract directly with the illegal robocallers. *See FTC v. James B. Christiano*, Case No. 8:18-cv-00936 (C.D. Cal. May 31, 2018).

We also bring to your attention that the FTC has sued VoIP service providers for allegedly violating the TSR. In FTC v. Educare, the FTC alleged that defendant Globex Telecom, Inc. assisted and facilitated telemarketers it knew, or consciously avoided knowing, were violating the TSR's prohibitions on calls delivering prerecorded messages. See FTC v. Educare Centre Services, Inc., No. 3:19-cv-00196-KC (W.D. Tex. Dec. 3, 2019). In September, 2020, Globex Telecom and its associates agreed to pay \$2.1 million to settle the FTC lawsuit, and Globex Telecom's former CEO and President was banned from telemarketing to the U.S. and was subject to a permanent court order. Similarly, in FTC v. Alcazar Networks, Inc., the FTC alleged that Alcazar Networks, Inc. and its founder and sole owner assisted and facilitated telemarketers responsible for tens of millions of illegal telemarketing calls, including robocalls and spoofed calls that displayed "911" as the caller ID. See FTC v. Alcazar Networks Inc., et al., No. 6:20-cv-2200 (M.D. Fla. Dec. 3, 2020). As part of their settlement with the FTC in January 2021, the defendants agreed to a permanent injunction that prohibits similar misconduct in the future and requires them to screen and monitor their customers, as well as imposing a monetary penalty.

The FTC has business educational materials that can assist you in complying with the TSR. *See* https://www.ftc.gov/tips-advice/business-center/guidance/complying-telemarketing-sales-rule.

In addition to FTC regulations and the FTC's actions against providers of VoIP services, you should also be aware that the United States Department of Justice (DOJ), state attorneys general, and other agencies have brought civil actions against VoIP companies and their owners. In two cases, DOJ alleged that the defendants were committing and conspiring to commit wire fraud by knowingly transmitting robocalls that impersonated federal government agencies. ¹⁰ In August 2020, a federal district court entered a permanent court order barring the defendants from

including more than 3.42 million robocall complaints. The FTC maintains an interactive Tableau Public web page that publishes details about do not call complaints on a quarterly basis. *See* https://public.tableau.com/profile/federal.trade.commission#!/vizhome/DoNotCallComplaints/M aps.

⁶ A copy of the FTC's Amended Complaint is attached as Attachment C.

⁷ See https://www.ftc.gov/news-events/press-releases/2020/09/globex-telecom-associates-will-pay-21-million-settling-ftcs-first.

⁸ A copy of the FTC's Complaint is attached as Attachment D.

⁹ See https://www.ftc.gov/news-events/press-releases/2020/12/ftc-takes-action-against-second-voip-service-provider.

¹⁰ See https://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/department-justice-files-actions-stop-telecom-carriers-who-facilitated-hundreds-millions.

conveying telephone calls into the U.S. telephone system. 11 State cases have had similar impacts. 12

We hope you will review this letter and the attached materials in detail. Please direct any inquiries regarding this letter to FTC attorney Fil Maria de Banate by email at fdebanate@ftc.gov or by telephone at 216.263.3413.

Sincerely,

/s/ Jon Miller Steiger

JONATHAN STEIGER Digitally signed by JONATHAN STEIGER Date: 2022.05.09 14:01:52 -04'00'

Jon Miller Steiger Director

Enclosures:

Attachment A (Chart of illegal robocalls)
Attachment B (TSR)
Attachment C (*Educare* Amended Complaint)
Attachment D (*Alcazar* Complaint)

https://www.michigan.gov/documents/ag/Assurance_of_Voluntary_Compliance_-

All Access Telecom FINAL 9-11-20 702047 7.pdf, and,

 $\underline{https://www.michigan.gov/ag/0,4534,7-359--536108--s,00.html}.$

¹¹ See https://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/district-court-enters-permanent-injunction-shutting-down-telecom-carriers-who-facilitated.

¹² For example, the Vermont and Michigan Attorneys General have brought successful actions against VoIP providers who route scam robocall traffic. *See*

https://ago.vermont.gov/blog/2021/04/28/attorney-general-donovan-announces-settlement-with-scam-robocall-carrier/;



Date of ITG Notification	Date of Call	Caller ID	Description of Robocall Campaign	Link to Robocall Recording	Potential Violation
Jan 14, 2022	Jan 10, 2022	8709003693	Social Security Administration Imposter	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/ attachments/635541	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Dec 08, 2021	Dec 07, 2021	9407659114	Social Security Administration Imposter	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/ attachments/584753	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Dec 07, 2021	Dec 01, 2021	8143866233	PayPal Imposter	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/ attachments/582998	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Nov 30, 2021	Nov 29, 2021	5135745889	Social Security Administration Imposter	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/ attachments/576039	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Nov 30, 2021	Nov 29, 2021	2152278453	Social Security Administration Imposter	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/ attachments/576038	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Nov 30, 2021	Nov 29, 2021	3043936709	Social Security Administration Imposter	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/ attachments/576035	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Nov 30, 2021	Nov 29, 2021	8643230278	Social Security Administration Imposter	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/ attachments/576032	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Nov 30, 2021	Nov 29, 2021	7133958251	Social Security Administration Imposter	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/ attachments/576029	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Nov 30, 2021	Nov 29, 2021	2567848722	Social Security Administration Imposter	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/ attachments/576022	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Nov 30, 2021	Nov 26, 2021	8083838809	Social Security Administration Imposter	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/ attachments/576021	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Nov 22, 2021	Nov 20, 2021	2022390873	Utility Disconnection	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/ attachments/567529	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Nov 22, 2021	Nov 20, 2021	3018761508	Utility Disconnection	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/ attachments/567528	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Nov 22, 2021	Nov 18, 2021	4107271218	Utility Disconnection	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/ attachments/567520	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Nov 19, 2021	Nov 18, 2021	8184593962	Amazon Imposter	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/ attachments/565726	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Nov 09, 2021	Nov 04, 2021	3376642951	Social Security Administration Imposter	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/attachments/550663	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)

		ı			
Oct 15, 2021	Oct 14, 2021	2817987530	Utility Disconnection	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/attachments/520015	16 C.F.R.
					§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Oct 14, 2021	Oct 13, 2021	8506519428	Amazon Imposter	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
				attachments/516624	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Oct 06, 2021	Oct 04, 2021	4436224034	Social Security	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
			Administration Imposter	attachments/490965	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
			Credit Card Interest Rate	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
Oct 01, 2021	Sep 29, 2021	8084359436	Reduction	attachments/484583	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
			Reduction		
Sep 20, 2021	Sep 18, 2021	8337971835	AT&T/DirecTV Imposter	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
				attachments/460581	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
San 14 2021	Sep 13, 2021	4808811723	Social Security	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
Sep 14, 2021			Administration Imposter	attachments/447432	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
	Sep 09, 2021	4245019250	1	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
Sep 15, 2021				attachments/444724	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
			Casial Casymity		16 C.F.R.
Aug 30, 2021	Aug 28, 2021	6823368252	Social Security	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	
			Administration Imposter	attachments/404481	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Aug 31, 2021	Aug 25, 2021	4012477704	Legal Enforcement	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
			Agency Imposter	attachments/392268	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
10.2021	Aug 17, 2021	7742192071	Social Security	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
Aug 18, 2021			Administration Imposter	attachments/373780	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
			Social Security	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
Aug 18, 2021	Aug 17, 2021	8657892953	Administration Imposter	attachments/373779	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
			1		
Aug 18, 2021	Aug 17, 2021	6618579725	Social Security	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
1145 10, 2021			Administration Imposter	attachments/373774	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Aug 16, 2021	Aug 07, 2021	6506250074	Marriott Hotels Imposter	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
				attachments/339829	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Aug 04, 2021	Aug 02, 2021	8652069471	Social Security	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
			Administration Imposter	attachments/316442	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Aug 04, 2021	Jul 29, 2021	2028337500	Utility Disconnection	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
				attachments/310553	
					§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Aug 04, 2021	Jul 29, 2021	2028337500	Utility Disconnection	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
				attachments/310551	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)

Ava 04 2021	Jul 20, 2021	2029227500	Litility Discomposition	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
Aug 04, 2021	Jul 29, 2021	2028337500	Utility Disconnection	attachments/310549	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Jul 27, 2021	Jul 23, 2021	9197820458	U.S. Customs and Border	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
341 27, 2021	Jul 23, 2021	7177020430	Protection Imposter	attachments/300557	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Jun 23, 2021	Jun 10, 2021	9168573029	Hilton Hotels Imposter	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
				attachments/196673	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
May 28 2021	May 27, 2021	7575774578	Marriott Hotels Imposter	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
1114 20, 2021				attachments/162225	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
May 28 2021	May 27, 2021	8044078902	Marriott Hotels Imposter	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
1114 20, 2021				attachments/162223	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Mar 13, 2021	Mar 11, 2021	2155271675	Social Security	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
			Administration Imposter	attachments/66154	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Feb 17, 2021	Feb 16, 2021	4802266708	11 1	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
100 17, 2021				attachments/57750	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Feb 19, 2021	Feb 16, 2021	6054758951	Credit Card Interest Rate	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
			Reduction	attachments/57715	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Feb 02, 2021	Feb 02, 2021	9315371345	Stay Safe Stay Home	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
1 60 02, 2021				attachments/29483	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Jan 28, 2021	Jan 21, 2021	8005775366	AT&T/DirecTV Imposter	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
				attachments/28766	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Jan 28, 2021	Jan 22, 2021	2053157896	Social Security	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
20, 2021	22, 2021	2000107000	Administration Imposter	attachments/28743	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)
Jan 21, 2021	Jan 13, 2021	3038997343	Stay Safe Stay Home	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public/	16 C.F.R.
				attachments/28064	§ 310.4(b)(1)(v)